

Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.

Contents lists available at [ScienceDirect](www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/23529148)

Informatics in Medicine Unlocked

Evaluation of the gut microbiome associated with COVID-19

Reza Maddah $^{\mathrm{a},\mathrm{*}},$ Vahid Goodarzi $^{\mathrm{b}},$ Seyedeh-Leili Asadi-Yousefabad $^{\mathrm{c}}$, Mahbobe Abbasluo $^{\mathrm{d}}$, Parvin Shariati^{a,**}, Amir Shafiei Kafraj^a

^a *Department of Bioprocess Engineering, Institute of Industrial and Environmental Biotechnology, National Institute of Genetic Engineering and Biotechnology, Tehran, Iran*

^b *Department of Anesthesiology, Rasoul-Akram Medical Center, Iran University of Medical Sciences (IUMS), Tehran, Iran*

^c *Department of Molecular Medicine, School of Medicine, Shahid Sadoughi University of Medical Sciences, Yazd, Iran*

^d *Islamic Azad University, Ashkezar Branch, Department of Biology, Yazd, Iran*

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Microbiome **Gut** COVID-19 Healthy individuals Biodiversity Co-occurrence network

ABSTRACT

Introduction: In 2019, a new virus from the coronavirus family called SARS-CoV-2, infected populations throughout the world. Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19), an illness induced by this virus, attacks vital organs in the body, such as the respiratory system and the gastrointestinal tract. Recent studies have confirmed changes in the gut microbiome caused by the COVID-19 disease. We examined the alteration of the gut microbiome in COVID-19 patients compared to healthy individuals.

Materials and methods: in this study, the 16s metagenomics dataset, publicly available in the Sequence Read Archive (SRA) database, was used for analysis (accession number PRJNA636824). The analysis processes were performed using the CLC Microbial Genomics Module 20.1.1 (Qiagen). At first, the sequence reads of samples were trimmed and classified into operational taxonomic units (OTUs) with 97% similarity and then assigned to the Greengenes reference database (v138). Differential abundance analysis was used to determine statistically significant differences in OTUs between COVID-19 and healthy groups. Next, biodiversity analyses including the alpha diversity (intragroup diversity) and beta diversity (intergroup diversity) using defined indexes were estimated. Then, the co-occurrence network at the species level was constructed using the Pearson correlation coefficient calculation between pairs of OTUs in R software and visualized using Cytoscape software. Ultimately, the hub OTUs at the species level were identified using the cytoHubba plugin of Cytoscape based on Maximal Clique Centrality (MCC) algorithm.

Results: The results of the metagenomic analysis revealed that the intestinal microbiome in healthy individuals has a higher biodiversity compared to COVID-19 patients. Indeed, healthy people also have a higher percentage of beneficial bacteria such as bifidobacteria adolescentis compared to COVID-19 patients; in contrast, COVID-19 patients have higher levels of opportunistic and pathogenic bacteria such as Streptococcus anginosus than healthy people. Also, by constructing a co-occurrence network at the species level, Bifidobacterium longum in the healthy group and Veillonella parvulain the COVID-19 group were found as hub species.

Conclusion: The results of this study shed light on the relationship between the gut microbiome and COVID-19. These results could be helpful for understanding the pathogenesis, clinical features, and treatment of COVID-9.

1. Introduction

In 2019, a new virus spread all around the world. Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) is a contagious disease of the respiratory system caused by the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) [[1](#page-7-0)]. This virus can lead to different clinical symptoms in patients. The severity of disease complications is associated with having some underlying diseases such as diabetes, severe obesity, hypertension, and cardiovascular disease that may worsen illness symptoms [2–[7\]](#page-7-0). In addition to the respiratory system, the disease has adverse effects on the nervous [\[8\]](#page-7-0), cardiovascular [[9\]](#page-7-0), and gastrointestinal systems [\[10](#page-7-0)]. Gastrointestinal symptoms include various complications such as diarrhea, anorexia, and nausea that are observed in some patients [[11\]](#page-7-0). The virus invades the cell through the angiotensin-converting enzyme 2

** Corresponding author. Shahrak-e Pajoohesh, km 15, Tehran - Karaj Highway, Tehran, Iran.

E-mail addresses: rmadah733@gmail.com (R. Maddah), parvinshariati@yahoo.com (P. Shariati).

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.imu.2023.101239>

Available online 3 April 2023 Received 29 December 2022; Received in revised form 14 March 2023; Accepted 2 April 2023

^{*} Corresponding author. Shahrak-e Pajoohesh, km 15, Tehran - Karaj Highway, Tehran, Iran.

^{2352-9148/© 2023} The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license([http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)[nc-nd/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/)).

R. Maddah et al.

Table 1

Information of dataset.

 $(ACE2)$ receptor $[12,13]$ $[12,13]$, which is expressed at high levels in the gastrointestinal and respiratory tracts [\[14](#page-7-0)]. Studies have indicated the presence of the SARS-CoV-2 in fecal samples [\[15](#page-7-0)]. The intestinal microbiome is a critical component of the gastrointestinal tract that plays an essential role in human health and disease [[16\]](#page-7-0). Evidence has implicated respiratory viruses in altering the gut microbiome [\[17](#page-7-0)], which in turn can cause an imbalance in the immune system and induce secondary bacterial pneumonia [\[18](#page-7-0)]. Recent studies have also shown that COVID-19 alters the intestinal microbiome [\[19](#page-7-0)]. According to the results, healthy individuals have a higher gut microbial diversity than COVID-19 patients. Indeed, such patients have higher bacterial pathogens and lower beneficial bacteria [\[20](#page-7-0),[21\]](#page-7-0).

The aim of this study is to explain the relationship between the gut microbiome and COVID-19 disease in terms of taxonomy and microbial ecology. Accordingly, we investigated alterations of the gut microbiome in COVID-19 patients relative to healthy individuals using a new approach.

2. Material and methods

2.1. Data collection and preprocessing

Following the coronavirus outbreak, Gu et al. (2019) evaluated gut microbiome alterations in COVID-19 and H1N1 patients as compared to healthy people [\[20](#page-7-0)]. Stool samples of healthy individuals and patients

were analyzed by 16S rRNA sequencing. We utilized the metagenomic dataset reported in Gu et al. [\[20](#page-7-0)]. This dataset is deposited in the Sequence Read Archive (SRA) under the accession number PRJNA636824. This dataset includes 30 COVID-19 patients, 30 healthy controls (HC), and 24 H1N1 patient samples. We excluded samples of H1N1 patients from this study. Also, samples of healthy people and COVID-19 patients were imported into this study for analysis. Bioinformatics analysis was performed using the CLC Microbial Genomics Module 20.1.1 (Qiagen). Information on the dataset is included in Table 1.

2.2. OTUs clustering ad taxonomic assignment

In this phase, the reads of samples were trimmed and classified into operational taxonomic units (OTUs) with 97% similarity and then assigned to the Greengenes reference database (v138) based on the default settings of the software. The OTUs clustering workflow includes five tools. "Optional Merge Paired Reads" is the first tool that merges two sets of sequences. The merged reads were trimmed with the "Trim sequence" tool. Alternatively, sequences were measured by the "Fixed Length Trimming" tool. Then, the sequences were filtered through the "Filer Samples Based on the Number of Reads" tool that generated output containing high-quality sequences. Ultimately, the sequences were clustered into operational taxonomic units (OTUs) using the "OTU clustering" tool. The relative abundance of OTUs was visualized using a bar chart at the phylum, class, family, and genus levels.

2.3. Differential abundance analysis

In this step, for evaluating differential abundance analysis, OTUs with low abundance were removed with a combined abundance of less than ten, and then statistically significant differences in OTUs between

Fig. 1. Results of taxonomic analysis, the relative abundance of bacterial populations among COVID-19 patients and healthy individuals were visualized by using stacked bar charts; respectively, phylum level (A), class level (B), family level (C), genus level (D).

Table 2

Results of differential abundance analysis.

OTUs names (specific number)	$Log2$ fold change: $log(FC)$ in COVID-19 vs healthy	Taxonomy
Positive abundances		
s_mucilaginosa,	9.82563	Rothia mucilaginosa
(1017181)		
g_Blautia, (174009)	6.41008	Blautia
g_Streptococcus,	5.50363	Streptococcus
(2024840)		
s anginosus, (1888677)	4.14302	Streptococcus
		anginosus
Negative abundances		
s_prausnitzii, (189937)	-3.105632	Faecalibacterium
		prausnitzii
f Clostridiaceae,	-3.695406	Clostridiaceae
(180516)		
g_Dorea, (189559)	-3.86359	Dorea
s adolescentis, (235262)	-7.172547	Bifidobacterium
		adolescentis
g SMB53, (555945)	-9.061805	SMB53

Positive abundances indicate that OTUs has the highest log(FC) in COVID-19; Negative abundances indicate that OTUs has the highest log(FC) in healthy individuals; *f*, family level; *g*, genus level; *s*, species level.

COVID-19 patients versus the healthy groups were determined.

2.4. Diversity analyses

In order to estimate the alpha diversity (intragroup diversity) and beta diversity (intergroup diversity), OTUs were aligned with the "MUSCLE" tool. This tool produces a phylogenetic tree based on the maximum likelihood phylogeny approach, which is used to estimate alpha and beta diversity. Alpha and beta diversity are two indicators in microbial ecology that are commonly estimated in various studies.

Alpha diversity represents diversity within the groups, and beta diversity indicates diversity between groups. For alpha diversity, the Total number, Shannon entropy, Choa 1, Simpson's index, and phylogenetic diversity Indices were estimated. The Kruskal-Wallis nonparametric test was used to determine statistical significance differences within groups for alpha diversity. The statistically significant level was consideredP*<* 0.05. Bray-Curtis, Jaccard, Unweighted Unifrac, and Weighted Unifrac Indices were calculated and visualized using the principal coordinate analysis (PCoA) for beta diversity. Indeed, the Permutational Multivariate Analysis of Variance (PERMANOVA) was employed to determine the statistical significance differences between groups. These tests were carried out with the CLC Microbial Genomics Module.

2.5. Co-occurrence network and selection of hub OTUs at the species level

To construct the bacterial co-occurrence network, the Pearson correlation coefficient between pairs of OTUs was calculated in R software using the Hmisc package [\[22](#page-7-0)]. Correlation coefficients with an r *>* 0.3 or r *<* 0.3 and p-value*<*0.05 were selected as significant relationships for network drawing and were visualized using Cytoscape software [\[23](#page-7-0)]. The co-occurrence network was constructed at the species level in COVID-19 and HC groups. Afterward, the hub OTUs at the species level were identified using the cytoHubba plugin of Cytoscape based on Maximal Clique Centrality (MCC) algorithm [[24\]](#page-7-0).

3. Results

3.1. Comparing the microbial community in COVID-19 patients and healthy individuals

Based on taxonomic analysis ([Fig. 1](#page-2-0)), *Actinobacteria* and *Firmicutes* were the two predominant phyla that comprise about 90% of the relative abundance distribution in both groups. At the class level, *Clostridia*

Fig. 2. Alpha diversity results, results were visualized with Box and whisker plot; respectively, Phylogenetic diversity (A), Shannon entropy (B), Chao1 (C), Total number (D), and Simpson's index (E).

Fig. 3. Beta diversity results; results were visualized by using a principal coordinate aalysis (PCoA); respectively, Weighted UniFrac (A), Unweighted UniFrac (B), Jaccard (C), and Bray-Curtis (D).

(67%), *Actinobacteria* (12%), and *Bacilli* (6.7%) were the three dominant classes in healthy individuals. Whereas, in COVID-19 patients, *Clostridia* (48%), *Actinobacteria* (25%), and *Bacilli* (9.6%) were the three prevalent classes. At the family level, *Lachnospiraceae* (31%), *Ruminococcaceae* (15%), and *Bifidobacteriaceae* (12%) were the three dominant families in healthy individuals. Whereas, *Lachnospiraceae* (31%), *Streptococcaceae* (21%), and *Ruminococcaceae* (8.6%) were the three dominant families in COVID-19 patients.

3.2. Differential abundance analysis between COVID-19 patients and healthy individuals

Based on the differential abundance analysis results ([Table 2](#page-3-0)), respectively, *Rothia mucilaginosa (species)*, *Blautia* (genus), *Streptococcus* (genus), and *Streptococcus anginosus* (species) were the four taxonomic levels with the highest fold change in COVID-19 group. On the other hand, SMB53 (genus), *Bifidobacterium adolescentis* (species), *Dorea* (genus), *Clostridiaceae* (family), and *Faecalibacterium prausnitzii* (species) were the most prevalent taxonomic levels with the highest fold change in healthy individuals.

3.3. Diversity analyses

According to the alpha diversity results ([Fig. 2](#page-3-0)), the Shannon entropy $(P = 0.02)$, Total number $(P = 0.001)$, and Chao1 $(P = 0.003)$ indices were significantly higher in healthy people compared to COVID-19 patients. The phylogenetic diversity and Simpson's indices were not statistically significant between the groups. The results revealed that the richness and evenness of healthy individuals' gut microbiomes are higher than those of COVID-19 patients.

The beta diversity results (Fig. 3) revealed that COVID-19 patients

and healthy individuals have completely distinct gut microbiome compositions. According to the PERMANOVA analysis, the Unweighted UniFrac ($P = 0.00003$), Weighted UniFrac ($P = 0.00028$), Bray-Curtis (P $= 0.00001$), and Jaccard (P $= 0.00001$) indices were found to be statistically significant in COVID-19 patients versus healthy individuals.

3.4. Co-occurrence network and selection of hub OTUs at the species level

The co-occurrence network in COVID-19 and healthy groups was constructed at the species level. The co-occurrence network of the COVID-19 group had 43 nodes and 67 edges [\(Fig. 5\)](#page-6-0); whereas, the cooccurrence network of the HC group had 43 nodes and 50 edges ([Fig. 4\)](#page-5-0). According to the results, 67 connections were found in the COVID-19 group; All connections are positive. The strongest correlations were between the *species Rothia mucilaginosa* and *Rothia aeria* (r = 0.996), *Bacteroides eggerthii* and *Akkermansia muciniphila* (r = 0.995) and *Bulleidia moorei* and *Rothia mucilaginosa* (r = 0.989). Also, in the HC group, 50 connections were found that all connections are positive. The strongest correlations were between the species *Akkermansia muciniphila* and *Shigella sonnei* (r = 0.996), *Eubacterium biforme* and *Ruminococcus callidus* ($r = 0.995$) and *Eubacterium biforme* and *Prevotella copri* ($r =$ 0.995). Furthermore, the top 10 hub OTUs at the species level were determined based on MCC algorithms. According to the result, *Bifidobacterium longum* is the hub species in HC group with the highest MCC score. On the other hand, *Veillonella parvula* is the hub species in COVID-19 group with the highest MCC score. The top 10 hub OTUs in COVID-19 and HC groups are inserted in Supplementary file 1.

4. Discussion

In this study, the intestinal microbiome of healthy individuals and

Fig. 4. The bacterial co-occurrence network of the HC group at the species level; the green rectangles indicted bacterial species and black lines indicate interactions between them. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the Web version of this article.)

COVID-19 patients are evaluated ecologically and taxonomically. According to the results, the microbiome of COVID-19 patients has less biodiversity than healthy people, and the microbiome of healthy people is much richer than that of COVID-19 patients. The results also revealed that opportunistic bacteria and pathogens are prevalent in the microbiome of COVID-19 patients. On the other hand, beneficial bacteria are dominant in the microbiome of healthy people, which demonstrates the dynamism and healthy status of their intestines.

In the current study*, R. mucilaginosa* was found that have the highest log(FC) in the microbiome of the COVID-19 group. *R. mucilaginosa* is one of the oral and respiratory tract flora. This Gram-positive coccus is occasionally observed in the gastrointestinal system [\[25](#page-7-0)], which can appear as a pathogen that causes several infections, such as bacteremia, meningitis, pneumonia, and other manifestations, notably under immunocompromised conditions [\[26](#page-7-0)]. Wu et al. showed that *R. mucilaginosa* was enriched in COVID-19 patients' feces that seemed

Fig. 5. The bacterial co-occurrence network of the COVID-19 group at the species level; the green rectangles indicted bacterial species and black lines indicate interactions between them. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the Web version of this article.)

associated with growth potential of pathogenic bacteria or the extra-intestinal microbe's migration into the gut [\[27](#page-7-0)]. Furthermore, previous research confirmed that COVID-19 suffered patients, especially in severe cases, with cardiovascular disorder tended to have a greater prevalence of the genus Rothia related with SARS-CoV-2, and can be used as a marker to detect the increased risk in people with covid-19 [[28\]](#page-7-0). Also, *S. anginosus* is another Gram-positive opportunistic bacterium that can lead to various diseases. Complications of infection with this bacterium include pneumonia and lung abscess under certain circumstances [[29\]](#page-7-0). *S. anginosus* and *Olsenella* normally form a biofilm in oropharynx to increase bacterial thriving and adherence [[30\]](#page-7-0). De Pascale et al. reported that in the patients of COVID-19 group, *S. anginosus* was significantly enriched in the lung microbiota compared to the non–COVID-19 group [\[31](#page-7-0)]. Indeed, two important bacteria that display a highist log (FC) in healthy people are *B. adolescentis* and *F. prausnitzii.* One of the prevalent and dominant bacteria in the intestinal flora of healthy people is *F. prausnitzii* that is regarded as an indicator of gastrointestinal health [\[32](#page-7-0)]. Based on the evidence, an imbalance in the composition of this bacterium is correlated with several diseases [\[33](#page-7-0)]. He et al. found that there was a negative correlation between the abundance of *F. prausnitzii* and severity of COVID-19 [\[34](#page-7-0)]. Additionally, Zuo et al. reported that *F. prausnitzii* was one of the most important bacterial species which showed an inverse association with severity of COVID-19 [[35\]](#page-7-0). Another beneficial bacterium is *B. adolescentis*, which is commonly found in the intestines of healthy people [[35\]](#page-7-0). Several benefits have been reported for this bacterium, one of which is antiviral properties against certain viruses [36–[38\]](#page-7-0). The presence of *B. adolescentis* was related with the higher effectivness of neutralising

antibodies to CoronaVac suggesting that the *B. adolescentis* may use as an adjuvant to overcoming waning immunity of inactivated vaccine [[39\]](#page-8-0).

Additionally, our result showed that *Bifidobacterium longum* and *Veillonella parvula* are the hub species with the highest MCC score in HC and COVID-19 groups, respectively. *V. parvula* is an anaerobic opportunistic coccus that leading to serious infection, in particular in individuals with immunological defects [[40\]](#page-8-0). Several studies presented that *V. parvula* is a marker for COVID-19 that can stimulate pro-inflammatory cytokines production such as TNF-a, and might induce responses of pro-oxidative and inflammatory which result in various respiratory infections outcomes [[41\]](#page-8-0).

Furthermore, *B. longum* is an obligatory anaerobic bacterium that inhabits in the intestine of human predominantly from premature infants to elderly individuals [\[42](#page-8-0)]. Multiple conventional probiotics such as *B. longum* potentially enhanced the antibodies level in viral infections [[43\]](#page-8-0). Li et al. reported that *Bifidobacterium* sp. significantly declined in the fecal samples of COVID-19 patients. They confirmed that immune responses of covid-19 patient to SARS-CoV-2 was improved by increasing the level of this bacteria and their metabolite inosine [[44\]](#page-8-0).

This study has illustrated the relationship between the intestinal microbiome and COVID-19. Consequently, considering the critical role of the intestinal microbiome in the human immune system and health, studies and clinical trials using beneficial probiotics such as*Bifidobacterium* and *Lactobacillus* to enrich and reinforce the composition of the intestinal microbiome can be evaluated for the prevention and treatment of COVID-19 patients. It should be noted that not all probiotics have the same function. *Bifidobacteria* and *Lactobacilli* can be used as two types of non-pathogenic and beneficial probiotics. However, the

arbitrary use of probiotics and other fermented products containing probiotics is not recommended. The effects of probiotics combating COVID-19 should be tested in randomized clinical trials (RCTs) to evaluate their impacts on the modulation and balance of intestinal microbial composition. It is likely that probiotic therapy may be used as a new therapeutic method to harmonize intestinal microbiota so as to prevent or treat COVID-19.

5. Conclusion

In this study, the alterations of the gut microbiome in COVID-19 patients compared to HC were evaluated using the metagenomic approach, the results of which revealed lower microbial biodiversity in the intestine of COVID-19 patients, when compared to healthy individuals. In fact, beneficial bacteria such as bifidobacteria were found to be more prevalent in healthy individuals than in COVID-19 patients, who were reported to have higher levels of opportunistic and pathogenic bacteria. Therefore, the restoration of dysbiotic gut microbiota with the use of probiotics for the prevention or treatment of COVID-19 could be examined as a therapeutic strategy.

Data availability statement

In this study, an available public dataset was analyzed. This dataset is located at the following address:

<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/bioproject/PRJNA636824/>

Funding

Not applicable for this study.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Acknowledgments

We would like to express our gratitude to the National Institute of Genetic Engineering and Biotechnology (Tehran, Iran) for supporting us during the course of this research.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.imu.2023.101239) [org/10.1016/j.imu.2023.101239.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.imu.2023.101239)

References

- [1] [Hu B, Guo H, Zhou P, Shi ZL. Characteristics of SARS-CoV-2 and COVID-19. Nat](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref1) [Rev Microbiol 2020;19:1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref1)–14.
- [2] [Mantovani A, Byrne CD, Zheng MH, Targher G. Diabetes as a risk factor for greater](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref2) [COVID-19 severity and in-hospital death: a meta-analysis of observational studies.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref2) [Nutr Metabol Cardiovasc Dis 2020;30:1236](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref2)–48.
- [3] [Gao F, Zheng KI, Wang XB, Sun QF, Pan KH, Wang TY, Chen YP, Targher G,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref3) [Byrne CD, George J, Zheng MH. Obesity is a risk factor for greater COVID-19](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref3) [severity. Diabetes Care 2020;43:e72](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref3)–4.
- [4] [Parveen R, Sehar N, Bajpai R, Agarwal NB. Association of diabetes and](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref4) [hypertension with disease severity in covid-19 patients: a systematic literature](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref4) [review and exploratory meta-analysis. Diabetes Res Clin Pract 2020;166:108295](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref4).
- [5] [Aggarwal G, Cheruiyot I, Aggarwal S, Wong J, Lippi G, Lavie CJ, Henry BM,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref5) [Sanchis-Gomar F. Association of cardiovascular disease with coronavirus disease](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref5) [2019 \(COVID-19\) severity: a meta-analysis. Curr Probl Cardiol 2020;45:100617](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref5).
- [6] [Sun P, Qie S, Liu Z, Ren J, Li K, Xi J. Clinical characteristics of hospitalized patients](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref6) [with SARS-CoV-2 infection: a single arm meta-analysis. J Med Virol 2020 Jun;92](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref6) [\(6\):612](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref6)–7.
- [7] a [Mubarak M, Nasri H. COVID-19 nephropathy; an emerging condition caused by](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/bib7a) [novel coronavirus infection. Journal of Nephropathology 2020 Jul 1;\(3\):9](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/bib7a).b [Wu Y,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/bib7b) [Xu X, Chen Z, Duan J, Hashimoto K, Yang L, Liu C, Yang C. Nervous system](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/bib7b)

[involvement after infection with COVID-19 and other coronaviruses. Brain Behav](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/bib7b) [Immun 2020;87:18](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/bib7b)–22.

- [8] [Liu PP, Blet A, Smyth D, Li H. The science underlying COVID-19: implications for](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref7) [the cardiovascular system. Circulation 2020;142:68](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref7)–78.
- [9] [Zhou Z, Zhao N, Shu Y, Han S, Chen B, Shu X. Effect of gastrointestinal symptoms](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref8) [in patients with COVID-19. Gastroenterology 2020;158:2294](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref8)–7.
- [10] [Ai JW, Zi H, Wang Y, Huang Q, Wang N, Li LY, Pei B, Ji J, Zeng XT. Clinical](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref9) [characteristics of COVID-19 patients with gastrointestinal symptoms: an analysis of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref9) even patients in China. Front Med 2020;7:308.
- [11] [Jing Y, Run-Qian L, Hao-Ran W, Hao-Ran C, Ya-Bin L, Yang G, Fei C. Potential](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref10) [influence of COVID-19/ACE2 on the female reproductive system. Mol Hum Reprod](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref10) [2020;26:367](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref10)–73.
- [12] [Xu H, Zhong L, Deng J, Peng J, Dan H, Zeng X, Li T, Chen Q. High expression of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref11) [ACE2 receptor of 2019-nCoV on the epithelial cells of oral mucosa. Int J Oral Sci](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref11) [2020;12:1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref11)–5.
- [13] [Valizadeh R, Baradaran A, Mirzazadeh A, Bhaskar LV. Coronavirus-nephropathy;](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref12) [renal involvement in COVID-19. J Ren Inj Prev 2020 Mar 9;9\(2\):e18](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref12).
- [14] [Zhang J, Wang S, Xue Y. Fecal specimen diagnosis 2019 novel](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref13) coronavirus–[infected pneumonia. J Med Virol 2020;92:680](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref13)–2.
- [15] [Kinross JM, Darzi AW, Nicholson JK. Gut microbiome-host interactions in health](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref14) [and disease. Genome Med 2011;3:1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref14)–12.
- [16] [Groves HT, Higham SL, Moffatt MF, Cox MJ, Tregoning JS. Respiratory viral](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref15) [infection alters the gut microbiota by inducing inappetence. mBio 2020;11.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref15) [e03236-19](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref15).
- [17] [Hanada S, Pirzadeh M, Carver KY, Deng JC. Respiratory viral infection-induced](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref16) [microbiome alterations and secondary bacterial pneumonia. Front Immunol 2018;](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref16) [9:2640.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref16)
- [18] [Zuo T, Zhang F, Lui GC, Yeoh YK, Li AY, Zhan H, Wan Y, Chung AC, Cheung CP,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref17) [Chen N, Lai CK. Alterations in gut microbiota of patients with COVID-19 during](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref17) [time of hospitalization. Gastroenterology 2020;159:944](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref17)–55.
- [19] [Xu R, Lu R, Zhang T, Wu Q, Cai W, Han X, Wan Z, Jin X, Zhang Z, Zhang C.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref18) [Temporal association between human upper respiratory and gut bacterial](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref18) [microbiomes during the course of COVID-19 in adults. Commun Biol 2021;4:1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref18)–11.
- [20] [Gu S, Chen Y, Wu Z, Chen Y, Gao H, Lv L, Guo F, Zhang X, Luo R, Huang C, Lu H.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref19) [Alterations of the gut microbiota in patients with coronavirus disease 2019 or](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref19) [H1N1 influenza. Clin Infect Dis 2020;71:2669](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref19)–78.
- [21] [Alharbi KS, Singh Y, Rawat S, Afzal O, Altamimi AS, Kazmi I, Al-Abbasi FA,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref20) [Alzarea SI, Singh SK, Bhatt S, Chellappan DK. Gut microbiota disruption in COVID-](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref20)[19 or post-COVID illness association with severity biomarkers: a possible role of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref20) [pre/pro-biotics in manipulating microflora. Chem Biol Interact 2022 May 1;358:](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref20) [109898.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref20)
- [22] [Harrell Jr FE, Harrell Jr MF. Package 'hmisc](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref21)'. CRAN2018 2019 Jan 25;2019:235–6.
- [23] [Smoot ME, Ono K, Ruscheinski J, Wang PL, Ideker T. Cytoscape 2.8: new features](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref22) [for data integration and network visualization. Bioinformatics 2011 Feb 1;27\(3\):](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref22) [431](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref22)–2.
- [24] [Chin CH, Chen SH, Wu HH, Ho CW, Ko MT, Lin CY. cytoHubba: identifying hub](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref23) [objects and sub-networks from complex interactome. BMC Syst Biol 2014 Dec;8\(4\):](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref23) $1 - 7$.
- [25] [Maraki S, Papadakis IS. Rothia mucilaginosa pneumonia: a literature review.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref24) [Infectious Diseases 2015;47:125](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref24)–9.
- [26] [Ramanan P, Barreto JN, Osmon DR, Tosh PK. Rothia bacteremia: a 10-year](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref25) [experience at mayo clinic, rochester, Minnesota. J Clin Microbiol 2014;52:3184.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref25)
- [27] [Wu Y, Cheng X, Jiang G, Tang H, Ming S, Tang L, Lu J, Guo C, Shan H, Huang X.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref26) [Altered oral and gut microbiota and its association with SARS-CoV-2 viral load in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref26) [COVID-19 patients during hospitalization. npj Biofilms and Microbiomes 2021;7](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref26) [\(1\):61](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref26).
- [28] [Marotz C, Belda-Ferre P, Ali F, Das P, Huang S, Cantrell K, Jiang L, Martino C,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref27) [Diner RE, Rahman G, McDonald D. SARS-CoV-2 detection status associates with](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref27) [bacterial community composition in patients and the hospital environment.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref27) [Microbiome 2021 Dec;9\(1\):1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref27)–5.
- [29] [Jiang S, Li M, Fu T, Shan F, Jiang L, Shao Z. Clinical characteristics of infections](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref28) [caused by Streptococcus Anginosus Group. Sci Rep 2020;10:1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref28)–6.
- [30] [Su TY, Lee MH, Huang CT, Liu TP, Lu JJ. The clinical impact of patients with](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref29) [bloodstream infection with different groups of Viridans group streptococci by using](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref29) [matrix-assisted laser desorption ionization](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref29)–time of flight mass spectrometry [\(MALDI-TOF MS\). Medicine 2018 Dec;97\(50\).](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref29)
- [31] [De Pascale G, De Maio F, Carelli S, De Angelis G, Cacaci M, Montini L, Bello G,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref30) [Cutuli SL, Pintaudi G, Tanzarella ES, Xhemalaj R. Staphylococcus aureus](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref30) [ventilator-associated pneumonia in patients with COVID-19: clinical features and](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref30) [potential inference with lung dysbiosis. Crit Care 2021 Dec;25\(1\):1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref30)–2.
- [32] [Sokol H, Thomas M, Wells JM, Langella. Faecalibacterium prausnitzii and human](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref31) [intestinal health. Curr Opin Microbiol 2013;16:255](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref31)–61.
- [33] Martín R, Bermúdez-Humarán LG, Langella P. Searching for the bacterial effector: [the example of the multi-skilled commensal bacterium Faecalibacterium](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref32) [prausnitzii. Front Microbiol 2018;9:346](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref32).
- [34] [He X, Zhao S, Li Y. Faecalibacterium prausnitzii: a next-generation probiotic in gut](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref33) [disease improvement. Can J Infect Dis Med Microbiol 2021 Mar 5;2021. 1-0](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref33).
- [35] [Zuo T, Zhang F, Lui GC, Yeoh YK, Li AY, Zhan H, Wan Y, Chung AC, Cheung CP,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref34) [Chen N, Lai CK. Alterations in gut microbiota of patients with COVID-19 during](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref34) [time of hospitalization. Gastroenterology 2020 Sep 1;159\(3\):944](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref34)–55.
- [36] [Duranti S, Ruiz L, Lugli GA, Tames H, Milani C, Mancabelli L, Mancino W,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref35) [Longhi G, Carnevali L, Sgoifo A, Margolles A. Bifidobacterium adolescentis as a key](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref35) [member of the human gut microbiota in the production of GABA. Sci Rep 2020;10:](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref35) 1–[13](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref35).

R. Maddah et al.

- [37] [Cha MK, Lee DK, An HM, Lee SW, Shin SH, Kwon JH, Kim KJ, Ha NJ. Antiviral](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref36) [activity of Bifidobacterium adolescentis SPM1005-A on human papillomavirus](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref36) [type 16. BMC Med 2012;10:1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref36)–6.
- [38] [Kim MJ, Lee DK, Park JE, Park IH, Seo JG, Ha NJ. Antiviral activity of](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref37) [Bifidobacterium adolescentis SPM1605 against coxsackievirus B3. Biotechnol](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref37) [Biotechnol Equip 2014;28:681](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref37)–8.
- [39] [Ng SC, Peng Y, Zhang L, Mok CK, Zhao S, Li A, Ching JY, Liu Y, Yan S, Chan DL,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref38) [Zhu J. Gut microbiota composition is associated with SARS-CoV-2 vaccine](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref38) [immunogenicity and adverse events. Gut 2022 Jun 1;71\(6\):1106](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref38)–16.
- [40] [Strach M, Siedlar M, Kowalczyk D, Zembala M, Grodzicki T. Sepsis caused by](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref39) [Veillonella parvula infection in a 17-year-old patient with X-linked](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref39)
- agammaglobulinemia (Bruton'[s disease\). J Clin Microbiol 2006 Jul;44\(7\):2655](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref39)–6. [41] [Devi P, Maurya R, Mehta P, Shamim U, Yadav A, Chattopadhyay P, Kanakan A,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref40) [Khare K, Vasudevan JS, Sahni S, Mishra P. Increased abundance of Achromobacter](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref40) [xylosoxidans and Bacillus cereus in upper airway transcriptionally active](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref40)

[microbiome of COVID-19 mortality patients indicates role of co-infections in](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref40) [disease severity and outcome. Microbiol Spectr 2022 Jun 29;10\(3\):e02311](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref40)–21.

- [42] [Kageyama Y, Nishizaki Y, Aida K, Yayama K, Ebisui T, Akiyama T, Nakamura T.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref41) [Lactobacillus plantarum induces innate cytokine responses that potentially provide](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref41) [a protective benefit against COVID-19: a single-arm, double-blind, prospective trial](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref41) [combined with an in vitro cytokine response assay. Exp Ther Med 2022 Jan 1;23](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref41) $(1):1-3.$ $(1):1-3.$
- [43] [Mirashrafi S, Moravejolahkami AR, Zehi ZB, Kermani MA, Bahreini-Esfahani N,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref42) [Haratian M, Dashti MG, Pourhossein M. The efficacy of probiotics on virus titres](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref42) [and antibody production in virus diseases: a systematic review on recent evidence](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref42) [for COVID-19 treatment. Clinical nutrition ESPEN 2021 Dec 1;46:1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref42)–8.
- [44] [Li S, Yang S, Zhou Y, Disoma C, Dong Z, Du A, Zhang Y, Chen Y, Huang W, Chen J,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref43) [Song D. Microbiome profiling using shotgun metagenomic sequencing identified](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref43) [unique microorganisms in COVID-19 patients with altered gut microbiota. Front](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref43) [Microbiol 2021 Oct 11;12:712081](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2352-9148(23)00081-3/sref43).