

# Toxicity of atmospheric aerosols on marine phytoplankton

Adina Paytan<sup>a,1</sup>, Katherine R. M. Mackey<sup>a,b</sup>, Ying Chen<sup>a,2</sup>, Ivan D. Lima<sup>c</sup>, Scott C. Doney<sup>c</sup>, Natalie Mahowald<sup>d</sup>, Rochelle Labiosa<sup>e</sup>, and Anton F. Post<sup>f</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Institute of Marine Science, University of California, Santa Cruz, CA 95064; <sup>b</sup>Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305; <sup>c</sup>Marine Chemistry and Geochemistry, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, MA 02543; <sup>d</sup>Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Cornell University, Cornell, NY 14850; <sup>e</sup>United States Geological Survey, 345 Middlefield Road, Menlo Park, CA 94025; and <sup>f</sup>H. Steinitz Marine Biology Laboratory, Interuniversity Institute of Marine Sciences, P.O.B. 469, Eilat 88103, Israel

Edited by Mark H. Thieme, University of California at San Diego, La Jolla, CA, and approved February 3, 2009 (received for review November 13, 2008)

**Atmospheric aerosol deposition is an important source of nutrients and trace metals to the open ocean that can enhance ocean productivity and carbon sequestration and thus influence atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations and climate. Using aerosol samples from different back trajectories in incubation experiments with natural communities, we demonstrate that the response of phytoplankton growth to aerosol additions depends on specific components in aerosols and differs across phytoplankton species. Aerosol additions enhanced growth by releasing nitrogen and phosphorus, but not all aerosols stimulated growth. Toxic effects were observed with some aerosols, where the toxicity affected picoeukaryotes and *Synechococcus* but not *Prochlorococcus*. We suggest that the toxicity could be due to high copper concentrations in these aerosols and support this by laboratory copper toxicity tests performed with *Synechococcus* cultures. However, it is possible that other elements present in the aerosols or unknown synergistic effects between these elements could have also contributed to the toxic effect. Anthropogenic emissions are increasing atmospheric copper deposition sharply, and based on coupled atmosphere–ocean calculations, we show that this deposition can potentially alter patterns of marine primary production and community structure in high aerosol, low chlorophyll areas, particularly in the Bay of Bengal and downwind of South and East Asia.**

Laboratory experiments, field observations, and numerical simulations all link atmospheric deposition events to increases in ocean chlorophyll concentrations and phytoplankton biomass (1–3), suggesting that atmospheric deposition of nutrients and trace metals can stimulate phytoplankton growth. Indeed, enrichment experiments with iron (a required nutrient scarce in seawater and enriched in dust) show that in high-nutrient low-chlorophyll areas (representing 20–40% of the ocean), iron addition can increase primary production, export production, and carbon sequestration (4–7). In areas where phosphorus and nitrogen concentrations are low, aerosol deposition can supply both iron and phosphate, nutrients that stimulate nitrogen fixation (8–9). It has been suggested that increases in dust deposition during glacial periods have been responsible for lowering atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations thus impacting climate (10–12).

Aerosol particles consist of many natural and anthropogenic components, including mineral dust, soot, organic molecules, sea salt crystals, spores, bacteria, and other microscopic particles (13), and can supply many elements and compounds to seawater (14–16). Little research has been done to elucidate what specific component(s) in aerosols affect phytoplankton at the level of community or individual species or how certain taxa within the community respond to distinct aerosol deposition events and to aerosols of different composition.

## Results and Discussion

To assess the short-term response of phytoplankton communities to aerosol deposition, we performed bioassay experiments on northern Red Sea surface seawater (17) using locally col-

lected dry deposition aerosol samples that represent the bulk of the deposition in this arid area [see detailed methods in [supporting information \(SI\) Text](#)]. We found that the phytoplankton were under colimitation of nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P), because N (combined nitrate and ammonium) and P (phosphate) additions on their own did not increase the amount of chlorophyll *a* (Chl *a*), whereas there were significant increases in Chl *a* relative to untreated controls when N and P were added together ( $P < 0.001$ ). Iron (Fe) concentrations are elevated in these surface waters (18, 19), thus the effect of Fe was not considered. Additions of 6 mg of locally collected aerosols (dry deposition collected on a filter by using a high-volume total-suspended-particle sampler) from the most prevalent (European) air mass source in this area, based on air mass back trajectories (19) along with N and P resulted in increases similar to those with combined N and P but without aerosol (Fig. 1). Treatments with European aerosols without inorganic N and P or with single-nutrient amendment resulted in doubling of Chl *a* relative to the control (significant increase  $P = 0.04$ , Fig. 1). The amount of aerosol added in these incubations (6 mg in 8 L) corresponds to the expected dust input ( $\text{mg L}^{-1}$  of surface seawater) from cumulative deposition ( $\text{mg m}^{-2}$ ) over 2 weeks and a mixed layer of 10–20 m (typical dust storms in this region last days to weeks). The response of the phytoplankton to aerosol additions indicates that aerosols were able to supply bioavailable N and P (although at concentrations less than those supplied in the nutrient additions we used) and reverse nutrient limitation of the phytoplankton community (Fig. 1). The N/P ratio in the aerosols was very high (on average N/P = 170) compared with the Redfield ratio typically required by marine phytoplankton (N/P = 16), emphasizing the importance and potential impact of atmospheric deposition as a nitrogen source to the ocean (3, 12, 20).

We also compared aerosols of African (Sahara Desert) trajectory to the more common European aerosol (Fig. 1). We use the same amount of aerosol as for the European aerosol additions that stimulated growth (6 mg in 8 L). The concentrations of soluble nutrients and trace metals added from these aerosols to the bioassay incubations were determined by measuring the total amount (micrograms or micromoles) of each component released to seawater from the aerosol filters after

Author contributions: A.P., K.R.M.M., and A.F.P. designed research; A.P., K.R.M.M., Y.C., I.D.L., S.C.D., N.M., R.L., and A.F.P. performed research; A.P., K.R.M.M., S.C.D., N.M., and A.F.P. contributed new reagents/analytic tools; A.P., K.R.M.M., Y.C., I.D.L., S.C.D., N.M., R.L., and A.F.P. analyzed data; and A.P., K.R.M.M., S.C.D., N.M., and A.F.P. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

Freely available online through the PNAS open access option.

<sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence should be addressed: E-mail: apaytan@ucsc.edu.

<sup>2</sup>Present address: Center for Atmospheric Chemistry Study, Department of Environmental Science and Engineering, Fudan University, 220 Handan Road, Shanghai 200433, People's Republic of China.

This article contains supporting information online at [www.pnas.org/cgi/content/full/0811486106/DCSupplemental](http://www.pnas.org/cgi/content/full/0811486106/DCSupplemental).





or other metal removal time scales ranging from 1 to 5 years (29–31). Under preindustrial conditions, potential Cu toxicity effects are concentrated in the northern hemisphere downwind of natural dust sources in low-chlorophyll subtropics in the Atlantic, Mediterranean and Indian Ocean basins (Fig. 4C; using an intermediate time scale of 3 years). Anthropogenic emissions expand the potential toxicity zones into the Bay of Bengal and small areas in the west Pacific downwind of Asian industrial regions (Fig. 4D). We note that if natural phytoplankton communities in the world's ocean are more sensitive to Cu toxicity than the Gulf of Aqaba populations, our model results may underestimate the actual area that may be impacted by Cu toxicity.

## Conclusions

The unique response of different phytoplankton to aerosols of different origin and chemical composition and our model results collectively illustrate the variable and globally significant impacts of aerosols on marine phytoplankton. Specifically, we report here a negative effect of aerosols in the open ocean in contrast to multiple examples of negative effects on land. Many climate models, however, assume that aerosol deposition is equivalent to Fe and/or P enrichment, which, in turn, uniformly stimulates phytoplankton growth across all taxonomic groups. Our work demonstrated that this is an incorrect oversimplification of the effects of aerosols, and more detailed and specific aerosol composition should be considered, as is done here. Moreover, the selective response of different taxa to aerosol additions demonstrates that aerosol deposition results in changes in phytoplankton community composition. On a local scale, these phytoplankton community shifts may affect grazing by higher trophic levels, thereby potentially impacting marine fisheries in coastal communities. Such changes may also directly affect the amount of export production, because species-dependent cell size, density, and aggregation potentially affect sinking rates. Predicted changes in dust deposition globally, from the present to the end of the century, range from a 300% increase (32) to a 60% decrease (33, 34). The complex mutual interactions between phytoplankton, atmospheric chemistry, and climate are important in view of predicted changes in aerosols deposition rates and distribution and the possible increase in future anthropogenic copper emissions. Accordingly, to predict the impacts of expected future changes in aerosol deposition, global climate change models should incorporate the variable effects of aerosol on the marine ecosystem (including negative toxic effects) and the complex interactions between aerosols and marine phytoplankton of different taxa (2, 35).

## Methods

**Bioassay Incubation Experiments.** Incubation experiments with natural phytoplankton assemblages took place in the Gulf of Aqaba in the northern Red Sea, an oligo- to mesotrophic marine ecosystem with significant aerosol deposition rates (17, 19). The nutrient concentrations in these waters during the stratified season when our experiment was conducted were very low—nitrate  $\approx 0.2 \mu\text{M}$  and soluble reactive phosphate (SRP)  $\approx 0.02 \mu\text{M}$ . Trace metals in the surface layer are high compared with open ocean conditions (Cu, 1.7 nM; Fe, 2.1 nM; Zn, 1.1 nM; Pb, 0.05 nM). However, because all of the treatment started with the same seawater composition, and we are comparing differences relative to control, these concentrations are not very important. Incubations were done in clear (acid and sample washed) polyethylene 10-L cubitainers (Fold-A-Carrier; Reliance). Screening material was used to attenuate the sunlight intensity reaching the containers; 50% light attenuation yielded maximum

midday irradiance of  $\approx 1,000 \mu\text{mol m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$  and was equivalent to the upper 10 m of the euphotic zone of the Gulf during summer months. We used concentrations of  $7 \mu\text{M N}$  (combined nitrate and ammonium) and  $0.6 \mu\text{M P}$  (as phosphate) that are representative of the deep-water concentrations in the Gulf. In each experiment, a similar amendment of N and/or P was used across all treatments. Where no nutrient additions were made, the nutrients were just from the seawater (control) or from the aerosol sources dissolving into the seawater. Concentrations released from aerosols were typically lower than our additions (inducing less growth) (see Fig. 2). We added  $\approx 6 \text{ mg}$  of locally collected aerosol that is equivalent to  $\approx 2$  weeks of deposition during dust storms in this area in a mixed layer of 10–20 m. Similar amounts of aerosol particles ( $\approx 6 \text{ mg}$ ) were added to each experiment from the aerosol collection filters regardless of aerosol source (based on back trajectories). Additions were made into 8 L of 100- $\mu\text{m}$  filtered surface seawater. Incubations were placed in a pond with surface seawater flowing through under ambient light and temperature conditions and were over a 5-day period. We monitored the response of bulk phytoplankton using Chl a concentrations and assessed the impact on specific phytoplankton taxa using flow cytometry as described in ref. 17. For more detail see *SI Text*.

**Toxicity Bioassays.** Serial copper (Cu standard prepared from high-purity metal Cu dissolved in 2% nitric acid—1,000 mg/L; Sigma–Aldrich) addition incubation experiments were done in the laboratory under controlled trace metal clean conditions by using *Synechococcus* WH8102 to determine the threshold toxicity. Control treatments with 2% nitric acid (no Cu) were included. Cells were grown (in triplicate) in F/2 medium at  $20 \mu\text{mol quanta m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ . We added 0.003–300  $\mu\text{g}$  of total Cu  $\text{L}^{-1}$  (using 10-fold concentration increments) to log-phase *Synechococcus* cultures. Measurements of Chl a,  $\text{OD}_{750}$ , and  $F/F_m$  were taken before Cu additions and at 1, 25, 68, and 93 h after Cu additions. Chl a was also measured 48 h and 5 days after Cu additions (see *SI Text*). Note that we observe a threshold response. Once the Cu concentration exceeds the chelating capacity and the free-Cu concentration is above the toxic level, the cells die; thus, additional Cu does not result in additional negative response. Similar experiments with Ni or Pb did not cause toxic effects at concentrations similar to those seen in the aerosol field bioassays (higher concentrations and/or longer exposure times were needed). For more detail see *SI Text*.

**Copper Deposition.** Cu-deposition fields are based on Cu concentrations derived from atmospheric aerosol composition datasets and compared with available observations over land and ocean regions (see *SI Text*). Based on observational relationships between Cu and other elements, we model fossil fuel, biofuel, biomass burning, dust, and primary biogenic particle contributions to atmospheric Cu. These estimates suggest that Cu in mineral dust dominates the global budget of Cu deposited to the oceans (65%) but that anthropogenic sources of Cu are important away from the desert regions. Assuming that 90% of biomass burning and 100% of fossil fuel and biofuel comes from anthropogenic sources, we estimate a large increase in Cu deposition to oceans away from desert regions in the current climate relative to the preindustrial (*SI Text*). Here, we ignore potentially large, but poorly constrained, changes in desert dust itself in response to humans (31). Although these results are preliminary, they represent the best state of our knowledge about Cu deposition globally. For more detail see *SI Text*.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** We thank our colleagues at the Interuniversity Institute for Marine Science in Eilat, Israel, for assisting in data collection and providing laboratory space and equipment during the study; P. Artaxo, G. Bergametti, D. Cohen, N. Kubilay, W. Maenhut, and J. Hand of the IMPROVE network for contributing data for the Cu deposition estimates; and T. Bond and C. Luo for contributing atmospheric deposition model results. This work was supported by National Aeronautics and Space Agency (NASA) New Investigator Program Grant NAG5-1266 (to A.P.) and North Atlantic Treaty Organization Science for Peace Grant SFP 982161 (to A.P. and A.F.P.). K.R.M.M. was supported through the National Science Foundation (NSF) Graduate Research Fellowship Program and the U.S. Department of Energy Global Change Education Program. S.C.D., I.D.L., and N.M. were supported in part by NASA Grant NNG06G127G and the NSF-sponsored Center for Microbial Oceanography Research and Education (C-MORE; NSF CCF-424599), and N.M. was supported in part by NSF Grant ATM-0758369.

1. Fung IY, et al. (2000) Iron supply and demand in the upper ocean. *Global Biogeochem Cycles* 14:281–295.
2. Jickells TD, et al. (2005) Global iron connections between desert dust, ocean biogeochemistry, and climate. *Science* 308:67–71.
3. Doney SC, et al. (2007) Impact of anthropogenic atmospheric nitrogen and sulfur deposition on ocean acidification and the inorganic carbon system. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 104:14580–14585.

4. Boyd PW, et al. (2007) Mesoscale iron enrichment experiments 1993–2005: Synthesis and future directions. *Science* 315:612–617.
5. Bishop JKB, Davis RE, Sherman JT (2002) Robotic observations of enhanced carbon biomass and export at 55°S during SOFEX. *Science* 298:817–821.
6. Erickson DJ, III, et al. (2003) Atmospheric iron delivery and surface ocean biological activity in the Southern Ocean and Patagonian region. *Geophys Res Lett* 30:1609–1613.

7. Buesseler KO, Andrews JE, Pike SM, Charette MA (2004) The effects of iron fertilization on carbon sequestration in the Southern Ocean. *Science* 304:414–417.
8. Mills MM, Ridame C, Davey M, La Roche J, Geider RJ (2004) Iron and phosphorus co-limit nitrogen fixation in the eastern tropical North Atlantic. *Nature* 429:292–294.
9. Gruber N, Sarmiento JL (1997) Global patterns of marine nitrogen fixation and denitrification. *Global Biogeochem Cycles* 11:235–266.
10. Martin JH (1990) Glacial-interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change: The iron hypothesis. *Paleoceanography* 5:1–13.
11. Kohfeld KE, Le Quére C, Harrison S P, Anderson RF (2005) Role of marine biology for glacial-interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> cycles. *Science* 308:74–78.
12. Moore JK, Doney SC, Lindsay K, Mahowald N, Michaels AF (2006) Nitrogen fixation amplifies the ocean biogeochemical response to decadal timescale variations in mineral dust deposition. *Tellus* 58B:560–572.
13. Duce RA (2005) Aerosols. *Encyclopedia of World Climates*, ed Oliver JE (Kluwer, Dordrecht, The Netherlands), pp 4–6.
14. Baker AR, Jickells TD, Witt M, Linge KL (2006) Trends in the solubility of iron, aluminium, manganese and phosphorus in aerosol collected over the Atlantic Ocean. *Mar Chem* 98:43–58.
15. Sedwick PN, Sholkovitz ER, Church TM (2007) Impact of anthropogenic combustion emissions on the fractional solubility of aerosol iron: Evidence from the Sargasso Sea. *Geochim Geophys Geosyst* 8:Q10Q06 10.1029/2007GC001586.
16. Baker AR, et al. (2007) Dry and wet deposition of nutrients from the tropical Atlantic atmosphere: Links to primary productivity and nitrogen fixation. *Deep Sea Res (Part I)* 54:1704–1720.
17. Mackey KRM, et al. (2007) Phosphorus availability, phytoplankton community dynamics, and taxon specific phosphorus status in the Gulf of Aqaba, Red Sea. *Limnol Oceanogr* 52:873–885.
18. Chase Z, Paytan A, Johnson KS, Street J, Chen Y (2006) Input and cycling of iron in the Gulf of Aqaba, Red Sea. *Global Biogeochem Cycles* 20:GB3017.
19. Chen Y, et al. (2008) Sources and fluxes of atmospheric trace elements to the Gulf of Aqaba, Red Sea. *J Geophys Res* 113:D05306.
20. Krishnamurthy A., Moore JK, Zender CS, Luo C (2007) Effects of atmospheric inorganic nitrogen deposition on ocean biogeochemistry. *J Geophys Res* 112 G02019 10.1029/2006JG000334.
21. Nayar S, Goh BPL, Chou LM (2004) Environmental impact of heavy metals from dredged and re-suspended sediments on phytoplankton and bacteria assessed in in-situ mesocosms. *Ecotoxicol Environ Saf* 59:349–369.
22. Sunda WG, Huntsman SA (1998) Processes regulating cellular metal accumulation and physiological effects: Phytoplankton as model systems. *Sci Total Environ* 219:165–181.
23. Morel MMF, Price NM (2003) The biogeochemical cycles of trace metals in the ocean. *Science* 300:944–947.
24. Mann EL, Ahlgren N, Moffett JW, Chisholm SW (2002) Copper toxicity and cyanobacteria ecology in the Sargasso Sea. *Limnol Oceanogr* 47:976–988.
25. Moffett JW, Brand LE (1996) Production of strong, extracellular Cu chelators by marine cyanobacteria in response to Cu stress. *Limnol Oceanogr* 41:873–885.
26. Moffett JW, Brand LE, Croot PL, Barbeau K (1997) Cu speciation and cyanobacterial distribution in harbors subject to anthropogenic Cu inputs. *Limnol Oceanogr* 42:789–799.
27. McClain CR, Feldman GC, Hooker SB (2004) An overview of the SeaWiFS project and strategies for producing a climate research quality global ocean bio-optical time series. *Deep Sea Res II* 51:5–42.
28. Chester RK, et al. (1993) Factors controlling the solubilities of trace metals from non-remote aerosols to the sea surface by the 'dry' deposition mode. *Mar Chem* 42:107–126.
29. Han Q, Moore JK, Zender C, Measures C, Hydes D (2008) Constraining oceanic dust deposition using surface ocean dissolved Al. *Global Biogeochem Cycles* 22:GB2003 10.1029/2007GB002975.
30. Measures CI, Vink S (2000) On the use of dissolved aluminium in surface waters to estimate dust deposition to the ocean. *Global Biogeochem Cycles* 14:317–327.
31. Moore JK, Braucher O (2008) Sedimentary and mineral dust sources of dissolved iron to the world ocean. *Biogeosciences* 5:631–656.
32. Woodward S, Roberts D, Betts R (2005) A simulation of the effect of climate change-induced desertification on mineral dust aerosol. *Geophys Res Lett* 32:GL023482.
33. Mahowald N, Luo C (2003) A less dusty future? *Geophys Res Lett* 30:GL017880.
34. Tegen M, Werner S, Harrison P, Kohfeld KE (2004) Relative importance of climate and land use in determining present and future global soil dust emission. *Geophys Res Lett* 31:L05105.
35. Malin G (2006) Oceans—New pieces for the marine sulfur cycle jigsaw. *Science* 314:607–608.