

NIH Public Access

Author Manuscript

Curr Opin Cell Biol. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2010 December 1.

Published in final edited form as:

Curr Opin Cell Biol. 2009 December ; 21(6): 900–912. doi:10.1016/j.ceb.2009.08.008.

Cellular and Nuclear Degradation during Apoptosis

Bin He¹, Nan Lu¹, and Zheng Zhou^{1,2}

¹Verna and Marrs McLean Department of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, TX 77030, USA

Abstract

Apoptosis ensures quick death and quiet clearance of unwanted or damaged cells, without inducing much, if any, immunological responses from the organism. In metazoan organisms, apoptotic cells are swiftly engulfed by other cells. The degradation of cellular content is initiated in apoptotic cells and completed within engulfing cells. In apoptotic cells, caspase-mediated proteolysis cleaves protein substrates into fragments; nuclear DNA is partially degraded into nucleosomal units; and autophagy potentially contributes to apoptotic-cell removal. In engulfing cells, specific signaling pathways promote the sequential fusion of intracellular vesicles with phagosomes and lead to the complete degradation of apoptotic cells in an acidic environment. Phagocytic receptors that initiate the engulfment of apoptotic cells play an additional and critical role in initiating phagosome maturation through activating these signaling pathways. Here we highlight recent discoveries made in invertebrate models and mammalian systems, focusing on the molecular mechanisms that regulate the efficient degradation of apoptotic cells.

Introduction

Among multiple types of cell deaths that have been identified, apoptosis stands out as a distinct type that is executed swiftly and quietly, without inducing much, if any, immunological responses in the organism. During an animal's life, a larger number of unwanted cells undergo apoptosis, a genetically programmed cell suicide process; these cells display several morphological changes including cellular shrinkage, chromatin condensation, nuclear fragmentation, and plasma membrane blebbing, yet retain their plasma membrane integrity and are rapidly internalized by other cells (Figure 1). The efficient demolition of apoptotic cells is a result of the degradation activities provided by both apoptotic cells and their phagocytes. Cell-autonomous degradation is initiated and executed by caspases, a family of <u>cysteine-dependent</u> <u>asp</u>artate-directed prote<u>ases</u> that play determinant roles in apoptosis, and by caspase-activated proteases and nucleases [1]. After being swiftly engulfed by their neighboring cells or professional phagocytes through phagocytosis, an actin-based cell internalization process, apoptotic cells are sequestered in intracellular vacuoles referred to as "phagosomes" where they are degraded by a lysosome-mediated digestive activities (Figure 1) [2-4].

The efficient removal of apoptotic cells plays important roles in sculpting structures, maintaining homeostasis, and eliminating abnormal, non-functional, or harmful cells [5,6]. It is also an efficient tool for cell competition [7]. Moreover, this process prevents potentially

²Corresponding author: Tel: 713-798-6489, Fax: 713-796-9438, zhengz@bcm.tmc.edu.

Publisher's Disclaimer: This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final citable form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

harmful inflammatory and auto-immune responses that could occur if contents from apoptotic cells were leaked out [8]. Macrophages that engulf apoptotic cells even elicit anti-inflammatory responses that facilitate the resolution of regional inflammation [9-12]. Inefficient engulfment or degradation of apoptotic cells is associated with numerous chronicle inflammatory and auto-immune diseases [13-18]. In this review, we describe recent advances in our understanding of apoptotic cell degradation, focusing on four major topics: (1) caspase-mediated proteolysis and cell-autonomous degradation, (2) the multi-step degradation of nuclear DNA, (3) the role of autophagy in the removal of apoptotic cells, and (4) signaling pathways that regulate the maturation of phagosomes. This review does not cover many related topics such as the recognition and engulfment of apoptotic cells, cross-presentation of apoptotic cell antigens, and the fate of cells undergoing caspase-independent apoptosis, which are covered by other excellent reviews [4,19-21].

Caspase-mediated proteolysis initiates cell-autonomous degradation of apoptotic cell contents

The activation of initiator caspases by "intrinsic" or "extrinsic" apoptotic signals marks the beginning of apoptosis [22]. Initiator caspases further cleave and activate effector caspases, which subsequently process a large number of cellular substrates proteolytically [22]. These cleavage events are believed to lead to the signature cellular changes observed from apoptotic cells, which include cellular retraction, degradation of the nuclear envelope, chromatin condensation, degradation of nuclear DNA, and the release of signaling molecules that attract engulfing cells [1,23]. The initiation of nuclear DNA degradation by capsase-mediated activation of caspase-activated DNase CAD (also known as DFF40) is one of the best-studied examples (see the next section). In addition, caspase cleavage of nuclear lamins disassembles the lamin complex and weaken the nuclear envelope [24]. This event, together with the caspase cleavage and activation of rho-associated kinase I (Rock I) that further modifies the actincytoskeleton, have been proposed to result in the fragmentation of apoptotic nuclei [25]. The cleavage of Rock I plays an additional role in initiating membrane blebbing through cytoskeleton rearrangement [26-28]. A number of cytoskeletal proteins, including actins, tubulins, and actin-binding proteins, are caspase substrates [29-33]. Although the detailed mechanism have not been revealed, the degradation of cytoskeletal proteins is likely to contribute to cellular shrinkage during apoptosis.

An open web resource (The CASBAH: www.bioinf.gen.tcd.ie/casbah) was built in an effort to collect a comprehensive list of caspase substrates [31]. Despite the large number of potential caspase substrates reported, the list of caspase substrates that have been demonstrated to directly contribute to the degradation of apoptotic cells is surprisingly short. Previously, caspase substrates were mostly identified through in vitro cleavage assays, which were not able to distinguish whether a protein that was cleaved by a caspase *in vitro* was an actual caspase substrate during apoptosis. Recently, two research groups developed novel proteomic techniques, using which they identified global proteolytic events occurring during apoptosis [34,35]. Interestingly, the identities of the 261 and 333 proteolytic substrates reported by Dix et al. and Mahrus et al. [34,35], respectively, have only a minimum overlap with the caspase substrates previously documented in CASBAH, indicating that many more apoptotic-specific proteolysis substrates are yet to be found. The newly reported protein substrates implicate two surprising findings [34,35]. First, caspases do not cleave the entire proteome indiscriminately; rather, they often target multiple proteins within the same complex or biochemical pathways, suggesting a tendency for caspases to target specific pathways or signaling networks [35]. Secondly, many of the cleavage products are mapped to stably-folded functional domains, suggesting that rather than complete degradation of proteins, the apoptotic proteolytic cascades primarily generate new forms of proteins that may adapt new functions that further contribute

to the self-killing event [34]. Future challenge resides at understanding the functional significance of the cleavage of the newly identified caspase targets *in vivo*.

The degradation of apoptotic nuclear DNA is a multi-step process

The degradation of nuclear DNA into oligonucleosomal fragments is a hallmark of apoptosis [36]. The massive cleavage of genetic materials irreversibly compromises DNA replication and gene transcription. Early in apoptosis, accompanied by chromatin condensation, chromosomal DNA is first cleaved into high molecular weight (HMW) fragments of 50-300 kb, which are subsequently processed into low molecular weight (LMW) fragments, the characteristic 180-bp DNA [37]. DNA fragments are readily detected *in situ* by the TUNEL (terminal deoxynucleotidyl transferase d<u>U</u>TP-mediated <u>nick end labeling</u>) assay, which labels 3'-OH end of DNA breaks [38]. After dying cells are engulfed by phagocytes, the partially digested DNA molecules are completely degraded into nucleotides in phagosomes [37]. A number of nucleases have been proposed to degrade apoptotic DNA, some of which act in apoptotic nuclei, whereas others in phagosomal lumen (Figure 2) [37,39-43].

CAD/DFF40 is the major cell-autonomous nuclease that accounts for most if not all activities for the generation of LMW DNA in apoptotic mammalian cells [44,45]. In cells in which CAD is deleted or inactive, inter-nucleosomal DNA fragmentation is either completely abolished or greatly reduced [18,46,47]. In living cells, CAD is in a complex with inhibitor of CAD (ICAD, as known as DFF45), which acts as CAD's folding chaperon during protein synthesis and subsequently inhibits its DNA cleavage activity [44,45,48,49]. During apoptosis, caspase 3 cleaves ICAD and releases CAD [44,45,50]. Initially, it was proposed that caspase cleavage of ICAD allowed CAD to enter the nucleus [44]. Subsequent evidence indicates that the endogenous ICAD/CAD complex resides in the nucleus of living cells; furthermore, the cleavage of ICAD that releases CAD appears to occur inside the nucleus [51,52]. The released CAD forms a scissors-like homodimer and cleaves double-strand DNA at nucleosomal linkers [53,54]. In addition, histone H1 might stimulate the enzymatic activity of CAD and also contribute to CAD's substrate specificity [55,56].

The residual DNA degradation activity detected in CAD-deficient cells suggests the existence of additional nuclease(s) during apoptosis [46,57]. Mammalian endonuclease G (endo G) is such a nuclease [57]. In living cell, Endo G resides in mitochondrial intermembrane space; upon apoptotic stimuli, it is released from mitochondria and translocated to nuclei, where it cleaves nucleic acids [57,58]. EndoGI, a recently identified EndoG inhibitor in *Drosophila*, is present in the nuclei of living cells and acts as a guardian for the accidental leakage of Endo G from mitochondria [59]. EndoGI is translocated to the cytoplasm upon apoptotic stimuli [59]. Additional CAD-independent DNases detected in apoptotic cells also include L-DNase II, apoptosis-enhancing nuclease (AEN), and DNase γ , which can be activated by different apoptotic stimuli [60-63].

The *C. elegans* genome does not encode any close sequence homolog of CAD. *C. elegans* NUC-1 (<u>nuc</u>lease abnormal), a homolog of mammalian DNase II, is the first nuclease identified that drives the degradation of nuclear DNA in apoptotic cells [64,65]. In *nuc-1* mutant embryos, many apoptotic cells remain TUNEL-positive, whereas in wild-type embryos TUNEL-positive apoptotic cells are hardly detectable [65]. Genetic and cellular characterizations of *nuc-1* and *nuc-1*'s functional relationship with genes involved in the engulfment of apoptotic cells indicate the presence of at least three steps of apoptotic DNA degradation: the initial digestion that generates TUNEL-positive DNA ends, the conversion of TUNEL-positive to TUNEL-negative DNA-ends, which depends on NUC-1 activity, and the complete digestion of nuclei DNA into free nucleotides [65]. Although the expression pattern of NUC-1 has not been determined, genetic evidence suggests that NUC-1 is likely to act in apoptotic cells to mediate DNA

degradation [65]. In addition, the *C. elegans* Endo G homolog CPS-6 and several other exoand endonucleases form a DNA degradation complex named "degradosome" that acts in parallel to NUC-1 to promote DNA degradation [42,66,67].

Mice deficient in either CAD or Endo G are viable and develop normally [47,68-70]. Apoptotic events such as phosphatidylserine exposure, caspase activation and early-stage chromatin condensation are also normal in CAD deficient cells, indicating that the degradation of apoptotic DNA *per se* is largely dispensable for the initiation and execution of apoptosis [46]. Several reports, however, indicate active roles of cell-autonomous nucleases in the progression of apoptosis, especially in sensitive genetic backgrounds [67,71,72]. In addition, in certain cases the fragmented DNA was detected on the surface of apoptotic cells and was proposed to act as one type of the "eat me" signals that attract phagocytes [73,74].

The partially digested nucleosomal DNA is further degraded into nucleotides by other types of nucleases, primarily DNase II a, in the phagosomes of mammalian and Drosophila engulfing cells (Figure 2). DNase II a activity is optimal in acidic compartments such as lysosomes and phagolysomes [41,75]. In DNase II deficient flies and mice, a large number of undegraded DNA accumulated inside phagocytes [18,76,77]. The degradation of apoptotic-cell DNA plays active roles in preventing antigenic DNA from eliciting improper immune responses [78]. Undegraded apoptotic cell DNA in the macrophages of DNase II deficient mice induces an IFN regulatory factor 3/7-dependent production of IFNβ, which is cytotoxic and contributes to the lethal anemia in DNase II null mice [18,79-81]. Conditional knock-out of DNase II gene after birth causes adult mice to develop chronic polyarthritis that resembles human rheumatoid arthritis [82]. In mice that lack both CAD and DNase II activities, the undegraded DNA induces innate immunity and impairs thymic development [18]. Similarly, the innate immunity is induced by undegraded DNA in CAD(-/-)DNase II(-/-) flies [76]. In C. elegans, other than NUC-1, the DNase II homolog that likely acts in apoptotic cells, there must be additional functional counterparts of DNase II that act in phagosomal lumen to conduct cellnonautonomous DNA degradation.

In summary, the nuclear DNA inside apoptotic cells is degraded in multiple steps by both cell autonomous and non-autonomous means. Cell-autonomous DNA degradation is dispensable for animal development since dying cells are subsequently engulfed by phagocytes and their DNA is effectively degraded by nucleases in phagosomes [68]. However, when massive apoptosis occurs and the degradation system is overloaded, the pre-cleavage by CAD may become essential [68]. Although the role of DNA degradation in apoptotic execution is largely elusive, the resulted DNA waste needs to be properly disposed to avoid the activation of innate immunity.

The contribution of autophagy to the clearance of apoptotic cells

Autophagy is a specific cellular event in which a portion of intracellular organelles and cytosolic components are engulfed by intracellular membranes and confined in a doublemembrane vacuolar structure named autophagosomes, and are subsequently degraded by lysosomes that fuse with autophagosomes [83]. Autophagy is a stress adaptation process that generates energy and nutrients by degrading and macromolecules. Its relationship with apoptosis is complex. In many cases autophagy acts to save cells from the fate of apoptosis [84-88]; in other cases, when the swift apoptosis machinery is inhibited, starved cells or cells receiving death stimuli undergo an alternative form of cell death via autophagy [89,90]. In addition, during animal development, autophagic cell death has been observed to act as an independent form of programmed cell death [91-93]. Autophagy was also reported to potentiate caspase-dependent death [94]. The role of autophagy in the execution of cell death thus appears to be heavily dependent on the cellular and tissue context. The question most relevant to this review, namely, whether autophagy contributes to the cellautonomous degradation of cellular contents during apoptosis, however, has not been answered. Interestingly, recently a new function of autophagy relevant to the ultimate degradation of apoptotic cells has been reported. In an *in vitro* system that mimics the cavitation of early mouse embryos, Qu et al. found that autophagy that occurred in apoptotic inner ectodermal cells contributed to the generation of ATP, which further promoted the exposure of phosphatidylserine, the "eat me" signal, on the surface of apoptotic cells, as well as the secretion of lysophosphatidylcholine, the "come-get-me" signal, to the neighborhood [95]. In this example, autophagy enables apoptotic cells to attract phagocytes, and thus indirectly facilitates their cell-nonautonomous degradation. A similar role played by autophagy has also been reported in chick retina [96]. On the other hand, ES cells in culture do not seem to rely on autophagy for the exposure of phosphatidylserine in response to apoptotic stimuli [95]. Whether the mechanism described above is commonly used by many kinds of apoptotic cells awaits further investigation.

Novel signaling pathways that control the maturation of phagosomes containing apoptotic cells

General knowledge about phagosome maturation

The maturation of phagosomes, a process that involves extensive remodeling of phagosomal membrane and contents and results in the eventual degradation of the engulfed particle, has been well characterized in mammalian phagocytes, such as macrophages, that ingest latex beads or opsonized microbes or red blood cells [97]. Once created, nascent phagosomes undergo sequential fusion events with intracellular organelles in the endocytic pathway, including early endosomes, late endosomes and lysosomes [97]. These fusion events promote the acidification of phagosomal lumen and deliver acid hydrolyses to phagosomes, which, in an acidic environment (pH<5.0), actively digest the protein, nucleic acid, and lipids confined in the phagosomal lumen [97]. A number of molecules, including phosphatidylinositol-3phosphate (PI3P) and Class III PI 3 kinase Vps34, small Rab GTPases Rab5 and Rab7, V-type ATPase, and membrane fusion machinery components, were found to be recruited to phagosomal surfaces and drive phagosome maturation. The synthesis of PI3P on phagosomal surfaces, primarily conducted by Vps34, is believed to attract downstream effectors that are PI3P-binding proteins [98,99]. Rab5 and Rab7 act as membrane tethering factors for vesicles of different identities: Rab5 facilitates the early endosomes/phagosome fusion, whereas Rab7 facilitates the fusion of late endosomes and lysosomes to phagosomes [100-105]. V-type ATPase catalyzes the acidification of phagosomal lumen [106-109].

Special features of the maturation of phagosomes containing apoptotic cells

Until recently, little is know about how apoptotic cell are degraded inside phagosomes. Unlike macrophages that ingest bacteria, macrophages that engulf apoptotic cells secrete antiinflammatory signals and actively suppress the secretion of the proinflammatory cytokines [9-12]. Further more, recent studies revealed that phagosomes containing apoptotic cells and opsonized-living cells matured at different rates [110]. These observations indicate the existence of mechanisms specific to the degradation of apoptotic cells. Recent research conducted in invertebrate model organisms and mammalian system revealed shared and unique mechanisms employed for the degradation of apoptotic cells.

The small nematode *C. elegans* has been a successful model for studying apoptotic cell death and apoptotic-cell engulfment [111,112]. Recently, owing to the establishment of multiple novel techniques, including the live-cell imaging in developing embryos and the genome-wide RNAi screen, and through the combined usage of these techniques with traditional genetic approaches, researchers have described in detail the different steps of the maturation process

of phagosomes that contain apoptotic cells and identified a novel signaling pathway controlling phagosome maturation (Figure 3). It has been observed that the degradation of apoptotic cells in *C. elegans* also requires fusions of endosomes and lysosomes to phagosomes [113,114]. The recruitment of a series of key molecules, some of which previously unknown to be involved in phagosome maturation, to phagosomal surfaces drives these fusion events [113-117]. Below we summarize these new findings made in *C. elegans* as well as in other systems.

New executors of phagosome maturation that drive lysosomes/phagosome fusion

The Rab family small GTPases and their protein complexes are known to act as tethering factors that bring vesicles together for fusion [118]. Three C. elegans Rab GTPases, RAB-5, RAB-7, and RAB-2, have been found to play distinct roles during the degradation of apoptotic cells (Figure 3) [114-117]. Knocking out or down the activity of each of the three results in the accumulation of undegraded apoptotic cells. C. elegans RAB-7 is specifically required for the incorporation of lysosomes to phagosomes [114]. It mediates the extension of lipid tubules from phagosomes to recruit lysosomes, like mammalian Rab7 [105,114], and further promotes the fusion between these two compartments after docking of lysosomes on phagosomal surfaces [114]. In rab-7(RNAi) treated worms, phagosomes containing apoptotic germ cells are arrested as RAB-5-labeled phagosomes, suggesting that RAB-7 may act downstream or independent of RAB-5 [115]. The homotypic fusion and vacuole protein sorting (HOPS) complex is known to act as both an exchange factor and an effector for Rab7 during yeast endocytosis [119]. RNAi knockdown of each of all seven HOPS complex components causes persistent apoptotic cells in C. elegans gonads; further more, phagosomes are arrested at a RAB-7-positive stage, suggesting that the HOPS complex is likely to act downstream of RAB-7 [115]. In a separate study, Xiao et al independently discovered the function of the HOPS complex component VPS-18 in the degradation of engulfed apoptotic cells [120]. However, Xiao et al proposed that the major cause of the observed phagosome maturation defect is due to defects in lysosomal biogenesis caused by the *vps-18* mutations [120]. Whether and how the HOPS complex plays a direct role on phagosomal surfaces for lysosomes/phagosome fusion needs to be further investigated.

Unlike RAB-5 or -7, RAB-2 is a less-studied Rab GTPase whose function in phagosome maturation has not been revealed previously. *C. elegans* RAB-2 was identified from genetic screens for mutants that contain un-removed apoptotic cells [116,117]. Like RAB-7, RAB-2 plays an important role in the recruitment and fusion of lysosomes to phagosomes; however, unlike RAB-7, RAB-2 is also required for the acidification of phagosomal lumen [116]. RAB-2 and RAB-7 may control lysosome-phagosome fusions in parallel; alternatively, they may each contribute to a different subset of events. Proteomic studies in *Drosophila* and mammals have identified Rab2 as a component of phagosomes [121,122]. It remains to be elucidated whether mammalian or *Drosophila* Rab2 plays a conserved role in the maturation of phagosomes.

In addition to Rab GTPases, a novel function of the V0-ATPase in lysosomal/phagosomal fusion during the clearance of zebrafish apoptotic neurons has been identified through *in vivo* imaging [123]. This fusion activity is separate from the proton pump activity of the V-type ATPase [123], and is consistent with the membrane fusion activity reported for the fusion of yeast vacuoles [124]. In the near future, components of the membrane fusion machinery such as the SNARE complex and the regulators of this machinery are likely to show up on the list of novel apoptotic-cell degradation factors.

Key factors that regulate the phagosome maturation executors

Dynamins are conserved large GTPases that play pivotal roles in multiple membrane trafficking processes [125]. Dynamin's membrane fission activity underlines its essential function in driving endocytosis [125]. In other cellular context, dynamin and dynamin-related

proteins are also known to promote membrane fusion [126-130]. In a genetic screen for mutants that are defective in both embryonic development and apoptotic-cell removal, fourteen loss-of-function alleles of *dyn-1*, the *C. elegans* dynamin gene, were identified [113]. Subsequent characterizations indicate that the function of DYN-1 is essential for both the engulfment and degradation of apoptotic cells [113,114]. DYN-1 drives the recruitment and fusion of early endosomes to phagocytic cups, an event that provides membrane material to support pseudopod extension around apoptotic cells [113]. Moreover, DYN-1 controls the recruitment and fusion of both endosomes and lysosomes to maturing phagosomes, a process critical for the delivery of multiple digestive enzymes and the V-type ATPase to phagosome maturation – it promotes the recruitment of RAB-7 to phagosomal surfaces and the synthesis of PI3P on phagosomal membranes [114]. DYN-1 thus acts as an upstream regulator of phagosome maturation effectors (Figure 3). In a genome-wide RNAi screen, Kinchen et al. also identified the function of *dyn-1* in phagosome maturation [115].

PI3P is generated on the phagosomal surfaces primarily owing to the activity of Class III PI-3 kinase Vps34 and functions there to recruit downstream factors, such as proteins with Phox (PX) or Fab1-YOTB-Vac1-EEA1 (FYVE) domains [97]. In *C. elegans* engulfing cells, PI3P is synthesized on nascent phagosome surfaces immediately after the internalization of apoptotic cells and remains present throughout phagosome maturation [114]. RNAi-mediated inactivation of *C. elegans vps-34* results in a mild increase in the number of apoptotic germ cells and *vps-34* was proposed to function under the control of DYN-1 to synthesis PI3P [115]. Given that *vps-34* RNAi, unlike *dyn-1* mutations or RNAi, only causes mild apoptotic-cell retention phenotype, there might be additional PI 3 kinases that act in parallel to generate phagosome-specific PI3P in response to DYN-1.

The role of Rab5 GTPase appears to be more complex. During the maturation of phagosomes containing microbes or opsonized particles, Rab5 is proposed to act as a tethering factor between early endosomes and phagosomes [102,131,132]. In both *C. elegans* and mammalian cells, recent studies found that Rab5 also promotes the maturation of phagosomes containing apoptotic cells [115,133]. Since the incorporation of early endosomes to phagosomes is a crucial step during the degradation of apoptotic cells [113], it is likely, although proof is still needed, that the tethering factor function of Rab5 is conserved during apoptotic-cell degradation. Besides this executor function, Rab5 also regulates downstream signaling events. In the endocytic pathway, Rab5 was known to activate Vps34 and promote PI3P synthesis on the target membranes [134-136]. Recently, Kinchen et al propose a different model in which Vps34 activates Rab5 by mediating the interaction between Rab5 and dynamin 2, based on protein-protein interaction studies in mammalian cells and genetic studies in *C. elegans* [115]. Whether this model can be reconciled with the observations made in the endocytic pathway and the model proposed by Kitano et al [133] in Rab5 activation requires further investigation.

Kitano et al observed that the activation of Rab5 on the surface of nascent phagosomes containing apoptotic cells is dependent on EB1, a microtubule-tip-associating protein that also interacts with Gapex-5, a guanine nucleotide exchange factor (GEF) for Rab5 [133]. Kitano et al thus propose that the recruitment of Gapex-5 to phagosomes through the microtubule network leads to the subsequent recruitment and activation of Rab5 [133]. The identification of Gapex-5 and EB1 as essential factors provides a molecular mechanism that involves the novel and critical role of microtubules for the regulation of Rab5.

Phagocytic receptors acting as the initiators of phagosome maturation

As an essential regulator of phagosome maturation that controls the recruitment and activity of multiple downstream regulators and executors, how is DYN-1 regulated? First of all, the

association of DYN-1 to extending pseudopods and nascent phagosomes is critical for its function in the removal of apoptotic cells [113]. Furthermore, the recruitment of DYN-1 to pseudopods and nascent phagosomes is dependent on the phagocytic receptor CED-1 and its adaptor protein CED-6 [113]. Lack of DYN-1 enrichment to the surfaces of pseudopods and nascent phagosomes, as a consequence of *ced-1* or *ced-6* mutations, causes severe defects in engulfment and degradation of cell corpses [113,114]. Consistent with this mechanism, epistasis analysis places *dyn-1* in the signaling pathway composed of *ced-1* and *ced-6* [113]. These results indicate that vesicle trafficking is a novel event regulated by the CED-1 pathway; they further imply that CED-1, by controlling DYN-1 activity, also regulates phagosome maturation [113,114].

CED-1 and CED-6 are members of one of the two previously identified *C. elegans* signaling pathways that are believed to specifically control the engulfment of apoptotic cells [137-139]. The novel functions of CED-1 and CED-6 in phagosome maturation were overlooked previously because strategies that distinguish engulfed vs. unengulfed apoptotic cells in real time were not established [114]. With the aid of the newly developed live-cell imaging technique, Yu et al discovered that like *dyn-1* mutations, *ced-1* mutations not only greatly reduce the efficiency of engulfment but also impair the degradation of those apoptotic cells that are engulfed inside phagosomes [114]. Signaling events that require CED-1 activity, including the recruitment of DYN-1 and RAB-7 to and the synthesis of PI3P on the surface of phagosomes, also require CED-6 [114]. As a consequence, *ced-1* and *ced-6* mutants are both defective in the recruitment and fusion of early endosomes and lysosomes to phagosomes [113,114]. Although CED-1 is only transiently localized to phagosomal surfaces, it co-exists with DYN-1 for a period of time [113,114]. Thus, through CED-6, CED-1 recruits DYN-1 to phagosomes, which promotes a downstream signaling cascade that leads to apoptotic cell degradation (Figure 3) [113,114].

Previously, phagocytic receptors were only known to recognize phagocytic targets and initiate their engulfment. The above finding reveals that in addition to this well-known function, CED-1 plays a novel role in phagosome maturation. It further indicates that phagosome maturation is not a process that occurs spontaneously once a phagosome forms, rather, signaling from the phagocytic receptor is needed to initiate this process. Moreover, this finding suggests that different phagocytic receptors may promote different phagosome maturation modes and subsequently induce phagocytes to elicit different responses, including different immune responses. CED-1 belongs to a family of transmembrane proteins whose extracellular domains are of large sizes and contain an N-terminal emilin (EMI)-like domain followed by tandem repeats of an atypical EGF like repeat motif [140]. Draper, the Drosophila ortholog of CED-1, like CED-1, is known to be essential for the engulfment of apoptotic cells as well as pruned axon fragments [141-144]. Interestingly, Kurant et al [145] recently observed that in draper mutants, apoptotic cells are retained inside phagosomes for a prolonged period of time. Based on their genetic and cell biological characterizations of single mutants of *draper* and simu, which encodes another EMI-domain and EGF-repeats containing transmembrane protein, and of draper; simu double mutants, Kurant et al. further propose that SIMU is primarily involved in the recognition and uptake of apoptotic cells whereas Draper is primarily required for the degradation of apoptotic cells [145]. These findings indicate a conserved role of the CED-1 family of phagocytic receptors in phagosome degradation in worms and flies. It remains to be elucidated whether mammalian homologs of CED-1, such as human mEGF10 [138,146], and other phagocytic receptors for apoptotic cells also provide the initiation signal for phagosome maturation in addition to promoting the engulfment of apoptotic cells, and furthermore, whether the initiation of phagosome maturation is a common function performed by all phagocytic receptors.

Cytoskeleton reorganization might also play a role in the degradation of apoptotic cells

CED-5, the *C. elegans* homolog of mammalian protein Dock180, is a component of a bipartite nuclear exchange factor for CED-1/Rac1 GTPase, and acts in a signaling pathway together with CED-10 but in parallel to CED-1 to promote the engulfment of apoptotic cells [112]. Recently, it was observed that CED-5 acted in a distinct pathway to control phagolysosome formation during the degradation of apoptotic cells [114]. During engulfment, the pathway led by CED-5 was known to regulate cytoskeletal reorganization [112]. Cytoskeletal reorganization also plays an active role in phagosome maturation in mammalian cells [110, 147]. CED-5 and other members of its pathway thus might contribute to phagosome maturation through remodeling the cytoskeleton.

Concluding remarks

Studies focusing on the degradation of apoptotic cells provide a wonderful platform for investigating a number of fundamental biological processes, including, but not limited to, how apoptotic execution machinery coordinates the multiple cellular demolishing events, whether and how autophagy, another fundamental cellular activity, is involved in the clearance of apoptotic cells, how the initiation and completion of apoptotic cell degradation in two different cell types are coordinated, and the identity of the components and organization of the signaling pathway(s) for recruiting intracellular vesicles to support phagosome maturation. The usage of model organisms further places the clearance of apoptotic cells in a whole animal context. However, what we know currently, as summarized in this review, is only the tip of an iceberg. Without repeating the questions for future exploration that have already been spelled out in the text, here I would like to list several interesting questions that have not been well explored. First, what is the exact role of cell-autonomous degradation of apoptotic cells? It seems that the caspase-initiated DNA degradation is dispensable under physiological conditions since DNA degradation occurring inside phagosomes provides a backup activity. However, other events, such as the exposure of "eat me" signals, cell retraction and detachment from the surrounding tissue, which are essential for ensuring that apoptotic cells are to be engulfed by phagocytes, may rely on caspase-mediated cleavage of multiple substrates. Exploring this aspect will lead us to further understand the relationship between apoptotic cells and there neighbors. Secondly, autophagy was associated with phagosome maturation in recent studies [148,149]. A comprehensive study of the contribution of autophagy in both apoptotic cells and phagocytes to the degradation of apoptotic cells will shed light on the relationship between autophagy and apoptosis. Last but not least, the cell-non-autonomous degradation of apoptotic cells has established a new model for studying the mechanism of phagosome maturation. The finding that phagocytic receptors for apoptotic cells are crucial in initiating phagosome maturation provides a new clue to understand the distinct immune responses phagocytes generated against different phagocytic targets. The detailed molecular mechanisms behind each step of phagosome maturation, such as how dynamin serves as a mediator of phagosome maturation, what the PI3P effectors are, and the functional relationship among Rab GTPases 2, 5, and 7 all await to be explored in worms, flies and mammals.

Acknowledgments

We apologize to all authors whose relevant work was not cited due to page limit. This work was supported by NIH GM067848.

References

 Taylor RC, Cullen SP, Martin SJ. Apoptosis: controlled demolition at the cellular level. Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol 2008;9:231–241. [PubMed: 18073771]

- Zhou Z, Yu X. Phagosome maturation during the removal of apoptotic cells: receptors lead the way. Trends Cell Biol 2008;18:474–485. [PubMed: 18774293]
- Kinchen JM, Ravichandran KS. Phagosome maturation: going through the acid test. Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol 2008;9:781–795. [PubMed: 18813294]
- Erwig LP, Henson PM. Clearance of apoptotic cells by phagocytes. Cell Death Differ 2008;15:243– 250. [PubMed: 17571081]
- 5. Vaux DL, Korsmeyer SJ. Cell death in development. Cell 1999;96:245-254. [PubMed: 9988219]
- Henson PM, Hume DA. Apoptotic cell removal in development and tissue homeostasis. Trends Immunol 2006;27:244–250. [PubMed: 16584921]
- Li W, Baker NE. Engulfment is required for cell competition. Cell 2007;129:1215–1225. [PubMed: 17574031]
- Savill J, Fadok V. Corpse clearance defines the meaning of cell death. Nature 2000;407:784–788. [PubMed: 11048729]
- Fadok VA, Bratton DL, Konowal A, Freed PW, Westcott JY, Henson PM. Macrophages that have ingested apoptotic cells in vitro inhibit proinflammatory cytokine production through autocrine/ paracrine mechanisms involving TGF-beta, PGE2, and PAF. J Clin Invest 1998;101:890–898. [PubMed: 9466984]
- Voll RE, Herrmann M, Roth EA, Stach C, Kalden JR, Girkontaite I. Immunosuppressive effects of apoptotic cells. Nature 1997;390:350–351. [PubMed: 9389474]
- Serhan CN, Savill J. Resolution of inflammation: the beginning programs the end. Nat Immunol 2005;6:1191–1197. [PubMed: 16369558]
- Freire-de-Lima CG, Xiao YQ, Gardai SJ, Bratton DL, Schiemann WP, Henson PM. Apoptotic cells, through transforming growth factor-beta, coordinately induce anti-inflammatory and suppress proinflammatory eicosanoid and NO synthesis in murine macrophages. J Biol Chem 2006;281:38376– 38384. [PubMed: 17056601]
- Botto M, Dell'Agnola C, Bygrave AE, Thompson EM, Cook HT, Petry F, Loos M, Pandolfi PP, Walport MJ. Homozygous C1q deficiency causes glomerulonephritis associated with multiple apoptotic bodies. Nat Genet 1998;19:56–59. [PubMed: 9590289]
- Scott RS, McMahon EJ, Pop SM, Reap EA, Caricchio R, Cohen PL, Earp HS, Matsushima GK. Phagocytosis and clearance of apoptotic cells is mediated by MER. Nature 2001;411:207–211. [PubMed: 11346799]
- Kawane K, Fukuyama H, Kondoh G, Takeda J, Ohsawa Y, Uchiyama Y, Nagata S. Requirement of DNase II for definitive erythropoiesis in the mouse fetal liver. Science 2001;292:1546–1549. [PubMed: 11375492]
- Hanayama R, Tanaka M, Miyasaka K, Aozasa K, Koike M, Uchiyama Y, Nagata S. Autoimmune disease and impaired uptake of apoptotic cells in MFG-E8-deficient mice. Science 2004;304:1147– 1150. [PubMed: 15155946]
- Kawane K, Ohtani M, Miwa K, Kizawa T, Kanbara Y, Yoshioka Y, Yoshikawa H, Nagata S. Chronic polyarthritis caused by mammalian DNA that escapes from degradation in macrophages. Nature 2007;446:102.
- •18. Kawane K, Fukuyama H, Yoshida H, Nagase H, Ohsawa Y, Uchiyama Y, Okada K, Iida T, Nagata S. Impaired thymic development in mouse embryos deficient in apoptotic DNA degradation. Nat Immunol 2003;4:138–144. [PubMed: 12524536]This paper and reference 72,75,77 and 78 characterized CAD and/or DNase II knock-out aminals and demonstrated that the failure of apoptotic DNA degredation could improperly activate innate immunity, which results in auto-immune diseases and lethal anemia in animal models. These studies highlight the essential roles of DNA degradation in animal development and in the regulation of innate immune system.
- Danial NN, Korsmeyer SJ. Cell death: critical control points. Cell 2004;116:205–219. [PubMed: 14744432]
- Tait SW, Green DR. Caspase-independent cell death: leaving the set without the final cut. Oncogene 2008;27:6452–6461. [PubMed: 18955972]
- Trombetta ES, Mellman I. Cell biology of antigen processing in vitro and in vivo. Annu Rev Immunol 2005;23:975–1028. [PubMed: 15771591]
- 22. Hengartner MO. The biochemistry of apoptosis. Nature 2000;407:770–776. [PubMed: 11048727]

He et al.

- 23. Lauber K, Bohn E, Krober SM, Xiao YJ, Blumenthal SG, Lindemann RK, Marini P, Wiedig C, Zobywalski A, Baksh S, et al. Apoptotic cells induce migration of phagocytes via caspase-3-mediated release of a lipid attraction signal. Cell 2003;113:717–730. [PubMed: 12809603]
- 24. Rao L, Perez D, White E. Lamin proteolysis facilitates nuclear events during apoptosis. J Cell Biol 1996;135:1441–1455. [PubMed: 8978814]
- Croft DR, Coleman ML, Li S, Robertson D, Sullivan T, Stewart CL, Olson MF. Actin-myosin-based contraction is responsible for apoptotic nuclear disintegration. J Cell Biol 2005;168:245–255. [PubMed: 15657395]
- 26. Coleman ML, Sahai EA, Yeo M, Bosch M, Dewar A, Olson MF. Membrane blebbing during apoptosis results from caspase-mediated activation of ROCK I. Nat Cell Biol 2001;3:339–345. [PubMed: 11283606]
- Sebbagh M, Renvoize C, Hamelin J, Riche N, Bertoglio J, Breard J. Caspase-3-mediated cleavage of ROCK I induces MLC phosphorylation and apoptotic membrane blebbing. Nat Cell Biol 2001;3:346–352. [PubMed: 11283607]
- Mills JC, Stone NL, Erhardt J, Pittman RN. Apoptotic membrane blebbing is regulated by myosin light chain phosphorylation. J Cell Biol 1998;140:627–636. [PubMed: 9456322]
- Martin SJ, O'Brien GA, Nishioka WK, McGahon AJ, Mahboubi A, Saido TC, Green DR. Proteolysis of fodrin (non-erythroid spectrin) during apoptosis. J Biol Chem 1995;270:6425–6428. [PubMed: 7534762]
- Taylor RC, Brumatti G, Ito S, Hengartner MO, Derry WB, Martin SJ. Establishing a blueprint for CED-3-dependent killing through identification of multiple substrates for this protease. J Biol Chem 2007;282:15011–15021. [PubMed: 17371877]
- •31. Luthi AU, Martin SJ. The CASBAH: a searchable database of caspase substrates. Cell Death Differ 2007;14:641–650. [PubMed: 17273173]
- Byun Y, Chen F, Chang R, Trivedi M, Green KJ, Cryns VL. Caspase cleavage of vimentin disrupts intermediate filaments and promotes apoptosis. Cell Death Differ 2001;8:443–450. [PubMed: 11423904]
- Gerner C, Frohwein U, Gotzmann J, Bayer E, Gelbmann D, Bursch W, Schulte-Hermann R. The Fasinduced apoptosis analyzed by high throughput proteome analysis. J Biol Chem 2000;275:39018– 39026. [PubMed: 10978337]
- ••34. Dix MM, Simon GM, Cravatt BF. Global mapping of the topography and magnitude of proteolytic events in apoptosis. Cell 2008;134:679–691. [PubMed: 18724940]
- ••35. Mahrus S, Trinidad JC, Barkan DT, Sali A, Burlingame AL, Wells JA. Global sequencing of proteolytic cleavage sites in apoptosis by specific labeling of protein N termini. Cell 2008;134:866–876. [PubMed: 18722006]In the above two papers new techniques were used to identify protease substrates *in vivo*. The first paper introduced a new high-content proteomic platform called PROTOMAP, to profile proteolytic events occurring in natural biological systems). The second paper labeled N-terminus of newly cleaved polypeptides with biotin. Applying these methods to cells undergo apoptosis, authors were able to identify proteins not previously documented as caspase substrate and provide a topographic map of proteolytic events during apoptosis.
- 36. Wyllie AH. Glucocorticoid-induced thymocyte apoptosis is associated with endogenous endonuclease activation. Nature 1980;284:555–556. [PubMed: 6245367]
- Samejima K, Earnshaw WC. Trashing the genome: the role of nucleases during apoptosis. Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol 2005;6:677–688. [PubMed: 16103871]
- Kaufmann SH, Mesner PW Jr, Samejima K, Tone S, Earnshaw WC. Detection of DNA cleavage in apoptotic cells. Methods Enzymol 2000;322:3–15. [PubMed: 10914000]
- 39. Widlak P, Garrard WT. Discovery, regulation, and action of the major apoptotic nucleases DFF40/ CAD and endonuclease G. J Cell Biochem 2005;94:1078–1087. [PubMed: 15723341]
- Widlak P, Garrard WT. Roles of the major apoptotic nuclease-DNA fragmentation factor-in biology and disease. Cell Mol Life Sci 2009;66:263–274. [PubMed: 18810317]
- Counis MF, Torriglia A. Acid DNases and their interest among apoptotic endonucleases. Biochimie 2006;88:1851–1858. [PubMed: 16989934]
- 42. Parrish JZ, Xue D. Cuts can kill: the roles of apoptotic nucleases in cell death and animal development. Chromosoma 2006;115:89–97. [PubMed: 16418867]

- 43. Nagata S. DNA degradation in development and programmed cell death. Annu Rev Immunol 2005;23:853–875. [PubMed: 15771588]
- ••44. Enari M, Sakahira H, Yokoyama H, Okawa K, Iwamatsu A, Nagata S. A caspase-activated DNase that degrades DNA during apoptosis, and its inhibitor ICAD. Nature 1998;391:43–50. [PubMed: 9422506]Together with reference 47 and 48, these are the original papers that described the biochemical purification and characterization of CAD/DFF40 as a major apoptotic DNase and clearly showed that DNase activity of CAD is always inhibited by ICAD until ICAD is cleaved by activated caspase 3 at two sites and its inhibitory effect on CAD is released.
- ••45. Liu X, Zou H, Slaughter C, Wang X. DFF, a heterodimeric protein that functions downstream of caspase-3 to trigger DNA fragmentation during apoptosis. Cell 1997;89:175–184. [PubMed: 9108473]
- 46. Samejima K, Tone S, Earnshaw WC. CAD/DFF40 nuclease is dispensable for high molecular weight DNA cleavage and stage I chromatin condensation in apoptosis. J Biol Chem 2001;276:45427– 45432. [PubMed: 11577114]
- 47. Zhang J, Liu X, Scherer DC, van Kaer L, Wang X, Xu M. Resistance to DNA fragmentation and chromatin condensation in mice lacking the DNA fragmentation factor 45. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 1998;95:12480–12485. [PubMed: 9770511]
- ••48. Sakahira H, Iwamatsu A, Nagata S. Specific chaperone-like activity of inhibitor of caspase-activated DNase for caspase-activated DNase. J Biol Chem 2000;275:8091–8096. [PubMed: 10713130]
- 49. Gu J, Dong RP, Zhang C, McLaughlin DF, Wu MX, Schlossman SF. Functional interaction of DFF35 and DFF45 with caspase-activated DNA fragmentation nuclease DFF40. J Biol Chem 1999;274:20759–20762. [PubMed: 10409614]
- Sakahira H, Enari M, Nagata S. Cleavage of CAD inhibitor in CAD activation and DNA degradation during apoptosis. Nature 1998;391:96–99. [PubMed: 9422513]
- Lechardeur D, Drzymala L, Sharma M, Zylka D, Kinach R, Pacia J, Hicks C, Usmani N, Rommens JM, Lukacs GL. Determinants of the nuclear localization of the heterodimeric DNA fragmentation factor (ICAD/CAD). J Cell Biol 2000;150:321–334. [PubMed: 10908575]
- 52. Samejima K, Earnshaw WC. ICAD/DFF regulator of apoptotic nuclease is nuclear. Exp Cell Res 1998;243:453–459. [PubMed: 9743604]
- ••53. Woo EJ, Kim YG, Kim MS, Han WD, Shin S, Robinson H, Park SY, Oh BH. Structural mechanism for inactivation and activation of CAD/DFF40 in the apoptotic pathway. Mol Cell 2004;14:531– 539. [PubMed: 15149602]The crystal structure of activated CAD/DFF40 revealed that CAD acts as dimer to cleave DNA. The deeply buried active site in the scissors-like structure explains how CAD distinguishes the internucleosomal DNA from nucleosomal DNA as its substrate.
- Hanus J, Kalinowska-Herok M, Widlak P. The major apoptotic endonuclease DFF40/CAD is a deoxyribose-specific and double-strand-specific enzyme. Apoptosis 2008;13:377–382. [PubMed: 18283539]
- 55. Widlak P, Kalinowska M, Parseghian MH, Lu X, Hansen JC, Garrard WT. The histone H1 C-terminal domain binds to the apoptotic nuclease, DNA fragmentation factor (DFF40/CAD) and stimulates DNA cleavage. Biochemistry 2005;44:7871–7878. [PubMed: 15910001]
- 56. Liu X, Li P, Widlak P, Zou H, Luo X, Garrard WT, Wang X. The 40-kDa subunit of DNA fragmentation factor induces DNA fragmentation and chromatin condensation during apoptosis. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 1998;95:8461–8466. [PubMed: 9671700]
- •57. Li LY, Luo X, Wang X. Endonuclease G is an apoptotic DNase when released from mitochondria. Nature 2001;412:95–99. [PubMed: 11452314]This paper and reference 71 used biochemical and genetic approach and independently identified mammalian endonuclease G (endo G) and its C. elegans homolog cps-6 (CED-3 protease suppressor) as a cell-autonomous nuclease in addition to CAD.
- Arnoult D, Gaume B, Karbowski M, Sharpe JC, Cecconi F, Youle RJ. Mitochondrial release of AIF and EndoG requires caspase activation downstream of Bax/Bak-mediated permeabilization. Embo J 2003;22:4385–4399. [PubMed: 12941691]
- Temme C, Weissbach R, Lilie H, Wilson C, Meinhart A, Meyer S, Golbik R, Schierhorn A, Wahle E. The Drosophila melanogaster Gene cg4930 Encodes a High Affinity Inhibitor for Endonuclease G. J Biol Chem 2009;284:8337–8348. [PubMed: 19129189]

- Torriglia A, Lepretre C, Padron-Barthe L, Chahory S, Martin E. Molecular mechanism of L-DNase II activation and function as a molecular switch in apoptosis. Biochem Pharmacol 2008;76:1490– 1502. [PubMed: 18761000]
- Kawase T, Ichikawa H, Ohta T, Nozaki N, Tashiro F, Ohki R, Taya Y. p53 target gene AEN is a nuclear exonuclease required for p53-dependent apoptosis. Oncogene 2008;27:3797–3810. [PubMed: 18264133]
- 62. Shiokawa D, Kobayashi T, Tanuma S. Involvement of DNase gamma in apoptosis associated with myogenic differentiation of C2C12 cells. J Biol Chem 2002;277:31031–31037. [PubMed: 12050166]
- 63. Shiokawa D, Shika Y, Araki S, Sunaga S, Mizuta R, Kitamura D, Tanuma S. Stage-specific expression of DNasegamma during B-cell development and its role in B-cell receptor-mediated apoptosis in WEHI-231 cells. Cell Death Differ 2007;14:992–1000. [PubMed: 17218958]
- 64. Sulston JE. Post-embryonic development in the ventral cord of Caenorhabditis elegans. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci 1976;275:287–297. [PubMed: 8804]
- 65. Wu YC, Stanfield GM, Horvitz HR. NUC-1, a caenorhabditis elegans DNase II homolog, functions in an intermediate step of DNA degradation during apoptosis. Genes Dev 2000;14:536–548. [PubMed: 10716942]
- Hsiao YY, Nakagawa A, Shi Z, Mitani S, Xue D, Yuan HS. Crystal structure of CRN-4: implications for domain function in apoptotic DNA degradation. Mol Cell Biol 2009;29:448–457. [PubMed: 18981218]
- 67. Parrish JZ, Xue D. Functional genomic analysis of apoptotic DNA degradation in C. elegans. Mol Cell 2003;11:987–996. [PubMed: 12718884]
- McIlroy D, Tanaka M, Sakahira H, Fukuyama H, Suzuki M, Yamamura K, Ohsawa Y, Uchiyama Y, Nagata S. An auxiliary mode of apoptotic DNA fragmentation provided by phagocytes. Genes Dev 2000;14:549–558. [PubMed: 10716943]
- Generation and characterization of endonuclease G null mice. Mol Cell Biol 2005;25:294–302. [PubMed: 15601850]
- David KK, Sasaki M, Yu SW, Dawson TM, Dawson VL. EndoG is dispensable in embryogenesis and apoptosis. Cell Death Differ 2006;13:1147–1155. [PubMed: 16239930]
- 71. Parrish J, Li L, Klotz K, Ledwich D, Wang X, Xue D. Mitochondrial endonuclease G is important for apoptosis in C. elegans. Nature 2001;412:90–94. [PubMed: 11452313]
- Zhang J, Wang X, Bove KE, Xu M. DNA fragmentation factor 45-deficient cells are more resistant to apoptosis and exhibit different dying morphology than wild-type control cells. J Biol Chem 1999;274:37450–37454. [PubMed: 10601318]
- 73. Radic M, Marion T, Monestier M. Nucleosomes are exposed at the cell surface in apoptosis. J Immunol 2004;172:6692–6700. [PubMed: 15153485]
- 74. Frisoni L, McPhie L, Colonna L, Sriram U, Monestier M, Gallucci S, Caricchio R. Nuclear autoantigen translocation and autoantibody opsonization lead to increased dendritic cell phagocytosis and presentation of nuclear antigens: a novel pathogenic pathway for autoimmunity? J Immunol 2005;175:2692–2701. [PubMed: 16081846]
- 75. Evans CJ, Aguilera RJ. DNase II: genes, enzymes and function. Gene 2003;322:1–15. [PubMed: 14644493]
- •76. Mukae N, Yokoyama H, Yokokura T, Sakoyama Y, Nagata S. Activation of the innate immunity in Drosophila by endogenous chromosomal DNA that escaped apoptotic degradation. Genes Dev 2002;16:2662–2671. [PubMed: 12381665]
- 77. Krieser RJ, MacLea KS, Longnecker DS, Fields JL, Fiering S, Eastman A. Deoxyribonuclease IIalpha is required during the phagocytic phase of apoptosis and its loss causes perinatal lethality. Cell Death Differ 2002;9:956–962. [PubMed: 12181746]
- Nagata S. Autoimmune diseases caused by defects in clearing dead cells and nuclei expelled from erythroid precursors. Immunol Rev 2007;220:237–250. [PubMed: 17979851]
- Okabe Y, Kawane K, Akira S, Taniguchi T, Nagata S. Toll-like receptor-independent gene induction program activated by mammalian DNA escaped from apoptotic DNA degradation. J Exp Med 2005;202:1333–1339. [PubMed: 16301743]

- Okabe Y, Kawane K, Nagata S. IFN regulatory factor (IRF) 3/7-dependent and -independent gene induction by mammalian DNA that escapes degradation. Eur J Immunol 2008;38:3150–3158. [PubMed: 18991290]
- •81. Yoshida H, Okabe Y, Kawane K, Fukuyama H, Nagata S. Lethal anemia caused by interferon-beta produced in mouse embryos carrying undigested DNA. Nat Immunol 2005;6:49–56. [PubMed: 15568025]
- Kawane K, Ohtani M, Miwa K, Kizawa T, Kanbara Y, Yoshioka Y, Yoshikawa H, Nagata S. Chronic polyarthritis caused by mammalian DNA that escapes from degradation in macrophages. Nature 2006;443:998–1002. [PubMed: 17066036]
- Maiuri MC, Zalckvar E, Kimchi A, Kroemer G. Self-eating and self-killing: crosstalk between autophagy and apoptosis. Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol 2007;8:741–752. [PubMed: 17717517]
- 84. Gonzalez-Polo RA, Boya P, Pauleau AL, Jalil A, Larochette N, Souquere S, Eskelinen EL, Pierron G, Saftig P, Kroemer G. The apoptosis/autophagy paradox: autophagic vacuolization before apoptotic death. J Cell Sci 2005;118:3091–3102. [PubMed: 15985464]
- Boya P, Gonzalez-Polo RA, Casares N, Perfettini JL, Dessen P, Larochette N, Metivier D, Meley D, Souquere S, Yoshimori T, et al. Inhibition of macroautophagy triggers apoptosis. Mol Cell Biol 2005;25:1025–1040. [PubMed: 15657430]
- 86. Hara T, Nakamura K, Matsui M, Yamamoto A, Nakahara Y, Suzuki-Migishima R, Yokoyama M, Mishima K, Saito I, Okano H, et al. Suppression of basal autophagy in neural cells causes neurodegenerative disease in mice. Nature 2006;441:885–889. [PubMed: 16625204]
- Komatsu M, Waguri S, Chiba T, Murata S, Iwata J, Tanida I, Ueno T, Koike M, Uchiyama Y, Kominami E, et al. Loss of autophagy in the central nervous system causes neurodegeneration in mice. Nature 2006;441:880–884. [PubMed: 16625205]
- 88. Pua HH, Dzhagalov I, Chuck M, Mizushima N, He YW. A critical role for the autophagy gene Atg5 in T cell survival and proliferation. J Exp Med 2007;204:25–31. [PubMed: 17190837]
- Shimizu S, Kanaseki T, Mizushima N, Mizuta T, Arakawa-Kobayashi S, Thompson CB, Tsujimoto Y. Role of Bcl-2 family proteins in a non-apoptotic programmed cell death dependent on autophagy genes. Nat Cell Biol 2004;6:1221–1228. [PubMed: 15558033]
- Lum JJ, Bauer DE, Kong M, Harris MH, Li C, Lindsten T, Thompson CB. Growth factor regulation of autophagy and cell survival in the absence of apoptosis. Cell 2005;120:237–248. [PubMed: 15680329]
- 91. Berry DL, Baehrecke EH. Growth arrest and autophagy are required for salivary gland cell degradation in Drosophila. Cell 2007;131:1137–1148. [PubMed: 18083103]
- Berry DL, Baehrecke EH. Autophagy functions in programmed cell death. Autophagy 2008;4:359– 360. [PubMed: 18212526]
- 93. Nezis IP, Lamark T, Velentzas AD, Rusten TE, Bjorkoy G, Johansen T, Papassideri IS, Stravopodis DJ, Margaritis LH, Stenmark H, et al. Cell death during Drosophila melanogaster early oogenesis is mediated through autophagy. Autophagy 2009;5:298–302. [PubMed: 19066465]
- Mohseni N, McMillan SC, Chaudhary R, Mok J, Reed BH. Autophagy promotes caspase-dependent cell death during Drosophila development. Autophagy 2009;5:329–338. [PubMed: 19066463]
- ••95. Qu X, Zou Z, Sun Q, Luby-Phelps K, Cheng P, Hogan RN, Gilpin C, Levine B. Autophagy genedependent clearance of apoptotic cells during embryonic development. Cell 2007;128:931–946. [PubMed: 17350577]This paper discovered a role of autophagy activity in apoptotic cells using in vitro cultured mouse embryonic cells. Although autophagy genes are dispensable for apoptosis but are essential for providing the dying cell sufficient ATP to generate the engulfment signals that are required for the apoptotic cells to be removed by phagocytes.
- 96. Mellen MA, de la Rosa EJ, Boya P. The autophagic machinery is necessary for removal of cell corpses from the developing retinal neuroepithelium. Cell Death Differ 2008;15:1279–1290. [PubMed: 18369370]
- Vieira OV, Botelho RJ, Grinstein S. Phagosome maturation: aging gracefully. Biochem J 2002;366:689–704. [PubMed: 12061891]
- Vieira OV, Botelho RJ, Rameh L, Brachmann SM, Matsuo T, Davidson HW, Schreiber A, Backer JM, Cantley LC, Grinstein S. Distinct roles of class I and class III phosphatidylinositol 3-kinases in phagosome formation and maturation. J Cell Biol 2001;155:19–25. [PubMed: 11581283]

He et al.

- Botelho RJ, Scott CC, Grinstein S. Phosphoinositide involvement in phagocytosis and phagosome maturation. Curr Top Microbiol Immunol 2004;282:1–30. [PubMed: 14594212]
- 100. Scott CC, Botelho RJ, Grinstein S. Phagosome maturation: a few bugs in the system. J Membr Biol 2003;193:137–152. [PubMed: 12962275]
- 101. Zerial M, McBride H. Rab proteins as membrane organizers. Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol 2001;2:107– 117. [PubMed: 11252952]
- 102. Duclos S, Diez R, Garin J, Papadopoulou B, Descoteaux A, Stenmark H, Desjardins M. Rab5 regulates the kiss and run fusion between phagosomes and endosomes and the acquisition of phagosome leishmanicidal properties in RAW 264.7 macrophages. J Cell Sci 2000;113(Pt 19): 3531–3541. [PubMed: 10984443]
- 103. Desjardins M, Huber LA, Parton RG, Griffiths G. Biogenesis of phagolysosomes proceeds through a sequential series of interactions with the endocytic apparatus. J Cell Biol 1994;124:677–688. [PubMed: 8120091]
- 104. Vieira OV, Bucci C, Harrison RE, Trimble WS, Lanzetti L, Gruenberg J, Schreiber AD, Stahl PD, Grinstein S. Modulation of Rab5 and Rab7 recruitment to phagosomes by phosphatidylinositol 3kinase. Mol Cell Biol 2003;23:2501–2514. [PubMed: 12640132]
- 105. Harrison RE, Bucci C, Vieira OV, Schroer TA, Grinstein S. Phagosomes fuse with late endosomes and/or lysosomes by extension of membrane protrusions along microtubules: role of Rab7 and RILP. Mol Cell Biol 2003;23:6494–6506. [PubMed: 12944476]
- 106. Nishi T, Forgac M. The vacuolar (H+)-ATPases--nature's most versatile proton pumps. Nat Rev Mol Cell Biol 2002;3:94–103. [PubMed: 11836511]
- 107. Kawasaki-Nishi S, Nishi T, Forgac M. Proton translocation driven by ATP hydrolysis in V-ATPases. FEBS Lett 2003;545:76–85. [PubMed: 12788495]
- 108. Hackam DJ, Rotstein OD, Zhang WJ, Demaurex N, Woodside M, Tsai O, Grinstein S. Regulation of phagosomal acidification. Differential targeting of Na+/H+ exchangers, Na+/K+-ATPases, and vacuolar-type H+-atpases. J Biol Chem 1997;272:29810–29820. [PubMed: 9368053]
- 109. Lukacs GL, Rotstein OD, Grinstein S. Phagosomal acidification is mediated by a vacuolar-type H (+)-ATPase in murine macrophages. J Biol Chem 1990;265:21099–21107. [PubMed: 2147429]
- •110. Erwig LP, McPhilips KA, Wynes MW, Ivetic A, Ridley AJ, Henson PM. Differential regulation of phagosome maturation in macrophages and dendritic cells mediated by Rho GTPases and ezrinradixin-moesin (ERM) proteins. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 2006;103:12825–12830. [PubMed: 16908865]This paper compared the different phagosome maturation rate in macrophagy and the role of Rho kinase in early maturation process. Phagosomes containing apoptotic cells in macrophagy mature faster than those containing Ig-opsonized target cells. These evidences suggest different cellular regulatory processes in degradation of apoptotic cells verses other engulfed objects.
- 111. Metzstein MM, Stanfield GM, Horvitz HR. Genetics of programmed cell death in *C. elegans*: past, present and future. Trends Genet 1998;14:410–416. [PubMed: 9820030]
- 112. Reddien PW, Horvitz HR. The engulfment process of programmed cell death in caenorhabditis elegans. Annu Rev Cell Dev Biol 2004;20:193–221. [PubMed: 15473839]
- •113. Yu X, Odera S, Chuang CH, Lu N, Zhou Z. C. elegans Dynamin mediates the signaling of phagocytic receptor CED-1 for the engulfment and degradation of apoptotic cells. Dev Cell 2006;10:743–757. [PubMed: 16740477]First paper discovered the function of *C. elegans* dynamin, DYN-1, in apoptotic cell removal Not like its canonical fission activity in endocytosis, dynamin function to mediate fusion of endocytic vesicles to the phagocytic cup and phagosome surface during phagocytosis. Although DYN-1 does not localize on phagosome for long period of time, its activity is important for both engulfment and degradation of apoptotic cells. This paper first showed the major downstream events of CED-1 signaling pathway, that is recruiting intracellular vesicles to fuse with nascent phagosome providing membrane material and proteins that are necessary for apoptotic cell degradation.
- ••114. Yu X, Lu N, Zhou Z. Phagocytic receptor CED-1 initiates a signaling pathway for degrading engulfed apoptotic cells. PLoS Biol 2008;6:e61. [PubMed: 18351800]This paper discussed the function of CED-1 as a phagocytic receptor in phagosome maturation. CED-1 not only promotes the engulfment of apoptotic cells but also control the recruitment of downstream factors that are important for phagosome maturation. This paper also provide a detailed characterization of RAB-7,

one of the down stream effectors, RAB-7 localizes on phagosome surface shortly after engulfment to mediate the fusion of lysosome to phagosome and its function is crucial for degradation of apoptotic cells.

- ••115. Kinchen JM, Doukoumetzidis K, Almendinger J, Stergiou L, Tosello-Trampont A, Sifri CD, Hengartner MO, Ravichandran KS. A pathway for phagosome maturation during engulfment of apoptotic cells. Nat Cell Biol 2008;10:556–566. [PubMed: 18425118]In this paper, a genome wise RNAi screen was performed to identify genes that involved in apoptotic cell removal in C. elegans. Provide the evidence that C. elegans VPS-34 and HOPS complex is required for phagosome maturation. A genetic pathway leads to degradation of apoptotic cell was built starting from DYN-1. Authors also compared the functions of several protein homologues of worm and mammalian, showing that the phagosome degradation pathway is high conserved in different species.
- ••116. Mangahas PM, Yu X, Miller KG, Zhou Z. The small GTPase Rab2 functions in the removal of apoptotic cells in Caenorhabditis elegans. J Cell Biol 2008;180:357–373. [PubMed: 18227280] Together with 117, showed the function of small GTPase RAB-2 in phagosome maturation. RAB-2 mediates the fusion of lysosomes to phagosomes. However, conflict results were reported regarding whether the fusion events lead phagosome acitification.
- •117. Lu Q, Zhang Y, Hu T, Guo P, Li W, Wang X. C. elegans Rab GTPase 2 is required for the degradation of apoptotic cells. Development 2008;135:1069–1080. [PubMed: 18256195]
- 118. Cai H, Reinisch K, Ferro-Novick S. Coats, tethers, Rabs, and SNAREs work together to mediate the intracellular destination of a transport vesicle. Dev Cell 2007;12:671–682. [PubMed: 17488620]
- 119. Grosshans BL, Ortiz D, Novick P. Rabs and their effectors: achieving specificity in membrane traffic. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 2006;103:11821–11827. [PubMed: 16882731]
- 120. Xiao H, Chen D, Fang Z, Xu J, Sun X, Song S, Liu J, Yang C. Lysosome biogenesis mediated by vps-18 affects apoptotic cell degradation in Caenorhabditis elegans. Mol Biol Cell 2009;20:21–32. [PubMed: 18923146]This paper disscused the important role of VPS-18, a worm homolog of yeast HOPS complex subunit Vps-18p, in phagosome degradation and biogenesis of endosomes and lysosomes. Mutation in *vps-18* was show to affect endosome and lysosome biogenesis and block phagosomes fuse to lysosomes.
- 121. Garin J, Diez R, Kieffer S, Dermine JF, Duclos S, Gagnon E, Sadoul R, Rondeau C, Desjardins M. The phagosome proteome: insight into phagosome functions. J Cell Biol 2001;152:165–180. [PubMed: 11149929]
- 122. Stuart LM, Boulais J, Charriere GM, Hennessy EJ, Brunet S, Jutras I, Goyette G, Rondeau C, Letarte S, Huang H, et al. A systems biology analysis of the Drosophila phagosome. Nature 2007;445:95–101. [PubMed: 17151602]
- 123. Peri F, Nusslein-Volhard C. Live imaging of neuronal degradation by microglia reveals a role for v0-ATPase a1 in phagosomal fusion in vivo. Cell 2008;133:916–927. [PubMed: 18510934]
- 124. Bayer MJ, Reese C, Buhler S, Peters C, Mayer A. Vacuole membrane fusion: V0 functions after trans-SNARE pairing and is coupled to the Ca2+-releasing channel. J Cell Biol 2003;162:211–222. [PubMed: 12876274]
- 125. Hinshaw JE. Dynamin and its role in membrane fission. Annu Rev Cell Dev Biol 2000;16:483–519. [PubMed: 11031245]
- 126. Peters C, Baars TL, Buhler S, Mayer A. Mutual control of membrane fission and fusion proteins. Cell 2004;119:667–678. [PubMed: 15550248]
- 127. Miyauchi K, Kim Y, Latinovic O, Morozov V, Melikyan GB. HIV enters cells via endocytosis and dynamin-dependent fusion with endosomes. Cell 2009;137:433–444. [PubMed: 19410541]
- 128. Hoppins S, Nunnari J. The molecular mechanism of mitochondrial fusion. Biochim Biophys Acta 2009;1793:20–26. [PubMed: 18691613]
- 129. Di A, Nelson DJ, Bindokas V, Brown ME, Libunao F, Palfrey HC. Dynamin regulates focal exocytosis in phagocytosing macrophages. Mol Biol Cell 2003;14:2016–2028. [PubMed: 12802072]
- 130. Gold ES, Underhill DM, Morrissette NS, Guo J, McNiven MA, Aderem A. Dynamin 2 is required for phagocytosis in macrophages. J Exp Med 1999;190:1849–1856. [PubMed: 10601359]

He et al.

- Perskvist N, Roberg K, Kulyte A, Stendahl O. Rab5a GTPase regulates fusion between pathogencontaining phagosomes and cytoplasmic organelles in human neutrophils. J Cell Sci 2002;115:1321–1330. [PubMed: 11884531]
- 132. Fratti RA, Backer JM, Gruenberg J, Corvera S, Deretic V. Role of phosphatidylinositol 3-kinase and Rab5 effectors in phagosomal biogenesis and mycobacterial phagosome maturation arrest. J Cell Biol 2001;154:631–644. [PubMed: 11489920]
- 133. Kitano M, Nakaya M, Nakamura T, Nagata S, Matsuda M. Imaging of Rab5 activity identifies essential regulators for phagosome maturation. Nature 2008;453:241–245. [PubMed: 18385674]
- 134. Christoforidis S, Miaczynska M, Ashman K, Wilm M, Zhao L, Yip SC, Waterfield MD, Backer JM, Zerial M. Phosphatidylinositol-3-OH kinases are Rab5 effectors. Nat Cell Biol 1999;1:249–252. [PubMed: 10559924]
- 135. Murray JT, Panaretou C, Stenmark H, Miaczynska M, Backer JM. Role of Rab5 in the recruitment of hVps34/p150 to the early endosome. Traffic 2002;3:416–427. [PubMed: 12010460]
- 136. Shin HW, Hayashi M, Christoforidis S, Lacas-Gervais S, Hoepfner S, Wenk MR, Modregger J, Uttenweiler-Joseph S, Wilm M, Nystuen A, et al. An enzymatic cascade of Rab5 effectors regulates phosphoinositide turnover in the endocytic pathway. J Cell Biol 2005;170:607–618. [PubMed: 16103228]
- 137. Liu QA, Hengartner MO. Candidate adaptor protein CED-6 promotes the engulfment of apoptotic cells in *C. elegans*. Cell 1998;93:961–972. [PubMed: 9635426]
- 138. Zhou Z, Hartwieg E, Horvitz HR. CED-1 is a transmembrane receptor that mediates cell corpse engulfment in C. elegans. Cell 2001b;104:43–56. [PubMed: 11163239]
- 139. Ellis RE, Jacobson DM, Horvitz HR. Genes required for the engulfment of cell corpses during programmed cell death in Caenorhabditis elegans. Genetics 1991a;129:79–94. [PubMed: 1936965]
- 140. Callebaut I, Mignotte V, Souchet M, Mornon JP. EMI domains are widespread and reveal the probable orthologs of the Caenorhabditis elegans CED-1 protein. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 2003;300:619–623. [PubMed: 12507493]
- 141. MacDonald JM, Beach MG, Porpiglia E, Sheehan AE, Watts RJ, Freeman MR. The Drosophila cell corpse engulfment receptor Draper mediates glial clearance of severed axons. Neuron 2006;50:869– 881. [PubMed: 16772169]
- 142. Awasaki T, Tatsumi R, Takahashi K, Arai K, Nakanishi Y, Ueda R, Ito K. Essential role of the apoptotic cell engulfment genes draper and ced-6 in programmed axon pruning during Drosophila metamorphosis. Neuron 2006;50:855–867. [PubMed: 16772168]
- 143. Manaka J, Kuraishi T, Shiratsuchi A, Nakai Y, Higashida H, Henson P, Nakanishi Y. Drapermediated and phosphatidylserine-independent phagocytosis of apoptotic cells by Drosophila hemocytes/macrophages. J Biol Chem 2004;279:48466–48476. [PubMed: 15342648]
- 144. Ziegenfuss JS, Biswas R, Avery MA, Hong K, Sheehan AE, Yeung YG, Stanley ER, Freeman MR. Draper-dependent glial phagocytic activity is mediated by Src and Syk family kinase signalling. Nature 2008;453:935–939. [PubMed: 18432193]
- 145. Kurant E, Axelrod S, Leaman D, Gaul U. Six-microns-under acts upstream of Draper in the glial phagocytosis of apoptotic neurons. Cell 2008;133:498–509. [PubMed: 18455990]This paper revealed the functions of two Drosophila phagoctosis rceptors, SIMU and DRPR in fly glial. Comparing with SIMU, DRPR mainly functions in control phagosome maturation rather than recognition and engulfment of apoptotic neurons.
- 146. Hamon Y, Trompier D, Ma Z, Venegas V, Pophillat M, Mignotte V, Zhou Z, Chimini G. Cooperation between engulfment receptors: the case of ABCA1 and MEGF10. PLoS ONE 2006;1:e120. [PubMed: 17205124]
- 147. Lerm M, Brodin VP, Ruishalme I, Stendahl O, Sarndahl E. Inactivation of Cdc42 is necessary for depolymerization of phagosomal F-actin and subsequent phagosomal maturation. J Immunol 2007;178:7357–7365. [PubMed: 17513786]
- 148. Sanjuan MA, Dillon CP, Tait SW, Moshiach S, Dorsey F, Connell S, Komatsu M, Tanaka K, Cleveland JL, Withoff S, et al. Toll-like receptor signalling in macrophages links the autophagy pathway to phagocytosis. Nature 2007;450:1253–1257. [PubMed: 18097414]

149. Shui W, Sheu L, Liu J, Smart B, Petzold CJ, Hsieh TY, Pitcher A, Keasling JD, Bertozzi CR. Membrane proteomics of phagosomes suggests a connection to autophagy. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 2008;105:16952–16957. [PubMed: 18971338]

He et al.



Figure 1.

The process of apoptotic cell removal including cell autonomous and cell nonautonomous degradations. (i) When cells adapt the apoptotic death fate, activated caspase family proteolyses are responsible for the degradation of cytoskeleton, releasing and exposure of signals that attract phagocytes and induce DNA fragmentation by activating DNases. (ii) Apoptotic cells are recognized and engulfed by phagocytes. (iii) Inside the phagocytes, apoptotic cell containing phagosomes fuse with different intracellular organelle species. This fusion process dramatically changes the membrane and lumen component of the phagosome and facilitates the complete degradation of apoptotic cells.



Cell non-autonomous DNA degradation

Figure 2.

In living cells, the activity of CAD is inhibited by ICAD and the Endo G is sequestered in mitochondrial intermembrane space. During apoptosis, the activated caspases cleave ICAD and release CAD, which forms homodimer and cleave linker DNA between necleosomes. The activation of caspases also triggers the release of Endo G from mitochondria into nucleus to cleave chromosomal DNA. B. After engulfed by phagocytes, the apoptotic cell resides in phagosome. Through phagosomal maturation, the phagosome acquires different digestive enzymes including DNase II α from lysosomes and its lumen is gradually acidified. In acidic condition, the active DNase II α further degrades nucleosomal DNA into nucleotides.

He et al.



Figure 3.

Cell non-autonomous degradation of apoptotic cells. In *C. elegans*, the signal cascade of apoptotic cell degradation start from phagocytic receptor CED-1 and followed by CED-6, large GTPase DYN-1, small GTPases (RAB-5, RAB-7 and RAB-2), class III PI3 kinase Vps-34 and members of HOPS complex. DYN-1 and RAB GTPase localize on phagocytic cup or phagosome surface to regulate the sequential fusion of intracellular organelles, including early and late endosomes and lysosomes, to phagosome. PIP3 are syntheses on the phagosome surface mainly by Vps-34 and serve to recruit downstream effectors. Members of HOPS complex are RAB-7 effectors and function mainly downstream of RAB-7. It is not know whether Vps-34 and HOPS complex also localize on phagosome surface. During phagosome maturation, its lumen pH level drop from near neural to below 5, which activate the capthesin family proteases and DNase II to complete degrade phagosome contents.