#### 437

# Nitrogen fixation in molybdenum-deficient continuous culture by a strain of *Azotobacter vinelandii* carrying a deletion of the structural genes for nitrogenase (*nifHDK*)

Paul E. BISHOP,\* Marie E. HAWKINS† and Robert R. EADY†

\*ARS-USDA, Department of Microbiology, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC 27695-7615, U.S.A., and †AFRC Unit of Nitrogen Fixation, University of Sussex, Brighton BN1 9RQ, U.K.

Steady-state chemostat cultures of Azotobacter vinelandii strain CA11, carrying a deletion of genes encoding the structural polypeptides of nitrogenase nifHDK, were established in a simple defined medium chemically purified to minimize contamination by Mo. The medium contained no utilizable N source. Growth was dependent on N<sub>2</sub> (1.1 × 10<sup>8</sup> viable cells · ml<sup>-1</sup> at D = 0.176 h<sup>-1</sup>), and was inhibited by Mo (20 nm). DNA hybridization showed the deletion to be stable during prolonged (55 days) growth in the chemostat (132 doublings). Since batch cultures, using unsupplemented 'spent' chemostat medium, showed good growth  $(1.9 \times 10^8 \text{ cells} \cdot \text{ml}^{-1})$ , no requirement for subnanomolar concentrations of Mo was found. The biomass yield, as the dilution rate (D) was varied, showed that the N content of the culture, protein and dry wt. increased as D was decreased, indicating that neither N<sub>2</sub> nor O<sub>2</sub> were limiting growth. The limiting nutrient was not identified. Substantial amounts of  $H_2$  were evolved by the chemostat cultures, probably as the result of inhibition of  $O_2$ -dependent hydrogenase activity by nitrilotriacetic acid present in the medium. Over a range of D values approx. 50% of the electron flux through the alternative system was allocated to  $H^+$ reduction. C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>2</sub> was a poor substrate, being reduced at 0.14-0.1 times the rate of N<sub>2</sub> fixation, calculated from the N content of the cells. SO42--limited steady-state continuous cultures of strain UW136 (wild-type for *nifHDK*) had a 2-fold greater biomass in the presence of  $MoO_4^{2-}$  (1  $\mu M$ ). The significance of this finding for 'Mo-limited' continuous cultures [Eady & Robson (1984) Biochem. J. 224, 853-862] is discussed.

### **INTRODUCTION**

Nitrogenase, the well-characterized molybdoenzyme system which catalyses the reduction of N<sub>2</sub>, comprises a MoFe protein ( $\alpha_2\beta_2$  tetramer) encoded by *nifD* and *nifK*, and an Fe protein ( $\gamma_2$  dimer) encoded by *nifH* (see Eady & Smith, 1979; Dixon, 1984). Some diazotrophs contain reiterated *nif* DNA sequences encoding *nifHDK* or *nifH* (Quinto *et al.*, 1985; Scolnik & Haselkorn, 1984; Jones *et al.*, 1984). Such reiterated sequences can be functional as in *Rhizobium phaseoli* (Quinto *et al.*, 1985) or, as in *Rhodopseudomonas capsulata*, normally silent but capable of activation by mutation (Scolnik & Haselkorn, 1984).

Azotobacter vinelandii has an alternative system for  $N_2$  fixation in addition to conventional nitrogenase (Bishop et al., 1980). Evidence for the alternative system was earlier based primarily on the observation that several classes of Nif<sup>-</sup> mutant strains of A. vinelandii underwent phenotypic reversal under Mo-deficient conditions. Since explanations other than the existence of an alternative  $N_2$  fixation system were possible, deletion strains of A. vinelandii lacking nifHDK were constructed, and  $N_2$  fixation under Mo-deficient conditions demonstrated (Bishop et al., 1986). This work provided definitive proof for the existence of a nitrogenase complex in A. vinelandii other than that encoded by the nifHDK gene cluster.

In order to define the parameters of the alternative  $N_2$  fixation system *in vivo*, in the absence of possible interference from the conventional system, a chemostat

study of growth of a *nifHDK* deletion growing under Mo-deficient conditions was undertaken. We report here that the unusual pattern of substrate reduction by the alternative  $N_2$  fixation system in steady-state cultures is similar to that of the wild type under Mo deficiency (Eady & Robson, 1984) but, contrary to the earlier study, no requirement for Mo could be established for diazotrophic growth of the deletion strain CA11.

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

### **Bacterial strains and media**

Azotobacter vinelandii strain UW136 (Bishop et al., 1977) referred to as UWrif<sup>r</sup> by Eady & Robson (1984) is wild type for the structural genes coding for nitrogenase (nifHDK). Strain CA11 contains a 5.25 kbp Bg/II deletion which removes both nifD and nifK plus approximately two-thirds of nifH (Bishop et al., 1986) and, except for the deletion, is isogenic with strain UW136. Both strains were maintained on agar plates containing modified Burk's medium (Strandberg & Wilson, 1968) supplemented by 29 mm-ammonium acetate. Chemostat medium routinely had the following composition (g/1): KH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>, 0.2; K<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub>, 3H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.8; MgSO<sub>4</sub>,7H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.2; CaCl<sub>2</sub>,2H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.09; sucrose, 20. High purity  $Fe_2(SO_4)_3$  (Johnson Matthey Chemicals, Royston, Herts. SG8 5HE, U.K.), 240 mg (final concn. 30  $\mu$ M) and trisodium nitrilotriacetate (Na<sub>3</sub>NTA), 2.87 g (final concn. 522  $\mu$ M) were mixed in approx. 20 ml of water and

Abbreviations used: NTA, nitrilotriacetate; c.f.u., colony-forming units; (k)bp, (kilo)base-pairs.

added to the bulk media (minus phosphate) shortly before autoclaving. The phosphate and bulk media were autoclaved separately and mixed when cool.

Medium used for  $SO_4^{2-}$ -limitation experiments was modified by substituting high purity  $Fe_2O_3$  for  $Fe_2(SO_4)_3$ , converted to FeCl<sub>3</sub> by dissolving 96 mg in 1 ml of boiling concentrated HCl. The FeCl<sub>3</sub> was mixed with 20 ml of water containing 2.87 g of Na<sub>3</sub>NTA and was added to 20 litres of bulk medium before autoclaving (final concn.  $60 \ \mu$ M-Fe<sup>3+</sup> and 522  $\mu$ M-NTA). Appropriate amounts of SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> were added to the medium as Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> after filter sterilization.

Medium was routinely prepared in 20 litre batches, and purified to remove trace Mo contamination as described previously (Eady & Robson, 1984), except that bulk medium was made up as a  $10 \times (2 \text{ litres})$ concentrated solution in order to facilitate extraction by dichloromethane. Double-glass-distilled water was used to bring the volume up to 20 litres after the final extraction step.

### **Experimental procedures**

All procedures including chemostats, cleaning of glassware, measurement of growth, viability, yield, N analyses, and assays for nitrogenase and hydrogenase were carried out essentially as described by Eady & Robson (1984).

### **DNA-DNA hybridization**

Preparation of genomic DNAs, SmaI digestions, electrophoresis of DNA in 0.8% agarose and transfer to Genescreen (New England Nuclear) have been described previously (Jones *et al.*, 1984). Hybridization to a SmaI digest of genomic DNA of *A. vinelandii* was conducted at 42 °C for 16 h in 1% SDS and 50% formamide using a <sup>32</sup>P-labelled probe of a 6.2 kbp Sma I fragment containing *nifHDK* from *A. vindelandii* (Bishop *et al.*, 1986) as described by the suppliers of Genescreen.

### RESULTS

### Continuous culture of *A. vinelandii* strain CA11 in Mo-deficient medium

A continuous culture of the *nifHDK* deletion strain CA11 was established in purified N-free medium containing no added Mo. The medium contained ferric nitrilotriacetate (0.5 mm), added to avoid problems, encountered early in this study, of instability of steady-states assigned to Fe limitation (characterized by a yellow-green colouration of the culture), so it was necessary to ensure that NTA was not acting as a nitrogen source and that  $N_2$  was the sole nitrogen source. The inflowing air supplied to the steady-state was changed from air to  $Ar/O_2$  (79:21) and over 6.3 replacement times (65 h) the population density decreased to 0.27% that of the initial steady-state population (Fig. 1), following closely the theoretical washout rate for non-growing organisms and indicating that the N<sub>2</sub>-to-Ar shift did not result in the death of the population.

Before restoring air to the culture,  $NH_4Cl$  (final concn. 3.85 nM) was added to the chemostat vessel and the medium pump was turned off. The resulting dense growth of this batch culture indicated that the  $Ar/O_2$  gas mixture was not toxic.  $N_2$  fixation was also established by <sup>15</sup>N enrichment experiments *in situ* in the chemostat





A steady-state chemostat culture of strain CA11  $(D = 0.097 h^{-1})$  was established under air in chemically purified 'N-free' Mo-deficient medium. At zero time the air passing over the culture was replaced with an Ar/O<sub>2</sub> (4:1) mixture. The effect on the population was determined by measuring viable counts expressed as c.f.u. in culture samples withdrawn at timed intervals. The solid line indicates the theoretical dilution of a non-dividing though viable population.  $\bigcirc$  indicates viable organisms expressed as a percentage of initial population at time zero (1.9 × 10<sup>8</sup> c.f.u./ml).

as described by Eady & Robson (1984). After 2 h incubation under air containing  ${}^{15}N_2$  the isotopic composition of the cells showed a 3.21 atom%  ${}^{15}N$  excess. These experiments show that growth of strain CA11 was N<sub>2</sub>-dependent.

### Stability of the Nif<sup>-</sup> phenotype of strain CA11 maintained in continuous culture

Periodically samples were removed and tested for growth on solid N-free agar medium containing Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub> (1  $\mu$ M). In one steady-state the Nif<sup>-</sup> phenotype remained stable for 81 days. Occasional Nif<sup>+</sup> colonies were observed but these are pseudorevertants which express the alternative N<sub>2</sub> fixation system in the presence of repressive levels of Mo or W (Bishop *et al.*, 1980). In addition, Southern blot hybridization analysis (using a 6.2-kbp *SmaI* fragment containing *nifHDK* from *A. vinelandii* as a probe) of DNA (digested with *SmaI*), isolated from strain CA11 after 55 days in continuous culture showed the persistence of the 5.25-kbp deletion carried by the inoculum.

#### Growth parameters of strain CA11 in continuous culture

A number of steady-states of strain CA11 growing on Mo-deficient medium was established at various dilution rates. Fig. 2 shows the changes that occurred in cell



Fig. 2. Relation of cell concentrations and cellular composition to dilution rate in continuous cultures of *A. vinelandii* strain CA11

Cultures were grown on Mo-deficient 'N-free' medium, and the parameters characterizing steady-states at various dilution rates were determined as described in the Materials and methods section.

density (measured as c.f.u. and  $A_{650}$ ), dry weight of organisms, protein, and total N content over a range of D from 0.049  $h^{-1}$  to 0.176  $h^{-1}$ . The yield of organisms showed a marked increase with decreasing growth rate. This increase is unlikely to be due to poly- $\beta$ -hydroxybutyrate accumulation associated with O<sub>2</sub> limitation because dry weight and protein content increased in parallel. Microscopic examination of the organisms also showed normal morphology over a range of D from  $0.089 h^{-1}$  to  $0.176 h^{-1}$  with little indication of polymer accumulation. The increased yield at low dilution rates is not due to 'cryptic growth' since the viability determined as c.f.u. did not decrease markedly. The parallel increase of N content  $ml^{-1}$  indicates that cultures were not intrinsically N<sub>2</sub>-limited, as defined by Dalton & Postgate (1969). When the medium inflow was stopped, a steady-state population continued to grow as a batch culture. The nature of the limiting nutrient is discussed later.

### Patterns of substrate reduction by nitrogenase in chemostat cultures

Substantial rates of  $H_2$  evolution were exhibited by steady-state populations of strain CA11, increasing with dilution rate up to  $0.12 h^{-1}$  where the activity was 46 nmol of  $H_2$  evolved/min per mg of protein (Fig. 3). These high rates of  $H_2$  evolution were probably due to the inhibition of uptake hydrogenase by NTA (Partridge & Yates, 1982) since O<sub>2</sub>-dependent uptake hydrogenase activity (measured in samples removed from a different steady state) decreased from 252 to 3.2 nmol  $H_2$ evolved/min per mg of protein when the NTA concentration in the medium was increased from 18 to  $522 \mu M$ . Concomitant with this inhibition of uptake hydrogenase activity, the rate of  $H_2$  evolution increased from 4.4 to 23.2 nmol of  $H_2$  evolved/min per mg of protein.

As observed previously with strain UW136,  $H_2$  evolution was not inhibited by  $C_2H_2$  (10%, v/v) (Eady &



#### Fig. 3. Pattern of substrate reduction by nitrogenase in relation to dilution rate in continuous culture of *A. vinelandii* strain CA11

Cultures were grown in Mo-deficient 'N-free' medium and the substrate reduction pattern of steady-state cultures was determined *in situ*, at different dilution rates. Nitrogenase activity was assayed either from the rate of reduction of added acetylene or from the rate of evolution of H<sub>2</sub> from the culture. The rate of N<sub>2</sub> reduction was calculated from the N content of the organisms and the dilution rate of the culture.

Robson, 1984). In the case of strain CA11, at higher dilution rates in the presence of  $522 \mu$ M-NTA a more than 2-fold stimulation of the rate of H<sub>2</sub> evolution to 78 nmol of H<sub>2</sub> evolved/min per mg of protein in the presence of C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>2</sub> was observed (Fig. 3). H<sub>2</sub> evolution was attributed to the presence of a nitrogenase since the activity was repressed by the addition of 29 mM-NH<sub>4</sub>Cl to the medium reservoir.

Substrate reduction patterns by Mo-deficient continuous cultures of strain UW136 indicated that the rate of  $C_2H_2$  reduction under represented the rate of  $N_2$  fixation (Eady & Robson, 1984). Fig. 3 shows that a similar pattern was obtained with strain CA11. Over the range of D = 0.049 h<sup>-1</sup> to 0.176 h<sup>-1</sup>, the rate of  $C_2H_2$  reduction determined *in situ* underestimated the N<sub>2</sub> fixation rate, calculated from D and the N content of the cells by 7–10-fold. Over this range of D the specific activity for N<sub>2</sub> reduction increased from 3.9 to 19 nmol of N<sub>2</sub> reduced/min per mg of protein at D = 0.176.

The proportion of electrons allocated to  $H^+$  reduction as the percentage of the total electron flux through nitrogenase is shown in Table 1 for different steady-state populations. Within the mid-range of *D* values investigated approx. 50% of the total electron flux through nitrogenase was allocated to the reduction of  $H^+$ . This proportion decreased at higher and lower dilution rates.

### Effect of Mo on diazotrophic growth of strains CA11 and UW136

Since a previous study (Eady & Robson, 1984) indicated that *A. vinelandii* strain UW136 had an absolute requirement for Mo when growing on  $N_2$ , it was

<i>D</i> (h <sup>-1</sup> )	Rates of substrate reduction (nmol/min per mg of protein)			Allocation of total	
	N <sub>2</sub>	$N_2 \times 3$	H+	H <sup>+</sup> reduction (%)	$H_2$ evolved/ $N_2$ reduced
0.049	3.47	10.4	3.5	25.2	1
0.089	9.96	29.9	26.3	46.8	2.6
0.120	13.53	40.6	45.6	52.9	3.4
0.152	16.80	50.4	40.7	44.7	2.4
0.176	17.97	53.9	26.5	33.0	1.47

#### Table 1. Electron allocation to proton reduction by nitrogenase in chemostat cultures of A. vinelandii strain CA11

The rate of  $N_2$  fixation was calculated from the N content of the organisms and D for different steady-states; H<sup>+</sup> reduction was measured from the H<sub>2</sub> content of the effluent air from the chemostat headspace and the air flow rate.

of interest to see whether this requirement could be established for strain CA11. Continuous cultures of strain UW136 (wild-type with respect to *nifHDK*) and strain CA11 fed with Mo-deficient medium from the same reservoir were tested for the effect of low concentrations of Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub> on growth under N<sub>2</sub>-fixing conditions. The D for the strain UW136 and CA11 cultures was adjusted to  $0.194 h^{-1}$  and  $0.198 h^{-1}$ respectively, corresponding to replacement times of  $5.125 \pm 0.75$  h. At steady-state the cell densities were  $7 \times 10^7$  c.f.u./ml for strain UW136 and  $3 \times 10^7$  c.f.u./ml for strain CA11. Two sequential additions (at 24 h intervals) of Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub> to give 10 nm and 20 nm final concentration were made to the medium reservoir. The culture density of strain UW136 increased from  $A_{540} = 0.94$  to 1.24 while that for strain CA11 decreased from  $A_{540} = 0.65$  to 0.115 over 47 h: growth of strain CA11 was inhibited by nanomolar concentrations of Mo, while growth of strain UW136 was stimulated.





Cultures were grown in either Mo-deficient 'N-free' medium ( $\bigcirc$ ), or on the same medium supplemented with 1  $\mu$ M-Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub> ( $\bigcirc$ ) at the SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> concentrations indicated. Samples were removed from different steady-state populations ( $D = 0.14 \text{ h}^{-1}$ ) for determination of the dry weight.

To test the possibility that subnanomolar levels of Mo might be necessary for diazotrophic growth of strain CA11, an outgrowth experiment, using 'spent' chemostat medium biologically scavenged of residual contaminating Mo, was done. Mo input from the organisms themselves was minimized by using low inoculation volume (1%), v/v) to give a culture density of  $4.2 \times 10^5$  c.f.u./ml of organisms derived from a Mo-deficient steady-state chemostat culture. Filter-sterilized 'spent' chemostat medium was inoculated and cultures were incubated at 30 °C with vigorous shaking; the population increased to  $1.9 \times 10^8$  c.f.u./ml over 44 h. On subculture of this batch culture with similar 'spent' medium the population increased from  $1.9 \times 10^6$  c.f.u./ml to  $6.4 \times 10^8$  c.f.u./ml over 48 h. In similar experiments, Eady & Robson (1984) reported  $5 \times 10^8$  c.f.u./ml with NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> as a source of fixed N for strain UW136. Since 'spent' chemostat medium supports growth to a similar extent with  $N_2$  or  $NH_4^+$  as N source, it is not limiting with respect to a nutrient essential for N<sub>2</sub> fixation. The low Mo content of such media suggests that there is no Mo requirement for diazotrophic growth of strain CA11.

## Effect of $SO_4^{2-}$ -limitation on diazotrophic growth of strain UW136 in chemostat culture in the presence and absence of added Mo

A range of sulphate-limited steady-states of strain UW136 were established in Mo-deficient medium, and in the same medium supplemented with Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub> (1  $\mu$ M). As shown in Fig. 4, the yield of organism was approx. 2-fold greater at all concentrations of SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> tested, in the presence of MoO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>. These data indicate that when N<sub>2</sub> fixation is occurring via the conventional nitrogenase system (in the presence of Mo) a more effective utilization of SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> occurs, which results in an increase in biomass. The significance of these observations in relation to the evidence presented for Mo-limited growth of strain UW136 by Eady & Robson (1984) is discussed below.

### DISCUSSION

Definitive evidence is now available for an alternative  $N_2$  fixation system in *A. vinelandii* (Bishop *et al.*, 1986). Data reported here (Fig. 1) show unequivocally that growth of the strain deleted for conventional nitrogenase genes in continuous culture in Mo-deficient medium depends on  $N_2$  as N source. Steady-state cultures also

incorporated  ${}^{15}N_2$  in agreement with results obtained with other Nif<sup>-</sup> mutant strains (Bishop *et al.*, 1980, 1985).

The stability of the Mo-dependent Nif<sup>-</sup> phenotype of strain CA11 is shown by its inability to grow on Mo-sufficient media and by the persistence of the *nifHDK* deletion after prolonged growth in continuous culture. This is an important observation since *A. vinelandii* can contain up to 40 chromosomes per cell (Sadoff *et al.*, 1979) and growth on N<sub>2</sub> might otherwise have been attributable to amplification of a chromosome not carrying the deletion.

The use of strain CA11 simplifies interpretation of physiological data concerning the involvement of Mo in nitrogen fixation, since complications arising from the altered properties of the conventional system operating under Mo-deficiency are avoided. From the yield data presented here it is evident that Mo, when added at a nanomolar levels, prevents the alternative system from functioning and stimulates the conventional system. Although a role for Mo in regulating expression of conventional nif genes has been questioned (Shah et al., 1984), the rate of synthesis and steady-state level of MoFe protein in A. vinelandii strain UW136 is very low during Mo starvation, in contrast to the rate of synthesis of Fe protein (Eady & Robson, 1984) and Fe protein activity (Premakumar et al., 1984). In addition, studies on nif transcription have shown that low levels of Mo repress the nifH-hybridizing mRNA transcripts which are observed in A. vinelandii under Mo-deficient conditions (Jacobson et al., 1985).

The similarity of the unusual substrate reduction pattern of nitrogenase in Mo-deficient continuous cultures of strain UW136 (Eady & Robson, 1984) and the data reported here for strain CA11 (Fig. 3) suggest that in medium which has been chemically purified to remove contaminating Mo, only the alternative system for N<sub>2</sub> fixation is functional. This is supported by our data which show that chemostat cultures of strains CA11 and UW136 fed from the same reservoir of Mo-deficient medium have similar biomass.

 $C_2H_2$  is a poor substrate for the alternative system in comparison with N<sub>2</sub>. This is unlikely to be due to an altered apparent  $K_m$  for  $C_2H_2$  (see Eady & Robson, 1984).

When uptake hydrogenase is inhibited by NTA, substantial amounts of  $H_2$  are evolved under air. The rate of  $H_2$  evolution was stimulated by  $C_2H_2$  (Fig. 3), in contrast to its effect on the conventional system where  $C_2H_2$  inhibits  $H_2$  evolution. The stimulation is unlikely to arise from inhibition of uptake hydrogenase since this activity is low, consequent on inhibition by NTA, and may arise from the inhibition of  $N_2$  reduction by  $C_2H_2$ directing electrons to  $H^+$  reduction.

A chemostat study of mutant strains of Azotobacter chroococcum lacking uptake hydrogenase activity showed that the minimum stoichiometry of H<sub>2</sub> evolved: N<sub>2</sub> reduced by nitrogenase was 1 (Aguilar *et al.*, 1984). This ratio increased to 2 as the *D* value was increased to  $0.17 h^{-1}$ . In contrast, our data for strain CA11 gave a ratio of 3.3 at intermediate *D* values, where approx. 50% of the electron flux through nitrogenase was allocated to H<sup>+</sup> reduction (Table 1). Recycling of H<sub>2</sub> by uptake hydrogenase is likely to play an important role in the economical use of energy during N<sub>2</sub> fixation under Mo-deficient conditions. We do not know whether the cultural conditions in our chemostat were optimal for the alternative system but, if the difference in efficiency of the two systems is real, it might provide a physiological explanation why the alternative nitrogen fixation system is repressed by low levels of Mo.

We have not attempted to determine the limiting nutrient under the conditions of our  $SO_4^{2^-}$ -sufficient continuous cultures. Our data exclude  $O_2^-$  and  $N_2^$ limitation; a comparable dependence of yield versus Dcan occur with a trace-metal limitation (Pirt, 1975) though this may not necessarily have a direct effect on  $N_2$ fixation.

The data of Fig. 4 indicate that  $SO_4^{2-}$ -limited chemostat cultures of strain UW136 growing on N<sub>2</sub> on Mo-deficient media respond to the addition of  $MoO_{4}^{2-}$ with an approx. 2-fold increase in cell yield. Since, under our conditions, a  $SO_4^{2-}$ -limited steady-state of strain UW136 has no nutritional advantage over strain CA11 under Mo-deficiency, these two situations correspond to diazotrophic growth by strain UW136 using the alternative and conventional nitrogenases respectively. The effect of Mo could be attributed either to an increase in efficiency of  $SO_4^{2-}$  uptake and utilization or to an increased rate of  $N_2$  fixation as the conventional system becomes functional. It is interesting to note that a Mo-uptake system associated with diazotrophy of Clostridium pasteurianum has been shown to co-transport  $SO_4^{2-}$  (Elliot & Mortenson, 1975). The difference in yield is unlikely to be a consequence of a greater SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>-requirement for the alternative system. As discussed by Tempest (1976), data for a single dilution rate can be misleading if there is a differential yield as a function of D, as is found for  $SO_4^{2-}$ -limited continuous cultures of A. chroococcum growing on  $N_2$  as against assimilating NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> (Hill *et al.*, 1972).

The establishment of steady-state chemostat populations of strain UW136 growing on Mo-deficient media which responded to the addition of Mo by increased yield led Eady & Robson (1984) to suppose that they were Mo-limited, i.e. that there was a Mo-requirement for growth. Additional support for this suggestion was the observation that, in outgrowth experiments using 'spent' chemostat media biologically scavenged to remove Mo, a 25-fold lower population was attained when Mo was not added. However, data presented here for strain UW136 show that  $SO_4^{2-}$ -limited chemostats responded to the addition of  $MoO_4^{2-}$  at the  $SO_4^{2-}$  concentrations used by these workers for continuous culture (20  $\mu$ M) and batch culture (50  $\mu$ M). The stimulation of growth of chemostat and batch cultures by added Mo reported by Eady & Robson (1984) can be explained as being due to a partial relief of  $SO_4^{2-}$ -limitation. The question as to what is the limiting nutrient in such cultures is vexed, since SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>-limited diazotrophic cultures of strain UW136 growing in our medium respond to the addition of  $MoO_4^{2^-}$ ,  $SO_4^{2^-}$  or  $NH_4^+$  by increasing growth yield. In this strain there are two routes for N<sub>2</sub> fixation, and depending upon the Mo status of the organism, one or other, sometimes possibly both, can function. However, in the case of the deletion strain CA11, MoO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> prevents growth when added at nanomolar concentrations and in SO42-sufficient 'spent' chemostat medium no differential limitation for final growth yield on N<sub>2</sub> compared with  $NH_4^+$  as N source is apparent. This would suggest that Mo is not required for the alternative N<sub>2</sub> fixation system and by inference is not involved in diazotrophic growth

of this strain. Thus, the question as to whether Mo is absolutely required for diazotrophy remains open.

In A. chroococcum the second copy of the nifH gene (termed  $nifH^*$ ), which is unlinked to the main *nif* gene cluster, has been sequenced and found to be 88%homologous with nifH (Kennedy et al., 1985; Robson et al. 1986). Running off the same putative promoter, and 124 bp downstream from nifH\*, is a DNA sequence containing a ferredoxin-like sequence (Robson et al., 1986). Since a DNA fragment from the A. chroococcum ferredoxin gene hybridizes to a mRNA transcript (which also hybridizes to nifH) present in N2-grown strain CA11 (Jacobson et al., 1985), these gene products are likely to be involved in diazotrophic growth under Mo-deficient conditions. Support for this suggestion is provided by the presence of Fe protein activity in extracts of N<sub>2</sub>-grown strain CA11 (Bishop et al., 1986) and the finding that the nifM product, which activates conventional Fe protein polypeptide, is required for growth under both Mo-sufficient and Mo-deficient conditions (Kennedy et al., 1985).

We thank Professor J. R. Postgate for critical reading of the manuscript, Dr. R. Robson for useful discussion, Miss Beryl Scutt for preparation of the typescript, Dr. R. L. Richards for <sup>15</sup>N analyses, and Mr. C. Macdonald for N analyses. P.E.B. wishes to thank the U.S. Department of Agriculture – Agricultural Research Service for the ARS fellowship awarded to him.

### REFERENCES

- Aguilar, O. M., Yates, M. G. & Postgate, J. R. (1984) in Advances in Nitrogen Fixation Research (Veeger, C. & Newton, W. E., eds.), p. 213, Nijhoff/Junk, The Hague
- Bishop, P. E., Gordon, J. K., Shah, V. K. & Brill, W. J. (1977) in Genetic Engineering for Nitrogen Fixation (Hollaender, A., ed.), pp. 67–50, Plenum, New York
- Bishop, P. E., Jarlenski, D. M. L. & Hetherington, D. R. (1980) Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 77, 7342–7346
- Bishop, P. E., Premakumar, R., Dean, D. R., Jacobson, M. R.,

Received 25 November 1985/2 April 1986; accepted 7 May 1986

Chisnell, J. R., Rizzo, T. M. & Kopczynski, J. (1986) Science 232, 92–94

- Dalton, H. & Postgate, J. R. (1969) J. Gen. Microbiol. 56, 307-319
- Dixon, R. A. (1984) J. Gen. Microbiol. 130, 2745-275
- Eady, R. R. & Smith, B. E. (1979) in A Treatise on Dinitrogen Fixation (Hardy, R. W. F., Bottomley, F. & Burns, R. C., eds.), sections 1 and 2, John Wiley and Sons, New York
- Eady, R. R. & Robson, R. L. (1984) Biochem. J. 224, 853–862 Elliott, B. B. & Mortenson, L. E. (1975) J. Bacteriol. 124, 1295–1301
- Hill, S., Drozd, J. W. & Postgate, J. R. (1972) J. Appl. Chem. Biotechnol. 22, 541-558
- Jacobson, M. R., Premakumar, R. & Bishop, P. E. (1985) Abstr. 6th International Symposium on Nitrogen Fixation, Corvallis
- Jones, R., Woodley, P. & Robson, R. L. (1984) Mol. Gen. Genet. 197, 318-327
- Kennedy, C., Robson, R. L., Toukdarian, A., Jones, R., Gamal, R., Bishop, P. E., Eady, R. R. & Postgate, J. R. (1985) Abstr. 6th International Symposium on Nitrogen Fixation, Corvallis
- Partridge, C. D. P. & Yates, M. G. (1982) Biochem. J. 204, 339-344
- Pirt, S. J. (1975) in Principles of Microbe and Cell Cultivation, Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford and London
- Premakumar, R., Lemos, E. M. & Bishop, P. E. (1984) Biochim. Biophys. Acta **797**, 64–71
- Quinto, C., de la Vega, H., Flores, M., Lemmans, J., Cevallos, M. A., Pardo, M. A., Aziproz, R., de Lourdes Girard, M., Calva, E. & Palacios, R. (1985) Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 82, 1170-1174
- Robson, R. L., Woodley, P. & Jones, R. (1986) EMBO J. 5, 1159-1163
- Sadoff, H. L., Shimei, B. & Ellis, S. (1979) J. Bacteriol. 138, 871-877
- Scolnik, P. A. & Haselkorn, R. (1984) Nature (London) 307, 289-292
- Shah, V. K., Ugalde, R. A., Imperial, J. & Brill, W. J. (1984) Annu. Rev. Biochem. 53, 231-257
- Strandberg, G. W. & Wilson, P. W. (1968) Can. J. Microbiol. 14, 25-31
- Tempest, D. W. (1976) in Continuous Culture 6: Applications and New Fields (Dean, A. C. R., Ellwood, D. C., Evans, C. T. T. & Melling, J., eds.), Ellis Horwood, Chichester