# Evidence of a Common Pathway of Carbon Dioxide Reduction to Methane in Methanogens

W. JACK JONES,<sup>†</sup> MARK I. DONNELLY, AND RALPH S. WOLFE\*

Department of Microbiology, University of Illinois, Urbana, Illinois 61801

Received 4 February 1985/Accepted 3 April 1985

The roles of methanofuran and tetrahydromethanopterin as carriers of  $C_1$  moieties in the reduction of carbon dioxide to methane were studied in representatives of diverse groups of methanogens, confirming that these roles, first reported for Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum, are common for methanogenesis in general. Extracts of the methanogens tested converted formyl-methanofuran and methyl-tetrahydromethanopterin to methane; the extractable cofactors derived from the same methanogens, with one exception, complemented a methanofuran- and tetrahydromethanopterin-deficient enzyme system from M. thermoautotrophicum. The amounts of extractable methanofuran and tetrahydromethanopterin were determined for each representative methanogen.

The pioneering investigations into the biosynthesis of methane from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , performed by H. A. Barker and colleagues, established that free formate, formaldehyde, and methanol were not intermediates in the reductive pathway, and Barker proposed that  $C_1$  units at intermediate oxidation states were carried as derivatives of an enzymic cofactor or cofactors (3). One of these cofactors, 2-mercaptoethanesulfonic acid (HS-CoM), was identified in the early 1970s as a carrier of  $C_1$  units at the methanol level of oxidation (17, 25). The methyl derivative of this cofactor, 2-(methylthio)ethanesulfonic acid  $(CH_3-S-CoM)$ , is the substrate for the methane-forming reaction which is catalyzed by the complex methylreductase enzyme system (11). Recently, two additional cofactors have been isolated from Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum which, in conjunction with HS-CoM, serve as carriers for  $C_1$  units in methane production from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ . Tetrahydromethanopterin  $(H_4MPT)$ , an analog of tetrahydrofolate (27), carries  $C_1$  units at the methine, methylene, and methyl levels of oxidation (7, 26). Methanofuran (MFR), formerly the carbon dioxide reduction factor (16, 21), a novel furan-containing cofactor (15), carries  $C_1$  units at the formyl and possibly the carboxyl levels of oxidation (15a). Addition of these two newly described cofactors, CH<sub>3</sub>-S-CoM, and component B to cellfree extracts of M. thermoautotrophicum which have been depleted of low-molecular-weight cofactors restores the ability of these extracts to convert  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to methane (16). In addition, cell extracts of M. thermoautotrophicum readily convert the formyl derivative of MFR and the methenyl, methylene, and methyl derivatives of H4MPT to methane under appropriate conditions (7, 15a). Accordingly, a model for the complete reduction of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to methane has been proposed in which derivatives of these cofactors account for the carrier-bound  $C_1$  units of intermediate oxidation states (6). A simplified version of this model is shown in Fig. 1.

Data to support this model were obtained from studies of M. thermoautotrophicum. Here we present results which indicate that the proposed pathway is the common mechanism of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  reduction in methanogens. We assayed several representative methanogens for their ability to convert de-

rivatives of MFR and H4MPT to methane, and we assayed boiled cell extracts from a number of methanogenic and nonmethanogenic bacteria for the presence of MFR and H4MPT.

# MATERIALS AND METHODS

Analytical procedures. The presence of methane was determined with a Packard model 428 gas chromatograph equipped with <sup>a</sup> flame ionization detector and <sup>a</sup> Porapak Q (Supelco, Bellefonte, Pa.) column. The standard methanogenic assay (19) included 18  $\mu$ mol of potassium PIPES (1,4-piperazine-N,N'-bis[2-ethanesulfonic acid]) buffer at pH  $6.3$  or 6.6, 2.5  $\mu$ mol of magnesium acetate, 0.8  $\mu$ mol of sodium ATP, and additional components as specified in a final volume of 200  $\mu$ l. Protein was estimated by measuring the turbidity at 400 nm after precipitation in 20% trichloroacetic acid (13). Standards were prepared with bovine serum albumin.

Chemicals. All routinely used chemicals were reagent grade. CH<sub>3</sub>-S-CoM was synthesized as previously described (20); HS-CoM was purchased from MC/B Manufacturing Chemist, Inc., Cincinnati, Ohio. MFR and [formyl-14C] formyl-MFR were purified and prepared as described (16) and were gifts of John Leigh. H4MPT and methyl-H4MPT were purified and prepared as described (5, 7) and were gifts of Jorge Escalante-Semerena.

Organisms and growth conditions. The strict anaerobic procedures described by Balch et al. (1) were used for cultivation of methanogens. Methanobacterium bryantii M.o.H., Methanobacterium ruminantium Ml, Methanobrevibacter smithii PS, and Methanospirillum hungatei JF1 were cultured in medium <sup>1</sup> of Balch et al. (1) under an atmosphere of  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$ . Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum  $\Delta H$  was cultured in medium 2 of Balch et al. (1) under an atmosphere of  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$ . Methanococcus voltae PS was cultured in defined medium under an atmosphere of  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  as described by Whitman et al. (28). Methanococcus jannaschii JAL-1 was cultured in defined medium under an atmosphere of  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$ as described by Jones et al. (12). Methanosarcina barkeri 227 was cultured in the following medium (grams per liter except as noted):  $K_2HPO_4$ , 0.3;  $KH_2PO_4$ , 0.3;  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$ , 0.3; NaCl, 0.6; MgSO<sub>4</sub>  $\cdot$  7H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.13; CaCl<sub>2</sub>  $\cdot$  2H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.0008; FeSO<sub>4</sub>  $\cdot$  7H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.0003; NiCl<sub>2</sub>  $\cdot$  6H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.0005; Na<sub>2</sub>SeO<sub>4</sub>,

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author.

t Present address: School of Applied Biology, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA 30332.



FIG. 1. Scheme showing the role of cofactors in the  $C_1$  cycle of methanogenesis from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ . The (?) indicates that the coupling mechanism between the methylreductase system and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  activation (the RPG effect, see reference 10) is unknown.  $C_1$  carriers are labeled as follows:  $(HCO-)MFR$ , formyl-methanofuran;  $(HC\equiv)$  $H_4MPT^+$ , methenyl-H<sub>4</sub>MPT;  $(H_2C=)H_4MPT$ , methylene-H<sub>4</sub>MPT;  $(H_3C \rightarrow H_4MPT,$  methyl-H<sub>4</sub>MPT.

0.004; NaHCO<sub>3</sub>, 4.0; cysteine hydrochloride  $H_2O$ , 0.5;  $Na<sub>2</sub>S$ . 9H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.5; yeast extract (Difco Laboratories, Detroit, Mich.), 1.0; Trypticase (BBL Microbiology Systems, Cockeysville, Md.), 1.0; trace vitamin solution (1), 10 ml; and trace mineral solution (1), 10 ml. The final gas atmosphere was  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  (4:1). In some experiments, methanol (50 mM) or sodium acetate (100 mM) was added as <sup>a</sup> sterile solution, and the final gas atmosphere was  $N_2$  and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (4:1). Methanogenium marisnigri was cultured in medium 3 of Balch et al. (1) under an atmosphere of  $H_2$  and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ .

Halobacterium volcanii D52 was cultivated in a tryptoneyeast extract-salt medium as described by Mullakhanbhai and Larsen (18). Cells of Thermoproteus tenax DSM2078 were a gift of C. R. Woese (University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign) and were cultivated as described by Zillig et al. (30). Rhodopseudomonas sphaeroides 2.4.1 was cultivated photoautotrophically in the medium of Sistrom (24), without succinic acid, glutamic acid, and aspartic acid, and supplemented with 4.0 g of NaHCO<sub>3</sub> per liter under  $H_2$  and CO<sub>2</sub>. Cells of photoautotrophically grown Rhodospirillum rubrum (23) were a gift of F. C. Hartman (Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, Tenn.). Escherichia coli UB1005 was grown on tryptone-yeast extract.

Preparation of cell-free extracts and partially purified enzymes. Cell-free extracts of methanogens were prepared by the anaerobic procedures described previously (29). Harvested cells of M. thermoautotrophicum and Methanosarcina barkeri were washed and suspended in equal volumes of anoxic <sup>30</sup> mM TES buffer [N-tris(hydroxymethyl)methyl-2-aminoethanesulfonic acid; Ultrol brand, Calbiochem-Behring, La Jolla, Calif.] at pH 6.8, containing <sup>10</sup> mM 2-mercaptoethanol. Cells were broken by passage through a French pressure cell  $(1 \times 10^5 \text{ kPa})$ , and the resulting suspension was treated with approximately 0.1 mg of DNase per g of cells. After removal of cell debris by centrifugation at 40,000  $\times$  g for 20 min, the supernatant solution was stored at  $4^{\circ}$ C under N<sub>2</sub> (100 kPa). Cell-free extracts of Methanococcus jannaschii, Methanococcus voltae, and Methanogenium marisnigri were prepared similarly except that cells were broken by osmotic shock in 30 mM TES buffer (pH 6.8) plus <sup>10</sup> mM 2-mercaptoethanol.

Certain extracts were freed of MFR and H4MPT by passage through a column (2.5 by 95 cm) of Sephadex G-25 (superfine) equilibrated with anoxic buffer that contained 50 mM Tris-hydrochloride (pH 7.2), <sup>20</sup> mM magnesium acetate, <sup>10</sup> mM 2-mercaptoethanol, <sup>1</sup> mM dithiothreitol, and 10% glycerol. Fractions of the eluate were collected anaerobically (9), and those determined to be free of MFR and  $H_4MPT$ , based on their inability to reduce  $CO_2$  to methane without the addition of both cofactors, were pooled and stored at  $-20^{\circ}$ C under an atmosphere of N<sub>2</sub> (100 kPa). Extract prepared in this manner is referred to as G-25 treated extract. Partially purified methenyl-H4MPT oxidoreductase was prepared by ammonium sulfate fractionation as described previously (7).

Preparation of anaerobic boiled cell-free extracts. Harvested cells of each bacterium tested were suspended in anoxic 20 mM  $KH_2PO_4$  buffer that contained 10 mM 2mercaptoethanol at pH 6.8; the ratio of packed wet cells to buffer was 1.0. In most cases, approximately 10 to 20 g (wet weight) of cell paste was used. Cells were extracted under anaerobic conditions by heating for approximately 30 min in a boiling water bath while passing a stream of  $O_2$ -free  $N_2$ over the slurry with gentle mixing. Cell debris was removed by centrifugation at  $40,000 \times g$  at  $4^{\circ}$ C for 25 min. The anoxic supernatant solution was stored anaerobically in butyl-rubber-stoppered serum vials under N<sub>2</sub> (100 kPa) at  $-20^{\circ}$ C. Deproteinated cell extracts of Methanococcus jannaschii were prepared by autoclaving the anoxic cell-buffer slurry at 121°C for <sup>5</sup> min followed by centrifugation or by methanol (60% final concentration) precipitation after cell breakage with a French pressure cell  $(10<sup>5</sup>$  kPa); the anoxic supernatant solution remaining after centrifugation of the methanolprecipitated cell extract was lyophilized to dryness, suspended in anoxic H<sub>2</sub>O, and stored at  $-20^{\circ}$ C under N<sub>2</sub> (100) kPa).

Methane formation from radiolabeled formyl-MFR. In the presence of H4MPT and CH3-S-CoM, G-25-treated extracts of *M. thermoautotrophicum* convert  $[formyl<sup>-14</sup>C]$ formyl-MFR to  $[14C]$ methane (15a). Cell extracts of other methanogens were tested for their ability to produce radiolabeled methane from this derivative. The standard methanogenic assay described above was prepared on ice and contained 200 nmol of  $CH<sub>3</sub>$ -S-CoM and 1 to 3 mg of extract protein under an atmosphere of hydrogen. [formyl-<sup>14</sup>C]formyl-MFR (4,160 dpm; specific activity, approximately 2 mCi per mmol) was added, and the assays were initiated by incubation at 37°C or, in the case of Methanococcus jannaschii, at 60°C. Upon completion of methane formation, the reactions were terminated by transferring the vials to ice, and 60  $\mu$ l of 4 M sodium hydroxide was added. After shaking gently for 20 min to allow any radioactive  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to be trapped in the aqueous phase, the gas phase was assayed for radioactivity with a Packard model 894 gas proportional counter linked to a gas chromatograph as described earlier (15a). Duplicate 0.5-ml samples were taken, and in the case of the second sample, the measured radioactivity was adjusted for the volume of gas removed. Radioactivity in the aqueous phase was determined by liquid scintillation counting with toluene-Triton X-100 (3:1) containing 0.6% 2,5-diphenyloxazole.

Methane formation from methyl-H4MPT. Conversion of methyl-H4MPT to methane was assayed by incubating cell

extracts of methanogens (3 mg of protein) in the standard methanogenic assay at pH 6.3 supplemented with 50  $\mu$ l of anoxic boiled cell extract of M. thermoautotrophicum and various amounts of either CH3-S-CoM or methyl-H4MPT. Reaction mixtures were incubated at 37°C for mesophilic methanogens and 60°C for thermophiles.

Assay for MFR. The amount of MFR in anoxic boiled cell-free extracts was estimated by evaluating the dependence of the yield of methane production from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  on the amount of boiled cell-free extract added to a methanogenic assay (16). The standard methanogenic assay was prepared as described above at pH 6.6 and included 0.2  $\mu$ mol of CH3-S-CoM, 52 nmol of of H4MPT, and 0.6 to 0.8 mg of protein of Sephadex G-25-treated cell extract of M. thermoautotrophicum. MFR or anaerobic boiled cell-free extract of various organisms was added as desired. Assay vials were gassed with  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  (4:1), and assays were initiated by incubating the vials at 60°C. CH<sub>3</sub>-S-CoM rather than HS-CoM was included in the assay due to the tight coupling of the reduction of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to  $CH<sub>4</sub>$  with the reduction of  $CH_3$ -S-CoM; in the absence of  $CH_3$ -S-CoM, no reduction of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to  $CH<sub>4</sub>$  was observed, whereas in its presence additional CH4 was formed above the amount attributable to the reduction of  $CH_3$ -S-CoM  $(10, 21, 22)$ . The additional methane formed from the reduction of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  reflected the amount of MFR added. In the presence of saturating amounts of  $H_4MPT$ , the yield of methane from  $CO_2$  was hyperbolically dependent upon the amount of MFR present (16). This saturable phenomenon is amenable to analysis by linear regression of the reciprocal of the yield of methane from CO<sub>2</sub> against the reciprocal of added MFR or anoxic boiled cell extract. Analysis of the response to purified MFR of G-25-treated extract of M. thermoautotrophicum used in our experiments indicated that  $0.55 \mu g$  of MFR produced one-half of the maximal stimulation of the conversion of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ to methane. As an estimate of the amount of MFR in extracts, the volume of boiled cell-free extract which produced one-half the maximal stimulation was assumed to contain  $0.55 \mu g$  of MFR.

TABLE 1. Methanogenesis from [formyl-'4C]formyl-MFR by cellfree extracts of methanogens<sup>a</sup>

Organism <sup>b</sup>	Disintegrations per minute		$\%$ CH.
	Gaseous	Aqueous	(gaseous)
Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum	3,403	773	81
<b>Methanobacterium</b> bryantii	3.532	414	90
<b>Methanococcus</b> iannaschii	3.225	474	87
Methanospirillum hungatei	3.169	1.098	74
Methanogenium marisnigri	3,383	343	91
Methanosarcina barkeri	3.593	1.209	75

<sup>a</sup> Methanogenic assays included 18  $\mu$ mol of potassium PIPES (pH 6.6), 2.5  $\mu$ mol of magnesium acetate, 0.8  $\mu$ mol of sodium ATP, 20  $\mu$ l of anoxic boiled cell extract of M. thermoautotrophicum,  $0.2 \mu$ mol of CH<sub>3</sub>-S-CoM, and 1 to 3 mg of cell extract protein in 220  $\mu$ l under an atmosphere of H<sub>2</sub>. Methane formed from [formyl-<sup>14</sup>C]formyl-MFR was determined as gaseous radioactivity after the injection of 60  $\mu$ l of 4 M sodium hydroxide as described in the text. In the absence of cell extract, no radioactive gas was produced.

 $b$  All organisms were grown on  $H_2$  and CO<sub>2</sub>.

TABLE 2. Methanogenesis from methyl-H4MPT by cell-free extracts of methanogens

Organism <sup>a</sup>	Substrate added (nmol)		CH <sub>4</sub> formed
	$CH3-S-CoM$	methyl-H <sub>4</sub> MPT	$(nmol)^b$
Methanobacterium	200	0	213
thermoautotrophicum	400		389
		60	45
	0	120	93
Methanococcus voltae	100		92
	200	0	180
	0	50	46
	0	100	80
Methanococcus jannaschii	200	0	180
	0	100	91
Methanosarcina barkeri			
Acetate grown	200	Λ	176
		50	42
		100	85
Methanol grown	200	o	181
	0	50	44
		100	91
	400	200	525

<sup>a</sup> Methanogens were cultivated under  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  unless otherwise indicated. Cell-free extracts were prepared as described in the text.

Final yields of CH<sub>4</sub> were obtained after 2 h of incubation. The assay mixture (200  $\mu$ l) was prepared as described (7) and contained 18  $\mu$ mol of potassium PIPES buffer (pH 6.3), 2.5  $\mu$ mol of magnesium acetate, 0.8  $\mu$ mol of sodium ATP, 50  $\mu$ l of boiled cell extract of M. thermoautotrophicum, 4 mg of cell extract, and CH3-S-CoM or methyl-H4MPT as indicated under an atmosphere of  $H_2$ . The assay temperature was 37°C; for M. thermoautotrophicum and Methanococcus jannaschii, the assay temperature was 60°C. Values are corrected for amount of CH<sub>4</sub> formed in the absence of added substrates.

Assay for H4MPT. The spectrophotometric assay described by Escalante-Semerena et al. (7) was used in most experiments to estimate the amount of H4MPT in anoxic boiled cell-free extracts from various bacteria. The assay involves the chemical reaction of H4MPT with formaldehyde to generate methylene-H4MPT, which is enzymatically oxidized to methenyl-H4MPT, with a consequent increase in absorbance at 340 nm. Dialyzed supernatant solution of a 70% ammonium sulfate fractionation of cell-free extract of M. thermoautotrophicum was used as a source of enzyme for the conversion of methylene-H4MPT to methenyl-H4MPT. Methenyl-H4MPT has an extinction coefficient at 340 nm of 20,800  $M^{-1}$  cm<sup>-1</sup> (7). Reactions were performed at  $60^{\circ}$ C.

Boiled cell-free extracts of certain methanogens were tested as sources of H4MPT by a modification of the enzymatic assay described above for measuring MFR. H<sub>4</sub>MPT was excluded from the assay mixture, and a saturating amount of MFR  $(4.0 \mu g)$  was added. By use of purified H4MPT, it was established that the half-maximal stimulation of the yield of methane from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  occurred in the presence of  $2.9 \mu g$  of H<sub>4</sub>MPT.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Cell extracts of all methanogens tested converted [formyl-14C]formyl-MFR to radioactive methane in the presence of  $CH<sub>3</sub>$ -S-CoM (Table 1). Thus, as established for M. thermoautotrophicum, the N-formyl derivative of MFR is <sup>a</sup> precursor of methane in all methanogens tested under the conditions normally required for the conversion of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to methane (10). In the case of M. thermoautotrophicum, Leigh et al. (1Sa) demonstrated that the conversion of formyl-MFR to methane by G-25-treated extract required the addition of methanopterin, and we showed that other methanogens

	Concn (nmol per mg [dry weight] of cells) of:		
Organism (growth substrate) <sup><i>a</i></sup>	$H_4MPT^b$	MFR <sup>c</sup>	
Methanogens			
Methanobacteriaceae			
Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum $\Delta H$	3.0	1.8	
Methanobacterium bryantii M.o.H.	1.3	1.8	
Methanobacterium ruminantium M1	2.2	3.1	
Methanobrevibacter smithii PS	1.9	1.4	
Methanococcaceae			
Methanococcus voltae PS	1.3	0.7	
Methanococcus jannaschii JAL-1	9.6	2.7	
Methanomicrobiaceae			
Methanospirillum hungatei JF1	0	0.7	
Methanogenium marisnigri	1.7	0.8	
Methanosarcinaceae			
Methanosarcina barkeri 227 $(H_2 + CO_2)$	2.8	1.7	
(acetate)	2.1	2.5	
(methanol)	7.4	2.1	
Nonmethanogenic archaebacteria			
Thermoproteus tenax $DSM2078$ (glucose + yeast extract)	$\bf{0}$	$\bf{0}$	
<i>Halobacterium volcanii</i> D52 (tryptone $+$ yeast extract)	$\mathbf{0}$	$\mathbf{0}$	
Eubacteria			
Rhodopseudomonas sphaeroides 2.4.1	0	0	
Rhodospirillum rubrum	0	$\bf{0}$	
<i>Escherichia coli</i> (tryptone $+$ yeast extract)	0	0	

TABLE 3. Amounts of H<sub>4</sub>MPT and MFR in methanogens, nonmethanogenic archaebacteria, and eubacteria

<sup>a</sup> Cells were cultivated with  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  (4:1) unless otherwise stated.

 $<sup>b</sup>$  Estimated spectrophotometrically by enzymatic conversion to methenyl-H<sub>4</sub>MPT (see the text).</sup>

 $\epsilon$  Estimated by the stimulation of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  conversion to methane as described in the text.

contain H4MPT, as described below. Cell extracts of representative methanogens also converted methyl- $H_4MPT$  to methane under a hydrogen atmosphere (Table 2). Near stoichiometric conversion of this derivative to methane was catalyzed by members of each order of methanogenic bacteria. Thus, the enzyme systems of other methanogens recognize and interconvert  $C_1$  derivatives of the cofactors isolated from M. thermoautotrophicum, providing yields of methane comparable to those produced by extracts of M. thermoautotrophicum (7, 15a).

The model (Fig. 1) is further supported by our observation that boiled cell extracts of all methanogens tested, with one exception, were able to complement an enzyme system from M. thermoautotrophicum which required MFR or H4MPT. Thus, these extracts contain MFR and H4MPT or, possibly, modified forms of the cofactors which are recognized by the enzymes of M. thermoautotrophicum that are involved in the conversion of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to methane. We calculated that the concentrations of these cofactors were comparable in all methanogens tested (Table 3). H4MPT levels in eight strains ranged from 1.3 to 3.4 nmol of  $H_4MPT$  per mg (dry weight) of cells, with two strains, Methanosarcina barkeri grown on methanol and Methanococcus jannaschii, possessing significantly higher levels of the cofactor, 7.4 and 9.6 nmol per mg (dry weight) of cells, respectively. MFR occurred at slightly lower concentrations, ranging from 0.7 to 3.1 nmol per mg (dry weight) of cells. However, H4MPT was present at higher levels in <sup>7</sup> out of the <sup>10</sup> strains tested. No H4MPT was detected in Methanospirillum hungatei, although this organism produces methane from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and converts formyl-MFR to methane (Table 1). We do not have <sup>a</sup> convincing explanation for the failure to detect this cofactor in boiled cell extract of this strain. Possibly H4MPT is tightly bound to protein or the method of extract preparation failed to yield

biologically active cofactor from these cells. However, H4MPT was detected in normal leyels in Methanogenium marisnigri, a member of the same family, Methanomicrobiaceae, as Methanospirillum hungatei (reference 1, Table 3).

The levels of the cofactors determined in this study approximate the yields reported for the isolation of the purified cofactors from M. thermoautotrophicum  $\Delta H$  (5, 14; J. C. Escalante-Semerena, personal communication). In both cases about 50 to 70 mg of cofactor was isolated from <sup>1</sup> kg of wet cells. We determined that the dry weight of M. thermoautotrophicum was 27% of the wet weight. Thus, based on molecular weights of 776 for H4MPT and 748 for MFR, <sup>1</sup> kg of wet cells of M. thermoautotrophicum would be expected to contain approximately 630 mg of H4MPT and 360 mg of MFR. The reported purifications of cofactors therefore represent recoveries between 10 and 15%, based on the data of this study.

Consistent with the unique structures of the two cofactors and their role in a novel pathway of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation, we were unable to detect MFR or H4MPT in extracts from several nonmethanogenic bacteria (Table 3). For both cofactors, amounts as low as 0.1 nmol per mg (dry weight) of cells would be readily detected by the assays employed. The strains tested included two nonmethanogenic archaebacteria, T. tenax and H. volcanii, two phototrophic organisms grown on  $H_2$  plus  $CO_2$ , Rhodospirillum rubrum and Rhodopseudomonas sphaeroides, and the enteric E. coli.

Differences in the levels of cofactors among the different methanogen strains are of dubious physiological significance; a more likely explanation is that these differences simply reflect variation in the extraction of the cofactors by boiling. Anaerobic boiled cell extract of methanol-grown Methanosarcina barkeri was previously reported to contain considerably higher than average amounts of HS-CoM (2),

and similarly, we found that it possessed high levels of H<sub>4</sub>MPT, compared with other methanogens. H<sub>4</sub>MPT was not detected in Methanococcus jannaschii with the spectrophotometric assay, but its presence could be quantified by assaying the ability of boiled cell-free extract to sustain  $H_4MPT$ -dependent methanogenesis from  $CO_2$  with M. thermoautotrophicum G-25 enzyme. As Methanococcus jannaschii is an extreme thermophile (12), it is possible that some enzymes survived the 100°C deproteination procedure used to prepare the extract and that these enzymes interfered with the accumulation of methenyl-H4MPT in the spectrophotometric assay.

The apparent presence of both H4MPT and MFR in Methanosarcina barkeri grown on either acetate or methanol is of considerable interest. In neither case does the organism need to convert  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to methane to grow, and the occurrence of both cofactors in normal or above normal amounts might be interpreted as being inconsistent with their proposed essential role in methanogenesis from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ . A simple explanation is that the biosynthesis of the cofactors may not be regulated. More interesting, however, is the possibility that, in addition to methanogenesis from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , both cofactors participate in other essential metabolic processes. Tetrahydrofolate functions as a  $C_1$  carrier in several important biosynthetic reactions in nonmethanogenic bacteria (4) and is not found in the methanogens (14). It is reasonable to anticipate that in methanogens H4MPT functions analogously to tetrahydrofolate and mediates  $C_1$  transfers involved in purine and thymine biosynthesis and in acetate formation, the principle mechanism of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  assimilation in methanogens (8). Additionally, the cofactors may be directly involved in the acetoclastic reactions by which the methyl carbon of acetate is reduced to methane and the carboxyl group is converted to CO<sub>2</sub>. Further studies are essential to determine the possible roles and importance of H4MPT and MFR in these metabolic processes.

Regardless of the possible roles of H4MPT and MFR in synthetic reactions in methanogens, our data strongly support their role in the conversion of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to methane. Enzymes from all methanogens tested converted derivatives of the cofactors isolated from M. thermoautotrophicum to methane. Conversely, cofactors present in extracts of all methanogens tested, with one exception, complemented MFR- and H4MPT-dependent enzymes of M. thermoautotrophicum. Thus, the proposed pathway of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ reduction to methane (Fig. 1) appears to be common to methanogens.

### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by grant DE-ACO2-80ER10681 from the U.S. Department of Energy.

We thank Victor Gabriel for assistance in culture of the organisms, J, Leigh and J. C. Escalante-Semerena for samples of MFR and H4MPT as well as for helpful discussions, and F. C. Hartman and C. R. Woese for the cultures indicated.

#### LITERATURE CITED

- 1. Balch, W. E., G. E. Fox, L. J. Magrum, C. R. Woese, and R. S. Wolfe. 1979. Methanogens: reevaluation of a unique biological group. Microbiol. Rev. 43:260-296.
- 2. Balch, W. E., and R. S. Wolfe. 1979. Specificity and biological distribution of coenzyme M (2-mercaptoethanesulfonic acid). J. Bacteriol. 137:256-263.
- 3. Barker, H. A. 1956. Bacterial fermentations. John Wiley & Sons, Inc., New York.
- 4. Blackley, R. L. 1969. The biochemistry of folic acid and related pteridines. North-Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam.
- 5. Escalante-Semerena, J. C., J. A. Leigh, K. L. Rinehart, Jr., and R. S. Wolfe. 1984. Formaldehyde activation factor, tetrahydromethanopterin, a coenzyme of methanogenesis. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 81:1976-1980.
- 6. Escalante-Semerena, J. C., J, A. Leigh, and R. S. Wolfe. 1984. New insights into the biochemistry of methanogenesis from  $H_2$ and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , p. 191–198. In R. L. Crawford and R. S. Hanson (ed.), Microbial growth on  $C_1$  compounds. Proceedings of the 4th International Symposium. American Society for Microbiology, Washington, D.C.
- 7. Escalante-Semerena, J. C., K. L. Rinehart, Jr., and R. S. Wolfe. 1984. Tetrahydrometbanopterin, a carbon carrier in methanogenesis. J. Biol. Chem. 259:9447-9455.
- 8. Fuchs, G., and E. Stupperich. 1980. Acetyl CoA, a central intermediate of autotrophic  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation in Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum. Arch. Micobiol. 127:267-272.
- 9. Gunsalus, R. P., S. M. Tandon, and R. S. Wolfe. 1980. A procedure for anaerobic column chromatography employing an anaerobic Freter-type chamber. Anal. Biochem. 101:327-331.
- 10. Gunsalus, R. P., and R. S. Wolfe. 1977. Stimulation of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ reduction to methane by methyl coenzyme M in extracts of Methanobacterium. Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun. 76:790-795.
- 11. Gunsalus, R. P., and R. S. Wolfe. 1980. Methyl coenzyme M reductase from Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum. J. Biol. Chem. 255:1891-1895.
- 12. Jones, W. J., J. A. Leigh, F. Mayer, C. R. Woese, and R. S. Wolfe. 1983. Methanococcus jannaschii sp. nov., an extremely thermophilic methanogen from <sup>a</sup> submarine hydrothermal vent. Arch. Microbiol. 136:254-261.
- 13. Kunitz, M. J. 1952. Crystalline inorganic pyrophosphatase isolated from baker's yeast. J. Gen. Physiol. 35:423-450.
- 14. Leigh, J. A. 1983.. Levels of water-soluble vitamins in methanogenic and non-methanogenic bacteria. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 45:800-803.
- 15. Leigh, J. A., K. L. Rinehart, Jr., and R. S. Wolfe. 1984. Structure of methanofuran, the carbon dioxide reduction factor of Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 106:3636-3640.
- 15a.Leigh, J. A., K. L. Rinehart, Jr., and R. S. Wolfe. 1985. Methanofuran (carbon dioxide reduction factor), a formyl carrier in methane production from carbon dioxide in Methanobacterium. Biochemistry 24:995-999.
- 16. Leigh, J. A., and R. S. Wolfe. 1983. Carbon dioxide reduction factor and methanopterin, two coenzymes required for  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ reduction to methane by extracts of Methanobacterium. J. Biol. Chem. 258:7536-7540.
- 17. McBride, B. C., and R. S. Wolfe. 1971. A new coenzyme of methyl transfer, coenzyme M. Biochemistry 10:2317-2324.
- 18. Mullakhanbhai, M. F., and H. Larsen. 1975. Halobacterium volcanii spec. nov., a Dead Sea halobacterium with moderate salt requirement. Arch. Microbiol. 104:207-214.
- 19. Nagle, D. P., Jr., and R. S. Wolfe. 1983. Component A of the methyl coenzyme M methylreductase system of Methanobacterium: resolution into four components. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 80:2151-2155.
- 20. Romesser, J. A., and W. E. Balch. 1980. Coenzyme M. Preparation and assay. Methods Enzymol. 67:545-552.
- 21. Romesser, J. A., and R. S. Wolfe. 1982. CDR factor, <sup>a</sup> new coenzyme required for carbon dioxide reduction to methane by extracts of Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum. Zentralbl. Bakteriol. Mikrobiol. Hyg. <sup>1</sup> Abt. Orig. C 3:271-276.
- 22. Romesser, J. A., and R. S. Wolfe. 1982. Coupling of methyl coenzyme M reduction with carbon dioxide activation in extracts of Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum. J. Bacteriol. 152:840-847.
- 23. Schloss, J. V., E. F. Phares, M. V. Long, I. L. Norton, C. D. Stringer, and F. C. Hartman. 1979. Isolation, characterization, and crystallization of ribulosebisphophate carboxylase from autotrophically grown Rhodospirillum rubrum. J. Bacteriol. 137:490-501.
- 24. Sistrom, W. R. 1962. The kinetics of the synthesis of photopigments in Rhodopseudomonas sphaeroides. J. Gen. Microbiol.

28:607-616.

- 25. Taylor, C. D., and R. S. Wolfe. 1974. Structure and methylation of coenzyme M. J. Biol. Chem. 249:4879-4885.
- 26. Van Beelen, P., R. M. deCock, W. Guit, C. A. G. Haasnoot, and G. D. Vogels. 1984. Isolation and identification of 5,10-methenyl-5,6,7,8-tetrahydromethanopterin, a coenzyme involved in methanogenesis. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 21:159-163.
- 27. Van Beelen, P., A. P. M. Stassen, J. W. G. Bosch, G. D. Vogels, W. Guijt, and C. A. G. Haasnoot. 1984. Elucidation of the structure of methanopterin, a coenzyme from Methanobacterium thermoautotrophicum, using two-dimensional nuclear magnetic resonance techniques. Eur. J. Biochem.

138:563-571.

- 28. Whitman, W. B., E. Ankwanda, and R. S. Wolfe. 1982. Nutrition and carbon metabolism of Methanococcus voltae. J. Bacteriol. 149:852-863.
- 29. Whitman, W. B., and R. S. Wolfe. 1983. Activation of the methylreductase system from Methanobacterium bryantii by ATP. J. Bacteriol. 154:640-649.
- 30. Zillig, W., K. 0. Stetter, W. Schafer, D. Janekovic, S. Wunderl, I. Holz, and P. Palm. 1981. Thermoproteales: a novel type of extremely thermoacidophilic anaerobic archaebacteria isolated from Icelandic solfataras. Zentralbl. Bakteriol. Mikrobiol. Hyg. <sup>1</sup> Abt. Orig. C 2:205-227.