

Article Addendum

Interplay Among Nitric Oxide and Reactive Oxygen Species

A Complex Network Determining Cell Survival or Death

Jian Zhao

Correspondence to: Jian Zhao; 1100 Bates Street; Room 9016; Children's Nutrition Research Center; Department of Pediatrics; Baylor College of Medicine; Houston, TX 77030; Tel: 713.798.7039; Fax: 713.798.7078; Email: jzhao1@bcm.tmc.edu

Original manuscript submitted: 07/20/07
Manuscript accepted: 07/29/07

Previously published online as a *Plant Signaling & Behavior* E-publication:
<http://www.landesbioscience.com/journals/psb/article/4802>

KEY WORDS

cell death, nitric oxide, reactive oxygen species, interaction, posttranslational modification

Addendum to:

Reactive Oxygen Species, Nitric Oxide, and Their Interactions Play Different Roles in Cupressus lusitanica Cell Death and Phytoalexin Biosynthesis

Zhao J, Fujita K, Sakai K

New Phytol 2007; 175:215-29

PMID: 17587371

DOI: 10.1111/j.1469-8137.2007.02109.x

ABSTRACT

Programmed cell death (PCD) is an integrated cellular process occurring in plant growth, development, and defense responses to facilitate normal growth and development and better survival against various stresses as a whole. As universal toxic chemicals in plant and animal cells, reactive oxygen or nitrogen species (ROS or RNS), mainly superoxide anion ($O_2^{\cdot-}$), hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2) or nitric oxide ($\cdot NO$), have been studied extensively for their roles in PCD induction. Physiological and genetic studies have convincingly shown their essential roles. However, the details and mechanisms by which ROS and $\cdot NO$ interplay and induce PCD are not well understood. Our recent study on *Cupressus lusitanica* culture cell death revealed the elicitor-induced co-accumulation of ROS and $\cdot NO$ and interactions between $\cdot NO$ and H_2O_2 or $O_2^{\cdot-}$ in different ways to regulate cell death. $\cdot NO$ and H_2O_2 reciprocally enhanced the production of each other whereas $\cdot NO$ and $O_2^{\cdot-}$ showed reciprocal suppression on each other's production. It was the interaction between $\cdot NO$ and $O_2^{\cdot-}$ but not between $\cdot NO$ and H_2O_2 that induced PCD, probably through peroxynitrite ($ONOO^{\cdot-}$). In this addendum, some unsolved issues in the study were discussed based on recent studies on the complex network of ROS and $\cdot NO$ leading to PCD in animals and plants.

INTRODUCTION

Biosynthesis of β -thujaplicin is of great interest not only because of its novel structure but also for its multiple biological activities and an increasing demand in market.¹ Fungal elicitor-induced β -thujaplicin production by *Cupressus lusitanica* cell culture results from several signaling mechanisms, while the elicitor-induced hypersensitive cell death was mediated in part by elicitor-induced $O_2^{\cdot-}$ but not H_2O_2 .^{2,3} It was found that $\cdot NO$ was generated upon elicitor treatment in parallel with $O_2^{\cdot-}$ and H_2O_2 accumulation, and $\cdot NO$ donors also induced a pronounced *C. lusitanica* cell death. Using biosynthetic enzyme inhibitors or scavengers, we showed that $\cdot NO$ and $O_2^{\cdot-}$ production was necessary for $O_2^{\cdot-}$ or $\cdot NO$ induction of cell death, respectively. Measuring H_2O_2 , $\cdot NO$ and $O_2^{\cdot-}$ production in various treatments indicated that H_2O_2 and $\cdot NO$ reciprocally stimulated the production of each other, whereas $\cdot NO$ and $O_2^{\cdot-}$ suppressed the accumulation of each other. Since $\cdot NO$ readily reacts with $O_2^{\cdot-}$ and generate a more potent oxidant $ONOO^{\cdot-}$, which plays pivotal roles in animal cells under oxidative and nitrosative stress, we proposed that $\cdot NO$ and $O_2^{\cdot-}$ induced cell death mainly through their interaction product $ONOO^{\cdot-}$.

ROS-OR RNS-INDUCED CELL DEATH IS MORE LIKELY MEDIATED BY INTERACTION BETWEEN ROS AND RNS

Early physiological studies have shown many controversial results about if ROS and $\cdot NO$, either $O_2^{\cdot-}$ or H_2O_2 or $\cdot NO$, is necessary or sufficient to induce plant cell death.⁴⁻⁷ Genetic evidence has proved that elevated $O_2^{\cdot-}$, singlet oxygen, or H_2O_2 levels are able to induce cell death under certain conditions. Arabidopsis mutants *lsd1* and *rcd1* produce more $O_2^{\cdot-}$ and thus undergo a PCD spontaneously.^{8,9} A *flu* mutant generates singlet oxygen (1O_2) upon a dark-to-light shift and initiates a cell death.¹⁰ Transgenic plants deficient in H_2O_2 -scavenging enzymes such as ascorbate peroxidase (APX) and catalase have elevated ROS levels, and therefore are more susceptible to $\cdot NO$ treatment by showing a more dramatically augmented cell death than wild-type plants.^{11,12} These data suggest that elevated ROS levels in these plants are necessary for cell death induction. However, it may be too early to conclude that these ROS alone are sufficient to induce PCD since whether

Thiol modification by ROS such as hydrogen peroxide is already recognized as a potential signalling mechanism in plants.¹⁹ S-Nitrosylation of cysteine residues in proteins has been well documented in animals.²² S-nitrosylation of plant proteins is also regarded as an important regulatory mechanism similar to that of protein phosphorylation. S-Nitrosylation of glyceraldehyde 3-phosphate dehydrogenase (GAPDH), hemoglobin and Met adenosyltransferase has been reported; more substrate proteins have been identified as potentially S-nitrosylated targets in Arabidopsis.²³ H₂O₂ also modified and inhibited GAPDH.²⁴

Tyrosine nitration is mediated by ONOO⁻ and nitrogen dioxide (*NO₂) formed as interaction between RNS and ROS or transition metals. In animals, peroxynitrite mediates the inactivation of Mn-superoxide dismutase (Mn-SOD) through tyrosine nitration at Tyr34 into 3-nitrotyrosine.²⁵ This modification also activates cytochrome c.²⁶ Nitration of Tyr residues in plant proteins has also been observed in antisense nitrite reductase tobacco²⁷ and following administration of ONOO⁻ in vitro.⁴ Tyrosine nitration causes conformation, structure or catalytic activity changes; it also could block protein phosphorylation, which may be one mechanism for activation of target proteins.

All *NO or ROS, or ONOO⁻ mediated protein modifications can be essential cellular processes for PCD induction, not only by activation or inactivation of RNS/ROS generating and metabolizing enzymes but also through direct regulation of signaling and cellular process of PCD such as Ca²⁺ fluctuation, procaspase-3 activation.²²

BALANCES OF ROS AND RNS MAY CONTROL PCD OR NECROTIC CELL DEATH

ROS and *NO generate under both stress situations and normal growth conditions, thus ROS and *NO interaction and ONOO⁻ may form universally.^{14,19} Animals and plants developed enzyme- and non-enzyme-based systems to scavenge excessive ROS and RNS to keep the balances between generation and depletion of ROS and RNS, such as Mn-SOD, catalase, APX and glutathione-based systems.^{5,14,15} S-Nitrosoglutathione (GSNO) from rapid reaction of *NO and glutathione, or methemoglobin, can be the ways to remove *NO or as reservoirs or donors of *NO.²⁸ Peroxiredoxins are likely involved in reduction of both ROS and peroxynitrite.²⁹ However, loss of these balances during pathogenesis or abiotic stresses results in oxidative and nitrosative stresses, where ROS and RNS are over-produced. A plenty of evidence suggest that balances of RNS (mainly *NO) and ROS production are important for directing physiological consequences, either better survival or cell death.^{4,15,30} *C. lusitanica* culture cells have strong capability to scavenge H₂O₂, just like other cell cultures, and thus physiological concentrations of H₂O₂ do not induce a significant cell death.² High Fe²⁺ in culture medium induced cell death and strong lipid peroxidation through Fenton reaction, and also induced β-thujaplicin biosynthesis. However, glutathione enhanced both H₂O₂ and Fe²⁺-induced β-biosynthesis although it reduced lipid peroxidation, which was proposed to lead to oxylipin signaling for β-thujaplicin induction.² This may suggest GSNO from *NO- glutathione played roles in β-thujaplicin biosynthesis.

*NO-induced H₂O₂ production or H₂O₂-induced *NO accumulation may not be only due to suppression of catalase and activation of NADPH oxidase or *NO-generating enzymes, other reasons such as ROS- and RNS- mediated radical self-propagation mechanisms also can contribute to the results. Particularly in *C. lusitanica* cells,

interactions between NO and ROS and their interactions with Fe²⁺ or other free radicals, such as lipid radicals, may formed much more complicated chain reactions beyond our current understanding.^{3,31,32} RNS, ROS and lipid free radicals often form self-propagated chains and generate a large number of toxic oxidants, which can cause various cellular effects from modulations of cell signaling to overwhelming oxidative injury on lipids, DNA and proteins as well as integrity of both plasma- or endo-membranes, and eventually commit cells to necrosis or PCD.¹⁴ On enzyme levels, except affecting catalase and APX activity, *NO binding to Cyt C oxidase reversibly inhibits its activity and, as a consequence, increases O₂^{-•} and H₂O₂ production.²¹ ONOO⁻ mediated tryrosine nitration of Mn-SOD inhibit Mn-SOD activity, which results in over-accumulation of O₂^{-•} and ONOO⁻.²¹

On the other hand, some of the spontaneous and rapid chain reactions of RNS and ROS may scavenge some toxic radicals and protect cells from oxidative or nitrosative damaging.³¹ Guo and Crawford showed that deficiency in *NO production deficiency in AtNOS1 mutant resulted in unbalanced accumulation of ROS.³⁴ In our study, higher *NO production obviously inhibited lipid peroxidation. This often observed concentration-dependent function changes may reflect the importance of balance between RNS and ROS and their interactions.^{4,30} The different fates resulted from these reactive free radicals also depend on physiological environments that plant cells are in. Details and mechanisms for these aspects remain to be elusive.

ROS-RNS INDUCED CELL DEATH INITIATES FROM DYSFUNCTION OF MITOCHONDRIA

Unlike necrotic cell death caused by excessive phytotoxics, PCD is a cell death and involves many reversible molecular processes and cellular machineries. The cellular components for both ROS and *NO signaling pathways leading to cell death include Ca²⁺ spiking, Ca²⁺-binding proteins, protein kinases such as MAPKs, caspase or caspase-like proteases, lipid messengers such as phosphatidic acid and fatty acid hydroperoxides.^{19,32,33} The apoptosis and necrosis in animals all are originated from the mitochondria, where ROS and *NO can be excessively generated during pathogenesis.³⁵ The mitochondrial dysfunction such as permeability transition, cytochrome c release and respiration inhibition caused by ROS and RNS stresses, as well as their interaction results.^{36,37} Cytochrome c release is necessary for caspase activation that precedes mitochondrial permeability transition, nuclear condensation, and other hallmarks of apoptosis in animals.³⁵ Mitochondria also serve as an essential place for launching plant cell death because ROS and *NO stresses are amplified in mitochondria to trigger cytochrome c release through mitochondrial transition pore opening and morphological changes.^{36,37} One of the interesting observations for elicitor-induced PCD in *C. lusitanica* cell culture is treachery element differentiation. This xylogenesis PCD may involve *NO and ROS signaling as reported by others.³⁸ Further study is required to illustrate this issue.

In conclusion, ROS and *NO coincidentally occur within the same subcellular organelles, such as the mitochondria, in response to biotic and abiotic stresses, and their levels can be reciprocally controlled or affected by each other through the direct modification of enzymes involved in synthesis or catabolism of *NO and ROS.³⁹ *NO and ROS often show some overlapping and synergistic functions, particularly in cell death induction through interactions, which are determined by their reactive natures. The production balances of and

diverse interactions between ROS and *NO under different physiological environments form a complex signaling cellular network to determine if plant cells continue to survive or are directed to death. These redox signaling and complex cellular processes play essential roles in innate immune response and other defense systems of plants.

References

- Zhao J. Plant troponoids: Chemistry, biological activity, and biosynthesis. *Curr Med Chem* 2007; 14:2597-621.
- Zhao J, Fujita K, Sakai K. Oxidative stress in plant cell culture: A role in production of β -thujaplicin by *Cupressus lusitanica* cell cultures. *Biotechnol Bioeng* 2005; 90:621-31.
- Zhao J, Davis L, Verpoorte R. Elicitor signal transduction leading to production of plant secondary metabolites. *Biotechnol Adv* 2005; 23:283-333.
- Delledonne M, Zeier J, Marocco A, Lamb C. Signal interactions between nitric oxide and reactive oxygen intermediates in the plant hypersensitive disease resistance response. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2001; 98:13454-9.
- de Pinto MC, Tommasi F, De Gara L. Changes in the antioxidant systems as part of the signaling pathway responsible for the programmed cell death activated by nitric oxide and reactive oxygen species in tobacco Bright-Yellow 2 cells. *Plant Physiol* 2002; 130:698-708.
- Beligni MV, Fath A, Bethke PC, Lamatina L, Jones RL. Nitric oxide acts as an antioxidant and delays programmed cell death in barley aleurone layers. *Plant Physiol* 2002; 129:1642-50.
- Tada Y, Mori T, Shinogi T, Yao N, Takahashi S, et al. Nitric oxide and reactive oxygen species do not elicit hypersensitive cell death but induce apoptosis in the adjacent cells during the defense response of oat. *Mol Plant-Microbe Interact* 2004; 17:245-53.
- Jabs T, Dietrich RA, Dangel JL. Initiation of runaway cell death in a *Arabidopsis* mutant by extracellular superoxide. *Science* 1996; 273:1853-6.
- Overmyer K, Brosche M, Pellinen R, Kuittinen T, Tuominen H, Ahlfors R, Keinänen M, Saarna M, Scheel D, Kangasjarvi J. Ozone-induced programmed cell death in the *Arabidopsis* radical-induced cell death1 mutant. *Plant Physiol* 2005; 37:1092-104.
- op den Camp RG, Przybyla D, Ochsenein C, Laloi C, Kim C, Danon A, Wagner D, Hideg E, Gobel C, Feussner I, Nater M, Apel K. Rapid induction of distinct stress responses after the release of singlet oxygen in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Cell* 2003; 15:2320-32.
- Tarantino D, Vannini C, Bracale M, Campa M, Soave C, Murgia I. Antisense reduction of thylakoidal ascorbate peroxidase in *Arabidopsis* enhances paraquat-induced photooxidative stress and nitric oxide-induced cell death. *Planta* 2005; 221:757-65.
- Zago E, Morsa S, Dat JF, Alard P, Ferrarini A, Inzé D, Delledonne M, Van Breusegem F. Nitric oxide- and hydrogen peroxide-responsive gene regulation during cell death induction in tobacco. *Plant Physiol* 2006; 141:404-11.
- Clark D, Durner J, Navarre DA, Klessig DF. Nitric oxide inhibition of tobacco catalase and ascorbate peroxidase. *Mol Plant-Microbe Interact* 2000; 13:1380-4.
- Pacher P, Beckman JS, Liaudet L. Nitric oxide and peroxynitrite in health and disease. *Physiol Rev* 2007; 87:315-424.
- de Pinto MC, Paradiso A, Leonetti P, De Gara L. Hydrogen peroxide, nitric oxide and cytosolic ascorbate peroxidase at the crossroad between defence and cell death. *Plant J* 2006; 48:784-95.
- Bright J, Desikan R, Hancock JT, Weir IS, Neill SJ. ABA-induced NO generation and stomatal closure in *Arabidopsis* are dependent on H₂O₂ synthesis. *Plant J* 2006; 45:113-22.
- Caro A, Puntarulo S. Nitric oxide decreases superoxide anion generation by microsomes from soybean embryonic axes. *Physiol Plantarum* 1998; 104:357-64.
- Vanin F, Svistunenko DA, Mikoyan VD, Serezhnikov VA, Fryer MJ, Baker NR, Cooper CE. Endogenous superoxide production and the nitrite/nitrate ratio control the concentration of bioavailable free nitric oxide in leaves. *J Biol Chem* 2004; 279:24100-7.
- Zaninotto F, Camera SL, Polverari A, Delledonne M. Cross talk between reactive nitrogen and oxygen species during the hypersensitive disease resistance response. *Plant Physiol* 2005; 141:379-83.
- Navarre DA, Wendehenne D, Durner J, Noad R, Klessig DF. Nitric oxide modulates the activity of tobacco aconitase. *Plant Physiol* 2002; 122:573-82.
- Gow AJ, Farkouh CR, Munson DA, Posencheg MA, Ischiropoulos H. Biological significance of nitric oxide-mediated protein modifications. *Am J Physiol Lung Cell Mol Physiol* 2004; 287:L262-8.
- Benhar M, Stamler JS. A central role for S-nitrosylation in apoptosis. *Nature Cell Biol* 2005; 7:645-6.
- Lindermayr C, Saalbach G, Durner J. Proteomic identification of S-nitrosylated proteins in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Physiol* 2005; 137:921-30.
- Hancock JT, Henson D, Nyirenda M, Desikan R, Harrison J, Lewis M, Hughes J, Neill SJ. Proteomic identification of glyceraldehyde 3-phosphate dehydrogenase as an inhibitory target of hydrogen peroxide in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Physiol Biochem* 2005; 4:828-35.
- Yamakura F, Taka H, Fujimura T, Murayama K. Inactivation of human manganese-superoxide dismutase by peroxynitrite is caused by exclusive nitration of tyrosine 34 to 3-nitrotyrosine. *J Biol Chem* 1998; 273:14085-9.
- Cassina AM, Hodara R, Souza JM, Thomson L, Castro L, Ischiropoulos H, Freeman BA, Radi R. Cytochrome c nitration by peroxynitrite. *J Biol Chem* 2000; 275:21409-15.
- Morot-Gaudry-Talarmin Y, Rockel P, Moureaux T, Quillere I, Leydecker MT, Kaiser WM, Morot-Gaudry JF. Nitrite accumulation and nitric oxide emission in relation to cellular signaling in nitrite reductase antisense tobacco. *Planta* 2002; 215:708-15.
- Rusterucci C, Espunya MC, Diaz M, Chabannes M, Martinez MC. S-nitrosoglutathione reductase affords protection against pathogens in *Arabidopsis*, both locally and systemically. *Plant Physiol* 2007; 143:1282-92.
- Wood ZA, Poole LB, Karplus PA. Peroxiredoxin evolution and the regulation of hydrogen peroxide signaling. *Science* 2003; 300:650-3.
- Espey MG, Miranda KM, Feelisch M, Fukuto J, Grisham MB, Vitek MP, Wink DA. Mechanisms of cell death governed by the balance between nitrosative and oxidative stress. *Ann NY Acad Sci* 2000; 899:209-21.
- Rubbo H, Radi R, Anselmi D, Kirk M, Barnes S, Butler J, Eiserich JP, Freeman BA. Nitric oxide reaction with lipid peroxyl radicals spares α -tocopherol during lipid peroxidation. Greater oxidant protection from the pair nitric oxide/ α -tocopherol than α -tocopherol/ascorbate. *J Biol Chem* 2000; 275:10812-8.
- Montillet JL, Chamongpol S, Rustérucci C, Dat J, Van de Cotte B, Agnel JP, Battesti C, Inzé D, Van Breusegem F, Triantaphyllidis C. Fatty acid hydroperoxides and H₂O₂ in the execution of hypersensitive cell death in tobacco leaves. *Plant Physiol* 2005; 138:1516-26.
- Laxalt AM, Raho N, Have AT, Lamatina L. Nitric oxide is critical for inducing phosphatidic acid accumulation in xylanase-elicited tomato cells. *J Biol Chem* 2007; 282:21160-8.
- Guo FQ, Crawford NM. *Arabidopsis* nitric oxide synthase1 is targeted to mitochondria and protects against oxidative damage and dark-induced senescence. *Plant Cell* 2005; 17:3436-50.
- Borutaite V, Jekabsonė A, Morkuniene R, Brown GC. Inhibition of mitochondrial permeability transition prevents mitochondrial dysfunction, cytochrome c release and apoptosis induced by heart ischemia. *J Mol Cell Cardiol* 2003; 35:357-66.
- Vacca RA, Valenti D, Bobba A, Merafina RS, Passarella S, Marra E. Cytochrome c is released in a reactive oxygen species-dependent manner and is degraded via caspase-like proteases in tobacco Bright-Yellow 2 cells en route to heat shock-induced cell death. *Plant Physiol* 2006; 141:208-19.
- Morimoto S, Tanaka Y, Sasaki K, Tanaka H, Fukamizu T, Shoyama Y, Shoyama Y, Taura F. Identification and characterization of cannabinoids that induce cell death through mitochondrial permeability transition in *Cannabis* leaf cells. *J Biol Chem* 2007; 282:20739-51.
- Gabaldón C, Gómez Ros LV, Pedreño MA, Barceló AR. Nitric oxide production by the differentiating xylem of *Zinnia elegans*. *New Phytol* 2005; 165:121-30.
- Planchet E, Kaiser WM. Nitric oxide production in plants: Facts and fictions. 2006; *Plant Signal Behav* 1:46-51.