A Cultivar-Specific Interaction between Rhizobium leguminosarum bv. trifolii and Subterranean Clover Is Controlled by nodM, Other Bacterial Cultivar Specificity Genes, and a Single Recessive Host Gene

WENDY R. LEWIS-HENDERSON AND MICHAEL A. DJORDJEVIC*

Plant-Microbe Interaction Group, Research School of Biological Sciences, Australian National University, P.O. Box 475, Canberra City, Australia 2601

Received 4 December 1990/Accepted 14 February 1991

Insertion mutagenesis identified two negatively acting gene loci which restrict the ability of Rhizobium leguminosarum bv. trifolii TA1 to infect the homologous host Trifolium subterraneum cv. Woogenellup. One locus was confirmed by DNA sequence analysis as the nodM gene, while the other locus, designated csn-1 (cultivar-specific nodulation), is not located on the symbiosis plasmid. The presence of these cultivar specificity loci could be suppressed by the introduction of the nodT gene from ANU843, a related R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii strain. Other nod genes, present in R. leguminosarum bv. viciae (including nodX) and R. meliloti, were capable of complementing R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii TA1 for nodulation on cultivar Woogenellup. Nodulation studies conducted with F_2 seedlings from a cross between cultivar Geraldton and cultivar Woogenellup indicated that a single recessive gene, designated $rwtl$, is responsible for the Nod⁻ association between strain TAl and cultivar Woogenellup. Parallels can be drawn between this association and gene-for-gene systems common in interactions between plants and biotrophic pathogens.

Within the classical cross-inoculation groups of the Rhizobium-legume interaction (58), examples can be seen of more precise host-specific interactions at the plant cultivar level. Cultivar-specific nodulation has been documented for the symbiosis involving Rhizobium leguminosarum bv. trifolii and clover (30, 39), R. fredii and soybeans (2, 3, 9-12, 33, 46), and R. leguminosarum bv. viciae and peas (16, 40, 61, 62). Bacterial genes from the symbiosis plasmid (pSym) appear to control this cultivar specificity by acting as positive $(2, 3, 13)$ or negative $(33, 39)$ gene traits.

R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii TAl can successfully induce nitrogen-fixing nodules on several subterranean clover cultivars, including Geraldton, Larisa, Mt. Barker, and Tallarook (30, 39). However, the ability of this strain to nodulate Trifolium subterraneum cv. Woogenellup is cold sensitive (30): at 28°C, strain TAl forms an effective symbiosis with this cultivar; at 22°C, little or no sign of nodulation is apparent. The host genes which determine this incompatibility are not known. We recently showed that strain TAl cannot nodulate cultivar Woogenellup because of the presence of negatively acting gene functions which restrict the host range of nodulation (39). In addition, the $nodT$ gene from a related R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii strain, ANU843, acted as a dominant suppressor of these negatively acting gene functions and conferred the ability to nodulate cultivar Woogenellup.

This report presents a further analysis of the cultivar specificity genes in strain TAl which act in a manner akin to the cultivar specificity avirulence genes well documented in plant-pathogen interactions (24, 26-28). We identified two distinct loci in strain TAl which control cultivar specificity. One gene was identified by mutagenesis and DNA sequence analysis as nodM. The nodM gene from R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii ANU843 also acted to suppress nodulation by

strain TA1 of cultivar Woogenellup. The other gene (csn-1) was identified by insertion mutagenesis with Tn5mob, was found to be unlinked to the nodulation gene region of strain TA1, and represents a novel host specificity determinant. In addition, we show that nod genes from other Rhizobium species are capable of suppressing the action of the negatively acting cultivar specificity genes in a manner akin to that recently reported for $nodT$ from R . leguminosarum bv. trifolii ANU843 (39). These genes act as dominant suppressors, and it is clear that nodulation of a particular plant species is governed by a complex interaction of positively and negatively acting genes.

The segregation of host genes which may be specifically involved in cultivar specificity was determined by assaying F₂ seedlings from a cross between cultivar Geraldton and cultivar Woogenellup; the former is a cultivar which is effectively nodulated by strain TAl. We report that ^a single recessive host gene is involved in the cultivar-specific nodulation, indicating that a mechanism similar to, but more complex than, gene-for-gene cultivar specificity between plants and pathogens operates in the Rhizobium-legume symbiosis.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Bacterial strains and plasmids. The bacterial strains and plasmids used in this study are listed in Table 1. Bacterial matings were done on TY agar or in TY broth (45), and triparental matings were done with the helper mobilizing plasmid pRK2013 (17). Conditions and media used for bacterial growth were described previously (45), except for GMM medium, which was used to support Rhizobium growth. GMM medium contained (milligrams per milliliter): KH₂PO₄, 540; K₂HPO₄, 690; MgSO₄ · 7H₂O, 80; NaCl, 40; $CaCl_2 \cdot 2H_2O$, 40; FeCl₃ $\cdot 6H_2O$, 10; MnSO₄ $\cdot 4H_2O$, 10; H_3BO_3 , 3; $ZnSO_4 \cdot 7H_2O$, 3; $Na_2MoO_4 \cdot 2H_2O$, 0.25; CuSO₄ 5H₂O, 0.25; CoCl₂ 6H₂O, 0.25; D-mannitol, 5,000;

^{*} Corresponding author.

^a Sm, Streptomycin; Sp, spectinomycin; Tc, tetracycline; Km, kanamycin.

sodium glutamate, 500; thiamine HCI, 0.4; and biotin, 0.2. Bacto-Agar (15 g/liter; Difco) was added for solid medium, and the pH was 6.8 before autoclaving. Antibiotics were used for selection purposes at the following concentrations (milligrams per liter): for Escherichia coli, kanamycin, 50; tetracycline, 10; carbenicillin, 100; and spectinomycin, 50; for Rhizobium species, kanamycin, 150; tetracycline, 2; carbenicillin, 90; spectinomycin, 150; and streptomycin, 150.

DNA manipulations. DNA isolations, ligations, electrophoresis, and hybridizations were done as described by Maniatis et al. (43). Nonstringent hybridizations were done at 50°C. All enzymes were obtained from Boehringer Mannheim Biochemicals and New England BioLabs and used as recommended by the suppliers. DNA probes were ³²P labeled with random primers (59). The plasmid vector pBS $SK-$ (Stratagene) was used in cloning for sequencing. Single-stranded DNA for sequencing was isolated as described by Gray et al. (32). Sequencing reactions were done with a Sequenase kit (US Biochemical Corp., Cleveland, Ohio) in accordance with the manufacturer's instructions. The protocol provided with this kit is an adaptation of the dideoxy chain termination method (47) which uses a modified T7 DNA polymerase (54). A specific TnS primer (5'-CGT TCAGGACGCTACTT-3'; a gift from J. Watson, Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organization, Canberra, Australia) was used to sequence the TnSmob insertion sites.

Tn5mob mutagenesis. E. coli containing the suicide vector pSUP5011 (49) was used to introduce TnSmob into strain ANU794. Overnight TY broth cultures were mixed by vacuum filtration onto a nitrocellulose filter, which was then incubated on ^a TY agar plate at 28°C for ³ h. Appropriate dilutions of the transconjugant cells were made and plated out on selective media containing kanamycin to generate single colonies. Since strain TAl induces slowly forming, poorly developed nodules on cultivar Woogenellup, mutants with enhanced nodulation ability were screened by direct observation of the roots of inoculated plants. About 15,000 potential TnSmob-induced mutants were inoculated onto 150 individual cultivar Woogenellup plants in pools containing about 300 colonies. An agar plate assay involving three cultivar Woogeneilup seedlings per plate was used, as this procedure allowed direct observation of the plant roots. Large, red-pigmented, rapidly induced nodules were found on the tap roots on 7 of 150 plants. Bacterial isolates from these were screened for the appropriate genetic markers, checked by molecular analysis, and reinoculated onto cultivar Woogenellup plants to confirm the enhanced nodulation phenotype. Nodulation was always directly compared with that on plants inoculated with strain TA1, ANU794, or ANU329 (negative control) and strain ANU843 (positive nodulation control).

Chromosomal mobilization of TnSmob mutations. To confirm that TnSmob was responsible for the Nod' phenotype, we introduced the chromosome-mobilizing plasmid RP4-4 (Tcr Kms derivative of RP4; 32a, 49) separately into ANU794-derived mutant strains. Purified Km^r Tc^r transconjugants were mated with a Sp^r derivative of strain TA1 (strain ANU329) to allow for reciprocal recombination between wild-type and mutated gene regions. Final selection for Sp^r Km^r Tc^s transconjugants isolated new strains which contained the respective TnSmob insertions in the ANU329 background but which did not contain the RP4-4 plasmid. Molecular characterization of these derivatives was done to confirm that recombination had occurred.

Plant assays. Plants were assayed with an agar plate assay (45) or a Magenta jar assay (Magenta Corp., Chicago, Ill.) under nitrogen-free conditions. Magenta jar assays were adapted from the technique of Bender et al. (4). Approximately 10⁸ Rhizobium cells from an overnight BMM broth culture (optical density at 600 nm, 0.27) were resuspended in 10 ml of F medium in a sterile petri dish, and germinated seedlings were exposed to the inoculum for ¹ h to permit bacterial attachment before being planted at nine seedlings per jar. Each jar was covered with a plastic bag to maintain vermiculite sterility, with a hole in the top of the bag to allow gas exchange. Plants in both types of assay were grown for 3 to 4 weeks in a growth chamber with fluorescent and incandescent lights (400 microeinsteins per $m²$ per s) and a root temperature of 22°C. Humidity was 60%, and a lightdark cycle of 17 h-7 h was used. Clover seeds were sterilized and germinated as previously described (45).

 $F₂$ generation seedlings from a cross between cultivar Geraldton and cultivar Woogenellup were obtained from P. Nichols and W. Collins, Western Australia Department of Agriculture. Pollen from cultivar Woogenellup was used to fertilize cultivar Geraldton flowers, and the resulting F_1 plants were screened for characteristics of the petiole, leaf, and flower to ensure that genuine hybrids had been constructed. The $F₂$ generation was produced by allowing the isolated F_1 plants to self-pollinate.

RESULTS

Isolation of mutants of strain ANU794 which induced an enhanced nodulation response on cultivar Woogenellup. To identify possible negatively acting genes that condition the inability of strain TAl to induce normal nodulation on

FIG. 1. Nodulation of cultivar Woogenellup by strain ANU794 and by a TnSmob-induced mutant (later designated ANU7941; see the text). (A) Poor lateral root nodulation induced by strain ANU794. (B) Enhanced nodulation ability typical of a Nod' Tn5mob-induced mutant, with extensive nodulation of tap and lateral roots. Plants were grown in Magentajars for 4 weeks at 22°C.

cultivar Woogenellup, we mutagenized strain ANU794 (Smr derivative of strain TA1) with TnSmob. Seventeen mutants which induced large, red-pigmented tap root nodules on cultivar Woogenellup (Fig. 1) were isolated from the nodules. After purification and retesting for the enhanced nodulation phenotype, genomic DNA was isolated from these mutants, restricted with EcoRI (as TnSmob contains no EcoRI sites), and hybridized to a TnS-specific probe. Two distinct classes of mutant were identified. In the class ^I mutants, the TnS probe hybridized to an 18-kb EcoRI fragment, while in the class II mutants, hybridization was observed with a 10-kb EcoRI fragment. The pattern of banding in restriction profiles of ethidium bromide-stained total DNA was indistinguishable from that of the parental strain. This result, together with the retention of the genetic markers of strain ANU794 (Sm'), verified that the mutants were indeed derivatives of ANU794.

The EcoRI Tn5mob-containing DNA fragments were

cloned from each of four mutants (two from each class) by ligation to plasmid pBS and transformation into E. coli NM522. Further molecular analysis showed that the Tn5mob insertion was located approximately 150 bp apart in the two class ^I derivatives and that the two class II derivatives were siblings. No homology could be detected between the DNA fragments mutated in class ^I and II derivatives.

Tn5mob is responsible for the mutant phenotype in class ^I and II mutants. The two class ^I mutants and the class II mutant of ANU794 were designated ANU7941, ANU7942, and ANU7943, respectively. To confirm that TnSmob was responsible for the Nod' phenotype, we introduced the chromosome-mobilizing plasmid RP4-4 (32a) separately into mutant strains ANU7941, ANU7942, and ANU7943 and subsequently mated the transconjugants with ANU329 (Spr derivative of TA1; see Materials and Methods). EcoRIrestricted genomic DNA from ANU329 and the ANU329 derived Tn5mob strains was analyzed to confirm that chromosome mobilization and reciprocal recombination had occurred; hybridizations with the TnSmob-containing EcoRI fragment isolated from each original mutant strain indicated that reciprocal recombination had successfully taken place (results not shown). The nodulation ability of each of the Tn5mob derivatives of strain ANU329 was tested on cultivar Woogenellup. Each construct was Nod', confirming that the Tn5mob insertion was responsible for the enhanced nodulation phenotype of mutant strains ANU7941, ANU7942, and ANU7943. Strain ANU329, like its parental strain TA1, induced poor nodulation on cultivar Woogenellup.

Two cultivar-specific nodulation genes identified by TnSmob mutagenesis. To examine the possibility that nod genes were mutated in either class ^I or II mutant derivatives, we used the TnSmob-containing EcoRI fragment from each mutant as ^a hybridization probe for DNA from ^a cosmid clone which was derived from strain TAl DNA (cosmid pWLH1; 39) and which spanned the *nod* gene region of this strain. Positive hybridization (results not shown) was observed between both of the class I EcoRI fragments and an EcoRI fragment which has recently been shown to contain genes functionally and structurally homologous to ANU843 nodABCIJD FERLMN (39). As expected, the class II EcoRI fragment did not hybridize to the nod region of strain TAl. A 1.7-kb HindIII fragment containing 1.2 kb of the Tn5mob arm and flanking DNA sequences of the class II mutant was isolated and subsequently hybridized to genomic DNA from R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii CC2480a and ANU843 (both capable of nodulating cultivar Woogenellup), ANU794 and UNZ29 (both incapable of nodulating cultivar Woogenellup), and ANU845 (pSym cured) and ANU815 (ApSym). Positive hybridization was observed to all of these strains (Fig. 2), indicating that the mutation in the class II mutant is not pSym located. We designate this novel locus csn-J (cultivarspecific nodulation). Preliminary sequence data (not shown) indicate that the 0.5 kb of Rhizobium DNA in the 1.7-kb HindIII probe is gene specific. Hence, it appears that the presence of this csn-J gene region does not directly correlate with the ability of a strain to nodulate cultivar Woogenellup. However, DNA sequencing of the corresponding locus in the strains tested may indicate subtle differences between nodulation-restricted and -unrestricted strains.

DNA sequence analysis demonstrates that Tn5mob is located in $nodM$ in class I mutants. HindIII digestion of the two EcoRI fragments from the two class ^I derivatives was used to subclone the end of each TnSmob arm and flanking DNA from strain ANU794 into the sequencing vector pBS SK-. A TnS primer (see Materials and Methods) was used to

FIG. 2. Hybridization of the csn-1 gene region to genomic DNA from various R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii strains. Lanes: 1, lambda size markers (kilobases); 2, ANU843; 3, ANU845 (pSym cured); 4, ANU794; 5, ANU815 (ApSym); 6, CC2480a; 7, UNZ29. Genomic DNA was restricted with EcoRI before hybridization. A 1.7-kb HindIII fragment (containing 1.2 kb of the arm of Tn5mob) internal to the TnSmob-containing EcoRI fragment from the ANU794 derived class II mutant (later designated ANU7943; see the text) was used as a probe. Preliminary sequence data indicated that the 0.5 kb of Rhizobium DNA in this probe is gene specific (data not shown). Strains ANU843 and CC2480a proficiently nodulated cultivar Woogenellup, but strains ANU794 and UNZ29 did not.

sequence the DNA flanking the site of insertion of Tn5mob. A comparison of the sequences obtained to known nod gene sequences revealed that both of these mutants were affected in the *nodM* gene (Fig. 3). The sequence of the *nodM* gene of ANU843 is 96% homologous to that of the nodM gene of ANU794 over the 308 nucleotide bases sequenced in the vicinity of the insertion sites of the two class ^I derivatives (Fig. 3). The mutations in each of the class ^I derivatives are 174 bases apart and occur in the 5' end of the TA1 nodM gene.

The nodM genes in strains ANU843 and TA1 are functionally identical. As an adjunct to the DNA sequence analysis, several genetic complementation tests were done to determine whether the nodM genes in strains ANU843 and TA1 are functionally identical. Previous results (19, 39, 48) had shown that the strain ANU843-derived plasmid pRtO32, which contains nodABCIJDFERLMN, is capable of conferring nodulation ability on a range of clover species (T. repens, T. pratense, and T. subterraneum). Despite this capability, plasmid pRtO32 fails to confer nodulation ability on cultivar Woogenellup to strains TAl and ANU815 (ApSym). Derivatives of plasmid pRtO32 containing insertion mutations in various nod genes (Table 1) were introduced into strain ANU815. Only plasmid pRtO32::822, which contains a MudI1734 insertion in $nodM$, was capable of fully restoring nodulation ability on cultivar Woogenellup in the ANU815 background (Table 2). Plasmid pRtO32::m570 also restored nodulation ability (Table 2). Plasmids pRtO32::C7 (mutated in $nodE$) and $pRt032::932$ (mutated in $nodD$) partially restored nodulation ability (Table 2). This result indi-

FIG. 3. Comparison of the DNA sequences of portions of the nodM genes of strain ANU843 and two ANU794-derived mutants (later designated ANU7941 and ANU7942; see the text). Three hundred eight bases of nodM sequence flanking the sites of Tn5mob insertion (arrowheads) in mutant strains ANU7941 (top arrow) and ANU7942 (bottom arrow) are shown. Bases homologous between strain ANU843 and ANU794 nodM genes are joined by dots. Total homology over the region sequenced was 96%. Sequence data for strain ANU843 were provided by J. J. Weinman (58a).

cates that the *nodE* gene probably acts in a negative manner in conjunction with other genes in this background. The restoration of nodulation ability by plasmid pRtO32::932 is most likely due to the presence of a second copy of nodD retained in the ANU815 ($\Delta pSym$) background (39). Plasmid $pRt032$, containing insertion mutations in gene *nodA*, *nodC*, nodl, nodJ, nodR, or nodN (nodN lies downstream of nodM in the same operon), failed to enhance the ability of strain ANU815 to nodulate cultivar Woogenellup (Table 2), suggesting that none of these genes acts in a negative manner to restrict the nodulation of this cultivar.

Nodulation genes from foreign Rhizobium species are capable of suppressing the activity of strain TA1 nodM. Previous results (39) indicated that the *nodT* gene from R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii ANU843 can confer cultivar Woogenellup nodulation ability to strain TAl. Nodulation genes from

TABLE 2. Ability of nod gene constructs derived from strain ANU843 to confer cultivar Woogenellup nodulation ability to strain ANU815

Construct	Gene affected	Nodulation ability ^a
pRt032		
pRt032::m114	nodA	
pRt032::C10	nodC	
pRt032::932	nodD	$+$ (29)
pRt032::C7	nodE	$+$ (13)
pRt032::B15	nodI	
pRt032::G5	nodJ	
pRt032::m344	nodR	
pRt0328	nodN	
pRt032::m570 ^b	nodM nod-box	$+$ (60)
pRt032::822	nodM	+ (91)

 $a +$, Nod⁺ response (average percent nodulated plants). $-$, Nod⁻ response. Results are from at least two repeat plant assays testing 10 to 15 plants each. Plants were grown on agar plates at 22°C for ³ weeks.

 b The m570 mutation is located in the nod-box sequence 5' to the nodMNX</sup> operon.

other Rhizobium species were also found to be capable of complementing strain TAl to Nod' on cultivar Woogenellup. These included nod gene-containing clones from R. meliloti (on plasmid pRmSL26) and R. leguminosarum bv. viciae ²⁴⁸ (on plasmids pIJ1089 and pMP180) and TOM (on plasmids pIJ1095 and pIJ1230 $[nodX::Tn5]$) (Table 1). All five plasmids were capable of complementing strain TAl for cultivar Woogenellup nodulation in a manner akin to that imparted by the introduction of R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii $nodT$ (similar to that depicted in Fig. 1). However, differential results were obtained when the effects of these introduced plasmids in the TAl and ANU815 backgrounds were measured. The introduction of cosmids pIJ1095 and pIJ1230 into strain ANU815 led to $Nod⁺$ and $Nod⁻$ results on cultivar Woogenellup, respectively, whereas the introduction of either cosmid into strain TAl led to a Nod' result. This result showed that the $nodX$ gene was essential for the ability of plasmid pIJ1095 to confer cultivar Woogenellup nodulation ability to strain ANU815 but that other genes (besides $nodX$) interacted with pSym-located genes in the background of strain TAl to effect the nodulation phenotype.

Further analysis was conducted on the ability of R. leguminosarum bv. viciae-derived plasmids pMP180 and pIJ1089 to confer cultivar Woogenellup nodulation ability to strain TA1. Neither of these plasmids contains the *nodX* gene. The results showed that the R . *leguminosarum* bv. viciae nodDEFLMT genes are not individually involved in complementation, as pMP180 constructs containing mutations in any of these genes (pMP180::D2, pMP180::E1, pMP180::F4, pMP510, pMP589, pMP562, pMP574, pMP528, and pMP578) were still able to confer cultivar Woogenellup nodulation ability. The nodN gene on pMP180 and pIJ1089 may therefore be responsible for complementing the nodulation failure of strain TAl on cultivar Woogenellup; it is also possible that several nod genes act together. Interestingly, this result suggests that the R . *leguminosarum* by. viciae NodT is not functionally homologous to that of R . leguminosarum bv. trifolii despite the fact that it is 60% homologous (51).

Plasmid pRmSL26 is known to encode nodD1 and nodAB CIJ (15, 29, 37, 55) and $fixF$ (1). When pRmSL26 DNA was probed with fragments specific for $nodX$ and $nodT$ genes, no positive hybridization was detected, even under nonstringent conditions, although faint hybridization was observed to R . leguminosarum by. trifolii nod M and nod N genespecific fragments (17a). It has not been determined which gene(s) on plasmid pRmSL26 confers cultivar Woogenellup nodulation ability to strain TAl.

Analysis of the F_2 generation of cultivar Geraldton \times cultivar Woogenellup. The segregation of the plant genes involved in the cultivar-specific interaction between strain TAl and cultivar Woogenellup was examined. A total of ⁷² $F₂$ generation seedlings from a cross between cultivar Geraldton and cultivar Woogenellup were inoculated with strain TA1, and the nodulation phenotype was examined in a Magenta jar assay. While strain TA1 induced nodules on tap and lateral roots of some F_2 plants (cultivar Geraldton-like nodulation response), other \overline{F}_2 plants were not nodulated or were only poorly nodulated on lateral roots (cultivar Woogenellup-like nodulation response) (Fig. 4). The ratio of F_2 plants nodulated in a manner similar to that of cultivar Geraldton to $F₂$ plants with a nodulation profile similar to the strain TAl-cultivar Woogenellup phenotype was calculated to be 53:19, or approximately 3:1. This ratio indicates that a single recessive gene, which we propose to call rwtl (resistance of Woogenellup to strain TA1), conditions the cultivarspecific incompatibility between strain TAl and cultivar Woogenellup.

DISCUSSION

The mutagenesis of TAl derivative strain ANU794 clearly indicated the presence in this strain of negatively acting genes which suppress the nodulation of cultivar Woogenellup. This report presents evidence for the first time that a nod gene, nodM, is involved in restricting host range in a cultivar-specific manner. Another novel, negatively acting cultivar specificity locus, csn-1, was also identified and is located outside pSym. Although the mechanistic basis for the inability of strain TAl to nodulate cultivar Woogenellup is unknown, it is interesting that recent evidence has been presented that the $nodM$ gene product functions as a glucosamine synthetase (43a). It is therefore possible that the action of gene products, including NodM and Csnl, finely modifies the surface chemistry or molecular signals exuded by strain TAl such that an incompatible response is generated with cultivar Woogenellup (18, 38).

A clear gene-for-gene match has been documented in many plant-pathogen interactions, in which a single dominant avirulence gene overrides the basic ability to form a compatible interaction only when the plant host possesses the corresponding (usually dominant) resistance gene (18, 24, 26-28). In contrast to well-documented gene-for-gene pathway interactions, in the interaction between R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii and cultivar Woogenellup, a clear genefor-gene interaction occurs. Together with other nodulation gene products, the products of nodM and the csn-1 locus probably act in the same pathway, since mutation of either gene allows cultivar Woogenellup nodulation to proceed. The action of both of these genes can be suppressed by the presence of the *nodT* gene (naturally deleted in strain TA1; 39) or other genes in foreign rhizobia (e.g., by R. leguminosarum bv. viciae $nodX$ in certain backgrounds).

FIG. 4. Nodulation phenotypes of F_2 cultivar Geraldton \times cultivar Woogenellup plants inoculated with strain TAl. (A) Cultivar Woogenellup-like nodulation response by F_2 plants, showing virtually no nodule induction. (B) Cultivar Geraldton-like nodulation response by F_2 plants, showing nodulation of tap and lateral roots. The ratio of the former to the latter was calculated to be 1:3. Nodulation profiles of control cultivar Woogenellup and cultivar Geraldton plants inoculated with strain TAl were similar to those

depicted in panels A and B, respectively. Plants were grown in

majenta jars for 3 weeks at 22° C.

Previous results (39) indicated that a negatively acting gene encoded by the nodABCIJTDFERLMN(X) region of strain ANU843 (on plasmid pRI4003) prevented strain TAl from nodulating cultivar Woogenellup at 22° C. This gene(s) was absent in plasmid pRI4001, containing *nodABCIJTD* FERL, and hence was located in the nodMNX region. The results presented here confirm that it is the nodM gene which acts in a negative manner in the nodulation of subterranean clover. The results from sequencing and complementation analysis also indicate that the $nodM$ gene is functionally equivalent in R. leguminosarum by. trifolii ANU843 and TA1. It is clear that while $nodM$ does not play an obligatory role in nodulation (as evidenced by the lack of a definitive phenotype for *nodM* mutants; 6, 20), it is capable of interacting with the products of other nodulation genes to finetune the efficiency of nodulation on several host plants. In some cases, it appears that the nodM gene may act in a positive manner. For example, the nodLMN region of R. leguminosarum by. viciae increases the efficiency of nodulating peas and Vicia hirsuta (52, 53) and, similarly, nodM of R. leguminosarum by. trifolii increases the efficiency of nodulating red clover (39). Our results clearly indicate that

nodM of R. leguminosarum by. trifolii also acts in a negative manner in the background of strain TAl to restrict nodulation of subterranean clover cultivar Woogenellup at 22°C.

Negatively acting nod gene functions which act at the genus level have been demonstrated in other Rhizobiumlegume interactions (8, 14, 15, 20, 25, 35), although cultivar specificity genes which restrict host range have only recently been reported, for example, in the symbiosis between R. fredii and soybeans (33). TnS-induced mutants of R. fredii strain USDA257 acquired the ability to nodulate the soybean cultivar McCall, which the parent strain is unable to nodulate (9, 33). Although one of the mutations was located on pSym, no evidence of the involvement of specific *nod* genes was presented. The gene(s) mutated was proposed to be involved in preventing infection thread initiation or development in cultivar McCall (9). Similarly, Sadowsky et al. (46a) recently identified a genotype-specific nodulation determinant in Bradyrhizobium japonicum which restricts nodulation on certain soybeans.

Our results show that the *nodT* genes from R . *leguminosa*rum bv. trifolii and R . leguminosarum bv. viciae are not functionally identical in that the R . leguminosarum bv. viciae nodT cannot confer cultivar Woogenellup nodulation ability. However, it appears that several genes in different Rhizobium species and biovars (encoded on plasmids pMP180, pIJ1095, pIJ1089, pIJ1230, and pRmSL26), including $nodX$, can act in a manner phenotypically similar to that of the R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii nodT gene. The nodX gene is responsible for conferring the ability of R. leguminosarum bv. viciae TOM to nodulate the primitive pea cultivar Afghanistan (13). Other R. leguminosarum bv. viciae strains, such as 248, which lack $nodX$ cannot nodulate this pea cultivar and are limited to infecting North American or European pea lines (40, 61, 62). It is interesting to note that a gene downstream of $nodC$ (probably $nodT$) has been shown to be important for the ability of ANU843 nodE mutants to nodulate cultivar Afghanistan peas (extended host range ability) (7, 20). These findings suggest that the products of nodX (R. leguminosarum by. viciae) and nodT (R. leguminosarum bv. trifolii) act in a similar manner, possibly by enzymatically altering products which would otherwise impede the successful infection of the cultivar involved.

The results presented here show that a single recessive plant gene affecting the nodulation of cultivar Woogenellup, designated rwtl, is involved in the incompatibility between strain TAl and cultivar Woogenellup. It is possible that the product of the clover host gene rwtl interacts with lowmolecular-weight factors released from rhizobia after the induction of the nod genes (38). Similar host resistance genes which limit nodulation by specific Rhizobium strains have also been reported in symbioses between R. leguminosarum bv. viciae and peas (41) and between B. japonicum and soybeans (5, 56, 57). In contrast to the recessive nature of rwtl, strain-specific nodulation ability is determined by single dominant host genes in the interactions between pea cultivar Afghanistan and two particular strains of R . leguminosarum bv. viciae: the plant gene Sym4 determines resistance to nodulation by strain 310a, and another host gene determines resistance to strain PRE (41).

It is clear from the results presented here that a fine balance of control exists between positive and negative functions provided by nod genes and other genes in bacteria and plant hosts and determines cultivar specificity in the Rhizobium-legume symbiosis. These types of cultivar-specific interactions may be more common in the Rhizobiumlegume symbiosis than once thought.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank P. Nichols and W. Collins of the Western Australian Department of Agriculture for supplying $F₂$ generation seeds of crosses between cultivars Geraldton and Woogenellup. We thank B. G. Rolfe for critical reading of the manuscript and J. J. Weinman for providing unpublished sequence data. We thank J. McIver and M. Oakes for technical assistance and G. Hanson for photography.

W.R.L.-H. is supported by an Australian Postgraduate Research Award.

REFERENCES

- 1. Aguilar, 0. M., D. Kapp, and A. Puhler. 1985. Characterization of a Rhizobium meliloti fixation gene $(f \circ F)$ located near the common nodulation region. J. Bacteriol. 164:245-254.
- 2. Appelbaum, E., N. Chartrain, D. Thompson, K. Johansen, M. O'Connell, and T. McLoughlin. 1985. Genes of Rhizobium japonicum involved in the development of nodules, p. 101-107. In H. Evans and P. Bottomley (ed.), Nitrogen fixation research progress. Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands.
- 3. Appelbaum, E. R., T. J. McLoughlin, M. O'Connell, and N. Chartrain. 1985. Expression of symbiotic genes of Rhizobium japonicum USDA 191 in other rhizobia. J. Bacteriol. 63:385-388.
- 4. Bender, G. L., W. Goydych, B. Rolfe, and M. Nayudu. 1987. The role of the Rhizobium conserved and host specific nodulation genes in the infection of the non-legume Parasponia andersonii. Mol. Gen. Genet. 210:299-306.
- 5. Caldwell, B. E. 1966. Inheritance of a strain specific ineffective nodulation in soybeans. Crop Sci. 6:427-428.
- 6. Canter-Cremers, H. C. J., H. P. Spaink, A. H. M. Wifjes, E. Pees, C. A. Wiffelnan, R. J. H. Okker, and B. J. J. Lugtenberg. 1989. Additional nodulation genes on the Sym plasmid of Rhizobium leguminosarum biovar viciae. Plant Mol. Biol. 13: 163-174.
- 7. Canter-Cremers, H. C. J., C. A. Wijffelman, E. Pees, B. G. Rolfe, M. A. Djordjevic, and B. J. J. Lugtenberg. 1988. Host specific nodulation of plants of the pea cross-inoculation group is influenced by genes in fast-growing Rhizobium downstream nodC. J. Plant Physiol. 132:398-404.
- 8. Cervantes, E., S. Sharma, F. Maillet, J. Vasse, G. Truchet, and C. Rosenberg. 1989. The product of the host-specific $nodQ$ gene of Rhizobium meliloti shares homology with translation elongation and initiation factors. Mol. Microbiol. 3:745-755.
- 9. Chatterjee, A., P. A. Balatti, W. Gibbons, and S. G. Pueppke. 1990. Interaction of Rhizobium fredii USDA257 and nodulation mutants derived from it with the agronomically improved soybean cultivar McCall. Planta 180:303-311.
- 10. Cregan, P., and H. Keyser. 1986. Host restriction of nodulation by Bradyrhizobium japonicum strain USDA ¹²³ in soybean. Crop Sci. 29:911-916.
- 11. Cregan, P., H. Keyser, and M. Sadowsky. 1989. A soybean genotype that restricts nodulation of a previously unrestricted isolate of Bradyrhizobium japonicum serocluster 123. Crop Sci. 29:307-312.
- 12. Cregan, P. B., H. H. Keyser, and M. J. Sadowsky. 1989. Host plant effects on nodulation and competitiveness of the Bradyrhizobium japonicum serotype strains constituting serocluster 123. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 55:2532-2536.
- 13. Davis, E. O., I. J. Evans, and A. W. B. Johnston. 1988. Identification of $nodX$, a gene that allows $Rhizobium$ leguminosarum biovar viciae strain TOM to nodulate Afghanistan peas. Mol. Gen. Genet. 212:531-535.
- 14. Debelle, F., F. Maillet, J. Vasse, C. Rosenberg, F. De Billy, G. Truchet, J. Denarie, and F. M. Ausubel. 1988. Interference between Rhizobium meliloti and Rhizobium trifolii nodulation genes: genetic basis of R. meliloti dominance. J. Bacteriol. 170:5718-5727.
- 15. Debelle, F., C. Rosenberg, J. Vasse, F. Maillet, E. Martinez, J.

Denarie, and G. Truchet. 1986. Assignment of symbiotic developmental phenotypes to common and specific nodulation (nod) genetic loci of Rhizobium meliloti. J. Bacteriol. 168:1075-1086.

- 16. Degenhardt, T. L., T. A. Larue, and E. A. Paul. 1976. Investigation of a non-nodulating cultivar of Pisum sativum. Can. J. Bot. 54:1633-1636.
- 17. Ditta, G., S. Stanfield, D. Corbin, and D. R. Helinski. 1980. Broad host range DNA cloning system for gram negative bacteria: construction of a gene bank of Rhizobium meliloti. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 77:7348-7351.
- 17a.Djordjevic, M. A. Unpublished data.
- 18. Djordjevic, M. A., D. W. Gabriel, and B. G. Rolfe. 1987. Rhizobium-the refined parasite of legumes. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 25:145-168.
- 19. Djordjevic, M. A., R. W. Innes, C. A. WUffelman, P. R. Schofield, and B. G. Rolfe. 1986. Nodulation of specific legumes is controlled by several loci in Rhizobium trifolii. Plant Mol. Biol. 6:389-423.
- 20. Djordjevic, M. A., P. R. Schofield, and B. G. Rolfe. 1985. TnS mutagenesis of Rhizobium trifolii host-specific nodulation genes result in mutants with altered host range ability. Mol. Gen. Genet. 200:463-471.
- 21. Djordjevic, M. A., W. Zurkowski, and B. G. Rolfe. 1982. Plasmids and stability of symbiotic properties of Rhizobium trifolii. J. Bacteriol. 151:560-568.
- 22. Djordjevic, M. A., W. Zurkowski, J. Shine, and B. G. Rolfe. 1983. Sym plasmid transfer to various symbiotic mutants of Rhizobium trifolii, R. leguminosarum, and R. meliloti. J. Bacteriol. 156:1035-1045.
- 23. Downie, J. A., G. Hombrecher, Q. S. Ma, C. D. Knight, B. Wells, and A. W. B. Johnston. 1983. Cloned nodulation genes of Rhizobium leguminosarum determine host-range specificity. Mol. Gen. Genet. 190:359-375.
- 24. Ellingboe, A. 1981. Changing concepts in host-pathogen genetics. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 19:125-145.
- 25. Faucher, C., S. Camut, J. Denarie, and G. Truchet. 1989. The nodH and nodQ host range genes of Rhizobium meliloti behave as avirulence genes in R. leguminosarum bv. viciae and determine changes in the production of plant-specific extracellular signals. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 2:291-300.
- 26. Flor, H. H. 1947. Inheritance of reaction to rust in flax. J. Agric. Res. 74:241-262.
- 27. Flor, H. H. 1955. Host-parasite interaction in flax rust-its genetics and other implications. Phytopathology 45:680-685.
- 28. Gabriel, D. W. 1989. Genetics of plant parasite populations and host-parasite specificity, p. 343-379. In T. Kosuge and E. W. Nester (ed.), Plant-microbe interactions: molecular and genetic perspectives, vol. 3. Macmillan Publishing Co., New York.
- 29. Gerhold, D. L., G. Stacey, and A. Kondorosi. 1989. Use of a promoter-specific probe to identify two loci from the Rhizobium meliloti nodulation regulon. Plant Mol. Biol. 12:181-188.
- 30. Gibson, A. 1968. Nodulation failure in Trifolium subterraneum L. cv. Woogenellup (Syn. Marrar). Aust. J. Agric. Sci. 19:907- 918.
- 31. Gough, J., and N. Murray. 1983. Sequence diversity among related genes for recognition of specific targets in DNA molecules. J. Mol. Biol. 166:1-19.
- 32. Gray, J. X., M. A. Djordjevic, and B. G. Rolfe. 1990. Two genes that regulate exopolysaccharide production in Rhizobium sp. strain NGR234: DNA sequences and resultant phenotypes. J. Bacteriol. 172:193-203.
- 32a.Hedges, R. W., and A. C. Jacob. 1974. Transposition of ampicillin resistance from RP4 to other replicons. Mol. Gen. Genet. 132:31-40.
- 33. Heron, D. S., T. Ersek, H. B. Krishnan, and S. G. Peuppke. 1989. Nodulation mutants of Rhizobium fredii USDA257. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 2:4-10.
- 34. Hombrecher, G., R. Gotz, N. J. Dibb, J. A. Downie, A. W. B. Johnston, and J. Brewin. 1984. Cloning and mutagenesis of nodulation genes from Rhizobium leguminosarum TOM, a strain with extended host range. Mol. Gen. Genet. 194:293-298.
- 35. Horvath, B., E. Kondorosi, M. John, J. Schmidt, I. Torok, Z. Gyorgypal, I. Barabas, U. Wieneke, J. Scheli, and A. Kondorosi.

1986. Organisation, structure and symbiotic function of Rhizobium meliloti nodulation genes determining host specificity for alfalfa. Cell 46:335-343.

- 36. Innes, R. W., P. L. Kuempel, J. Plazinski, H. Canter-Cremers, B. G. Rolfe, and M. A. Djordjevic. 1985. Plant factors induce expression of nodulation and host-range genes in Rhizobium trifolii. Mol. Gen. Genet. 201:426-432.
- 37. Jacobs, T. W., T. T. Egelhoff, and S. R. Long. 1985. Physical and genetic map of a Rhizobium meliloti nodulation gene region and nucleotide map of nodC. J. Bacteriol. 162:469-476.
- 38. Lerouge, P., P. Rouche, C. Faucher, F. Maillet, G. Truchet, J. C. Prome, and J. Denarie. 1990. Symbiotic host-specificity of Rhizobium meliloti is determined by a sulphated and acylated glucosamine oligosaccharide signal. Nature (London) 344:781- 784.
- 39. Lewis-Henderson, W. R., and M. A. Djordjevic. nodT, a positively-acting cultivar specificity determinant controlling nodulation of Trifolium subterraneum by Rhizobium leguminosarum biovar trifolii. Plant Mol. Biol., in press.
- 40. Lie, T. A. 1978. Symbiotic specialisation in pea plants: the requirement of specific Rhizobium strains for peas from Afghanistan. Ann. Appl. Biol. 88:462-465.
- 41. Lie, T. A. 1984. Host genes in Pisum sativum L. conferring resistance to European Rhizobium leguminosarum strains. Plant Soil 82:415-425.
- 42. Long, S. R., W. J. Buikema, and F. M. Ausubel. 1982. Cloning of Rhizobium meliloti nodulation genes by direct complementation of Nod⁻ mutants. Nature (London) 298:485-488.
- 43. Maniatis, T., E. F. Fritsch, and J. Sambrook. 1982. Molecular cloning: a laboratory manual. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory, Cold Spring Harbor, N.Y.
- 43a.Marie, C., and A. J. Downie. 1990. Abstr. 5th Int. Symp. Mol. Gen. Plant-Microbe Interactions, abstr. no. 185.
- 44. McIver, J., M. A. Djordjevic, J. J. Weinman, G. L. Bender, and B. G. Rolfe. 1989. Extension of host range of Rhizobium leguminosarum bv. trifolii caused by point mutations in nodD that result in alterations in regulatory function and recognition of inducer molecules. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact. 2:97-103.
- 45. Rolfe, B. G., P. M. Gresshoff, J. Shine, and J. M. Vincent. 1980. Interaction between a non-nodulating and an ineffective mutant of Rhizobium trifolii resulting in effective (nitrogen-fixing) nodulation. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 41:449-452.
- 46. Sadowsky, M., R. Tufly, P. Cregan, and H. Keyser. 1987. Genetic diversity in Bradyrhizobium japonicum serogroup 123 and its relation to genotype-specific nodulation of soybeans. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 53:2624-2630.
- 46a.Sadowsky, M. J., A. A. Bhagwat, and P. B. Cregan. 1990. Abstr. 5th Int. Symp. Mol. Gen. Plant-Microbe Interactions, abstr. no. 178.
- 47. Sanger, F., S. Nicklen, and A. R. Coulson. 1977. DNA sequencing with chain-terminating inhibitors. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 74:5463-5467.
- Schofield, P. R., R. W. Ridge, B. G. Rolfe, J. Shine, and J. M. Watson. 1984. Host-specific nodulation is encoded on a ¹⁴ Kb DNA fragment in Rhizobium trifolii. Plant Mol. Biol. 3:3-11.
- 49. Simon, R. 1984. High frequency mobilization of gram-negative bacterial replicons by the in vitro constructed TnS-mob transposon. Mol. Gen. Genet. 196:413-420.
- 50. Staskawicz, B., D. Dahlbeck, N. Keen, and C. Napoli. 1987. Molecular characterization of cloned avirulence genes from race 0 and race ¹ of Pseudomonas syringae pv. glycinea. J. Bacteriol. 169:5789-5794.
- 51. Surin, B., J. Watson, W. Hamilton, A. Economou, and J. Downie. 1990. Molecular characterisation of the nodulation gene, nodT, from two biovars of Rhizobium leguminosarum. Mol. Microbiol. 4:245-252.
- 52. Surin, B. P., and J. A. Downie. 1988. Characterisation of the Rhizobium leguminosarum genes nodLMN involved in efficient host specific nodulation. Mol. Microbiol. 2:173-183.
- 53. Surin, B. P., and J. A. Downie. 1989. Rhizobium leguminosarum genes required for expression and transfer of host specific nodulation. Plant Mol. Biol. 12:19-29.
- 54. Tabor, S., and C. C. Richardson. 1987. Sequence analysis with

^a modified bacteriophage T7 DNA polymerase. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 84:4767-4771.

- 55. Truchet, G., F. Debelie, J. Vasse, B. Terzaghi, A. Garnerone, C. Rosenberg, J. Batut, F. Maillet, and J. Denarie. 1985. Identification of a Rhizobium meliloti pSym2011 region controlling the host specificity of root hair curling and nodulation. J. Bacteriol. 164:1200-1210.
- 56. Vest, G. 1970. Rj_3 —a gene conditioning ineffective nodulation in soybean. Crop Sci. 10:34-35.
- 57. Vest, G., and B. E. Caldwell. 1972. Rj_4 —a gene conditioning ineffective nodulation in soybean. Crop Sci. 12:692-693.
- 58. Vincent, J. M. 1980. Factors controlling the legume-Rhizobium symbiosis, p. 103-129. In W. E. Newton and W. H. Orme-Johnson (ed.), Nitrogen fixation, vol. 2. University Park Press, Baltimore.

58a.Weinman, J. J. Unpublished data.

- 59. Whitfield, P., P. Seeburg, and J. Shine. 1982. The human proopiomelanocortin gene: organisation, sequence and interspersion with repetitive DNA. DNA 1:134-143.
- 60. Wijffelman, C. A., E. Pees, A. A. N. van Brussel, R. J. H. Okker, and B. J. J. Lugtenberg. 1985. Genetic and functional analysis of the nodulation region of the Rhizobium leguminosarum Sym plasmid pRLlJI. Arch. Microbiol. 143:225-232.
- 61. Winaro, R., and T. A. Lie. 1979. Competition between Rhizobium strains in nodule formation: interaction between nodulating and non-nodulating strains. Plant Soil 53:135-142.
- 62. Young, J. P. W., A. W. B. Johnston, and N. J. Brewin. 1982. A search for peas (Pisum sativum L.) showing strain specificity for symbiotic Rhizobium leguminosarum. Heredity 50:197-201.