Characterization and Immunogenicity of Salmonella typhimurium SL1344 and UK-1 Δcrp and Δcdt Deletion Mutants

XIN ZHANG, SANDRA M. KELLY, † WENDY S. BOLLEN, AND ROY CURTISS III*

Department of Biology, Washington University, St. Louis, Missouri 63130

Received 21 April 1997/Returned for modification 22 May 1997/Accepted 9 September 1997

S. typhimurium SL1344 and UK-1 mutants with deletions of the crp (cyclic AMP receptor protein) and cdt (colonization of deep tissues) genes have been constructed and characterized, and their levels of virulence and immunogenicity have been determined for BALB/c mice. All Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ mutants were avirulent, as mice survived oral doses of 10⁹ cells without illness. All the mutants colonized the gut-associated lymphoid tissue efficiently, but capacities to colonize deeper tissues, such as those of the spleen and liver, and blood were significantly reduced for the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ mutants compared with the Crp⁻ Cdt⁺ mutant and the wild-type parent strain. The Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ SL1344 strains induced complete protection, as all mice immunized with the mutants survived challenge with ~10⁴ times the 50% lethal dose of the wild-type SL1344 strain. The Crp⁻ UK-1 strain was least attenuated yet induced the highest level of protective immunity against challenge with the wild-type UK-1 strain. The Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strains, although totally attenuated, differed in immunogenicity to challenge with the highly virulent UK-1 parent, with the apparently hyperattenuated Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strain inducing a lower level of protective immunity than the Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strain. Nevertheless, these UK-1 Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strains induced complete protective immunity to challenge with the less-virulent SL1344 wild-type strain. Taken collectively, the results indicate that the attenuation of a highly virulent *S. typhimurium* strain can yield a vaccine that induces excellent protective immunity to challenge with less-virulent *S. typhimurium* strains.

Salmonella infection in humans and some domestic animals has been a public concern for many years. The development of attenuated Salmonella vaccine strains to protect against diseases caused by Salmonella spp. has been a field extensively studied by many investigators. One reason for the use of live avirulent Salmonella organisms as an oral vaccine is that Salmonella spp. initially colonize the gut-associated lymphoid tissue (GALT) prior to colonizing deeper tissues, such as those of the spleen and liver (6), a characteristic which is particularly important since the delivery of antigens to the GALT leads to generalized secretory, humoral, and cellular immune responses (2, 3, 7, 10, 26, 28). The ideal attenuated vaccine strain should be safe, stably attenuated, and protective. To render Salmonella spp. avirulent without impairing immunogenicity, several means of attenuation have been used, including curing the virulence plasmid and the introduction of auxotrophic mutations, mutations altering utilization and synthesis of carbohydrates, and mutations altering gene expression (for reviews, see references 5, 8, and 14).

Curtiss and Kelly (13) described Salmonella typhimurium SR-11 mutants with deletions (Δ) of the genes encoding the adenylate cyclase (cya) and cyclic AMP receptor protein that are avirulent and protective in mice. S. typhimurium $\Delta cya \ \Delta crp$ mutants have been shown to be avirulent and protective for swine (9) and chickens (19, 20). Kelly et al. (22) described a mutation in Salmonella choleraesuis that extended beyond the crp gene, that resulted in decreased virulence, and that could not be complemented to the wild-type state by a plasmid containing the crp⁺ gene. Similar mutations were generated in S. typhimurium and also introduced into Salmonella typhi (16, 29, 38). This locus adjacent to crp was termed cdt (colonization of

* Corresponding author. Mailing address: Department of Biology, Washington University, One Brookings Dr., St. Louis, MO 63130. Phone: (314) 935-6819. Fax: (314) 935-7246. deep tissues), since strains with these extended *crp* deletion mutations, although colonizing the GALT with wild-type ability, were significantly impaired in their ability to colonize internal visceral organs (4).

The present paper reports the characterization of *S. typhi-murium* SL1344 and UK-1 Δcrp and $\Delta (crp-cdt)$ mutant strains and their avirulence, persistence, and abilities to induce protection against challenge with the highly virulent *S. typhi-murium* SL1344 wild-type strain and the wild-type UK-1 strain.

The *Escherichia coli* and *S. typhimurium* LT-2, SL1344, and UK-1 strains used are listed in Table 1. Bacterial strains for most experiments, unless otherwise noted, were grown in Luria broth (LB) (24). Bacterial strains were maintained in 1% Bacto Peptone (Difco Laboratories, Detroit, Mich.) containing 5% glycerol and were fast frozen in dry ice-ethanol for storage in duplicate at -70° C. Plasmid pSD110 contains a 1.3-kb *Bam*HI-*Eco*RI fragment of *S. typhimurium* LT-2 DNA cloned into pBR322 and was generously provided by C. Schroeder (36). The 1.3-kb fragment carries the *crp* structural gene flanked by 370 bp of DNA which includes the promoter region at the 5' end and 300 bp at the 3' end. This plasmid was used to complement in *trans* the Δcrp mutation in the chromosome.

The Δcrp and $\Delta (crp-cdt)$ mutant strains were constructed by using bacteriophage P22HT*int* transduction following standard methods (1, 35). Fusaric acid selection for tetracycline-sensitive deletion mutants was performed as described by Maloy and Nunn (25). (Note that the *zhc-1431*::Tn10 insertion used to introduce the linked *crp* and *crp-cdt* alleles into UK-1 strain χ 3761 has not been removed by fusaric acid selection. This ensures that the only differences in the UK-1 strains are the specific *crp* allele and the presence or absence of pSD110.) Plasmid pSD110 was introduced into the Δcrp and $\Delta (crp-cdt)$ strains by electroporation or by P22HT*int* transduction.

All strains were tested for growth characteristics in LB at 37°C and for carbohydrate fermentation or utilization with MacConkey agar (Difco Laboratories) or minimal agar, re-

[†] Present address: Megan Health, Inc., St. Louis, MO 63130.

TABLE 1.	Bacterial	strains
----------	-----------	---------

Strain	Genotype	Derivation or reference
E coli		
CA8445	thi rpsL Δcrp -45 Δcya -06 (pSD110)	36
S. typhimurium		
LT-2		
PP1037	<i>trpB223 crp-773</i> ::Tn10	31
DU8802	<i>zhc-1431</i> ::Tn10	33
TT172	cysG::Tn10	33
$\chi 3000$	Wild type	18
χ3385	hsdL6 galE496 trpB2 flaA66 rpsL120 xyl-404 metE551 lamB ⁺ (E. coli) Δ (zja::Tn10) val his-6165 hsdSA29 metA22	39
χ3477	F^- hsdL6 Δ (galE-chl-uvrB)1005 flaA66 rpsL120 xyl-404 lamB ⁺	39
χ3670	hsdL6 galE496 trpB2 flaA66 his-6165 rpsL120 xyl-404 metE551 metA22 lamB ⁺ (E. coli) Δ (zja::Tn10) hsdSA29 val (pSD110)	P22HT <i>int</i> (CA8445) $\rightarrow \chi 3385$ with selection for Ap ^r
χ3741	<i>zhc-1431</i> ::Tn10	P22HTint (DU8802) $\rightarrow \chi 3000$ with selection for Tc ^r
χ4430	$\label{eq:F-hsdL6} \begin{array}{l} \Delta(gal\mbox{-}chl\mbox{-}uvrB)1005\mbox{ fla}A66\mbox{ rpsL120\mbox{ zhc-}1431::Tn10\mbox{ xyl-}404\mbox{ lamB^+}\mbox{ (E. coli)\mbox{ hsdSA29}\Delta(zja::Tn10)\end{array}$	P22HTint (DU8802)→χ3477
SL1344		
χ3339	Wild type <i>rpsL hisG</i>	18
$\chi 3605$	hisG rpsL crp-773::Tn10	P22HTint (PP1037) $\rightarrow \chi$ 3339 with selection for Tc ^r , Mal ⁻
χ3622	hisG rpsL Δ (crp-cdt)10	FA ^r Tc ^s Mal ⁻ Arg ⁻ Cys ⁻ derivative of χ 3605
χ3623	hisG rpsL $\Delta crp-11$	FA ^r Tc ^s Mal ⁻ derivative of χ 3605
χ^{3706}	hisG rpsL Δ (crp-cdt)10 (pSD110)	χ 3622 transformed by pSD110
χ3/12	hisG rpsL Δ (crp-cdt)10 zhc-1431::1n10	P22HTint ($\chi^{3}/41$) $\rightarrow \chi^{3}622$ with selection for Tc ⁴ , Mal Cys Arg
χ3/3/	his G rpsL Δ (crp-cat)10 (pSD110)	Mouse-passaged $\chi_3/06$
χ3//3	his G rpsL Acrp-11 znc-1431::1n10	P22H1 <i>tht</i> ($\chi_5/41$) $\rightarrow \chi_{5025}$ with selection for 1°, Mai
$\chi_{3/14}$	his Crost cus C: Tn10	23025 transformed by pSD110 P22int (TT172) 2330 with selection for Tc ^r (vs ⁻)
χ3910 ₂ 3031	hisG rpsL CysO. Third	$FA^{T} Tc^{s}$ derivative of $\sqrt{3010}$: $Cvs^{-} Crp^{-}$
×4452	his G rps L $\Delta(crp-cdt)$ 14 zhc_1/31. Tp 10	P22HTint ($\sqrt{430}$) \rightarrow (3031 with selection for Tc ^r Mal ⁻ Cvc ⁻
χ++52	$mso pst \Delta(cp-cu) + 2nc-1+511mo$	$122111uu (\chi + 50) \times \chi 5551$ with selection for re, war eys
UK-1		
χ3761	Wild type	15
χ3779	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10 \ zhc-1431::Tn10$	P22HT <i>int</i> (χ 3712) $\rightarrow\chi$ 3761 with selection for Tc ^r , Mal ⁻ Cys ⁻ Arg ⁻
χ3828	$\Delta crp-11 zhc-1431::Tn10$	P22HTint (χ 3773) $\rightarrow\chi$ 3761 with selection for Tc ^r , Mal ⁻
χ4464	$\Delta(crp-cdt)$ 14 zhc-1431::Tn10	P22HTint (χ 4452) $\rightarrow\chi$ 3761 with selection for Tc ^r , Mal ⁻ Cys ⁻
χ4635	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10 zhc-1431::Tn10 (pSD110)$	P22HTint (χ 36/0) $\rightarrow\chi$ 37/9 with selection for Ap ⁺ , Mal ⁺
χ4030	Δ <i>crp-11 znc-14</i> 31::1n10 (pSD110)	P22H1 <i>int</i> $(\chi_{30}/0) \rightarrow \chi_{3828}$ with selection for Ap', Mal

spectively, with maltose, mannitol, sorbitol, melibiose, xylose, rhamnose, mannose, or glucose as the sole carbon source. The motilities of the mutants were determined by using medium composed of 1% casein enzyme hydrolysate (Sigma, St. Louis, Mo.), 0.5% NaCl, 0.5% agar (Difco Laboratories), and 50 µg of triphenyltetrazolium chloride per ml. The presence of group B O antigen (factors 1, 4, 5, and 12) and H antigen (poly a-z) was confirmed by slide agglutination with antisera (Difco Laboratories). The lipopolysaccharide profiles of the mutant and parent strains were analyzed by sodium dodecyl sulfate-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis; the profiles were visualized by the silver staining procedure (21, 40). Normal human serum (90%) was used to test the resistance of the mutants to complement-mediated bacteriolysis. Bacteria were grown at 37°C to log phase in LB and then diluted in buffered saline with gelatin (BSG) (11), which was added as a wetting agent to approximately 10⁶ CFU/ml. Each strain was added at 10⁴ CFU to serum buffered with HEPES (Sigma) (1 mM, pH 7.0) and allowed to incubate for 1 h at 37°C in a 5% CO₂ atmosphere. Samples were then diluted and plated on MacConkey agar containing 1% maltose for enumeration of CFU. S. typhimurium χ 3477 [Δ (gal-chl-uvrB)1005], a rough strain, was used as a positive control for complement-mediated bacteriolysis.

Eight-week-old female BALB/c mice obtained from Sasco Inc. (Omaha, Nebr.) were used for all infectivity and immunization experiments. The animal room was maintained at 22 to 23°C with 12 h of illumination daily. Methods for growth of the bacteria and inoculation of mice were as described by Curtiss and Kelly (13) and Kelly et al. (22). Generally, the mutants or wild-type strains were grown to late log phase in LB broth at 37°C with aeration. Prior to immunization mice were deprived of food and water for 4 h and then were orally given 30 μ l of sodium bicarbonate (10% [wt/vol]) to neutralize stomach acid. Twenty minutes later, 20 μ l of *S. typhimurium* cells suspended in BSG diluted to the desired density was administered through a pipette tip to the back of the mouth. Food and water were returned 30 min after inoculation.

The levels of virulence of the *S. typhimurium* wild-type and mutant strains were determined by oral inoculation of mice with various doses of the strains. Morbidity and mortality of mice were observed for 30 days postinoculation. Survivors were subsequently challenged with up to 2×10^5 times the oral 50% lethal dose (LD₅₀) of the wild-type parent, χ 3761 or χ 3339. Morbidity and mortality of the challenged mice were observed for an additional 30 days. LD₅₀s were calculated by the method of Reed and Muench (32).

Groups of three mice were inoculated with 10^9 CFU of the mutants and necropsied on days 1, 4, 7, and 10 after oral inoculation. Spleens, livers, Peyer's patches, and blood samples were collected, and the tissues were homogenized in BSG with

a homogenizer (Brinkmann, Westburg, N.Y.). *S. typhimurium* was recovered from the homogenates and blood samples by plating on MacConkey agar supplemented with 1% maltose for identification of the Crp^- mutants or with 1% lactose for identification of the Crp^+ strains. The CFU recovered from tissues were replica plated onto MacConkey agar supplemented with maltose and ampicillin to test the in vivo stability of plasmid pSD110. Group B antiserum (Difco) was used for verification of *S. typhimurium* CFU. CFU are presented as geometric means with standard errors.

Student's t test was used to compare differences in colonization of mice by the wild-type and mutant strains. P < 0.05 was regarded as significant.

Discovery of (crp-cdt) mutations and construction of the mutants. In an effort to construct a prototype deletion mutation of the crp region for all future vaccine strain constructions, several independent deletions of crp-773::Tn10 were generated in S. typhimurium SL1344. One Δcrp mutant, designated χ 3622, appeared to be particularly more attenuated, as mice receiving greater than 10⁹ CFU did not develop any visible signs of illness. Upon oral challenge with the wild-type SL1344 parent strain 30 days later, the mice were protected against at least 10 times the wild-type LD50 (higher challenge doses were not tested). Further characterization revealed that this deletion, created by the imprecise excision of Tn10, conferred auxotrophy for arginine and cysteine and presumably caused deletion of the *argD* and *cysG* loci in addition to *crp*. This mutation was initially given the designation $\Delta(arg-crp-cysG)10$ (based on the then-reported gene order in the S. typhimurium chromosome (33). crp⁺-containing plasmid pSD110 was transformed into χ 3622 and into χ 3623, which has another independently generated *crp* mutation, designated Δcrp -11, to restore *crp* function. The pSD110 plasmid was able to restore virulence to Δcrp -11 χ 3623, but χ 3622, carrying the crp^+ plasmid, remained fully attenuated for mice at doses exceeding 6×10^8 CFU. Mutants with argD::Tn10 and cysG::Tn10 mutations were constructed in SL1344, and each displayed wild-type SL1344 virulence, with LD₅₀s of about 10⁵ CFU. The $\Delta(arg-crp-cysG)10$ mutation was subsequently introduced into other Salmonella serotypes via P22- or P1L4-mediated transduction. In each case, the avirulence phenotype was associated with the genetic lesion generated in the 75-min map region of the Salmonella chromosome.

We endeavored to isolate this virulence-associated allele independent of *crp* by generating another series of independent deletion mutations by imprecise excision of cysG::Tn10 located near 75.5 min (34) downstream from crp and arg. This attempt produced a mutant, χ 3931, that was Arg⁺ Cys⁻ Crp⁻. Complementation of the crp mutation with pSD110 did not restore virulence for mice. The mutation in χ 3931 was initially designated $\Delta(crp-cysG)$ 14. In this mutant search, we failed to recover Cys⁻ Crp⁺ strains that were avirulent for mice. Persistence studies of mice with $\chi 3622 \left[\Delta (arg-crp-cysG) 10 \right]$ and χ 3931 [Δ (*crp-cysG*)14] with and without pSD110 revealed that these mutants localized to the GALT but that the number of bacteria that reached deeper tissues were reduced compared to strains with complementable crp mutations. Thus, we termed this locus *cdt*, as *Salmonella* strains with this region of DNA deleted were defective in reaching and colonizing deep tissues of mice after oral inoculation. The mutant alleles were therefore redesignated $\Delta(crp-cdt)10$ and $\Delta(crp-cdt)14$. Since S. typhimurium SL1344 is streptomycin resistant, which would make it less suitable as a vaccine, we generated $\Delta(crp-cdt)10$ and $\Delta(crp-cdt)$ 14 mutations in S. typhimurium UK-1, which is highly virulent for mice and totally antibiotic sensitive.

TABLE 2. Mortality of BALB/c mice 30 days after oral inoculation with mutant *S. typhimurium* strains^{*a*}

Strain	Genotype	Inoculating dose (CFU)	No. of survivors/ total no. of mice
SL1344			
χ3622	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$	6.2×10^{8}	5/5
χ3623	$\Delta crp-11$	2.2×10^{9}	1/5
χ3737	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$ (pSD110)	5.0×10^{8}	5/5
χ3774	Δ <i>crp-11</i> (pSD110)	$3.0 imes 10^4$	3/5
UK-1			
χ3779	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$	$1.8 imes 10^{9}$	9/9
$\chi 3828$	$\Delta crp-11$	$2.6 imes 10^{9}$	8/9
$\chi 4635$	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$ (pSD110)	$1.0 imes 10^{9}$	9/9
χ4636	$\Delta crp-11$ (pSD110)	5.0×10^{4}	8/15

^a Mice were inoculated perorally with the indicated strains. Morbidity and mortality were observed for 30 days.

Characterization of the mutant strains. The Δcrp and $\Delta (crp$ *cdt*) derivatives failed to ferment or utilize maltose, mannitol, sorbitol, melibiose, rhamnose, or xylose as the sole carbon source but did grow on glucose and mannose. Wild-type UK-1 strain χ 3761 and SL1344 strain χ 3339 fermented all of the carbon sources assayed. The plasmid carrying the Salmonella crp⁺ allele with its own promoter, pSD110, restored the carbohydrate utilization ability of the Δcrp and $\Delta (crp-cdt)$ mutants to the wild-type phenotype. The mutant strains did not display motilities equivalent to those displayed by the wild-type parents in the medium with triphenyltetrazolium chloride, but they agglutinated with Salmonella H antiserum. The synthesis of flagella is under cyclic AMP-cyclic AMP receptor protein control (42). Komeda et al. (23) have described a suppressor mutation, cfs (constitutive flagellar synthesis), which restores flagellation in Crp⁻ mutants. It is therefore likely that such suppressor mutations can be or are spontaneously selected to result in a Crp⁻ mutant with restored ability to synthesize flagella. The Δcrp and $\Delta (crp-cdt)$ mutants exhibited reduced growth rates, with mean generation times in LB broth decreased by 13% compared to that of the wild-type parent. Both wild-type parent and mutant strains had similar lipopolysaccharide compositions. Resistance to complement-mediated bacteriolysis when exposed to 90% normal human serum in a 5% CO_2 atmosphere was not affected by introducing the *crp* and/or crp cdt mutations into wild-type S. typhimurium χ 3761.

Virulence of mutant strains in BALB/c mice. The oral LD₅₀, determined for 8-week-old BALB/c mice, of wild-type SL1344 χ 3339 was 6 \times 10⁴ CFU and of UK-1 χ 3761 was 8.5 \times 10³ CFU. All the mutant strains had $LD_{50}s$ more than 10^5 times higher than those of the wild-type parents, χ 3339 and χ 3761 (Table 2). The Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ mutants were completely avirulent, as all mice survived oral infection with 6×10^8 CFU of Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ SL1344 strain χ 3622 [Δ (*crp-cdt*)10] and 1.8 \times 10⁹ CFU of Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ UK-1 strain χ 3779 [Δ (*crp-cdt*)10] (Table 2). Mice that received these mutants did not show any signs of illness and remained healthy throughout the 30-day observation period after inoculation. The Crp⁻ Cdt⁺ SL1344 and UK-1 mutants (χ 3623 and χ 3828 with Δcrp -11, respectively) were less attenuated than the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strains, as some mice died in both treatment groups (Table 2). In addition, mice inoculated with UK-1 Crp⁻ Cdt⁺ mutant χ 3828 (Δ crp-11) developed splenomegaly 10 days postinoculation, whereas the Crp- Cdtmutants of both SL1344 and UK-1 did not induce any spleen enlargement.

Introduction of plasmid pSD110 carrying the wild-type crp



gene and promoter into the mutant strains restores *crp* gene function in *trans*. Inclusion of pSD110 in the SL1344 and UK-1 Crp⁻ strains with the Δcrp -11 allele complemented the mutation to generate strains with near-wild-type virulence (Table 2). However, inclusion of the crp^+ plasmid in the SL1344 and UK-1 Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strains did not restore full virulence, as all mice survived oral infection with the highest dose given (Table 2). These results indicate that pSD110 does not carry the DNA sequences needed to complement the missing *cdt* allele(s) in the *crp* region of the chromosome to restore full virulence.

Substitution of the $\Delta(crp-cdt)14$ allele for the $\Delta(crp-cdt)10$ allele in both SL1344 and UK-1 backgrounds generated strains that displayed identical phenotypes with regard to avirulence, inability to induce splenomegaly, and inability to have virulence restored by the addition of the crp^+ allele in pSD110 (data not shown).

Tissue tropism and persistence of avirulent mutants in mice. Figure 1 presents data on the recovery of the UK-1 mutants from tissues of mice after oral infection with 10⁹ CFU of the strains. Strain χ 4636 (Δcrp -11 pSD110) was used as a wild-type control, as the crp deletion mutation was complemented by the crp gene carried by pSD110. Figure 1 shows high numbers of χ 4636 CFU recovered on day 7 from the Peyer's patches of the intestinal tract, spleens, and blood of mice prior to death due to disease. The Crp⁻ χ 3828 (Δ crp-11) strain colonized Peyer's patches (Fig. 1Å) as well as did wild-type χ 4636 (Δ *crp-11* pSD110). χ 3828 was also found in the spleen and blood (Fig. 1B and C). Mice inoculated with this strain displayed signs of illness and had enlarged spleens. Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strain χ 3779 colonized the Peyer's patches (Fig. 1A) as efficiently as the Δcrp -11 and wild-type strains but was limited in its ability to colonize spleen and blood compared to Crp-



С

FIG. 1. Recovery of CFU of *S. typhimurium* UK-1 strains from the Peyer's patches (A), spleens (B), and blood (C) of 8-week-old BALB/c female mice at specified times after peroral inoculation with 10^{9} CFU of Crp⁺ Cdt⁺ χ 4636 (Δcrp -11 pSD110) (\blacksquare), Crp⁻ Cdt⁺ χ 3828 (Δcrp -11) (\square), Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ χ 4635 [Δ (*crp*-*cdt*)10 pSD110] (\bigcirc), and Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ χ 3779 [Δ (*crp*-*cdt*)10] (\bigcirc). Three mice were sampled for each time point. The results are given as \log_{10} means \pm standard errors.

strain χ 3828 (Δ *crp-11*) (Fig. 1B and C). Significantly lower numbers of CFU of the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strains $[\Delta(crp-cdt) \text{ and } \Delta(crp-cdt) \text{ pSD110, respectively}]$ than of Crp⁻ strain $\chi 3828$ (Δcrp -11) and Δcrp -11 pSD110⁺ strain $\chi 4636$ (P < 0.01) were recovered from spleens of mice on day 7 or 10. No bacteria could be recovered from the blood of mice inoculated with the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strains (Fig. 1C). The differences between the wild-type and the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp^+ Cdt⁻ strains were statistically significant (P < 0.01). Inclusion of the crp gene carried on pSD110 in the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strains did not completely restore the ability of the mutants to colonize deep tissues as did complementation of the $\Delta crp-11$ mutation in χ 3828. The phenotype associated with the *cdt* mutation has been identified as a marked decrease in the efficiency of the bacteria to reach and colonize deep tissues compared to the parent strain. Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strain χ 4635 [Δ (*crp*cdt)10 pSD110⁺] (Fig. 1B and C) colonized deeper tissues at significantly reduced levels (P < 0.05 and P < 0.01, respectively) compared with Crp⁻ Cdt⁺ Δcrp -11 strain χ 3828. An evaluation of S. typhimurium UK-1 strains with the $\Delta(crp$ cdt)14 allele in place of the $\Delta(crp-cdt)$ 10 allele gave equivalent results in terms of the abilities of the strains to colonize Peyer's patches and deep tissues in orally infected female BALB/c mice (data not shown).

Similarly, in evaluating *S. typhimurium* SL1344 strains, there was no significant difference in colonization of Peyer's patches between wild-type χ 3339, Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strain χ 3622 (Δ crp-cdt), and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strain χ 3737 [Δ (crp-cdt) pSD110⁺]. Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strain χ 3737 did not colonize spleens as efficiently as wild-type χ 3339. No splenomegaly was observed in mice inoculated with SL1344 Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ or Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ mutants. Mice that received 10⁹ CFU of χ 3622 or χ 3737 did not show signs of illness; however, all mice that received wild-type χ 3339 died by day 7 (data not shown).

The in vivo stability of plasmid pSD110 was assessed by replica plating CFU recovered from the tissue homogenates plated on MacConkey agar with either maltose or lactose onto MacConkey agar plus maltose and ampicillin. All CFU recovered from mice inoculated with mutant strains containing pSD110 were Ap^r and Mal⁺, indicating that each colony visualized on the MacConkey plates plus maltose had Ap^r and *crp*⁺

 TABLE 3. Effectiveness of single oral immunization with

 S. typhimurium SL1344 mutants in protecting BALB/c

 mice against challenge with wild-type SL1344^a

Strain	Genotype	Immunizing dose (CFU)	Challenging dose (CFU)	No. of survivors/ total no. of mice
χ3622	$\Delta(crp\text{-}cdt)10$	$\begin{array}{c} 1.5 \times 10^9 \\ 6.2 \times 10^8 \\ 4.2 \times 10^8 \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 3.2 \times 10^8 \\ 3.6 \times 10^8 \\ 8.8 \times 10^8 \end{array}$	5/5 5/5 5/5
χ3737	$\begin{array}{c} \Delta(crp\text{-}cdt)10\\ (\text{pSD110}) \end{array}$	$5.8 imes 10^8$	$8.4 imes 10^8$	5/5

^{*a*} Thirty days after mice were immunized perorally with a single dose of the indicated attenuated strains, they were challenged with wild-type SL1344 strain χ 3339. Morbidity and mortality observations were recorded daily for an additional 30 days postchallenge.

portions of the plasmid and thus demonstrating the stability of the *crp* gene complementing the *crp* deletion.

Efficacy of avirulent mutants in conferring protective immunity. Table 3 contains data on the ability of SL1344 mutant strains $\chi 3622$ and $\chi 3737$ to induce protective immunity. All mice immunized with a single dose of Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strain $\chi 3622$ were protected against challenge with 5×10^3 to 1.5×10^4 times the LD₅₀ of the wild-type parent, $\chi 3339$. Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strain $\chi 3737$ protected mice against wild-type challenge to the same degree. These encouraging results prompted us to conduct a more extensive series of experiments to evaluate the avirulence and immunogenicity of the mutant derivatives of the highly virulent and antibiotic-sensitive UK-1 strain.

Data on the efficacy of a single oral immunization with S. typhimurium UK-1 mutant strains for protecting BALB/c mice against challenge with wild-type strains are shown in Table 4. Since colonization of deep tissues in mice by Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strain χ 3779 was significantly lower than for Crp⁻ strain χ 3828, it follows that mice immunized with the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ mutant might not be as protected against wild-type challenge as mice immunized with χ 3828. Thus, although mice immunized with $10^8\,\text{or}\,10^9\,\text{CFU}$ of Crp^- strain $\chi3828$ displayed signs of illness as evidenced by splenomegaly and bacteremia and although 2 of 18 mice died prior to challenge, consistent with the above reasoning, 23 of 25 (92%) mice immunized with Crp^- strain $\chi 3828$ survived challenge with various doses of wild-type χ 3761 (Table 4). In contrast, only 10 of 27 (37%) mice immunized with either 10^7 , or 10^8 , or 10^9 CFU of $\chi 3779$ $[\Delta(crp-cdt)10]$ survived challenge with the wild-type parent strain, χ 3761. Complementation of the *crp* mutation in Crp Cdt⁻ strains by pSD110 yielded strains that induced greater protective immunity in mice, as mice immunized with $\Delta(crp$ cdt)10 pSD110⁺ strain χ 4635 displayed higher frequencies (14 of 27; 52%) of survival after challenge with the wild-type parent than mice immunized with the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strain (Table 4). $\Delta(crp-cdt)14$ strain χ 4464 showed protective efficacy results similar to those of $\Delta(crp-cdt)10$ strain χ 3779 and failed to provide complete protection (data not shown).

Since a single oral immunization with UK-1 Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ or Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ mutants did not induce complete protection, it was of interest to determine whether multiple immunizations with the mutants would give enhanced protection and whether these UK-1 mutants can induce complete protection to challenge with less-virulent wild-type strains such as SL1344. Mice were perorally given two immunizations with 10⁹ CFU of UK-1 Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strain χ 3779 [Δ (*crp-cdt*)10] or Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strain χ 4635 [Δ (*crp-cdt*)10 pSD110] one month apart and were challenged 30 days after the second immunization with either wild-type UK-1 or SL1344 (Table 5). Of 10 mice in each of the two

groups immunized with either UK-1 attenuated strain, 8 (80%) survived challenge with wild-type UK-1; interestingly, all mice (4 of 4; 100%) challenged with the highest dose (10⁹ CFU) survived, while one from each group challenged with the lower doses (10⁶ and 10⁷ CFU) died (Table 5). Complete protection was apparent when mice immunized with the UK-1 mutant strains survived challenge with 10⁶ to 10⁹ CFU of the wild-type SL1344 strain (Table 5). None of the immunized mice showed signs of illness either before or after challenge.

It has been shown that S. typhimurium $\Delta crp \ \Delta cya$ mutants are avirulent and immunogenic in mice, chickens, and swine (9, 13, 19) but provide diminished attenuation to S. typhi for humans (37). An extended crp deletion mutation termed crp-cdt was discovered in S. choleraesuis, and bacteria carrying this mutation were found to be avirulent and protective in mice (22) and in swine (41). Subsequently, an S. typhi $\Delta(crp-cdt)$ strain was tested in adult volunteers and shown to be avirulent and immunogenic (38). In this study S. typhimurium SL1344 and UK-1 Δcrp -cdt and $\Delta (crp$ -cdt) mutants were constructed and characterized. The SL1344 wild-type strain, χ 3339 (18), has an LD₅₀ of 6×10^4 CFU. S. typhimurium UK-1 is a strain of extremely high virulence, having an LD50 for one-day-old chicks of 3×10^3 CFU (15) and an LD₅₀ of 8.5×10^3 CFU for mice (this manuscript), and is capable of causing lethal infections in swine, cattle, and horses. It was therefore reasoned that if the strain could be effectively attenuated, then its ability

TABLE 4. Effectiveness of single oral immunization with S. typhimurium UK-1 mutants in protecting BALB/c mice against challenge with wild-type UK-1^a

Strain	Genotype	Immunizing dose (CFU)	Challenging dose (CFU)	No. of survivors/ total no. of mice
χ3779	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$	$1.8 imes 10^9$	$1.8 imes 10^9$	1/3
			$1.8 imes 10^8$	1/3
			$1.8 imes 10^7$	2/3
		$1.8 imes 10^8$	1.8×10^{9}	0/3
			1.8×10^{8}	0/3
			$1.8 imes 10^7$	2/3
		$1.8 imes 10^7$	1.8×10^{9}	0/3
			1.8×10^{8}	1/3
			$1.8 imes 10^7$	3/3
Total				10/27
χ3828	$\Delta crp-11$	2.6×10^{9}	1.8×10^{9}	3/3
	1		$1.8 imes 10^8$	1/3
			$1.8 imes 10^7$	2/2
		2.6×10^{8}	1.8×10^{9}	3/3
			$1.8 imes 10^8$	3/3
			$1.8 imes 10^7$	2/2
		$2.6 imes 10^7$	1.8×10^9	3/3
			$1.8 imes 10^8$	3/3
			$1.8 imes 10^7$	3/3
Total				23/25
χ4635	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$	1.0×10^{9}	1.2×10^{9}	1/3
	(pSD110)		1.2×10^{8}	2/3
	u ,		1.2×10^7	0/3
		$1.0 imes 10^8$	1.2×10^{9}	2/3
			1.2×10^8	2/3
			1.2×10^7	2/3
		$1.0 imes 10^7$	1.2×10^{9}	2/3
			$1.2 imes 10^8$	3/3
			$1.2 imes 10^7$	0/3
Total				14/27

^{*a*} Thirty days after mice were immunized perorally with a single dose of the indicated attenuated strains, they were challenged with wild-type UK-1 strain χ 3761. Morbidity and mortality observations were recorded daily for an additional 30 days postchallenge.

TABLE 5. Effectiveness of two oral immunizations w	<i>ith</i>
S. typhimurium UK-1 mutants in protecting BALB/c n	nice
against challenge with wild-type UK-1 or SL1344 ^a	

Immunizing strain or	Genotype	Challenging dose (CFU)	No. of su no. of n challer	No. of survivors/total no. of mice after challenge with:	
compound			UK-1	SL1344	
x3779	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$	1×10^{9}	4/4	4/4	
	(1)	1×10^7	2/3	3/3	
		1×10^{6}	2/3	3/3	
χ4635	$\Delta(crp-cdt)10$	1×10^{9}	4/4	4/4	
	(pSD110)	1×10^7	2/3	3/3	
	u ,	1×10^{6}	2/3	3/3	
BSG	NA	1×10^{6}	ND	0/3	
		1×10^5	0/3	2/3	

^{*a*} Mice were given two immunizations, 1 month apart, with 10⁹ CFU of the indicated attenuated strains or with BSG and challenged 30 days after the second immunization with the wild-type UK-1 χ 3761 or SL1344 χ 3339. Morbidity and mortality observations were recorded daily for an additional 30 days postchallenge. NA, not applicable; ND, not determined.

to induce protective immunity against *Salmonella* challenge might be enhanced relative to those of attenuated derivatives of less-virulent *S. typhimurium* strains.

All the SL1344 and UK-1 mutants were attenuated, with mice surviving greater than 10^4 times the wild-type LD_{50} . SL1344 Crp⁻ strain χ 3623 and UK-1 Crp⁻ strain χ 3828 were more virulent for mice than the Cdt⁻ or Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strains since mice receiving doses higher than 10⁸ CFU became ill and some died. χ 3828 and χ 3623 (data not shown) also colonized and persisted at higher levels in spleen and blood than did the more attenuated $\Delta(crp-cdt)$ strains. It is significant that this least-attenuated strain induced the highest level of protective immunity in mice surviving the immunizing dose. The $\Delta(crp$ *cdt*) mutation did not significantly impair the abilities of the mutants to attach to, invade, and persist in GALT but significantly reduced the abilities of the strains to colonize deeper tissues, such as the spleen, compared to the $\Delta crp-11$ and the UK-1 wild-type strains. These data indicate that the level of protective immunity in mice is dependent on the degree of colonization by the immunizing strain, especially with respect to internal lymphoid organs. Similar data by others have shown that mutations such as pur (27), asd (12), thy (30), and phoP (17) in Salmonella impair the ability of the wild type to invade and persist in internal lymphoid organs and that protection was not complete after immunized mice received a significant oral challenge with the wild-type parent. Interestingly, when the crp deletion mutation in UK-1 strains was complemented by crp plasmid pSD110, the Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strains induced a higher degree of protective immunity in immunized mice, as evidenced by a higher frequency of survival after challenge with the wildtype parent than that for mice immunized with the Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ strains. Complementation of the *crp* mutation in the Δcrp -*cdt* mutant strains did not restore the ability of the Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strains to colonize spleen tissue to the level observed for Crp⁻ strain χ 3828. The Δ (*crp-cdt*) mutation is highly attenuating, possibly too much so in UK-1, but in some strains, such as SL1344, yields vaccines that are completely safe and that confer high-level protective immunity against infection by virulent S. typhimurium wild-type strains except for hypervirulent strains such as UK-1. On the other hand, the UK-1 Crp⁻ Cdt⁻ and Crp⁺ Cdt⁻ strains, although not fully protecting mice against challenge with the highly virulent UK-1 strain, can induce excellent protective immunity to challenge with a lessvirulent *S. typhimurium* strain such as SL1344. Also, since Cdt⁻ *S. typhimurium* strains are much more efficient at colonizing the GALT than internal lymphoid organs, such as the spleen, it can be anticipated that such attenuated strains might be more effective in inducing generalized mucosal immune responses than in inducing either systemic or cellular immune response.

The results of these studies help to improve the understanding of the phenotype associated with a locus close to the *crp* gene that results in stable avirulent *Salmonella* strains that are able to efficiently colonize the GALT but that do not significantly invade deep tissues. Studies are in progress to delineate the functions of this genetic locus.

We thank P. W. Postma for supplying the *crp*::Tn10 S. *typhimurium* mutant and Jack Diani, Dan Piatchek, and Sue Penrose for assistance with animal experimentation.

This work was supported by NIH grant DE06669.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, R. P., and J. R. Roth. 1978. Tandem chromosomal duplications in Salmonella typhimurium: fusion of histidine genes to novel promoters. J. Mol. Biol. 119:147–166.
- Asherson, G. L., M. Zembala, M. A. C. C. Perera, B. Mayhew, and W. R. Thomas. 1977. Production of immunity and unresponsiveness in the mouse by feeding contact sensitizing agents and the role of suppressor cells in the Peyer's patches, mesenteric lymph nodes and other lymphoid tissues. Cell. Immunol. 33:145–155.
- Bienenstock, J., M. McDermott, D. Befus, and M. O'Neill. 1978. A common mucosal immunologic system involving the bronchus, breast, and bowel. Adv. Exp. Med. Biol. 107:53–59.
- 4. Bollen, W. S., L. Burns-Keliher, S. A. Tinge, X. Zhang, and R. Curtiss III. 1994. Characterization of a deletion mutant of *Salmonella typhimurium* UK-1 affecting colonization of deep tissue, abstr. B-314, p. 85. *In* Abstracts of the 94th General Meeting of the American Society for Microbiology 1994. American Society for Microbiology, Washington, D.C.
- Cardenas, L., and J. D. Clements. 1992. Oral immunization using live attenuated *Salmonella* spp. as carriers of foreign antigens. Clin. Microbiol. Rev. 5:328–342.
- Carter, P. B., and F. M. Collins. 1974. The route of enteric infection in normal mice. J. Exp. Med. 139:1189–1203.
- Cebra, J. J., P. J. Gearhart, R. Kamat, S. M. Robertson, and J. Tseng. 1976. Origin and differentiation of lymphocytes involved in the secretory IgA response. Cold Spring Harbor Symp. Quant. Biol. 41:201–215.
- Chatfield, S., M. Roberts, J. Li, A. Starns, and G. Dougan. 1994. The use of live attenuated Salmonella for oral vaccination. Dev. Biol. Stand. 82:35–42.
- Coe, N. E., and R. L. Wood. 1992. The effect of exposure to a Δ*crp* Δ*cya* mutant of *Salmonella typhimurium* on the subsequent colonization of swine by the wild-type parent strain. Vet. Microbiol. **31**:207–220.
- Collins, F. M. 1974. Vaccines and cell-mediated immunity. Bacteriol. Rev. 38:371–376.
- Curtiss, R., III. 1965. Chromosomal aberrations associated with mutations to bacteriophage resistance in *Escherichia coli*. J. Bacteriol. 89:28–40.
- Curtiss, R., III, R. Goldschmidt, S. M. Kelly, M. Lyons, S. Michalek, R. Pastian, and S. Stein. 1987. Recombinant avirulent *Salmonella* for oral immunization to induce mucosal immunity to bacterial pathogens, p. 261– 271. *In* H. Kohler and P. T. LoVerde (ed.), Vaccines: new concepts and developments. Proceedings of the 10th International Convocation on Immunology. Longman Scientific and Technical, Harlow, Essex, Great Britain.
- Curtiss, R., III, and S. M. Kelly. 1987. Salmonella typhimurium deletion mutants lacking adenylate cyclase and cyclic receptor protein are avirulent and immunogenic. Infect. Immun. 55:3035–3043.
- Curtiss, R., III. 1990. Attenuated Salmonella strains as live vectors for the expression of foreign antigens, p. 161–188. In G. C. Woodrow and M. M. Levine (ed.), New generation vaccines. Marcel Dekker, Inc., New York, N.Y.
- 15. Curtiss, R., III, S. B. Porter, M. Munson, S. A. Tinge, J. O. Hassan, C. Gentry-Weeks, and S. M. Kelly. 1991. Nonrecombinant and recombinant avirulent *Salmonella* live vaccines for poultry, p. 169–198. *In* L. C. Blankenship, J. S. Bailey, N. A. Cox, N. J. Stern, and R. J. Meinersmann (ed.), Colonization control of human bacterial enteropathogens in poultry. Academic Press, New York, N.Y.
- Curtiss, R., III, S. M. Kelly, S. A. Tinge, C. O. Tacket, M. M. Levine, J. Srinivasan, and M. Koopman. 1994. Recombinant Salmonella vectors in vaccine development. Dev. Biol. Stand. 82:23–33.
- Galan, J. E., and R. Curtiss III. 1989. Virulence and vaccine potential of phoP mutants of Salmonella typhimurium. Microb. Pathog. 6:433–443.
- 18. Gulig, P. A., and R. Curtiss III. 1987. Plasmid-associated virulence of Sal-

monella typhimurium. Infect. Immun. 55:2891-2901.

- 19. Hassan, J. O., and R. Curtiss III. 1990. Control of colonization by virulent *Salmonella typhimurium* by oral immunization of chickens with avirulent $\Delta crp \Delta cya S$. typhimurium. Res. Microbiol. **141**:839–850.
- Hassan, J. O., and R. Curtiss III. 1996. Effect of vaccination of hens with an avirulent strain of *Salmonella typhimurium* on immunity of progeny challenged with wild-type *Salmonella* strains. Infect. Immun. 64:938–944.
- Hitchcock, P. J., and T. M. Brown. 1983. Morphological heterogeneity among *Salmonella* lipopolysaccharide chemotypes in silver-stained polyacrylamide gels. J. Bacteriol. 154:269–277.
- Kelly, S. M., B. A. Bosecker, and R. Curtiss III. 1992. Characterization and protective properties of attenuated mutants of *Salmonella choleraesuis*. Infect. Immun. 60:4881–4890.
- Komeda, Y., H. Suzuki, J. Ishidsu, and T. Iino. 1975. The role of the cAMP in flagellation of *Salmonella typhimurium*. Mol. Gen. Genet. 142:289–298.
- Luria, S. E., and J. W. Burrous. 1957. Hybridization between *Escherichia coli* and shigella. J. Bacteriol. 74:461–476.
- Maloy, S. E., and W. D. Nunn. 1981. Selection for loss of tetracycline resistance by *Escherichia coli*. J. Bacteriol. 145:1110–1112.
- McCaughan, G., and A. Basten. 1983. Immune system of the gastrointestinal tract. Int. Rev. Physiol. 28:131–157.
- McFarland, W. C., and B. A. D. Stocker. 1987. Effect of different purine auxotrophic mutations on mouse-virulence of a Vi-positive strain of *Salmonella dublin* and of two strains of *Salmonella typhimurium*. Microb. Pathog. 3:129–141.
- Nair, R., and R. S. Kamat. 1982. Effector cell-mediated immune response in mice immunized with *Salmonella*. J. Med. Microbiol. 15:215–221.
- Nardelli-Haefliger, D., J. P. Krachenbuhl, R. Curtiss III, F. Schodel, A. Potts, S. Kelly, and P. D. Grandi. 1996. Oral and rectal immunization of adult female volunteers with a recombinant attenuated *Salmonella typhi* vaccine strain. Infect. Immun. 64:5219–5224.
- O'Callaghan, D., D. Maskell, F. Y. Liew, C. S. F. Easmon, and G. Dougan. 1988. Characterization of aromatic- and purine-dependent *Salmonella typhimurium*: attenuation, persistence, and ability to induce protective immunity in BALB/c mice. Infect. Immun. 56:419–423.
- 31. Postma, P. W., H. G. Keizer, and P. Kookwijk. 1986. Transport of trehalose

in Salmonella typhimurium. J. Bacteriol. 168:1107-1111.

- Reed, L. J., and H. Muench. 1938. A simple method of estimating fifty percent endpoints. Am. J. Hyg. 27:493–497.
- Sanderson, K. E., and J. R. Roth. 1988. Linkage map of Salmonella typhimurium, edition VII. Microbiol. Rev. 52:485–532.
- Sanderson, K. E., A. Hessel, and K. E. Rudd. 1995. Genetic map of Salmonella typhimurium, edition VIII. Microbiol. Rev. 59:241–303.
- Schmeiger, H. 1972. Phage P22 mutants with increased or decreased transduction abilities. Mol. Gen. Genet. 119:75–88.
- Schroeder, C. J., and W. J. Dobrogosz. 1986. Cloning and DNA sequence analysis of the wild-type and mutant cyclic AMP receptor protein genes from *Salmonella typhimurium*. J. Bacteriol. 167:616–622.
- 37. Tacket, C. O., D. M. Hone, R. Curtiss III, S. M. Kelly, G. Losonsky, L. Guers, A. M. Harris, R. Edelman, and M. M. Levine. 1992. Comparison of the safety and immunogenicity of Δ*aroC* Δ*aroD* and Δ*cya* Δ*crp* Salmonella typhi strains in adult volunteers. Infect. Immun. 60:536–541.
- 38. Tacket, C. O., S. M. Kelly, F. Schödel, G. Losonsky, J. P. Nataro, R. Edelman, M. M. Levine, and R. Curtiss III. 1997. Safety and immunogenicity in humans of an attenuated *Salmonella typhi* vaccine vector strain expressing plasmid-encoded hepatitis B antigens stabilized by the Asd-balanced lethal vector system. Infect. Immun. 65:3381–3385.
- Tinge, S. A., and R. Curtiss III. 1990. Conservation of Salmonella typhimurium virulence plasmid maintenance regions among Salmonella serovars as a basis for plasmid curing. Infect. Immun. 58:3084–3092.
- Tsai, C. M., and C. E. Frasch. 1982. A sensitive silver stain for detecting lipopolysaccharides in polyacrylamide gels. Anal. Biochem. 119:115–119.
- 41. Yancey, R. J., Jr., R. A. Rzepkowski, B. J. Hanson, R. K. Frank, S. A. Salmon, M. S. Sanchez, S. M. Kelly, and R. Curtiss III. 1995. Safety and efficacy in pigs of orally administered, *Δcya Δcrp* attenuated *Salmonella choleraesuis* isolates, abstr. E-83, p. 295. *In* Abstracts of the 95th General Meeting of the American Society for Microbiology 1995. American Society for Microbiology, Washington, D.C.
- Yokota, T., and J. S. Gots. 1970. Requirement of adenosine 3',5'-cyclic phosphate for flagella formation in *Escherichia coli* and *Salmonella typhimurium*. J. Bacteriol. 103:513–516.

Editor: S. H. E. Kaufmann