# Mechanisms Involved in Mycobacterial Growth Inhibition by Gamma Interferon-Activated Bone Marrow Macrophages: Role of Reactive Nitrogen Intermediates

INGE E. A. FLESCH AND STEFAN H. E. KAUFMANN\*

Department of Immunology, University of Ulm, Albert-Einstein-Allee 11, D-7900 Ulm, Federal Republic of Germany

Received <sup>15</sup> April 1991/Accepted 29 May 1991

Murine bone marrow-derived macrophages are able to inhibit the growth of *Mycobacterium bovis* after stimulation with recombinant gamma interferon. This antimycobacterial activity was inhibited by  $N<sup>G</sup>$ . monomethyl-L-arginine, a specific inhibitor of nitrite and nitrate synthesis from L-arginine. Furthermore, there was a complete lack of mycobacterial growth inhibition in a medium deficient in L-arginine. Nitrite is generated by gamma interferon-activated bone marrow-derived macrophages after infection with M. bovis, and a correlation between mycobacterial growth inhibition and nitrite production was observed. These results indicate that reactive nitrogen intermediates derived from L-arginine are crucially involved in macrophage antimycobacterial activity.

Evidence that the reactive nitrogen intermediates (RNI) nitric oxide (NO), nitrite  $(NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>)$ , and nitrate  $(NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>)$  are potent effector molecules of macrophage-mediated extracellular and intracellular cytotoxicity (5, 12, 18, 21, 24) is accumulating. For example, it has been shown recently that killing by macrophages of the protozoa Toxoplasma gondii (1) and Leishmania major (11, 22, 23), the opportunistic fungus Cryptococcus neoformans (9), the metazoan pathogen Schistosoma mansonii (17, 18), and tumor cells (12, 13, 19, 33) involves RNI.

Mycobacterium bovis and M. tuberculosis are facultative intracellular bacteria capable of persisting and replicating within resting mononuclear phagocytes. After stimulation with interleukins, macrophages acquire the capacity to reduce their load of intracellular mycobacteria, and there is strong evidence that gamma interferon (IFN-y) is particularly effective (26). By using murine bone marrow-derived macrophages (BMM $\phi$ ) preactivated with recombinant IFN- $\gamma$  $(rIFN-\gamma)$  or lymphokines from antigen-specific T-cell clones, we have observed powerful tuberculostatic effects in vitro (7).

Although the precise mechanism(s) of this antimycobacterial activity is unclear, it has been claimed that the reactive oxygen intermediates (ROI),  $O_2^-$ ,  $H_2O_2$ , <sup>1</sup>O<sub>2</sub>, and OH, are important for macrophage antimycobacterial activities (15, 16, 35). In contrast, we obtained evidence arguing against an involvement of ROI in the growth inhibition of  $M$ . bovis by rIFN- $\gamma$ -activated BMM $\phi$  (i) because phagocytosis of M. bovis by rIFN- $\gamma$ -activated BMM $\phi$  failed to trigger the oxidative burst (7) and (ii) because scavengers of reactive oxygen metabolites did not reverse mycobacterial growth inhibition (8).

In this report, we provide evidence for an involvement of RNI, rather than ROI, in macrophage tuberculostasis. The data presented show that RNI are generated from L-arginine by rIFN- $\gamma$ -activated BMM $\phi$  after infection with *M. bovis* and that growth inhibition of M. bovis is markedly reversed by means which specifically interfere with RNI production in macrophages.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

Microorganisms. M. bovis BCG Phipps was grown in Dubos broth (Difco Laboratories, Detroit, Mich.) supplemented with bovine serum albumin and Tween 80 with shaking. Cultures were centrifuged, washed twice in phosphate-buffered saline, and stored frozen at  $-70^{\circ}$ C. Numbers of viable organisms were determined by plating 1:10 dilutions on Middlebrook Dubos agar plates (Difco). Plates were incubated at 37°C, and the number of CFU was determined.

Cytokines and culture reagents. Murine  $rIFN-\gamma$  was kindly provided by G. Adolf, Ernst Boehringer-Institut fur Arzneimittel-Forschung, Vienna, Austria.  $N<sup>G</sup>$ -monomethyl-L-arginine (MLA) was purchased from Calbiochem (La Jolla, Calif.). Nw-nitro-L-arginine (NLA) and L-arginine were obtained from Sigma Chemical Co. (St. Louis, Mo.). L-arginine-depleted RPMI 1640 medium was prepared by using an RPMI 1640 select amine kit (GIBCO).

Macrophage cultures. Bone marrow cells were prepared from the femora of 6- to 8-week-old C57BL/6 male or female mice from our own breeding colony. BMM $\phi$  were grown in Teflon film bags (Heraeus, Hanau, Federal Republic of Germany) in a serum-free culture medium as described previously (6, 7). The serum-free medium consisted of Iscove's modified Dulbecco's medium (IMDM) without antibiotics and was supplemented with  $15 \mu g$  of transferrin per ml,  $5 \times 10^{-5}$  M 2-mercaptoethanol, and 30% (vol/vol) serum-free supernatant from L-929 cells as a source of macrophage colony-stimulating factor. BMM $\phi$  were harvested after 9 days in culture.

Inhibition of mycobacterial growth by BMM4). Mycobacterial growth inhibition was assessed as described previously (7). BMM $\phi$  (10<sup>5</sup> cells per well) were seeded in flat-bottom microdilution plates (Nunc, Roskilde, Denmark) in IMDM without additives and were stimulated with  $rIFN-\gamma$ . After 24 h, the medium was removed and BMM4 were infected with  $10<sup>6</sup>$  live *M. bovis* organisms per well. After incubation for 4

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author.

days at 37 $\degree$ C in 10% CO<sub>2</sub> in air, macrophages were washed to remove extracellular bacteria. Cells were lysed by the addition of IMDM containing 0.1% saponin, and the viability of mycobacteria was assessed by the addition of 0.5  $\mu$ Ci of [3H]uracil per well. After 7 to 8 h, cultures were harvested onto glass fiber filters. The incorporation of radioactivity was counted in a  $\beta$ -counter (Beta-plate; LKB).

To assess the effects of MLA and NLA on the viability and growth of M. bovis, mycobacteria were seeded into microdilution plates (106 bacteria per well) in IMDM containing MLA or NLA, respectively. After <sup>4</sup> days of incubation, the growth of  $M$ . bovis was determined by the addition of  $[3H]$ uracil (0.5 µCi per well); the solution was allowed to stand for 7 to 8 h.

Nitrite determination. BMM $\phi$  supernatants were collected at different time points, as indicated in Results. The nitrite concentration was measured by Griess reagent (4, 10). Briefly, 50-µl aliquots were mixed with equal volumes of Griess reagent (1% sulfanilamide, 0.1% naphthylethylene diamine dihydrochloride,  $2.5\%$  H<sub>3</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>) and incubated at room temperature for 10 min.  $A_{570}$  was measured in an Immunoreader NJ 2000 (Intermed).  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  was determined by using  $NaNO<sub>2</sub>$  dissolved in IMDM as a standard, with IMDM alone as a blank.  $NO_2^-$  production is reported as nanomoles per 10<sup>5</sup> BMMφ. Griess reagent detects nitrite in the range of 1 to 300  $\mu$ M (10).

Incubation of M. bovis with RNI at reduced pH. M. bovis organisms were seeded into flat-bottom microdilution plates with  $5 \times 10^5$  bacteria per well in bicarbonate-free IMDM with increasing concentrations of  $NaNO<sub>2</sub>$ . After 3 days of incubation, [3H]uracil (0.5  $\mu$ Ci per well) was added and the solution was allowed to stand for 7 h. The incorporation of radioactivity was counted in a Beta-plate  $\beta$ -counter.

## RESULTS

In the following experiments, BMM $\phi$  obtained by cultivation in serum-free medium were used. As shown previously, these cells represent a quiescent macrophage population. After activation with rIFN- $\gamma$ , growth of *M*. bovis as well as M. tuberculosis H37Rv is inhibited (7, 8). The viability of M. bovis was determined by the uptake of  $[^3H]$ uracil, which is incorporated into the RNA of mycobacteria. An <sup>80</sup> to 95% reduction in [3H]uracil uptake reflects a 10- to 100-fold decrease in the number of intracellular bacteria as determined by CFU (7). Since BMM $\phi$  were lysed with saponin before the addition of  $[3H]$ uracil, the incorporation of radioactivity into cellular RNA could be ruled out.

RNI production by BMM $\phi$ . Among RNI, NO has been identified as the intermediate effector molecule. NO is short-lived (half-life, 4 to 50 s) and reacts with itself, oxygen, and water to generate  $NO_2^-$  and  $NO_3^-$ , which accumulate in macrophage culture supernatants at a ratio of 3:2 (4, 10, 33). With the Griess reaction, the amount of accumulated  $NO<sub>2</sub>$ is measured (10). Since RNI are small molecules which diffuse through cell membranes, an active secretion process is not required. We assume <sup>a</sup> steady state between intracellular and extracellular nitrite on the day of measurement (day 4).

RNI production, as measured by  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$ , was investigated in BMM $\phi$ . Cells were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  for 24 h and subsequently treated with either viable  $M$ . bovis organisms or zymosan particles. After 24 h, supernatants were collected for  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  detection, macrophages were washed, and fresh medium was added. After 48 and 72 h, supernatants were collected in the same way. As shown in Table 1,

TABLE 1.  $NO_2^-$  production by BMM $\phi^a$ 

Phagocytic stimulus and amt of $rIFN-\gamma$ (U/m)	$NO2$ production, nmol/10 <sup>5</sup> BMM $\phi$ $mean \pm SD$			
	24h	48 h	72 h	
M. bovis				
$\boldsymbol{b}$	0	Ω		
100	$0.9 \pm 0.1$	$0.7 \pm 0.1$		
500	$2.9 \pm 0.2$	$4.8 \pm 0.1$		
2.500	$3.2 \pm 0.1$	$5.6 \pm 0.2$	$0.5 \pm 0.2$	
Zymosan				
	0	0	0	
100	0	0	0	
500	$0.3 \pm 0.2$	$0.3 \pm 0.06$		
2.500	$0.9 \pm 0.1$	$1.2 \pm 0.2$		

<sup>a</sup> BMM $\phi$  (10<sup>5</sup> per well) were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  for 24 h, washed, and treated with either viable M. bovis organisms or zymosan. Every 24 h, supernatants were collected for  $NO_2^-$  detection, cells were washed, and fresh medium was added. Either  $M$ . bovis (10<sup>6</sup> per well) or unopsonized zymosan (10  $\mu$ g per well) were used as phagocytic stimuli. In the absence of any phagocytic stimulus, results showed no  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  production. Data are presented as means from fourfold determinations  $\pm$  standard deviations.

 $-$ , none.

unstimulated BMM $\phi$  or BMM $\phi$  stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$ failed to release detectable amounts of  $NO<sub>2</sub>^-$ . M. bovis infection of  $rIFN-\gamma$ -stimulated BMM $\phi$  induced marked  $NO_2^-$  production for 48 h; afterwards,  $NO_2^-$  release declined. Also, phagocytosis of unopsonized zymosan particles induced  $NO_2^-$  release in BMM $\phi$  which were activated with rIFN- $\gamma$ . However, the amount of NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> detected was significantly lower than that produced by cells costimulated by IFN- $\gamma$  and viable *M. bovis.* Obviously, RNI synthesis by murine BMM $\phi$  requires two signals which are provided by costimulation with rIFN- $\gamma$  and M. bovis.

Antimycobacterial activity of and RNI production by **BMM** $\phi$ **.** Previously, we demonstrated that rIFN- $\gamma$  is capable of inducing antimycobacterial capacities in BMM4 (7). To determine whether mycobacterial growth inhibition is paralleled by  $NO<sub>2</sub>$  production, BMM $\phi$  were stimulated with increasing concentrations of rIFN- $\gamma$  for 24 h and subsequently infected with  $M$ . bovis organisms. After 4 days of incubation, supernatants were collected for  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  determination; afterwards  $BMM\phi$  were lysed and mycobacterial growth was assessed by  $[^{3}H]$ uracil incorporation. As shown in Fig. 1, increasing concentrations of  $rIFN-\gamma$  induced the release of  $NO_2^-$  by BMM $\phi$  in a dose-dependent fashion, which was paralleled by intracellular growth inhibition of M. bovis.

Effect of L-arginine depletion on BMM $\phi$  antimycobacterial activity. RNI produced by macrophages are derived from L-arginine (14, 24, 25, 34), and hence a lack of L-arginine should prevent RNI production. BMM $\phi$  were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  in medium containing L-arginine to guarantee normal protein synthesis during the activation period. Then medium was removed and infection with  $M$ . bovis was performed in L-arginine-deficient medium. As shown in Fig. 2, the depletion of L-arginine from the medium completely abolished the antimycobacterial activity of  $BMM\phi$ . The depletion of L-arginine not only affects RNI production by macrophages; it also enhances superoxide production, the phagocytosis of latex beads, and protein synthesis (2).

Reversion of  $NO_2^-$  production and antimycobacterial activity by L-arginine analogs. MLA and NLA are two N-guanidino-substituted specific analogs of L-arginine which inhibit



FIG. 1. Antimycobacterial activity and  $NO_2^-$  production by rIFN- $\gamma$ -activated BMM $\phi$ . BMM $\phi$  were stimulated with increasing concentrations of rIFN-y for 24 h, washed, and infected with M. bovis organisms. Four days later, supernatants were collected for NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> determination ( $\blacklozenge$ ). Intracellular growth of mycobacteria was measured by [3H]uracil incorporation ( $\Box$ ). Data are presented as means from triplicate cultures  $\pm$  standard deviations. Take note that nitrite concentrations below 1  $\mu$ M (0.2 nmoles per 10<sup>5</sup> BMM $\phi$ ) cannot be detected with Griess reagent (10).

RNI synthesis by macrophages (12, 14). BMM $\phi$  were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  for 24 h, washed, and infected with M. bovis in the presence of increasing concentrations of MLA or NLA, respectively. After 4 days of incubation, supernatants were collected to measure  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  production. As shown in Table 2,  $NO<sub>2</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> production was inhibited in a concentration-dependent manner by MLA but not by NLA. In parallel, mycobacterial growth inhibition was determined. The addition of MLA or NLA to the cultures during activation with rIFN- $\gamma$  and the subsequent infection with M. bovis in medium without analogs had no effect on intracellular growth inhibition of mycobacteria (Fig. 3). In contrast, when the analogs were added during infection with  $M$ . bovis, MLA markedly reversed the growth inhibition induced by  $rIFN-\gamma$ , whereas NLA had little effect (Fig. 4). MLA and NLA had no direct effect on the viability of M. bovis, and the addition of excess L-arginine partially counteracted the effect of MLA (data not shown). We do not have an explanation for the different effects of MLA and NLA in our assay system. Both analogs have been shown to reverse the RNI-mediated inhibition of malaria parasite development induced by tumor necrosis factor and interleukin 6 in cocultures of hepatocytes and nonparenchymal cells (27).

Direct effect of RNI on the growth of M. bovis. The direct effect of RNI on the growth of  $M$ . bovis was assessed by incubating bacteria with increasing concentrations of NaNO<sub>2</sub> in bicarbonate-free IMDM at pH 6.5 and 6.0 for 3 days. Upon mild acidification,  $HNO<sub>2</sub>$  is formed from NaNO<sub>2</sub>, the dismutation of which generates NO  $(33)$ . Accordingly, NaNO<sub>2</sub> at pH  $6.0$  and less so at pH  $6.5$  inhibited [ $3H$ ]uracil incorporation by *M. bovis* in a concentrationdependent way (Table 3).

## DISCUSSION

Although it is generally accepted that interleukin-activated macrophages represent the crucial effector cells of host resistance against tubercle bacilli and other intracellular bacteria, little is known about the underlying mechanisms (26). Low-molecular-weight components including ROI  $(O_2^-$ ,  $H_2O_2$ , <sup>1</sup>O<sub>2</sub>, and OH<sup>\*</sup>) and RNI (NO, NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>, and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) could be important. For a long time, ROI have been considered crucial for antimycobacterial resistance (15, 16, 35). Our attempts to show a role for ROI in mycobacterial growth inhibition by  $rIFN-\gamma$ -activated BMM $\phi$  have thus far failed  $(8)$ . We used murine BMM $\phi$  obtained in a serum-free culture medium, which represent a quiescent macrophage population. After activation with  $rIFN-\gamma$ , these macrophages express marked antimycobacterial activities; however, scavengers of ROI had no effect on the growth inhibition of M. bovis (8).

By using the very same cell system, we now provide evidence for a major role of RNI in mycobacterial growth inhibition. Our claim is based on the following findings: (i) mycobacterial infection of rIFN--y-stimulated BMM4 caused marked RNI production, as measured by  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$ ; (ii) mycobacterial growth was inhibited by RNI generated by mild acidification of IMDM containing  $NaNO<sub>2</sub>$ ; and (iii) inhibition of RNI production by  $BMM\phi$  either by the addition of the L-arginine analog MLA or by L-arginine depletion-reversed growth inhibition of M. bovis.

Synthesis of RNI appears to be a general property of macrophages (21, 24). After activation,  $NO_2^-$ ,  $NO_3^-$ , and citrulline are synthesized from L-arginine with NO as an intermediate (25). Evidence that NO rather than  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  and  $NO<sub>3</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> is the bacteriostatic effector molecule has been previ-



FIG. 2. Effect of L-arginine depletion on growth inhibition of M. bovis. BMM $\phi$  were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  for 24 h, washed, and infected with M. bovis organisms in medium without ( $\Box$ ) or with ( $\blacklozenge$ ) 0.5 mM of L-arginine. Intracellular growth of M. bovis was measured after 4 days by  $[{}^{3}H]$ uracil incorporation. Data are presented as means from triplicate cultures  $\pm$  standard deviations.

ously presented (33). The enzyme nitric oxide synthase has been found in the cytosol of macrophages costimulated with IFN- $\gamma$  plus lipopolysaccharide but not in the cytosol of unstimulated cells (34).

By using either resident peritoneal macrophages or peri-

TABLE 2. Effect of MLA and NLA on  $NO<sub>2</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> production<sup>a</sup>

RNI inhibitor $(\mu$ g/ml)	$NO2$ production, $nmoles/105$ BMM $\Phi$ $mean \pm SD$
<b>MLA</b>	
	$10.3 \pm 0.4$
	$9.8 \pm 0.8$
	$8.0 \pm 0.3$
	$3.9 \pm 0.08$
	$1.8 \pm 0.3$
NLA	
	$9.5 \pm 0.6$
	$9.7 \pm 0.6$
	$8.9 \pm 0.2$
	$9.0 \pm 0.2$

" BMM $\phi$  were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  (500 U/ml) for 24 h, washed, and infected with M. bovis in the presence of MLA or NLA. Accumulation of  $NO<sub>2</sub>$  in the culture supernatant was measured after 4 days of incubation. Data are presented as the means from triplicate cultures  $\pm$  the standard deviations.

-, no inhibitor.

toneal macrophages elicited with periodate, casein, or thioglycolate, Ding et al. (4) showed that, of 12 cytokines, IFN- $\gamma$ is the only one which induces substantial  $NO<sub>2</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> secretion. IFN- $\gamma$  plus lipopolysaccharide as well as IFN- $\gamma$  plus tumor necrosis factor interacted synergistically. M. bovis infection of mice results in an increased excretion of  $NO_3$ <sup>-</sup> (31). Peritoneal macrophages from  $M$ . bovis-infected mice also produce high levels of  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  and  $NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  (32). Murine BMM $\phi$  obtained in a serum-containing medium could also be induced to secrete  $NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>$  after stimulation with macrophage-activating lymphokines (19). In our system,  $NO<sub>2</sub>$  production was not induced by rIFN- $\gamma$  alone; rather, mycobacterial infection was necessary. In some but not all macrophage preparations, viable M. bovis alone was sufficient to induce  $NO_2$ <sup>-</sup> secretion. Since serum-free BMM $\phi$ represent a completely quiescent macrophage population (in contrast to peritoneal macrophages and BMM $\phi$  cultivated with serum), these findings suggest that a triggering signal provided by bacteria is necessary for RNI production by macrophages.

Previous studies have already revealed that RNI are involved in the elimination of the intracellular protozoa  $L$ . *major* and *T. gondii* by interleukin-activated macrophages  $(1, 11, 22, 23)$ . Also, macrophages activated with IFN- $\gamma$  and lipopolysaccharide are cytostatic for the opportunistic fungus C. neoformans and for some tumor cell lines (9, 12, 13, 19, 33). Furthermore, cytotoxic activity of lymphokine-



FIG. 3. Effect of L-arginine analogs MLA and NLA on growth inhibition of M. bovis. Analogs were present during activation of BMM $\phi$  with rIFN- $\gamma$ . BMM $\phi$  were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  (500 U/mI) in the presence of MLA (closed columns) or NLA (hatched columns) or in the absence of either compound (open column). After 24 h, cells were washed and infected with  $M$ . bovis organisms. Growth of mycobacteria was measured after 4 days by  $[3]$ H]uracil incorporation. Percent inhibition =  $(1 - [3H]$ uracil uptake after culture with rIFN-y-activated BMM $\phi$ /<sup>3</sup>H]uracil uptake after culture with unstimulated  $BMM\phi$ ) × 100. Data are presented as means from triplicate cultures  $\pm$  standard deviations.

activated macrophages for the extracellular helminth S. mansoni seems to depend on RNI (17, 18). These studies as well as ours employed inhibition of the L-arginine-dependent production of RNI by the L-arginine analog MLA or by the use of L-arginine-depleted medium. In our experiments, the L-arginine analog NLA showed negligible effects for unknown reasons.

When generated in a cell-free system, both ROI and RNI expressed marked antimycobacterial activity. On the other hand, the infection of rIFN-y-activated BMM $\phi$  with M.

TABLE 3. Effect of NaNO<sub>2</sub> on the  $[3H]$ uracil incorporation of M. bovis at pHs  $6.0$  and  $6.5<sup>a</sup>$ 

$NaNO2$ , $\mu$ g/ml $(\mu M)$	Effect at pH 6.0		Effect at pH 6.5	
	<sup>3</sup> H luracil uptake, cpm $mean \pm SD$	% Inhibition <sup><i>b</i></sup>	[ <sup>3</sup> H]uracil uptake, cpm $mean \pm SD$	% Inhibition
	$3.164 \pm 98$		$2.893 \pm 258$	
0.05(0.72)	$2.919 \pm 159$	8	$2,835 \pm 193$	2
0.5(7.2)	$2.849 \pm 114$	10	$2.634 \pm 61$	9
5(72)	$2.370 \pm 183$	25	$2,407 \pm 170$	17
50 (720)	$1.015 \pm 184$	68	$2,373 \pm 234$	18
125 (1,800)	$151 \pm 65$	95	$1.431 \pm 158$	51
250 (3,600)	$64 \pm 20$	98	$307 \pm 89$	89

<sup>a</sup> M. bovis organisms  $(5 \times 10^5$  per well) were seeded into microdilution plates in IMDM with  $NANO<sub>2</sub>$  at pHs 6.0 and 6.5. After 3 days of incubation,  $[3H]$ uracil was added for 7 h to assess the viability of mycobacteria. —, no NaNO<sub>2</sub>.

<sup>b</sup> Percent inhibition =  $(1 - [3H]$ uracil uptake of bacteria treated with NaNO<sub>2</sub>/[<sup>3</sup>H]uracil uptake of untreated bacteria) × 100. [<sup>3</sup>H]uracil uptake data are presented as means from fourfold determinations  $(±$  standard deviations).



FIG. 4. Effect of the L-arginine analogs MLA and NLA on the growth inhibition of  $M$ . bovis. Analogs were present during the infection of BMM4 with M. bovis. BMM4 were stimulated with rIFN- $\gamma$  (500 U/ml) for 24 h, washed, and infected with M. bovis organisms in the presence of MLA (closed columns) or NLA (hatched columns) or in the absence of either compound (open columns). Growth of mycobacteria was measured after 4 days by [<sup>3</sup>H]uracil uptake. Percent inhibition was calculated as described in the legend to Fig. 3. Data are presented as means from triplicate determinations  $\pm$  standard deviations.

bovis did not result in the secretion of ROI (7) but induced production of RNI only. It has been shown previously that mycobacteria are preferentially taken up via complement receptors and that this type of receptor-mediated phagocytosis bypasses ROI production (29). In addition, low-molecular-weight fractions of mycobacteria, including sulfolipids (28, 36), lipoarabinomannan (30), and phenolic glycolipid-1 (3), are able to inhibit ROI production by macrophages. Taken together, these data suggest that mycobacteria are well equipped to interfere with the oxidative burst, but not with RNI production. Obviously, RNI play a more important role in antituberculous resistance than ROI.

Several groups including ourselves have provided evidence for an additional role of phagosome-lysosome fusion in mycobacterial growth inhibition (8, 26). With what we know now, it appears that RNI release and the introduction of lysosomal enzymes into the infected phagosome are of major importance for the host defense against tubercle bacilli. It is unclear at the moment whether the two mechanisms are independent or synergistic in action.

Tuberculosis is typically a disease of the lung, and this organ represents the preferential port of entry for tubercle bacilli. Recent studies have shown that nitric oxide synthase is induced by endotoxin in rat lungs (20). We, therefore, assume that the mechanism delineated here in an in vitro system may also contribute to the defense against tuberculosis in vivo. Further studies employing the inhibition of RNI production in vivo by MLA are planned to decide whether RNI are indeed involved in in vivo resistance against tuberculosis.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

S.H.E.K. received financial support for this work from the A. Krupp award for young professors, SFB 322, and Landesschwerpunkt 30.

The secretarial help of B. Simon and R. Mahmoudi is gratefully acknowledged. We also thank G. Adolf for supplying us with  $rIFN-\gamma$ .

## ADDENDUM IN PROOF

After this paper was submitted, Denis published similar results (M. Denis, Cell. Immunol. 132:150-157, 1991).

## **REFERENCES**

- 1. Adams, L. B., J. B. Hibbs, Jr., R. R. Taintor, and J. L. Krahenbuhl. 1990. Microbiostatic effect of murine-activated macrophages for Toxoplasma gondii. Role for synthesis of inorganic nitrogen oxides from L-arginine. J. Immunol. 144: 2725-2729.
- 2. Albina, J. E., M. D. Caldwell, W. L. Henry, Jr., and C. D. Mills. 1989. Regulation of macrophage functions by L-arginine. J. Exp. Med. 169:1021-1029.
- 3. Chan, J., T. Fujiwara, P. Brennan, M. McNeil, S. J. Turco, J. C. Sibille, M. Snapper, P. Aisen, and B. R. Bloom. 1989. Microbial glycolipids: possible virulence factors that scavenge oxygen radicals. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 86:2453-2457.
- 4. Ding, A. H., C. F. Nathan, and D. J. Stuehr. 1988. Release of reactive nitrogen intermediates and reactive oxygen intermediates from mouse peritoneal macrophages. Comparison of activating cytokines and evidence for independent production. J. Immunol. 141:2407-2412.
- 5. Drapier, J.-C., J. Wietzerbin, and J. B. Hibbs, Jr. 1988. Interferon- $\gamma$  and tumor necrosis factor induce the L-arginine-dependent cytotoxic effector mechanism in murine macrophages. Eur. J. Immunol. 18:1587-1592.
- 6. Flesch, I., and E. Ferber. 1986. Growth requirements of murine bone marrow macrophages in serum-free cell culture. Immunobiology 171:14-26.
- 7. Flesch, I., and S. H. E. Kaufmann. 1987. Mycobacterial growth inhibition by interferon-y-activated bone marrow macrophages and differential susceptibility among strains of Mycobacterium tuberculosis. J. Immunol. 138:4408-4413.
- 8. Flesch, I. E. A., and S. H. E. Kaufmann. 1988. Attempts to characterize the mechanisms involved in mycobacterial growth inhibition by gamma-interferon-activated bone marrow macrophages. Infect. Immun. 56:1464-1469.
- 9. Granger, D. L., J. B. Hibbs, Jr., J. R. Perfect, and D. T. Durack. 1988. Specific amino acid (L-arginine) requirement for the microbiostatic activity of murine macrophages. J. Clin. Invest. 81:1129-1136.
- 10. Green, L. C., D. A. Wagner, J. Glogowski, P. L. Skipper, J. S. Wishnok, and S. R. Tannenbaum. 1982. Analysis of nitrate, nitrite, and  $[15N]$ nitrate in biological fluids. Anal. Biochem. 126:131-138.
- 11. Green, S. J., M. S. Meltzer, J. B. Hibbs, Jr., and C. A. Nacy. 1990. Activated macrophages destroy intracellular Leishmania major amastigotes by an L-arginine-dependent killing mechanism. J. Immunol. 144:278-283.
- 12. Hibbs, Jr., J. B., R. R. Taintor, Z. Vavrin, and E. M. Rachlin. 1988. Nitric oxide: a cytotoxic activated macrophage effector molecule. Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun. 187:87-94.
- 13. Higuchi, M., N. Higashi, H. Taki, and T. Osawa. 1990. Cytolytic mechanisms of activated macrophages. Tumor necrosis factor and L-arginine-dependent mechanisms act synergistically as the major cytolytic mechanisms of activated macrophages. J. Immunol. 144:1425-1431.
- 14. Iyengar, R., D. J. Stuehr, and M. A. Marletta. 1987. Macrophage synthesis of nitrite, nitrate, and N-nitrosamines: precursors and role of the respiratory burst. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 84:6369-6373.
- 15. Jackett, P. S., V. R. Aber, D. A. Mitchison, and D. B. Lowrie. 1981. The contribution of hydrogen peroxide resistance to virulence of Mycobacterium tuberculosis during the first six days after intravenous infection of normal and BCG-vaccinated guinea pigs. Br. J. Exp. Pathol. 62:34-40.
- 16. Jackett, P. S., P. W. Andrew, V. R. Aber, and D. B. Lowrie. 1983. Guinea pig alveolar macrophages probably kill M. tuberculosis H37Rv and H37Ra in vivo by producing hydrogen peroxide. Adv. Exp. Med. Biol. 162:99-104.
- 17. James, S. L., and J. Glaven. 1989. Macrophage cytotoxicity against schistosomula of Schistosoma mansoni involves arginine-dependent production of reactive nitrogen intermediates. J. Immunol. 143:4208-4212.
- 18. James, S. L., and J. B. Hibbs, Jr. 1990. The role of nitrogen oxides as effector molecules of parasite killing. Parasitology Today 6:303-305.
- 19. Keller, R., and R. Keist. 1989. Abilities of activated macrophages to manifest tumoricidal activity and to generate reactive nitrogen intermediates: a comparative study in vitro and ex vivo. Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun. 164:968-973.
- 20. Knowles, R. G., M. Merrett, M. Salter, and S. Moncada. 1990. Differential induction of brain, lung and liver nitric oxide synthase by endotoxin in the rat. Biochem. J. 270:833-836.
- 21. Liew, F. Y., and F. E. G. Cox. 1990. Non-specific defence mechanism: the role of nitric oxide. Immunol. Today 12:A17- A21.
- 22. Liew, F. Y., Y. Li, and S. Millot. 1990. TNF-alpha synergizes with IFN-gamma in mediating killing of Leishmania major through the induction of nitric oxide. J. Immunol. 145:4306- 4310.
- 23. Liew, F. Y., S. Millot, C. Parkinson, R. M. J. Palmer, and S. Moncada. 1990. Macrophage killing of Leishmania parasite in vivo is mediated by nitric oxide from L-arginine. J. Immunol. 144:4797.
- 24. Marletta, M. A. 1989. Nitric oxide: biosynthesis and biological significance. Trends Biochem. Sci. 14:488-492.
- 25. Marietta, M. A., P. S. Yoon, R. Iyengar, C. D. Leaf, and J. S. Wishnok. 1988. Macrophage oxidation of L-arginine to nitrite and nitrate: nitric oxide is an intermediate. Biochemistry 27: 8706-8711.
- 26. Moulder, J. W. 1985. Comparative biology of intracellular parasitism. Microbiol. Rev. 49:298-337.
- 27. Nussler, A., J.-C. Drapier, L. Renia, S. Pied, F. Miltgen, M. Gentilini, and D. Mazier. 1991. L-arginine-dependent destruction of intrahepatic malaria parasites in response to tumor necrosis factor and/or interleukin 6 stimulation. Eur. J. Immunol. 21:227-230.
- 28. Pabst, M. J., J. M. Gross, J. P. Brozna, and M. B. Goren. 1988. Inhibition of macrophage priming by sulfatide from Mycobacterium tuberculosis. J. Immunol. 140:634-640.
- 29. Schlesinger, L. S., C. G. Bellinger-Kawahara, N. R. Payne, and M. A. Horwitz. 1990. Phagocytosis of Mycobacterium tuberculosis is mediated by human monocyte complement receptors and complement component C3. J. Immunol. 144:2771-2780.
- 30. Sibley, L. D., S. W. Hunter, P. J. Brennan, and J. L. Krahenbuhl. 1988. Mycobacterial lipoarabinomannan inhibits gamma interferon-mediated activation of macrophages. Infect. Immun. 56:1232-1236.
- 31. Stuehr, D. J., and M. A. Marletta. 1985. Mammalian nitrate biosynthesis: mouse macrophages produce nitrite and nitrate in response to Escherichia coli lipopolysaccharide. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 82:7738-7742.
- 32. Stuehr, D. J., and M. A. Marletta. 1987. Induction of nitrite/ nitrate synthesis in murine macrophages by BCG infection, lymphokines, or interferon- $\gamma$ . J. Immunol. 139:518-525.
- 33. Stuehr, D. J., and C. F. Nathan. 1989. Nitric oxide. A macrophage product responsible for cytostasis and respiratory inhibition in tumor target cells. J. Exp. Med. 169:1543-1555.
- 34. Tayeh, M. A., and M. A. Marletta. 1989. Macrophage oxidation of L-arginine to nitric oxide, nitrite, and nitrate. J. Biol. Chem. 264:19654-19658.
- 35. Walker, L., and D. B. Lowrie. 1981. Killing of Mycobacterium microti by immunologically activated macrophages. Nature (London) 293:69-70.
- 36. Zhang, L., M. B. Goren, T. J. Holzer, and B. R. Andersen. 1988. Effect of Mycobacterium tuberculosis-derived sulfolipid <sup>I</sup> on human phagocytic cells. Infect. Immun. 56:2876-2883.