# MARKER EFFECTS IN THE GENETIC TRANSDUCTION OF TRYPTOPHAN MUTANTS OF E. COLI<sup>1</sup>

#### DAVID STADLER AND BEVERLY KARIYA

## Department of Genetics, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington 98195

Manuscript received May 7, 1973 Revised copy received August 15, 1973

#### ABSTRACT

Recombination frequencies have been determined in crosses involving 28 mutant strains for 20 of which the site of the alteration is known from studies of amino-acid substitutions in the protein products. Three of these mutants showed especially high frequencies of recombination when crossed to other single mutants or when crossed to a strain carrying two alterations at opposite ends of the trpA gene. There is no obvious molecular explanation of the high recombination of these three mutants. They include one missense mutant, one amber and one ochre. The low-frequency recombination mutants include all these same classes as well as frameshift mutants. There is nothing unique about the intragenic location of the high-recombination mutants; in each case there is at least one low-recombination mutant in the same codon.---Crosses involving mutants which were isolated in an altered wild type have shown that the behavior of a high-recombination mutant does not result from its molecular configuration alone, but from its combination with the homologous wild-type sequence from the other parent,----Several lines of evidence indicate that recombination in this system frequently involves closely-spaced double exchanges (about 40 codons apart).

MARKERS are segregating sites and are used in genetic experiments to reveal interactions between homologous chromosomes. A useful assumption is that the markers only reveal recombination and do not influence its occurrence. This assumption seems to be valid for recombination events taking place some distance (several gene lengths) from the segregating sites, but it is quite possible that events within the same gene as the segregating markers are altered in some way.

Studies of meiotic recombination in ascomycetes have suggested the occurrence of marker effects. Cases have been reported in Ascobolus (KRUSZEWSKA and GAJEWSKI 1967) and in fission yeast (GUTZ 1971) in which two mutants which are at or near the same site give very different frequencies of recombination when both are crossed to the same third mutant elsewhere in the gene. One limitation of this observation is that the basis for assuming that the first two mutant sites are close together comes from recombination—the same mysterious process that is under study.

An unambiguous test for the occurrence of marker effects can only be made with a system in which the physical positions of the markers are determined by a

<sup>1</sup> This work was supported by a grant from the National Science Foundation.

Genetics 75: 423-439 November, 1973.

method other than recombination mapping. It is also desirable to know the base sequences in the mutant and wild-type genes in order to find out whether marker effects are based on particular molecular configurations. This paper reports the results of studies of recombination by transduction in the trpA gene of *E. coli*. YANOFSKY and his co-workers have amassed a large amount of information about the amino acid sequence of the protein product of this gene: the  $\alpha$ -chain of tryptophan synthetase. Their comparison of the wild-type enzyme to those forms produced by particular mutants and revertants has revealed the positions of the genetic alterations (Table 1). In some cases they have been able to determine the base sequence for a segment of the gene and the base alterations involved in particular mutation events.

The first question posed here was: do marker effects occur? Having concluded that they do, we posed several additional questions:

1) Do marker effects result from a particular base sequence?

2) Do they result from a particular kind of mutational alteration (base substitution as opposed to addition or deletion, transition as opposed to transversion)?

3) Do marker effects depend on the mutant base sequence *per se* or on its association with a specific sequence from the other parent?

4) What aspect of the recombination process is marker-dependent? Do the high-frequency markers cause more frequent recombination events? Do they cause closer-spaced exchanges in the normal events? Or do they cause a completely different kind of recombination event?

Mutant	Codon	mRNA codon Wild type	and amino acid Mutant
A38	15	AAA lys	UAA ochre
A218	22	$\mathrm{UU_C}\mathrm{phe}$	CU <sup>U</sup> C leu
A33	49	GAG glu	AUG met
A88	49		UAG amber
A446	175	UAU tyr	UGU cys
A487	177	CUG leu	CGG arg
A223	183	$AC_{C}^{U}$ thr	AU <sup>U</sup> <sub>C</sub> ile
A23	211	GGA gly	AGA arg
A46	211		GAA glu
$A46^{Asp}$	211		GAU asp
$A46^{Asp}MUT$	211		GAC asp
A187	213	$GG^{U}{}_{C}$ gly	GUU <sub>C</sub> val
A58	234	GGU <sub>C</sub> gly	GAU <sub>C</sub> asp
A78	234		UG <sup>U</sup> C cys
A96	243	CAA gln	UAA ochre

TABLE 1

TrpA mutants of known location

Amino acid abbreviations: arg: arginine; asp: aspartate; cys: cysteine; gln: glutamine; glu: glutamate; gly: glycine; ile: isoleucine; leu: leucine; lys: lysine; met: methionine; phe: phenylalanine; thr: threonine; tyr: tyrosine; val: valine. This paper seeks answers to the above questions through recombination studies with mutants known to result from specific molecular changes at specific sites in the trpA gene.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

Mutant strains: All the mutant strains and the molecular information about them were obtained from CHARLES YANOFSKY. The mutants of known location are described in Table 1. Some crosses involved ochre mutants of the A gene for which the specific location is not known (A7, A13, A17, A44 and A74).

In the tables the mutants are designated by the isolation numbers of YANOFSKY with the prefix "A" omitted. Amber derivatives of ochre mutants are designated 17am, 38am, 54am and 96am. Mutant  $A46^{Asp}$  is called 46A, and  $A46^{Asp}MUT$  is called 46M.

Measurements of recombination: Recombination was measured in transduction experiments using the temperate phage P1kc. Map distances within the trpA gene were measured by the frequency of trp+ progeny in crosses in which both donor and recipient carried mutations in trpA. The specific procedures used in the preparation of lysates and recipient cells and in performing the crosses were those of YANOFSKY and LENNOX (1959). All recipient strains were his-, and the frequencies of trp+ transductants were normalized to the frequency of the unlinked transduction to his+ in the same cross. All the trp+ recombination frequencies in the tables represent the number of trp+ transductants were from two to four per hundred thousand recipient cells. A typical datum resulted from counts of 100-300 trp+ colonies and a similar number of his+ colonies. In many cases the same cross was repeated in two or more experiments, and these gave good agreement (see Tables 5 and 6 for examples).

Construction of trpA double mutants: Two stocks were constructed which each contained two ochre mutations near opposite ends of the trpA gene: A38 on the left and A96 or A109 on the right. Double mutant 38-96 was built by transducing a cysB A96 recipient with phage from a cys+ A38 donor. Cys+ recombinants were selected on minimal medium plus indole. CysB and trpA are co-transduced with a frequency of about 50%, and some fraction of these are recombinant with respect to the marked sites in trpA. The trpA double mutants were recognized by virtue of the fact that ochre suppressors do not suppress trpA ochre double mutants (YANOFSKY and Iro 1966). The recipient parent of this cross also carried the gal-linked ochre suppressors  $u_{oc}$ -A. Thus the recipient parent was tryptophan-independent as were all progeny that carried either of the single trp mutants. The only tryptophan-requiring progeny were those carrying both mutations. One such strain was isolated, and its genotype was confirmed by the failure to produce trp+ recombinants in separate crosses to A38 and to A96. The same procedure was used to isolate the double mutant 38-109.

Selection of ochre-to-amber mutations: Spontaneous trp+ revertants were selected from ochre mutant strains A17 and A54 which carried amber suppressors. These reversions could result from any of three different genetic events: a new ochre suppressor mutation, a back-mutation at trpA or a change from ochre (UAA) to amber (UAG) at the mutant site in trpA.

The revertants which resulted from ochre suppressor mutations were screened out by a test for the ability to suppress a T4 ochre mutant (YANOFSKY and ITO 1966). Cells were streaked on nutrient agar plates and a loopful of the T4 lysate was spotted on the streak. The plates were scored after 72 hours' incubation at 37°. A clear area of lysis indicated that the bacteria carried the ochre suppressor which was required for phage growth.

P1 lysates were prepared from revertants which did not carry ochre suppressors. The lysates were used as donors in transduction with a recipient strain carrying a deletion of the tryptophan operon (this strain would grow on medium supplemented with tryptophan but not on medium supplemented with indole). Transductants were selected on minimal medium plus indole and replicated to minimal. If the donor had been a trp+ back mutant, all the selected transductants would grow on minimal. If the donor had been a suppressed amber mutant, transductants receiv-

#### TABLE 2

Single mutant parent	Donor 38-96	Recipient 38–96	Donor 38-109	Recipient 38–109
Single mutants of known	location			
23	1.88 (8)	1.69	1.86 (6)	1.76
88	1.82	1.89	1.54	0.85
187		0.61(2)		
223		0.55(2)		
487		0.33		
58	0.26 (3)	0.25	0.42 (3)	0.12
78	0.26 (3)		0.32 (3)	
33	0.15	0	0.14	0
46	0.07 (6)	0.10	0.11 (4)	0.09
446		0.06		
46A	0.03	0.05	0	0.05
46M	0.04			
Single mutants of unknow	n location			
54	1.60 (2)	0.78	1.33	0.88 (2)
54am	0.02(2)		0	0.08
44	0.09		0.08	
74	0.14		0.14	
7	0.26		0.04	
13	0.18	0.02	0.09	0.08 (2)
17	0.35 (2)	0	0.13	0.06(2)
17am	0			
Control crosses				
38am				0
38	0.06 (6)	0.02	0.08 (5)	0 (2)
96	0.01 (5)	0	0 (4)	0
109	0 (2)		0 (2)	
96am	0		0	

Frequencies of trp+ recombinants in three-point crosses at trpA

Note: In those cases in which the same cross was made more than once, the results have been averaged, and the number in brackets tells how many times it was made.

ing the trpA gene but not the amber suppressor would grow on indole but not on minimal. The interpretation was confirmed by checking the parents and transductants of this cross for the presence of an amber suppressor by the T4 lysis test (using a T4 amber mutant).

Construction of trpE trpA double mutant strains: Mixtures of cys+trpA— donor phage and cys-trpE— recipients were plated on minimal medium plus indole for cys+ transductants. These included wild type, trpA and trpE single mutants and the double mutant. Wild-type transductants were identified by their ability to grow on minimal medium, and the trpE single mutants were recognized by growth on anthranilate. The trpA single mutants and the double mutants both required indole for growth. The double mutants were identified by their failure to give trp+ transductants when mixed with a lysate from trpE— on minimal medium.

### RESULTS

Three-point crosses: Two stocks were built which each carried two mutational changes near the ends of the trpA gene. These were used to screen for trpA

mutants showing high-frequency intragenic recombination. When one of the double mutants was crossed to a strain carrying a single mutation located in the middle part of the gene, prototrophic recombinants could only result from at least two exchanges within the gene. This represented the replacement of a very short segment of one parent genome with the homologous segment of the other parent. Such an event appears to be the basis of "gene conversion" in meiotic systems, the event which gives rise to non-reciprocal segregation ratios (3:1 and 1:3). Gene conversion frequencies have been reported to show dramatic evidence of marker-specific effects.

The double-mutant stocks carried ochre mutations: A38 on the left and A96 or A109 on the right. One or both of the double mutants were crossed to each of twenty single mutants which were all located between the two marked sites of the double mutants (Table 2). Twelve of these single mutants are at known positions (localized to a specific codon position by protein studies).

Three of the mutants (A23, A54 and A88) gave significant numbers of trp+ recombinants and will be called HR (high recombination) mutants. Most of the others gave none or were not much above the reversion frequency and will be called LR (low recombination) mutants. The crosses of mutants A187 and A223 gave lower frequencies of trp+ recombinants than the HR mutants and they will be designated IR (intermediate recombination) mutants. Some crosses were made in both directions, and in most of these cases the results of the reciprocal crosses were similar (Table 2).

Three of the five mutants which gave significant frequencies of recombinants in the crosses to the double mutants had been shown earlier to give unusually high recombination in two-point crosses. YANOFSKY *et al.* (1964) noted high frequency recombination for A23 and A187, and a similar observation regarding A88 was made by DRAPEAU, BRAMMER and YANOFSKY (1968).

Two-point crosses: Fifty-seven pairwise combinations of fifteen single mutants of known position were crossed, and trp+ recombinants were selected and counted. The recombination frequencies are shown in Table 3. Figure 1 presents the same data as frequencies of recombination per codon (amino acid residue) between the two segregating sites, and they are graphed against increasing distance. The same mutants which produced prototrophs in the three-point crosses (HR and IR mutants) show high frequencies in the two-point crosses, especially in those crosses in which the segregating sites are close together. Most of the crosses between LR mutants show rates of recombination per codon in the range of 0.01 to 0.02%. This rate was previously observed by YANOFSKY *et al.* (1964) to generate a recombination map length for the trpA gene of 4%.

Figure 1 shows that all classes of mutants (even those showing low-frequency recombination) produce somewhat elevated frequencies of recombinants per codon in the crosses in which the segregating sites are close together (less than 40 codons). This is the pattern predicted by "negative interference" (CHASE and DOERMANN 1958): the frequent occurrence of two or more exchanges in close proximity (about 40 codons apart in the present case).

## TABLE 3

Frequencies of recombination in two-point crosses between trpA mutants of known position

L R × L R crosses Total Recombi-		lea	Crosses in which at least one parent is IR or HR Total Recombi-				
Cross	Distance (residues)	recombi- nation	nation per residue	Cross	Distance (residues)	recombi- nation	nation per residue
				23 × 187	2	0.18	0.090
				46 imes187	2	0.085	0.042
58 imes96	9	0.28	0.031				
58 🗙 96am	9	0.43	0.048				
78 imes96	9	0.38	0.042				
78 imes96am	9	0.20	0.022				
				187 imes 58	21	2.12	0.101
46 imes 58	23	0.96	0.042	23 imes 58	23	2.50	0.109
46A imes 58	23	0.41	0.018				
				223 imes23	28	4.51	0.161
				223 imes46	28	1.09	0.039
				187 $ imes$ 96	30	1.91	0.064
				223 imes187	30	1.08	0.036
46 imes96	32	0.76	0.024	23  imes 96	32	1.93	0.060
46 🗙 96am	a 32	1.32	0.041	23 × 96an	n 32	2.32	0.069
46A  imes 96	32	0.87	0.027				
46 $A imes$ 96am	ı 32	0.89	0.028				
487 imes46	34	0.63	0.019	487  imes 23	34	1.65	0.049
38am 🗙 33	34	1.11	0.033	38am × 88	34	1.94	0.057
487 imes58	57	1.11	0.019				
				223 imes96	60	1.21	0.020
487 imes96	66	1.20	0.018				
33 imes 487	128	1.14	0.009				
				33  imes 223	134	1.34	0.010
$33 \times 46A$	162	1.76	0.011	$88 \times 46A$	162	4.31	0.027
33  imes 46	162	2.47	0.015	88  imes 46	162	9.61	0.059
33  imes 487	162	2.58	0.016	33  imes 23	162	2.70	0.017
				88  imes 23	162	5.79	0.036
				38  imes 223	168	3.99	0.024
33 imes 58	185	1.62	0.009	88  imes 58	185	6.06	0.033
33  imes 78	185	1.15	0.006	88  imes 78	185	5.54	0.030
33  imes 96	194	2.27	0.012	88 × 96	194	3.85	0.020
33 × 96an	n 194	1.67	0.009	88 × 96ar	n 194	3.26	0.017
38  imes 46	196	3.61	0.018	38  imes 23	196	3.60	0.018
38  imes 46A	196	3.66	0.019				
38am  imes 46A	196	2.86	0.014				
$38 \times 58$	219	3.54	0.016				
$38 \times 78$	219	3.87	0.018				
$38 \times 96$	228	2.74	0.012				
38 × 96ar	n 228	2.37	0.010				
$38am \times 96$	228	3.60	0.016				
38 $am  imes$ 96 $ar$	n 228	2.81	0.012				



FIGURE 1.—Recombination frequency *versus* physical distance in two-point crosses between mutants of known position. Circles represent crosses in which one or both parents were HR or IR mutants. Dots represent crosses in which both parents were LR mutants.

Frameshift mutants: All the trpA mutations involved in the experiments described above resulted from base substitutions in the wild-type gene. Frameshift mutants result from the addition or deletion of one or two nucleotides. Three frameshift mutants in the trpA gene have been examined for intragenic recombination. Mutant A9813 resulted from the deletion of an adenine nucleotide at codon 175 (BRAMMAR, BERGER and YANOFSKY 1967). Mutant A21 resulted from either a deletion of two nucleotides at codon 215 or a single deletion at codon 216 or 217 (BERGER, BRAMMAR and YANOFSKY 1968). Mutant A504 resulted from either a deletion of two nucleotides at codon 216 and/or codon 217 or a single deletion at codon 218 (BERGER, BRAMMAR and YANOFSKY 1968).

All three of these mutants have high frequencies of spontaneous reversion which interfere with the accurate measurement of intragenic recombination frequencies. In order to distinguish transductants from revertants, we built each of the three frameshift mutants into a double mutant with cysB. In the subsequent crosses we selected and counted cys + trp + co-transductants (MALING and YANOFSKY 1961).

It is difficult to make any *a priori* prediction about the frequency of  $c\gamma s+trp+$ transductants in these crosses, as it will depend on the relative positions of the two parental *trpA* mutations with respect to  $c\gamma sB$ . Therefore, an important control is provided by a base-substitution mutant of high recombination frequency and another of low recombination frequency located very near the site of the frameshift mutant under study. Therefore A23 and A46 (which are both near the sites of A21 and A540) were built into double mutants with  $c\gamma s$  and studied in corresponding crosses to those of the frameshift mutants.

The results are shown in Table 4. In crosses to the double mutant A38-109, all three frameshift mutants behave like the base-substitution mutant A46. In the crosses to single mutants, A21 and A540 generally behave like low-recombination mutants, although the results are somewhat variable. Mutant A9813 gives somewhat higher recombination frequencies with the single mutants at the right-hand end of the gene (A58, A96, A109), but A9813 is located about 40 codons farther to the left than the other frameshift mutants or the controls.

We conclude that at least two of the three frameshift mutants show the lowfrequency intragenic recombination which is characteristic of the majority of the base substitution mutants which have been examined.

BERGER, BRAMMER and YANOFSKY (1968) also studied revertants of frameshift mutants, which carried base additions or deletions at two closely-linked sites in the A gene. We have compared three of these revertants to wild type for their efficiency as donors in trpA+ transduction, and have found very similar rates. The average frequency of trp+ transductions in all these crosses was about 1.8 times the frequency of the unlinked his+ transduction, as noted previously by YANOFSKY and LENNOX (1959).

Molecular stimulus for high-frequency recombination. What are the significant molecular features which cause high-frequency recombination in crosses involving A23 and low frequency in crosses of A46 (a different base-substitution mutant in the same codon)? There is abundant evidence that crosses involving A23 show high-frequency recombination whether that mutant enters the cross as donor or recipient. Evidence of this type has already been shown in the results of the three-point crosses in Table 2. Many of the two-point combinations of Table 3 were also crossed in both directions, with reciprocal crosses giving similar results. Table 5 gives results of triplicate experiments in which A23 and A46

			Recipient		
Donor	his cys 23	his cys 46	his cys 21	his cys 540	his cys 9813
38-109	1.00	0.05	0.12	0.16	0.04
17	1,12	0.06	0.74	0.57	0.65
58	1.60	0.42	0.78	0.59	1.33
96	1.40	0.20	0.79	0.47	1.00
109	1.48	0.61	0.81	0.77	1.82

**TABLE 4** 

Frequencies of cys+ trp+ transductants in crosses involving frameshift mutants

TABLE	5
-------	---

Recipient	. F	requenc	y
his 17	0.75	0.78	1.11
his 23	1.25	1.28	1.07
his 17	0	0.18	0
his 46	0	0.17	0.09
his 96	1.76	1.74	1.77
his 23	1.64	1.50	1.13
his 96	0.82	0.88	1.01
his 46	0.43	0.38	0.81
	Recipient his 17 his 23 his 17 his 46 his 96 his 23 his 96 his 46	Recipient F   his 17 0.75   his 23 1.25   his 17 0   his 46 0   his 96 1.76   his 23 1.64   his 96 0.82   his 46 0.43	Recipient Frequence   his 17 0.75 0.78   his 23 1.25 1.28   his 17 0 0.18   his 46 0 0.17   his 96 1.76 1.74   his 96 0.82 0.88   his 46 0.43 0.38

Trp+ transduction frequencies in reciprocal crosses

were crossed reciprocally with a nearby mutant on the left (A17) and one on the right (A96).

We should like to know whether it is the molecular sequence of A23 per se which stimulates high-frequency recombination, or the combination of this sequence with the homologous region (codon 211 and environs) of the other parent. YANOFSKY and HORN (1972) have isolated *trpA* mutants in a wild-type strain with an altered sequence in codon 211, which permits us to test this point. All the mutants in the crosses reported above were isolated in the standard wildtype *trpA* gene which has GGA (glycine) in position 211 (YANOFSKY 1963). Among *trp*+ revertants of mutant A23, YANOFSKY and HORN (1972) isolated one which had serine (codon AGU or AGC) at position 211. Starting with this 211-serine wild type, they isolated a new series of *trpA* mutants. We have crossed eight of these mutants to A23 and A46, and the results are shown in Table 6. There are some fluctuations, but in most cases A23 and A46 give similar frequencies of recombination when crossed to the same mutant. We conclude that high recombination depends not only on A23, but on its combination with the homologous sequence in strains carrying 211-glycine.

We cannot be certain whether the levels of recombination shown in the crosses of Table 6 are high or low, because the exact positions are unknown for seven

TABLE 6

utant with 211-serine	X 23	X 46
250	0.29, 0.59	0.10, 0.35
213	0.37, 0.39	0.67, 0.68
231a	0.54, 0.44	0.35, 0.59
245	0.60, 0.67	0.78, 0.55
215C	0.87, 0.73	0.53, 0.54
215a	1.56, 1.76	3.54, 2.85
225	2.24, 1.18	1.56, 1.13
218	2.28	2.26

Trp+ transduction in crosses to mutants in 211-serine genetic background

of the eight mutants in the serine-211 trpA gene. Mutant 218 is in codon 22 (YANOFSKY and HORN 1972). Recombination in the crosses of this mutant to A23 and A46 occurs at typical LR rates.

Comparison of ochre mutants to amber mutants at the same site: Starting with an ochre (UAA) mutant, it is possible to obtain mutations to amber (UAG) in the same codon by selecting revertants in a strain carrying an amber suppressor. In this way we have obtained the amber mutants corresponding to ochre mutants A54 and A17. Amber mutants corresponding to A38 and A96 were kindly supplied by C. YANOFSKY, who obtained them by the same procedure.

Table 7 shows the results of experiments in which the members of an ochreamber pair were both crossed to the same single or double-mutant parent. In three of the pairs the two members do not differ significantly in recombination behavior. In all these pairs, both members show low-frequency recombination. Ochre mutant A54 shows high-frequency recombination. The change to the amber sequence converts it to a low-recombination mutant.

TA	BL	Æ	7

Comparison of trp+ recombinant frequencies for crosses of ochre and amber mutants at the same site

Other parent	38oc	38am	Other parent	54oc	54am
17	2.63	2.28	38	2.54	0.39
88	3.84	1.94	88	8.60	2.26
33	0.75	1.11	33	1.76	0.24
46A	3.66	2.86	13	2.53	0.40
96	2.74	3.60	23	6.50	4.20
96am	2.37	2.81	17	6.23	3.52
13	0.66	0.48	58	10.57	4.12
			78	8.03	3.81
			96	9.88	3.37
			109	6.51	2.68
			3896	1.33	0.02
Other parent	17oc	17am	Other parent	96oc	96am
38	1.55	0.50	54	7.99	5.42
54	2.54	4.56	54am	3.44	3.75
54am	1.76	2.39	13	1.31	1.21
23	1.11	0.56	17	0.69	0.46
46	0	0	58	0.28	0.43
33	1.03	0	78	0.38	0.20
88	2.99	2.65	23	1.93	2.32
96	0.98	0.55	46	0.76	1.32
38–96	0.24	0	46A	0.87	0.89
			88	3.85	3.26
			33	2.27	1.67
			38	2.74	2.37
			38am	3.60	2.81

432

NORKIN (1970) compared the recombination behavior of ochre and amber mutants in the same codon of the beta-galactosidase z gene of E. coli in a conjugation experiment. His results, like ours, showed no consistent differences between ochre and amber mutants in recombination.

Marker-specific effects and recB,C function: Mutation in either of the closelylinked genes recB and recC results in a drop of recombination frequency to less than 5% (WILLETTS and MOUNT 1969) and in the disappearance of a specific endonuclease (OISHI 1969). BARBOUR et al. (1970) have obtained revertants which have recovered normal frequencies of recombination as a result of suppressor mutations, and they have shown that the BC nuclease is still absent in these suppressed mutants. Two of these suppressed rec mutant strains were kindly supplied to us by A. J. CLARK along with the rec+ strain from which they were derived. TrpA mutants were introduced into these strains by transduction. They were then used as recipients in two-point trpA crosses in order to observe the pattern of intragenic recombination in that genetic background. The results are shown in Table 8. It is clear that the high-recombination behavior of A23 persists in the absence of the BC nuclease. (Note that the frequencies of trpA recombination are higher in this genetic background, but that the difference between A23 and A46 is still seen, particularly in the three-point crosses.)

Segregation of an unselected marker: TrpE is linked to trpA, four gene lengths to the left. TrpE mutants grow on minimal medium supplemented with anthranilate, but trpA mutants do not. In crosses segregating at both loci, we can select recombinants at trpA on anthranilate and then score them for the unselected trpE marker by replicating to minimal.

In "one-point" crosses at trpA (recipient is trpA, donor is trpA+), about 90% of the trpA+ transductants carry the trpE marker from the donor as well (Table 9a). Among trpA+ recombinants from two-point crosses in which the selected site from the donor is to the left of that from the recipient, the inclusion of the donor marker from trpE drops to well below 90% (Table 9b). This result is another demonstration of negative interference. It means that when we select for an *exchange within trpA* (as opposed to merely selecting for inclusion of donor material from trpA) we are selecting a subset of transductants which frequently have another exchange nearby to the left.

Recipients		58	Donors 96	38-96	
 rec+:	23	2.84	4.34	3.38	
	46	2.33	2.37	0.17	
recB sbcA:	23	2.77	2.52	1.79	
	46	1.31	1.06	0.18	
recB sbcB:	23	2.28	1.70	1.75	
	46	1.42	1.43	0.20	

TABLE 8

Marker effects in trpA recombination in cells with a suppressed rec mutant

#### TABLE 9

a) One-point crosse	es at <i>trpA</i> :			
Donor <u>+</u>	<del>+</del>		DE	+•
Recipient			R	
E	A		·+·	A
$WT \times E$ -33	72/75 490/520	95%	$E \times 33$	29/360 8%
WT  imes E-88	103/124 657/735	89%	$E \times 88$	36/305 12%
$\mathrm{WT}  imes E$ -46	237/258	92%		
$WT \times E$ -23	346/375	92%		
b) Two-point cross	es between LR mutants	at <i>trpA</i> :		
D+	+ A2		DE	+ A2
R	_		R	
E	A1 +		+	A1 +
$46 \times E$ -33	173/268 65%		E-58 $ imes$ 46	138/262 53%
7  imes E-33	132/249 53%		$E-7 \times 33$	30/68 44%
c) Two-point cross	es in which recipient m	utant is H	R:	
D+	+ A2		DE	+ A2
R			R	
E	A1 +		+	A1 +
$46 \times E$ -88	393/917 43%		E-58 $ imes$ 23	196/253 77%
7  imes E-88	199/590 34%		$E-7 \times 88$	108/131 81%
$58 \times E$ -23	52/191 27%			

Segregation of unselected marker at trpE among trpA+ transductants

Note: Results are recorded as fractions in which the denominator is the total number of A+ transductants and the numerator is the number of E+ A+ among them. At the right is the percentage of E+ A+ transductants among total A+ transductants.

Two-point crosses in which the recipient carries a high-recombination mutant at trpA are presented in Table 9c. Here the frequencies of inclusion of the donor markers at trpE fall even lower. This is a further demonstration that recombination involving these mutants is like gene conversion—the inclusion of a very short segment of genetic information from one parent in a recombinant which is otherwise identical to the other parent.

## DISCUSSION

Marker effects may be of two kinds. If heterozygosity *per se* had a consistent effect on recombination, this could be called a "general marker effect". If a certain segregating mutant affected recombination differently from others, this could be called a "specific marker effect".

General marker effects: One type of general marker effect has been proposed by HOLLIDAY (1964) and is called "map expansion": the close proximity of two segregating sites inhibits the effective pairing which is a necessary precondition for recombination, the degree of inhibition being some inverse function of the distance between the sites. Map expansion would generate a decreasing frequency of recombination per distance in two-point crosses as the segregating sites approached each other. This is the reverse of the trend seen in the present study (Figure 1). Our observations could result from the opposite kind of a general marker effect: closely-spaced segregating sites *increasing* the likelihood of recombination. Alternatively, this trend might occur in the absence of general marker effects if exchanges frequently occurred in pairs separated by a distance similar to that between our closer-spaced mutants; between farther-spaced mutants there would be some double exchanges which would not yield recombinants.

Specific marker effects: The two-point and three-point crosses clearly demonstrate specific marker effects at the trpA locus. Strong evidence for markerspecific effects has also been observed at the lacZ locus of E. coli by NORKIN (1970). He studied intragenic recombination between markers at known sites in conjugation crosses.

What properties of the HR mutants are responsible for their recombination behavior? There are no simple molecular properties which are common to the three HR mutants and absent in the LR set. All three HR mutants resulted from base substitutions, but so did several LR mutants. The location of the HR mutants within the A gene does not appear significant. A88 and A54 are rather near the left end, and A23 is rather near the right end. In each case we know at least one LR mutant in the same codon as the HR mutant. A23 is missense, A88 is amber, and A54 is ochre; all three of these classes occur also among the LR mutants. A23 resulted from a transition, and A88 from a transversion. (The mutational origin of A54 is not known.) The LR mutants include all classes of base-substitution mutants as well as frameshift mutants.

The base sequence in the region around HR mutant A23 is mostly known (BERGER, BRAMMAR and YANOFSKY 1968) and that around HR mutant A88 is partially known (DRAPEAU, BRAMMAR and YANOFSKY 1968). They have no obvious common features which could explain the specific marker effects (see Table 10).

NORKIN (1970) suggested that some marker effects might be explained by phenotypically non-mutant base substitutions which occurred at sites other than the mutant site and which affected the frequency of recombination. There is good

leu	glu	leu	 leu	gln	_gly_	phe	gly
<sup>U</sup> cU? <i>A81</i> <i>A3</i>	GAG 3 UAG ar 3 AUG m	U <sub>C</sub> U? nber et	 UUG A	CAG A2 A4 A46as A46aspMU	GGA 3 AGA a 6 GAA a p GAU a T GAC a	UUU arg glu asp asp	GG <sup>∪</sup> c

TABLE 10

Molecular sequences at sites of known marker effects at the trpA locus

Base sequences represent mRNA codons for the wild-type gene and for various mutants. Underlined sequences represent HR mutants. evidence that such second-site effects are not involved in the difference in recombination shown by A23 and A46, as YANOFSKY *et al.* (1964) have pointed out. They recorded several independent occurrences of the A23 mutation and of the A46 mutation, end, in each case, the amino acid substitution correlated with the recombination behavior.

The nature of specific marker effects: How do the HR mutants alter the recombination process? They do not cause a significant increase in the number of basic recombination events; the frequency of trp+ transductants in one-point crosses is much the same for HR mutant A23 as for LR mutants. However, if the other parent carries a nearby trpA mutant, the HR effect on trp+ recombinant frequency is maximal. Therefore, we conclude that the presence of an HR mutant increases the likelihood of nearby exchanges per recombination event. The experiment with an unselected marker (Table 9c) and the three-point crosses (Table 2) indicate that HR mutants are frequently associated with multiple exchanges spanning very short segments.

Integration of donor material into recombinants: The experiments which employed trpE as an unselected marker provide strong evidence for negative interference: the clustering of two or more exchanges. In the crosses in which an exchange within trpA was required (Table 9b), a significant fraction of the transductants had a second exchange between trpE and trpA. A similar conclusion was reached by CRAWFORD and PREISS (1972) who used P1 transduction to study intragenic recombination at trpB (which is adjacent to trpA). They had unselected markers on both sides, and this revealed that a large proportion of the intragenic (trpB+) recombinants had parental marker combinations, especially if the two segregating sites in trpB were very close together.

The clusters of exchanges might occur anywhere along the donor segment which has been transferred into the recipient cell, and any cluster might include either an odd or even number of exchanges. However, the *effective* exchanges would be singles or odd-number clusters, and they would appear at both ends of an integrated segment of donor material. Even-numbered clusters would insert short segments of genetic information from one parent within a longer segment from the other parent; if the successive exchanges within a cluster were only about 0.1 gene length apart, the genetic results of even-number clusters would be negligible (unless they were much more frequent than odd-number events.)

The results of the experiments on trpA transduction with the unselected marker at trpE lead us to propose the following model. Odd-number exchanges occur at random sites along a donor chromosome fragment paired with the homologous region of a recipient chromosome. The average distance between two odd-number exchange events in the same cell is about forty gene lengths. Between or around the odd-number events there may be some even-number exchange events. The genetic consequences of the even-number events are expected to be minimal, but they may become important in regard to the HR mutants. It is possible that these mutants achieve their frequent recombination by inducing even-number events around themselves. The estimate of 40 gene lengths for an integrated donor piece was derived from the frequency of cotransduction of trpE and trpA (Table 9a): ten percent of those transductants carrying trpA+ from the donor are terminated within the four-gene span to trpE. A similar figure (about 45 gene lengths) could be derived from the absolute frequencies of trpA+ transductants in one-point and two-point crosses: the average frequency in one-point crosses (wild-type donor) is 180% (of *his*+ transductants) while the frequency of recombination between two mutants at opposite ends of trpA is four percent; thus 4/180 of the integrated donor segments terminate within one gene length of the selected site.

DOERMANN and PARMA (1967) studied T4 crosses involving a partial phage genome and a helper phage and observed a high frequency of exchanges (negative interference) near the ends of the partial phage. It is possible that a similar phenomenon occurs in the transduction system: odd-number exchanges occurring at the ends of the donor fragment. However, this cannot be established without independent evidence on the genetic content of the donor fragment. Odd-number events occur, by definition, at the ends of the *integrated* donor segment, regardless of whether the donor segment brought in by the phage extended beyond these points. Physical studies (IKEDA and TOMIZAWA 1965) have shown that the transducing phage carries a piece of bacterial DNA with a molecular weight of  $6 \times 10^7$ . This would be 90,000 base pairs, which corresponds to about 70 genes of the size of those in the *trp* region (YANOFSKY *et al.* 1971).

Integration of two separate donor segments: DEMEREC and DEMEREC (1956) assumed that a double exchange was required to integrate a single donor segment (in P22 transduction in Salmonella) and a quadruple was required to integrate two separate segments. They assumed that double exchanges would be significantly more frequent than quadruples, and they used this assumption in the analysis of three-point crosses to determine the order of the genes for tryptophan synthesis. The same assumptions might apply here, with the qualification that what they termed double exchanges correspond to what we have called two separate odd-number exchange events.

In the crosses reported here in which three segregating sites are in the same gene (Table 2), there is little evidence that the double exchange type is more likely than the quadruple. (In this situation the markers are so closely spaced that the separate exchanges of a cluster may each produce an effective exchange.) The production of a prototroph should require a quadruple exchange when the donor is the single mutant, while a double exchange should suffice when the donor is the double mutant. However, most of the pairs of reciprocal crosses show very similar results. Among the six pairs of crosses involving the HR mutants, three show almost identical frequencies for reciprocal crosses; the other three show a twofold excess of the double exchange type over the quadruple exchange type. This result is ambiguous, but the absence of any pronounced excess of the double exchange type may mean that intragenic recombinants are produced from an intermediate structure in which donor and recipient genetic information have parity. This structure might be a "hybrid DNA" molecule (complementary strands which came from separate molecules or chromosomes), as envisaged by WHITEHOUSE (1963) and by HOLLIDAY (1964).

Mutational analysis of the recombination process: The experiment involving the suppressed recB mutant strains (Table 8) gave a negative result: it failed to show any involvement of the recB gene product in the occurrence of marker effects. However, we believe this is a promising approach to the problem of the mechanism of recombination. It may be possible to dissect this complex process into its simpler components by identifying the specific roles of the genes which are involved.

Recombination may be considered as a two-step process: the formation or preparation of a structure capable of producing recombinants, and the resolution of recombinants from this structure. Numerous ideas and models have been proposed and a common feature of several of them has been a recombinogenic structure (the product of step one) involving a region of hybrid DNA.

Regarding step one, the mutation approach in phage T4 has already led to considerable insights into the sequence of events in terms of the physical structures of DNA intermediates and the function of specific enzymes (TOMIZAWA 1967; BROKER and LEHMAN 1971). Step two, however, remains largely hypothetical, although the study of transfection products from artificial heteroduplex molecules of DNA (SPATZ and TRAUTNER 1970) offers a promising approach.

We are extremely grateful to CHARLES YANOFSKY, VIRGINIA HORN, and MIRIAM BONNER for providing us with the materials, teaching us the procedures and advising us during these experiments.

#### LITERATURE CITED

- BARBOUR, S. D., H. NAGAISHI, A. TEMPLIN and A. J. CLARK, 1970 Biochemical and genetic studies of recombination proficiency in *Escherichia coli*. II. Rec+ revertants caused by indirect suppression of rec- mutations. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S. **67**: 128-135.
- BERGER, H., W. J. BRAMMAR and C. YANOFSKY, 1968 Spontaneous and ICR191-A-induced frameshift mutations in the A gene of *Escherichia coli* tryptophan synthetase. J. Bacteriol. 96: 1672–1679.
- BRAMMAR, W. J., H. BERGER and C. YANOFSKY, 1967 Altered amino acid sequences produced by reversion of frameshift mutants of tryptophan synthetase A gene of E. coli. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S. 58: 1499–1506.
- BROKER, T. E. and I. R. LEHMAN, 1971 Branched DNA molecules: intermediates in T4 recombination. J. Mol. Biol. 60: 131–149.
- CHASE, M. and A. H. DOERMANN, 1958 High negative interference over short segments of the genetic structure of bacteriophage T4. Genetics **43**: 332–353.
- CRAWFORD, I. P. and J. PREISS, 1972 Distribution of closely linked markers following intragenic recombination in *Escherichia coli*. J. Mol. Biol. **71**: 717-733.
- DEMEREC, M. and Z. E. DEMEREC, 1956 Analysis of linkage relationships in Salmonella by transduction techniques. Brookhaven Symp. in Biology 8: 75-87.
- DOERMANN, A. H. and D. H. PARMA, 1967 Recombination in bacteriophage T4. J. Cell Physiol. **70** (suppl.): 147–164.
- DRAPEAU, G. R., W. J. BRAMMAR and C. YANOFSKY, 1968 Amino acid replacements of the glutamic acid residue at position 48 in the tryptophan synthetsae A protein of *Escherichia coli*. J. Mol. Biol. **35**: 357–367.

- Gurz, H., 1971 Site specific induction of gene conversion in Schizosaccharomyces pombe. Genetics 69: 317-337.
- HOLLIDAY, R., 1964 A mechanism for gene conversion in fungi. Genet. Res. 5: 282-304.
- IKEDA, H. and J. TOMIZAWA, 1965 Transducing fragments in generalized transduction. I. Molecular origin of the fragments. J. Mol. Biol. 14: 85-109.
- KRUSZEWSKA, A. and W. GAJEWSKI, 1967 Recombination within the Y locus in Ascobolus immersus. Genet. Res. 9: 159-177.
- MALING, B. and C. YANOFSKY, 1961 The properties of altered proteins from mutants bearing one or two lesions in the same gene. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S. 47: 551-566.
- NORKIN, L. C., 1970 Marker-specific effects in genetic recombination. J. Mol. Biol. 51: 633-655.
- OISHI, M., 1969 An ATP-dependent deoxyribonuclease from *Escherichia coli* with a possible role in genetic recombination. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S. **64**: 1292–1299.
- SPATZ, H. C. and T. A. TRAUTNER, 1970 One way to do experiments on gene conversion? Transfection with heteroduplex SPP1 DNA. Molec. Gen. Genetics 109: 84–106.
- TOMIZAWA, J., 1967 Molecular mechanisms of genetic recombination in bacteriophage: joint molecules and their conversion to recombinant molecules. J. Cell Physiol. **70** (Suppl.): 201–214.
- WHITEHOUSE, H. L. K., 1963 A theory of crossing-over by means of hybrid deoxyribonucleic acid. Nature **199:** 1034–1040.
- WILLETTS, N. S. and D. W. MOUNT, 1969 Genetic analysis of recombination-deficient mutants of *Escherichia coli* K12 carrying *rec* mutations cotransducible with *thyA*. J. Bacteriol. 100: 923-934.
- YANOFSKY, C., 1963 Amino acid replacements associated with mutation and recombination in the A gene and their relationship to in vitro coding data. Cold Spring Harbor Symp. on Quant. Biol. 28: 581-588.
- YANOFSKY, C., B. C. CARLTON, J. R. GUEST, D. R. HELINSKI and U. HENNING, 1964 On the colinearity of gene structure and protein structure. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S. 51: 266-272.
- YANOFSKY, C. and V. HORN, 1972 Tryptophan synthetase  $\alpha$  chain positions affected by mutations near the ends of the genetic map of *trpA* of *Escherichia coli*. J. Biol. Chem. **247**: 4494-4498.
- YANOFSKY, C., V. HORN, M. BONNER and S. STASIOWSKI, 1971 Polarity and enzyme functions in mutants of the first three genes of the tryptophan operon of *Escherichia coli*. Genetics 69: 409-433.
- YANOFSKY, C. and J. ITO, 1966 Nonsense codons and polarity in the tryptophan operon. J. Mol. Biol. 21: 313-334.
- YANOFSKY, C. and E. S. LENNOX, 1959 Transduction and recombination study of linkage relationships among the genes controlling tryptophan synthesis in *Escherichia coli*. Virology 8: 425-447.

Corresponding editor: D. KAISER