Errors in Clinical Statements of Causes of Death

Second Report *

KURT POHLEN, PH.D., AND HAVEN EMERSON, M.D., F.A.P.H.A.

Consultant in Statistics, W. K. Kellogg Foundation, Battle Creek, Mich.[†]; and Professor of Public Health Emeritus in Residence, DeLamar Institute of Public Health, College of Physicians and Surgeons, Columbia University, New York, N. Y.

THIS is the second paper of a series on "Errors in Clinical Statements of Causes of Death." In using the word "error," we do not necessarily mean real or serious diagnostic mistakes such as occur when, for instance, the clinician diagnoses an ulcer of the duodenum which proves at autopsy to be a carcinoma of the stomach, or when the pathologist finds that the aneurysm of the aorta is not due to syphilis, but to arteriosclerotic degeneration.

Besides such incorrect statements we often find others which are only incomplete diagnoses; for instance, if "pneumonia" is stated instead of the precise diagnosis, lobar pneumonia or bronchopneumonia. In this group of partly correct statements belong cases in which the clinician has given only the site or pathologic condition, or both, secondary to the primary disease. This is especially true with metastasis of malignant tumors, and purulent infections.

† Recently of the Bureau of Vital Statistics, New York City Health Department.

Both such groups of diagnostic errors, the incorrect and partly correct statements, are of a *clinical nature*. Comparing the clinical diagnosis with the autopsy findings, we are in most cases in position to decide whether the clinical diagnosis was correct, partly correct, incomplete or incorrect. But dealing with the statistics of causes of death, we frequently find differences between clinical and pathologic causes of death as they are to be tabulated according to the *International List of Causes of Death*.

For instance: A case in which the clinician has given the cause of death as "hypertensive arteriosclerotic heart disease" and the pathologist reports: " nephrosclerosis with hypertension and myocardial failure," we decide that the clinical diagnosis is correct because the same condition was meant in both diagnostic statements. The classification of these two statements according to the International List of Causes of Death. however, would place the clinical diagnosis under No. 93d (hypertensive heart disease when no involvement of the kidneys is mentioned) and the pathologist's statement under 131a, because the arteriosclerotic kidney is mentioned. Thus, we find the same clinical condition may be tabulated under two

^{*} Based upon 25,066 clinical and post-mortem statements on causes of death. The Tables 1-5 contain only an abstract of 19 diseases, the complete tables refer to every disease listed in the *International List of Causes of Death* with numerous additional subdivisions. The first report appeared in *A.J.P.H.*, 32, 3:251 (Mar.), 1942. The final report, to be finished in 1943, will be based on 40,000 autopsy protocols and clinical histories from 30 different hospitals.

гн *Мау, 1943*

different rubrics or numbers of the *International List*. In another illustration, we find the opposite situation: when the clinician, without having made an operation or biopsy, diagnoses a carcinoma of the gallbladder and the pathologist finds a sarcoma of the liver with obstruction of the biliary passages, we have a clinical error of site and kind of disease. Tabulation of either statements would, however, be under the name number, 46f (cancer of the liver and biliary passages).

The first example is complicated by the lack of uniformity in clinical diagnoses and terms of the International classification and brings both statements "arteriosclerotic heart disease" and "hypertensive cardio-vascular disease" under the same number, 93d (chronic myocarditis without mention of rheumatism), but the clinician means, in most cases, renal involvement when he states the condition to be that of hypertension. Of a similar nature are all cases where the clinician states: "chronic rheumatic cardio-valvular disease " without mentioning especially that the mitral valve is also affected. These cases must be registered under No. 92c (chronic myocarditis, specified as rheumatic). The pathologist gives accurately the same diagnosis, but mentions in his report aortic stenosis and insufficiency, mitral stenosis and insufficiency and many secondary conditions caused by this " chronic rheumatic cardio-valvular disease." The result in tabulation is to list that case under 92b (chronic diseases of the mitral valve). We find later that the bulk of changes in clinical and pathologic assignments to numbers of the International List for cardio-valvular and cardio-vascular diseases are due to such lack of uniformity of diagnostic statements.

We have to mention the only further important source of changes in the statistical tabulation caused by different assignment according to primary and contributory causes of death. We have in this group two possibilities:

(a) cases in which both diseases, which occurred simultaneously, have been diagnosed by either clinical or post-mortem examination, but where the clinician was of other opinion than the pathologist, as to which disease shall be mentioned as primary and which as contributory.

(b) cases in which the disease, mentioned solely by the clinician, was verified by the pathologist, who, however, found an additional or other condition of primary importance. We have, for instance, several cases of benign hypertrophy of the prostate (No. 137a), in which the clinician found beside the benign hypertrophy a carcinoma of the prostate and mentions the malignant tumor in first place as primary cause of death, and reports both conditions as the final causes of death.

It is sometimes extremely difficult to decide whether or not the clinician made a mistake, especially in cases belonging to group (a), and more so when the pathologist says afterward that the clinical opinion is correct also.

The comparison of Errors in Clinical Statements, as they appear in the statistics of causes of death, must therefore consider both types of diagnostic changes of:

(I) clinical nature

(II) statistical tabulation

Such a twofold and combined consideration of incorrect, incomplete, partly correct, and correct clinical statements is the subject of this second contribution.

Our first objective is to determine the accuracy of clinical statements with regard to the clinical nature of the diagnosis. Every complete diagnosis consists, or should consist of three statements:

- (1) the cause of the disease
- (2) the organ which is affected

(3) the manifestation and pathologic changes caused by the disease

Illustration: "ruptured appendicitis" is complete; it gives the organ (appendix), the cause (infection), and the pathologic condition (rupture). "Arteriosclerotic cardio-vascular disease" is incomplete; it gives the organ (cardiovascular system in its entirety), the cause (arteriosclerotic degeneration), but it fails to give the important manifestation which may be that of a coronary sclerosis, nephrosclerosis, cerebral hemorrhage, etc.

In the first report we did not attempt to evaluate the clinical statements regarding the manifestation of diseases, because of the difficulties due to lack of uniformity in diagnostic definitions, especially as far as the pathologic verification of clinical statements is concerned. We have, for instance, to remember that some manifestations of disease, removed by operations, cannot be seen at autopsy. Second: In this paper we intend to compare the results of the statistics of causes of death with clinical considerations which must be based upon the statistical classification of diseases in which only occasional manifestations are mentioned (such as cholecystitis: with and without mention of cholelithiasis, the arteriosclerotic cardio-vascular and the rheumatic cario-valvular diseases, and the manifestations of tertiary syphilis, etc.)

We have, however, distinguished in each case, between the *site* of disease and the *cause* of disease, and coded each clinical statement according to the degree of its correctness or incorrectness, topographically and etiologically.

The following code was used for diagnostic changes which are numbered from O to Y in twelve different items with corresponding meanings for the topo-

CODES FOR DIAGNOSTIC CHANGES

		Code	Topographic	Etiologic
			Correct site is stated	Correct cause is stated
Corr	rect	0	(the statement is considered correct also in cases where the body as a whole is affected, or the correct site was not found in either diagnosis)	(the statement is considered correct also in cases where in neither diagnosis a specific cause but only a pathologic con- dition has been given)
Inco •	omplete	1	Only correct organ system or body system was mentioned	Only correct etiologic or pathologic group was mentioned
		2	Secondary area involved in extension of disease has been mistaken for primary site	Secondary pathologic condition in exten- sion of disease has been mistaken for primary cause
	Specified Diagnosis	3	Secondary site (metastasis or other sec- ondary lesion) has been mistaken for primary site	Secondary pathologic condition subsequent to primary disease has been mistaken for cause of primary disease
Partly Correct	5 D	4	Site of contributory disease, which is in- dependent of primary disease, has been mistaken for site of primary disease	Specified cause of contributory disease, which is independent from primary dis- ease, has been mistaken for cause of primary disease
Partly	Unspecified Diagnosis	5	Organ system or body region of sec- ondary site, which is different from organ system or body region of primary site, has been mistaken for primary site.	Etiologic or pathologic group of secondary disease, subsequent to primary disease and different from etiologic or pathologic group of primary disease, has been mistaken for cause of primary disease
	Unsp Diag	6	Organ system or body region of contribu- tory disease, different from organ system or body region of primary disease, has been mistaken for site of primary disease	Etiologic or pathologic group of contribu- tory disease has been mistaken for etio- logic or pathologic group of primary disease
	ſ	7	Incorrect specified site, belonging to the same organ system of correct site and in close topographic relation	Incorrect specified cause or pathologic condition, belonging to the same etiologic group and in close etiologic relation
Inco	prrect {	8	Other specified incorrect sites	Other specified incorrect causes or patho- logic conditions
		9	Incorrect unspecified site, belonging to another organ system or body region	Incorrect unspecified cause, belonging to another etiologic or pathologic group
No dias	nosis	×x		Only a symptom or manifestation, not indicating a definite disease (cause) is mentioned
7.45		Y	No site of primary disease is given	No cause, pathologic condition or symp- tom is given

4	
TABLE	

Accuracy of Clinical Statements Regarding the Site of Disease

		Амі	ERI	CAI	N .	Jo	UR	2N/	٩L	01	F]	Pu	BI	.IC	E	Ie	AL	TH	[1	Ma	y , 1	194	43
	-	No Site 15	Given	13	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	1	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:		622
		rect	Per cent	12	S	1	2	9	10	10	1	1	4	4	3	1	13	17	4	3	9	2	1		9
se Is		Incorrect	No.	11	4	24	1	9	57	14	2	2	11	11	6	75	66	29	16	3	11	10	6		1,547
ite of Disea		Contributory Disease	Per cent	10	S	2	:	1	1	1	:	17	1	9	4	16	S	S	1	1	9	ŝ	13		2
urding the S	Correct ing to	Contri Dis	No.	6	4	27	:	1	S	1	:	60	3	. 17	13	170	43	80	4	2	11	30	115		1,371
tement Regu	Partly Correct Referring to	Secondary Site	Indistinct	8	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	:	29	:	۰:	:	:	:	2	:		106
The Clinical Statement Regarding the Site of Disease Is		Seco	Precise	7	:	8	:	S	10	30	4	2	1	:	:	137	2	3	e.	:	6	26	1		1,412
			Per cent Incomplete	9	:	6	:	1	2	1	:	:	1	3	ø	61	9	••	2	:	1	S	3	l	743
		Correct	Per cent	S	89	96	98	88	87	67	96	52	94	89	90	55	81	73	94	16	84	88	85		11
	l	С ⁰	No.	4	65	1,696	. 65	95	481	93	132	287	269	242	279	574	639	127	396	156	164	518	748		19,265
		Ē	1 orat Deaths	3	73	1,764	66	108	555	139	138	352	285	273	309	1,046	789	175	421	161	196	591	876		25,066
			Causes of Death	2	Scarlet fever	Tuberculosis of the respiratory system	Measles	Lymphogranulomatosis	Cancer of the stomach	Cancer of the liver or biliary passages	Cancer of the cervix	Diabetes mellitus	Leukemias	Chronic diseases of the mitral valve	Chronic rheumatic endocarditis	Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic	Lobar pneumonia	Ulcer of the stomach	Appendicitis	Hernia	Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified	Arteriosclerotic kidney	Premature birth		Total
(104	0110113 010100 0501	ini (o . v9A) i:	5!7 0N	1	80	13b	35	44b	46b	46f	48a	61	74a	92 b	92c	93 d	108	117a	. 121	122 a	124b	1318	159		

508

•

S	
TABLE	

Accuracy of Clinical Statements Regarding the Cause of Disease

Take of (CCorrect CorrectCorrect ImCorrect ContisionImSecondary Contained123456781234567813bTuberculosis of the respiratory system1,7641,65394235Measles6659844bLymphogranulomatosis10881751460Cancer of the stomach5554798614			Partly Correct Referring to	orrect ig to					
Cause of DeathTotalNo.Far centInter234562Scarlet fever736184Tuberculosis of the respiratory system1,7641,653942Measles666598Measles666598Measles10881751Measles1391178412Cancer of the liver or biliary passages1391178412Cancer of the cervix332286811Leukemias3522868111Leukemias3322868311Leukemias3092668653Chronic disease of the mitral valve273232857Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232857Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,0467196933Uffer of the stomach1751,44823Appendicitis16115697Hernia1751,0467196933Chronic invocarditis, not rheumatic1,0467196933Chronic information1751,44823Chronic information1751,44823Appendicitis16115697Hernia1751,44897Chronic information <th></th> <th>l</th> <th>udary lition</th> <th>Contributory Disease</th> <th>tory</th> <th>Incorrect</th> <th></th> <th>No C</th> <th>No Cause</th>		l	udary lition	Contributory Disease	tory	Incorrect		No C	No Cause
2 3 4 5 6 7 Scarlet fever 73 61 84 Tuberculosis of the respiratory system 1,764 1,653 94 2 Weasles Measles 66 65 98 Weasles 108 81 75 11 Measles 108 81 75 11 Cancer of the liver or biliary passages 139 117 84 12 Cancer of the liver or biliary passages 138 136 99 Cancer of the liver or biliary passages 138 136 99 <th>-</th> <th>C.</th> <th>Indistinct</th> <th>No. P</th> <th>Per cent</th> <th>No.</th> <th>Per cent</th> <th>Symptom Only</th> <th>1s Given</th>	-	C.	Indistinct	No. P	Per cent	No.	Per cent	Symptom Only	1s Given
Scalet fever7361Tuberculosis of the respiratory system1,7641,653Measles6665Lymphogranulomatosis68Lymphogranulomatosis10881Cancer of the stomach555479Cancer of the liver or biliary passages139117Cancer of the liver or biliary passages133136Cancer of the cervix352286Cancer of the mitral valve372286Diabetes mellitus352273232Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia1,751,44Appendicitis1011,66Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748		7	8	6	10	11	12	13	14
Tuberculosis of the respiratory system1,7641,653Measles6665Lymphogranulomatosis10881Lymphogranulomatosis10881Cancer of the stomach555479Cancer of the liver or biliary passages139117Cancer of the liver or biliary passages133136Cancer of the liver233232236Cancer diseases of the mitral value273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia1,751,44Appendicitis1,61156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	84	:	:	4	S	8	11	:	:
Measles6665Lymphogranulomatosis10881Cancer of the stomach555479Cancer of the liver or biliary passages139117Cancer of the liver or biliary passages139136Cancer of the cervix352286Cancer of the cervix352286Leukemias352285Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	94 2		:	24	1	84	S	1	:
Lymphogranulomatosis10881Cancer of the stomach555479Cancer of the liver or biliary passages139117Cancer of the cervix138136Cancer of the cervix138136Cancer of the cervix138136Cancer of the cervix138136Cancer of the cervix232286Diabetes mellitus285273Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	80	:	:	:	:	1	2	:	:
Cancer of the stomach555479Cancer of the liver or biliary passages139117Cancer of the cervix138136Cancer of the cervix138136Cancer of the cervix352286Diabetes mellitus352285Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	75 1	:	:	1	1	25	23	:	:
Cancer of the liver or biliary passages139117Cancer of the cervix138136Cancer of the cervix138136Diabetes melitus352286Leukemias352285Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	86 14	:	:	1	1	61	11	:	:
Cancer of the cervix138136Diabetes mellitus352286Leukemias352285Leukemias352285Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis161156Hernia161156Arteriosciencic kidney591525Premature birth376748	84 12	:	:	:	:	10	7	:	:
Diabetes mellitus352286Leutemias285252Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis161156Hernia161156Arterioscierotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	66	:	:	:	:	2	1	:	:
Leukemias285552Chronic diseases of the mitral value273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis175144Appendicitis161156Eternia161156Arterioscierotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	81 1	2	:	60	17	2	1	1	:
Chronic diseases of the mitral valve273232Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis175144Appendicitis161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arterioscierotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	88 9	1	:	3	1	20	7	:	:
Chronic rheumatic endocarditis309266Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis175144Appendicitis161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arterioscierotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	85 7	1	:	16	ŝ	17	ė	:	:
Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic1,046719Lobar pneumonia789652Ulter of the stomach175144Appendicitis421401Hernia161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	86 5	:	:	15	5	23	7	:	:
Lobar pneumonia789652Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis421401Hernia161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	69 33	ŝ	:	171	16	109	10	6	:
Ulcer of the stomach175144Appendicitis421401Hernia161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	83 16	1	:	28	4	92	12	:	:
Appendicitis421401Hernia161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	82 3	1	:	80	S	18	10	1	:
Hernia161156Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified196138Arteriosclerotic kidney591525Premature birth376748	56	:	:	3	1	17	4	:	:
Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified 196 138 Arteriosclerotic kidney 591 525 Premature birth 376 748	16	:	:	1	1	4	2	:	:
Arteriosclerotic kidney 591 525 Premature birth 376 748	70 2	2	:	16	•0	37	19	1	:
Premature birth 376 748	89 5	1	:	32	S	26	4	2	:
	85	:	:	115	13	11	-	:	:
	1	1	=	1 241	 "	7 427	=	636	120

graphic and etiologic part of the diagnosis.

O-means a correct diagnosis, where the pathologic statement is the same as the clinical statement.

1-means incomplete statements, such as pneumonia instead of lobar or bronchopneumonia, or urinary infection, etc.

2—indicates the secondary area (or pathologic condition, etiologically) involved in extension of the disease. These are cases in which the form of the lesion (manifestation) plays its part, and to which a complicating extension of the process, e.g., a carcinoma of the prostate, involving ureters and bladder belongs.

3 and 4—distinguish the secondary and contributory diseases, the former caused by the primary disease and the latter independent of it.

5 and 6—are similar to 3 and 4, respectively; in 5 and 6 the site or cause is not given in precise but rather in unspecified terms, for instance, tumor of the urinary system.

The other items are self-explanatory.

A code number 00 means that the clinical diagnosis was correct, topographically and etiologically; 10 means: incomplete topographic and correct etiologic statement (e.g., the beforementioned example of pneumonia); 01 means: correct topographic, incomplete etiologic statement (e.g., tumor of prostate instead of carcinoma or benign hypertrophy of the prostate); 24 means: secondary site and contributory disease (e.g., a case of carcinoma of the stomach with metastasis in the liver diagnosed as liver cirrhosis when the liver cirrhosis was really present), but a case of carcinoma of the stomach without metastasis in the liver, diagnosed as liver cirrhosis, when cirrhosis of the liver was present, would be coded as 44; 88 means: a disease incorrectly diagnosed both topographically and etiologically.

This large number of different code numbers is summarized in our report according to the group mentioned in the first column: correct, incomplete, partly correct, incorrect, and no diagnosis.

We may refer first to Tables 4 and 5 *

dealing with 19 diseases of interest, according to frequency, statistical consideration and for other reasons. The tables are based upon slightly more than 25,000 cases; the final report will deal with more than 40,000 cases. Our preliminary study includes each disease mentioned in the *International List of Causes of Death*. Since these 5 tables and additional figures referring to a former similar study made upon material from Magdeburg contain 115 pages, we have summarized our results in the material presented here.

Table 4 refers to the accuracy of topographic statements, disregarding the etiologic statements, and Table 5 to the accuracy of etiologic statements, disregarding the topographic part of the diagnosis. We find 6 per cent of cases with incorrect site of disease, and 10 per cent with incorrect cause of disease. The frequency varies among the diseases considerably, as we see in column 12.

Column 10 indicates the percentage of contributory sites, or causes, taken as primary causes, and column 5 gives the results of the positive part of our study, the correct sites and causes, which are, about equally, slightly more than four-fifths of all cases.

Table 3 combines the accuracy of statements regarding the clinical nature and the comparison of statistical tabulation for the same diseases. We have, at first, divided all cases whether or not the clinical diagnosis was correct, incomplete, partly correct, and incorrect (including with the latter group the cases with no diagnosis given). Under incorrect are included all cases in which either part of the diagnosis was incorrect; i.e., that incorrect site but correct cause, or vice versa, renders the whole

^{*} The tables are numbered according to the sequence of the complete tables contained in Vol. 2, Nos. 4 and 5, of "*Health and Statistics*," published by Kurt Pohlen. A limited number of copies of these tables are available to those interested.

diagnosis incorrect. Similarly, we defined as partly correct all cases in which at least one part of the diagnosis was partly correct, the other part may be better (incomplete or correct) but not incorrect, and so forth.

Then we distinguished in every group of "correct, incomplete, partly correct, or incorrect" diagnosis the individual cases, whether or not the respective number of the *International List* was the same, if tabulation was made on the clinical diagnosis as it would have been had the pathologist's statement been used as basis of tabulation.

In column 6, for instance, 190 cases of chronic rheumatic endocarditis (No. 92c) are mentioned, where the clinical statement "rheumatic chronic cardiovalvular disease" was considered correct, but where the additional findings at autopsy revealed the mitral involvement and called for a different classification under 92b. The same is true with the disease No. 93d, chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic, where beside 278 correct cases there were 265 others, mostly "hypertensive cardio-vascular diseases" for which their international classification was changed due to insufficient definition of the disease.

Table 3 is based upon the clinical diagnosis; all diseases being first sorted according to the *International List* numbers of the clinical statement. Then they were grouped according to the code as correct, incomplete, ... etc., diagnoses.

We can carry out the same operation in sorting all cases under the *International List* number according to the pathologist's statements and consider how many of them were previously (at clinical examination) correctly, incompletely, etc., diagnosed.

This is done in *Table 2*, which is arranged in the same manner as Table 3. We see here again two diseases with large frequencies in column 6, but now No. 92b, chronic diseases of the mitral valve, and 131a, arteriosclerotic kidney, to which the corresponding cases of chronic rheumatic endocarditis, and chronic myocarditis, beforementioned, were transferred. It is not a mere coincidence that we find in column 6 of *Table 3* (under disease No. 92c), and in column 6 of *Table 2* (under disease No. 92b), exactly the same number of cases.

The final figures for vital statistics, summarizing the experience of *Tables* 2 and 3, are given in Table 1, which refers to the classification according to the International List of Gauses of Death only. Let us take, for illustration, No. 46b, cancer of the stomach. The clinical examination resulted in 555 cases classified under this rubric, of which 456 (col. 6) were verified by autopsy, which means that the pathological classification was the same for them. In 99 cases, however, their allocation in the International List was changed, 24 times due to incomplete or partly correct statements and 75 times due to real diagnostic errors.

In addition to the 456 cases of clinically diagnosed and pathologically verified cancer of the stomach, there are 168 cases in which the gastric malignancy was discovered at autopsy only; 90 times among them due to incomplete and partly correct statements, and 78 times due to an incorrect diagnosis. This gives a total of 624 cases, which is 12 per cent higher than the figures compiled according to the clinical examination.

The rate 12 per cent is listed in column 12 as coefficient of correction, which indicates the percentage to which the figures based on clinical statements must be increased or decreased when corrected by the figures based on the pathologist's statements.

In columns 10 and 11, are listed two types of indices of error. If we take again the example of carcinoma of the stomach, we find that this disease (or a disease which has the same *International*

	Accordance of	Accordance of Clinical Statements on Causes of Death With Autopsy Findings—Based Upon the Clinical Diagnosis	ments on Causes of Death Wi Upon the Clinical Diagnosis	Clinical	Death With Diagnosis	h Autops) Findings–	-Based			
ายน	•		1		The Autops	sy Findings as Me	ndings Reveal, That the Cli as Mentioned in Col. 2, 1s	t the Clini ol. 2, Is	The Autopsy Findings Reveal, That the Clinical Statement, as Mentioned in Col. 2, Is	_	
(686 01101				Correct		Incomplete	plete	Partly	Partly Correct	Inco	Incorrect
of Inter (Rev. 1	 		Total Correct in	•	Ē	he No. of th Referring or Differe	No. of the International List of Causes of Dea Referring to the Autopsy Diagnosis, Is Same as or Different from the No. Mentioned in Col. 1	d List of Ca y Diagnosis o. Mentione	The No. of the International List of Causes of Death, Referring to the Autopy Diagnosis, is Same as or Different from the No. Mentioned in Col. 1		
isiJ. Vo.	Causes of Death	Total Deaths	Per cent of Col. 3	Same	Different	Same	Different	Same	Different	Same	Different
1	2	ę	4	S	6	7	8	6	10	11	12
×	Scarlet fever	73	84	61	:	:	:	:	8	:	4
13b	Tuberculosis of the respiratory system	1,764	93	1,630	13	:	2	:	32	:	87
35	Measles	66	66	65	:	:	:	:	:	:	1
44b	Lymphogranulomatosis	108	75	81	:	:	2	:	3	:	22
· 46b	Cancer of the stomach	555	80	442	:	7	3	7	21	:	75
46f	Cancer of the liver or biliary passages	139	63	88	:	2	:	8	25	3	14
48a	Cancer of the cervix	138	95	131	:	:	:	:	ъ	:	2
61	Diabetes mellitus	352	81	284	2	:	1	:	62	:	3
74a	Leukemias	285	88	251	1	4	4	.2	. 11	:	12
92b	Chronic diseases of the mitral valve	273	83	219	7	3	9	2	25	1	10
92c	Chronic rheumatic endocarditis	309	85	73	190	:	. 2	1	22	:	16
93d	Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic	1,046	52	278	265	3	45	3	309	1	142
108	Lobar pneumonia	789	75	587	3	1	11	:	117	:	70
117a	Ulcer of the stomach	175	65	114	:	1	10	:	29	1	20
121	Appendicitis	421	94	396	:	:	1	:	9	:	18
122a	Hernia	161	26	156	:	:	:	1	1	:	£,
124b	Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified	196	70	137	1	1	1	:	21	:	35
131 a	Arteriosclerotic kidney	291	85	499	2	2	:	11	49	:	28
159	Premature birth	876	85	744	3	:	2	:	115	:	12
	Total	25,066	67	16,782	836	191	747	163	2,940	4	3,391

TABLE 3

512

American Journal of Public Health

May, 1943

Vol. 33

number) was mentioned in 723 cases:

- 456 times in both the clinical and pathological statement,
- 99 (24 plus 75) times in the clinical statement only, which was not verified by autopsy, and in
- 168 (90 plus 78) times in the pathologic statements and not previously mentioned as any kind of gastric malignancy in the clinical record.

Among the 723 cases, in which some kind of gastric malignancy was mentioned, we find 456 correct and 267 (99 plus 168) erroneous statements. These 267 erroneous statements are 37 per cent of the total of 723 and this can be considered as the Index of Error.

Based upon our studies on the difference between incomplete, partly correct, and incorrect diagnoses, we may divide the Index of Error into

(a) the error of clinical diagnosis (col. 10) which includes both types of incorrect diagnoses (75 clinical statements not verified post-mortem and 78 post-mortem statements not observed clinically), and expresses the sum as a percentage of the total of all examinations in which cancer of the stomach is mentioned.

(b) the inadequacy of statistical tabulation (col. 11) which combines in the same manner the changes in the *International* classification due to incomplete and partly correct statements.

The variation of the Indices of Error is seen in *Table 1*. We observe the large difference between the infectious diseases (scarlet fever, tuberculosis of the respiratory system, and measles) and the organic heart diseases (endocarditis and myocarditis), but we see also the large factor of partly correct diagnoses among the latter.

These facts cannot be discussed in detail here. We mention briefly, however, the two other groups, representing the data from *Tables 4 and 5* and indicating the accuracy of etiologic and topographic statements, separated from each other.

Statistical studies like these about

which we are reporting cannot be easily compared with other similar studies. This is due to several causes:

(1) Our present material is derived from outstanding hospitals. We might expect to find here relatively low "Indices of Error," but we have seen that the statements of the best clinicians by reason of their exactness and completeness of diagnostic statements differ often in some details from the findings of expert pathologists. The better the pathologic examination, the higher the per cent of error.

(2) A nomenclature of diseases which goes into many details makes more changes in the statistical classification possible than a nomenclature which is less detailed. For instance: the previous International List (1929) mentioned chronic nephritis only. Today (1938 list), we have a division into arteriosclerotic kidney and other chronic cases _ of nephritis. Numerous chronic glomerulonephritis which proved to be arteriosclerotic kidney are, in the present study, considered to be incorrect diagnoses; they did not indicate a change in the statistical tabulation before the last revision of the International List took place in 1938.

CONCLUSION

We recognize that we all are inaccurate, partly because we do not have the means to establish and express the truth completely. There are inaccuracies in vital statistics, but we do not think that vital statistics are therefore worthless or should be discarded or unused. On the contrary, by identifying the location and degree of errors, we are in the position to offer valuable aid to the clinician and the pathologist in diagnosis, and we increase the information which statistics can offer by making manifest those errors which so often are used to discredit vital statistics. In this way, the former cause of unreliability becomes a source of genuine information.

The statistics which we have presented herewith and those presented last year would be incomplete if we should not have tabulated the direction of diagnostic changes. Now we know how often a diagnosis has been incorrect, but

3011D1033Y 541D9()0	sis	The Clinical Diagnosis as			ſ		Inutes		
	,	intioned in Col	sis as . 2	The Diagnosis of	osis of	sisou Suipu	Rega	Regarding	
υ ι []εα	onzoia	Was Not Verified by Autopsy	ſ	Col. 2 Was Found Only by Autopsy Due to	s Found utopsy to	200 A 214 2010 Dia	Error of Clinical	Inade- quacy of Statistical	Coefficient of
	limical Incomplete and David	٩	. Was	Incomplete and Dartin		109A {0 109A {0	Utagnosis Col.: 5 1 2	Tabulation Col.:	Correction Col.:
Causes of Death	ی بور م	Incorrect t Statement	by Autopsy	Correct Statement	Incorrect Statement	.0N	$\frac{3+9-6}{3+9-6}$	$\frac{4+1}{3+9-6}$	3 3
2	3 4	Ŋ	ø	2	8	6	10	11	12
Scarlet fever	73 8	4	61	:	:	61	5	11	-16
Tuberculosis of the respiratory system 1,	,764 . 47	87	1,630	85	86	1,801	6	7	+2
Measies		1	65	ę	:	68	1	4	+3
Lymphogranulomatosis	108 5	22	81	6	18	108	31	10	0
Cancer of the stomach	555 24	75	456	60	78	624	21	16	+12
or biliary passages	139 25	14	100	72	. 92	248	31	34	+79
Cancer of the cervix	138 5	2	131	10	7	148	9	10	+1
Diabetes mellitus	352 65	3	284	10	6	303	ŝ	20	-14
	285 16	12	257	12	18	287	10	6	+1
valve	273 38	10	225	247	60	532	11	68	64
Chronic rheumatic endocarditis	309 219	16	74	15	21	110	25	44	+33
Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic 1,	,046 619	142	285	86	49	420	16	60	- 60
Lobar pneumonia	789 131	70	588	162	64	814	13	29	+3
Ulcer of the stomach	175 39	20	116	18	43	177	28	. 24	7
Appendicitis	421 7	18	396	3.9	28	463	6	6	+10
Hernia	161 1	3	157	1	12	170	6	1	9+
Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified	196 23	35	138	31	70	239	35	18	+22
Arteriosclerotic kidney	591 51	28	512	697	196	1,405	15	49	+138
Premature birth	876 120	12	744	9	8	758	2	14	-13
Total · 25.	25.066 4.523	3.301	17.152	4 523	3 301	25 066	20	6	

TABLE 1

.

Summary of Clinical-pathologic Statistics of Statements on Causes of Death, U.S. Hospitals, 1930–1939

514

American Journal of Public Health

May, 1943

* Regarding the No. of the International List of Causes of Death

•

2	
TABLE	

Accordance of Clinical Statements on Causes of Death With Autopsy Findings-Based

Upon the Post-mortem Diagnosis

Differen 3,423 8 18 78 3 49 43 2 21 64 196 12 12 Incorrect Same : 46 : : : : : 11 The No. of the International List of Causes of Death, Referring to the Previous Clinical Diagnosis, Is Same as The Previous Clinical Statement, Regarding the Autopsy Cases, as Mentioned in Col. 2, 1s or Different from the No. Mentioned in Col. 1 Different 125 : 65 Ξ \$ 4 15 35 28 343 2,911 61 10 Partly Correct Same ¢ 163 0 Different 24 2 4 35 3 55 756 : Incomplete Same 161 : Different 2 190 s 39 299 824 0 Correct 1,630 Same 65 442 88 131 284 251 219 73 278 587 114 396 156 16,782 137 499 61 8 74 ŝ per cent of Total Correct Col. 3 100 96 75 69 36 89 94 88 77 72 75 72 . 49 86 8 58 36 20 98 5 .u 4 Deaths 110 Total1,801 68 108 624 248 148 303 287 532 420 814 177 463 170 239 1,405 758 25,066 61 ŝ Cancer of the liver or biliary passages Tuberculosis of the respiratory system Chronic diseases of the mitral valve Chronic myocarditis, not rheumatic Cirrhosis of the liver, unspecified Chronic rheumatic endocarditis Cancer of the stomach Causes of Death Lymphogranulomatosis Ulcer of the stomach Arteriosclerotic kidney Cancer of the cervix Lobar pneumonia Diabetes mellitus Premature birth Scarlet fever Appendicitis Leukemias Total Measles Hernia ∞ → List (Rev. 1939) ∞ **13b** 44b 46b 46f 48a 74a 92b 92c 93d 117a 124b 131a 122a 35 61 08 121 159

we do not know yet which new diagnosis took the place of the one first given. We are, therefore, preparing tables that show each individual change of diagnosis and all combinations of diagnoses with each other.

We are preparing to make the same (or similar) tables as for the clinical and pathologic cause of death, for the comparison between the diagnosis at admission to hospital and at autopsy. Furthermore, we are sorting our records according to cases with operation, biopsy, electrocardiogram, etc.

Finally, we are preparing tables giving the combination between primary and secondary conditions, on one hand, and the various contributory diseases on the other hand (each separated from the other). These tables based upon autopsy findings, will then include the various secondary conditions and manifestations in order to give a complete picture of the cause of death.