# Parallel Formation and Synergism of Hydrolytic Enzymes and Peptaibol Antibiotics, Molecular Mechanisms Involved in the Antagonistic Action of Trichoderma harzianum against Phytopathogenic Fungi

## MARION SCHIRMBÖCK,<sup>1</sup> MATTEO LORITO,<sup>2</sup> YONG-LI WANG,<sup>1</sup> CHRISTOPHER K. HAYES,<sup>3</sup> INCI ARISAN-ATAC,<sup>4</sup> FELICE SCALA,<sup>2</sup> GARY E. HARMAN,<sup>3</sup> AND CHRISTIAN P. KUBICEK<sup>1</sup>\*

Abteilung für Mikrobielle Biochemie, Institut für Biochemische Technologie und Mikrobiologie, TU Wien, A-1060 Vienna, Austria<sup>1</sup>; Istituto di Patologia Vegetale, Universita degli Studi di Napoli, 80055 Naples, Italy<sup>2</sup>; Department of Horticultural Science and Entomology, Comell University, and New York State Agricultural Experiment Station, Geneva, New York<sup>3</sup>; and Institute of Biochemistry, Yildiz University, Sisli-Istanbul, Turkey<sup>4</sup>

Received 31 May 1994/Accepted <sup>11</sup> October 1994

Chitinase,  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase, and protease activities were formed when Trichoderma harzianum mycelia, grown on glucose as the sole carbon source, were transferred to fresh medium containing cell walls of Botrytis cinerea. Chitobiohydrolase, endochitinase, and  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase activities were immunologically detected in culture supernatants by Western blotting (immunoblotting), and the first two were quantified by enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay. Under the same conditions, exogenously added  $[U^{-14}C]$ valine was incorporated in acetone-soluble compounds with an apparent  $M_r$  of  $\lt$  2,000. These compounds comigrated with the peptaibols trichorzianines  $A_1$  and  $B_1$  in thin-layer chromatography and released [U-<sup>14</sup>C]valine after incubation in 6 N HCI. Incorporation of radioactive valine into this material was stimulated by the exogenous supply of a-aminoisobutyric acid, a rare amino acid which is a major constituent of peptaibols. The obtained culture supernatants inhibited spore germination as well as hyphal elongation of B. cinerea. Culture supernatants from mycelia placed in fresh medium without cell walls of B. cinerea did not show hydrolase activities, incorporation of  $[U^{-14}C]$ valine into peptaibol-like compounds, and inhibition of fungal growth. Purified trichorzianines  $A_1$ and  $B_1$  as well as purified chitobiohydrolase, endochitinase, or  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase inhibited spore germination and hyphal elongation, but at concentrations higher than those observed in the culture supernatants. However, when the enzymes and the peptaibols were tested together, an antifungal synergistic interaction was observed and the 50% effective dose values obtained were in the range of those determined in the culture supernatants. Therefore, the parallel formation and synergism of hydrolytic enzymes and antibiotics may have an important role in the antagonistic action of T. harzianum against fungal phytopathogens.

Trichoderma spp. have received major attention as agents for the biological control of phytopathogenic fungi and are excellent candidates for successful exploitation (5, 36). However, the molecular basis of biocontrol is not clearly understood. Proposed mechanisms of antagonism resulting in biocontrol are antibiosis (6, 8, 9, 14, 35), mycoparasitism (1, 4, 5, 40), and competition (41). Evidence for a fungicidal action of selected antibiotics or hydrolytic enzymes of Trichoderma spp. under in vitro conditions is available (13, 25, 28, 29). In most cases the concentrations required are far beyond those occurring in vivo, although combinations of enzymes with different modes of action substantially improved the inhibitory effect (14). Interestingly, the in vitro 50% effective dose for chitinases was considerably reduced by the simultaneous addition of selected fungicides (30). Similarly, a synergism between Trichoderma enzymes and antibiotics could occur in vivo.

In the present study, we investigated this possibility, using the peptaibols (trichorzianines) (Fig. 1) of Trichoderma harzianum as model antibiotics. Trichorzianines and a number of closely related peptaibols are produced by several Trichoderma

spp. (3, 12, 15). These antibiotics form voltage-gated ion channels in black lipid membranes (34) and modify the membrane permeability of liposomes in the absence of applied voltage (13, 26). They induce leakage of compounds from Rhizoctonia solani and lysis of Phytophthora cactorum (13, 25). However, there is no evidence that peptaibols are produced by T. harzianum during its antagonistic action or under conditions inducing formation of cell wall lytic enzymes.

In this paper we show that (i) the synthesis of both hydrolytic enzymes and peptaibols is triggered by cell walls of Botrytis cinerea and (ii) peptaibols act synergistically with chitinases and a  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase in the inhibition of fungal spore germination and hyphal elongation.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

Fungal strains and culture conditions. T. harzianum Rifai (ATCC 36042), which is <sup>a</sup> potent mycoparasite, was used

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author. Mailing address: Abteilung für Mikrobielle Biochemie, Institut fuir Biochemische Technologie und Mikrobiologie, TU Wien, Getreidemarkt 9/1725, A-1060 Wien, Austria. Phone: (43-1) 58801 4707. Fax: (43-1) 587 48 35. Electronic mail address: E1725@ eichow.tu wien.ac.at.

 $TA<sub>1</sub>$ : Ac Aib Ala Ala Aib Aib Gin Aib Aib Aib Ser Leu Aib Pro Val Aib lle Gin Gin Trpol

TB1: Ac Aib Ala Ala Aib Aib Gln Aib Aib Aib Ser Leu Aib Pro Val Aib lie Gin Glu Trpol

FIG. 1. Amino acid structure of peptaibol antibiotics trichorzianines  $A_1$  (TA<sub>1</sub>) and  $B_1$  (TB<sub>1</sub>). Ac, N-acetyl; Trpol, -CH<sub>2</sub>OH; Boldface indicates those amino acids which differ in  $TA_1$  and  $TB_1$ .



Cultivation Time [hrs]



throughout the present study. The organism was maintained on malt agar slants and subcultured bimonthly.

For enzyme and peptaibol production, T. harzianum was grown for 20 h on a rotary shaker (250 rpm, 28°C) in 1-liter flasks containing Mandels-Andreotti medium (32), with glycerol (0.5% [vol/vol]) as the carbon source. The fungal biomass was removed by filtration through a sintered (Gi porosity) funnel without suction (to avoid hyphal breakage) but with continuous aeration (by stirring with a sterile spatula). The biomass was transferred to fresh Mandels-Andreotti medium (32), lacking carbon and nitrogen sources, and supplemented with 0.5 g of B. cinerea cell walls per liter, 2 g of  $\text{NaNO}_3$  per liter, and 0.14 g of glutamine per liter, to give a mycelial density of  $1 \pm 0.3$  g (wet weight)/liter. Incubation was continued for 36 h, and 10-ml samples were taken at appropriate times. The samples were centrifuged (15 min,  $4^{\circ}$ C,  $12,000 \times g$ ) and stored at  $-20^{\circ}$ C until use for analysis.

To monitor peptaibol formation, the contents from a 1-liter flask of replacement culture (time zero) were distributed in 10-ml aliquots into 100-ml Erlenmeyer flasks and further o in unquoto mio 100 nn Enemiejer nume una future measured on a shanning water sum (100 rpm, 20 c). There is (specific radioactivity, 9.25 GBq/mmol; Amersham, United Kingdom), and incubation was continued for 24 h. Duplicate flasks were harvested at 0, 20, 28, and 36 h (calculated from the time of the pulse labelling), and the supernatant was analyzed for peptaibol formation.



Cultivation Time [hrs]

FIG. 2. Formation of cell wall hydrolytic enzymes by  $T$ . harzianum on transfer to replacement medium with (a) or without (b) B. cinerea cell walls. Circles, protease activity; triangles,  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase activity; squares, chitinase activity. Values shown are from a single experiment only, while similar differences between the results shown in panels a and b were obtained in three separate experiments. (c) SDS-PAGE and immunostaining of extracellular hydrolases. CBS, chitobiosidase; ECH, endochitinase; BGA,  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase. Culture filtrates from mycelia incubated for 37 h were used for these experiments.

For enzyme production, T. harzianum was grown for 4 days on a rotary shaker in Richard's modified medium, which contained 10 g of  $KNO_3$ , 5 g of  $KH_2PO_4$ , 2.5 g of  $MgSO_4 \cdot 7H_2O$ , 2 mg of FeCl<sub>3</sub>, 1% (wt/vol) crab shell chitin (Sigma), 1% (wt/vol) polyvinylpyrrolidone (Polyclar AT; GAF Corp., Wayne, N.J.), 150 ml of V8 juice, and 1 liter of  $H<sub>2</sub>O$  at pH 6.0 (19). Thereafter, the biomass was removed by filtration and used for enzyme purification.

To isolate *B. cinerea* cell walls, the fungus was grown for 72 h in 1-liter flasks containing 200 ml of medium (20 g of glucose per liter, 10 g of ammonium sulfate per liter, 10 g of  $KH_2PO_4$ per liter, 1 g of NaCl per liter,  $0.5$  g of MgSO<sub>4</sub>  $\cdot$  7H<sub>2</sub>O per liter [pH 6.5]). The mycelial mass was harvested by filtration, dried between filter paper, and stored at  $-20^{\circ}$ C until use for cell wall preparations.

For bioassays, B. cinerea 26, isolated from grapes (provided by R. Pearson, Cornell University), and Fusarium oxysporum f. sp. phaseoli isolated from beans (Naples, Italy) were used. These fungi were grown on potato dextrose agar (Difco Laboratories, Detroit, Mich.). Spores were suspended in <sup>5</sup> mM Tris-HCl buffer (pH 6.5) and filtered through sterile filter paper (if necessary to remove mycelial fragments), and their  $\frac{1}{2}$  concentration was adjusted to  $10^5$  to  $10^6$  propagules per ml.

Bethand was adjusted to 10 to 10 propagates per military cell walls of B. cinerea, the mycelia were homogenized in 10 volumes of  $0.1\%$ (wt/vol) sodium dodecyl sulfate (SDS) in a Potter Elvehjem Pistill homogenizer. Purification of cell walls was carried out as reported previously (32a). The purified cell walls were ground to a fine powder under liquid nitrogen and stored at  $-20^{\circ}$ C until use.

Enzyme assay and production. Endochitinase, the 40-kDa chitin-1,4- $\beta$ -chitobiosidase (chitobiosidase), and glucan- $\beta$ -1,3glucosidase  $(\beta-1,3$ -glucanase) were purified to electrophoretic homogeneity as previously described (19, 29). Enzyme solutions were kept at 4°C and were utilized for bioassays within 2



FIG. 3. Inhibition of B. cinerea spore germination caused by crude culture filtrate of T. harzianum in the absence of any addition (A) or harvested after 37 h of incubation in replacement medium in the presence (B) or absence (D) of B. cinerea cell walls or after ultrafiltration through an Amicon YM <sup>10</sup> membrane (cutoff, <sup>10</sup> kDa) (C). Subscripts <sup>1</sup> and 2 refer to 25 and 50% (vol/vol), respectively, of the crude culture filtrate in the spore germination assays.

weeks. Otherwise they were concentrated until dry in a Speed-Vac apparatus (Savant Instruments, Fermingdale, N.Y.) and stored at  $-20^{\circ}$ C until use.

Endochitinase activity was measured by determining the release of  $N$ -acetyl- $\beta$ -D-glucosamine under the conditions described by Elad et al.  $(11)$ , by the Elson-Morgan method  $(37)$ . P-1,3-Glucanase was determined by measuring the release of reducing groups from a 0.1% (wt/vol) solution of laminarin in <sup>50</sup> mM phosphate buffer (pH 6.7) (Sigma) (33). Protease activity was measured by the azocasein hydrolysis method (17). The endochitinase and  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase activities are expressed in units (micromoles of product formed per minute) under the conditions used. For protease, <sup>1</sup> U is defined as the increase in  $A_{365}$  per minute. Protein contents were determined according to the method of Bradford (2).

Electrophoretic and immunological methods. Samples from the culture filtrate of T. harzianum were mixed with a double volume of ethanol and left at  $-20^{\circ}$ C for 3 h. The precipitated protein was harvested by centrifugation in an Eppendorf centrifuge (10 min) and resuspended in SDS-sample buffer (24) to give a final protein concentration of about  $\overline{0.1}$  mg/ml. For electrophoresis, the samples were heated to 100°C for 5 min, and occurring precipitates were removed by centrifugation. SDS-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (PAGE) was carried out according to the method of Laemmli (24), and the separated proteins were blotted onto nitrocellulose (4). Enzyme bands were visualized by immunostaining (18), with polyclonal antibodies raised in rabbits against endochitinase, chitobiosidase, and glucan- $\beta$ -1,3-glucosidase (19, 29)

Quantification of chitobiosidase and endochitinase by ELISA. Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assays (ELISA) were carried out as described previously (22a), with polyclonal antibodies raised in rabbits in a final dilution of 1:1,000 and<br>anti-rabbit immunoglobulin G coupled to alkaline phosphatase anti-rabbit immunoglobulin G coupled to alkaline phosphatase as a second antibody. Purified enzymes (19, 29) were used to calibrate the assay.

Determination of peptaibol formation. Samples (10 ml) from the culture filtrate were lyophilized and extracted three times each with <sup>1</sup> ml of acetone. To analyze the peptaibols by gel chromatography, the acetone extract was concentrated to 0.5 ml by evaporation and passed through a column (10 by <sup>1</sup> cm) of Biogel P-2. Fractions (0.5 ml) were collected and analyzed in the following way. Individual fractions were lyophilized, taken up in 20  $\mu$ l of acetone, and subjected to thin-layer chromatography on Merck 60  $F_{254}$ , with *n*-butanol-acetic acid-H<sub>2</sub>O (6/2/2 [vol/vol/vol]) as the mobile phase. Trichorzianines  $A_1$  and  $B_1$  were applied as standards on separate tracks. After their positions were visualized by spraying with anisaldehyde reagent (anisaldehyde-H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>-acetic acid [1/0.5/20] [vol/vol/vol]), the corresponding spots were scraped out of the tracks of the individual samples. After they were mixed with Ready Value LSC Cocktail (Beckman Scientific Instruments, Fullerton, Calif.), their radioactivity was counted in an LSC (Pharmacia-LKB, Uppsala, Sweden).

Assay of antifungal activity. Fractions from gel chromatography were lyophilized and redissolved in  $50$   $\mu$ l of distilled water and analyzed for antifungal activity. Analyses of antifungal activities of purified trichorzianines were done with trichorzianines  $A_1$  and  $B_1$ , which were kindly supplied by B. Bodo (Paris, France). Assays were performed under sterile conditions. Equal volumes of spore suspension,  $3 \times$  potato dextrose broth, and the test solution or suspension (in <sup>5</sup> mM Tris-HCl buffer [pH 6.5]) were mixed. Control samples contained <sup>5</sup> mM Tris-HCl buffer (pH 6.5) instead of the test solution. The test was carried out by a modification of the method described by Lorito et al. (30): test suspensions with 1,000 to 3,000 spores per well were transferred to sterile flat-bottom ELISA plates and incubated at 25°C. After 22 to 30 h, the plates were placed under an inverted microscope. The percentage of conidia germinating was determined as the percentage of the first 100 spores randomly found in the well. In addition, the lengths of 20 germ tubes were measured and averaged. All experiments were performed twice, with three replicates for each treatment. The inhibition values obtained for the two experiments were combined and averaged, and standard deviations were calculated from these six data values. To determine the 50% effective dose, the dose-response curves were subjected to regression analysis by using a binomial regression of the third order, with  $R^2$  ranging between 0.95 and 0.99. According to Richer (39), the following formula was used to determine an antifungal synergistic effect between lytic enzymes and peptaibols: if synergism exists,  $E_0(xA + yB) > E_0(x + y)A$  and  $E_0(xA)$ bots. It syncretism exists,  $E_0(X + yB) > E_0(X + y)A$  and  $E_0(X + yB) > E_0(X + y)B$ , where E, is the percentage of inhibition  $(A \times B)$   $\geq E_0(X + y)$ , where  $E_0$  is the percentage of infinition,<br>A and B are enzymes and pentaibols, respectively, and x and y A and B are enzymes and peptaibols, respectively, and  $x$  and  $y$  are the concentrations of each component in the mixture. The  $E<sub>o</sub>$  values were calculated by regression analysis of the doseresponse curves.

#### RESULTS

Formation of hydrolytic enzymes by T. harzianum incubation with B. cinerea cell walls. In order to demonstrate the biochemical changes occurring on contact of T. harzianum with  $\frac{1}{2}$  focus of a plant pathogen, we have used a myselium replacement system. Briefly, this consists of pregnancies T. replacement system. Briefly, this consists of pregrowing  $T$ .<br>*harzianum* in a medium allowing rapid growth but not leading to expression of antagonistic activity and then transferring the we caprossion or amagomstic activity and their transicring the genia to from media containing cen wans of the phytopathogenic host. This technique reduces incubation times and avoids interferences caused by different growth rates. A similar approcedure to state the study different successfully used to study enzyme productions of  $\mu$ in Trichoderma reesei (42) or penicillin formation by P. chrysoin Trichoderma reesei (42) or penicillin formation by  $P$ . chrysogenum (20). When pregrown mycelia were transferred to new medium containing  $B$ . *cinerea* cell walls as the only carbon solution containing *D.* Chierca Contrasses as the only carbon pource, mey started to secrete emitiases,  $p-1,3-1$  glucaliases, and



FIG. 4. (a and b) Gel chromatography on Biogel P-2 of acetone extract from extracellular culture supernatant of T. harzianum incubated for 37 h in replacement medium in the presence of B. cinerea cell walls. The elution profile for  $A_{280}$  is indicated by the dashed line. (a) Activity of individual fractions inhibiting B. cinerea spore germination; (b) radioactivity from [U-<sup>14</sup>C]valine in individual fractions. The elution profile of trichorzianines  $A_1$  and  $B_1$ , as determined in a separate experiment, is indicated by a horizontal bar. (c) Separation of the second peak from gel permeation chromatography (see panel b) by thin-layer chromatography. The arrow indicates the position of trichorzianines  $A_1$  and  $B_1$ , as exploration in a separate experiment. (d) Incorporation of radioactivity from  $[U^{-1}C]$  value into putative peptations din a separate experiment. (d) Incorporation of Theorem in realizative periodic direction of  $T$ . *harzianum* in replacement medium in the presence (closed symbols) or absence (open symbols) of  $\alpha$ -aminoisobutyrate (10 mM).  $\bullet$  and  $\circ$ , replacement to glucose-containing medium;  $\blacksquare$ , with cycloheximide (50  $\mu$ g/ from a single experiment, but similar differences between the four curves were obtained in four separate experiments.

increased to about 30 to 35 h of incubation and then decreased slowly (data not shown). With the exception of protease, no other enzyme activities were found when mycelia were incubated in the same medium containing glucose instead of cell walls (Fig. 2b). Since these enzyme activities are the result of a number of isoenzymes, we used antibodies against endochitinase, chitobiosidase, and  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase to demonstrate the presence of specific, well-characterized (19, 29) components. All three enzymes were present in the supernatants from the cell wall-containing cultures but absent from the culture medium containing glucose (Fig. 2c). By using the same antibodies in an ELISA, the concentrations of chitobiosidase and endochitinase were determined as 5.9 and 2.7 mg/liter in  $f(x, t) = \int_0^t \cos t \, dt$  were determined as  $J, J$  and  $L, J$  inguiter in to demonstrate a demonstrate a demonstrate a demonstrate  $\frac{d}{dx}$ to demonstrate a de novo protein synthesis, experiments were also carried out with cycloheximide, an inhibitor of translation (43). In its presence, no enzyme activities were found, and no

enzymes were detected with the aid of immunological techniques (data not shown).

When the extracellular supernatant from a cell wall-induced culture (harvested after  $36$  h of incubation) was added to spores of *B. cinerea*, it inhibited their germination (Fig. 3). However, the fungistatic activity was partially maintained when extracellular enzymes were removed by ultrafiltration (Amicon<br>XM 10; cutoff size, 10 kDa; see Fig. 5), suggesting that other YM 10; cutoff size, 10 kDa; see Fig. 5), suggesting that other antifungal compounds were present in the culture filtrate. No inhibitory activity was present in culture filtrates obtained in the presence of glucose or in filtrates obtained after incubating the cell wall-containing medium without T. harzianum for 37 h.

Peptaibol formation in T. harzianum on incubation with B. cinerea cell walls. The results described above suggest that one meren cen wans. The results described above suggest that one In the dimension with B. cinema cell walls. The culture supernatent incubation with  $B$ , *cinerea* cell walls. The culture supernatant was lyophilized and subjected to gel chromatography, and the



FIG. 5. Effect of addition of endochitinase ( $\blacktriangle$ , 25  $\mu$ g/ml), chitobiosidase ( $\blacktriangle$ , 50  $\mu$ g/ml), and  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase ( $\blacktriangle$ , 25  $\mu$ g/ml) on inhibition of B. TEC. 3. Exect of addition of endominate ( $\triangle$ ,  $\triangle$   $\nu$   $p$ gin), emicolosidate ( $\triangle$ ,  $\triangle$   $\nu$   $p$ gin), and  $p$ -1,  $\nu$ gindards ( $\triangle$ ,  $\triangle$   $\nu$   $p$ gin) on inition of  $D$ .<br>therea spore germination (A and C) and hyphal e

individual fractions were assayed for their ability to inhibit B. cinerea sport germination. This inhibition activity correspondence to the corre- $\mu$  sport germination. This immorting activity corresponded to an  $\overline{M}_r$ , of about 2,000  $\pm$  500 (Fig. 4a), suggesting that peptide antibiotics or peptaibols (15) may be the components responsible for this fungicidal effect. The absence of antifungal activity in the high-molecular-weight (i.e., enzyme) fraction is not in contradiction to the findings shown in Fig. 3, since chitinases and  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanases were inactivated by the actore treatment. To determine if the  $2 \text{ hD}$  material had a pertone treatment. To determine it the  $25L/4$  material had a acid present in the T. harzianum peptaibol trichorzianine, to the medium (12). After incubation for 8 h, the obtained supernatant was lyophilized and subjected to gel chromatography. The radioactive label appeared in three peaks with aphy. The radioactive facer appeared in three peaks with  $\mu$  protein,  $\mu_{\text{p}}$  (1 ig. 40), which conceivanty represent extractilular protein, peptaibols, and free valine. This putative peptai-<br>bol peak eluted from Biogel P-2 at the same position as the peak club from Dioger  $1 - 2$  at the same position as position of trichoration  $A_1$  and  $B_1$  (Fig. 40) and imigrates to the position of trichorzianines  $\overline{A}_1$  and  $B_1$  in thin-layer chromatography (Fig. 4c). Upon hydrolysis in 6 N HCl, the  $[14$ Clvaline aphy  $(1 \text{ g. } \pm 0)$ . Opon hydrolysis in 0 is 11Cl, the  $\lfloor$  -C  $\rfloor$  valine shown appeared in the vanite peak on Dioger  $1-2$  only (data not shown). All these data clearly indicate that the 2-kDa chromatography peak contains peptaibols. Furthermore, the incorporation of radioactivity into this peak was stimulated by the

addition of calculation of cases at  $\lambda$  and  $\lambda$  to the medium  $\lambda$  $\frac{1}{2}$  during of  $\alpha$ -rannolase of  $\frac{1}{2}$  and  $\frac{1}{2}$  (AID). The incumum (Fig. 4d). As with the induction of hydrolases, no formation was observed in the presence of glucose, and cycloheximide also prevented the formation (Fig. 4d).

With trichorzianine  $A_1$  as a standard, the  $A_{280}$  peak from gel which allowed the calculation that the original culture<br>diffration allowed the calculation that the original culture  $\frac{1}{2}$  are not communically  $\frac{1}{2}$  ( $\frac{1}{2}$  by might peptaibols per inci.

growth. The parallel formation of hydrolytic enterpretential control of hydrolytic enterpretential control and growth. The parallel formation of hydrolytic enzyme and antibiotics in  $\overline{T}$ . *harzianum* in the presence of cell walls of a potential host suggests that these two classes of compounds may cooperate in mycoparasitism. Therefore, the effect of diary cooperate in inversions of the tricitore, the effect of increa concentrations of the holznannes  $A_1$  and  $B_1$  on spore germination and hyphal elongation of  $B$ . cinerea and  $F$ . oxysporum was investigated in the presence of purified endochitiportant was investigated in the presence of purinted endocumase, chiloolosidase, and  $5-1,3-$ glucanase from  $\mu$ . *harrianum*. As a prerequisite, the  $50\%$  effective doses for trichorzianines  $A_1$  and  $B_1$  with respect to spore germination and germ tube elongation of  $B$ . cinerea and  $F$ . oxysporum were determined. The values obtained were in the range of 70 to 100  $\mu$ g/ml, with spore germination being less sensitive than germ tube elongation (Fig. 5). The same range of peptaibol concentration has previously been reported to inhibit growth of other fungi (13, 25). When one of the three enzymes was added, the concentration of trichorzianines needed for complete inhibition was strongly reduced. About 200  $\mu$ g of trichorzianine A<sub>1</sub> per ml was needed to completely inhibit conidial germination in the absence of enzymes, whereas the presence of  $25 \mu g$  of endochitinase per ml reduced this concentration to 30  $\mu$ g/ml. The same concentration of endochitinase resulted in only 35% inhibition (28). When the data were evaluated by the method of Richer (39), evidence of a synergistic action was obtained.

Essentially consistent data were obtained when F. oxysporum was used as a test organism.

In order to investigate, whether the concentrations of enzymes and peptaibols formed under the present experimental conditions would be sufficient to explain the observed inhibitory effect, a further experiment was carried out in which endochitinase, chitobiosidase, and trichorzianine  $A_1$  were added at final concentrations of 6, 3, and 25 mg/ml, respectively, to the spore germination assay. Under these conditions, spore germination was inhibited by  $41\%$  ( $\pm 17\%$ ). Although this value is somewhat lower than the inhibition obtained by the crude culture filtrate (57%) (see Fig. 3), we conclude that synergism of hydrolytic enzymes and peptaibols contribute significantly to the antagonism of T. harzianum against phytopathogens.

### DISCUSSION

There have been several attempts to explain the antagonistic action of T. harzianum against phytopathogenic fungi either by the secretion of cell wall hydrolytic enzymes or by the production of antibiotics. Our results indicate that in fact both types of compounds are involved in this process and that antibiotics (at least some) and hydrolytic enzymes cooperate synergistically in antagonism. Di Pietro et al. (10) reported on a similar type of synergism between an endochitinase and a diketopiperazine antibiotic (gliotoxin) from the biocontrol fungus Gliocladium (Trichoderma) virens, closely related to T. harzianum. The investigators interpreted the synergism as a result of a weakening of the cell wall of B. cinerea, which improved the rate of diffusion of the antibiotic towards the cell surface. It is intriguing that both gliotoxin and the peptaibols affect the cytoplasmic membrane (13, 22), hence pointing to the cell membrane as an important target, as also supported by other studies (27). Similarly, many plant pathogenic fungi attack plant cells via <sup>a</sup> modification of their cell membrane (7).

Although the antibiotic compounds, whose formation was triggered by B. cinerea cell walls, have not been fully identified in the course of this study, we assume that they belong to the peptaibol family for the following reasons: (i) they exhibit similar  $M_r$ s, (ii) they migrate to the same position in thin-layer chromatography, (iii) exogenously added [U-<sup>14</sup>C]valine becomes incorporated into them and is released under conditions of hydrolysis of peptide bonds, and (iv) their formation is stimulated by the exogenous addition of AIB. AIB is <sup>a</sup> nonprotein amino acid, <sup>a</sup> major component of all peptaibols, and its exogenous addition has been shown to increase the formation of these antibiotics (3, 38). However, we have not proven that these compounds are identical to trichorzianine  $A_1$ or  $B_1$ , but it is possible that the formation of different peptaibols is strain specific.

The question as to which antibiotics are involved in antagonism has not been conclusively answered until now. The present results show that the concentrations of trichorzianines found can account for a major portion of the effect. However, it is well possible that other antibiotics may also be formed under these conditions and thereby further reduce the concentration needed by individual components. The fact that an isolate of T. harzianum can produce various different antibiotics (3, 9, 38) could explain why strains defective in the production of only one of them, e.g., 6-n-pentyl pyrone, are not impaired in biocontrol (16). It would be intriguing to know whether there is also synergism between different secondary metabolites produced by Trichoderma spp. This will explain why the effective dose of inhibitory compounds is particularly low in vivo (5, 15). This topic should be considered for future studies as well as for strain improvement and strain application.

The fact that the presence of cell walls of B. cinerea triggers the production of both cell wall hydrolytic enzymes and peptaibols suggests that the cascade of antagonistic events may be regulated by <sup>a</sup> common mechanism. We do not know whether this is caused by the release of cell wall oligosaccharides or carbon catabolite derepression, by a physical elicitation, or by a combination of all these factors. The first hypothesis is supported by the evidence that in T. reesei the degradation of cellulose and xylan is triggered by degradation products (23, 31). However, the initial coiling of T. harzianum around its victim is triggered solely by recognition of a lectin on the cell surface of the pathogen (21). The experimental approach used in this study may be an additional tool to investigate this process.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This study was supported by the Austrian Federal Ministery of Agriculture and Forestry (C.P.K.), by the Istituendo Centro CNR di Studio delle Tecniche di Lotta Biologica, 80055 Portici (Napoli), Italy (M.L.), and in part by BARD grants US-1723-89 and CRG <sup>931173</sup> from the NATO Collaborative Research Grants Programme, which are gratefully acknowledged, to G.E.H.

We are also very grateful to B. Bodo (Paris) for the gift of trichorzianines  $A_1$  and  $B_1$ .

#### REFERENCES

- 1. Ayers, W. A., and P. B. Adams. 1981. Mycoparasitism and its application to biological control of plant diseases, p. 91-103. In G. C. Papavizas (ed.), Biological control in crop production. Allanheld, Osmun, Totowa, N.J.
- 2. Bradford, M. M. 1976. A rapid and sensitive method for the quantitation of microgram quantities of protein utilizing the principle of protein-dye binding. Anal. Biochem. 72:248-254.
- 3. Brewer, D., F. G. Mason, and A. Taylor. 1987. The production of alamethicins by Trichoderma sp. Can. J. Microbiol. 33:619-625.
- Burnette, W. N. 1981. Western blotting: electrophoretic transfer of proteins from polyacrylamide gels to unmodified nitrocellulose and radiographic detection with antibody and radioiodinated protein A. Anal. Biochem. 112:195-203.
- 5. Chet, I. 1987. Trichoderma-application, mode of action, and potential as a biocontrol agent of soilborne plant pathogenic fungi, p. 147-160. In I. Chet (ed.), Innovative approaches to plant disease control. John Wiley & Sons, New York.
- 6. Claydon, N., M. Allan, J. R. Hanson, and A. G. Avent. 1987. Antifungal alkyl pyrones of Trichoderma harzianum. Trans. Br. Mycol. Soc. 88:503-513.
- 7. Daly, J. M., and B. J. Deverall. 1983. Toxins in plant pathogenesis. Academic Press, New York.
- Dennis, C., and J. Webster. 1971. Antagonistic properties of species groups of Trichoderma. I. Production of non-volatile antibiotics. Trans. Br. Mycol. Soc. 57:25-39.
- 9. Dennis, C., and J. Webster. 1971. Antagonistic properties of species groups of Trichoderma. II. Production of volatile antibiotics. Trans. Br. Mycol. Soc. 57:41-48.
- 10. Di Pietro, A., M. Lorito, C. K. Hayes, R. M. Broadway, and G. E. Harman. 1993. Endochitinase from Gliocladium virens: isolation, characterization, and synergistic antifungal activity in combination with gliotoxin. Phytopathology 83:308-313.
- 11. Elad, Y., I. Chet, and Y. Henis. 1982. Degradation of plant

pathogenic fungi by Trichoderma harzianum. Can. J. Microbiol. 28:  $719 - 725$ 

- 12. El Hajji, M., S. Rebuffat, D. Lecommandeur, and B. Bodo. 1987. Isolation and determination trichorzianines A antifungal peptides from Trichoderma harzianum. Int. J. Peptide Protein Res. 29:207- 215.
- 13. El Hajji, M., S. Rebuffat, T. Le Doan, G. Klein, M. Satre, and B. Bodo. 1989. Interaction of trichorzianines A and B with model membranes and with amoeba Dictyostelium. Biochim. Biophys. Acta 978:97-104.
- 14. Ghisalberti, E. L., M. J. Narbey, M. M. Dewan, and K. Siva sinthamparam. 1990. Variability among strains of Trichoderma harzianum in their ability to reduce take-all and to produce pyrones. Plant Soil 121:287-291.
- 15. Ghisalberti, E. L., and K. Sivasinthamparam. 1991. Antifungal antibiotics produced by Trichoderma spp. Soil Biol. Biochem. 23: 1011-1020.
- 16. Graeme-Cook, K. A., and J. L. Faull. 1991. Effect of ultravioletinduced mutants of Trichoderma harzianum with altered production on selected pathogens in vivo. Can. J. Microbiol. 37:659-664.
- 17. Haab, D., K. Hagspiel, K. Szakmary, and C. P. Kubicek. 1990. Formation of the extracellular proteases from Trichoderma reesei QM <sup>9414</sup> involved in cellulase degradation. J. Biotechnol. 16:187- 198.
- 18. Hagspiel, K., D. Haab, and C. P. Kubicek. 1989. Protease activity and proteolytic modification of cellulases from a Trichoderma reesei QM <sup>9414</sup> selectant. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 32:61-67.
- 19. Harman, G. E., C. K. Hayes, M. Lorito, R. M. Broadway, A. Di Pietro, C. Peterbauer, and A. Tronsmo. 1993. Chitinolytic enzymes of Trichoderma harzianum: purification of chitobiosidase and endochitinase. Phytopathology 83:313-318.
- 20. Hönlinger, C., and C. P. Kubicek. 1989. Regulation of  $\delta$ -(L- $\alpha$ aminoadipyl)-L-cysteinyl-D-valine and isopenicillin N biosynthesis in Penicillium chrysogenum by the  $\alpha$ -aminoadipate pool size. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 65:71-76.
- 21. Inbar, J., and I. Chet. 1992. Biomimics of fungal cell-cell recognition by use of lectin-coated nylon fibers. J. Bacteriol. 174:1055- 1059.
- 22. Jones, R. W., and J. G. Hancock. 1988. Mechanism of gliotoxin action and factors mediating gliotoxin sensitivity. J. Gen. Microbiol. 134:2067-2075.
- 22a.Kolbe, J., and C. P. Kubicek. 1990. Qualification and quantification of the main components of the Trichoderma reesei cellulase complex by an enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA). Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 34:26-30.
- 23. Kubicek, C. P. 1993. From cellulose to cellulase inducers: facts and fiction, p. 181-188. In P. Suominen and T. Reinikainen (ed.), Trichoderma reesei cellulases and other hydrolases: enzyme structures, biochemistry, genetics and applications. Foundation of Biotechnical and Industrial Fermentation Research, Helsinki, Finland. 24. Laemmli, U. K. 1970. Cleavage of structural proteins during the
- assembly of the head of bacteriophage T4. Nature (London) 227: 680-685.
- 25. Lederer, W., H.-K. Lorenz, and E. Seemüller. 1992. Studies on antagonistic effects of Trichoderma isolates against Phytophthora cactorum. J. Phytopathol. 136:154-164.
- 26. Le Doan, T., M. El-Hajji, S. Rebuffat, M. R. Rajeswari, and B. Bodo. 1986. Fluorescein studies of the interaction of trichorzianine

A III<sub>c</sub> with model membranes. Biochim. Biophys. Acta 858:1-5.

- 27. Lewis, J. A., and G. C. Papavizas. 1987. Permeability changes in hyphae of Rhizoctonia solani induced by germling preparations of Trichoderma and Gliocladium. Phytopathology 77:699-703.
- 28. Lorito, M., G. E. Harman, C. K. Hayes, R. M. Broadway, A. Tronsmo, S. L. Woo, and A. Di Pietro. 1993. Chitinolytic enzymes produced by Trichoderma harzianum: antifungal activity of purified endochitinase and chitobiosidase. Phytopathology 83:302- 307.
- 29. Lorito, M., C. K. Hayes, A. Di Pietro, S. L. Woo, and G. E. Harman. 1994. Purification, characterization, and synergistic activity of a glucan- $\beta$ -1,3-glucosidase and a N-acetyl- $\beta$ -glucosaminidase from Trichoderma harzianum. Phytopathology 84:398-405.
- 30. Lorito, M., C. K. Peterbauer, C. K Hayes, and G. E. Harman. 1994. Synergistic interaction between fungal cell-wall degrading enzymes and different antifungal compounds on spore germination. Microbiology 140:623-629.
- 31. Mach, R. L., A. Butterweck, M. Schindler, R. Messner, P. Herzog, and C. P. Kubicek. 1993. Molecular regulation of formation of xylanase (XYN) <sup>I</sup> and II by Trichoderma reesei, p. 211-216. In P. Suominen and T. Reinikainen (ed.), Trichoderma reesei cellulases and other hydrolases: enzyme structures, biochemistry, genetics and applications. Foundation of Biotechnical and Industrial Fermentation Research, Helsinki, Finland.
- Mandels, M., and R. E. Andreotti. 1978. The cellulose to cellulase fermentation. Proc. Biochem. 13:6-13.
- 32a.Messner, R., and C. P. Kubicek. 1990. Synthesis of cell wall glucan, chitin, and protein by regenerating protoplasts and mycelia of Trichoderma reesei. Can. J. Microbiol. 36:211-217.
- 33. Miller, G. L. 1959. Use of dinitrosalicylic acid reagent for determination of reducing sugar. Anal. Chem. 31:426-428.
- 34. Molle, G., H. Duclohier, and G. Spach. 1987. Voltage dependent and multistate ionic channels induced by trichorzianines, antifungal peptides related to alamethicin. FEBS Lett. 224:208-212.
- 35. Okuda, T., A. Fujiwara, and M. Fujiwara. 1982. Correlation between species of Trichoderma and production patterns of isonitril antibiotics. Agric. Biol. Chem. 46:1811-1822.
- Papavizas, G. C., and R. D. Lumsden. 1980. Biological control of soilborne fungal propagules. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 18:389-413.
- 37. Reissig, J. L., J. L. Strominger, and L. F. Leloir. 1955. A modified colorimetric method for the determination of N-acetylamino sugars. J. Biol. Chem. 217:959-966.
- 38. Reusser, F. 1967. Biosynthesis of antibiotic U-22,324, a cyclic polypeptide. J. Biol. Chem. 242:243-247.
- 39. Richer, D. L. 1987. Synergism: a patent view. Pestic. Sci. 19:309- 315.
- 40. Singh, J., and J. L. Faull. 1990. Hyperparasitism and biological control, p. 167-179. In K. G. Mukerji and K. L. Garg (ed.), Biocontrol of plant pathogens. CRC Press, Boca Raton, Fla.
- 41. Sivan, A., and I. Chet. 1989. The possible role of competition between Trichoderma harzianum and Fusarium oxysporum on rhizosphere colonization. Phytopathology 79:198-203.
- 42. Sternberg, D., and G. R. Mandels. 1979. Induction of cellulolytic enzymes in Trichoderma reesei by sophorose. J. Bacteriol. 139:761-  $\sim$ 43. Woodruff, H. B., and I. M. Miller. 1963. Antibiotics, p. 23-51. In
- **COUTTER, H. D., and I. M. MINEL.** 1705. AND FOUNDS,  $p. 25 51.$  *In* R. M. Hochster and J. H. Quastel (ed.), Metabolic inhibitors: a comprehensive treatise. Academic Press, New York.