The Sesbania Root Symbionts Sinorhizobium saheli and S. teranga bv. sesbaniae Can Form Stem Nodules on Sesbania rostrata, although They Are Less Adapted to Stem Nodulation than Azorhizobium caulinodans

CATHERINE BOIVIN,¹* IBRAHIM NDOYE,² GILLES LORTET,¹ AMADOU NDIAYE,¹ PHILIPPE de LAJUDIE,¹ and BERNARD DREYFUS¹

Laboratoire de Microbiologie, ORSTOM,¹ and Département de Biologie Végétale, Université Cheikh Anta Diop,² Dakar, Sénégal

Received 2 July 1996/Accepted 20 December 1996

Sesbania species can establish symbiotic interactions with rhizobia from two taxonomically distant genera, including the Sesbania rostrata stem-nodulating Azorhizobium sp. and Azorhizobium caulinodans and the newly described Sinorhizobium saheli and Sinorhizobium teranga by. sesbaniae, isolated from the roots of various Sesbania species. A collection of strains from both groups were analyzed for their symbiotic properties with different Sesbania species. S. saheli and S. teranga by, sesbaniae strains were found to effectively stem nodulate Sesbania rostrata, showing that stem nodulation is not restricted to Azorhizobium. Sinorhizobia and azorhizobia, however, exhibited clear differences in other aspects of symbiosis. Unlike Azorhizobium, S. teranga bv. sesbaniae and S. saheli did not induce effective stem nodules on plants previously inoculated on the roots, although stem nodulation was arrested at different stages. For Sesbania rostrata root nodulation, Sinorhizobium appeared more sensitive than Azorhizobium to the presence of combined nitrogen. S. saheli and S. teranga by, sesbaniae were effective symbionts with all Sesbania species tested, while Azorhizobium strains fixed nitrogen only in symbiosis with Sesbania rostrata. In a simple screening test, S. saheli and S. teranga by. sesbaniae were incapable of asymbiotic nitrogenase activity. Thus, Azorhizobium can easily be distinguished from Sinorhizobium among Sesbania symbionts on the basis of symbiotic and free-living nitrogen fixation. The ability of Azorhizobium to overcome the systemic plant control appears to be a stem adaptation function. This last property, together with its host-specific symbiotic nitrogen fixation, makes Azorhizobium highly specialized for stem nodulation of the aquatic legume Sesbania rostrata.

Biological nitrogen fixation by legumes is the result of a symbiotic relationship between the host plant and rhizobia. Rhizobia elicit the formation of specialized organs called nodules on their legume host. In nodules, which are usually formed on the roots, rhizobia can reduce N_2 to ammonia, which is then used by the plant as a source of nitrogen. This biological N_2 fixation is exploited in agriculture by using legume crops as an alternative to the application of nitrogen fertilizer.

One of the most exciting recent advances in the agricultural use of biological N_2 fixation is the development of an annual tropical African legume shrub, *Sesbania rostrata*, as a green manure crop for lowland rice. *Sesbania rostrata* grows rapidly in the wet season, producing high levels of biomass even in flooded conditions, and exhibits high rates of nitrogen accumulation, making this species one of the most valuable legumes (17, 21). The genus *Sesbania* includes about 50 species, which are widespread throughout tropical and subtropical areas. Most species are annual or biannual herbs or shrubs (*Sesbania rostrata, Sesbania pubescens*, and *Sesbania pachycarpa*), but a few are small trees (*Sesbania grandiflora, Sesbania sesban*, and *Sesbania javanica*). Many exhibit potential for use in paddy fields, intercropping, agroforestry, and food production (1).

Except for *Sesbania rostrata*, very little work has been done with rhizobia that nodulate these agriculturally important legumes. *Sesbania rostrata* establishes a highly specific interacnamed species, Azorhizobium caulinodans (7, 10), which is phylogenetically separated from other rhizobia (10). This symbiosis exhibits several unusual features (for reviews, see references 2 and 4). Like other rhizobia, A. caulinodans induces effective nodules on roots, but it also nodulates the stems of Sesbania rostrata at the sites of dormant root primordia (11, 30). Compared to root nodulation, stem nodulation and related N₂ fixation are less inhibited by combined nitrogen (7, 19). A. caulinodans also has the unique capacity among rhizobia to fix N₂ in the free-living state and to utilize fixed nitrogen for growth (9). Sesbania rostrata and other Sesbania species also can enter

tion with the genus Azorhizobium, which contains only one

into symbiosis with other rhizobia (10, 25), including the newly described species Sinorhizobium saheli and Sinorhizobium teranga (5). The latter species has been subdivided into by. sesbaniae (Sesbania-nodulating strains) and by. acaciae (Acacianodulating strains) (18). S. saheli and S. teranga belong to the group containing Rhizobium meliloti and Rhizobium fredii, which have recently been placed in the genus Sinorhizobium, which is phylogenetically distant from Azorhizobium (5). The ability of such distantly related bacteria to establish interactions with Sesbania species raises the questions of whether sinorhizobia exhibit the unusual characteristics of azorhizobia, i.e., stem nodulation and free-living N2 fixation, and whether they have similar or specific symbiotic properties. More knowledge of both symbioses may improve the use of Sesbania as a green manure. Furthermore, S. rostrata, with its dual nodulation topology, offers a unique system for investigating which

^{*} Corresponding author. Mailing address: Laboratoire de Microbiologie, ORSTOM, BP 1386, Dakar, Sénégal. Phone: (221) 32 07 13. Fax: (221) 32 16 75. E-mail: boivinc@belair.orstom.sn.

TABLE 1. Wild-type strains used in this study

Strain	Original host plant	Geograph- ical origin	Reference or source		
Sinorhizobium saheli					
ORS600	Sesbania pachycarpa	Senegal	7		
ORS609T	Sesbania cannabina	Senegal	7		
ORS611	Sesbania grandiflora	Senegal	7		
Sinorhizobium teranga					
bv. sesbaniae ^a					
ORS8	Sesbania rostrata ^b	Senegal	7		
ORS15	Sesbania sp.	Senegal	7		
ORS19	Sesbania cannabina	Senegal	7		
ORS22	Sesbania rostrata ^b	Senegal	7		
ORS51	Sesbania rostrata ^b	Senegal	7		
ORS52	Sesbania rostrata ^b	Senegal	7		
ORS53	Sesbania rostrata ^b	Senegal	7		
ORS604	Sesbania aculeata	Senegal	7		
ORS613	Sesbania sesban	Senegal	7		
ORS1013	Acacia senegal ^c	Senegal	7		
Azorhizobium cauli-					
nodans					
ORS571T	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	6		
ORS590	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	6		
OR\$591	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Madagascar	6		
OR\$592	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Madagascar	6		
Azorhizobium sp.					
ORS56	Sesbania rostrata ^b	Senegal	This study		
ORS314	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
ORS470	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
ORS478	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
ORS484	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
ORS494	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
ORS500	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
ORS552	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
ORS599	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	This study		
$SG05^e$	Sesbania rostrata ^d	Senegal	29		

^{*a*} In *S. teranga*, two biovars, bv. sesbaniae (*Sesbania*-nodulating strains) and bv. acaciae (*Acacia*-nodulating strains) have been distinguished on the basis of host specificity (18).

^b Strains isolated from root nodules.

^c ORS1013 originates from *A. senegal* but was shown to be a *Sesbania*-nodulating strain (20).

^d Strains isolated from stem nodules of Sesbania rostrata.

^e SG05 was shown to belong to a genomic species separate from *A. caulinodans* (25).

bacterial properties are essential for stem nodulation, a property contributing to its considerable N_2 fixing ability (17. To evaluate and compare their symbiotic properties towards *Sesbania* species, a collection of *S. saheli, S. teranga* by sesbaniae, *A. caulinodans*, and *Azorhizobium* sp. was investigated for stem and root nodulation of *Sesbania rostrata* and for root nodulation of various other *Sesbania* species, as well as for symbiotic and free-living N_2 fixation.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Bacterial strains, media, and growth conditions. Wild-type strains used in this study are described in Table 1. *Azorhizobium* sp. strains were isolated from naturally occurring *Sesbania rostrata* stem nodules harvested from different regions in Senegal, as already described (10). The taxonomic position of these isolates was assessed by auxanographic tests and whole-cell-protein electrophoretic analysis (sodium dodecyl sulfate-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis), which indicated that they are different strains (14). ORS571*nifA*⁻, an ineffective mutant of *A. caulinodans* ORS571, has been previously described (15). *Sinorhizobium* strains were grown on yeast extract-mannitol agar (5). Strains of *Azorhizobium* were maintained on solid lactate medium (9), and liquid cultures were grown in solid lactate medium supplemented with nicotinic acid (20 mg/liter). All

strains were grown at 37°C. Strains of *S. saheli* and *S. teranga* by sesbaniae but not of *Azorhizobium* were resistant to nalidixic acid (200 μ g/ml) and erythromycin (100 μ g/ml). Strains of *Azorhizobium* and *S. saheli* but not *S. teranga* by sesbaniae were resistant to carbenicillin (100 μ g/ml).

Nodulation tests. Seeds were surface sterilized by immersion in concentrated sulfuric acid for 30 to 60 min and washed and soaked in water for 24 h. Surface-sterilized seeds were germinated at 30° C for 24 to 48 h and then transferred to Gibson tubes containing nitrogen-free Jensen slant agar (32) and Jensen liquid medium (with or without nitrogen as mentioned below) for root and/or stem nodulation trials; six to eight plants were tested for each strain. The plants were grown under continuous light (20 W/m²) at 28°C. Sterile Jensen liquid medium was added when necessary.

For root nodulation tests, nitrogen-free liquid Jensen medium was used as plant growth medium, except where stated otherwise, and 3- to 4-day-old seedlings were inoculated by addition of a few drops of exponential-phase liquid culture.

For stem nodulation tests, tubes containing nitrogen-free Jensen slant agar were filled with Jensen liquid medium supplemented with 3 mM NH₄NO₃ before seedling transfer. After 3 weeks, the liquid medium was removed completely and replaced by nitrogen-free Jensen liquid medium. Simultaneously, stems were spray inoculated with exponential-phase liquid cultures. For stem nodulation of previously root-inoculated plants, plants were prepared as for stem nodulation tests. Eighteen days after seedling transfer, liquid medium was completely removed and replaced with nitrogen-free Jensen liquid medium. Simultaneously, roots were inoculated with A. caulinodans ORS571. Two days after root inoculation, stems were inoculated as described above. Alternatively, plants were prepared as for root nodulation tests and roots of 4-day-old seedlings were inoculated with A. caulinodans ORS571. Next, stem inoculation was performed on 3-week-old plants as mentioned above. In all cases, plants were harvested 3 weeks after stem inoculation and examined for nodules. Effectiveness was estimated by measuring the fresh weights of aerial parts and by visual observation of plant vigor and foliage color of 45- to 60-day-old plants.

Microscopy. Stem nodules of *Sesbania rostrata* inoculated with *S. teranga* ORS604 were collected on days 2, 7, and 14 after inoculation. Nodules were fixed for 1 h in 2.5% glutaraldehyde in a 0.1 M sodium cacodylate buffer (pH 7.2) and postfixed for 1 h in 1% osmium tetroxide in the same buffer. Fixed samples were then rapidly washed with distilled water and dehydrated through graded ethanol solutions and propylene oxide before being embedded in Spurrs. Spurrs-embedded samples were cut on a Reichert Ultracut ultramicrotome. Semithin sections (0.95 μ m) were laid on a slide and stained by the basic fuchsin-methylene blue method (22) before observation by bright-field microscopy.

Asymbiotic nitrogenase activity assays. Rubber-capped tubes (15 ml) containing 6 ml of semisolid LO medium (9) were inoculated by a deep prick method with a fresh culture of bacteria and left for 30 h at 30° C. C_2H_2 was then injected to a 2% final volume in the gas phase. After 6 days, samples of gas were analyzed for C_2H_4 production with a Varian Aerograph model 1400 gas chromatograph with a flame ionization detector.

RESULTS

S. saheli and S. teranga by. sesbaniae can nodulate Sesbania rostrata on the stem. Among Sesbania species, Sesbania rostrata is unique in developing stem nodules at dormant root primordia present in rows along the stem when it is inoculated with A. caulinodans (8). The Sesbania rostrata stem nodulation ability of rhizobia isolated from Sesbania roots and identified as S. saheli or S. teranga by. sesbaniae was evaluated. Test strains included both A. caulinodans and Azorhizobium sp. (Table 1). All the Sinorhizobium strains tested were able to nodulate stems of root-uninoculated Sesbania rostrata plants grown in nitrogen-free conditions (partially presented in Table 2 and Fig. 1). Bacteria were reisolated from the nodules induced by several different strains of S. saheli and S. teranga and were shown to correspond to the inoculant strains on the basis of antibiotic resistance (see Materials and Methods), growth on different media, and colony morphology (5, 10). Between strains of the two genera, no significant differences in nodule number, fresh weights (Table 1), or the kinetics of nodule development were observed (data not shown). The cortex of nodules induced by S. saheli and S. teranga was dark red, indicating the presence of functional leghemoglobin. Twomonth-old plants nodulated by either Sinorhizobium or Azorhizobium strains looked similarly green and healthy, and their aerial parts were of equivalent sizes and fresh weights (data not

TABLE 2. Stem nodulation of Sesbania rostrata	by S. saheli, S. teranga, A.	caulinodans, and Azorhizobium sp. ^a
---	------------------------------	--

Strain	No.	of stem nodules/plan	t	Stem nodule fresh wt (mg/plant)					
	Without previous	After root in	oculation by:	Without previous	After root inoculation by:				
	root inoculation	Treatment A	Treatment B	root inoculation	Treatment A	Treatment B			
S. saheli									
ORS600	10.6^{c}	7.4^{c}	4.1^{c}	109.6^{c}	7.0^d	6.6^{d}			
ORS609	2.1^{c}	4.9^{c}	9.5^{d}	28.7^{c}	4.4^{d}	9.8^{d}			
ORS611	4.2^{c}	2.9^{c}	9.1^{d}	77.4^{c}	2.1^{d}	11.8^{d}			
S. teranga bv. sesbaniae									
ORS15	8.3^{c}	ND	ND	75.9^{c}	ND	ND			
ORS19	9.6^{c}	1.5^{d}	3.9^{d}	128.3^{c}	1.8^{d}	1.8^{d}			
ORS22	12.1^{c}	0.4^d	3.5^{d}	166.8^{c}	0.4^d	6.5^{d}			
ORS51	16.6^{c}	0.0^d	0.0^d	69.5^{c}	0.0^d	0.0^d			
ORS52	ND	ND	0.1^{d}	ND	ND	0.0^d			
ORS53	10.2^{c}	0.0^d	3.6^{d}	63.4^{c}	0.0^d	10.1^{d}			
ORS604	11.4^{c}	0.5^{d}	3.4^{d}	117.5^{c}	0.1^d	4.4^{d}			
ORS613	13.5^{c}	0.0^d	1.9^{d}	128.8^{c}	0.0^d	0.8^d			
ORS1013	12.3^{c}	0.0^d	4.5^{d}	126.3^{c}	0.0^d	4.2^{d}			
A. caulinodans									
ORS571	8.5^{c}	19.4^{d}	20.4^{d}	117.6^{c}	32.6^{d}	48.9^{d}			
ORS590	21.9^{c}	ND	ND	156.9^{c}	ND	ND			
ORS591	14.8^{c}	14.5^{c}	12.2^{c}	83.9^{c}	11.9^{d}	14.2^{d}			
OR\$592	14.2^{c}	17.2^{c}	15.9^{c}	138.5 ^c	23.9^{d}	38.1 ^d			
Azorhizobium sp.									
ORS314	11.8^{c}	ND	17.6^{c}	119.5^{c}	ND	38.6^{d}			
ORS470	10.1^{c}	9.1 ^c	12.7^{c}	107.2^{c}	7.1^{d}	20.6^{d}			
ORS552	13.4^{c}	15.6^{c}	20.0^{c}	135.4 ^c	22.4^{d}	46.2^{d}			
ORS599	11.4^{c}	10.0^{c}	19.4^{d}	121.4^{c}	14.0^{d}	46.6^{d}			

^{*a*} Stem inoculation was performed on 3-week-old plants, and nodulation ability was observed 3 weeks after stem inoculation, as described in Materials and Methods. Only easily detachable nodular structures were considered nodules, and their numbers and fresh weights were determined. In treatment A, stem inoculation was performed 2 days after root inoculation of 18-day-old plants with ORS571. In treatment B, stem inoculation was performed 20 days after root inoculation of 4-day-old seedlings with ORS571. All numbers are means from eight replications. Stem nodule numbers and stem nodule fresh weights on the same line and followed by different letters are significantly different (Fisher test, $P \le 0.05$). Independent experiments gave similar results. ND, not determined.

shown). Thus, sinorhizobia and azorhizobia were equally effective.

The organization of young and mature stem nodules induced by S. teranga ORS604 was studied. From light microscopy of semithin nodule sections, the infection process was intercellular (crack entry) (Fig. 2B) and revealed the presence of large infection pockets extending inward towards cortical plant cells (Fig. 2B and C). Narrow infection threads originating from the infection pockets grew towards meristematic cells induced in the plant cortex (Fig. 2C). Developing Sesbania rostrata stem nodules contained an actively dividing nodule meristem located at the periphery (Fig. 2A and B), an intermediary zone, and a central region corresponding to the N_2 -fixing zone (Fig. 2B), an organization similar to that of indeterminate nodules of other plants (31). The central tissue contained both infected and uninfected cells (Fig. 2D). When meristematic activity ceased, 2 weeks after inoculation, mature nodules possessed a large central mass of N2-fixing cells surrounded by peripheral tissues (data not shown), a histological organization typical of determinate nodules. The peripheral tissues comprised an outer layer of periderm, nodule parenchyma cells, and vascular bundles (data not shown).

Previous root inoculation inhibits stem nodulation by *S. saheli* and *S. teranga* **bv. sesbaniae.** Stem nodulation requires the development of root primordia on the stem. In the field, root nodulation usually occurs before stem nodulation. We thus studied the effect of root inoculation on subsequent stem nodulation. For this purpose, *S. saheli, S. teranga* by. sesbaniae, *A. caulinodans*, or *Azorhizobium* sp. strains were inoculated on *Sesbania rostrata* stems, either 2 days after root inoculation of 18-day-old plants (treatment A) or 20 days after root inoculation of 4-day-old seedlings (treatment B), with *A. caulinodans* ORS571.

Previous root inoculation had no effect on the formation or the number of stem nodules induced by *Azorhizobium* strains (Table 2). In all cases, 100% of the plants were nodulated and nearly all the nodules fixed N_2 , as estimated by the dark-red color of the nodule interior (data not shown). However, a significant reduction of the nodule size (fresh weight) was observed (Table 2).

In the case of S. teranga by. sesbaniae, root inoculation strongly inhibited subsequent stem nodule development (Table 2). When stem inoculation was performed 2 days after root inoculation, most plants formed only swellings at nodulation sites (Fig. 1). Some developed very small nodule-like structures, whose interior was green, indicating that they were ineffective. In treatment B, the number and the sizes of nodulelike structures increased and, rarely, some plants developed nodules harboring the dark-red color characteristic of functional leghemoglobin. S. saheli showed little inhibition of stem nodulation (Table 2). However, almost all stem nodules were ineffective, as estimated by their interior color, and had not developed completely. To evaluate the role of symbiotic N_2 fixation in this phenomenon, previous root inoculation was performed with A. caulinodans ORS571nifA-, an ineffective mutant. ORS571*nifA*⁻ also inhibited stem nodulation by S.



FIG. 1. Stem nodulation of *Sesbania rostrata* by *Azorhizobium* and *Sinorhizobium* strains under different conditions. (A) Three-week-old stem nodules formed on non-root-nodulated plants. Lanes: 1, *Azorhizobium* sp. strain ORS314; 2, *S. teranga* by. sesbaniae ORS22. (B) Nodules or swellings formed on root-nodulated plants, 3 weeks after stem inoculation (treatment B) (Table 2). Lanes: 3, *A. caulinodans* ORS592; 4, *S. teranga* by. sesbaniae ORS515.

teranga bv. sesbaniae ORS19 and ORS51 (data not shown). Cultivation of plants in Jensen medium supplemented with 3 mM NH_4NO_3 did not inhibit the induction of stem nodule formation by *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae ORS51 (data not shown).

Root nodulation of *Sesbania rostrata*. All 11 *Azorhizobium* and 13 *Sinorhizobium* strains tested formed effective root nodules on *Sesbania rostrata*. Both partially and highly effective strains were found in both genera (data not shown). When comparing the two genera in nodulation kinetics over a 15-day period, no differences were observed (Fig. 3). However, 3 mM NH_4NO_3 completely abolished nodulation by sinorhizobia while it caused only a two- to threefold reduction in the number of nodules after inoculation with azorhizobia (Fig. 3).

Depending on the strains, variations in the morphologies and locations of 3- to 5-week-old root nodules were observed. Nodules induced by *Azorhizobium* and *S. saheli* were usually small (1 to 2 mm), dark green, and distributed along the length of the root (Fig. 4). By contrast, nodules induced by *S. teranga* strains were often yellow-green, big, and multilobed (1 to 5 mm) and occurred mostly on upper roots (Fig. 4). Interestingly, a correlation between the sensitivity of stem nodulation to previous root nodulation and the positions and morphologies of root nodules was noted.

Host-specific nitrogen fixation of *Azorhizobium*. A collection of 3 *S. saheli*, 10 *S. teranga*, 4 *A. caulinodans*, and 7 *Azorhizobium* sp. strains was compared for their nodulation and effectiveness on *Sesbania grandiflora* and *Sesbania pubescens*. No difference in nodulation kinetics between sinorhizobia and

azorhizobia was observed with Sesbania pubescens (data not shown). In contrast, nodulation of Sesbania grandiflora by Azorhizobium was delayed (about 6 days) and the number of nodules was dramatically reduced when compared to that for Sinorhizobium (Fig. 5). Nodules induced on both Sesbania pubescens and Sesbania grandiflora by all azorhizobia were ineffective as estimated by fresh weight and visual observation of aerial parts (partially shown in Table 3) and the green color of the nodule interior. Bacteria could be reisolated from nodules, indicating that azorhizobia were Inf⁺ and Fix⁻. By contrast, almost all sinorhizobia tested were effective on both plants (Table 3). To confirm that Azorhizobium and Sinorhizobium strains differ in their symbiotic nitrogen-fixing abilities, many different Sesbania species, mostly originating from Africa or Asia, were inoculated with a collection of azorhizobia and sinorhizobia. The five Azorhizobium strains tested induced ineffective nodules on all plants, whereas the three S. saheli and the five S. teranga strains were effective on almost all plants (Table 3).

Lack of free-living-nitrogen fixation by S. saheli and S. teranga bv. sesbaniae. Using a simple assay (Materials and Methods), we screened S. saheli and S. teranga isolates for their ability to fix N_2 under free-living conditions. A. caulinodans ORS571 and ORS592 and Azorhizobium sp. strains ORS56 and ORS314 served as proficient controls. Only Azorhizobium strains exhibited significant nitrogenase activity in pure culture (data not shown).

DISCUSSION

Two taxonomically distant genera, *Azorhizobium* and *Sino-rhizobium*, contain strains able to nodulate *Sesbania* species, among them *A. caulinodans*, *Azorhizobium* sp., *S. saheli*, and *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae. Rhizobia from both groups nodulate stems of *Sesbania rostrata* and roots of all *Sesbania* species tested, but they exhibit clear differences in other aspects of symbiosis.

Previously, nodulation on the Sesbania rostrata stem was thought to be restricted to Azorhizobium strains, since most nonazorhizobial strains isolated from Sesbania were reported to be root specific (10), including the recently described Rhizobium sp. strain SIN-1 (24). Rinaudo et al. (25) characterized nonazorhizobial strains able to form stem nodules on Sesbania rostrata as very poorly effective or ineffective. Recently, the ability of some S. teranga strains to stem nodulate under particular conditions was demonstrated (29). In this work, we showed that, whatever their original host plant, all S. saheli and S. teranga by. sesbaniae strains tested nodulate stems as efficiently as do Azorhizobium strains, when roots were not previously inoculated (Table 2; Fig. 1). Infection by S. teranga bv. sesbaniae ORS604 occurs through intercellular proliferation and formation of intercellular infection pockets extending as intercellular infection threads towards the meristematic zone (Fig. 2). This form of infection is similar to the organogenesis of both Sesbania rostrata stem (11, 30) and root (22) nodules after inoculation with A. caulinodans. Moreover, early steps of stem nodule development closely resemble those of root nodules initiated by A. caulinodans (22) and display characteristics of both indeterminate and determinate nodules.

Unlike Azorhizobium, the ability of Sinorhizobium strains to form nodules on stems is highly dependent on the nodulation status of the plant. Indeed, whereas stem nodulation by azorhizobia is relatively unaffected by previous root inoculation, stem nodulation by *S. teranga* by. sesbaniae is strongly inhibited, with most of the strains able to develop only swellings or



FIG. 2. Light microscopy of semithin sections (width, $0.95 \ \mu$ m) of stem nodules induced by *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae ORS604 on non-root-nodulated *Sesbania rostrata*. Nodules were fixed 48 h (A) and 7 days (B, C, and D) after inoculation. Bars, $100 \ \mu$ m (A) and $50 \ \mu$ m (B, C, and D). (A) Typical basket structure of the meristem (asterisk) positioned below the original site of infection (star). The arrow indicates the nodule's vascular bundles, and the arrowhead shows the stem's vascular bundles. (B) Section of a developing nodule showing different histological zones from the outside towards the central tissue: the infection zone (five-rayed black star) with the presence of large infection pockets (five-armed white asterisk) extending inwards, the actively dividing nodule meristem (six-armed black star) located at the periphery, the intermediate zone (eight-rayed black star), and the central nitrogen-fixing zone (black square) with the invaded cells. (C) Magnification of panel B showing the spread of infection threads (arrows) originating from the intercellular infection pockets (asterisk) filled with rhizobia. (D) Magnification of panel B showing the central nitrogen-fixing zone comprising both invaded (arrow) and noninvaded cells (arrowhead).

pseudonodules. Stem nodulation by *S. saheli* strains is less sensitive to prior root inoculation, but the nodules formed are generally ineffective. Stem nodulation by *Azorhizobium* under these conditions led only to smaller nodules, probably as a result of the presence of N₂-fixing root nodules. Indeed, Moudiongui et al. (20) observed that combined nitrogen has no significant effect on stem nodule number but inhibits the development of stem nodules, with a strong effect on nodule size and effectiveness. It was recently reported that root nodulation of *Sesbania rostrata* suppresses stem nodulation by *S. teranga* ORS51 and ORS52 but not *A. caulinodans* ORS571 (29). Here, the use of a collection of azorhizobia and sinorhizobia shows that insensitivity to root nodulation is specific to the Azorhizobium genus among Senegalese isolates and furthermore indicates that the sensitivity to previous root inoculation increases from *S. saheli* to *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae. In the field, root inoculation usually occurs prior to stem infection. Despite their ability to nodulate stems, *S. saheli* and *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae form only about 10% of the naturally occurring stem nodules on *Sesbania rostrata* (26). The density of *Azorhizobium* on stems and leaves of *Sesbania rostrata* was far higher than the density of *Sinorhizobium* (26). We conclude that both the relative insensitivity to root inoculation and the epiphytic survival of azorhizobia may explain their greater competitiveness for stem nodulation. Furthermore, the ability to infect root-nodulated plants may be a stem adaptation function com-



FIG. 3. Nodulation kinetics with *Sinorhizobium* and *Azorhizobium* strains on *Sesbania rostrata* roots. The numbers of nodules correspond to the means of the total sums of nodules present on plants inoculated with sinorhizobia or azorhizobia. Eight plants were tested for each strain. Thirteen *Sinorhizobium* strains (*S. saheli* ORS600, ORS609, and ORS611 and *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae ORS8, ORS15, ORS19, ORS22, ORS51, ORS52, ORS53, ORS604, ORS613, and ORS1013) and 12 *Azorhizobium* strains (*Azorhizobium* sp. strains ORS56, ORS314, ORS470, ORS484, ORS494, ORS500, ORS522, and ORS599 and *A. caulinodans* ORS571, ORS590, ORS591, and ORS592) were tested when plants were grown in Jensen medium free of nitrogen. Six *Sinorhizobium* strains (*S. saheli* ORS600 and ORS611 and *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae ORS19, ORS22, ORS51, ORS52, ORS51, ORS52, and ORS590 and *A. strains* (*Azorhizobium* strains (*Azorhizobium* strains (*S. saheli* ORS600 and ORS611 and *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae ORS19, ORS22, ORS51, ORS52, and ORS599 and *A. caulinodans* ORS571 and ORS590) were tested when plants were grown in Jensen medium free of nitrogen. Six *Sinorhizobium* strains (*Azorhizobium* strains (*Azorhizobium* strains (*Azorhizobium* strains ORS314 and ORS599 and *A. caulinodans* ORS571 and ORS590) were tested when plants were grown in Jensen liquid medium supplemented with 3 mM NO₃NH₄. Standard deviations are given as error bars.

mon to epiphytic rhizobia, such as *Azorhizobium*. Stem nodulation may be crucial for these aquatic legumes, since, in waterlogged soils, root N_2 fixation is much lower and may be replaced by stem N_2 fixation (6).



FIG. 5. Nodulation kinetics with *Sinorhizobium* and *Azorhizobium* strains on *Sesbania grandiflora* roots. The numbers of nodules correspond to the means of the total sums of nodules present on plants inoculated with sinorhizobia (13 strains, namely, *S. saheli* ORS600, ORS609, and ORS611 and *S. teranga* bv. sesbaniae ORS8, ORS15, ORS19, ORS22, ORS51, ORS52, ORS53, ORS604, ORS613, and ORS1013, with eight plants for each strain) or with azorhizobia (12 strains, namely, *Azorhizobium* sp. strains ORS56, ORS314, ORS470, ORS549, ORS593, and ORS592, and ORS599 and *A. caulinodans* ORS571, ORS590, ORS591, and ORS592, with eight plants for each strain). Standard deviations are given as error bars.

Using an ineffective A. caulinodans ORS571 derivative as a root inoculum, we showed that N_2 fixation in root nodules does not itself inhibit stem nodulation by S. teranga by sesbaniae. The control of the number of nodules formed on the overall plant, known as autoregulation of nodulation or systemic suppression of nodulation, has been described for several legumes by the split-root system (see reference 3). Our discovery of natural strains exhibiting different degrees of sensitivity towards the plant systemic control makes the Sesbania rostrata-



FIG. 4. Morphologies and distribution of Sesbania rostrata root nodules induced by S. saheli, S. teranga, and A. caulinodans strains. Lanes: 1, A. caulinodans ORS571; 2, A. caulinodans ORS590; 3, S. saheli ORS611; 4, S. teranga bv. sesbaniae ORS19; 5, S. teranga bv. sesbaniae ORS22; 6, S. teranga bv. sesbaniae ORS604. Bar, 1 cm.

Sesbania aegyptiaca (Egypt) Sesbania sesban (Kenya)

Sesbania sericea (West Indies)

Sesbania emerus (East Africa)

Sesbania tetraptera (Madagascar)

Sesbania alba (Kenya)

Е

E

Е

Е

Е

Е

Е

E

Е

Ε

Е

Е

Е

Е

Е

Е

Е

Е

Е

E

Ε

E

Е

Е

Strain (country of origin)					Symbiot	ic effective	eness ^a of r	hizobial st	rain:				
	A. caulinodans			Azorhizo- bium sp.	zorhizo- ium sp. S. sahe		ıheli		S. teranga bv. sesbaniae				
	ORS571	ORS590	ORS591	ORS592	ORS489	ORS600	ORS609	ORS611	ORS51	ORS52	ORS53	ORS604	ORS613
Sesbania pubescens (Senegal)	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е
Sesbania grandiflora (Thailand)	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Е	Е	E	E	E	E	Е	Е
Sesbania aculeata (Ethiopia)	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	E	E	Ι	E	Е	E	E	Е
Sesbania aculeata (India)	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	E	E	E	E	Е	E	E	Е
Sesbania cannabina (Vietnam)	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	E	E	E	E	Е	E	E	Е
Sesbania pachycarpa (Senegal)	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	E	E	E	E	Е	E	E	Е
Sesbania formosa (India)	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Ι	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	E	Е

TABLE 3. Root symbiotic N₂ fixation specificity of Azorhizobium and Sinorhizobium strains among Sesbania species

I " I, ineffective nodulation; E, effective nodulation, as estimated by plant visualization and determination of aerial part fresh weight 45 days after inoculation.

T

I

I

I

Ι

Е

E

Е

Ε

Е

Е

Е

E

Е

Е

Е

Е

Azorhizobium or -Sinorhizobium system unique for studying the mechanisms involved in the autoregulation of nodulation and in natural stem nodulation.

I

I

Ι

I

I

Ι

I

I

I

I

Ι

I

I

I

I

I

I

T

I

T

I

I

T

T

The greater sensitivity of S. teranga by. sesbaniae strains towards plant nodulation controls may be responsible for the particular distribution and morphology of nodules on Sesbania rostrata roots. S. teranga develops a few big multilobed nodules, while Azorhizobium and S. saheli induce many smaller, round nodules along the length of the root (Fig. 4). Root nodule development has been shown to occur through two successive steps, the first one showing indeterminate characteristics and the last one showing determinate characteristics (22). S. teranga by. sesbaniae might prolong the first indeterminate stage, while Azorhizobium might quickly progress to the final determinate step. If true, nodule morphogenesis might not be solely under host plant control (16). The supernodulation ability of Azorhizobium may contribute to the low percentage, around 50 to 60%, of root nodules occupied by fast-growing rhizobia, which are present in higher densities than azorhizobia in the Sesbania rostrata rhizosphere (26).

When compared to that by azorhizobia, nodulation by sinorhizobia was found to be much more sensitive to the presence of fixed nitrogen (3 mM) in the plant culture medium (Fig. 3). The inhibitory effect of nitrogen on root nodulation, also observed in the Sesbania rostrata-A. caulinodans system (19), is still poorly understood (27, 28). Ammonium has been shown to regulate the expression of the nodABC genes in Sinorhizobium meliloti (12), a bacterium closely related to S. teranga and S. saheli (5). The greater sensitivity of sinorhizobia to nitrogen inhibition of nodule formation could thus reflect a greater influence of nitrogen in nodulation gene regulation compared to that of azorhizobia.

Originally, the new genus Azorhizobium and species caulinodans were assigned to Sesbania symbionts exhibiting three properties: the ability to stem nodulate Sesbania rostrata, the ability to fix atmospheric N₂, and the ability to grow while fixing N_2 (10, 13). Our results show that stem nodulation is not restricted to Sesbania-azorhizobium symbiosis, although Azorhizobium is best adapted to aerial nodulation. In contrast, freeliving N₂ fixation remains uniquely typical of Azorhizobium among Sesbania isolates (10, 25), since none of the Sinorhizobium strains exhibits asymbiotic nitrogenase activity (data not shown). Furthermore, azorhizobia fix N2 only in symbiosis with

Sesbania rostrata while sinorhizobia are effective with all the Sesbania species tested (Table 3). Ex planta and in planta N_2 fixation activity tests, easy to perform under laboratory conditions, might be used to distinguish Azorhizobium strains from other Sesbania isolates in agro-ecological studies, together with API Systems auxanographic tests (5). This is the first description of two rhizobium genera exhibiting different symbiotic properties and nodulating the same legume.

Е

E

Е

E

Е

E

E

E

Ε

E

Е

Е

Azorhizobium is phylogenetically more related to Xanthobacter spp. and Aquabacter spp., both of which include nonsymbiotic aquatic bacteria, than to other rhizobia (10, 23). Azorhi*zobium* is also found in high densities in African temporary ponds, where the aquatic legume Sesbania rostrata grows (6). Several other Sesbania species, nodulated by the soil-prevalent Sinorhizobium strains, thrive on submerged soils near these ponds. In these natural conditions, Azorhizobium might have inherited nod genes from Sinorhizobium, simultaneously evolving into an epiphytic and symbiotic bacterium highly specific to the stem-nodulating legume Sesbania rostrata. Sinorhizobium nod gene sequencing would support or refute such a hypothesis.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are grateful to Jean Dénarié and G. Truchet for stimulating discussions and are indebted to Michael Kahn and Kyle Miller for editorial corrections. We also thank Nathalie Méar, Tidiane Badji, and Paul Tendeng for technical assistance.

REFERENCES

- 1. Becker, M., J. K. Ladha, and M. Ali. 1995. Green manure technology: potential, usage, and limitations. A case study for lowland rice. Plant Soil 174:181-194.
- 2. Boivin, C., I. Ndoye, F. Molouba, P. de Lajudie, N. Dupuy, and B. Dreyfus. Stem nodulation in legumes: diversity, mechanisms and unusual characteristics. Crit. Rev. Plant Sci., in press.
- 3. Caetano-Anolles, G., and P. M. Gresshoff. 1991. Plant genetic control of nodulation. Annu. Rev. Microbiol. 45:345-382.
- 4. de Bruijn, F. 1989. The unusual symbiosis between the diazotrophic stemnodulating bacterium Azorhizobium caulinodans ORS571 and its host, the tropical legume Sesbania rostrata, p. 457-504. In E. Nester and T. Kosuge (ed.), Plant microbe interaction, vol. 3. McGraw-Hill, New York, N.Y.
- 5. de Lajudie, P., A. Willems, B. Pot, D. Dewettinck, G. Maestrojuan, M. Nevra, M. D. Collins, B. L. Dreyfus, K. Kersters, and M. Gillis. 1994. Polyphasic taxonomy of rhizobia. Emendation of the genus Sinorhizobium and description of Sinorhizobium meliloti comb. nov., Sinorhizobium saheli sp. nov., and Sinorhizobium teranga sp. nov. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. 44:715-733.
- 6. Dreyfus, B. Unpublished data.

- Dreyfus, B., and Y. Dommergues. 1980. Non-inhibition de la fixation d'azote atmosphérique par l'azote combiné chez une légumineuse à nodules caulinaires, *Sesbania rostrata*. C. R. Acad. Sci. Ser. D 291:767–770.
- Dreyfus, B. L., and Y. R. Dommergues. 1981. Nitrogen-fixing nodules induced by *Rhizobium* on the stem of the tropical legume *Sesbania rostrata*. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 10:313–317.
- Dreyfus, B. L., C. Elmerich, and Y. R. Dommergues. 1983. Free-living *Rhi-zobium* strain able to grow on N₂ as the sole nitrogen source. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 45:711–713.
- Dreyfus, B. L., J. L. Garcia, and M. Gillis. 1988. Characterization of Azorhizobium caulinodans gen. nov., sp. nov., a stem-nodulating nitrogen-fixing bacterium isolated from Sesbania rostrata. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. 38:89–98.
- 11. Duhoux, E. 1984. Ontogenèse des nodules caulinaires de Sesbania rostrata (légumineuse). Can. J. Bot. 62:982–994.
- 12. Dusha, I., A. Bakos, A. Kondorosi, F. de Bruijn, and J. Schell. 1983. The *Rhizobium meliloti* early nodulation genes (*nodABC*) are nitrogen-regulated: isolation of a mutant strain with efficient nodulation capacity on alfalfa in the presence of ammonium. Mol. Gen. Genet. 219:89–96.
- Elmerich, C., B. L. Dreyfus, G. Reysset, and J. P. Aubert. 1982. Genetic analysis of nitrogen fixation in a tropical fast-growing *Rhizobium*. EMBO J. 1:499–503.
- 14. Gillis, M., and B. Dreyfus. Unpublished data.
- 15. Kaminsky, P. A., N. Desnoues, and C. Elmerich. 1994. The expression of *nifA* in *Azorhizobium caulinodans* requires a gene product homologous to *Escherichia coli* HF-1 and RNA-binding protein involved in the replication of phage Qβ RNA. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 91:4663–4667.
- Kijne, J. W. 1992. The *Rhizobium* infection process, p. 349–398. *In* G. Stacey, R. H. Burris, and J. H. Evans (ed.), Biological nitrogen fixation. Chapman & Hall, New York, N.Y.
- Ladha, J. K., R. P. Pareek, and M. Becker. 1992. Stem-nodulating legume-*Rhizobium* symbiosis and its agronomic use in lowland rice. Adv. Soil Sci. 20:147–192.
- Lortet, G., N. Méar, J. Lorquin, B. Dreyfus, P. de Lajudie, C. Rosenberg, and C. Boivin. 1996. Nod factor TLC profiling as a tool to characterize symbiotic specificity of rhizobial strains: application to *Sinorhizobium saheli*, *Sinorhizobium teranga* and *Rhizobium* sp. strains isolated from *Acacia* and *Sesbania*. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 9:736–747.
- Moudiongui, A., and G. Rinaudo. 1987. Effect of ammonium nitrate on nodulation and nitrogen fixation (acetylene reduction) of the tropical legume *Sesbania rostrata*. MIRCEN J. 3:235–241.
- 20. Moudiongui, A., E. Duhoux, and G. Rinaudo. 1989. Étude structurale de

nodules caulinaires de *Sesbania rostrata* induits en presence d'azote combiné, p. 91–96. *In* Proceedings of the International Congress on *Sesbania rostrata*. Institute Français de Recherche Scientifique pour le Développement en Coopération, Dakar, Senegal.

- Ndoye, I., and B. Dreyfus. 1988. N₂ fixation by Sesbania rostrata and Sesbania sesban estimated using ¹⁵N and total N difference method. Soil Biol. Biochem. 20:209–213.
- Ndoye, I., F. de Billy, J. Vasse, B. L. Dreyfus, and G. Truchet. 1994. Root nodulation of Sesbania rostrata. J. Bacteriol. 176:1060–1068.
- Rainey, F. A., and J. Wiegel. 1996. 16S ribosomal DNA sequence analysis confirms the close relationship between the genera *Xanthobacter*, *Azorhizobium*, and *Aquabacter* and reveals a lack of phylogenetic coherence among *Xanthobacter* species. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. 46:607–610.
- Rana, D., and H. B. Krishnan. 1995. A new root-nodulating symbiont of the tropical legume *Sesbania*, *Rhizobium* sp. SIN-1, is closely related to *R. galegae*, a species that nodulates temperate legumes. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 134:19–25.
- Rinaudo, G., S. Orenga, M. Fernandez, H. Meugnier, and R. Bardin. 1991. DNA homologies among members of the genus *Azorhizobium* and other stem- and root-nodulating bacteria isolated from the tropical legume *Sesbania rostrata*. Int. J. Syst. Bacteriol. 41:114–120.
- Robertson, B. K., B. L. Dreyfus, and M. Alexander. 1995. Ecology of stemnodulating *Rhizobium* and *Azorhizobium* in four vegetation zones of Senegal. Microb. Ecol. 29:71–81.
- Schultze, M., E. Kondorosi, P. Ratet, M. Buiré, and A. Kondorosi. 1994. Cell and molecular biology of *Rhizobium*-plant interactions. Int. Rev. Cytol. 156: 1–75.
- Streeter, J. 1988. Inhibition of legume nodule formation and N₂ fixation by nitrate. Crit. Rev. Plant Sci. 7:1–23.
- Tomekpe, K., B. L. Dreyfus, and M. Holsters. 1996. Root nodulation of Sesbania rostrata suppresses stem nodulation by Sinorhizobium teranga but not Azorhizobium caulinodans. Can. J. Microbiol. 42:187–190.
- Tsien, H. C., B. L. Dreyfus, and E. L. Schmidt. 1983. Initial stages in the morphogenesis of nitrogen-fixing stem nodules of *Sesbania rostrata*. J. Bacteriol. 156:888–897.
- Vasse, J., F. de Billy, S. Camut, and G. Truchet. 1990. Correlation between ultrastructural differentiation of bacteroids and nitrogen fixation in alfalfa nodules. J. Bacteriol. 172:4296–4306.
- Vincent, J. 1970. A manual for the practical study of root nodule bacteria. I. B. P. Handbook no. 15. Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford, United Kingdom.