Identification of a Rhizobium meliloti pSym2011 Region Controlling the Host Specificity of Root Hair Curling and Nodulation

GEORGES TRUCHET,¹ FRÉDÉRIC DEBELLÉ,² JACQUES VASSE,¹ BETTY TERZAGHI,²† ANNE-MARIE GARNERONE,² CHARLES ROSENBERG,² JACQUES BATUT,² FABIENNE MAILLET,² AND JEAN DÉNARIÉ^{2*}
Laboratoire de Biologie de la Différ

Marseille Cedex 9, France,¹ and Laboratoire de Biologie Moléculaire des Relations Plantes-Microorganismes, Centre
National de la Recherche Scientifique-Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique, Groupement Scientifiq Microbiologie Toulouse, BP 27, 31326 Castanet-Tolosan Cedex, France²

Received 24 June 1985/Accepted 6 September 1985

In Rhizobium meliloti 2011 nodulation genes (nod) required to nodulate specifically alfalfa are located on a pSym megaplasmid. Nod⁻ derivatives carrying large pSym deletions were isolated. By complementation of these strains with in vivo- and in vitro-constructed episomes containing pSym of sequences and introduction of these episomes into *Agrobacterium tumefaciens*, we show (i) that from a region of pSym of about 360 kilobases, genes required for specific alfalfa nodulation are clustered in a DNA fragment of less than 30 kilobases and (that a nod region located between nifHDK and the common nod genes is absolutely required for alfalfa nodulation and controls the specificity of root hair curling and nodule organogenesis initiation.

Rhizobium strains are soil bacteria which induce the formation of nodules on the roots of leguminous hosts, in which they fix nitrogen. The induction of nodule organogenesis is specific: a Rhizobium strain can generally form root nodules with a limited range of plants, e.g., Rhizobium meliloti strains with species of Medicago, Melilotus, and Trigonella, or Rhizobium trifolii with Trifolium species (38). In Medicago sativa-R. meliloti symbiosis the developmental steps leading to the initiation of nodule formation can be divided schematically as follows: attachment to root hairs, root hair curling, formation of infection threads within root hairs, growth of the threads toward the inner cortex of the root, initiation of a nodule meristem in the inner root cortex, and nodule organogenesis (17, 19, 29, 39, 40). This multistep process is likely to be controlled by both host and bacterial genes (for reviews, see references 41 and 43). Whether host specificity is involved for each of the early steps or only for some is not known (26).

The formation of shepherd's crooks (i.e., marked root hair curling) on root hairs (43) is considered to be a very specific host reaction to infection by the compatible bacteria (45). In R. meliloti it has been shown that genes controlling alfalfa root hair curling are located on a pSym megaplasmid (2, 19, $27, 30$) of about $1,500$ kilobase pairs (kb) (7) . In R. meliloti 2011 insertional mutations that simultaneously alter root hair curling and nodulation have been mapped at about 25 kb from the nitrogenase genes (21, 24). These nod mutations, which can be complemented not only by the corresponding wild-type sequences from R. meliloti (27) but also by nodulation genes from other Rhizobium species (16), can be defined as altering common nod genes (16, 18, 25).

Indeed, DNA sequencing studies recently have revealed ^a considerable degree of homology between the common nod genes from R . meliloti (37) and R hizobium leguminosarum (32). Transfer of R. meliloti pSym genes into Agrobacterium tumefaciens enables this bacterium to induce nodule formation on alfalfa roots (20, 24, 39, 44) but not on clover (18, 39), demonstrating that genes coding for nodule initiation and host range specificity are also located on pSym.

In this report, we describe the isolation of Nod^- derivatives of strain ²⁰¹¹ which carry large deletions in pSym. Complementation studies of these strains with in vivo- and in vitro-constructed episomes containing pSym sequences and introduction of these episomes into A. tumefaciens showed that (i) genes required for alfalfa nodulation are clustered in a DNA fragment of less than 30 kb, (ii) a nod region located between nifHDK and the common nod genes described previously (27) is absolutely required for alfalfa root hair curling and nodulation, and (iii) sequences located in this new nod region control the specificity of root hair curling and nodule organogenesis initiation.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Bacterial strains and plasmids. Bacterial strains and plasmids used in this study are shown in Table 1. A. tumefaciens GMI9050 is ^a spontaneous streptomycin resistant (100 μ g/ml) and rifampin-resistant (100 μ g/ml) derivative of C58C1. The Nod⁻ mutants were characterized as R. meliloti 2011 derivatives by sensitivity tests with the specific bacteriophage π 1. Escherichia coli, Rhizobium, and Agrobacterium strains were grown as described previously (30). Phage sensitivity tests were performed by the double-layer technique on yeast extract-mannitol C medium (6).

Mating conditions. Donor and recipient strains were grown in, TY liquid medium (4) to mid-log phase, mixed in equal volumes, and incubated overnight on ^a TY agar plate, directly in the case of spot mating, or after collection on a filter membrane. E. coli and R.meliloti crosses resulting in the insertion of Tn7 into pSym2011 have been described elsewhere (23) . For the introduction of plasmids into R. meliloti and A. tumefaciens, E. coli donor strains (GMI3180, GMI3540, 803, and HB101) were counterselected with 100 μ g of streptomycin per ml, 100 μ g of rifampin per ml, or 100 µg of spectinomycin per ml. Transfer of pRmSL26, pGMI515, pGMI149, and pIJ1089 was selected with 10 μ g of

^{*} Corresponding author.

^t Present address: Plant Physiology Division, Division of Scientific and Industrial Research, Private Bag, Palmerston North, New Zealand.

^a On M. sativa cv. Gemini.

 b See Fig. 2 and 4.</sup>

^c Tn7, Sp^r Sm^r Tp^r.
^d Tn5, Nm^r Sm^r.

 $\overline{}$

 ϵ See Fig. 2.

 f See Fig. 4.

tetracycline per ml for R . meliloti and $4 \mu g$ of tetracycline per ml for A. tumefaciens. Transfer of pGMI42 and pGMI71 was selected with 100 μ g of neomycin per ml for R. meliloti and 100μ g of kanamycin per ml for A. tumefaciens. Transfer of pRmSL26, pIJ1089, and' pGMI149 was achieved by triparental crosses with E. *coli* HB101 carrying the pRK2013 helper plasmid (11).

Plant assays. Seeds of Medicago sativa cv. Gemini were obtained from Tourneur Frères (F77120 Coulommiers, France) $;$ seeds of Trifolium repens cv. Ladino and cv. Louisiana Nolin were a gift from F. B. Dazzo (East Lansing, Mich,). For nodulation tests, seeds were surface sterilized an'd germinated, and the seedlings were aseptically grown ih

test tubes on Jensen nitrogen-free agar slants (42). Twenty plants were used for each treatment.

For microscopy, seeds germinated for 36 h were transferred onto Fahraeus agar plates (14) in square Petri dishes (23 by 23 cm; eight plants per dish). Five days later seedlings were inoculated with a suspension of bacteria (approximately 10^8 /ml) grown for 48 h on TY agar medium. Root hairs were observed by 3, 5, 7, 10, and 14' days after inoculation on seedlings previously transferred between a slide and a cover slip and stained with 0.01% methylene blue in liquid Fahraeus medium as described previously (40). For each of the three parameters studied (the bacterial strain, the host, and the time after inoculation at which root hairs were observed) the whole root system of a minimum of 12 plants was observed. Light and electron microscopy of root deformations were performed as described previously (39). Anatomical studies of root deformations were also performed on sections (50 μ m) of fixed and frozen plant material (Cryomicrotome Frigipel; Decimu, Paris).

General DNA techniques. The in-gel lysis method of Eckhardt (13) as modified by Rosenberg et al (31) was used, and plasmid content was determined by electrophoresis on 0.7 or 0.5% agarose gels. For preparative isolation, plasmid DNA was separated from chromosomal DNA by the cleared lysate technique (8) for pGMI160 and by alkaline denaturation (22) for pGMI42, pGMI71, and pGMI149. Plasmid DNA was purified in ^a cesium chloride-ethidium bromide density gradient (65,000 rpm in a VTI80 Beckman rotor for 4 h).

Total DNA from R. meliloti was prepared as follows (T. Huguet, personal communication). Cells from a 10-ml stationary-phase culture in TY medium were incubated for ²⁰ min at 20°C in 3.8 ml of the following mixture: ²⁵ mM Tris hydrochloride (pH 8.0), ¹⁰ mM EDTA, ⁵⁰ mM sucrose, ² mg of lysozyme (Sigma Chemical Co., St. Louis, Mo.) per ml (5). Bacteria were lysed by adding 0.2 ml of 20% (wt/vol) Sarkosyl (CIBA-GEIGY Corp., Summit, N.J.). The lysate was added to 4.32 g of cesium chloride and 0.1 ml of ethidium bromide (15 mg/ml). After centrifugation (65,000 rpm in ^a VTI80 Beckman rotor for ¹² h) the DNA band was recovered and extracted with salt-satured isopropanol before ethanol precipitation. Digestions were performed in UREB restriction buffer (33).

Transfer of DNA to ^a Biodyne membrane was as recommended by the manufacturer (Pall). DNA was labeled with $[\alpha^{-32}P]$ dCTP (3,200 Ci/mmol) using a nick-translation kit (New England Nuclear Corp., Boston, Mass.). Hybridizations were carried out at 41°C for 24 h in $2 \times$ SSC ($1 \times$ SSC is 0.15 M NaCl plus 0.015 M sodium citrate)-50% (vol/vol) formamide. Filters were washed three times in $2 \times$ SSC-0.2% (wt/vol) sodium dodecyl sulfate at 65°C and three times in $0.1 \times$ SSC at room temperature.

Construction of episomes. The pGMI71 episome was constructed by in vivo cloning of a 70-kb pSym insert into RP4 by the method used previously to construct pGMI42 (23). In spite of its size, this episome was shown to be stable in E. coli as well as in R . meliloti. pGMI515 is one of the plasmids constructed by subcloning of pGMI42 DNA, after partial HindIII digestion, into the HindIII site of pGMI500; pGMI500 is a derivative of the self-transmissible RP4 plasmid which no longer carries an EcoRI site (3). Physical characterization of pGMI515 was done by comparing the HindIII digestion patterns of pGMI515 and pGMI42. The cloned HindIII fragments were found to be adjacent on the pSym map (3). pGMI149 was generated by subcloning pGMI71 DNA, after partial EcoRI digestion, into the EcoRI site of pRK290 (F. Debellé, F. Maillet, J. Dénarié, E. Martinez, C. Rosenberg, J. Vasse, and G. Truchet, manuscript in preparation).

RESULTS

Isolation of Nod⁻ mutants, pGMI42 is an RP4-prime plasmid which contains a 290-kb insert of pSym2011 (23). It carries sequences required for specific nodulation of alfalfa (39). In a previous study we have reported the use of this episome to mutagenize the corresponding pSym2011 region (the ⁴² region) with transposon Tn7 (23). Bacteriophage Mu was inserted into the RP4 region of pGMI42 to generate a

FIG. 1. Electrophoretic characterization of megaplasmids of symbiotically defective R . meliloti mutants in 0.5% agarose gels. Lane A, strain GM1956; lane B, GM1255; lane C, the wild-type R. meliloti 2011 strain; lane D, GMI963; lane E, GM1766; lane F, the A. tumefaciens GMI9050 strain with ^a plasmid of ⁴¹⁰ kb. In lanes A through E, the upper bands correspond to the cryptic megaplasmid (35); the lower bands correspond to the pSym megaplasmid.

suicide vector (23) . The resulting pGMI42::Mu hybrid (pGMI104) was mutagenized with $Tn\bar{z}$ in E. coli by mating strain GMI3506(pGMI104) with strain GM13232. The resulting population of E. coli GM13232 (pGMI104::Tn7) transconjugants was then mated with R , meliloti 2011 (experiment 1). Among 793 Tn7-containing R. meliloti 2011 transconjugants 3 Nod⁻ and 10 Fix⁻ mutants were isolated. The *nod* mutations were located in the 42 region of pSym since the introduction of pGMI42 restored the Nod' phenotype.

In a second similar experiment (experiment 2) the proportion of symbiotically defective mutants obtained was much higher: 20 Nod⁻ and 8 Fix⁻ mutants among the 115 Tn7containing transconjugants tested. It has been observed that in the E. coli Rec^+ donor strains GMI3506 and GMI3232 deletions into the pSym insert of pGMI104 occur frequently (T. Huguet, personal communication). This suggests that the increased proportion of Nod⁻ and Fix⁻ mutants could be due to the cointroduction into pSym2011 of such deletions together with Tn7. Introduction of pGMI42 restored the nodulating ability of all the Nod⁻ mutants tested.

Physical characterization of Nod⁻ mutants. The megaplasmid profile of various Nod⁻ mutants was studied by gel electrophoresis using a low concentration of agarose (0.5%). In the wild-type strain two very close bands of low motility could be seen, thus confirming the presence of a cryptic megaplasmid in addition to pSym (35). In all the Nod ⁻ mutants tested (from experiments 1 and 2), the upper band remained at the same position, while the lower band showed an increased migration (Fig. 1). These results indicate that all these Nod^- mutants carry a rather large $pSym$ deletion.

Figure ² shows the physical map (HindIIl sites) of the 42 region calibrated in kilobases starting from the nifHDK promoter region with positive values in the direction of the nod genes and negative values toward the nifA gene(3). To localize the various deletions in the 42 region, HindIIIdigested total DNA from the mutants was hybridized with ^a pGMI42 probe. In addition to the bands which strongly hybridized and corresponded to homologous bands of pSym, some bands hybridized at various degrees, suggesting the presence of repeated sequences in the 42 region (Fig. 3). The precise end of deletions within the HindIII border fragments was not determined.

FIG. 2. Map of the 42 region of the pSym megaplasmid and physical characterization of symbiotically defective mutants of R. meliloti 2011. In the middle of the figure is shown the HindIII physical map of the 42 region of the pSym of approximately 300 kb (3). The HindIII fragments are numbered according to their estimated size (in kilobases). Fragments smaller than 0.7 kb were not recorded. The symbiotic regions are located according to the following previous results: fix2.3 (3), nod (16), nifHDK (34), nifA (36). Above the map are shown the episomes pGMI42 and pGMI71. Below the map the deletions are represented by interrupted lines. The slanting borders of a deletion mean that the deletion ends in the fragments but that the precise end within the fragments has not been studied. Similarly, the insertions of Tn7 represented by a bracket means that the point of insertion within the HindIII fragment has not been determined. On the scale the coordinates (in kilobases) are given from the promoter of the nifHDK operon as localized by Sundaresan et al. (36). Symbols: ∇ , Tn7 insertions; ∇ , Tn5 insertions.

FIG. 3. Mapping of deletions in the 42 region of pSym plasmid. GMI957 (lane a), GMI963 (lane c), GMI766 (lane d), Wild-type control (lanes b and e). A pGMI42 probe was hybridized against HindIII-digested total DNA from the various strains. Asterisks indicate weakly hybridizing bands, suggesting that sequences present in the 42 region are repeated in the R . meliloti genome. Sizes are given in kb.

Interpretation of these hybridization data is given in Fig. 2, in which a map of the various deletions is proposed. As a control, strain GM1255, generated by a site-directed deletion procedure described elsewhere (M. H. Renalier, B. Terzaghi, A. M. Garnezone, G. Truchet, J. Vasse, J. Dénarié, and P. Boistard, manuscript in preparation), was shown to contain a deletion of approximately 280 kb covering almost the whole 42 region. The deleted pSym plasmid carried by strain GM1255 is much larger than the pAtC58 plasmid of 410 kb (32), confirming that the size of 2011 megaplasmids is much larger than 700 kb.

which has its left that at approximately 210 kb, thus was
suspected to extend more than 70 kb to the right of nifHDK.
This was confirmed by hybridization of GMI766 HindIII-
directed total DNA with a redication of GMI766 Hi **Example 2.1 RP4-prime plasmid carrying a pSym insert of about 70 kb** \blacksquare $+4.65$ in preparation). No hybridizing bands could be detected. In all the Tn7 Nod $-$ mutants isolated from experiments 1 and 2 $+100$ kb) and extended further than the right extremity of $\frac{345}{1000}$ the 64 region (approximately -70 kb). GMI766, a spontaneous Nod⁻ mutant, carries a deletion larger than that of GM1255 (which is more than 280 kb), according to the results of gel electrophoresis; this deletion, which has its left end at approximately 210 kb, thus was suspected to extend more than 70 kb to the right of *nifHDK*. digested total DNA with ^a radioactive probe of pGMI53, an from a region located on the right of nifHDK (Renalier et al., all the Tn7 Nod⁻ mutants isolated from experiments 1 and 2, for example strains GM1956, GM1957, GM1958, and GM1932, the deletions had the same left end (approximately

..... * HindIII-digested total DNA with ^a radioactive pGMI160 The Tn7 insertions were mapped by hybridization of used as a Tn7 probe. In mutants GM1956 and GMI957 (experiment 1) the Tn7 insertion was located in HindIII fragments of 10.2 and 21.0 kb, respectively, whereas in mutants GMI958 (experiment 1) and GMI932 (experiment 2) it was in a fragment of 8.1 kb (Fig. 2). In the Nod⁺ Fix⁻ mutant GM1963 the deletion was shown to extend over about 210 kb in the 42 region (from $+45$ to $+257$ kb); the Tn7 insertion was located at the junction of the two borders of the deletion (Fig. 2).

FIG. 4. Physical characterization of the nod region of pSym2011. The HindIII (H) and EcoRI (E) physical maps; the pRmSL26, pGMI149, and pGMI515 episomes; and the AHGO.1 and AHG4.1 deletions are shown (see legend to Fig. 2).

Cloning of a pSym2011 region controlling alfalfa nodulation. The set of physically characterized deletions covers the 42 and 64 pSym regions, which is more than 360 kb. None of these Nod^- deletion mutants could be restored to Nod^+ by the pRmSL26 plasmid containing the common nod genes (Fig. 4), showing that other nod gene(s) required for alfalfa nodulation are present in the pSym-deleted region. The fact that strain GM1963 was Nod⁺ Fix⁻ showed that no nod genes essential for alfalfa nodulation lies between coordinates $+46$ and $+257$ kb. To locate pSym regions required for alfalfa nodulation, complementation studies were performed by introducing into Nod⁻ mutants a set of episomes carrying pSym DNA inserts of various sizes, ranging from ²⁰ to 290 kb (Fig. 2 and 4). The RP4-prime pGMI42 restored the $Nod⁺$ phenotype in GMI766, suggesting that no essential nod genes are located in the 64 region. pGMI71 complemented the Nod⁻ mutants GMI255 and GMI766. It complemented also the Tn7-deleted strains, showing that the Nod⁻ phenotype of these mutants is not due to Tn7 insertions in the HindIII fragments of 8.1, 10.2, and 21.0 kb but to genetic rearrangements within the 71 region. pGMI71 was thus used as ^a source of nod DNA for subcloning into the broad-hostrange vector pRK290 after partial EcoRI digestion (Debelle et al., in preparation). The pRK290-prime population was mobilized from E. coli into R. meliloti GMI255 and GM1766 recipients, and Nod' transconjugants were selected on alfalfa seedlings by the procedure described by Long et al. (27). All the pRK290-prime plasmids present in the R. meliloti clones isolated from the nodules carried in common, like the plasmid pGMI149 shown in Fig. 4, the EcoRI fragments of 8.7, 1.8, 1.2, 2.1, and 15.3 kb. These fragments are adjacent on the pSym map (3, 27).

Introduction of $pGMI149$ into GMI766 resulted in a Nod⁺ Fix^- phenotype (Table 2). That the root deformations were genuine nodules was shown by cytological studies which revealed the presence of peripheral vascular bundles and typical nodule zonation of the central tissue (Fig. SA), the presence of infection threads (Fig. SB), and the release of bacteria into the host cells (Fig. SC and D). However, abnormalities in the infection process at the root hair level and in the differentiation into bacteroids were observed. The frequency of infection threads within root hairs was estimated to be lowered by at least an order of magnitude. A degeneration of released bacteria could be observed in the submeristematic zone of infection (ZII) associated with an increase of lysosome-like organelles (Fig. SH). In the central tissue (ZIII) the host cells were surcharged with amyloplast (Fig. SC), and the bacterial population comprised a majority of completely disorganized bacteria in addition to welldifferentiated bacteroids (Fig. SD). Introduction of pGMI149 in GMI255 resulted also in a Nod⁺ Fix⁻ phenotype (Table 2).

A pSym region controlling the specificity of nodulation. The R. meliloti GM1357 strain carries a site-directed deletion of 9 kb $(\Delta HGO.1)$ which removed the 8.7-kb EcoRI fragment which has been shown previously (16, 27) to carry common nod genes (T. Huguet, M. Ghérardi, and J. Batut, submitted for publication). GM1361 carries a site-directed 17.9-kb deletion $(\Delta HG4.1)$ covering approximately the SL26 region (Fig. 4). These two Nod⁻ mutants were restored to Nod⁺ by introduction of pRmSL26. In contrast, pRmSL26 could not complement all the other Nod^- deletion mutants (GMI255, GM1766, GM1956, GM1980, etc.) which could be restored to Nod' with pGMI149 (Table 2). Thus, in addition to the common nod genes already described in strain 2011 (27), sequences absolutely required for alfalfa nodulation are located in the EcoRI fragments of 2.1 kb, 15.3 kb, or both (Fig. 4).

When pRmSL26 was introduced into A. tumefaciens GMI9050, a C58 derivative cured of its Ti plasmid, no nodules could be observed on alfalfa seedlings; however, nodule-like deformations could be seen on a white clover root system (Fig. 6A and B). Cytological studies revealed that these deformations were swollen secondary roots and not nodules; their origin was not cortical and they contained central vascular bundles (Fig. 6C). In contrast, GMI90S0 (pGMI149) induced root deformation on alfalfa (28 plants among the 100 tested) and not on clover. These deformations, which exhibited a terminal meristem and peripheral vascular bundles, were genuine nodules (Fig. SE). Neither infection threads in the submeristematic zone (Fig. SF) nor bacterial release in the central host cells (Fig. SG and H) could be detected. These central host cells filled with amyloplasts (Fig. SG) were enriched with dictyosomes and lysosome-like organelles (Fig. SH). Results of these experiments with A. tumefaciens provide positive evidence that the genetic information responsible for the host specificity of nodule initiation is located in pGMI149, that is, in one or several of the EcoRI fragments of 8.7, 1.8, 1.2, 2.1, and 15.3 kb.

The plasmid pIJ1089 is a derivative of pRK290 which carries the nod genes of R. leguminosarum required for pea and Vicia hirsuta nodulation. It contains common nod genes (32) as well as genes that control the host range (12). pIJ1089 was used in complementation studies to discriminate regions of pSym2011 which carry common or specific nod genes. Introduction of pIJ1089 into GMI357 and GMI361 restored the ability to nodulate alfalfa (Table 2). Thus, in the $EcoRI$ fragments of 3.5, 0.8, 3.9, and 8.7 kb and in the HindIII fragments of 8.9, 2.4, 4.6, 0.8, and 1.2 kb of the SL26 region, it can be seen that (i) all the nod genes can be complemented by nod genes of R. leguminosarum and are thus common nod genes and (ii) no sequences required for alfalfa-specific

TABLE 2. Complementation studies of Nod⁻⁻deleted strains^a

Episomes ^b		
pRmSL26	pIJ1089	pGMI149
		$\ddot{}$
		$\ddot{}$

² Nodulations tests were performed on M. sativa cv. Gemini.

 \cdot , No nodule observed on the roots of 20 plants; $+$, abundant nodulation.

FIG. 5. Light and electron microscopy of nodules induced on M. sativa by R. meliloti GMI766(pGMI149) (A, B, C, and D) and A. tumefaciens GMI9050(pGMI149) (E, F, G, and H). (A) Semithin section of a nodule showing typical zonation. Endodermis (arrows) and nodular vascular bundles (double arrows) are seen at the periphery of the nodule. Bar, $100 \mu m$. (B) Semithin section of the submeristematic zone. Infection threads (arrows) and infected cells (ic) are visible. The large arrow (upper right) is pointed to the apical meristem. Bar, 100 μ m. (C) Semithin section of the bacteroid zone. Infected cells (ic) as well as uninfected cells (uc) are densely packed with amyloplasts (arrows). Bar, 10 μm. (D) Electron micrograph of an infected cell of the bacteroid zone. Some bacteria differentiated into bacteroids (b) or they prematurely senesced (arrows). Bar, $\overline{1}$ μ m. (E) Semithin section of a nodule showing the apical meristem (m) and the unique central zone (cz) . Endodermis (arrow) and nodular vascular bundles (double arrows) are peripheral. Bar, 100 μ m. (F) Semithin section of the submeristematic zone. No infection threads are visible. The large arrow (upper right) is pointed to the apical meristem. Arrows, amyloplasts; bar, 100 μ m. (G) Semithin section of the central zone. Plant cells, devoid of bacteria, are filled with large amyloplasts (arrows). Bar, 10 μ m. (H) Electron micrograph of a plant cell of the central zone. Dictyosomes (arrows) and lysosome-like organelles (double arrows) lie in the plant cell cytoplasm. a, amyloplast; m, mitochondria; cw, plant cell wall; bar, $1 \mu m$.

FIG. 6. T. repens cv. L. Nolin inoculated by A. tumefaciens GMI9050(pRmSL26). (A) General view of a plant with nodule-like root deformations (arrows). The double arrow points to the root deformation further shown after fixation (B) and freeze sectioning (C). In panel C, the central vascular trace (arrows) is typical of a swollen lateral root. Bars: 1 cm (A); 200 μ m (B); 100 μ m (C).

recognition are located in this region. pIJ1089, as pRmSL26, could not complement all of the other Nod⁻ deletions which could be complemented by pGMI149 (Table 2). Thus, in the HindIlI fragments of 19.5 kb, or 1 kb, or both are located noncommon (specific) nod sequences.

Functional assays of different nod gene region clones. As opposed to various other root hair deformations, the formation of shepherd's crooks (marked curling) on root hairs is considered to be a very specific host reaction to infection by the compatible bacteria (45). In this study, shepherd's

FIG. 7. Micrographs illustrating the criteria used in this study to define a shepherd's crook. (A) M. sativa-A. tumefaciens GMI9050(pGMI149). Typical shepherd's crook showing the 360° curvature of the root hair tip and the hyaline spot (arrow) in the middle of the curvature. Bar, 10 μ m. (B) Semithin section of a curled clover root hair induced by A. tumefaciens GM19050(pRmSL26). Arrow, hyaline spot; bar, 10 μ m. (C and D) M. sativa-R. meliloti 2011. Shepherd's crook deformation of an individual root hair before (C) and after (D) pressure on the cover slip. Bars, 25 μ m.

crooks were distinguished from other types of root hair deformations by the following criteria: (i) a curvature of the tip of the root hair of at least 360° (Fig. 7A, C, and D); (ii) in the middle of the curvature, a spot intensively stained by methylene blue, corresponding to the hyaline spot described previously (9, 14) (Fig. 7, arrows in panels A, B, C, and D); (iii) a shepherd's crook deformation which withstands a firm pressure exerted on the cover slip (Fig. 7, compare panels C and D). In addition, to prevent confusion with root hair tip deformations due to a contact with adjacent root hairs, shepherd's crooks were always searched for oh isolated root hairs.

To initiate a study of the respective roles of the left (the 8.7-kb EcoRI fragment) and right (the four EcoRI right fragments) nod regions of pSym2011 which control the specificity of marked root hair curling, R. meliloti GM1766 and A. tumefaciens GMI9050, carrying pRmSL26, pGMI515, or pGMI149 (Fig. 4), were inoculated on the R. *meliloti* homologous host $(M. sative)$ or on an heterologous host (two cultivars of T. repens).

With the two control strains A. tumefaciens GMI9050 and R. meliloti GM1766 root hairs remained straight on all the host plants for up to three weeks. Similarly, the inoculation of strains GM19050 and GM1766 carrying the pGMI515 plasmid to alfalfa or clover plants did not produce any root hair deformation (Fig. 8A). Inoculation of white clover varieties with GMI766(pRmSL26) or GMI9050(pRmSL26) resulted in the formation of numerous shepherd's crooks $(Hac⁺ phenotype)$ (Fig. 8C and D). The proportion of clover root hairs exhibiting shepherd's crooks was of the same order of magnitude as that on the seedlings inoculated by the R. trifolii 0403 control strain. The fact that an A. tumefaciens strain carrying pRmSL26 was Hac⁺ suggests strongly that the gene(s) encoding for the product(s) required for marked root hair curling is located on this episome. In contrast, GM1766(pGMI149) and GMI9050(pGMI149) did not induce shepherd's crook formation on the two clover varieties (Fig. 8G and H).

Opposite results were obtained by inoculation of the homologous host. Strains carrying pRmSL26 were Hac-(Fig. 8B), whereas those carrying $pGM1149$ were Hac^+ (Fig. 8E and F). These results show that the EcoRI fragments of 15.3 kb, 2.1 kb, or both are required for alfalfa root hair curling. In addition, it seems that this region interacts negatively with the SL26 region for hair curling on heterologous hosts. The plant reactions for the marked root hair curling character provoked by $pRmSL26$ (Hac⁻), $pGMI515$ (Hac^-) , and pGMI149 (Hac⁺) were similar in the R. meliloti or A. tumefaciens genetic background (Table 3), suggesting that the DNA sequences required for hair curling and the control of its specificity are cloned in pGMI149.

We propose to call the various root hair deformations Had (such as branching, waviness, bulging, swelling, moderate curling) to distinguish them from marked hair curling (Hac, as proposed by Vincent [43]). A. tumefaciens and R. meliloti strains which were Hac^+ were also Had^+ . In contrast, $Hac^$ strains could be Had⁺ or Had⁻. Thus, GMI766(pGMI149) and GMI9050(pGMI149) were Had⁺ Hac⁺ on alfalfa and $Had^+ Hac^-$ on clover (Table 3).

In general, for a given episome the proportion of deformed root hairs (Had and Hac) was higher in A. tumefaciens GMI9050 than in R. meliloti GMI766. This was particularly the case for GM19050(pRmSL26) and GM1766(pRmSL26) on clover.

No infection thread could be detected on clover root system whatever the R . meliloti or A . tumefaciens strain

inoculated, or on both plants when inoculated with an A. tumefaciens strain. Thus A. tumefaciens GM19050 $(pGMI149)$ was found to be Inf⁻ Nod⁺ on alfalfa. No infection threads could be detected in the root hairs, even when they were markedly curled; and no threads could be detected in the submeristematic zone of the nodules. Infection threads in root hairs could be seen only in the association alfalfa R. meliloti GM1766(pGMI149).

DISCUSSION

pGMI42, an RP4-prime plasmid carrying a 290-kb pSym insert, contains the host-specific nodulation genes of R. meliloti 2011 (39). In the course of Tn7 mutagenesis of the corresponding 42 region of $pSym$, several Nod ⁻ mutants were isolated which were shown to carry large deletions of pSym. Electrophoresis of lysates of deleted strains in soft agarose gels revealed the presence of a second band of low motility, confirming the presence of a cryptic megaplasmid, in strain R. meliloti ²⁰¹¹ (35). A cryptic megaplasmid, in addition to pSym, has also been reported in R. meliloti 41 (1, 2) and in R. meliloti L5-30 (C. Rosenberg, unpublished data). Thus, the presence of two megaplasmids of about 1,500 kb each (7) seems to be the rule in this bacterial species.

In some deleted strains, for instance GM1963, it was shown that the Tn7 transposon was located between the two borders of the deletion, suggesting that the transposon could be involved in the generation of the deletion. Since during the Tn7 mutagenesis of $pGMI42::Mu$ in E. coli spontaneous deletions occurred frequently in the pSym insert, deletions could also be introduced in the R . meliloti plasmid by cotransfer with Tn7. The mechanism by which the deletions extending outside the 42 region were generated on the right is not clear. The left end of many deletions, for instance those of strains GM1956, GM1957, and GMI958, is located in the HindIII fragment of 6.9 kb which contains a repeated sequence (A. M. Garnerone, unpublished data).

All of these Nod^- deletions could be restored by $pGMI42$ but not by pRmSL26 which carries the common *nod* genes (16, 21, 27), showing that some gene(s) essential for alfalfa nodulation is located in the 42 region outside the fragment cloned in pRmSL26. One such deleted strain was used to allow the selection on alfalfa seedlings, by the procedure of Long et al. (27), of subclones which contain sequences required to nodulate alfalfa. The isolated clones contained a piece of 29.1 kb in common: the EcoRI fragments of 8.7, 1.8, 1.2, 2.1, and 15.3 kb. Due to the fact that the two extreme bands were large, 8.7 and 15.3 kb, the minimal size of DNA required for alfalfa nodulation could be much smaller.

When introduced into A. tumefaciens GHI9050, a strain cured of its Ti plasmid, the clone pGMI149 carrying the 29.1-kb insert conferred to the transconjugants the ability to induce marked root hair curling and genuine nodule formation on the homologous host alfalfa and not on clover. These experiments have shown that this clone carries the genetic information required for host-specific root hair curling and nodule initiation on alfalfa,

An R. meliloti strain carrying a site-directed deletion removing the 8.7-kb EcoRI fragment and containing pIJ1089 which carries common and host range nodulation genes of *.* leguminosarum (12, 32) was able to nodulate alfalfa. This result shows that no gene essential for alfalfa recognition is present in the 8.7-kb fragment and indicates that such genes are likely to be located in the right part of pGMI149 that is in one or several of the EcoRI fragments of 1.8, 1.2, 2.1, or 15.3 kb. This is in agreement with the finding of Kondorosi et al. (25) that in R. meliloti 41, a strain of a different geographical

FIG. 8. Root hair curling. (A and B) M. sativa inoculated by R. meliloti GMI766(pGMI515) (A) or R. meliloti GMI766(pRmSL26) (B).
Straight root hairs are shown (Had⁻ phenotype). Bar, 30 µm. (C and D) T. repens inoculated or R. melilõti GMI766(pSL26) (D). Arrows point to shepherd's crooks (Hac⁺ phenotype). Bars: 20 μm (C); 25 μm (D). (E and F) M. sativa with R. meliloti GMI766(pGMI149) (E) or A. tumefaciens GMI9050(pGMI149) (F). Both strains induced shepherd's crook deformations (arrows), but infection threads (double arrows) were initiated only by R. meliloti GMI766(pGMI149) (E). Bars: 10 μ m (E); 15 μ m (F). (G and H) T. repens inoculated with R. meliloti GMI766(pGMI149) (G) and A. tumefaciens GMI9050(pGMI149) (H). Deformations other than
shepherd's crook are shown (Had⁺ Hac⁻ phenotype). Bars, 25 µm.

^a Had⁺, root hair deformations (branching, waviness, swelling, etc.); Hac⁺, shepherd's crooks; Inf⁺, infection threads in root hairs; Nod⁺, nodule formation (43).

 \overrightarrow{b} The same phenotypes were observed for the two white clover cultivars tested.

Root deformations (Fig. 6).

origin, a cluster of nodulation genes which cannot be complemented by R. leguminosarum nodulation genes lies between the common *nod* genes and the *nifHDK* genes.

By insertional mutagenesis, Long and co-workers have shown that genes located in the 8.7-kb fragment control alfalfa root hair curling (19, 21, 27). The fact that an A. tumefaciens strain containing pRmSL26 elicits very effectively the formation of shepherd's crooks on clover roots provides positive evidence that the left nod region contains all the genetic information to induce this plant reaction. Surprisingly, the introduction of neither the 8.7-kb fragment nor pRmSL26 into A. tumefaciens (18) or into R. meliloti GM1766, a strain that carries a pSym deletion which removes the whole *nod* region, results in an Hac^+ phenotype on alfalfa. This indicates that another gene(s) is required for shepherd's crook formation on the homologous host.

Plasmid pGMI149, containing the whole nod region, elicited the opposite plant reactions: shepherd's crook formation on the homologous host and not on the heterologous plant. Strains carrying the pGMI515 episome (containing the right part of the nod region) did not induce any visible plant reaction. These results suggest that in the right portion of pGMI149 (EcoRI fragments of 2.1 and 15.3 kb) is located a gene(s) which is absolutely required, in addition to genes in the common *nod* region, for root hair curling of the homologous host. On the other hand the right nod region interacts negatively with the left region to suppress the shepherd's crook formation on heterologous hosts. TnS mutagenesis of the right nod region is in progress to locate the DNA sequences which interact with the common nod genes to control positively and negatively the host specificity of root hair curling. This mutagenesis is a prerequisite to investigate whether these controls of host specificity are mediated at the gene expression level or at the gene product level.

Typical hyaline spots could be observed in the middle of shepherd's crooks of white clover inoculated with R. meliloti
GMI766(pRmSL26) and A. tumefaciens GMI9050 GM1766(pRmSL26) and A. tumefaciens GM19050 (pRmSL26) and of alfalfa inoculated with A. tumefaciens GM19050(pGMI149), in spite of the fact that in these plantbacteria combinations no infection threads could be detected in the root hairs. In previous studies it has been suggested that these bright refractile spots are the point at which rhizobia enter the root and initiate infection thread formation (9, 43). Our results indicate that the gene(s) required for spot formation is located in pRmSL26 and that it is not sufficient for infection thread formation.

pGMI149 provoked alfalfa root hair curling and nodulation when introduced into R. meliloti GMI766 and A. tumefaciens GM19050, but in the latter case no infection threads could be detected either in the root hairs or in the nodules. This confirms the results of previous studies in which it has been reported that alfalfa nodule initiation does not require the formation of infection threads (15, 18, 20, 39) and can be triggered at a distance by rhizobial cells. The lack of thread formation in A. tumefaciens, even when the whole pSym megaplasmid is introduced (39), could mean that R. meliloti inf genes either (i) are located on the chromosome or on the second megaplasmid or (ii) cannot be expressed in A. tumefaciens. In contrast to R. meliloti GM1766(pRmSL26), R. meliloti GM1766(pGMI149) is Inf+ on alfalfa. This could be interpreted by two hypotheses concerning the inf genes: (i) they are located in pGMI149 or (ii) they are located elsewhere in the R. meliloti GM1766 genome but pGMI149 makes the infection thread formation possible by allowing the previous steps of the infection process, root hair curling and hyaline spot formation, to occur.

R. meliloti GM1766(pGMI149) induced a much reduced proportion of shepherd's crook and infection thread formation on alfalfa than did the wild-type strain; this suggests that ancillary nodulation genes involved in the efficiency of the infection process are located on the pSym plasmid in the deleted area (from about 200 kb to more than -60 kb on the pSym map). This is in agreement with the results of a previous report (39) in which it has been shown that ancillary nodulation genes are located on the pSym2011 fragment outside the 42 region.

The pSym2011 fragment which contains genes coding for host-specific root hair curling and nodulation has been cloned. This was a prerequisite to study the molecular genetics of host range specificity in R. meliloti 2011.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by a Biological Nitrogen Fixation grant from the Société Nationale Elf Aquitaine, Entreprise Minière et Chimique, Rh6ne Poulenc and Charbonnages de France Chimie, and by the European Communities Biomolecular Programm. J.B. and B.T. were supported by grants from Elf-Biorecherches.

We thank Monique Dénarié for preparing the manuscript and René Odorico for drawing Fig. 2 and 4. We acknowledge Mick Chandler and Marilyn Magazin for reviewing the manuscript. We also thank Sharon Long, Alan Downie, Gary Ditta, and Thierry Huguet for providing bacterial strains. We acknowledge the generosity of Laboratoires Bristol (Paris) for providing us with kanamycin, Laboratoires Diamant (F92800 Puteaux) for neomycin, Laboratoires Lepetit (F59113 Seclin) for rifampin, and Laboratoires Upjohn (Paris) for spectinomycin.

LITERATURE CITED

- 1. Banfalvi, Z., E. Kondorosi, and A. Kondorosi. 1985. Rhizobium meliloti carries two megaplasmids. Plasmid 13:129-138.
- 2. Banfalvi, Z., V. Sakanyan, C. Konzc, A. Kiss, I. Dusha, and A. Kondorosi. 1981. Location of nodulation and nitrogen fixation genes on a high molecular weight plasmid of R . meliloti. Mol. Gen. Genet. 184:334-339.
- Batut, J., B. Terzaghi, M. Ghérardi, M. Huguet, E. Terzaghi, A. M. Garnerone, P. Boistard, and T. Huguet. 1985. Localization of a symbiotic fix region on Rhizobium meliloti pSym megaplasmid more than 200 kilobases from the nod-nif region. Mol. Gen. Genet. 199:232-239.
- Beringer, J. E. 1974. R factor transfer in Rhizobium leguminosarum. J. Gen. Microbiol. 84:188-198.
- 5. Birnboim, H., and J. Doly. 1979. A rapid alkaline extraction

procedure for screening recombinant plasmid DNA. Nucleic Acids Res. 7:1513-1525.

- 6. Boucher, C., B. Bergeron, M. De Bertaimio, and J. Denarie. 1977. Introduction of bacteriophage Mu into Pseudomonas solanacearum and Rhizobium meliloti using the R factor RP4. J. Gen. Microbiol. 98:253-263.
- 7. Burkardt, B., and H. J. Burkardt. 1984. Visualization and exact molecular weight determination of a Rhizobium meliloti megaplasmid. J. Mol. Biol. 175:213-218.
- 8. Clewell, B. D., and D. R. Helinski. 1969. Supercoiled circular DNA-protein complex in Escherichia coli: purification and induced conversion to an open circular DNA form. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 69:2110-2114.
- 9. Dart, P. J. 1977. Infection and development of leguminous nodules, p. 367-472. In R. W. F. Hardy and W. S. Silver (ed.), A treatise on dinitrogen fixation. III. John Wiley and sons, Inc., New York.
- 10. Datta, N., R. W. Hedges, E. J. Shaw, R. B. Sykes, and M. H. Richmond. 1971. Properties of an R factor from Pseudomonas aeruginosa. J. Bacteriol. 108:1244-1249.
- 11. Ditta, G., S. Stanfield, D. Corbin, and D. R. Helinski. 1980. Broad host range DNA cloning system for gram-negative bacteria: construction of a gene bank of Rhizobium meliloti. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 77:7347-7351.
- 12. Downie, J. A., G. Hombrecher, Q.-S. Ma, C. D. Knight, B. Wells, and A. W. B. Johnston. 1983. Cloned nodulation genes of Rhizobium leguminosarum determine host-range specificity. Mol. Gen. Genet. 190:359-365.
- 13. Eckhardt, T. 1978. A rapid method for the identification of plasmid desoxyribonucleic acid in bacteria. Plasmid 1:584-588.
- 14. Fahraeus, G. 1957. The infection of clover root hairs by nodule bacteria studied by a simple glass slide technique. J. Gen. Microbiol. 16:374-381.
- 15. Finan, T. M., A. M. Hirsch, J. A. Leigh, E. Johansen, G. A. Kuldau, S. Deegan, G. C. Walker, and E. R. Signer. 1985. Symbiotic mutants of Rhizobium meliloti that uncouple plant and bacterial differentiation. Cell 40:869-877.
- 16. Fischer, R. F., J. K. Tu, and S. R. Long. 1985. Conserved nodulation genes in Rhizobium meliloti and Rhizobium trifolii. Appl. Env. Microbiol. 49:1432-1435.
- 17. Hirsch, A. M., M. Bang, and F. M. Ausubel. 1983. Ultrastructural analysis of ineffective alfalfa nodules formed by nif::TnS mutants of Rhizobium meliloti. J. Bacteriol. 155:367-380.
- 18. Hirsch, A. M., D. Drake, T. W. Jacobs, and S. R. Long. 1985. Nodules are induced on alfalfa roots by Agrobacterium tumefaciens and Rhizobium trifolii containing small segments of the Rhizobium meliloti nodulation region. J. Bacteriol. 161:223-230.
- 19. Hirsch, A. M., S. R. Long, M. Bang, N. Haskins, and F. M. Ausubel. 1982. Structural studies of alfalfa roots infected with nodulation mutant of Rhizobium meliloti. J. Bacteriol. 151:411-419.
- 20. Hirsch, A. M., K. J. Wilson, J. D. G. Jones, M. Bang, V. V. Walker, and F. M. Ausubel. 1984. Rhizobium meliloti nodulation genes allow Agrobacterium tumefaciens and Escherichia coli to form pseudonodules on alfalfa. J. Bacteriol. 158:1133-1143.
- 21. Jacobs, T. W., T. T. Egelhoff, and S. R. Long. 1985. Physical and genetic map of a Rhizobium meliloti nodulation gene region and nucleotide sequence of nodC. J. Bacteriol, 162:469-476.
- 22. Jouanin, L., P. de Lajudie, S. Bazetoux, and T. Huguet. 1981. DNA sequence homology inRhizobium meliloti plasmids. Mol. Gen. Genet. 182:189-195.
- 23. Julliot, J. S., I. Dusha, M. H. Renalier, B. Terzaghi, A. M. Garnerone, and P. Boistard. 1984. An RP4-prime containing a 285-kb fragment of Rhizobium meliloti pSym plasmid: structural characterization and utilization for genetic studies of symbiotic functions controlled by pSym. Mol. Gen. Genet. 193:17-26.
- 24. Kondorosi, A., E. Kondorosi, C. E. Pankhurst, W. J. Broughton, and Z. Banfalvi. 1982. Mobilization of a Rhizobium meliloti megaplasmid carrying nodulation and nitrogen fixation genes into other rhizobia and Agrobacterium. Mol. Gen. Genet. 188:433-439.
- 25. Kondorosi, E., Z. Banfalvi, and A. Kondorosi. 1984. Physical and genetic analysis of a symbiotic region of Rhizobium meliloti: identification of nodulation genes. Mol. Gen. Genet. 193: 445-452.
- 26. Long, S. R. 1984. Genetics of Rhizobium nodulation, p. 265-306. In T. Kosuge and E. W. Nester (ed.), Plant-microbe interactions, vol. 1. Macmillan, New York.
- 27. Long, S. R., W. J. Buikema, and F. M. Ausubel. 1982. Cloning of Rhizobium meliloti nodulation genes by direct complementation of Nod⁻ mutants. Nature (London) 298:485-488.
- 28. Maniatis, T., E. F. Fritsch, and J. Sambrook. 1982. Molecular cloning. A laboratory manual. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory, Cold Spring Harbor, N.Y.
- 29. Patel, J. J., and A. F. Yang. 1981. Light and electron microscopic studies of nodule structure of alfalfa. Can. J. Microbiol. $27:36-43$.
- 30. Rosenberg, C., P. Boistard, J. Denarie, and F. Casse-Delbart. 1981. Genes controlling early and late functions in symbiosis are located on a megaplasmid in Rhizobium meliloti. Mol. Gen. Genet. 184:326-333.
- 31. Rosenberg, C., F. Casse-Delbart, I. Dusha, M. David, and C. Boucher. 1982. Megaplasmids in the plant-associated bacteria Rhizobium meliloti and Pseudomonas solanacearum. J. Bacteriol. 150:402-406.
- 32. Rossen, L., A. W. B. Johnston, and J. A. Downie. 1984. DNA sequence of the Rhizobium leguminosarum nodulation genes nodAB and C required for root hair curling. Nucleic Acids Res. 12:9497-9508.
- 33. Ruvkun, G. B., and F. M. Ausubel. 1981. A general method for site directed mutagenesis in prokaryotes: construction of mutations in symbiotic nitrogen fixation genes of Rhizobium meliloti. Nature (London) 289:85-88.
- 34. Ruvkun, G. B., V. Sundaresan, and F. M. Ausubel. 1982. Directed transposon TnS mutagenesis and complementation analysis of Rhizobium meliloti symbiotic nitrogen fixation genes. Cell 29:551-559.
- 35. Simon, R. 1984. High frequency mobilization of gram-negative bacterial replicons by the in vitro constructed TnS-mob transposon. Mol. Gen. Genet. 196:413-420.
- 36. Sundaresan, V., J. D. G. Jones, D. W. Ow, and F. M. Ausubel. 1983. Klebsiella pneumoniae nifA product activates the Rhizobium meliloti nitrogenase promoter. Nature (London) 301:728-731.
- 37. Torok, I., E. Kondorosi, T. Stepkowski, J. Posfai, and A. Kondorosi. 1984. Nucleotide sequence of Rhizobium meliloti nodulation genes. Nucleic Acids Res. 12:9509-9524.
- 38. Trinick, M. J. 1982. Biology, p. 76-146. In W. J. Broughton (ed.), Nitrogen fixation, vol. 2, Rhizobium. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- 39. Truchet, G., C. Rosenberg, J. Vasse, J.-S. Julliot, S. Camut, and J. Dénarié. 1984. Transfer of Rhizobium meliloti Sym genes into Agrobacterium tumefaciens: host-specific nodulation by atypical infection. J. Bacteriol. 157:134-142.
- 40. Vasse, J. M., and G. L. Truchet. 1984. The Rhizobium-legume symbiosis: observation of root infection by bright-field microscopy after staining with methylene blue. Planta 161:487-489.
- 41. Verma, D. P. S., and S. R. Long. 1983. Molecular biology of the Rhizobium legume symbiosis, p. 211-245. In K. Jeon (ed.), Intracellular symbioses. Academic Press, Inc., New York.
- 42. Vincent, J. M. 1970. A manual for the practical study of root-nodule bacteria. International Biological Programme handbook no. 15. Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford.
- 43. Vincent, J. M. 1980. Factors controlling the legume-Rhizobium symbiosis, p. 103-129. In W. E. Newton and W. H. Orme-Johnson (ed.), Nitrogen fixation, vol. 2. University Park Press, Baltimore.
- 44. Wong, C. H., C. E. Pankhurst, A. Kondorosi, and W. J. Broughton. 1983. Morphology of root nodules and nodule-like structures formed by Rhizobium and Agrobacterium strains containing a Rhizobium meliloti megaplasmid. J. Cell. Biol. 97:787-794.
- 45. Yao, P. Y., and J. M. Vincent. 1969. Host specificity in the root hair "curling factor" of Rhizobium spp. Aust. J. Biol. Sci. 22:413-423.