Differentiation of *Mycobacterium ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum*: Mapping of Their Relationships to *M. tuberculosis* by Fatty Acid Profile Analysis, DNA-DNA Hybridization, and 16S rRNA Gene Sequence Analysis

T. TØNJUM,^{1*} D. B. WELTY,² E. JANTZEN,³ and P. L. SMALL²

*Section of Molecular Microbiology, Institute of Microbiology, University of Oslo, National Hospital, N-0027 Oslo,*¹ *and Department of Vaccinology, National Institute of Public Health, N-0403 Oslo,*³ *Norway, and Microscopy Section, Rocky Mountain Laboratory, National Institutes of Health, Hamilton, Montana*²

Received 25 July 1997/Returned for modification 1 October 1997/Accepted 13 November 1997

Although *Mycobacterium ulcerans***,** *M. marinum***, and** *M. haemophilum* **are closely related, their exact taxonomic placements have not been determined. We performed gas chromatography of fatty acids and alcohols, as well as DNA-DNA hybridization and 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis, to clarify their relationships to each other and to** *M. tuberculosis. M. ulcerans* **and** *M. marinum* **were most closely related to one another, and each displayed very strong genetic affinities to** *M. tuberculosis***; they are actually the two mycobacterial species outside the** *M. tuberculosis* **complex most closely related to** *M. tuberculosis***.** *M. haemophilum* **was more distinct from** *M. ulcerans* **and** *M. marinum***, and it appeared to be as related to these two species as to** *M. tuberculosis***. These results are important with regard to the development of diagnostic and epidemiological tools such as speciesspecific DNA probes and PCR assays for** *M. ulcerans***,** *M. marinum***, and** *M. haemophilum***. In addition, the finding that** *M. ulcerans* **and** *M. marinum* **are more closely related to** *M. tuberculosis* **than are other pathogenic mycobacterial species suggests that they may be evaluated as useful models for studying the pathogenesis of** *M. tuberculosis***.** *M. marinum* **may be particularly useful in this regard since strains of this species grow much more rapidly than** *M. tuberculosis* **and yet can cause systemic disease in immunocompromised hosts.**

Mycobacterium marinum, *M. haemophilum*, and *M. ulcerans* are slowly growing mycobacterial species with optimal growth temperatures of 28 to 33°C. These organisms are emerging as clinically significant pathogens and are primarily associated with skin infections (13, 21, 47), although *M. marinum* and *M. haemophilum* are capable of causing systemic disease in immunocompromised patients (21, 47). *M. marinum* is widely distributed and gives rise to infections in temperate climates. *M. marinum*, which was previously also designated *M. balnei*, was first described in Sweden and has been known as the cause of "fish tank granulomas" (35). *M. haemophilum* was only recently recognized (48). It is now regarded as a relatively common pathogen of immunosuppressed patients, with infections with this organism typically occurring following organ transplantation and in association with human immunodeficiency virus infection (29, 47).

M. ulcerans appears to have a much more limited range of distribution and is the cause of infections primarily in tropical climates. Infections with this species present characteristically as extensive skin ulceration with scarring and were initially recognized as the causative agent of Buruli ulcer in Uganda (7, 8, 12) and later in central African countries (5, 19, 39, 41). *M. ulcerans* has recently received some attention from the clinical epidemiological side due to outbreaks in central African areas $(21, 37, 38)$, also in conjunction with human immunodeficiency virus infections (1). However, *M. ulcerans* skin infections have

also been described in Australia, where outbreaks have occurred recently (16, 18, 28, 51). In contrast to other mycobacterial agents, culture filtrates and viable organisms of *M. ulcerans* strains have shown cytotoxic activity in cell culture assays, and this toxin has been implicated as the cause of both focal necrosis and focal inflammation (22, 40, 44). A defined cytotoxic substance has not yet been isolated. The natural reservoir of *M. ulcerans* remains unknown, despite attempts to find the pathogen in resident flora and fauna (41). The incidence of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum* as causes of infection may be seriously underestimated due to the long incubation time for *M. ulcerans* and the fact that culture of clinical specimens other than skin biopsy specimens at 37°C usually does not result in the isolation of these species.

Once cultured, *M. marinum* and *M. haemophilum* are readily identified by using conventional mycobacterium characterization methods. *M. marinum* grows relatively quickly (5 to 14 days) and is easily recognized due to its photochromogenicity. *M. haemophilum* is characterized by its enhanced growth requirement for iron (42, 48), although recent evidence suggests that this requirement is not absolute (47a). *M. ulcerans* strains are often difficult to isolate from primary culture, and due to their long generation time, they need at least 4 to 6 weeks to form colonies. Definitive identification of *M. ulcerans* strains is particularly time-consuming due to the slow growth and weak phenotypic expression, except for the presence of a heat-stable catalase, in conventional tests. The characteristics of the clinical lesion(s) and knowledge about geographic location can provide a presumptive tentative diagnosis, which is important for establishing the clinical prognosis, but definitive identification has required inoculation into animals, preferably guinea pigs.

^{*} Corresponding author. Present address: Department of Microbiology and Immunology, University of Michigan Medical School, 5641 Medical Science Building II, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-0620. Phone: (313) 647 6765. Fax: (313) 764 3562. E-mail: tone.tonjum@rh.uio.no.

^a NCTC, National Collection of Type Cultures; ATCC, American Type Culture Collection; TMC, Trudeau Mycobacterial Collection; CCUG, Culture Collection, University of Gothenburg, Gothenburg, Sweden; NIPH, National Institute of Public Health.

M. ulcerans, *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum* are closely related, but their exact taxonomic placements have not been completely delineated. Only scarce information is available on these species on the genomic level (2, 4, 20, 24). Recently, the molecular typing of *M. ulcerans* and *M. haemophilum* has been described (25, 30). Although the 16S rRNA gene sequences of all three species have been determined (31, 43, 56), this has provided inadequate information for definitive species identification since *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* display identical signature regions (31) and have only two single-nucleotide differences in the $3'$ part of the gene (23, 43). Furthermore, their relationships to *M. tuberculosis* have not been detailed.

In the present study we have investigated the molecular and biochemical characteristics of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M.*

haemophilum to clarify how they are interrelated and to improve the classificatory placements of these species. We also sought to investigate the heterogeneity of strains currently assigned to these species. Information from DNA-DNA hybridization and 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis, as well as from gas chromatography of fatty acids and alcohols, was used. These findings may be useful in for the development of nucleic acid-based tests for the direct detection of these species in clinical settings and epidemiological investigations.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Bacterial strains, growth conditions, and conventional characterization. The strains investigated in this study are listed in Table 1. The strains were grown on Middlebrook 7H9 and 7H10 with 10% acid-albumin-dextrose-catalase (Difco) broth and agar plates, respectively, at 31°C. For the *M. haemophilum* strains, the media were supplemented with ferric ammonium citrate and the atmosphere was enriched with 10% CO₂. The conventional characterization methods consisted of microscopy after Ziehl-Neelsen staining, evaluation of growth on Lowenstein-Jensen slants and Middlebrook medium, photochromogenicity assay, investigation of heat-stable catalase, and association with clinical presentation and geographic location (33, 53). Assignment to a species was based on conventional gas chromatography characterization (27).

Lipid analyses. Gas chromatography of fatty acids and alcohols was performed as described previously (27). A Perkin-Elmer Autosystem gas chromatograph (Perkin-Elmer Cetus, Norwalk, Conn.) equipped with a standard methyl siliconecoated fused-silica capillary column $(30 \text{ m})\dot{y}$ 0.2 mm) was used, and the inlet was in the splitless mode. The temperature of both the injector and the detector was 350°C. The column was operated at 80 to 280°C; the temperature was increased by 8°C/min, and a carrier gas (He) flow rate of 1 ml/min was used. Peak areas and retention times were recorded with a Perkin-Elmer 1020 integrator.

Principal-component analysis of the fatty acid data was performed as described previously (26) by using the SIRIUS program (Pattern Recognition Systems Ltd., Bergen, Norway), which includes a SIMCA principal component analysis element. The principles of SIMCA have been described previously (55). Briefly, (i) the raw gas chromatographic data (fatty acid profile of each strain) are loaded into the computer program. (ii) These raw data are transformed into the corresponding logarithmic values after the addition of the value of 1.0 to each datum. (iii) The computer program then calculates the number of statistically significant principal components and their relative contribution to the variation within the fatty acid profiles from the strains and then creates the plots.

DNA isolation. *M. tuberculosis* cells were heat inactivated for 20 min at 80°C in $1\times$ TE buffer (0.01 M Tris-HCl [pH 7.5], 0.001 M EDTA). The cell suspension was treated with lysozyme at 37°C for 1 to 16 h. Lysis was performed with a sodium dodecyl sulfate-proteinase K mixture at 65°C for 1 h or until lysis was obtained. The lysate was treated with NaCl and cetyltrimetylammonium bromide-NaCl at 65°C for 10 min, and chloroform extraction was performed (52). The supernatant was precipitated with isopropanol, and after washing, the pellet was resuspended in TE buffer and the mixture was heated for 10 min at 65°C.

DNA-DNA hybridization. DNA-DNA hybridization was performed essentially as described previously (49).

(i) Dot blot filters. For each strain, eight parallel dots of single-stranded genomic DNA and Tris-EDTA buffer control were blotted onto nitrocellulose paper. The filters were stored dry.

(ii) Labelling of probes. Mechanically fragmented genomic DNA probes were labelled with $\left[\frac{32}{2}\right]$ dCTP to a specific activity of 10^8 cpm with a random priming labelling kit (Amersham International, Buckinghamshire, United Kingdom) according to the manufacturer's recommendations.

(iii) Hybridization. Hybridization was performed in a Hyb-Aid hybridization oven with a hybridization fluid consisting of denatured probe DNA, SSC (0.15 M NaCl plus 0.015 M sodium citrate), $2 \times$ Denhardt's solution, 0.5% sodium dodecyl sulfate, 0.1 mg of denatured salmon sperm DNA per ml, and 10% dextran sulfate. The modifications used to increase the stringency of the hybridization procedure were a temperature of 70°C and sodium salt concentrations in the prehybridization and hybridization fluids of 0.1 M. The posthybridization washes were also performed at 70°C and with a sodium salt concentration of 0.1 M. The hybridization results for the dot blot were obtained by overnight autoradiography (Hyperfilm MP; Amersham International) and scintillation counting (Packard Instruments and Beckman) of standardized pieces cut from the nitrocellulose filter with a self-designed vacuum cutting device.

(iv) Quantitation of the dot blot hybridization reaction. The mean counts per minute for the eight parallel dots minus the counts per minute for the control (salmon sperm DNA) was determined for each of the strains. The mean counts per minute for the autologous strains was defined as representing a DNA homology ratio or a relative binding ratio (RBR) of 100%. The mean RBR for each strain was calculated by dividing the mean counts per minute for each strain by the mean counts per minute for the autologous reaction and multiplying by 100. The 95% confidence interval of the sample mean of the RBRs was estimated (49).

(v) Selection of *M. marinum* **hybridization probe.** Clone pMm5 from an *M. marinum* genomic pHC79 cosmid library was selected because of its lack of affinity to *M. ulcerans* DNA by Southern hybridization. This clone was used as probe DNA in parallel with the total genomic DNA probes.

PCR. Synthetic oligonucleotides (Genosys Biotechnologies, Inc., The Woodlands, Tex.) were made from conserved areas of the 16S rRNA gene molecule that were most convenient for PCR and DNA sequencing. The nucleotide sequences of the primers used were as follows: primer 285, 5'-GAGAGTTTGAT CCTGGCTCAG-3'; primer 244, 5'-CCCACTGCTGCCTCCCGTAG-3' primer 259, 5'-TTTCACGAACAACGCGACAA-3'; primer 248, 5'-GTGTGG GTTTCCTTCCTTGG-3'; primer 264, 5'-TGCACACAGGCCACAAGGGA-3' (31); primer rRog, 5'-AAGGAGGTGATCCAGCCGCA-3' (45); primer TT85, 5'-CAACCGCACCCGGAACTG-3'; and primer TT86, 5'-GTCCCGAAATAT CTCGAC-3'. Fragments were amplified in 50 - μ l reaction mixtures containing 10 ng of template DNA, 10 mM Tris-HCl (pH 8.0), 50 mM KCl, 2 mM $MgCl₂$, 200 μ M (each) dATP, dCTP, dGTP, and dTTP (Pharmacia LKB Biotechnology AB, Bromma, Sweden), 0.001% (wt/vol) gelatin, $0.5 \mu M$ (each) primer, and 1 U of Amplitaq DNA polymerase (Perkin-Elmer Cetus, Norwalk, Conn.). Each sample was amplified for 25 cycles of 45 s at 95°C, 1 min at 65°C, and 1 min at 72°C in a DNA thermal cycler (TA9600; Perkin-Elmer Cetus). For the negative controls, buffer instead of DNA was added. The PCR products were visualized by electrophoresis in a 0.8% agarose gel (SeaKem GTG; FMC Bioproducts, Rockville, Md.) to monitor size and specificity. The PCR products were prepared for DNA sequence analysis by purification in Magic Wizard columns (Promega, Madison, W is.)

DNA sequence analysis. Sequencing reactions with the Taq DyeDeoxy terminator cycle sequencing kit (Applied Biosystems Inc., Foster City, Calif.) were performed with 7μ l of PCR-amplified DNA as the template and 3.2 pmol of either primer. The unincorporated dye terminators and primers were separated from the extension products by spin column purification (Centri-Sep; Princeton Separations Inc., Adelphia, N.J.). The products were dried in a vacuum centrifuge, resuspended in $\frac{1}{4}$ μ l of loading buffer (5:1 deionized formamide, 50 mM EDTA [pH 8.0]), heat denatured for 2 min at 90°C, and immediately loaded onto an acrylamide gel in an automated DNA sequencer (model 373A; Applied Biosystems Inc.). Both strands of the 16S rRNA gene were sequenced, and ubiquitous areas were resequenced. The DNA sequence data were compiled and were analyzed by computer with the MacVector program (version 5.0; Oxford Molecular Group PLC, Oxford, United Kingdom).

The 16S rRNA and/or 16S rRNA gene sequences 22 mycobacterial species and *Nocardia asteroides* were obtained from GenBank. The accession numbers of these respective sequences are as follows: *M. ulcerans* ATCC 19423, Z13990 and X58954; *M. marinum* FIB, X52920; *M. haemophilum* NCTC 11185T, L24800; *M. tuberculosis* Rv, X52917; *M. terrae* ATCC 15755T, M29568 and X52925; *M. hiberniae* ATCC 9874T, X67096; *M. nonchromogenicum* ATCC 19530T, M29565 and X52928, *M. celatum* ATCC 51131, L08170; *M. cookii* ATCC 49103, X53896; *M. shimoidei* ATCC 27962, X82459 and Z27069; *M. xenopi* ATCC 19250T, X52929; *M. asiaticum* ATCC 25276T, M29556 and X55604; *M. gordonae* ATCC 14470T, M29563 and X52923; *M. leprae* LTB, X55587; *M. gastrii* and *M. kansasii* ATCC 12478T, M29575; *M. scrofulaceum* ATCC 19981T, X52924; "*M. paraffinicum*" LT, L08169; *M. szulgai* ATCC 25799T, X52926; *M. malmoense* ATCC 29571T, X52930; *M. intracellulare* ATCC 15985, X52927; *M. paratuberculosis* ATCC 19698T, X52934; *M. avium* DSM 43216, X52918; and *N. asteroides* ATCC 3306, X57949. The sequences from our 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis of the *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum* strains were aligned with the selected 16S rRNA sequences retrieved from GenBank by the multisequence alignment program Pileup (11) and with Clustal personal computer software packages. The alignment was edited by removing all positions at which any sequence contained an ambiguous or undetermined nucleotide. Phylogenetic relationships were inferred by using version 3.4 of the PHYLIP software package (15). A dendrogram was constructed by the distance-based, neighbor-joining method (46) by using the sequence from *N. asteroides* as the outgroup (the nonrelated species used to root the tree). The reproducibility of the tree nodes was analyzed by bootstrapping (15).

RESULTS

Gas chromatography. The strains of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, *M. haemophilum*, and *M. tuberculosis* were clearly distinguished by their fatty acid profiles. Three categories of fatty acids were represented among the four species examined: straight-chain saturated, straight-chain monounsaturated, and methyl branched, including long-chain mycolic acid cleavage products (Table 2). *M. ulcerans* strains were characterized by a 2,4,6-trimethyl tetracosanoic acid (2,4,6Me24:0), as described previously by semiquantitative analysis (9, 10, 32). *M. marinum* was the only species containing 2,4-dimethyl hexadecanoic acid (2,4Me16:0). A feature of *M. haemophilum* not seen in the other species was higher amounts of docosanoic acid (22:0) than tetracosanoic acid (24:0), which has also been described previously (42). The *M. tuberculosis* isolates consistently contained a relatively high amount of tuberculostearic acid (10Me18:0) and hexacosanoic acid (26:0) (27, 36). Long-chain secondary alcohols characteristic of strains of the *M. avium* complex and several other mycobacterial species (27, 36) were not detected. As seen in Fig. 1 and Table 2, when analyzed by principal-component analysis (27), the overall differences in fatty acid profiles gave four distinct clusters representing the four species investigated.

DNA-DNA hybridization. Mean RBRs of DNAs from strains of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, *M. haemophilum*, and *M. tuberculosis* and reference strains of other mycobacterial species hybridized with total genomic DNA probes of the type and reference strains of the same species are shown in Fig. 2 and

Fatty acid ^{a}	Range (mean) % of total amt of fatty acids					
	<i>M. ulcerans</i> $(n = 7)$	M. marinum $(n = 12)$	<i>M.</i> tuberculosis $(n = 7)$	M. haemophilum $(n = 9)$		
14:0	$0.1 - 1.5(0.9)$	$0.4 - 1.5(1.0)$	$0.5 - 4.4(1.2)$	$1.7 - 3.4(2.7)$		
15:0	$0.1 - 0.9(0.4)$	$0.2 - 1.1(0.6)$	$0.4 - 1.0(0.7)$	$0.2 - 0.6(0.4)$		
16:1a	$0.3 - 2.0(0.9)$	$0.7 - 4.2(1.9)$	$0-1.5(0.5)$	$0.5 - 2.8(1.0)$		
16:1 _b	$0.3 - 4.3(2.4)$	$1.3 - 5.8(3.3)$	$1.9 - 5.3(2.6)$	$3.3 - 8.2(6.3)$		
16:0	$17.5 - 23.9(19.8)$	$24.1 - 31.2(26.6)$	$24.2 - 41.8$ (31.4)	$28.6 - 35.9$ (32.4)		
10Me17:0	$0.2 - 1.0(0.5)$	$0-1.4(0.6)$	$0.3 - 0.7(0.6)$	$1.1 - 1.8(1.5)$		
$2,4$ Me $16:0^b$		$0.1 - 8.5$ (3.4 ^b)				
17:1	$0.1 - 1.0(0.7)$	$0.5 - 4.4(1.3)$	$0.4 - 1.2(0.6)$	$0.3 - 0.7(0.5)$		
17:0	$0.3 - 1.8(1.2)$	$0.5 - 6.4(1.8)$	$0.9 - 4.4(2.7)$	$0.2 - 0.4(0.4)$		
18:1a	$2.8 - 6.0(4.0)$	$1.5 - 9.9(6.7)$	$0.1 - 1.0(0.5)$	$2.0 - 5.4(4.3)$		
18:1 _b	$10.3 - 23.4(14.6)$	$21.7 - 39.2$ (30.8)	$9.5 - 23.6(15.1)$	$19.7 - 23.7(21.7)$		
18:0	$8.7 - 20.5(14.5)$	$3.7 - 10.9(7.8)$	$4.8 - 9.2(7.2)$	$4.3 - 8.2(6.7)$		
10Me18:0	$1.1 - 5.1(2.9)$	$0.5 - 9.0(4.0)$	$14.0 - 28.8$ (18.3)	$9.2 - 13.9$ (11.7)		
20:0	$1.9 - 3.8(2.8)$	$0.1 - 0.8$ (0.4)	$0.7 - 2.5(1.2)$	$0.5 - 1.0$ (0.7)		
22:0	$2.2 - 3.8$ (2.9)	$0.2 - 1.6(0.7)$	$0.3 - 1.2(0.5)$	$1.8 - 7.9$ (3.9)		
24:0	$2.3 - 18.5$ (12.5)	$1.2 - 14.3(5.5)$	$0.8 - 3.6(1.9)$	$1.3 - 5.1(3.1)$		
TriMe24:0	$6.4 - 24.0$ (17.6)	$0-1.7(0.8)$				
26:0		$0 - 3.7$ (trace)	$2.2 - 16.9(9.0)$	0–4.1 c (trace)		

TABLE 2. Fatty acid contents of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, *M. tuberculosis*, and *M. haemophilum* analyzed by gas chromatography (as methyl esters) and identified by retention characteristics

^a The number before the colon sign indicates the number of the carbon atoms in the chain, and the number after the colon represents the number of double bonds.
The prefix denotes the number and position of the methyl sid

Fatty acids and percentages in boldface type are useful for differentiation among species.

^c Found in three strains.

Table 3. Total genomic DNA of the reference strain *M. ulcerans* TMC 1615, which was used as a probe, gave mean intraspecies RBRs ranging from 87 to 101%. Strain TMC 1615 DNA had mean RBRs of 25 to 47% for binding to strains of *M. marinum*, 25 to 34% for binding to *M. tuberculosis*, and 22 to 30% for binding to *M. haemophilum*. Total genomic DNA of *M. haemophilum* NCTC 11185 hybridized to the DNAs of other *M. haemophilum* strains, with mean RBRs ranging from 88 to 102%. *M. marinum* DNAs displayed more heterogeneous intraspecies RBRs than the other species investigated. Intraspecies variation in DNAs from *M. marinum* strains yielded RBRs ranging from 72 to 101%. RBRs of 30 to 41% were found between *M. marinum* and both *M. tuberculosis* and *M. ulcerans*, and RBRs of 17 to 28% were found between *M. marinum* and *M. haemophilum*. Toward *M. tuberculosis* DNAs, *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum* DNAs had RBRs of 32 to 38, 25 to 38, and 22 to 26%, respectively. Cosmid clone pMm5 from *M. marinum* detected all *M. marinum* DNAs tested (RBR range, 89 to 104%). This probe also discriminated better between DNAs from *M. marinum* and the other mycobacterial species investigated (including those from *M. ulcerans*) than did total DNA because it did not have heterologous RBRs higher than 19% (Fig. 2).

16S rRNA gene sequence analysis. The DNA sequence of 1469 to 1482 bp of the 16S rRNA genes of five strains were analyzed, namely, *M. ulcerans* TMC 1615 (reference strain), *M. marinum* CCUG 20998 (type strain), T24/83, and MNC195, and *M. haemophilum* NCTC 11185 (type strain). The 16S rRNA gene sequences between these species and *M. tuberculosis* were mutually conserved except at base pairs 129, 130, 186 to 192, 193, 198, 200, 201, 456, 463, 1248, and 1289, according to the numbering for the *Escherichia coli* 16S rRNA gene (6, 14). The 16S rRNA gene sequences of the three *M. marinum* strains examined were identical. The sequences of the *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* strains were identical in the 16S rRNA gene signature region and throughout the gene had only two single-nucleotide differences between them (nucleotides 1248 and 1289). The 16S rRNA gene sequences for *M. ulcerans*

TMC 1615, *M. marinum* CCUG 20998T , T24/83, and MNC195, and *M. haemophilum* NCTC 11185^T obtained in this study were otherwise identical to the sequences in GenBank. The 16S rRNA gene sequences determined for *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum* were compared to the 16S rRNA gene sequences of 19 other species of slowly growing mycobacteria from GenBank. A phylogenetic tree constructed on the basis of these data is presented in Fig. 3.

DISCUSSION

Detection of heat-stable catalase is the only phenotypic characteristic available for the identification of *M. ulcerans*, and definitive identification has relied on injection of strains into guinea pigs or mouse footpads. Two of the isolates analyzed in this study, TMC 1617 (the type strain) and ATCC 10013, showed increased growth rates, and they were deficient in toxin production and had attenuated virulence when they were injected intradermally into guinea pigs. This led to the concern that these isolates had been misidentified. However, gas chromatography, DNA-DNA hybridization, and heat-stable catalase production confirmed their identities as *M. ulcerans*. Since these isolates were originally obtained from patients with clinical cases of ulcerating disease, it is clear that *M. ulcerans*, like many pathogenic bacteria, can lose their virulence through subculture.

The gas chromatographic results (Fig. 1; Table 2) revealed that *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, *M. haemophilum*, and *M. tuberculosis* were clearly distinguishable from each other by their fatty acid and alcohol profiles. It is interesting that the *M. haemophilum* strains appeared as a very homogeneous cluster, despite the diverse sources of the strains (Table 1). The seven strains of *M. tuberculosis* examined comprised a fairly homogeneous group, with reference strain H37Rv being a typical member, whereas the *M. marinum* cluster emerged as a more heterogeneous group. The inter- and intraspecies affinities revealed by these phenotypic characteristics were convincingly confirmed by the nucleic acid analysis.

FIG. 1. Principal-component plots based on the fatty acid profiles of the individual mycobacterial strains. (A) Component 1 versus component 2. (B) Component 1 versus component 3. (C) Component 2 versus component 3. Each point represents one strain. *M. tub*., *M. tuberculosis*; *M. ulc*., *M. ulcerans*, *M. haem*., *M. haemophilum*.

DNA-DNA hybridization demonstrated a particularly close relationship between *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M. tuberculosis*. *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* were just sufficiently different to be considered separate species (Fig. 2 and Table 3) (54), and their relationships to *M. tuberculosis* were found to be closer than was previously recognized. The strong affinities of *M. marinum* versus *M. tuberculosis* and *M. ulcerans* versus *M. tuberculosis* have apparently been overlooked, probably because of the few hybridization data that have been available for these species. Moreover, the sparse data that did exist were based on DNAs from single isolates (20, 24). To distinguish between bacterial DNAs with high guanine-plus-cytosine contents, such as for mycobacteria, DNA-DNA hybridization conditions need to be highly stringent, as provided by the 0.1 M sodium salt concentration and the 70°C hybridization and wash temperature used in this study. The high $G+C$ content and the consequent high denaturation and annealing temperatures used may lead to a shift in hybridization kinetics. This may make it difficult to compare these hybridization results directly to the results of similar studies comparing bacterial DNAs with lower G+C contents. Cosmid clone pMm5 from *M. marinum* detected all *M. marinum* DNAs tested and also discriminated better between *M. marinum* and the other mycobacterial DNAs investigated, displaying promising results for the development of an *M. marinum* species-specific DNA probe (Fig. 2 and Table 3).

In this study we determined the nearly complete DNA sequences of the 16S rRNA genes from *M. ulcerans* TMC 1615, *M. haemophilum* NCTC 11185, and three *M. marinum* isolates, CCUG 20998, T24/83, and MNC195. When these sequences were compared to the 21 16S rRNA gene sequences of slowly growing mycobacteria from GenBank, a phylogenetic tree could be constructed (Fig. 3). Evidently, *M. marinum* and *M. ulcerans* are more closely related to *M. tuberculosis* than are any of the mycobacterial species commonly used as model systems for studying tuberculosis, such as *M. avium* and *M. intracellulare. M. marinum* replicates within macrophages and resides in an endosomal compartment which is developmentally retarded and which does not fuse with the lysosomal compartment, and like *M. tuberculosis*, it readily kills infected macrophages (3). This species may therefore provide an improved model for studying the interaction of *M. tuberculosis* with macrophages.

M. marinum and *M. ulcerans* have identical sequences in the mycobacterial 16S rRNA gene signature region (31). The only 16S rRNA sequence differences found were A versus G at position 1248 for *M. marinum* and *M. ulcerans*, respectively, and A versus C at position 1289, respectively, as described previously (23, 43). The *M. ulcerans* strains analyzed in this study were type 2 strains belonging to the Institute of Tropical Medicine (ITM) and originated in Australia (43). Considerable phenotypic variation was found among the *M. marinum* isolates examined with regard to colony morphology, growth temperature limitation, and pigmentation. The isolates analyzed were obtained from humans with infections, fish, and water. Not surprisingly, therefore, our hybridization data showed that the *M. marinum* group appeared to be more heterogeneous than the groups of the other mycobacterial species examined. However, the 16S rRNA gene sequences from all three *M. marinum* isolates were identical.

Despite the high degree of homology at the 16S rRNA gene sequence level, DNAs from strains of *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* analyzed with the *M. tuberculosis* complex-specific PCR test Amplicor (Roche, Basel, Switzerland), which uses the 16S rRNA gene signature region as a target template (50), repeatedly gave negative results (50a). The observed lack of cross-reactivity of nucleic acids from *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* in this established diagnostic test adds to the specificity criteria of this assay. However, a corresponding distinction between *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* by 16S rRNA gene analysis is more difficult due to the existence of identical signature regions and only two single-nucleotide differences at the 3' end of the gene. Correspondingly, negative test results and a high level of specificity were obtained when analyzing *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* DNAs and cultures with the *M. tuberculosis* complex-specific LCx MTB assay (Abbott Laboratories, Chicago, Ill.), which uses the gene encoding the protein antigen b as a target for identification (34). However, new

M. ulcerans TMC 1615-32P

M. marinum ATCC 927-32P

M. haemophilum NCTC 11185-32P

FIG. 2. Graphic presentation of the mean RBRs for *M. ulcerans* (*M. ulc*.), *M. marinum* (*M. mar*.), *M. tuberculosis* (*M. tb*.), and *M. haemophilum* (*M. haem*.) with total genomic DNAs as radioactively labelled probes. For *M. marinum* the results obtained by using the genomic DNA probe (left bars) and the cosmid clone pMm5 (right bars) are shown.

targets for discriminating between *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* will be sought, and the probe pMm5 may be a candidate.

Fox and coworkers (17) showed that among *Bacillus* species, the 16S rRNA gene sequence data are not always reliable criteria for species designation. In most cases, organisms with fewer than 15 differences in their 16S rRNA sequences will be defined as a single species by other criteria such as the results

of DNA-DNA hybridization. However, even though *Bacillus psychrophilus* and *Bacillus globisporus* share 99.8% similarity in their 16S rRNA sequences, they are only 23% homologous by DNA-DNA hybridization and thus are clearly separate species (17). A similar case is that of *M. marinum* and *M. ulcerans*. These two organisms share more than 99.8% similarity in their 16S rRNA sequences, but DNA-DNA hybridization results

TABLE 3. RBRs for hybridization of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, *M. tuberculosis*, and *M. haemophilum* obtained by using total genomic DNA as radioactively labelled probe

	Mean (range) RBR with the following DNA probes ^a :					
Filter DNA source	genomic DNA	genomic DNA	genomic DNA	M. ulcerans TMC 1615^T M. marinum CCUG 20998^T M. tuberculosis H37Ra ^T M. haemophilum NCTC 11185^T M. marinum pMm5 genomic DNA	plasmid DNA	
<i>M. ulcerans</i> $(n = 7)$	$95(87-101)$	$37(35-41)$	$36(32-38)$	$24(21-26)$	$14(12-18)$	
M. marinum $(n = 12)$	$38(25-47)$	$85(72-101)$	$30(25-38)$	$24(18-27)$	$96(89-104)$	
<i>M.</i> tuberculosis $(n = 5)$	$32(25-34)$	$33(29-37)$	$93(87-100)$	$27(25-29)$	$17(15-19)$	
M. haemophilum $(n = 9)$	$29(22-30)$	$21(17-28)$	$24(22-26)$	$95(88-102)$	$9(7-11)$	
Other NTM ^b $(n = 6)$	$9(2-15)$	$11(2-18)$	$13(4-22)$	$9(4-12)$	$4(0-7)$	

^a The sample mean and range RBRs for eight parallel DNAs from the total number of strains indicated in parentheses in the filter DNA source column are presented. The 95% confidence interval was calculated for all RBRs (data not shown). *^b* NTM, nontuberculous mycobacteria.

FIG. 3. Phylogenetic tree based on the alignment of partial 16S rRNA gene sequences illustrating the positions of strains of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, *M. tuberculosis*, and *M. haemophilum* and other slowly growing mycobacterial species. The tree was rooted by use of *N. asteroides* as an outgroup. The bar indicates a 10-nucleotide (10-nt) difference.

showed RBRs of 37 to 38% (range, 25 to 47%; Table 3). This is less than the 50 to 70% DNA hybridization level expected within a single species (54) .

Although helpful in assigning classificatory placements for many mycobacterial and other bacterial species (6, 31), 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis may not reflect phylogenetic relations in, for example, slowly growing mycobacteria or in bacterial groups which may exhibit more recent evolutionary divergence in this part of the genome (17). The high degree of conservation of the mycobacterial 16S rRNA gene may explain why analysis of the 16S rRNA genes of *M. ulcerans*, *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum* is not so useful for discriminating between these species. Although the 16S rRNA gene sequences of all three species have been known for some time (23, 45, 56), the taxonomic relationships of these organisms to each other and to *M. tuberculosis* have not definitively been described previously.

At the time that this study was started limited data on the taxonomic relationship of *M. haemophilum* to other slowly growing mycobacteria were available. The gas chromatography and DNA hybridization data presented in this study confirm that *M. haemophilum* is a separate species which is clearly distinct from *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum*, and *M. haemophilum* appears to be as related to *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* as to *M. tuberculosis*. Sufficient *M. leprae* DNA was not available to compare *M. haemophilum* with *M. leprae* by DNA-DNA hybridization, but the 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis suggests a relatively close relationship between *M. haemophilum* and *M. leprae*. On the basis of the affinities demonstrated by 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis, the relationships of *M. haemophilum* to *M. malmoense* and *M. szulgai* should also be further detailed. In our analyses, the total genomic DNA of *M. haemophilum* strains appeared to be quite homogeneous, despite their various origins, and other markers are required for further subtyping, such as the insert sequence element that has been described previously (30).

In summary, gas chromatography of fatty acids and alcohols, DNA-DNA hybridization, and 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis showed that *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* are most closely related and that these species are more closely related to *M. tuberculosis* than are any other mycobacterial species outside the *M. tuberculosis* complex. *M. haemophilum* was more distantly related to both *M. ulcerans* and *M. marinum* and to *M. tuberculosis*. These findings will be helpful in addressing major obstacles such as how to develop rapid and reliable diagnostic tests for these slowly growing mycobacterial species. They can also enable us to design tools for use in environmental screening for the reservoir of *M. ulcerans.*

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank J. Eng, F. Portaels, and L. W. Riley for providing strains and V. J. DiRita for constructive comments on the manuscript.

This work was supported by grants from the Anders Jahre Foundation, the Laurine Maarschalk Foundation, and the Norwegian Research Council (grant 111468/310) to T.T.

REFERENCES

- 1. **Allen, S.** 1992. Buruli ulcer and HIV infection. Int. J. Dermatol. **31:**744.
- 2. **Athwal, R. S., S. S. Deo, and T. Imaeda.** 1984. Deoxyribonucleic acid relatedness among *Mycobacterium leprae*, *Mycobacterium lepramurium*, and selected bacteria by dot blot and spectrophotometric deoxyribonucleic acid hybridization assays. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **34:**371–375.
- 3. **Barker, L. P., K. M. George, S. Falkow, and P. L. Small.** 1997. Differential trafficking of live and dead *Mycobacterium marinum* organisms in macrophages. Infect. Immun. **65:**1497–1504.
- 4. **Bradley, S. G.** 1973. Relationships among mycobacteria and nocardiae based upon deoxyribonucleic acid reassociation. J. Bacteriol. **113:**645–651.
- 5. **Burchard, G. D., and M. Bierther.** 1986. Buruli ulcer: clinical pathological study of 23 patients in Lambarene, Gabon. Trop. Med. Parasitol. **37:**1–8.
- 6. Böttger, E. C. 1989. Rapid determination of bacterial ribosomal RNA sequences by direct sequencing of enzymatically amplified DNA. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. **65:**171–176.
- 7. **Connor, S. D., and F. T. Lunn.** 1966. Buruli ulceration. A clinicopathologic study of 38 Ugandans with *Mycobacterium ulcerans* ulceration. Arch. Pathol. **81:**183–198.
- 8. **Cook, A.** 1970. Mengo Hospital notes 1897, Makerere Medical School Library. Br. Med. J. **2:**378–379.
- 9. **Daffe, M., M. A. Lanelle, and C. Lacave.** 1991. Structure and stereochemistry of mycolic acids of *Mycobacterium marinum* and *Mycobacterium ulcerans*. Res. Microbiol. **142:**397–403.
- 10. **Daffe, M., A. Varnerot, and V. V. Levy-Frebault.** 1992. The phenolic mycoside of *Mycobacterium ulcerans*. Structure and taxonomic implications. J. Gen. Microbiol. **138:**131–137.
- 11. **Devereux, J., P. Haeberli, and O. Smithies.** 1984. A comprehensive set of sequence analysis programs for the VAX. Nucleic Acids Res. 12:387-395.
- 12. **Dodge, O. G.** 1964. Mycobacterial skin ulcers in Uganda: histopathological and experimental aspects. J. Pathol. Bacteriol. **88:**167–174.
- 13. **Edelstein, H.** 1994. *Mycobacterium marinum* skin infections. Report of 31 cases and review of the literature. Arch. Intern. Med. **154:**1359–1364.
- 14. Edwards, U., T. Rogall, H. Blöcker, M. Emde, and E. C. Böttger. 1989. Isolation and direct complete determination of entire genes: characterization
- of a gene coding for 16S ribosomal RNA. Nucleic Acids Res. **17:**7843–7853. 15. **Felsenstein, J.** 1993. PHYLIP: phylogeny inference package (version 3.51c). Department of Genetics, University of Washington, Seattle.
- 16. **Flood, P., A. Street, P. O'Brien, and J. Hayman.** 1994. *Mycobacterium ulcerans* infection on Philip Island, Victoria. Med. J. Aust. **160:**160.
- 17. **Fox, G. E., J. E. Wisotzkey, and P. Jurtshuk, Jr.** 1992. How close is close: 16S rRNA sequence identity may not be sufficient to guarantee species identity. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **42:**166–170.
- 18. **Goutzamanis, J. J., and G. L. Gilbert.** 1995. *Mycobacterium ulcerans* infection in Australian children: report of eight cases and review. Clin. Infect. Dis. **21:**1186–1192.
- 19. **Gray, H. H., S. Kingma, and S. H. Kok.** 1967. Mycobacterial skin ulcers in Nigeria. Trans. R. Soc. Trop. Med. Hyg. **61:**712–714.
- 20. **Grosskinsky, C. M., W. R. Jacobs, J. E. Clarke-Curtiss, and B. Bloom.** 1989. Genetic relationships among *Mycobacterium leprae*, *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, and candidate leprosy vaccine strains determined by DNA hybridization. Identification of an *M. leprae*-specific repetitive sequence. Infect. Immun. **57:**1535–1541.
- 21. **Hayman, J.** 1993. Out of Africa: observations on the histopathology of *Mycobacterium ulcerans* infections. Clin. Pathol. **46:**5–9.
- 22. **Hockmeyer, W. T., R. E. Krieg, M. Reich, and R. D. Johnson.** 1978. Further characterization of *Mycobacterium ulcerans* toxin. Infect. Immun. **21:**124– 128.
- 23. **Hofer, M., A. Kaelin, B. Hirschel, P. Kirschner, M. Beghetti, A. Kealin, C.-A.** Siegrist, S. Suter, A. Teske, and E. C. Böttger. 1993. Brief report: disseminated osteomyelitis from *Mycobacterium ulcerans* after a snake-bite. Lancet **328:**1007–1009.
- 24. **Imaeda, T., G. Broslawski, and S. Imaeda.** 1988. Genomic relatedness among mycobacterial species by nonisotopic blot hybridization. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **38:**151–156.
- 25. **Jackson, K., R. Edwards, D. E. Leslie, and J. Hayman.** 1995. Molecular method for typing *Mycobacterium ulcerans*. J. Clin. Microbiol. **33:**2250–2253.
- 26. **Jantzen, E., A. Sonesson, T. Tangen, and J. Eng.** 1993. Hydroxy-fatty acid

profiles of *Legionella* species: diagnostic usefulness by principal component analysis. J. Clin. Microbiol. **31:**1413–1419.

- 27. **Jantzen, E., T. Tangen, and J. Eng.** 1989. Gas chromatography of mycobacterial fatty acids and alcohols: diagnostic applications. APMIS **97:**1037–1045.
- 28. **Johnson, P. D., M. G. Veitch, D. E. Leslie, P. E. Flood, and J. A. Hayman.** 1996. The emergence of *Mycobacterium ulcerans* in Melbourne. Med. J. Aust. **164:**76–78.
- 29. **Kiehn, T. E., M. White, K. J. Pursell, N. Boone, M. Tsivitis, A. E. Brown, B. Polsky, and D. Armstrong.** 1993. A cluster of four cases of *Mycobacterium haemophilum* infection. Eur. J. Clin. Microbiol. Infect. Dis. **12:**114–118.
- 30. **Kikuchi, K., E. M. Bernard, T. E. Kiehn, D. Armstrong, and L. W. Riley.** 1994. Restriction fragment length polymorphism analysis of clinical isolates of *Mycobacterium haemophilum*. J. Clin. Microbiol. **32:**1763–1767.
- 31. Kirschner, P., A. Meier, and E. C. Böttger. 1993. Genotypic identification and detection of mycobacteria: facing novel and uncultured pathogens, p. 173–190. *In* D. T. Persing, T. F. Smith, F. C. Tenover, and T. J. White (ed.), Diagnostic molecular microbiology. ASM Press, Washington, D.C.
- 32. **Levy-Frebault, V., and A. Varnerot.** 1989. Detection of phtiocerol derivatives in *Mycobacterium ulcerans*: a preliminary report. Acta Leprol. **7**(Suppl. 1)**:** 94–97.
- 33. **Levy-Frebault, V. V., and F. Portaels.** 1992. Proposed minimal standards for the genus *Mycobacterium* and for description of new slowly growing *Mycobacterium* species. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **42:**315–323.
- 34. **Lindbråthen, A., P. Gaustad, B. Hovig, and T. Tønjum.** 1997. Direct detection of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in clinical samples from patients in Norway by ligase chain reaction. J. Clin. Microbiol. **35:**3248–3253.
- 35. **Linell, F., and A. Norden.** 1954. *Mycobacterium balnei*. A new acid-fast bacillus occurring in swimming pools and capable of producing skin lesions in humans. Acta Tuberc. Scand. **33**(Suppl. 1)**:**26–42.
- 36. **Luquin, M., V. Ausina, F. Lopez Calahorra, F. Belda, M. Barcelo Garcia, C. Celma, and G. Pratts.** 1991. Evaluation of practical chromatographic procedures for identification of clinical isolates of mycobacteria. J. Clin. Microbiol. **29:**120–130.
- 37. **Meyers, W. M., N. Tignokpa, G. B. Priuli, and F. Portaels.** 1996. *Mycobacterium ulcerans* infection (Buruli ulcer): first reported patients in Togo. Br. J. Dermatol. **134:**1116–1121.
- 38. **Muelder, K., and A. Nourou.** 1990. Buruli ulcer in Benin. Lancet **336:**1109– 1111.
- 39. **Pettit, J. H. S., N. J. Marchette, and R. J. Rees.** 1966. *Mycobacterium ulcerans* infection. Br. J. Dermatol. **78:**188–197.
- 40. **Pimsler, M., T. A. Sponsler, and W. M. Myers.** 1988. Immunosuppressive properties of the soluble toxin from *Mycobacterium ulcerans*. J. Infect. Dis. **157:**577–580.
- 41. **Portaels, F.** 1992. Mycobacterioses. *In* P. G. Janssens, M. Kivits, and J. Vuyelsteke (ed.), Medecine et hygiene en Afrique Centrale de 1885 a nos jour, vol. 2. Foundation du Roi Badoin, Brussels, Belgium.
- 42. **Portaels, F., D. J. Daeson, L. Larson, and L. Rigouts.** 1993. Biochemical properties and fatty acid composition of *Mycobacterium haemophilum*: study of 16 isolates from Australian patients. J. Clin. Microbiol. **31:**26–30.
- 43. **Portaels, F., P. A. Fonteyne, H. De Beenhouwer, P. De Rijk, A. Guedenon, J.** Hayman, and W. M. Meyers. 1996. Variability in the 3' end of 16S rRNA sequence of *Mycobacterium ulcerans* is related to geographic origin of iso-

lates. J. Clin. Microbiol. **34:**962–965.

- 44. **Read, J. K., C. M. Heggie, W. M. Meyers, and D. H. Connor.** 1974. Cytotoxic activity of *Mycobacterium ulcerans*. Infect. Immun. **9:**1114–1122.
- 45. Rogall, T., J. Wolters, T. Flohr, and E. C. Böttger. 1990. Towards a phylogeny and definition of species at the molecular level within the genus *Mycobacterium*. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **40:**323–330.
- 46. **Saitou, N., and M. Nei.** 1987. The neighbour-joining method: a new method for reconstructing phylogenetic trees. Mol. Biol. Evol. **4:**406–425.
- 47. **Saubolle, M. A., T. E. Kiehn, M. H. White, M. F. Rudinsky, and D. Armstrong.** 1996. *Mycobacterium haemophilum*: microbiology and expanding clinical and geographic spectra of disease in humans. Clin. Microbiol. Rev. **9:**435–447.
- 47a.**Small, P. L., and T. Tønjum.** Unpublished results.
- 48. **Sompolinsky, D., A. Lagziel, D. Naveh, and T. Yankilevitz.** 1978. *Mycobacterium haemophilum* sp. nov., a new pathogen of humans. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **28:**67–75.
- 49. **Tønjum, T., D. A. Caugant, and K. Bøvre.** 1992. Differentiation of *Moraxella nonliquefaciens*, *Moraxella lacunata*, and *Moraxella bovis* by multilocus enzyme electrophoresis and hybridization using pilin-specific DNA probes. J. Clin. Microbiol. **30:**3099–3107.
- 50. **Tønjum, T., T. Bergan, J. Baann, G. Furuberg, S. Hoffner, L. Klintz, M. Cristea, and B. Petrini.** 1996. Identification of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in sputum and bronchoalveolar lavage samples from Scandinavian patients by using the polymerase chain reaction. Clin. Microbiol. Infect. **2:**127–131.
- 50a.**Tønjum, T., and M. Hdberg-Petersen.** Unpublished results.
- 51. **Tsang, A. Y., and E. R. Farber.** 1973. The primary isolation of *Mycobacterium ulcerans*. Am. J. Clin. Pathol. **59:**688–692.
- 52. **van Embden, J. D. A., M. D. Cave, J. T. Crawford, J. W. Dale, K. D. Eisenach, B. Gicquel, P. Hermans, C. Martin, R. McAdam, T. M. Shinnick, and P. M. Small.** 1993. Strain identification of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* by DNA fingerprinting: recommendations for a standardized methodology. J. Clin. Microbiol. **31:**406–409.
- 53. **Wayne, L., R. C. Good, M. I. Krichevsky, Z. Blacklock, H. L. David, D. Dawson, N. Gross, J. Hawkins, V. V. Levy-Frebault, C. McManus, F. Por**taels, S. Rusch-Gerdes, K. H. Schröder, V. A. Silcox, M. Tsukamura, L. van **den Breen, and M. A. Yakrus.** 1991. Fourth report of the cooperative, open-ended study of slowly growing mycobacteria by the International Working Group on Mycobacterial Taxonomy. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **41:**463– 472.
- 54. **Wayne, L. G., D. J. Brenner, R. R. Colwell, P. A. D. Grimont, O. Kandler, M. I. Krichevsky, L. H. Moore, W. E. C. Moore, R. G. E. Murray, E.** Stackebrandt, M. P. Starr, and H. G. Trüper. 1987. Report on the ad hoc committee in reconciliation of approaches to bacterial systematics. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. **37:**463–464.
- 55. **Wold, S., C. Albano, W. J. Dunn III, U. Edlund, K. Esbensen, P. Geladi, S. Hellberg, E. Johanson, W. Linberg, and M. Sjøstrøm.** 1984. Multivariate data analysis in chemistry, p. 17–95. *In* B. R. Kowalski (ed.), Chemometrics, mathematics and statistics in chemistry. Reidel, Dordrecht, The Netherlands.
- 56. **Zappe, C. H., D. Barlow, H. Zappe, I. J. Bolton, D. Roditi, and L. M. Steyn.** 1995. 16S rRNA sequence analysis of an isolate of *Mycobacterium haemophilum* from a heart transplant patient. J. Med. Microbiol. **43:**189–191.