



Published in final edited form as:

J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2010 May ; 125(5): 1028–1036.e13. doi:10.1016/j.jaci.2010.02.008.

Analyses of Asthma Severity Phenotypes and Inflammatory Proteins in Subjects Stratified by Sputum Granulocytes

Annette T Hastie, PhD, Wendy C Moore, MD, Deborah A Meyers, PhD, Penny L Vestal, MS, Huashi Li, MS, Stephen P Peters, MD, PhD, Eugene R Bleecker, MD, and the NHLBI Severe Asthma Research Program (SARP)

Center for Human Genomics, Wake Forest University Health Sciences, Winston Salem, NC

Abstract

Background—Patients with severe asthma have increased granulocytes in their sputum compared to patients with mild to moderate asthma.

Objective—We hypothesized that inflammatory granulocytes in sputum may identify specific asthma severity phenotypes and are associated with different patterns of inflammatory proteins in sputum supernatants.

Methods—This hypothesis was tested in 242 asthmatics enrolled in the Severe Asthma Research Program who provided sputum samples for cell count, differential cell determinations, cell lysates for Western blot, and supernatant analyses by inflammatory protein microarrays and ELISAs. ANOVA and multiple linear regression models tested mediator associations.

Results—Stratified by sputum granulocytes, < or $\geq 2\%$ eosinophils and < or $\geq 40\%$ neutrophils, subjects with both increased eosinophils and neutrophils had the lowest lung function, increased symptoms and healthcare utilization. Subjects with elevated eosinophils with or without increased neutrophils had significantly increased FeNO, serum eosinophils and greater frequency of daily β -agonist use. Microarray data, stratified by granulocytes revealed 25–28 inflammatory proteins increased >2-fold in sputa with $\geq 40\%$ neutrophils. Microarray analyses stratified by severity of asthma, identified 6–9 proteins increased >2-fold in sputa in subjects with severe asthma compared to nonsevere asthma. ELISA data, stratified by sputum granulocytes, showed significant increases in BDNF, IL-1 β , and MIP-3 α /CCL20 for those with $\geq 40\%$ neutrophils; these mediators demonstrated positive associations with neutrophil counts.

Conclusion—Combined increased sputum eosinophils and neutrophils identified asthmatics with the lowest lung function and worse asthma control, increased symptoms and healthcare requirements. Inflammatory protein analyses of sputum supernatants found novel mediators increased in asthmatics, predominantly associated with increased sputum neutrophils.

Keywords

asthma phenotypes; protein microarrays; BDNF; CXCL13; TNFSF14; CCL20; CCL18

Corresponding Author and reprint request: Annette T. Hastie, ahastie@wfubmc.edu, Center for Genomics and Personalized, Medicine Research, NRC-G70, Wake Forest University Health Sciences, Winston-Salem, NC 27157, Phone: (336) 713-7500, Fax: (336) 713-7544.

This article has supplemental data for the online repository

Publisher's Disclaimer: This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final citable form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

INTRODUCTION

Eosinophils and neutrophils have each been separately observed in sputum from severe, poorly controlled or persistent asthma¹⁻⁷. Severe asthma, as well as milder asthma, is therefore heterogeneous and comprised of subgroups with potentially different underlying inflammatory pathologies. Subjects may be stratified according to sputum granulocytes to determine whether inflammatory differences are associated with asthma severity phenotypes. In the past asthmatics with both elevated eosinophils and elevated neutrophils were assigned to either the group with high eosinophils⁸ or to the group with high neutrophils⁹. This approach potentially obscures distinguishing features for mixed granulocytic inflammation. One study evaluated these subjects as a separate group but found no significant differences in clinical characteristics between the groups except for age¹⁰. The small number of subjects with mixed granulocytes may have reduced differentiation from other phenotypes. We hypothesized that asthmatic subjects with both granulocytes increased in sputum represent a separate phenotypic group different from those with either only increased eosinophils, only increased neutrophils, or neither granulocyte increased.

In addition, only a few reports have investigated protein constituents of sputum, despite recognition that mucosal leukocytic infiltration is regulated by inflammatory mediator release. Earlier reports have measured limited numbers of proteins present in sputum, primarily those predicted for a single cell type, such as eosinophil cationic protein or IL-8, and compared these to normal controls¹¹⁻¹⁴. We hypothesized that the patterns of infiltrating leukocytes in sputum are determined by differences in the inflammatory proteins contributing to asthmatic phenotypes.

To test these hypotheses, comprehensively characterized severe and nonsevere subjects with asthma enrolled in the Severe Asthma Research Program (SARP) provided sputa and were stratified on the basis of granulocyte percents. A subset of sputa were screened with a commercial protein microarray assessing 120 inflammatory proteins to identify mediators differing between subjects characterized by both granulocytes increased, eosinophils increased, neutrophils increased, or neither granulocyte increased. Selected proteins were confirmed by standard ELISA in sputum supernatants from the larger group of asthmatics. Mediator levels were additionally examined for association with specific cell counts, and clinical characteristics. Sputum cell lysates were analyzed by Western blotting for presence of specific mediators.

METHODS

Characterization of severe and not severe asthma was performed according to the SARP protocol¹⁵. Non-smoking subjects (<5 packyears) met ATS criteria for diagnosis of asthma, and provided informed consent approved by the institutional review board. Comprehensive evaluation included spirometry, bronchodilator reversibility and bronchial responsiveness, assessment of atopy, collection of blood, exhaled NO, sputum induction, and administered questionnaire that characterized asthma symptoms, quality of life, medications and healthcare utilization¹⁵ (online repository).

Subjects

SARP subjects with severe (N=48, as defined by the ATS Workshop on Refractory Asthma¹⁶) and nonsevere asthma (N=194, asthmatics not meeting “severe” criteria), enrolled at Wake Forest University (WFU), had sputum induction, or, if safety criteria were not met, a spontaneous sputum collected. WFU collected a majority of the sputum samples and not all SARP sites participated in the sputum protocol. Demographics and clinical characteristics for

the subjects in the sputum subset matched those previously reported for SARP subjects from all sites 15 (Table E1 online repository).

Sputum Induction and Processing

The sputum induction method was adopted from the Asthma Clinical Research Network 17. Sputum was processed immediately; cell cytopins were stained for differential count of leukocytes, bronchial epithelial and squamous cells; and aliquots of sputum supernatant were stored at -80°C . The sputum cell differential counts from 175 subjects were adequate for further analyses¹⁷. Cell lysates were examined by Western blotting for presence of specific proteins (online repository).

Inflammation Microarrays and ELISAs

Inflammation protein microarray analyses (RayBiotech) were performed on sputum supernatants from subjects with asthma (N=12 nonsevere, noninhaled corticosteroid [ICS] treatment, N=12 nonsevere, ICS-treated, and N=12 severe, high dose ICS treatment) diluted to 1 mg total protein (online repository). Densities of duplicate reactions were averaged and normalized to controls on each membrane. Proteins identified from analyses based on corticosteroid use, granulocyte%, or asthma severity, were investigated by specific ELISA (R & D Systems, except PARC/CCL18 and Eotaxin 2 from RayBiotech).

Statistics

Microarray density data were \log_2 transformed and analyzed by Significance Analysis of Microarrays (SAM 18). A score >1 , false discovery rate of less than 5% and a greater than 2-fold change were the criteria for significance. The SAM program is designed to address a chance identification problem for larger datasets than the 120 protein microarray 18. Demographic and ELISA data are presented as means \pm standard deviations, standard errors, or medians (25%–75% quartiles). Measures not meeting Kolmogorov-Smirnov test for normal distribution, were transformed to log, or square root values. A zero in cell differentials or ELISA assays was replaced with a value half of the lowest observed before log transformation¹⁹. Continuous variables were tested by ANOVA, or by student's t-test, if parametric; or by Kruskal-Wallis and Mann-Whitney, if non-parametric (SAS 9.2, or Sigmastat 2.03). Initial analyses with a significant difference were further explored by post-hoc pairwise analyses (Tukey). Categorical variables were analyzed using Chi-square tests. Multivariate linear regression models examined mediators for association with sputum cells, age and clinical characteristics. Bonferroni correction was applied to variables with a p value <0.05 to determine significance.

RESULTS

Subject Stratification Based on Sputum Inflammation %Eosinophils and %Neutrophils

There were no significant differences in sputum cell percentages for severe compared to nonsevere subjects (Table E2, online repository), and therefore, these were combined for stratification by granulocytes: $<2\% \text{Eos} + <40\% \text{Neu}$, $<2\% \text{Eos} + \geq 40\% \text{Neu}$, $\geq 2\% \text{Eos} + <40\% \text{Neu}$, and $\geq 2\% \text{Eos} + \geq 40\% \text{Neu}$ (Table I). The group with both increased Eos and increased Neu had lowest lung function ($\text{FEV}_1\%$ predicted, FEV_1/FVC ratio, change $\text{FEV}_1\%$ predicted [maximum-baseline]), highest frequency of daily wheeze, and most frequent healthcare utilization (Table I). Subjects with $\geq 2\% \text{Eos}$ and $<40\% \text{Neu}$ had the highest FeNO ($p<0.001$). Subjects with $\geq 40\% \text{Neu}$, with or without $\geq 2\% \text{Eos}$, were significantly older, but there was no difference in age of asthma onset. No differences were observed for + skin test frequency or number. Greater frequency of positive response to “daily use of β -agonist”, and daily wheeze were associated with $\geq 2\% \text{Eos}$, with or without $\geq 40\% \text{Neu}$; whereas, a greater frequency of

positive response to “>1 urgent healthcare visit in the past year” was associated with $\geq 40\%$ Neu, with or without $\geq 2\%$ Eos. While only >1 urgent healthcare visit in the past year reached significance, other measures of healthcare utilization were higher in the combined increased granulocyte group than the other groups.

Stratification of Microarray Data based on Sputum %Eosinophils and %Neutrophils

Microarray data were analyzed based on sputum Eos and Neu of groups divided by granulocyte %. Corticosteroid effects^{20, 21} were considered by first comparing nonsevere without corticosteroid treatment to nonsevere with corticosteroid treatment. Only MCP3 was significantly reduced >2fold in the corticosteroid treatment group. Nevertheless to control for corticosteroid effects, only ICS-treated subjects were examined in the comparison of subjects with primarily elevated eosinophils (N=6) to subjects with primarily elevated neutrophils (N=7). Twenty-five proteins were increased >2-fold in the group with elevated Neu (Table II comparison 1). For subjects with elevated eosinophils (N=6) compared to subjects with both granulocytes elevated (N=8), 30 proteins were significantly increased >2-fold for those subjects with both granulocytes elevated (Table II, comparison 2). Eight new proteins were observed in this comparison, and 22 of the increased proteins were previously observed in comparison 1. Subjects with elevated Neu (N=7) were also compared to those with both granulocytes elevated (N=8), but showed no protein differences despite differing %Eos (not shown).

Microarray data stratified by subjects with <2%Eos compared to $\geq 2\%$ Eos, without considering %Neu, showed just two proteins, IL-11 (2.2X) and IL-2Ra (2.3X), significantly increased >2-fold (false discovery rate =0%) in those subjects with $\geq 2\%$ Eos (not shown). In contrast, microarray data stratified by subjects with <40%Neu compared to $\geq 40\%$ Neu without considering %Eos, had 28 proteins significantly increased in those subjects with $\geq 40\%$ Neu (Table II comparison 3). The three comparisons identified 19 proteins increased in common (highlighted). Limited supernatant fluid available required reducing the large number of potential biomarkers for specific ELISA confirmation. Therefore, microarray data were alternatively stratified by asthma severity.

Stratification of Microarray Data based on Asthma Severity

Comparisons of microarray data for nonsevere asthma subjects without and with inhaled corticosteroid treatment (N=12 and N=12, respectively) to severe asthma subjects (N=12) included: 1) all nonsevere with severe asthmatics, 2) nonsevere subjects receiving corticosteroids with severe subjects, and 3) nonsevere asthmatics receiving corticosteroids, and FEV₁ predicted >80% with severe subjects. These 3 comparisons yielded 9, 6, and 33 proteins, respectively, with significant increases >2fold in sputa of severe subjects. Three proteins matched in all 3 comparisons (highlighted in Table E3): Brain-derived neurotrophic factor (BDNF), B-lymphocyte chemoattractant (BLC/CXCL13), and epidermal growth factor (EGF). The comparison of nonsevere with mild disease to severe asthmatics found 25 proteins significantly increased >2-fold in the severe subjects which were not observed in the other 2 comparisons (Table E4, online repository). Based on the microarray results, proteins were selected for ELISA assay on the larger panel of sputa available (N=175). IL-13 and IFN γ were also examined although identified in only one microarray comparison (Comparison 1, Table II).

ELISAs on Selected Inflammatory Mediators Stratified by Sputum %Eosinophils and %Neutrophils

ELISA data stratified into the 4 groups based on sputum granulocytes, < or $\geq 2\%$ Eos + < or $\geq 40\%$ Neu, revealed significant increases in mediators for those subjects with $\geq 40\%$ Neu (Table III). BDNF, IL-1 β , and macrophage inflammatory protein 3 α /MIP-3 α /CCL20 were

significantly increased in sputa containing $\geq 40\%$ Neu, either with $< 2\%$ Eos or with $\geq 2\%$ Eos. Only Eotaxin 2 showed an increase associated with $\geq 2\%$ Eos, which was enhanced in combination with $\geq 40\%$ Neu, but did not reach significance after correction.

Associations of Mediators with Leukocytes and Clinical Characteristics

Associations of each inflammatory mediator's concentration with the actual count of specific cell types occurring in the sputum sample were investigated (Table IV). Age is positively associated with %Neu²² and therefore included as an independent variable. Only Neu were observed to have positive associations with those mediators showing significance. Despite positive association of Neu with age and with several mediators, age independently showed associations with only LIGHT/TNFSF14 and PARC/CCL18 which were not significant.

Inflammatory mediators were also examined for association with clinical characteristics including spirometric measures, FeNO, number of positive skin tests, and IgE levels (online repository Table E6). IL-8 and PARC/CCL18 had negative associations with baseline FVC% predicted, and LIGHT/TNFSF14 had a negative association with baseline FEV₁% predicted. TNF α had a positive association with FeNO. Neither IgE nor number of positive skin tests showed associations with any mediator.

Western Blots of Sputum Cell Lysates Probed for Mediator Presence

Sputum cell lysates were analyzed by western blots for BDNF and IL-1 β . Mean densities for both BDNF and IL-1 β in lysates from subjects with combined elevated Eos+Neu were higher than in those with elevated Eos, elevated Neu or neither granulocyte elevated, but did not reach significance (Figure E2 of online repository).

DISCUSSION

Sputum represents the best available, non-invasive assessment of bronchial inflammation in asthma and reflects underlying pathology caused by infiltrating cells and soluble mediators. Instead of comparing sputum cellular and biochemical components between normals and asthmatic subjects, our objective was to assess whether comprehensive analysis of induced sputum over a spectrum of asthma severity improves our understanding of the factors that characterize different asthma phenotypes. At present definitions of asthma severity are based primarily on the recommendations of asthma guidelines and on consensus statements. Unfortunately, these definitions may not rely on evidence based science for classification of asthma severity. Currently, the NHLBI SARP network is investigating new approaches to classify asthma severity, including new imaging techniques, unbiased cluster methods²³ similar to these reported by Haldar et al²⁴ and the assessment based on sputum granulocytes described here. Our hypothesis that sputum inflammatory granulocytes identify phenotypic subgroups of differing pathology and clinical characteristics was examined in a unique, well-characterized SARP population including patients with and without corticosteroid treatment.

Other investigators have observed that asthma, including severe asthma, contains subgroups categorized by sputum granulocytes, eosinophilic or neutrophilic, or "non-eosinophilic"^{25, 26}, and further subdivided in a 4-way stratification based on both eosinophils and neutrophils¹⁰. However, this latter report observed only age differences for a small number of subjects having mixed granulocytes. In contrast, our larger groups stratified by granulocyte %s showed significant differences in lung function, asthma control, healthcare utilization and symptoms. Although most of the soluble mediators examined did not differ between the elevated Eos + elevated Neu group compared to the elevated Neu group, Eotaxin 2 and clinical characteristics, support a distinction between these 2 groups. Phenotypic characteristics associated with the 4 asthma groups revealed that combined increased sputum eosinophils and

neutrophils defined the most severe patients with lowest lung function measures, worse asthma control, greatest symptoms and use of healthcare resources.

Inflammatory mediators in sputum have been reported for specific mediators, predicted by increases in specific cell types such as ECP for eosinophils or IL-8 for neutrophils^{12, 26, 27}. Additional mediators reported in sputum for asthma include vascular endothelial growth factor, basic fibroblast growth factor, elastase, GM-CSF, IFN- γ , IL-4, IL-5, IL-13, endostatin, MIP3 α /CCL20, metalloproteinase 9, tissue-inhibitor metalloproteinase 1, PARC, RANTES and α 1-antitrypsin^{12, 28–33}. However, most increased inflammatory proteins are reported for subjects with asthma compared to normals, instead of within asthma severity subgroups where proteins may reflect important mechanisms determining disease severity.

We used a more comprehensive approach with a focused 120 inflammatory protein microarray to identify mediators in sputum supernatants from severe and nonsevere asthmatics. A recent report²⁸ used a similar protein microarray approach, but examined fewer proteins and only compared nine asthmatics to atopic and normal controls. PARC, GRO- α and Eotaxin-2 were elevated in sputum from subjects with asthma, but subgroups of asthma were not investigated²⁸.

A 4-group stratification of our microarray data by sputum %eosinophils and %neutrophils identified significant increases in nineteen inflammatory mediators in sputa with $\geq 40\%$ Neu. ELISA data confirmed the significant increases in sputa with $\geq 40\%$ Neu, either with $< 2\%$ Eos or with $\geq 2\%$ Eos, for BDNF, IL-1 β , and MIP-3 α /CCL20. Eotaxin 2 increases in ELISA data were observed with increased Eos, but did not reach significance. Nevertheless, higher levels of Eotaxin 2 were observed for sputum having combined increased Eos and increased Neu. Regression analyses showed significant positive associations of mediators with Neu counts, and less robust positive or negative associations with Eos counts.

The positive association of neutrophils with BDNF, IL-1 β and MIP3 α raises the question whether neutrophils produce or are elicited by the actions of these proteins. Immunohistology in mouse models and isolated human peripheral monocytes identified cellular sources for BDNF as bronchial epithelium, activated T cells, and macrophages^{34–35}. Likewise, IL-1 β is synthesized by multiple cells, including macrophages, epithelial cells and neutrophils^{36–38}. Both BDNF and IL-1 β levels in our sputum cell lysates were higher for combined increased Eos+Neu but not significantly, suggesting contribution from other cells. Cell sources for MIP3 α include airway epithelium, monocytes, eosinophils and neutrophils; release is either constitutive or in response to LPS, particulates, allergens, or TNF α , IL1 β , IL-4, or IL-13^{33, 39–40}. Thus, any one or a combination of sputum cell types may contribute to the levels of MIP3 α observed, including neutrophils.

The results demonstrate that mediators previously less well recognized for involvement in asthmatic inflammation may be identified by this approach. BDNF, BLC/CXCL13 and EGF were found to be significantly increased by microarray analysis of sputum from subjects with severe compared to nonsevere asthma groups. ELISA results on the larger panel of sputum supernatants showed that higher levels of these mediators occurred in the severe group, but did not reach significance (online repository).

BDNF has been implicated in bronchial hyperresponsiveness and inflammation⁴¹ but not specifically connected to asthma severity. Allergic asthmatics have higher levels of BDNF, promoting eosinophil survival, in bronchoalveolar lavage fluid after segmental allergen challenge^{35, 42}. Both epithelial cells and monocytes release BDNF in response to TNF α , IL1 β , and IL-6^{35, 43–44}.

BLC/CXCL13 has not previously been associated with asthma severity. CXCL13 upregulation in STAT6 deficient mice after repeated allergen challenge is associated with neutrophilic inflammation⁴⁵. Similarly, we observed positive association of CXCL13 with neutrophils. Monocytes and mature macrophages treated with lipopolysaccharide secrete CXCL13⁴⁶. IL-6 signaling results in accumulation of B cell follicles in the lung expressing CXCL13⁴⁷. IL-6 was increased in microarrays for sputa with elevated Neu.

EGF stimulates IL-8 release and enhances TNF α -induced IL8 release from epithelium, and is thereby linked to neutrophilic inflammation in severe asthma^{48–49}. There is evidence of increased EGF receptor in bronchial biopsies from severe compared to mild asthma⁴⁸, but EGF either is similar⁵⁰ or increased⁵¹, in 2 studies examining small numbers of asthmatics compared to nonasthmatic controls. Our study confirms association of EGF with neutrophils and higher amounts in subjects with severe asthma, although not significantly.

Paired microarray comparisons of dialyzed to autologous undialyzed samples, and of protease inhibitor-treated supernatants to autologous untreated supernatants indicated minimal consistent alteration of sputum proteins due either to dithiothreitol use or proteolysis detected by microarrays. Moreover, known amounts of standards for each ELISA generally displayed full recovery when assessed in normal sputum supernatants or buffer solution containing dithiothreitol (online repository).

The processing method employing whole sputum potentially contributes variable amounts of saliva but is counteracted by a two step collection⁵². In fact, %squamous cells did not differ for any stratification. Observed significant association of mediators in the supernatant with actual cell counts further supports that variable amounts of saliva had little dilutional effect on mediators.

Woodruff et al.²¹ reported that age, sex, ethnicity and use of inhaled corticosteroids were important confounders of cellular inflammation in asthma. This contrasts with the report of Thomas et al.²², which demonstrated age significantly affected %neutrophils but sex did not, in a normal population. We confirm a positive association between age and %Neu in asthmatics. Inclusion of age into our models examining mediator association with specific sputum cell types showed associations of age with LIGHT/TNFSF14 and PARC/CCL18 (neither significant) but otherwise had little effect on Neu association with mediators. Subject stratification by sputum granulocytes did not show a difference in age of asthma onset; although subjects with greater %neutrophils were older and therefore, possibly had longer duration of asthma.

We did not find any significant effect for race or for corticosteroid use on sputum cell counts or on mediator levels. The Caucasian and African American proportions in our population (53–77% and 23–45%, respectively) are slightly different than those reported by Woodruff²¹ (68% Caucasian, and 12% African American), however, lack of an effect for race/ethnicity in our data cannot be attributed to insufficient numbers of minority subjects.

Certain mediators identified, IL-1 β , IL-8 and TNF α , are usually associated with innate immunity and a T_H1 response, rather than the T_H2 mediators, IL-4, IL-5, and IL-13, typical of allergic asthma. This finding is consistent with the heterogeneity of clinical asthma that may be influenced by different pathologic mechanisms. However, we did observe increased MIP3 α /CCL20, recently reported as a critical link between TRAIL and the activation of T_H2 cells in allergic airway disease³³. TNF α , which we found increased in microarrays, induces increased MIP3 α /CCL20 secretion from primary bronchial epithelium³³, indicating overlap of T_H1 and T_H2 inflammatory pathways. It is interesting that Kikuchi et al.⁵³ reported both IL-8 and neutrophils were necessary to promote greatest trans-basement membrane migration of

eosinophils. The group of subjects, with both elevated sputum Eos and Neu, had equally high, if not the highest levels of mediators, supporting this observation.

In conclusion, stratification of asthmatics by sputum %Eos and %Neu demonstrated that combined increased granulocytes identify those asthmatics with lowest lung function, increased frequency of symptoms and healthcare utilization. Protein microarray screening of sputa identified novel proteins that have been less well recognized for participation in asthma, and suggested a T_H1 component to inflammation in more severe asthma. The levels of these mediators were generally higher in subjects with severe asthma, but showed stronger association with neutrophils than with eosinophils. These approaches delineating cellular and biochemical proteomics provides better understanding of the pathogenesis of asthma subphenotypes and may lead to development of biomarkers differentiating heterogeneity in asthma.

Key Messages

- Four-way stratification of subjects, based on high or low %eosinophils and high or low %neutrophils in sputum, identified an association of subjects characterized by both high %eosinophils and high %neutrophils with the lowest lung function, worse asthma control, and increased use of healthcare resources.
- Protein microarray data revealed novel proteins increased in sputum with both increased neutrophils and eosinophils, suggesting the importance of combined granulocyte effects on asthma severity.

Acknowledgments

The authors acknowledge the essential contributions of Jeffrey Krings, RN, and Regina Smith, clinical coordinators, Xingnan Li, statistician, and Min Wu, laboratory technician, in the recruitment, characterization and analyses of all subjects enrolled in this study.

Support for this study: funded by the NHLBI Severe Asthma Research Program Awards: HL69167, and Wake Forest University General Clinical Research Center, MO1 RR07122

Abbreviations

BDNF	brain derived neurotrophic factor
BLC	B-lymphocyte chemoattractant/CXCL13
BMP	bone morphogenic protein
EGF	epidermal growth factor
Eos	eosinophils
ICS	inhaled corticosteroids
IL	interleukin
MIP3 α	macrophage inflammatory protein 3 α /CCL20
Neu	neutrophils
PARC	pulmonary and regulated chemokine/CCL18
SARP	Severe Asthma Research Program (of NHLBI)
TNFSF14	Tumor necrosis factor superfamily factor 14/LIGHT

References

1. Louis R, Lau LCK, Bron AO, Roldaan AC, Radermecker M, Djukanovic R. The relationship between airways inflammation and asthma severity. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2000;161:9–16. [PubMed: 10619791]
2. The ENFUMOSA Study Group. The ENFUMOSA cross-sectional European multicentre study of the clinical phenotype of chronic severe asthma. *Eur Respir J* 2003;22:470–477. [PubMed: 14516137]
3. Bartoli ML, Bacci E, Carnevali S, Cianchetti S, Dente FL, DiFranco A, et al. Clinical assessment of asthma severity partially corresponds to sputum eosinophilic airway inflammation. *Respir Med* 2004;98:184–193. [PubMed: 14971884]
4. Lemiere C, Ernst P, Olivenstein R, Yamauchi Y, Govindaraju K, Ludwig MS, et al. Airway inflammation assessed by invasive and noninvasive means in severe asthma: eosinophilic and noneosinophilic phenotypes. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2006;118:1033–1039. [PubMed: 17088126]
5. Green RH, Brightling CE, Woltmann G, Parker D, Wardlaw AJ, Pavord ID. Analysis of induced sputum in adults with asthma: identification of subgroup with isolated sputum neutrophilia and poor response to inhaled corticosteroids. *Thorax* 2002;57:875–879. [PubMed: 12324674]
6. Jatakanon A, Uasuf C, Maziak W, Lim S, Chung KF, Barnes PJ. Neutrophilic inflammation in severe persistent asthma. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1999;160:1532–1539. [PubMed: 10556116]
7. ten Brinke A, Zwinderman AH, Sterk PJ, Rabe KF, Bel EH. “Refractory” eosinophilic airway inflammation in severe asthma. Effect of parenteral corticosteroids. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2004;170:601–605. [PubMed: 15215154]
8. Berry M, Morgan A, Shaw DE, Parker D, Green R, Brightling C, et al. Pathological features and inhaled corticosteroid response of eosinophilic and non-eosinophilic asthma. *Thorax* 2007;62:1043–1049. [PubMed: 17356056]
9. Simpson JL, Grissell TV, Douwes J, Scott RJ, Boyle MJ, Gibson PG. Innate immune activation in neutrophilic asthma and bronchiectasis. *Thorax* 2007;62:211–218. [PubMed: 16844729]
10. Simpson JL, Scott R, Boyle MJ, Gibson PG. Inflammatory subtypes in asthma: assessment and identification using induced sputum. *Respirology* 2006;11:54–61. [PubMed: 16423202]
11. Daldegan MB, Teixeira MM, Talvani A. Concentration of CCL11, CXCL8, and TNF- α in sputum and plasma of patients undergoing asthma or chronic obstructive pulmonary disease exacerbation. *Braz J Med Bio Res* 2005;38:1359–1365. [PubMed: 16138219]
12. Dente FL, Carnevali S, Bartoli ML, Cianchetti S, Bacci E, Di Franco A, et al. Profiles of proinflammatory cytokines in sputum from different groups of severe asthmatic patients. *Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol* 2006;97:312–320. [PubMed: 17042136]
13. Pizzichini E, Pizzichini MMM, Efthimiadis A, Evans S, Morris MM, Squillace D, et al. Indices of airway inflammation in induced sputum: reproducibility and validity of cell and fluid-phase measurements. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1996;154:308–317. [PubMed: 8756799]
14. Simpson JL, Scott RJ, Boyle MJ, Gibson PG. Differential proteolytic enzyme activity in eosinophilic and neutrophilic asthma. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2005;172:559–565. [PubMed: 15901607]
15. Moore WC, Bleecker ER, Curran-Everett D, Erzurum SC, Ameredes BT, Bacharier L, et al. Characterization of the Severe Asthma Phenotype by the NHLBI Severe Asthma Research Program. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2007;119:405–413. [PubMed: 17291857]
16. Proceedings of the ATS Workshop on Refractory Asthma. Current Understanding, Recommendations, and Unanswered Questions. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2000;162:2341–51. [PubMed: 11112161]
17. Fahy JV, Boushey HA, Lazarus SC, Mauger EA, Cherniack RM, Chinchilli VM, et al. Safety and reproducibility of sputum induction in asthmatic subjects in a multicenter study. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2001;163:1470–1475. [PubMed: 11371420]
18. Tusher V, Tibshirani R, Chu C. Significance analysis of microarrays applied to ionizing radiation response. *Proc Nat Acad Sci* 2001;98:5116–5121. [PubMed: 11309499]
19. Berry MA, Shaw DE, Green RH, Brightling CE, Wardlaw AJ, Pavord ID. The use of exhaled nitric oxide concentration to identify eosinophilic airway inflammation: an observational study in adults with asthma. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2005;35:1175–1179. [PubMed: 16164444]

20. Fahy JV, Boushey HA. Effect of low-dose beclomethasone dipropionate on asthma control and airway inflammation. *Eur Respir J* 1998;11:1240–1247. [PubMed: 9657561]
21. Woodruff PG, Khashayar R, Lazarus SC, Janson S, Avila P, Boushey HA, et al. Relationship between airway inflammation, hyperresponsiveness, and obstruction in asthma. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2001;108:753–758. [PubMed: 11692100]
22. Thomas RA, Green RH, Brightling CE, Birring SS, Parker D, Wardlaw AJ, et al. The influence of age on induced sputum differential cell counts in normal subjects. *Chest* 2004;126:1811–1814. [PubMed: 15596678]
23. Moore WC, Meyers DA, Wenzel SE, Teague WG, Li H, Li X, et al. Identification of asthma phenotypes using cluster analysis in the severe asthma research program. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2010;181:315–323. [PubMed: 19892860]
24. Haldar P, Pavord ID, Shaw DE, Berry MA, Thomas M, Brightling CE, et al. Cluster analysis and clinical asthma phenotypes. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2008;178:218–224. [PubMed: 18480428]
25. Haldar P, Pavord ID. Noneosinophilic asthma: A distinct clinical and pathologic phenotype. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2007;119:1043–1052. [PubMed: 17472810]
26. Gibson PG, Simpson JL, Saltos N. Heterogeneity of airway inflammation in persistent asthma: Evidence of neutrophilic inflammation and increased sputum interleukin-8. *Chest* 2001;119:1329–1336. [PubMed: 11348936]
27. Simpson JL, Timmins NL, Fakes K, Talbot PI, Gibson PG. Effect of saliva contamination on induced sputum cell counts, IL-8 and eosinophil cationic protein levels. *Eur Respir J* 2004;23:759–762. [PubMed: 15176693]
28. Kim H-B, Kim C-K, Iijima K, Kobayashi T, Kita H. Protein microarray analysis in patients with asthma: elevation of the chemokine PARC/CCL18 in sputum. *Chest* 2009;135:295–302. [PubMed: 19017877]
29. Kanazawa H, Yoshikawa J. Effect of beclomethasone dipropionate on basic fibroblast growth factor levels in induced sputum samples from asthmatic patients. *Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol* 2005;95:546–550. [PubMed: 16400894]
30. Asai K, Kanazawa H, Otani K, Shiraishi S, Hirata K, Yoshikawa J. Imbalance between vascular endothelial growth factor and endostatin levels in induced sputum from asthmatic subjects. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2002;110:571–575. [PubMed: 12373263]
31. Vignola AM, Riccobono L, Mirabella A, Profita M, Chanez P, Bellia V, et al. Sputum metalloproteinase-9/tissue inhibitor of metalloproteinase-1 ratio correlates with airflow obstruction in asthma and chronic bronchitis. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1998;158:1945–1950. [PubMed: 9847290]
32. Park S-W, Jangm HK, An MH, Min JW, Jang A-S, Lee J-H, et al. Interleukin-13 and interleukin-5 in induced sputum of eosinophilic bronchitis. Comparison with asthma *Chest* 2005;128:1921–1927.
33. Weckmann M, Collison A, Simpson JL, Kopp MV, Wark PAB, Smyth MJ, et al. Critical link between TRAIL and CCL20 for the activation of T_H2 cells and the expression of allergic airway disease. *Nature Med* 2007;13:1308–1315. [PubMed: 17934471]
34. Braun A, Lommatzsch M, Mannsfeldt A, Neuhaus-Steinmetz U, Fischer A, Schnoy N, et al. Cellular sources of enhanced brain-derived neurotrophic factor production in a mouse model of allergic inflammation. *Am J Respir Cell Mol Biol* 1999;21:537–546. [PubMed: 10502564]
35. Hahn C, Islamian AP, Renz H, Nockher WA. Airway epithelial cells produce neurotrophins and promote the survival of eosinophils during allergic airway inflammation. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2006;117:787–794. [PubMed: 16630935]
36. Arend WP, Palmer G, Gabay C. IL-1, IL-18, and IL-33 families of cytokines. *Immunol Rev* 2008;223:20–38. [PubMed: 18613828]
37. Hastie AT, Everts KB, Cho S-K, Zangrilli J, Shaver JR, Pollice MB, et al. IL-1b release from cultured bronchial epithelial cells and bronchoalveolar lavage cells from allergic and normal humans following segmental challenge with ragweed. *Cytokine* 1996;8:730–738. [PubMed: 8932985]
38. Sabnis AS, Reilly CA, Veranth JM, Yost GS. Increased transcription of cytokine genes in human lung epithelial cells through activation of a TRPM8 variant by cold temperatures. *Am J Physiol Lung Cell Mol Physiol* 2008;295:L194–L200. [PubMed: 18441098]

39. Reibman J, Hsu Y, Chen LC, Bleck B, Gordon T. Airway epithelial cells release MIP3 α /CCL20 in response to cytokines and ambient particulate matter. *Am J Respir Cell Mol Biol* 2003;28:648–654. [PubMed: 12760962]
40. Pichavant M, Charbonnier A-S, Taront S, Brichet A, Wallaert B, Pestel J, et al. Asthmatic bronchial epithelium activated by the proteolytic allergen Der p 1 increases selective dendritic cell recruitment. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2005;115:771–8. [PubMed: 15805997]
41. Nockher WA, Renz H. Neurotrophins and asthma: novel insight into neuroimmune interaction. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2006;117:67–71. [PubMed: 16387586]
42. Virchow JC, Julius P, Lommatzsch M, Luttmann W, Renz H, Braun A. Neurotrophins are increased in bronchoalveolar lavage fluid after segmental allergen provocation. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1998;158:2002–2005. [PubMed: 9847299]
43. Fox AJ, Patel HJ, Barnes PJ, Belvisi MG. Release of nerve growth factor by human pulmonary epithelial cells: role in airway inflammatory diseases. *Eur J Pharmacol* 2001;424:159–162. [PubMed: 11476762]
44. Schulte-Herbruggen O, Nassenstein C, Lommatzsch M, Quarcoo D, Renz H, Braun A. Tumor necrosis factor- α and interleukin-6 regulate secretion of brain-derived neurotrophic factor in human monocytes. *J Neuroimmunol* 2005;160:204–209. [PubMed: 15710474]
45. Fulkerson PC, Zimmermann N, Hassman LM, Finkelman FD, Rothenberg ME. Pulmonary chemokine expression is coordinately regulated by STAT1, STAT6, and IFN- γ . *J Immunol* 2004;173:7565–7574. [PubMed: 15585884]
46. Carlsen HS, Bækkevoold ES, Morton HC, Haraldsen G, Brandtzaeg P. Monocyte-like and mature macrophages produce CXCL13 (B cell-attracting chemokine 1) in inflammatory lesions with lymphoid neogenesis. *Blood* 2004;104:3021–3027. [PubMed: 15284119]
47. Goya S, Matsuoka H, Mori M, Morishita H, Kida H, Kobashi Y, et al. Sustained interleukin-6 signalling leads to the development of lymphoid organ-like structures in the lung. *J Pathol* 2003;200:82–87. [PubMed: 12692845]
48. Hamilton LM, Torres-Lozano C, Puddicombe SM, Richter A, Kimber I, Dearman RJ, et al. The role of the epidermal growth factor receptor in sustaining neutrophil inflammation in severe asthma. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2003;33:233–240. [PubMed: 12580917]
49. Subauste MC, Proud D. Effects of tumor necrosis factor- α , epidermal growth factor and transforming growth factor- α on interleukin-8 production by, and human rhinovirus replication in, bronchial epithelial cells. *Internat Immunopharmacol* 2001;1:1229–1234.
50. Polosa R, Puddicombe SM, Krishna MT, Tuck AB, Howarth PH, Holgate ST, et al. Expression of c-erbB receptors and ligands in the bronchial epithelium of asthmatic subjects. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2002;109:75–81. [PubMed: 11799369]
51. Amishima M, Munakata M, Nasuhara Y, Sato A, Kakahashi T, Homma Y, et al. Expression of epidermal growth factor and epidermal growth factor receptor immunoreactivity in the asthmatic human airway. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1998;157:1907–1912. [PubMed: 9620926]
52. Gershman NH, Wong HH, Liu JT, Mahlmeister MJ, Fahy JV. Comparison of two methods of collecting induced sputum in asthmatic subjects. *Eur Respir J* 1996;9:2448–2453. [PubMed: 8980952]
53. Kikuchi I, Kikuchi S, Kobayashi T, Hagiwara K, Sakamoto Y, Kanazawa M, et al. Eosinophil trans-basement membrane migration induced by interleukin-8 and neutrophils. *Am J Respir Cell Mol Biol* 2006;34:760–765. [PubMed: 16456187]

Demographics of Subjects Stratified by Sputum %Eos+%Neu. Results from ANOVA are presented as mean±SEM; results from Kruskal-Wallis analysis of variance are presented as median (25%–75%), p values meeting Bonferroni correction are in bold font:

Table 1

Categories:	<2%Eos <40%Neu	<2%Eos ≥40%Neu	≥2%Eos <40%Neu	≥2%Eos ≥40%Neu	P value
N=175	63 (36%)	50 (29%)	42 (24%)	20 (11%)	
Gender					
%Female	81%	76%	74%	60%	0.30
Age (yr)					
33±1.6	42±1.9	34±1.8	40±2.1	< 0.001	
Age Onset					
10 (4-24)	13 (5-26)	13.5 (2-23)	7.5 (3-30)	0.92	
Duration					
17±1.6	25±2.1	19±1.9	23±2.5	0.014	
Lung Function:					
Baseline FEV ₁ % Predict.	86.5±2.0	80.4±2.3	76.6±2.8	66.6±4	< 0.001
Baseline FVC % Predict.	93.8±1.8	87.0±2.0	90.5±2.7	81.7±3.7	0.01
FEV ₁ /FVC	0.77±0.01	0.75±0.01	0.70±0.02	0.66±0.03	< 0.001
Max FEV ₁ % Predict.	95.4±1.8	88.8±1.9	90.3±2.6	80.8±4.2	0.003
%Rev 2puff β agonist	9.89±10	7.98±5.8	14.5±12.3	15.8±15.5	0.005
Change FEV ₁ %pred (max-baseline)	9.1±6.5	8.3±6.4	13.7±10.3	14.7±10.1	0.002
LogPC ₂₀ *	0.47±0.1 N=55	0.41±0.1 N=46	-0.013±0.1 N=34	0.23±0.3 N=14	0.006
FeNO	22.9±1.1	20.0±1.1	49.0±1.1	30.9±1.2	< 0.001
Freq + skin test	83%	78%	86%	89%	0.66
No. + skin tests	4 (2-6.8)	3 (1-5.3)	4 (2-7.3)	4 (2-7)	0.59
Serum eos	0.20 (0.1-3.3)	0.20 (0.1-2.5)	0.30 (0.2-2.5)	0.30 (0.2-2.1)	0.001
IgE	126±1.2	78±1.3	191±1.3	100±1.3	0.06
Asthma Control & Healthcare Utilization[†]:					
daily use β-agonist	24%	28%	60%	55%	< 0.001
Ever ER visits	57%	70%	69%	80%	0.21
>1 urgent HC visit in past year	22%	40%	19%	70%	< 0.001
Symptoms worse if reduce CS	49%	39%	38%	70%	0.07
>3 oral CS bursts/yr	17%	12%	9%	30%	0.17
Ever spent night in Hospital	25%	40%	38%	40%	0.07
Ever ICU admitted	6%	8%	21%	25%	0.009
Symptoms[‡]:					
>daily wheeze	13%	14%	26%	50%	0.002

* Not all subjects met safety criteria for methacholine challenge.

† % of category answering "yes"

Table II

Three Comparisons of Inflammatory Protein Microarray Data in Subjects (all treated with corticosteroids) Stratified by Sputum Eosinophils (Eos) and Neutrophils (Neu). Comparison 1 examines differences in mediators between elevated Eos+low Neu and elevated Neu+low Eos; comparison 2 examines differences between elevated Eos+low Neu and elevated Eos+elevated Neu; comparison 3 examines differences between low Neu and elevated Neu without considering Eos. Highlighted proteins were observed to meet criteria in all 3 comparisons.

Protein	1. $\geq 2\%$ Eos+ $< 40\%$ Neu (N=6) vs $< 2\%$ Eos+ $\geq 40\%$ Neu (N=7)		2. $\geq 2\%$ Eos+ $< 40\%$ Neu (N=6) vs $\geq 2\%$ Eos+ $\geq 40\%$ Neu (N=8)		3. $< 40\%$ Neu (N=9) vs $\geq 40\%$ Neu (N=15)	
	False positive rate=0-1%		False positive rate=0%		False positive rate=0-1%	
	Criteria Failure*	Increase for $\geq 40\%$ Neu Fold change	Criteria Failure*	Increase for $\geq 40\%$ Neu Fold change	Criteria Failure*	Increase for $\geq 40\%$ Neu Fold change
BDNF	a			3.3		2.2
BLC	a			3.2	a	
BMP-4		3.3		3.8		2.4
BMP-6		5.5		6.2		3.2
CK b8-1	a, b		b			2.2
EGF		2.9		3.4		2.0
Eotaxin-2		3.0		5.3		2.1
Eotaxin-3		3.6		3.6		2.7
FGF-7		2.2		2.5	b	
GCP-2		4.0		3.2		2.7
GDNF	a			2.5	a, b	
GM-CSF	a, b			3.8	b	
HGF	a		ns			3.1
I-309	a			2.3	b	
IFN- γ		2.6	a		a, b	
IGFBP-1		2.6		2.7		2.1
IGFBP-2		11.7		16.1		7.7
IGF-1		3.1		3.3	b	
IL-1 β		9.0		8.4		6.8
IL-2		4.1		2.9		2.1
IL-4		5.9		4.2		2.2
IL-6		3.1		3.5		3.2

Protein	1. $\geq 2\%$ Eos+ < 40% Neu (N=6) vs < 2% Eos+ $\geq 40\%$ Neu (N=7)		2. $\geq 2\%$ Eos+ < 40% Neu (N=6) vs $\geq 2\%$ Eos+ $\geq 40\%$ Neu (N=8)		3. < 40% Neu (N=9) vs $\geq 40\%$ Neu (N=15)	
	False positive rate=0-1%	Increase for $\geq 40\%$ Neu Fold change	False positive rate=0%	Increase for $\geq 40\%$ Neu Fold change	False positive rate=0-1%	Increase for $\geq 40\%$ Neu Fold change
	Criteria Failure*		Criteria Failure*		Criteria Failure*	
IL-10		2.7		3.8		2.1
IL-13		2.8	a		a	
IL-15		2.1		3.5		2.4
LIGHT		2.1		3.3		2.8
MCP-1	a			2.7		2.4
MCP-2		3.8		2.5	a	
MDC	a, b			3.0	b	
MIP-1 β		3.9		3.6		2.6
MIP-3 α		3.0		4.8		3.0
NT-3		2.4	a, b			2.3
SCF		2.4		2.6		2.1
SDF-1	a			3.3	a, b	
TARC	a		a, b			2.4
TIMP-2	ns		ns			2.1
TNF- α		4.8		5.5		2.8
TRAIL R3	ns		ns			2.5
uPAR	ns		ns			3.3

* ns = not significant (q>5%);

a scored <1;

b fold increase <2.

Table III

Sputum Supernatant Mediator Levels Stratified by Sputum %Eos and %Neu. P values meeting Bonferroni correction are in bold font.

	<2%Eos+ <40%Neu	<2%Eos+ ≥40%Neu	≥2%Eos+ <40%Neu	≥2%Eos+ ≥40%Neu	P value For 4 grps *
BDNF pg/ml	9.5 (6–14.5)	18.4 (11.2–29)	15.4 (8–26.5)	20 (14–39)	<0.001
BLC/CXCL13 pg/ml	110±29	223±48	94±20	142±49	0.005
BMP4 pg/ml	4.9±1.5	2.8±0.6	1.8±0.3	3.7±1.1	0.33
EGF pg/ml	159 (108–205)	190 (116–263)	171 (90–212)	199 (145–256)	0.13
Eotaxin 2/CCL24 pg/ml	0.88 (0.01–2.38)	1.13 (0.01–6.78)	2.39 (0.38–4.63)	8.90 (2.5–14.1)	0.022
IFNγ pg/ml	77 (37–149)	47 (2–128)	108 (49–175)	91 (23–125)	0.11
IL-1β pg/ml	104±14	224±56	76±12	228±65	<0.001
IL-8 ng/ml	1.5±0.1	2.1±0.2	1.6±0.2	1.9±0.2	0.017
IL-13 pg/ml	91±18	74±9.9	64±12	81±18	0.55
LIGHT/TNFSF14 pg/ml	36 (12–69)	92 (36–156)	33 (13–108)	58 (24–184)	0.021
MIP-3 α/CCL20 pg/ml	390±41	781±85	341±52	668±121	<0.001
PARC/CCL18 pg/ml	6.7 (0.4–19)	12.7 (4.7–59)	8.3 (1.7–22)	11 (4.6–40)	0.037
TNF α pg/ml	0.3 (0.01–1.24)	1.1 (0.01–2.6)	0.39 (0.01–1.9)	0.7 (0.01–8.1)	0.44

* ANOVA (mean±SEM) or Kruskal-Wallis (median [25–75% quantiles])

Table IV

Multiple Linear Regression Analyses for Mediators Significantly Associated with Specific Sputum Cells and Age. The overall R and p values for each mediator are reported with the coefficient and individual p values for specific cell types or age necessary to predict a linear model for the mediator. P values meeting Bonferroni correction are in bold font:

Cytokine or Growth Factor	R & P value	Br. Epith. Cell Count*	Mac/Mono Count*	Lym Count*	Neu Count*	Eos Count*	Age*
BDNF	0.51 <0.001	0.414 0.032			0.769 <0.001	0.238 0.064	
BLC/CXCL13	0.388 0.008				0.265 0.003	-0.131 0.065	
BMP4	0.393 0.122					-0.197 0.0167	
EGF	0.508 <0.001			32.6 0.014	26.1 0.02		
Eotaxin2	0.27 0.29					0.28 0.02	
IL-1β	0.486 <0.001	-0.12 0.06			0.174 0.016		
IL-8	0.585 <0.001		0.569 0.033		0.382 <0.005		
IL-13	0.171 0.86						
IFNγ	0.324 0.136	19.21 0.08					
LIGHT/TNFSF14	0.651 <0.001		3.76 0.014		2.22 0.007		0.097 0.018
MIP3α/CCL20	0.621 <0.001				5.59 <0.001	-2.24 0.014	
PARC/CCL18	0.553 <0.001				0.338 0.006	0.184 0.025	0.016 0.026
TNF α	0.567 <0.001		0.613 0.062	0.458 0.007			

* Values under Cell type are regression coefficient and p value for that specific cell. Blank indicates that the cell type or age were not found to be necessary for linear model of association with the cytokine.