

Open access – Research article

Genome size variation in diploid and tetraploid wild wheats

Hakan Özkan^{1*†}, Metin Tuna^{2*†}, Benjamin Kilian³, Naoki Mori⁴ and Shoji Ohta⁵

¹ Department of Field Crops, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Cukurova, 01330 Adana, Turkey
² Department of Field Crops, Faculty of Agriculture, Namık Kemal University, 59030 Tekirdag, Turkey
³ Leibniz Institut

06466 Gatersleben, Germany
⁴ Graduate School of Agricultural Science, Kobe University, 1 Rokkodai, Nada, Kobe 657-8501, Japan

⁵ Department of Bioscience, Fukui Prefectural University, 4-1-1, Kenjojima, Matsuoka, Yoshida, Fukui 910-1185, Japan

Received: 5 June 2010; Returned for revision: 15 July 2010; Accepted: 22 September 2010; Published: 30 September 2010

Citation details: Özkan H, Tuna M, Kilian B, Mori N, Ohta S. 2010. Genome size variation in diploid and tetraploid wild wheats. AoB PLANTS 2010: plq015, doi:10.1093/aobpla/plq015

Abstract

that the genome size of wild self-fertilizing Triticum species is generally stable, despite the presence of many potentially active retroelements. In natural habitats, it is very difficult to distinguish wild wheats from each other. However, all four species can be distinguished easily, quickly and unambiguously by using the FCM technique.

* Corresponding author's e-mail address: hozkan@cu.edu.tr

†These two authors have contributed equally to this work.

AoB PLANTS Vol. 2010, plq015, doi:10.1093/aobpla/plq015, available online at www.aobplants.oxfordjournals.org

& The Authors 2010. Published by Oxford University Press. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/2.5/uk/) which permits unrestricted noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Introduction

The term genome size refers to the DNA content of the unreplicated reduced nucleus, irrespective of the ploidy level of the taxon, and it is expressed as C value in picograms ([Swift, 1950\)](#page-10-0). Since it became possible to measure the DNA content of a single nucleus (1950s), various researchers have reported interspecific variation among different species [\(Swift, 1950](#page-10-0); Price et al[., 1981](#page-10-0); [Bennett and Leitch, 1995](#page-9-0), [2005\)](#page-9-0). The 1C nuclear DNA amount of plant species with the same ploidy level differs by several orders of magnitude, from 0.0648 pg/1C for Genlisea margaretae Hutch ([Greilhuber](#page-9-0) et al[., 2006](#page-9-0)) to 132.45 pg/1C for Trillium camschatcense Ker Gawler ([Zonneveld, 2010](#page-10-0)). More recently, it was found that differences in genome size among species are predominantly associated with differences in the amount of repetitive sequences. Particularly, retrotransposons play a dominant role in genome size differences, and most of the variation in genome size in plants can be ascribed to differential accumulation of retrotransposons [\(Bennetzen, 2000](#page-9-0), 2007; [Feuillet](#page-9-0) [and Keller, 2002\)](#page-9-0). The occurrence and extent of genome size variation below the species level are still controversial and not satisfactorily analysed yet. Intraspecific variation in plants has been reported for numerous species and was attributed to differences in chromosome number, chromosome size (polyploidy, aneuploidy, B chromosomes, sex chromosomes) and inherent undetected cryptic species [\(Greilhuber, 1998](#page-9-0); [Gregory, 2005](#page-9-0)). However, evidence for intraspecific genome size variation other than chromosome polymorphism and cryptic taxonomic variation is rare and still controversial. A high degree of genome constancy, which is in agreement with the initial notion of constancy in DNA content within individuals and species [\(Swift, 1950\)](#page-10-0), has been found in many species, including the base calibration standard for estimating C values, Allium cepa L. ([Bennett](#page-9-0) et al., 2000). On the other hand, in several earlier studies, intraspecific variation often based on densitometry or cytofluorometry techniques has been observed, but these results could not be confirmed by subsequent flow cytometry (FCM) analyses that used exactly the same plant material. Therefore, in most cases, intraspecific variation has been explained by taxonomic misclassification or technical artefacts such as suboptimal staining and insufficient standardization (reviewed by [Greilhuber, 1998,](#page-9-0) [2005\)](#page-9-0). However, it seems plausible that genome size may diverge in populations, even in the face of limited gene flow (Kron et al[., 2007\)](#page-10-0).

Wheat is one of the principal cereal crops in the world. There are two wild diploid Triticum species: T. boeoticum Boiss. (A^bA^b) and T. urartu Thum. ex Gandil. (A^uA^u). These species are separated by crossing barriers ([Johnson and](#page-10-0) [Dhaliwal, 1976\)](#page-10-0), and differ in their plant morphology ([Gan](#page-9-0)[dilian, 1972](#page-9-0); [Dorofeev](#page-9-0) et al., 1979) and biochemical and molecular marker loci [\(Johnson, 1975](#page-9-0); [Kilian](#page-10-0) et al., [2007](#page-10-0)a; [Konovalov](#page-10-0) et al., 2010). Triticum boeoticum has been considered to be the progenitor of cultivated diploid einkorn wheat, T. monococcum L. There are also two wild tetraploid Triticum species: Triticum dicoccoides (Körn. ex Aschers. & Graebn.) Schweinf. (BBA^uA^u) and T. araraticum Jakubz. (GGA^uA^u). Triticum dicoccoides is the primary wild-type form and has given rise to several tetraploid wheat taxa that are now cultivated. Similarly, T. araraticum is the wild-type progenitor of T. timopheevii Menabde et Ericzjan (GGA^uA^u). The A genome of T. dicoccoides and T. araraticum was contributed by the diploid wheat T. urartu (Dvorak et al[., 1993\)](#page-9-0). The diploid and tetraploid wild wheats are important germplasm sources for cultivated wheat improvement.

Interspecific variability in nuclear DNA content has been reported in Triticum L. and the related genus Aegilops L. Furuta et al[. \(1977\)](#page-9-0) measured the nuclear DNA content in 43 accessions of the genus Aegilops and confirmed that intra- and interspecific variation existed. Recently, [Eilam](#page-9-0) et al[. \(2007\)](#page-9-0) reported that within the diploid Aegilops species, the 1C DNA amount ranged from 4.84 pg in Ae. markgrafii (Greuter) Hammer ($=$ Ae. caudata L.) to 7.52 pg in Ae. sharonensis Eig. The nuclear DNA content of Ae. geniculata Roth ($=$ Ae. ovata L.) was measured at 9.23 pg ([Furuta, 1970\)](#page-9-0), and Ae. neglecta Req. ex Bertol. at 16.35 pg of 1C DNA [\(Maranon and Grubb, 1993](#page-10-0)). [Rees](#page-10-0) [and Walters \(1965\)](#page-10-0) and [Nishikawa and Furuta \(1978\)](#page-10-0) have indicated that the nuclear DNA content of T. timopheevii is less than that of T. turgidum L. 1C DNA amounts of 11.30 pg for T. timopheevii ([Rees and](#page-10-0) [Walters, 1965\)](#page-10-0), 10.05 pg for T. araraticum (Hülgenhof et al.[, 1988](#page-9-0)) and 12.28 pg for T. durum Desf. [\(Bennett and](#page-9-0) [Smith, 1976\)](#page-9-0) have been reported. Recently, [Eilam](#page-9-0) et al. [\(2008\)](#page-9-0) studied T. araraticum, T. timopheevii, T. dicoccoides and T. durum, and the nuclear DNA content was found to be 11.82, 11.87, 12.84 and 12.91 pg, respectively.

In order to make wild wheat sampling more representative, we studied wild wheat populations from different geographical regions. The present study was carried out on 376 plants representing 41 well-characterized populations belonging to two diploid and two tetraploid wild wheat species collected recently in Southeast Turkey. The objectives of this study were (i) to determine the nuclear DNA content (1C) using FCM, (ii) to assess the magnitude of intraspecific variation and (iii) to study the correlation between the mean nuclear DNA content per population and their geographical origins and 19 bioclimate variables.

Materials and methods

Experimental material

The first step was to sample diploid and tetraploid wild wheats from Southeast Turkey. Collecting missions were carried out in 2004 and 2005. During the missions, 26 populations of T. boeoticum, 1 population of T. urartu, 10 populations of T. dicoccoides and 4 populations of T. araraticum were sampled. Later, all these populations were planted in a nethouse, morphologically re-identified and selfed in 2006. Altogether, 376 plants representing 41 populations belonging to 4 species were analysed in this study (Table [1](#page-3-0)). Collection sites are shown in [Additional](http://aobpla.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/content/full/plq015/DC1) [information, Fig. S1](http://aobpla.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/content/full/plq015/DC1).

Information on current climate data was obtained from the WorldClim database ([Hijmans](#page-9-0) et al., 2005; www.worldclim.org). Climate data included monthly mean variables of minimum and maximum temperature and precipitation. Based on these data, 19 so-called 'bioclimate' variables were calculated [\(Hijmans](#page-9-0) et al., [2005\)](#page-9-0) and were more useful than monthly values, since they were independent of latitudinal variation. The climate data are presented in [Additional infor](http://aobpla.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/content/full/plq015/DC1)[mation, Table S1.](http://aobpla.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/content/full/plq015/DC1)

Genome size determination by FCM

Nuclear DNA content analysis was carried out on 6–21 plants for each population. The procedures described by [Arumuganathan and Earle \(1991\)](#page-8-0) were used to determine the DNA content per nucleus. Briefly, the procedure consists of preparing suspensions of intact nuclei by chopping plant tissues and lysing protoplasts in an MgSO4 buffer mixed with DNA standards and staining with propidium iodide (PI) in a solution containing DNase-free RNase. Fluorescence intensities of the stained nuclei are measured by a flow cytometer CYTOMICS FC 500 (Beckman Coulter, Inc., Fullerton, CA, USA). The values for nuclear DNA content are estimated by comparing fluorescence intensities of the nuclei of the test population with those of an appropriate internal DNA standard that is included with the tissue being tested. We used barley (Hordeum vulgare L.) cultivar Sladoran as the internal standard. It is a diploid ($2x =$ 14) species that has a 1C complement of DNA of 5.325 pg per nucleus (Tuna et al[., 2001](#page-10-0)). Specifically, for the flow cytometer analysis, 50 mg of fresh leaf tissue were excised from 3- to 4-week-old healthy seedlings and placed on ice in a sterile plastic Petri dish. Twenty milligrams of fresh leaf tissue from barley were added to the Petri dish as standard. Tissue was chopped into 0.25–1 mm segments in 1 mL of solution A [24 mL of MgSO₄ buffer (ice cold); 25 mg of dithiothreitol; 500 μ L of PI stock (5.0 mg of PI in 1.0 mL of double-distilled

H₂O); 625 μ L of Triton X-100 stock (1.0 g of Triton X-100 in 10 mL of double-distilled H_2O). The solution and tissue were filtered through a 30 - μ m nylon mesh into a microcentrifuge tube and centrifuged at high speed (13 000 r.p.m.) for \sim 15–20 s. The supernatant was discarded; the pellet was resuspended in 400 μ L of solution B (7.5 mL of solution A; 17.5 µL of DNase-free RNase) and incubated for 20 min at 37 \degree C before flow cytometric analysis. Samples stained with PI were excited with a 15-mW argon ion laser at 488 nm. Red PI fluorescence area signals (FL2A) from nuclei were collected in the FL2 channel. Mean DNA content per sample was based on analysis of 1000 nuclei per sample. The nuclear DNA content was determined using the flow cytometer CYTOMICS FC 500 at the Central Laboratory of the Medical School of Trakya University. The analysis was repeated if the variation coefficient of the sample was $>$ 2.5.

Statistical analysis

Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was carried out to evaluate whether the differences within and among populations of diploid and tetraploid wild wheats were significant or not. In those cases in which ANOVA revealed significant differences, Student's test was performed. Correlations between mean nuclear DNA content and geographical information (altitude, latitude, longitude) as well as 19 bioclimate variables were estimated with Spearman rank correlations. All statistical analyses were carried out using JMP® 5.0 Statistical Discovery software (SAS Institute, Inc., Cary, NC, USA; http:www.jmp.com).

Results

The mean nuclear DNA content of natural populations belonging to four wild wheat species is presented in Table [2](#page-5-0). Based on ANOVA, significant differences between diploid and tetraploid Triticum species were found. Furthermore, significant variations among populations of T. boeoticum and T. dicoccoides, but not T. araraticum, were found (Table [2](#page-5-0)). However, variation among individuals of the same population was not statistically significant (data not shown).

Mean nuclear DNA content per population ranged from 6.167 to 6.310 pg/1C for T. boeoticum, from 12.603 to 12.917 pg/1C for T. dicoccoides and from 11.613 to 11.729 pg/1C for T. araraticum. For the one population of T. urartu studied, we detected a mean nuclear DNA content of 5.784 pg. The highest genome size value for T. boeoticum was observed for the Türkoğlu population (BOE-53, 6.310 pg), followed by BOE-6, BOE-33 and BOE-16; the smallest value was noted for the Narlı population (BOE-56, 6.167 pg). In T. dicoccoides, the largest genome size was found for DIC-17 (12.917 pg), a

Population name	Collection no.	Locality	Altitude (m)	Latitude (°N)	Longitude (°E)
T. boeoticum (A ^b A ^b)					
BOE-1	2004-6-21-3	12 km SSW from Camardi to Pozanti	1200	37°43′49″	35°01′03″
BOE-3	2004-6-29-2	20 km SW from Diyarbakır to Ovadağ	760	$37^{\circ}49'36''$	40°14′51″
BOE-6	2004-6-29-8	18.5 NW from Ovadağto Pirinçlik	920	37°49′17″	39°59′34″
BOE-9	2004-6-29-11	2.9 km NE from Karabahçe to Pirinçlik	1300	37°49′12″	39°46′29″
BOE-11	2004-6-29-13	41.2 km SW from Pirinçlik	1250	37°46′42″	39°44'50"
BOE-13	2004-6-30-2	4.6 km SW from Karabahçe	1180	37°46'19"	39°44′03″
BOE-15	2004-6-30-4	21.7 km SW from Karabahçe	1235	37°42'51"	37°44′03″
BOE-16	2004-6-30-5	28.1 km SW from Karabahçe	1170	37°39'49''	39°42′49″
BOE-17	2004-6-30-6	33.7 km SW from Karabahçe	1150	37°38′18″	37°42′37″
BOE-18	2004-6-30-7	37.9 km SW from Karabahçe	1180	37°36′27″	39°43′41″
BOE-19	2004-6-30-8	41.6 km SW from Karabahçe	1170	37°35′08″	39°44′36″
BOE-20	2004-6-30-9	48.7 km SW from Karabahçe	1030	37°33'09"	39°42′06″
BOE-22	2004-6-30-10	27.6 km SW from Karacadağ	950	37°37′40″	39°33′40″
BOE-24	$2004 - 7 - 1 - 1$	27.1 km SE from Diyarbakır to Bismil	650	$37^{\circ}47'58''$	40°25′35″
BOE-25	2004-7-1-2	42.2 km SE from Diyarbakır to Bismil	600	37°50′02″	40°33'51"
BOE-26	$2004 - 7 - 1 - 3$	9 km SE from Diyarbakır to Bismil	580	37°51′03″	40°45'15"
BOE-31	2004-7-3-4	44.5 km W from Adıyaman to Besni	710	37°42'21"	37°54′55″
BOE-32	2004-7-3-9	17.5 km SW from Araban to Gaziantep	900	$37^{\circ}21'57''$	37°32′30″
BOE-33	2004-7-3-11	17.5 km W from Gaziantep to Nurdağ	1010	37°10′14″	37°12′12″
BOE-38	2005-6-27-1	11 km NW from Beyşehir to Yalvaç	1150	37°46′27″	31°39'51"
BOE-46	2005-7-5-3	42 km E from Türkoğlu to Gaziantep	710	37°19'31″	37°09′28″
BOE-48	2005-7-5-7	57 km SE from Türkoğlu to Gaziantep	860	37°15'59"	37°14′00″
BOE-49	2005-7-5-8	60 km SE from Türkoğlu	840	37°17′33″	37°14′42″
BOE-51	2005-7-5-10	63 km SE from Türkoğlu	840	37°18′53″	37°15′41″
BOE-53	2005-7-5-11	72 km SE from Türkoğlu	800	37°19′46″	37°16′29″
BOE-56	2005-7-5-16	39 km ESE from Narlı	760	37°17′06″	37°17'39"
T. urartu (A^uA^u)					
URA-8	2004-6-29-10	20 km SW from Pirinçlik	1260	37°50′40″	39°47'58"
T. dicoccoides (AABB)					
DIC-3	2004-6-29-7-4	12.9 km NW from Ovadağ to Pirinçlik	1007	37°47′31″	39°57'18"
DIC-5	2004-6-29-9-4	20.1 km SW from Pirinçlik	1080	37°52′02″	39°51′05″
DIC-6	2004-6-29-10	20 km SW from Pirinçlik	1260	37°50′40″	39°47'58"
DIC-7	2004-6-29-11	2.9 km NE from Karabahçe to Pirinçlik	1300	37°49'12"	39°46'29"
DIC-17	2004-6-30-10	27.6 km SW from Karacadağ	950	37°37′40″	39°33′40″
DIC-19	2004-7-2-6	30.2 km SW from Çermik to Siverek	800	38°00'56"	39°22'11"
DIC-29	2005-7-5-11	72 km SE from Türkoğlu	800	37°19′46″	37°16′29″
DIC-30	2005-7-5-14	33 km ESE from Narlı	780	37°20'25"	37°17′54″
DIC-31	2005-7-5-15	34 km ESE from Narlı	780	37°20'12"	37°17′53″
DIC-33	2005-7-5-16	39 km ESE from Narlı	760	37°17′06″	37°17'39"
					Continued

Table 1 List of diploid and tetraploid wild wheat populations studied and their collection sites

population from Karacadağ/Diyarbakır, closely followed by populations from Ovadağ/Pirinclik/Diyarbakır (DIC-3, 12.890 pg) and Türkoğlu/Kahramanmaraş (DIC-29, 12.863 pg); the lowest genome size was discovered in population DIC-30 (12.603 pg), located in the Kartal-Kardağ region. In the case of T. araraticum, the maximum genome size was noted for one population from Gaziantep (ARA-22, 11.729 pg); however, genome size differences in T. araraticum populations were not significantly different from each other. Small genome size differences between the most extreme populations per species, BOE-53 vs. BOE-56 (0.143 pg, 2.31 %), DIC-17 vs. DIC-30 (0.314 pg, 2.49 %), and ARA-22 vs. ARA-21 (0.116 pg, 0.99 %), were detected. This indicates a narrow variation among populations.

In contrast to limited genome size variation at the intraspecific level, interspecific variation was large, with an average nuclear DNA amount ranging in diploid wild wheats from 5.784 pg/1C in T. urartu to 6.247 pg/1C in T. boeoticum. For wild tetraploid wheats, the average nuclear DNA amount ranged from 11.680 pg/1C in T. araraticum to 12.813 pg/1C in T. dicoccoides.

To determine the association between mean nuclear DNA content per population and their collection sitespecific geographical parameters, the non-parametric Spearman test was used. We found no significant correlation between nuclear DNA amount and all studied geographical/bioclimate data in T. boeoticum and T. dicoccoides (Table [3](#page-6-0)). However, for T. araraticum, the nuclear DNA content was positively or negatively correlated with all bioclimate data except altitude, annual mean temperature, maximum temperature of warmest month, mean temperature of coldest quarter, precipitation of wettest month, precipitation seasonality and precipitation of driest quarter (Table [3](#page-6-0)).

Discussion

The main goal of the present study was to assess the extent of intra- and interspecific genome size variation in diploid and tetraploid wild wheat populations sampled recently in Turkey, and to determine whether the mean genome size per population is correlated with geographical and bioclimate variables. To determine the nuclear DNA content, we used the FCM technique. Early studies showed that FCM can be employed successfully for determining ploidy level and genome size in Triticeae species (Tuna et al[., 2001](#page-10-0), [2005,](#page-10-0) 2006). For FCM, the choice of standard with a known DNA content is important to estimate the DNA content of unknown samples exactly. Therefore, we used barley (H. vulgare, cultivar Sladoran, 5.325 pg/1C) as an internal reference standard. Barley was selected as it has an appropriate DNA content for all wheat species analysed. Using this standard, we found that FCM is a reliable and highly sensitive method for detecting the differences in the small nuclear DNA amount in wild wheat species. Nuclear DNA contents (in pg/1C) found in this study were consist-ent with previously published values for wheat [\(Bennett](#page-9-0) [and Smith, 1976](#page-9-0); Özkan et al[., 2003](#page-10-0)). However, discrepancies were observed compared with previous work of [Rees](#page-10-0) [and Walters \(1965\)](#page-10-0), Furuta et al[. \(1986\)](#page-9-0) and [Eilam](#page-9-0) et al. [\(2007\).](#page-9-0) The genome size difference of \sim 5 % can probably be explained by the use of different instruments and techniques (Fuelgen vs. FCM) and different internal standards as reported by [Dolezel and Bartos \(2005\)](#page-9-0).

Interspecific variation

Triticum dicoccoides and T. araraticum are morphologically very similar and have partly overlapping distribution areas (Kilian et al[., 2009](#page-10-0)). Similarly, T. boeoticum and T. urartu are nearly indistinguishable in their natural habitats. It is not surprising that confusion sometimes arises during sampling, propagating and investigating germplasm collections. However, based on molecular markers and wheat genome-specific re-sequencing, all four wild wheat species can be recognized easily [\(Kilian](#page-10-0) et al[., 2007](#page-10-0)b; [Konovalov](#page-10-0) et al., 2010). Variance analyses showed that significant differences among diploid and tetraploid Triticum species can be detected. Similarly, Eilam et al[. \(2007\)](#page-9-0) observed significant differences in genome size at the interspecific level in diploid and tetraploid Triticum species. In our study at the diploid level

Table 2 Continued

^aPopulations with different letters are significantly different from each other according to Student's test at $P < 0.01$.

T. urartu has \sim 0.5 pg/1C (8 %) less nuclear DNA content when compared with T. boeoticum. These two species diverged \sim 3 million years ago (Huang et al[., 2002](#page-9-0); [Dvorak and Akhunow, 2005](#page-9-0); Chalupska et al., 2008), probably from a common ancestor. Differences in genome size are expected to be mainly due to copy number differences of retroelements that occurred since deviation from the common ancestor. Especially the Jeli retrotransposon family, which belongs to the Gypsy class, was found to be A-genome specific and participated due to different transpositional activities in wheat A genome speciation [\(Konovalov](#page-10-0) et al., 2010).

Our results for wild tetraploid wheats are similar to those of [Rees and Walters \(1965\)](#page-10-0), [Nishikawa and Furuka \(1978\)](#page-10-0) and Eilam et al[. \(2007\)](#page-9-0), who reported that the genome size of T. araraticum is smaller than that of T. dicoccoides. We found that T. araraticum has more than 1 pg/1C (9.7 %) less nuclear DNA content compared with T. dicoccoides. [Dvorak and Akhunov \(2005\)](#page-9-0) estimated the origin of T. dicoccoides to have occurred \sim 0.36 million years ago. The age of formation of T. araraticum is still unkown and cannot be concluded based on genome size. The balance of retroelement accumulation and removal may vary between species and over time, but is nevertheless maintained. Several studies have pointed out that T. dicoccoides is more diverse than T. araraticum;

Table 3 Spearman rank correlations between nuclear DNA content and altitude, latitude, longitude and 19 bioclimatic variables in diploid and tetraploid wild wheats

 \textdegree Relationships are significant at <0.01.

it has therefore been concluded that T. dicoccoides was formed earlier than T. araraticum. Restriction fragment length polymorphism results obtained from Mori [et al](#page-10-0)., [\(1995\)](#page-10-0) showed larger intraspecific variation (at the DNA level) for T. dicoccoides than for T. araraticum. Similar conclusions have been made based on cytogenetic data [\(Badaeva](#page-8-0) et al., 1990, [1995](#page-9-0)).

Our present study provides further evidence for considerable nuclear DNA content differences between T. dicoccoides and T. araraticum, and between T. urartu and T. boeoticum. Therefore, these four species can easily be distinguished from each other in early growth stage by comparing their DNA content by FCM.

Intraspecific variation

Intraspecific variation for nuclear DNA content has been reviewed by [Greilhuber \(2005\)](#page-9-0). [Muray \(2005\)](#page-10-0) and

[Greilhuber \(2005\)](#page-9-0) suggested that most of the previous results reported for different species could be artefacts, and intraspecific variation in genome size can be small and non-significant. Recently, limited genome size variation was also reported in populations of Sesleria albicans Kit. ex Schult. (Lysak et al[., 2000](#page-10-0)). For wheat and wheat wild relatives, Furuta et al[. \(1977\)](#page-9-0) measured the nuclear DNA content of 43 accessions belonging to section Sitopsis of Aegilops and confirmed that intra- and interspecific variation existed. Furuta et al[. \(1978\)](#page-9-0) also reported that there is no appreciable difference in nuclear DNA content among accessions of T. boeoticum, T. monococcum and T. urartu. Furuta et al[. \(1975\)](#page-9-0) reported a considerable intraspecific variation in nuclear DNA content among four varieties of Ae. tauschii Coss. In our comprehensive study of 376 individuals, we found low genome size variation at the intraspecific level for diploid and tetraploid

wild wheats. The largest genome contained \sim 2.32, 2.49 and 0.98 % more DNA than the smallest in T. boeoticum, T. dicoccoides and T. araraticum, respectively.

Besides the frequent wild stands of T. boeoticum sampled during our collection trips in 2004–2006, we found few populations of T. dicoccoides, four populations of T. araraticum and only one population of T. urartu. At the moment, we cannot correlate our genome size data with the wild einkorn races recently described by Kilian et al[. \(2007](#page-10-0)a); however, our data represent the genome size diversity/range for the whole T. boeoticum group. Population BOE-38, collected 11 km northwest of Beyşehir to Yalvaç, shows the largest standard deviation. Based on our recent studies, we expected the wild einkorn race gamma (the most diverse wild einkorn race) at this collection site (Kilian et al., $2007a$). More wild populations from the whole natural distribution range per species should be studied, and the recent distribution of wild einkorn races should be considered.

Similar evidence for small intraspecific genome size variation in the diploid Aegilops and Triticum species comes from Eilam et al[. \(2007\)](#page-9-0), using FCM. Our results are also in accord with the conclusions of [Greilhuber \(2005\)](#page-9-0) and [Muray \(2005\)](#page-10-0), who reported that plant species exhibit very little intraspecific variation in genome size. The limited genome size variation found here at the intraspecific level of diploid and tetraploid wheats could be related to self-pollination. For instance, Eilam et al[. \(2007\)](#page-9-0) reported that cross-pollinating Triticeae species such as Ae. speltoides Tausch, Ae. mutica Boiss. $(= Amblyopyrum)$ muticum (Boiss.) Eig) and Secale montanum Guss. resulted in higher variation in nuclear DNA content when compared with self-pollinating species. Predominantly self-pollinated Triticum populations show very stable genome sizes and harbour long-persisting haplotypes due to limited recombination events and well-controlled retroelement activities.

Correlation between genome size and collection site-specific parameters

[Bennett \(1987\)](#page-9-0) suggested that interspecific variation in DNA content has adaptive significance and is correlated with environment and geographical distribution. Ecogeographically correlated intraspecific genome size variability has been reported for several Poaceae species such as Poa annua L. ([Grime, 1983](#page-9-0)), Milium effusum L. ([Bennett and Bennett, 1992](#page-9-0)), Dactylis glomerata (Reeves et al[., 1998\)](#page-10-0), Dasypyrum villosum [\(Caceres](#page-9-0) et al[., 1998\)](#page-9-0) and Hordeum spontaneum [\(Vicient](#page-10-0) et al., [1999;](#page-10-0) [Kalendar](#page-10-0) et al., 2000). Zea mays L. cultivars in North America exhibited a decline in nuclear DNA content with increasing latitude [\(Rayburn](#page-10-0) et al., 1989). Similarly, a negative correlation between nuclear DNA

content and latitude was found in European populations of Festuca arundinacea Schreb ([Ceccarelli](#page-9-0) et al., 1992). Creber et al[. \(1994\)](#page-9-0) found a significant negative correlation between DNA C-value and altitude among eight natural populations of Dactylis glomerata. Furthermore, [Schmuths](#page-10-0) et al. (2004) reported a significant positive correlation between genome size and longitude, and a significant negative correlation between genome size and latitude in Arabidopsis thaliana. The environment in which an organism grows seems to influence the DNA content ([Johnston](#page-10-0) et al., 1996). It has been concluded that genome size variation is an adaptation to different environments. However, results were not straightforward and the relationship between intraspecific variation and environment is still not completely resolved. For instance, [Teoh and Rees \(1976\)](#page-10-0) and Creber et al[. \(1994\)](#page-9-0) did not find a consistent relationship between nuclear DNA content and latitude in Picea glauca (Moench) Voss and D. glomerata. Similar results were also reported for the relationship between altitude and nuclear DNA content for the same species. [Kankan](#page-10-0)paa et al[. \(1996\)](#page-10-0) reported that the pattern of genome size variation in H. spontaneum was not correlated with environmental factors. [Ceccarelli](#page-9-0) et al. (1992) did not find any correlation between genome size, latitude, longitude and altitude in Vicia faba L. In the current study, we detected a mean genome size difference of 0.013 pg/1C between the most southern (BOE-33) and the most northern wild einkorn populations (BOE-3) $(\sim$ 75 km), whereas the difference between the most western (BOE-38) and the most eastern (BOE-26) population (\sim 770 km) was 0.042 pg/1C. Therefore, no significant correlation was detected between genome size and latitude and longitude.

Populations collected from the same geographical region harboured the largest and smallest mean genome sizes. The largest genome size content was found for BOE-53 (6.310 pg/1C) from Türkoğlu (Kartal-Karadag region) and for BOE-6 (6.287 pg/1C) from Ovadag (Karacadag region). The smallest genome sizes were found in BOE-56 (6.167 pg/1C) from Narlı (Kartal-Karadag region) and in BOE-11 (6.183 pg/2C) from Pirinçlik (Karacadag region). Similar to the abovementioned examples, we did not find any significant correlation between three geographical (altitude, latitude and longitude) or 19 bioclimate variables and genome size for T. boeoticum and T. dicoccoides; T. araraticum was the exception. No conclusion can be made for T. urartu because only one population was investigated. The genome size of wild self-fertilizing Triticum species is generally stable, despite the presence of many poten-tially active retroelements [\(Charles](#page-9-0) et al., 2008). This suggests that retroelement activities in these species

are well controlled and/or balanced by removal via recombination ([Grover and Wendel, 2010;](#page-10-0) [Tenaillon](#page-10-0) et al[., 2010\)](#page-10-0). The correlation of T. araraticum genome size with some collection site-specific geographical parameters is interesting in this respect. To understand the intraspecific variation and resolve the influence of environment on genome size within plant species, more measurements of natural populations from the whole natural distribution area are required for all four wild wheat species studied here. Future studies also have to take into account the subdivision of wild Triticum species into wild races (Özkan et al[., 2005;](#page-10-0) [Kilian](#page-10-0) et al., [2007](#page-10-0)a; Luo et al[., 2007\)](#page-10-0).

In conclusion, low but statistically significant intraspecific genome size variation was found in diploid T. boeoticum and tetraploid T. dicoccoides wild wheats, and this limited variation was not correlated with geographical and climate variables. In contrast to limited genome size variation at the intraspecific level, interspecific variation was large: \sim 0.5 pg/1C (8 %) at the diploid level (T. boeoticum vs. T. urartu) and \sim 1 pg/1C (9.7 %) at the tetraploid level (T. dicoccoides vs. T. araraticum). In natural habitats, it is very difficult to distinguish these wild wheats from each other, especially in the early stages of development due to similar morphology. However, all four species can be distinguished easily, quickly and unambiguously by using the FCM technique. This can be useful for identifying wild wheat species in laboratories. FCM estimates the nuclear DNA amount per plant on the basis of thousands of nuclei and yields a narrow distribution of DNA intensities. This technique enables robust and precise analysis that should be carried out under standard conditions in more Triticeae species.

Conclusions and forward look

We studied genome size variation in natural populations of wild diploid and tetraploid wheats. Based on ANOVA, we found that inter-population differences were significant at both ploidy levels whereas intra-population differences were not significant. Maximum genome size differences among populations for T. boeoticum (0.143 pg; 2.32 %), T. dicoccoides (0.314 pg; 2.49 %) and T. araraticum (0.116 pg; 0.98 %) argue for genome constancy in these species. In contrast to the limited genome size variation at the intraspecific level, the interspecific variation was large: \sim 0.5 pg/1C at diploid level (T. boeoticum vs. T. urartu) and \sim 1 pg/1C at the tetraploid level (T. dicoccoides vs. T. araraticum). Low intraspecific genome size variation occurs within diploid and tetraploid wild wheats, and this limited variation is not correlated with geographical or climate variables. We conclude that the genome size of wild self-fertilizing Triticum species is generally stable, despite the presence of many potentially active retroelements. This suggests that retroelement activities in these species are well controlled and/or balanced by removal via recombination. In natural habitats, it is very difficult to distinguish wild wheats from each other especially in their early stages of their development due to their similar morphology. However, all four species can be distinguished easily, quickly and unambiguously by using the FCM technique.

Additional information

The following additional information is available in the online version of this article –

Figure S1 presents Geographical Information System (GIS) based collection sites for all 41 wild wheat populations (T. boeoticum, red; T. urartu, green; T. dicoccoides, blue; T. araraticum, black).

Table S1 summarizes the climate data per collection site.

Sources of funding

The field work of this study was financially supported by the Japanese Society for the Promotion of Science (JSPS) (Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research, Basic Research (A)(2), International Scientific Research Project, No:15255012). Lab work was funded by the University of Trakya (Project no. TUAF 625).

Contributions by the authors

H.Ö. and M.T. undertook the experimental work and laboratory analyses; all authors contributed to the planning of the research and wrote the manuscript.

Acknowledgements

We thank Sabine Jakob for GIS-based map production and providing the climate variables, and also thank Fedor Konovalov and Jörg Fuchs for valuable discussions on the manuscript.

Conflict of interest statement

None declared.

References

- Arumuganathan K, Earle ED. 1991. Estimation of nuclear DNA content of plants by flow cytometry. Plant Molecular Biology Reporter 9: 229–233.
- Badaeva ED, Boguslavsky RL, Badaev NS, Zelenin AV. 1990. Intraspecific chromosomal polymorphism of Triticum araraticum

(Poaceae) detected by C-banding technique. Plant Systematics and Evolution 169: 13–24.

- Badaeva ED, Jiang J, Gill BS. 1995. Detection of intergenomic translocations with centromeric and noncentromeric breakpoints in Triticum araraticum: mechanism of origin and adaptive significance. Genome 38: 976–981.
- Bennett MD. 1987. Variation in genomic form in plants and its ecological implications. New Phytologist 106: 177–200.
- Bennett MD, Leitch IJ. 1995. Nuclear DNA amounts in angiosperms. Annals of Botany 76: 113–176.
- Bennett MD, Leitch IJ. 2005. Plant DNA C-values database (release 4.0). http://data.kew.org/cvalues/homepage.html (accessed 20 October 2005).
- Bennett MD, Smith JB. 1976. Nuclear DNA amounts in angiosperms. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B 274: 227–274.
- Bennett MD, Johnston JS, Hodnett GL, Price HJ. 2000. Allium cepa L. cultivars from four continents compared by flow cytometry show nuclear DNA constancy. Annals of Botany 85: 351–357.
- Bennett ST, Bennett MD. 1992. Variation in nuclear DNA amount between wild and cultivated populations of Millium effusum $(2n = 28)$. Genome 35: 1050-1053.
- Bennetzen JL. 2000. Transposable element contributions to plant gene and genome evolution. Plant Molecular Biology 42: 251–269.
- Bennetzen JL. 2007. Patterns in grass genome evolution. Current Opinion in Plant Biology 10: 176–181.
- Caceres ME, De Pace C, Scarscia Mugnozza GT, Kotsonis P, Ceccarelli M, Cionini PG. 1998. Genome size variations within Dasypyrum villosum: correlations with chromosomal traits, environmental factors and plant phenotypic characteristics and behaviour in reproduction. Theoretical and Applied Genetics 96: 559–567.
- Ceccarelli M, Falisfocco E, Cionini PG. 1992. Variation in genome size and organisation within hexaploid Festuca arundinaceae. Theoretical and Applied Genetics 83: 273–278.
- Charles M, Belcram H, Just J, Huneau C, Viollet A, Couloux A, Segurens B, Carter M, Huteau V, Coriton O, Appels R, Samain S, Chalhoub B. 2008. Dynamics and differential proliferation of transposable elements during the evolution of the B and A genomes of wheat. Genetics 180: 1071–1086.
- Creber HMC, Davies MS, Francis D, Walker HD. 1994. Variation in DNA C value in natural populations of Dactylis glomerata L. New Phytologist 128: 555–561.
- Dolezel J, Bartos J. 2005. Plant DNA flow cytometry and estimation of nuclear genome size. Annals of Botany 95: 99–110.
- Dorofeev VF, Filatenko AA, Migushova EF, Udaczin RA, Jakubziner MM. 1979. Wheat. In: Dorofeev VF, Korovina ON, eds. Flora of cultivated plants, Vol. 1. St. Petersburg: Kolos, 346 pp (in Russian).
- Dvorak J, Akhunov ED. 2005. Tempos of gene locus deletions and duplications and their relationship to recombination rate during diploid and polyploid evolution in the aegilops-triticum alliance. Genetics 171: 323–332.
- Dvorak J, Diterlizzi P, Zhang HB, Resta P. 1993. The evolution of polyploidy wheats: identification of the A genome donor species. Genome 36: 21–31.
- Eilam T, Anikster Y, Millet E, Manisterski J, Sagi-Assif O, Feldman M. 2007. Nuclear DNA amount in diploid Triticeae species. Genome 50: 1029–1037.
- Eilam T, Anikster Y, Millet E, Manisterski J, Feldman M. 2008. Nuclear DNA amount and genome downsizing in natural and synthetic allopolyploids of the genera Aegilops and Triticum. Genome 51: 616–627.
- Feuillet C, Keller B. 2002. Comparative genomics in the grass family: molecular characterization of grass genome structure and evolution. Annals of Botany 89: 3–10.
- Furuta Y. 1970. DNA content per nucleus in Aegilops species. Wheat Information Service 30: 20–22.
- Furuta Y, Nishikawa K, Makino T. 1975. Intraspecific variation in nuclear DNA content in Aegilops squarrosa. Japanese Journal of Genetics 50: 257–263.
- Furuta Y, Nishikawa K, Kimizuka T. 1977. Quantitative comparison of nuclear DNA in section Sitopsis of genus Aegilops. Japanese Journal of Genetics 52: 107-115.
- Furuta Y, Nishikawa K, Haji T. 1978. Uniformity of nuclear DNA content in Triticum monococcum L. Japanese Journal of Genetics 53: 361–366.
- Furuta Y, Nishikawa K, Yamaguchi S. 1986. Nuclear DNA content in diploid wheat and its relatives in relation to the phylogeny of tetraploid wheat. Japanese Journal of Genetics 61: 97-105.
- Gandilian PA. 1972. On the wild growing Triticum species of the Armenian S.S.R. Botanical Journal 57: 173–181.
- Greilhuber J. 1998. Intraspecific variation in genome size in angiosperms: a critical reassessment. Annals of Botany 82: 27–35.
- Greilhuber J. 2005. Intraspecific variation in genome size in angiosperms: identifying its existence. Annals of Botany 95: 91–98.
- Greilhuber J, Borsch T, Müller K, Worberg A, Porembski S, Barthlott W. 2006. Smallest angiosperm genomes found in Lentibulariaceae, with chromosomes of bacterial size. Plant Biology 8: 770-777.
- Gregory TR. 2005. The C-value enigma in plants and animals: a review of parallels and an appeal for partnership. Annals of Botany 95: 133–146.
- Grime P. 1983. Prediction of weed and crop response to climate based on measurement of DNA content. Aspects of Applied Biology 4: 87–98.
- Grover CE, Wendel JF. 2010. Recent insights into mechanisms of genome size change in plants. Journal of Botany. Doi: 0.1155/ 2010/382732.
- Hijmans RJ, Guarino L, Cruz M, Rojas E. 2001. Computer tools for spatial analysis of plant genetic resources data: 1. DIVA-GIS. Plant Genetics Research Newsletter 127: 15–19.
- Hijmans RJ, Cameron SE, Parra JL, Jones PG, Jarvis A. 2005. Very high resolution interpolated climate surfaces for global land areas. International Journal of Climatology 25: 1965–1978.
- Huang S, Sirikhachornkit A, Su XJ, Faris J, Gill B, Haselkorn R, Gornicki P. 2002. Genes encoding plastid acetyl-CoA carboxylase and 3-phosphoglycerate kinase of the Triticum/Aegilops complex and the evolutionary history of polyploid wheat. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA 99: 8133–8138.
- Hülgenhof E, Weidhase RA, Schlegel R, Tewes A. 1988. Flow cytometric determination of DNA content in isolated nuclei of cereals. Genome 30: 565–569.
- Johnson BL. 1975. Identification of the apparent B-genome donor of wheat. Canadian Journal of Genetics and Cytology 17: 21–39.
- Johnson BL, Dhaliwal HS. 1976. Reproductive isolation of Triticum boeoticum and Triticum urartu and the origin of the tetraploid wheat. American Journal of Botany 63: 1088–1094.
- Johnston JS, Jenson A, Czeschin DG, Price HJ. 1996. Environmentally induced nuclear 2C DNA content variation in Helianthus annuus. American Journal of Botany 83: 1113–1120.
- Kalendar R, Tanskanen J, Irnmonen S, Nevo E, Schulman AH. 2000. Genome evolution of wild barley (Hordeum spontaneum) by BARE-1 retrotransposon dynamics in response to sharp microclimate divergence. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA 97: 6603–6607.
- Kankanpaa J, Mannonnen L, Schulman AH. 1996. The genome sizes of Hordeum species show considerable variation. Genome 39: 730–735.
- Kilian B, Özkan H, Walther A, Kohl J, Dagan T, Salamini F, Martin W. 2007a. Molecular diversity at 18 loci in 321 wild and 92 domesticate lines reveal no reduction of nucleotide diversity during Triticum monococcum (einkorn) domestication: implications for the origin of agriculture. Molecular Biology and Evolution 24: 2657–2668.
- Kilian B, Özkan H, Deusch O, Effgen S, Brandolini A, Kohl J, Martin W, Salamini F. 2007b. Independent wheat B and G genome origins in outcrossing Aegilops progenitor haplotypes. Molecular Biology of Evolution 24: 217–227.
- Kilian B, Özkan H, Pozzi C, Salamini F. 2009. Domestication of the Triticeae in the fertile crescent. In: Feuillet C, Muehlbauer GJ, eds. Genetics and genomics of the Triticeae. New York: Springer, 81–119.
- Konovalov FA, Goncharov NP, Goryunova S, Shaturova A, Tatyana Proshlyakova T, Kudryavtsev A. 2010. Molecular markers based on LTR retrotransposons BARE-1 and Jeli uncover different strata of evolutionary relationships in diploid wheats. Molecular Genetics and Genomics 283: 551–563.
- Kron P, Suda J, Husband BC. 2007. Applications of flow cytometry to evolutionary and population biology. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 38: 847–876.
- Luo MC, Yang ZL, You FM, Kawahara T, Waines JG, Dvorak J. 2007. The structure of wild and domesticated emmer wheat populations, gene flow between them, and the site of emmer domestication. Theoretical and Applied Genetics 114: 947–959.
- Lysak MA, Rostkova A, Dixon JM, Rossi G, Dolezel J. 2000. Limited genome size variation in Sesleria albicans. Annals of Botany 86: 399–403.
- Marañón T, Grubb PJ. 1993. Physiological basis and ecological significance of the seed size and relative growth rate relationship in Mediterranean annuals. Functional Ecology 7: 591–599.
- Mori N, Liu YG, Tsunewaki K. 1995. Wheat phylogeny determined by RFLP analysis of Nuclear-DNA. 2. Wild tetraploid wheats. Theoretical and Applied Genetics 90: 129–134.
- Muray BG. 2005. When does intraspecific variation become taxonomically significant? Annals of Botany 95: 119–125.
- Nishikawa K, Furuta Y. 1978. DNA content of nucleus and individual chromosomes and its evolutionary significance. In: Ramanujan E, ed. Proceedings of the 5th International Wheat Genetics Symposium. New Delhi: Indian Society of Genetics and Plant Breeding, Indian Agricultural Research Institute, 133–138.
- Özkan H, Tuna M, Arumuganathan K. 2003. Nonadditive changes in genome size during allopolyploidization in the wheat (Aegilops-Triticum) group. Journal of Heredity 94: 260–264.
- Özkan H. Brandolini A. Pozzi C. Effaen S. Wunder J. Salamini F. 2005. A reconsideration of the domestication geography of tetraploid wheats. Theoretical and Applied Genetics 110: 1052–1060.
- Price HJ, Chambers KL, Bachmann K. 1981. Geographic and ecological distribution of genomic DNA content in Microseris bigelovii (Asteraceae). Botanical Gazette 142: 415–429.
- Rayburn AL, Auger JA, Benzinger EA, Hepburn AG. 1989. Detection of intraspecific DNA variation in Zea mays L. by flow cytometry. Journal of Experimental Botany 40: 1179-1185.
- Rees H, Walters MR. 1965. Nuclear DNA and the evolution of wheat. Heredity 20: 73–82.
- Reeves G, Francis D, Davies MS, Rogers HJ, Hodkinson TR. 1998. Genome size is negatively correlated with altitude in natural populations of Dactylis polygama. Annals of Botany 82: 99–105.
- Schmuths H, Meister A, Horres R, Bachmann K. 2004. Genome size variation among accessions of Arabidopsis thaliana. Annals of Botany 93: 317–321.
- Swift HH. 1950. The desoxyribose nucleic acid content of animal nuclei. Physiological Zoology 23: 169–198.
- Tenaillon MI, Hollister JD, Gaut BS. 2010. A triptych of the evolution of plant transposable elements. Trends in Plant Science 15: 471–478.
- Teoh SB, Rees H. 1976. Nuclear DNA amounts in populations of Picea and Pinus species. Heredity 36: 123–137.
- Tuna M, Vogel KP, Arumunagathan K, Gill KS. 2001. DNA contents and ploidy determination of bromegrass germplasm accessions by flow cytometer. Crop Science 41: 1629–1634.
- Tuna M, Vogel KP, Arumuganathan K. 2005. Genome size and giemsa C-banded karyotype of tetraploid Bromus ciliatus L. Euphytica 146: 177–182.
- Tuna M, Vogel KP, Arumuganathan K. 2006. Cytogenetic and nuclear DNA conent characterization of diploid Bromus erectus and Bromus variegatus. Crop Science 46: 637–641.
- Vicient CM, Souniemi A, Anamthawat-Jonsson K, Tanskanen J, Beharav A, Nevo E, Schulman AH. 1999. Retrotransposon BARE-1 and its role in genome evolution in the genus Hordeum. The Plant Cell 11: 1769–1784.
- Zonneveld BJM. 2010. New record holders for maximum genome size in eudicots and monocots. Journal of Botany. Doi: 10.1155/2010/527357.