

COMMENTARY

New York State Physicians: Characteristics and Distribution in Health Professional Shortage Areas

Neil S. Calman, Diane Hauser, Gaetano Forte, and Tracey Continelli

Along with high numbers of physicians, New York State also has 2.7 million people living in poverty and 3 million without health insurance who are likely to live in areas with few physicians.^{1,2} Nearly 4 million New Yorkers live in communities that have been designated as health professional shortage areas (HPSAs).³ We conducted a study to examine the physician workforce in New York State and its HPSAs.

Data on federally designated primary medical HPSAs were obtained from the Bureau of Health Professions. Physician data obtained from the AMA Physician Masterfile were geocoded and cross-referenced with the HPSA file. A complete description of methods and findings are available in the full study report.⁴

Of the 47,981 physicians identified as practicing in New York State (NYS), 14.5% were found to practice in HPSAs. Most of these, 13.5% of all NYS physicians, practice in metropolitan HPSAs. Primary care physicians practice in HPSAs at only a slightly higher rate (16 vs. 15%) than non-primary care physicians, and also practice predominantly in metropolitan HPSAs (see Table 1).

More than half (53%) of all primary care physicians practicing in NYS metropolitan HPSAs are international medical graduates (IMGs), compared to 33% of those in nonmetropolitan HPSAs and 44% of those practicing outside of HPSAs. Thus, NYS relies heavily on IMGs born outside of the USA to meet the need for physicians in underserved communities, particularly in metropolitan areas.

Almost one in three black, non-Hispanic physicians in NYS were found to practice in metropolitan HPSAs, the highest prevalence of any racial/ethnic group. All non-white physicians had higher rates of metropolitan HPSA practice than white, non-Hispanic physicians. Overall, New York State has a small base of underrepresented minority physicians (8% of all physicians) who are disproportionately located in metropolitan HPSAs. The lack of growth in the number of minority students graduating from medical schools in NYS is out of sync with the state's growing minority population.

Thirty-six percent of NYS physicians are graduates of a medical school located in NYS, yet only 29% of physicians in HPSAs are graduates of these schools. Graduates of the four medical schools in the state university system comprise 13% of both the NYS physician workforce and the HPSA workforce.

Calman and Hauser are with the Institute for Urban Family Health, New York, NY, USA; Forte and Continelli are with the Center for Health Workforce Studies, School of Public Health, State University of New York at Albany, Rensselaer, NY, USA.

Correspondence: Neil S. Calman, Institute for Urban Family Health, 16 East 16th Street, New York, NY 10003, USA. (E-mail: nscalman@institute2000.org)

TABLE 1. New York State physicians in metropolitan and nonmetropolitan HPSAs, 2000

	New York State	Metropolitan HPSAs		Nonmetropolitan HPSAs	
		Total	Number	Percent	Number
Specialty					
Family practice	2,683	348	13	98	4
General practice	582	81	14	8	1
Internal medicine	7,989	1,125	14	68	1
Obstetrics-gynecology	2,698	338	13	22	1
Pediatrics	4,152	715	17	22	1
All other specialties	29,877	4,347	15	233	0.7
				Chi-square = 218.89	p < 0.001
US/IMG					
USMGs	29,030	3,429	12	292	1
US-IMGs	3,303	266	8	22	0.7
Non-US IMGs	15,648	2,808	18	137	0.9
				Chi-square = 28.34	p < 0.001
Gender					
Male	35,540	4,639	13	366	1
Female	12,441	1,864	15	85	0.7
				Chi-square = 20.15	p < 0.001
Race/ethnicity					
Black, non-Hispanic	1,512	469	31	7	0.5
Hispanic	1,338	304	23	7	0.5
Asian	5,658	1,009	18	57	1
Native American/Alaskan native	14	0	—	0	—
Other	1,229	198	16	20	2
White, non-Hispanic	24,080	2,493	10	230	1
Missing	14,150	2,030	14	130	1
				Chi-square = 51.85	p < 0.001

While the heavy concentration of NYS HPSA physicians in metropolitan HPSAs reflects, to a great extent, the distribution of the overall state population, it is disproportionate to the HPSA population which needs to be served. Seventy-eight percent of New York's HPSA population is located in metropolitan HPSAs, while 94% of the state's HPSA physicians practice there.⁵ New York's nonmetropolitan HPSAs have lower physician to population ratios and higher unmet need. Given that family physicians are more likely to practice in the nation's rural areas than other primary care physicians,⁶ the relatively small workforce and training pipeline for family physicians in NYS contributes to shortages in rural areas.

Increased family medicine training, recruitment of minority physicians into training, and ensuring the continuing flow of IMGs into NYS are efforts most likely to increase the number of physicians practicing in New York's HPSAs.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors wish to acknowledge the support of the National Center for Health Workforce Analysis of the Health Resources and Services Administration, Bureau of Health Profession and the New York State Area Health Education Center System.

REFERENCES

1. Table POV46: Poverty Status by State: 2003. Current Population Survey 2004: Annual Social and Economic Supplement. U.S. Census Bureau. Available at: http://pubdb3.cen.sus.gov/macro/032004/pov/new46_100125_01.htm. Accessed on: 11/20/06.
2. Table H105: Health Insurance Coverage Status and Type of Coverage by State and Age for All People: 2002. U.S. Census Bureau. Available at: <http://pubdb3.census.gov/macro/032003/health/h05-000.htm>. Accessed on: 11/20/06.
3. Selected Statistics on Health Professional Shortage Areas as of December 31, 2004. Shortage Designation Branch, National Center for Health Workforce Analysis, Bureau of Health Professions, HRSA. Rockville, Maryland.
4. Calman NS, Hauser D. *New York State Health Professionals in Health Professional Shortage Areas*. The New York State Area Health Education Centers System, Department of Family Medicine, University at Buffalo, State University of New York, May 2004. Accessed on: 8/7/06. Available at: <http://www.ahec.buffalo.edu/index.htm>.
5. HPSA Population Numbers were Calculated by the Authors from Data Obtained Through the HRSA Geospatial Warehouse. Accessed on: 2/16/06. Available at: <http://datawarehouse.hrsa.gov>.
6. Hart LG, Salsberg E, Phillips DM, Lishner DM. Rural Health Care Providers in the United States. *J Rural Health*. 2002;S:211-232.