

ERGODIC PROPERTY OF THE BROWNIAN MOTION PROCESS

BY G. KALLIANPUR AND H. ROBBINS*

THE INSTITUTE FOR ADVANCED STUDY AND UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA

Communicated by J. von Neumann, April 16, 1953

1. *Introduction.*—In a previous paper (“On the Equidistribution of Sums of Independent Random Variables,” to appear elsewhere; an abstract will appear in *Bull. Am. Math. Soc.*, **59**, (May, 1953); we shall refer to this paper as [1]) we considered some properties of the sequence S_n of partial sums of independent and identically distributed random variables or random vectors in two dimensions. Here we show in Theorems 1–4 that the results of [1] carry over to the Brownian motion process in one and two dimensions.

2. *The Two-Dimensional Case.*—Let $X(t)$ denote the Brownian motion (Wiener) process on the line: $X(0) \equiv 0$, $X(t)$ is continuous for all t with probability 1, and for any $t_0 < t_1 < \dots < t_n$ the random variables $X(t_j) - X(t_{j-1})$, $j = 1, \dots, n$, are independent and normally distributed with zero means and variances $t_j - t_{j-1}$. Let $V(t) = (X(t), Y(t))$ denote the Brownian motion process in the plane, the two components of $V(t)$ being independent one-dimensional Brownian motion processes. Suppose that $f(x, y)$, $g(x, y)$ are real valued functions which are bounded and summable in the plane $-\infty < x < \infty$, $-\infty < y < \infty$, and set $\bar{f} = \int \int f(x, y) dx dy$, $\bar{g} = \int \int g(x, y) dx dy$, where here and in the sequel an integral sign without limits denotes integration over $(-\infty, \infty)$. We shall prove the following two theorems for plane Brownian motion. The corresponding results for the one-dimensional case involve no essentially new arguments and will be stated without proof at the end of the paper.

THEOREM 1. *If $\bar{f} \neq 0$ then for every u ,*

$$\lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \Pr \left[\frac{2\pi}{\bar{f} \log T} \int_0^T f(V(t)) dt \leq u \right] = G(u), \tag{2.1}$$

where $G(u) = 1 - e^{-u}$ for $u \geq 0$, $= 0$ for $u < 0$.

THEOREM 2. *If $\bar{g} \neq 0$ then*

$$\lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\int_0^T f(V(t)) dt}{\int_0^T g(V(t)) dt} = \frac{\bar{f}}{\bar{g}} \text{ in probability.} \tag{2.2}$$

Proofs of Theorems 1 and 2: Assume $\bar{f} \neq 0$ and $\bar{g} \neq 0$ and define

$$Z_n(f) = \frac{2\pi}{\bar{f} \log n} \int_0^n f(V(t)) dt, \quad W_n(f) = \frac{2\pi}{\bar{f} \log n} \sum_{j=1}^n f(V(j)),$$

with corresponding definitions for $Z_n(g)$ and $W_n(g)$. For any positive

integer n , each component of $V(n)$ is the sum of n independent random variables, each distributed normally with zero mean and unit variance, since

$$X(n) = \sum_{j=1}^n [X(j) - X(j-1)], \quad Y(n) = \sum_{j=1}^n [Y(j) - Y(j-1)].$$

A theorem in [1] gives

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \Pr[W_n(f) \leq u] = G(u). \quad (2.3)$$

We shall later prove as Lemma 1 that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E[Z_n(f) - W_n(f)]^2 = 0. \quad (2.4)$$

It follows from (2.4) that $Z_n(f) - W_n(f)$ tends to zero in probability, and hence from (2.3) that $Z_n(f)$ has the same limiting distribution, $G(u)$, as $W_n(f)$. This proves (2.1) as $T \rightarrow \infty$ through integer values, and the extension to arbitrary T is immediate, proving Theorem 1.

To prove Theorem 2 we shall later prove as Lemma 2 that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E[Z_n(f)Z_n(g) - W_n(f)W_n(g)] = 0, \quad (2.5)$$

and we make use of the fact, proved in [1], that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} EW_n^2(f) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} EW_n^2(g) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} EW_n(f)W_n(g) = \int_0^\infty u^2 dG(u) = m_2, \text{ say.} \quad (2.6)$$

From (2.4)–(2.6) it follows that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} EZ_n^2(f) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} EZ_n^2(g) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} EZ_n(f)Z_n(g) = m_2, \\ \text{and hence } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} E[Z_n(f) - Z_n(g)]^2 = 0. \quad (2.7)$$

As in [1], given $\epsilon > 0$ we choose $\delta = \delta(\epsilon) > 0$ such that $\delta \leq \epsilon$, $G(\delta) \leq 1/2\epsilon$, and $N = N(\epsilon)$ (by (2.1) with f replaced by g) such that

$$n \geq N \text{ implies } \Pr[Z_n(g) > \delta] \geq 1 - G(\delta) - 1/2\epsilon \geq 1 - \epsilon.$$

$$\text{Since } \Pr[\{Z_n(f) - Z_n(g)\}^2 < \delta^3] \geq 1 - \frac{E[Z_n(f) - Z_n(g)]^2}{\delta^3},$$

if we choose (by (2.7)) $K = K(\epsilon)$ such that

$$n \geq K \text{ implies } E[Z_n(f) - Z_n(g)]^2 \leq \delta^4,$$

then if $n \geq \max.(N, K)$,

$$\Pr[Z_n(g) > \delta] \geq 1 - \epsilon, \quad \Pr[\{Z_n(f) - Z_n(g)\}^2 < \delta^3] \geq 1 - \epsilon.$$

which in turn imply that

$$\Pr \left[\left\{ \frac{Z_n(f)}{Z_n(g)} - 1 \right\}^2 < \epsilon \right] \geq \Pr[Z_n(g) > \delta, \{Z_n(f) - Z_n(g)\}^2 < \delta^2] \geq 1 - 2\epsilon.$$

Since ϵ was arbitrary this proves (2.2) as $T \rightarrow \infty$ through integer values. Again, the extension to arbitrary T is immediate. Finally, the restriction that $f \neq 0$ can be dropped by a simple argument and the proof of Theorem 2 is complete.

3. *Proof of the Lemmas.*—We shall prove Lemma 2 first. We have

$$Z_n(f) = \frac{2\pi}{f \log n} \sum_{j=1}^n \int_{j-1}^j f(V(t)) dt, \quad W_n(f) = \frac{2\pi}{f \log n} \sum_{j=1}^n \int_{j-1}^j f(V(j)) dt.$$

$$\text{Set } D_n = E[Z_n(f)Z_n(g) - W_n(f)W_n(g)]$$

$$\begin{aligned} &= \frac{4\pi^2}{f\bar{g}(\log n)^2} \sum_{j,k=1}^n \int_{j-1}^j \int_{k-1}^k E[f(V(t))g(V(u)) - f(V(j))g(V(k))] dudt \\ &= \frac{4\pi^2}{f\bar{g}(\log n)^2} \sum_{j,k=1}^n a_{jk}, \end{aligned}$$

where

$$a_{jk} = \int_{R_{jk}} [\theta(t, u) - \theta(j, k)] dudt, \quad R_{jk} = \{j-1 < t < j; k-1 < u < k\}, \quad \theta(t, u) = E[f(V(t))g(V(u))].$$

We want to show that $D_n \rightarrow 0$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$, i.e., that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} (\log n)^{-2} \sum_{j,k=1}^n a_{jk} = 0. \tag{3.1}$$

To evaluate $\theta(t, u)$ we observe that for $t_1 < t_2$ the random vector $V(t_2) - V(t_1) = (X(t_2) - X(t_1), Y(t_2) - Y(t_1))$ has the joint probability density

$$\frac{1}{2\pi(t_2 - t_1)} e^{-\frac{x^2 + y^2}{2(t_2 - t_1)}}.$$

Hence for $0 < t < u$,

$$\begin{aligned} \theta(t, u) &= \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \iiint \iiint f(x, y)g(x+x', y+y') \\ &\quad e^{-\frac{x^2 + y^2}{2t} - \frac{x'^2 + y'^2}{2(u-t)}} dx dy dx' dy' \\ &= \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \iiint \iiint f(x, y)g(\zeta, \eta) e^{-O(t, u)} dx dy d\zeta d\eta, \end{aligned}$$

where we have set

$$Q(t, u) = \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \frac{x^2 + y^2}{t} + \frac{(x - \xi)^2 + (y - \eta)^2}{u - t} \right\}.$$

In what follows C will denote any constant whose numerical value is immaterial, and $F = \sup |f(x, y)|$, $G = \sup |g(x, y)|$. Then if $(t, u) \in R_{jj}$ or $\epsilon R_{j, j+1} (j \geq 2)$,

$$|\theta(t, u)| \leq \frac{G}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \iint |f(x, y)| e^{-\frac{x^2 + y^2}{2t}} dx dy.$$

$$\iint e^{-\frac{x'^2 + y'^2}{2(u-t)}} dx' dy' \leq \frac{G}{2\pi t} \iint |f(x, y)| dx dy \leq \frac{C}{j-1}. \tag{3.2}$$

Also, for $0 < t < u$,

$$|\theta(t, u)| \leq \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \iiint |f(x, y) \cdot g(\xi, \eta)| e^{-\frac{x^2 + y^2}{2t}} dx dy d\xi d\eta \leq \frac{F}{2\pi(u-t)} \iint |g(\xi, \eta)| d\xi d\eta \leq \frac{C}{u-t}. \tag{3.3}$$

We write $\sum_{j, k=1}^n a_{jk}$ as the sum of the following terms:

- (a) $\sum_{j=2}^n a_{jj}$, (b) $\sum_{k=3}^n a_{1k}$, (b') $\sum_{=3}^n a_{j1}$, (c) $\sum_{j=2}^{n-1} a_{j, j+1}$,
- (c') $\sum_{k=2}^{n-1} a_{k+1, k}$, (d) $\sum_{2 \leq j \leq k-2 \leq n-2} a_{jk}$, (d') $\sum_{2 \leq k \leq j-2 \leq n-2} a_{jk}$, and
- (e) $a_{11} + a_{12} + a_{21}$.

To prove (3.1) it will suffice to show that each of (a), (b), (c), (d) is $o\{(\log n)^2\}$.

(a) From (3.2), if $(t, u) \in R_{jj}, j \geq 2$, $|\theta(t, u)| \leq \frac{C}{j-1}$.

Also, $|\theta(j, j)| = \frac{1}{2\pi j} \left| \iint f(x, y) g(x, y) e^{-\frac{x^2 + y^2}{2j}} dx dy \right| \leq \frac{C}{j-1}$.

Hence $\left| \sum_{j=2}^n a_{jj} \right| \leq C \cdot \sum_{j=2}^n \frac{1}{j-1} = O(\log n)$. (3.4)

(b) From (3.3), if $(t, u) \in R_{1k}, k \geq 3$,

$$|\theta(t, u)| \leq \frac{C}{u-t} \leq \frac{C}{k-2}$$

Also, $|\theta(1, k)| \leq \frac{C}{k-2}$.

$$\text{Hence } \left| \sum_{k=3}^n a_{1k} \right| \leq C \cdot \sum_{k=3}^n \frac{1}{k-2} = O(\log n). \tag{3.5}$$

(c) Again from (3.2),

$$\sum_{j=2}^{n-1} a_{j, j+1} = O(\log n). \tag{3.6}$$

(d) If $(t, u) \in R_{jk}$, $2 \leq j \leq k - 2 \leq n - 2$, then $Q(t, u) \geq 0$ and

$$\begin{aligned} \theta(t, u) - \theta(j, k) &= \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int f(x, y)g(\xi, \eta) [e^{-Q(t, u)} - \\ &e^{-Q(j, k)}] dx \dots d\eta + \frac{1}{4\pi^2} \left[\frac{1}{t(u-t)} - \frac{1}{j(k-j)} \right] \int \dots \int \times \\ &f(x, y)g(\xi, \eta)e^{-Q(j, k)} dx \dots d\eta = J_1 + J_2. \end{aligned}$$

Setting

$R_a = \{|x| \leq a, |y| \leq a, |\xi| \leq a, |\eta| \leq a\}$, $R'_a =$ complement of R_a , let $\epsilon > 0$ be arbitrary and choose $a > 0$ such that

$$\int \dots \int_{R'_a} |f(x, y)g(\xi, \eta)| dx \dots d\eta < \epsilon.$$

We can write

$$J_1 = \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int_{R'_a} + \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int_{R_a} = J'_1 + J''_1,$$

where

$$|J'_1| \leq \frac{\epsilon}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \leq \frac{C\epsilon}{(j-1)(k-j-1)}. \tag{3.7}$$

To obtain a bound for J''_1 we observe that

$$\begin{aligned} Q(t, u) - Q(j, k) &= \frac{x^2 + y^2}{2} \left(\frac{1}{t} - \frac{1}{j} \right) + \frac{(x-\xi)^2 + (y-\eta)^2}{2} \left(\frac{1}{u-t} - \right. \\ &\left. \frac{1}{k-j} \right) \leq \frac{x^2 + y^2}{2} \left(\frac{1}{j-1} - \frac{1}{j} \right) + \frac{(x-\xi)^2 + (y-\eta)^2}{2} \left(\frac{1}{k-j-1} - \right. \\ &\left. \frac{1}{k-j} \right) = \frac{x^2 + y^2}{2(j-1)j} + \frac{(x-\xi)^2 + (y-\eta)^2}{2(k-j-1)(k-j)} = A (\geq 0), \text{ say.} \end{aligned}$$

Also,

$$\begin{aligned} Q(t, u) - Q(j, k) &\geq \frac{(x-\xi)^2 + (y-\eta)^2}{2} \left(\frac{1}{k-j+1} - \frac{1}{k-j} \right) = \\ &= -\frac{(x-\xi)^2 + (y-\eta)^2}{2(k-j)(k-j+1)} \geq -A. \end{aligned}$$

Hence

$$e^{-A} - 1 \leq e^{-\{Q(t,u)-Q(j,k)\}} - 1 \leq e^A - 1, \quad \text{and}$$

$$|e^{-\{Q(t,u)-Q(j,k)\}} - 1| \leq \max. [e^A - 1, 1 - e^{-A}] = e^A - 1.$$

Therefore

$$|J_1^*| \leq \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int_{R_a} |f(x,y)g(\zeta,\eta)| \cdot e^{-Q(j,k)} \cdot |e^{-\{Q(t,u)-Q(j,k)\}} - 1| dx \dots d\eta \leq \frac{FG}{4\pi^2(j-1)(k-j-1)} \int \dots \int_{R_a} (e^A - 1) dx \dots d\eta.$$

Since $e^x \leq 1 + xe^b$ for $0 \leq x \leq b$, we have in R_a

$$e^A - 1 \leq Ae^{\left[\frac{a^2}{(j-1)j} + \frac{4a^2}{(k-j-1)(k-j)}\right]} \leq Ae^{\left[\frac{a^2}{2} + 2a^2\right]},$$

and hence

$$|J_1^*| \leq \frac{C(a)}{(j-1)(k-j-1)} \left[\frac{1}{(j-1)j} + \frac{1}{(k-j-1)(k-j)} \right]. \quad (3.8)$$

Turning to J_2 , we have

$$|J_2| \leq C \left| \frac{1}{t(u-t)} - \frac{1}{j(k-j)} \right| = C \left| \frac{j(k-j) - t(u-t)}{t(u-t)j(k-j)} \right| \leq C \frac{|j(k-j) - t(u-t)|}{(j-1)j(k-j-1)(k-j)}.$$

Since $1 - 2j = j(k-j) - jk + (j-1)^2 \leq j(k-j) - t(u-t) \leq j(k-j) - (j-1)(k-1) + j^2 = k + j - 1$,

$$|j(k-j) - t(u-t)| \leq \max. [k + j - 1, 2j - 1] = k + j - 1 = (k-j-1) + 2(j-1) + 2.$$

Hence

$$|J_2| \leq C \left[\frac{1}{(j-1)j(k-j)} + \frac{1}{j(k-j-1)(k-j)} + \frac{1}{(j-1)j(k-j-1)(k-j)} \right] \leq C \left[\frac{1}{(j-1)^2(k-j-1)} + \frac{1}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^2} + \frac{1}{(j-1)^2(k-j-1)^2} \right]. \quad (3.9)$$

From (3.7)-(3.9) we obtain for $2 \leq j \leq k - 2 \leq n - 2$,

$$|a_{jk}| \leq \frac{C\epsilon}{(j-1)(k-j-1)} + C(a) \left[\frac{1}{(j-1)^2(k-j-1)} + \frac{1}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^3} \right] + C \left[\frac{1}{(j-1)^2(k-j-1)} + \frac{1}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^2} + \frac{1}{(j-1)^2(k-j-1)^2} \right]. \tag{3.10}$$

Now from [1],

$$\sum_{2 \leq j \leq k-2 \leq n-2} \frac{1}{(j-1)(k-j-1)} \sim (\log n)^2, \tag{3.11}$$

while

$$\sum_{j=2}^{n-2} \sum_{k=j+2}^n \frac{1}{(j-1)^2(k-j-1)} \leq \sum_{j=2}^{n-2} \frac{1}{(j-1)^2} \cdot \sum_{m=1}^n \frac{1}{m} = O(\log n), \tag{3.12}$$

$$\sum_{j=2}^{n-2} \sum_{k=j+2}^n \frac{1}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^2} \leq \sum_{j=2}^{n-2} \frac{1}{j-1} \sum_{m=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{m^2} = O(\log n). \tag{3.13}$$

From (3.4)–(3.6) and (3.10)–(3.13) it follows that

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} (\log n)^{-2} \left| \sum_{j, k=1}^n a_{jk} \right| \leq C\epsilon,$$

and since ϵ is arbitrary this proves (3.1) and Lemma 2.

Turning to the proof of Lemma 1, let

$$K_n = \frac{1}{\log n} \left[\int_0^n f(V(t)) dt - \sum_{j=1}^n f(V(j)) \right] = \frac{1}{\log n} \sum_{j=1}^n \int_{j-1}^j [f(V(t)) - f(V(j))] dt.$$

$$\text{Then } EK_n^2 = (\log n)^{-2} \cdot \sum_{j, k=1}^n b_{jk},$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} b_{jk} &= \iint_{R_{jk}} E[f(V(t)) - f(V(j))][f(V(u)) - f(V(k))] dt du \\ &= \iint_{R_{jk}} [\{\theta(t, u) - \theta(t, k)\} - \{\theta(j, u) - \theta(j, k)\}] dt du \end{aligned}$$

and where we now write

$$\begin{aligned} \theta(t, u) &= Ef(V(t))f(V(u)) \\ &= \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int f(x, y)f(\zeta, \eta)e^{-Q(t, u)} dx \dots d\eta \end{aligned}$$

for $0 < t < u$. For $2 \leq j \leq k - 2 \leq n - 2$,

$$\begin{aligned} \theta(t, u) - \theta(t, k) &= \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int f(x, y)f(\zeta, \eta)[e^{-Q(t, u)} - \\ &e^{-Q(t, k)}] dx \dots d\eta + \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t} \left[\frac{1}{u-t} - \frac{1}{k-t} \right] \int \dots \int f(x, y)f(\zeta, \eta)e^{-Q(t, k)} dx \dots d\eta = J_1 + J_2. \end{aligned}$$

In R_{jk} ,

$$\begin{aligned} Q(t, u) - Q(t, k) &= \frac{(x - \zeta)^2 + (y - \eta)^2}{2} \left(\frac{1}{u-t} - \frac{1}{k-t} \right) = \\ &\frac{(x - \zeta)^2 + (y - \eta)^2}{2} \cdot \frac{k-u}{(u-t)(k-t)} \geq 0. \end{aligned}$$

Hence $|e^{-Q(t, u)} - e^{-Q(t, k)}| = e^{-Q(t, k)} |e^{-\{Q(t, u) - Q(t, k)\}} - 1| \leq 1 - e^{-\{Q(t, u) - Q(t, k)\}} \leq Q(t, u) - Q(t, k) \leq \frac{(x - \zeta)^2 + (y - \eta)^2}{2} \cdot \frac{k-u}{(u-t)(k-t)}$.

Thus, writing

$$J_1 = \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int_{R_a} + \frac{1}{4\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int \dots \int_{R_a} = J'_1 + J''_1,$$

we have $J'_1 \leq \frac{C\epsilon}{(j-1)(k-j-1)}$,

$$\begin{aligned} J''_1 &\leq \frac{F^2}{8\pi^2 t(u-t)} \int_{R_a} \dots \int [(x - \zeta)^2 + (y - \eta)^2] \times \\ &dx \dots d\eta \cdot \frac{k-u}{(u-t)(k-t)} \leq \frac{C(a)}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^3}, \end{aligned}$$

$$|J_2| \leq \frac{C}{t} \cdot \frac{k-u}{(u-t)(k-t)} \leq \frac{C}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^2}.$$

Hence we have

$$|\theta(t, u) - \theta(t, k)| \leq \frac{C\epsilon}{(j-1)(k-j-1)} + \frac{C(a)}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^2} + \frac{C}{(j-1)(k-j-1)^2}, \tag{3.14}$$

and similarly it can be shown that the right-hand side of (3.14) is an upper bound for $|\theta(j, u) - \theta(j, k)|$. Hence, as in the proof of Lemma 2,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} (\log n)^{-2} \sum_{2 \leq j \leq k-2 \leq n-2} b_{jk} = 0,$$

and the other sums occurring in EK_n^2 can be proved to be $o\{(\log n)^2\}$ as before, completing the proof of Lemma 1.

4. *The One-Dimensional Case.*—Let $f(x)$ and $g(x)$ be real valued functions which are bounded and summable in the line $-\infty < x < \infty$, and set $\bar{f} = \int f(x)dx$, $\bar{g} = \int g(x)dx$.

THEOREM 3. *If $\bar{f} \neq 0$ then for every u ,*

$$\lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \Pr \left[\frac{1}{\bar{f}\sqrt{T}} \int_0^T f(X(t)) dt \leq u \right] = H(u),$$

where
$$H(u) = \begin{cases} \sqrt{\frac{2}{\pi}} \int_0^u e^{-y^2/2} dy & \text{for } u \geq 0, \\ 0 & \text{for } u < 0. \end{cases}$$

THEOREM 4. *If $\bar{g} \neq 0$ then*

$$\lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\int_0^T f(X(t)) dt}{\int_0^T g(X(t)) dt} = \frac{\bar{f}}{\bar{g}} \text{ in probability.}$$

* John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Fellow.

OMNIBUS CHECKING OF THE 61-PLACE TABLE OF DENARY LOGARITHMS COMPILED BY PETERS AND STEIN, BY CALLET, AND BY PARKHURST

BY HORACE S. UHLER

YALE UNIVERSITY

Communicated by J. B. Whitehead, March 30, 1953

The first reference is: *Zehnstellige Logarithmentafel. Erster Band. Herausgegeben von Reichsamt für Landesaufnahme unter wissenschaftlicher Leitung von Prof. Dr. J. Peters.* Berlin 1922. Table 14b, pages 156–162 of the appendix. The original source for Table 14b is acknowledged on page xix by the statement that “...this table contains the 61-place common