

# NIH Public Access

**Author Manuscript** 

# Published in final edited form as:

Nat Immunol. 2010 December; 11(12): 1093-1101. doi:10.1038/ni.1952.

# Interleukin-35-mediated induction of a novel regulatory T cell population

Lauren W. Collison<sup>1</sup>, Vandana Chaturvedi<sup>1</sup>, Abigail L. Henderson<sup>1,8</sup>, Paul R. Giacomin<sup>4</sup>, Cliff Guy<sup>1</sup>, Jaishree Bankoti<sup>1</sup>, David Finkelstein<sup>2</sup>, Karen Forbes<sup>1</sup>, Creg J. Workman<sup>1</sup>, Scott A. Brown<sup>1</sup>, Jerold E. Rehg<sup>3</sup>, Michael L. Jones<sup>5</sup>, Hsiao-Tzu Ni<sup>6</sup>, David Artis<sup>4</sup>, Mary Jo Turk<sup>7</sup>, and Dario A. A. Vignali<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Immunology, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital, Memphis, TN 38105, USA

<sup>2</sup> Department of Bioinformatics, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital, Memphis, TN 38105, USA

<sup>3</sup> Department of Pathology, St. Jude Children's Research Hospital, Memphis, TN 38105, USA

<sup>4</sup> Department of Pathobiology, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA

<sup>5</sup> Shenandoah Biotechnology, Inc., Monroe, OH 45050, USA

<sup>6</sup> Department of Antibody Applications, R&D Systems, Inc., Minneapolis-MN, USA

<sup>7</sup> Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Dartmouth Medical School, Lebanon, NH 03756, USA

# Abstract

Regulatory T cells ( $T_{regs}$ ) play a critical role in the maintenance of immunological self-tolerance. Naïve human or murine T cell treatment with the inhibitory cytokine IL-35 induces a regulatory population, termed iT<sub>R</sub>35, that mediates suppression via IL-35, but not IL-10 or TGF $\beta$ , neither express nor require Foxp3, are strongly suppressive in five in vivo models, and exhibit in vivo stability.  $T_{reg}$ -mediated suppression induces i $T_R35$  generation in an IL-35- and IL-10-dependent manner in vitro, and in inflammatory conditions in vivo in Trichuris-infected intestines and within the tumor microenvironment, where they appear to contribute to the regulatory milieu.  $iT_R35$  may constitute a key mediator of infectious tolerance, may contribute to T<sub>reg</sub>-mediated tumor progression, and ex vivo generated iT<sub>R</sub>35 may possess therapeutic utility.

> Regulatory T cells (T<sub>regs</sub>) are a unique subset of CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells that are essential for maintaining peripheral tolerance, preventing autoimmunity, and limiting chronic inflammatory diseases. However, they also prevent beneficial anti-tumor responses and

### COMPETING FINANCIAL INTERESTS

The authors declare competing financial interests.

Correspondence should be addressed to D.A.A.V (vignali.lab@stjude.org). <sup>8</sup>Present address: Des Moines University, Des Moines, IA 50312, USA.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

L.W.C. designed (with help from D.A.A.V) and executed all mouse experiments, analyzed data and wrote the manuscript; V.C. performed human experiments; A.L.H. (with L.W.C) performed B16 tumor experiments; J.B. performed MC38 tumor experiments; P.R.G. carried out Trichuris muris infections; C.G. did confocal microscopy analyses; D.F. performed Affymetrix analyses; K.F. and S.A.B (with C.J.W) generated and screened anti-IL35 mAbs; C.J.W. coordinated anti-IL35 mAb development, testing and purification, and aided in figure preparation; M.L.J. generated and purified mEbi3 protein for immunizations and mAb development; J.N. provided key reagents and information; J.E.R. created and performed histological analyses of  $Foxp3^{-/-}$  mice; D.A. designed Trichuris muris experiments and provided input on interpretation; M.J.T provided training in the B16 tumor model, and provided input to the research design and interpretation; and D.A.A.V. conceptualized the research, directed the study, and edited the manuscript.

sterilizing immunity against certain chronic infections. Consequently, the modulation of  $T_{reg}$  activity or generation of  $T_{regs}$  *ex vivo* are important goals of immunotherapy. Naturally-occurring, thymus-derived CD4<sup>+</sup>  $T_{regs}$  (n $T_{regs}$ ) express the lineage specific transcription factor Foxp3 (forkhead box P3), which is required for their development, homeostasis and function<sup>1-4</sup>. Despite their limited numbers (5–10% of CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells),  $T_{regs}$  play a pivotal role in immune homeostasis. Indeed, it has been suggested that the suppressive milieu is potentiated by *in vivo* conversion of non- $T_{regs}$  into suppressive cells, a process termed 'infectious tolerance'. This contagious spread of suppression is thought to be a primary mechanism underlying transplantation tolerance<sup>5</sup> and modulating autoimmune and inflammatory diseases, such as experimental allergic encephalomyelitis (EAE)<sup>6</sup> and asthma<sup>7</sup>. While the mechanisms that mediate infectious tolerance remain obscure, both TGF $\beta$  and IL-10 have been implicated.

Induced regulatory T cell populations (iT<sub>R</sub>) can be generated in the periphery, or *in vitro*, from conventional CD4<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>-</sup> T cells (T<sub>conv</sub>)<sup>8–10</sup>. There is substantial interest in the therapeutic potential of iT<sub>R</sub> as it has been shown that antigen-specific regulatory populations can be generated that are potently inhibitory *in vivo*<sup>11, 12</sup>. Two types of iT<sub>R</sub> have been described based on the cytokines that induce them; TGFβ- and IL-10-iT<sub>R</sub>. TGFβ-iT<sub>R</sub> are generated following T cell activation in the presence of TGFβ with or without retinoic acid and IL-2. Both types of iT<sub>R</sub> are potently suppressive both *in vitro* and *in vivo*<sup>11, 13, 14</sup>, but possess distinct molecular signatures. While TGFβ iT<sub>R</sub> express Foxp3 and primarily secrete TGFβ, IL-10 iT<sub>R</sub> cells remain Foxp3<sup>-</sup> following conversion and are defined by high IL-10 secretion.

 $T_{reg}$ -based approaches to treating inflammatory conditions such as allergy, autoimmune diseases, and graft-versus-host responses have great potential, but also have limitations [reviewed in <sup>12</sup>]. The therapeutic potential of human  $T_{regs}$  is limited by their polyclonal specificity, poorly defined markers for enrichment, and reduced proliferative capacity which limits *ex vivo* expansion. Antigen-specific i $T_R$  (IL-10 i $T_R$  or TGF $\beta$  i $T_R$ ) can be generated *ex vivo* but their utility is restricted by technical complexities in their generation, limited potency and/or ambiguity regarding stability and longevity *in vivo*. Thus, the identification of a well-defined population of  $T_{regs}$  which can be readily generated *ex vivo*, and are stable and potently inhibitory *in vivo* is a critical goal for effective cell-based immunotherapy.

We have recently described a novel  $T_{reg}$ -specific cytokine, IL-35, that is required for maximal regulatory activity of murine  $T_{regs}$  *in vitro* and *in vivo*<sup>15</sup>. In this study, we show that IL-35, like IL-10 and TGF $\beta$ , can generate human and murine  $iT_R$  and address four questions: (1) what is their *in vivo* efficacy and stability, (2) can they be generated by  $nT_{regs}$ , (3) are they generated at inflammation sites, and (4) what is their physiological contribution to the regulatory milieu established by  $nT_{regs}$ ?

# RESULTS

## Human IL-35 treated T<sub>conv</sub> acquire a regulatory phenotype

Human IL-35 can suppress the proliferation of umbilical cord-derived human CD4<sup>+</sup>  $T_{conv}$  cells to a degree similar to that seen by activated  $T_{regs}$  (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Figs. 1 and 2).  $T_{conv}$  cells activated with anti-CD3- + anti-CD28-coated latex beads ( $\alpha$ CD3/CD28) in the presence of IL-35 dramatically upregulated *EBI3* and *IL12A* mRNA, the two constituents of IL-35 (Ebi3 and p35, respectively) (Fig. 1a), but not IL-10 or TGF $\beta$  (Supplementary Fig. 3). Single cell analysis by both intracellular cytokine staining (Fig. 1b) and confocal microscopy (Fig. 1c) suggests that IL-35, but not control protein, treatment induces homogeneous expression of IL-35 in human CD4<sup>+</sup>  $T_{conv}$  cells. Similarly, CD4<sup>+</sup>CD45RA<sup>+</sup>CD25<sup>-</sup>  $T_{conv}$  cells from adult peripheral blood expressed *EBI3* and *IL12A*,

but not *TGFB* or *IL10* mRNA following activation in the presence of IL-35 (Supplementary Fig. 3i,j and data not shown).

We next assessed if IL-35-treated cells assumed the functional phenotype of iT<sub>R</sub>. T<sub>conv</sub> cells activated in the presence of IL-35 but not control were hyporesponsive to secondary restimulation (Fig. 1d). To determine whether IL-35-pretreated T<sub>conv</sub> cells had acquired regulatory capacity, they were co-cultured as potential suppressors with freshly purified responder T<sub>conv</sub>. While control-treated cells lacked any suppressive capacity, IL-35 treated cells were strongly suppressive (Fig. 1e). Human IL-35, but not control-treated, T<sub>conv</sub> cells also suppressed responder T<sub>conv</sub> cell proliferation across a permeable membrane, in the absence of direct cell contact, supporting a role for cytokine-mediated suppression (Fig. 1f). Moreover, neutralizing mAbs to IL-35, but not IL-10 or TGF $\beta$ , blocked their suppressive capacity (Fig. 1g, Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 3). Taken together, these data suggest that IL-35 can convert human T<sub>conv</sub> into a homogeneous population of iT<sub>R</sub> cells that suppress via IL-35.

#### IL-35 treated murine T<sub>conv</sub> acquire a regulatory phenotype in vitro

Given that human IL-35 can mediate  $iT_R$  generation, we then asked if murine IL-35 possessed a similar capacity (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 4). Analysis of T<sub>conv</sub> cells activated in the presence of murine IL-35 upregulated both Ebi3 and Ill2a, but not Ill0 or Tgfb mRNA (Fig. 2a, Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 5). Immunoprecipitation and western blot analysis demonstrated that only IL-35 treated cells secrete IL-35, which was equivalent to the amount of IL-35 produced by natural T<sub>regs</sub>. Both control-treated  $T_{conv}$  cells and IL-35-treated  $Ebi3^{-/-} T_{conv}$  cells did not secrete IL-35 (Fig. 2b). We next assessed if IL-35-treated murine cells, like their human counterparts, assumed an iT<sub>R</sub> phenotype. Consistent with earlier reports<sup>16</sup>, previously activated  $T_{conv}$  cells proliferated well in response to secondary re-stimulation (Fig. 2c). IL-10 and IL-27 pretreated T<sub>conv</sub> also proliferated strongly in response to re-stimulation (note that short-term IL-10 treatment alone, in the absence of DCs, is insufficient to mediate IL-10  $iT_R$ conversion<sup>14</sup>) (Supplementary Fig. 6). However, both IL-35 and TGF $\beta$  pretreated T<sub>conv</sub> cells were hyporesponsive to re-stimulation, albeit to a lesser degree than freshly purified nT<sub>regs</sub>. To determine whether these cytokine-pretreated T<sub>conv</sub> cells had acquired regulatory capacity, they were co-cultured as potential suppressors with freshly purified responder T<sub>conv</sub> cells (Fig. 2d and Supplementary Fig. 6). Whereas the control, IL-10- and IL-27treated  $T_{conv}$  cells had no effect on responder proliferation, TGF $\beta$ -treated  $T_{conv}$  cells suppressed responder T cell proliferation<sup>13</sup>. As seen with human T cells, murine T<sub>conv</sub> cells pretreated with IL-35 were also capable of suppressing responder T cell proliferation. Furthermore, IL-35- but not control-treated T<sub>conv</sub> could suppress T cell proliferation in a contact-independent manner, across a permeable membrane, implicating soluble suppressive mediators (Fig. 2e). Using an IL-35 sandwich ELISA we also showed that approximately 500–700pg/ml IL-35 is required to mediate the induction of *Ebi3* and *Il12a* expression and of the suppressive phenotype (Supplementary Fig. 4).

To determine the mechanism of suppression, we first showed that IL-35-pretreated  $ll10^{-/-}$  (which cannot make IL-10), but not  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  (which cannot make IL-35), T<sub>conv</sub> could suppress responder T cells (Fig. 2f). In addition, TGF $\beta$ R.DN T<sub>conv</sub> that are unable to respond to TGF $\beta$  were fully suppressed by IL-35-treated T<sub>conv</sub> (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 7). Using cytokine neutralizing mAbs, we then showed that IL-35-pretreated T<sub>conv</sub> mediated suppression via IL-35 but not IL-10 or TGF $\beta$  (Fig. 2g,h [note that the anti-Ebi3 mAb used neutralizes IL-35 but not IL-27; Supplementary Fig. 8]). Collectively, these data suggest that murine IL-35 converts T<sub>conv</sub> into an iT<sub>R</sub> population that appears to mediate suppression exclusively via IL-35.

#### IL-35-treated murine T<sub>conv</sub> exhibit a highly restricted genetic signature

Given that IL-35 can convert proliferative,  $Foxp3^{-}T_{conv}$  cells into hypo-responsive, strongly suppressive  $iT_R$ , we next sought to define their genetic signature. Interestingly, Foxp3 is neither induced nor required for the generation of IL-35-iT<sub>R</sub>. While natural  $T_{regs}$ and  $TGF\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub> express Foxp3, neither control nor IL-35 treated  $T_{conv}$  cells express Foxp3 (Supplementary Fig. 9). Moreover,  $Foxp3^{-/-}$   $T_{conv}$  cells could be converted to IL-35 iT<sub>R</sub> which expressed IL-35 and mediated suppression in a manner indistinguishable from their wild type counterparts (Supplementary Fig. 9c). In addition, iT<sub>R</sub>35 cells do not express Foxp3 following *in vivo* inoculation as demonstrated by utilizing iT<sub>R</sub>35 generated from  $Foxp3^{gfp}$  mice in an *in vivo* model of homeostatic expansion. Seven days post-transfer into  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice, iT<sub>R</sub>control, wild-type iT<sub>R</sub>35 and  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  iT<sub>R</sub>35 were purified based on congenic Thy1 markers and Foxp3 expression assessed by flow cytometric analysis of GFP expression. No induction of Foxp3 was seen in any of the transferred iT<sub>R</sub> (Supplementary Fig. 9d).

We next compared the global gene expression of IL-35- and control-treated  $T_{conv}$  cells using Affymetrix GeneChip microarrays. Prior to analyses, we verified that the IL-35-iT<sub>R</sub> used for analysis expressed *Ebi3* and p35 mRNA, secreted IL-35 and suppressed responder  $T_{conv}$ cells (Supplementary Fig. 10). While clear differences were observed between  $nT_{reg}$  and T<sub>conv</sub>, no genes appear to be significantly up- or down-regulated between IL-35- and control-treated T<sub>conv</sub> (>3-fold; Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 11). Nevertheless, the IL-35-iT<sub>R</sub> cells generated from five independent experiments expressed *Ebi3* and *Il12a* mRNA, secreted IL-35 and mediated potent *in vitro* suppression. The minimalistic genetic alteration observed in IL-35- compared to control-treated  $T_{conv}$  was further supported by analysis of T cell activation and co-stimulatory molecule expression and cytokine production. While the expression of most of the proteins/cytokines examined was indistinguishable between IL-35- and control-treated  $T_{conv}$ , reductions in the secretion of GM-CSF, IFNy, and IL-4 were observed, albeit not statistically significant (Supplementary Fig. 12). In addition, surface molecules such as CLTA-4 and CD25, which have been previously described as mediators of nTreg suppression, were similarly upregulated in both control and IL-35-treated T<sub>conv</sub>, cells, arguing against an exclusive role in the latter. Furthermore, the percentage of CTLA4<sup>+</sup> IL-35-iT<sub>R</sub> was relatively small (<15%). Taken together, these results suggest that IL-35 treatment mediates surgical rather than global gene expression changes.

Given that IL-35 is central to both the generation and suppressive function of IL-35-iT<sub>R</sub>, we refer to this novel iT<sub>R</sub> population as iT<sub>R</sub>35 (for induced T regulatory population making IL-35) [Control-treated T<sub>conv</sub>, which do not acquire a suppressive phenotype, are referred to as iT<sub>R</sub>control]. While our data suggest that iT<sub>R</sub>35 have a highly restricted  $Cd4^+/Foxp3^-/Ebi3^+/Il12a^+/Il10^-/Tgfb^-$  genetic signature, we cannot rule out the possibility that there are some molecular changes that might distinguish IL-35- from control-treated T<sub>conv</sub> that were not revealed by this analysis, or that this signature may apply to an as yet undefined non-regulatory population (See Supplementary Information).

### iT<sub>R</sub>35 are potently suppressive in vivo

The regulatory capacity of  $iT_R35$  was tested in five different *in vivo* models. We first assessed whether  $iT_R35$  could restore immune homeostasis and prevent lethal autoimmunity in  $Foxp3^{-/-}$  mice<sup>17, 18</sup>.  $iT_R35$  and various control populations were transferred into newborn (2–3 day old)  $Foxp3^{-/-}$  mice. Approximately 25 days later, an external clinical score, splenic and lymph node CD4<sup>+</sup> T cell numbers, and a histological score (lungs, liver and skin) were determined (see Supplementary Information)<sup>19</sup>. As expected,  $nT_{regs}$  and TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub>, but not control-treated  $T_{conv}$  (iT<sub>R</sub>control) were able to restore immune

homeostasis and prevent autoimmunity (Fig. 3a-d and Supplementary Fig. 13). Interestingly,  $iT_R35$  were as effective as  $nT_{regs}$  at restoring immune homeostasis and preventing autoimmunity in  $Foxp3^{-/-}$  mice. Importantly, neither  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  nor  $p35^{-/-}$  iT<sub>R</sub>35 could restore immune homeostasis demonstrating the necessity for IL-35 production *in vivo* by  $iT_R35$ .

Second,  $T_{regs}$  can control the homeostatic expansion of  $T_{conv}$  cells in lymphopenic recombination activating gene 1 (*Rag1*)<sup>-/-</sup> mice<sup>15, 20, 21</sup>. Purified wild-type Thy1.1<sup>+</sup>  $T_{conv}$ cells, either alone or in the presence of control- or IL-35-treated Thy1.2<sup>+</sup> T cells were adoptively transferred into *Rag1<sup>-/-</sup>* mice, and splenic responder (Thy1.1<sup>+</sup>) and suppressor (Thy1.2<sup>+</sup>) T cell numbers determined 7 days later<sup>19</sup>. Thy1.2<sup>+</sup> iT<sub>R</sub>control expanded significantly and failed to block the expansion of Thy 1.1<sup>+</sup> responder  $T_{conv}$  cells (Fig. 3e, f). In contrast, Thy1.2<sup>+</sup>  $T_{conv}$  iT<sub>R</sub>35, but not *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* iT<sub>R</sub>35, had low proliferative capacity and significantly limited proliferation of Thy 1.1<sup>+</sup> responder  $T_{conv}$  cells.

Third, experimental autoimmune encephalomyelitis (EAE) is a model for the human autoimmune disease multiple sclerosis and can be induced in C57BL/6 mice following immunization with  $MOG_{35-55}$  peptide. Adoptively transferred  $nT_{regs}$  have been shown to reduce EAE disease severity<sup>6</sup>, <sup>23</sup>, <sup>24</sup>. To determine whether iT<sub>R</sub>35 could slow or prevent EAE, 10<sup>6</sup> nT<sub>regs</sub>, iT<sub>R</sub>control or iT<sub>R</sub>35 cells were transferred into mice prior to EAE induction<sup>19</sup>. Consistent with previous reports, clinical scores were reduced in nT<sub>regs</sub> recipients, while disease course in mice receiving the iT<sub>R</sub>control cells or saline alone was unaffected (Fig. 3g). Strikingly, the iT<sub>R</sub>35-treated mice were completely protected from EAE, while mice receiving *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* iT<sub>R</sub>35 were indistinguishable from saline control mice, suggesting that IL-35 production by iT<sub>R</sub>35 *in vivo* is required for protection.

Fourth,  $T_{regs}$  can prevent anti-tumor CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell responses against the poorly-immunogenic B16 melanoma<sup>25, 26</sup>. Wild type naïve CD4<sup>+</sup>CD25<sup>-</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells alone or in combination with  $nT_{regs}$  or  $iT_R35$  cells were adoptively transferred into  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice followed by i.d. injection of B16 melanoma cells and tumor size monitored daily<sup>19</sup>. As expected, tumor size was reduced in CD4<sup>+</sup>/CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell recipients lacking  $T_{regs}$  compared with the untreated  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice (Fig. 3h). In contrast, transfer of either  $nT_{regs}$  or  $iT_R35$  cells completely blocked the anti-tumor response resulting in more aggressive tumor growth that was comparable to untreated  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice. Surgical excision of the primary tumor and subsequent secondary tumor challenge at a distal site demonstrated that concomitant tumor immunity was also prevented by both  $nT_{regs}$  and  $iT_R35$  (Supplementary Fig. 13).

Fifth, inflammatory bowel disease (IBD) is initiated by the adoptive transfer of naïve  $CD4^+CD45RB^{hi}CD25^-$  T cells into  $Rag1^{-/-}$  recipient mice and disease assessed by weight loss and colonic histopathology<sup>22</sup>. After mice developed clinical symptoms of IBD (~4 weeks post T cell transfer), they received iT<sub>R</sub>control or iT<sub>R</sub>35 and were monitored daily19. Recovery from disease, marked by weight gain (Fig. 3i) and decreased histopathology (Fig. 3j and Supplementary Fig. 13), was observed in mice that received iT<sub>R</sub>35 but not the iT<sub>R</sub>control cells. We also used this model to further demonstrate that TGF $\beta$  is not required for the *in vivo* suppressive capacity of iT<sub>R</sub>35 (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 14).

Finally, we further assessed the importance of IL-35 production by  $iT_R35$  *in vivo* using a unique Ebi3-specific mAb that neutralized IL-35 but not IL-27 (Supplementary Fig. 8). Administration of this mAb, but not an isotype control, blocked the suppressive capacity of  $iT_R35$  in an *in vivo* model of homeostatic expansion (Supplementary Fig. 13g), consistent with our observations using  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  or  $p35^{-/-}$  iT<sub>R</sub>35 in three *in vivo* models (Fig. 3). Taken together, these data clearly demonstrate that  $iT_R35$  have potent suppressive capacity in a

wide variety of *in vivo* models and that this activity is dependent on IL-35 production *in vivo*.

#### iT<sub>R</sub>35 are stable *in vivo*

Some have suggested that ex vivo generated iT<sub>R</sub> cells are unstable *in vivo*. Although our five in vivo transfer experiments suggest that  $iT_R35$  have some degree of stability, we used two approaches to assess this question directly. First, CD45.2<sup>+</sup> iT<sub>R</sub>35 or TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub> were generated in vitro and adoptively transferred into CD45.1+ C57BL/6 mice to monitor cell recovery and function over time (see Supplementary Information). Both iT<sub>R</sub>35 and TGF $\beta$  $iT_{R}$  can be recovered from the spleen post-transfer, and retain expression of their signature genes, *Ebi3/II12a* and *Foxp3/Tgfb*, respectively (Supplementary Fig. 15d). As in vitro, iT<sub>R</sub>35 inoculated in vivo fail to induce Foxp3 expression suggesting that this critical nT<sub>reg</sub> transcription factor is not required for iT<sub>R</sub>35 maintenance and function. While 33% of the initial iT<sub>R</sub>35 inoculum was recovered 3 weeks post-transfer, only 12% of TGFβ iT<sub>R</sub> cells were recovered (Fig. 4a). In addition, purified iT<sub>R</sub>35 cells still retained strong suppressive capacity, whereas the function of TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub> cells was reduced by approximately 50% (Fig. 4b). While this suggests that  $iT_R35$  may be more stable *in vivo*, it does not exclude the possibility that iT<sub>R</sub>35 and TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub> may home to different anatomical locations in the mouse, which could affect their recovery from the spleen. Second, we transferred nTregs,  $T_R35$  or TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub> into 2–3 day old *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mice and determined how long they could prevent the onset of a moribund state (clinical score  $\geq 4$ ). By 5 weeks post-transfer, all the TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub> recipients were moribund compared with 40% and 33% of nT<sub>regs</sub> and iT<sub>R</sub>35 recipients, respectively (Fig. 4c). Furthermore, survival of the remaining  $nT_{reg}$  and  $iT_R35$ recipients was longer, with 100% moribund not being reached until 6.5 and 8 weeks, respectively. Although additional experiments will be required to fully evaluate the longterm stability of iT<sub>R</sub>35 in homeostatic and inflammatory environments, these data suggest that they may be functionally stable in vivo.

### T<sub>reg</sub>-mediated suppression generates iT<sub>R</sub>35

It has been suggested that Tregs can amplify their suppressive capacity by converting nonregulatory populations into suppressive cells, consistent with the concept of infectious tolerance, and that this process might be cytokine-mediated $^{27-29}$ . We have previously shown that nTregs are a natural source of IL-35, which increases 5-10-fold upon contact with the target  $T_{conv}$  cells<sup>15, 30</sup>. Thus, we asked whether  $nT_{reg}$ -derived IL-35 could mediate  $iT_R35$  conversion. We first purified  $T_{conv}$  cells that had been cultured with, and suppressed by,  $nT_{regs}$  for 3 days (which we refer to as suppressed  $T_{conv}$ ) and found that expression of both Ebi3 and Ill2a (p35) mRNA was significantly up-regulated following co-culture, to a level comparable with nT<sub>regs</sub> (Fig. 5a,b). Furthermore, suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> generated by coculture with wild type, but not  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  nT<sub>regs</sub>, secrete a significant amount of IL-35 (Fig. 5c). This demonstrates that IL-35 secretion by nTregs is required to induce IL-35 secretion by co-cultured, suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> cells. To determine whether suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> express Foxp3, a prerequisite for mediating the regulatory activity of  $nT_{regs}$  and TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub>, we activated Thy1.2<sup>+</sup> Foxp3<sup>gfp</sup> T<sub>conv</sub> cells alone or in combination with Thy1.1<sup>+</sup> nT<sub>regs</sub>. Unlike TGF $\beta$ -iT<sub>R</sub>, but similar to iT<sub>R</sub>35, suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> remain Foxp<sup>3-</sup> following activation in the presence of  $T_{regs}$  suggesting that TGF $\beta$  may not mediate this conversion (Supplementary Fig. 16). These data raise the possibility that  $iT_R35$  are generated within the suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> population.

We next assessed whether suppressed  $T_{conv}$  gained the phenotypic characteristics of a regulatory population. Interestingly, suppressed  $T_{conv}$  were profoundly unresponsive to anti-CD3 stimulation and were potently suppressive *in vitro* (Fig. 5d, e).  $T_{regs}$  can secrete IL-10, TGF $\beta$  and IL -35 which may influence their ability to convert  $T_{conv}$  into suppressed  $T_{conv}$ .

Likewise, the same cytokines could be secreted by suppressed  $T_{conv}$  and contribute in an autocrine fashion to their conversion and/or their suppressive activity. To address these questions we first co-cultured  $T_{conv}$  and  $T_{regs}$  that were wild type or lacked the capacity to produce IL-35 (*Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* or *Il12a<sup>-/-</sup>*) or IL-10 (*ll10<sup>-/-</sup>*), or were unable to respond to TGF $\beta$  (*TGF\betaR.DN*). While the generation of suppressed  $T_{conv}$  that were hyporesponsive and possessed regulatory capacity did not require TGF $\beta$ -mediated signaling, the absence of both IL-35 and IL-10 in the nT<sub>reg</sub>:T<sub>conv</sub> co-culture blocked their development and/or function (Fig. 5d, e). Further analysis using nT<sub>reg</sub>:T<sub>conv</sub> co-cultures in which only one population was mutant revealed that both nT<sub>reg</sub>-derived IL-10 and IL-35 was required for the generation of the regulatory suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> population. Interestingly, suppressed T<sub>conv</sub>-derived IL-35 was required for conversion as suggested by qPCR analysis of signature genes (see Supplementary Information and Fig. 15b).

Neutralizing antibodies were included during the conversion process or in the secondary suppression assay to further assess the role of IL-35, IL-10 and TGF $\beta$  (Fig. 5f). While anti-TGF $\beta$  had no effect at either stage, IL-10 neutralization partially blocked conversion but not the regulatory capacity of suppressed T<sub>conv</sub>, suggesting that IL-10 is required for optimal conversion of suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> into a regulatory population. In contrast, IL-35 neutralization prevented both the conversion and regulatory function of suppressed T<sub>conv</sub>. Collectively, these data suggest that some or all of the suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> are iT<sub>R</sub>35. The precise contribution of IL-10 to T<sub>reg</sub>-mediated conversion of iT<sub>R</sub>35 remains to be fully elucidated, as IL-10 alone does not induce *Ebi3* and *II12a* mRNA expression (Supplementary Fig. 5). However, the addition of low dose IL-10 appears to augment IL-35-mediated conversion, which may help offset the delayed production of IL-35 by nT<sub>regs</sub> (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 16c). Taken together, these data suggest that IL-35, either from a natural source (nT<sub>regs</sub>) or supplemented exogenously, mediates iT<sub>R</sub>35 conversion.

Next, the regulatory capacity of  $nT_{regs}$ -suppressed  $T_{conv}$  ( $nT_{regs}$ -induced i $T_R35$ ) was assessed *in vivo*. First, they were able to significantly suppress the homeostatic expansion of co-transferred naïve  $T_{conv}$  in  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice in a manner comparable to  $nT_{regs}$  and  $iT_R35$ (Fig. 5g). However, suppressed  $T_{conv}$  generated from  $Ebi3^{-/-}$   $T_{conv}$  cultured with wild-type  $nT_{reg}$ , failed to suppress the expansion of co-transferred  $T_{conv}$ . Second, in the EAE model, peak clinical disease scores were decreased by suppressed to a level  $T_{conv}$  comparable with  $nT_{regs}$  (Fig. 5h). However, suppressed  $T_{conv}$  could not ameliorate EAE as effectively as  $iT_R35$  suggesting either that only a proportion of this suppressed  $T_{conv}$  population are  $iT_R35$ or that conversion *in vitro* is suboptimal due the time required for potentiation of IL-35 production by  $nT_{regs}15$ , 30. Nevertheless, these data support the notion that  $iT_R35$  are generated from  $T_{conv}$ , to some degree, by  $nT_{regs}$  during suppression. In contrast, there is no evidence for the generation of IL-10-iT\_R or TGF $\beta$ -iT\_R in this setting.

## Treg-mediated induction of iTR35 in vivo

We reasoned that  $iT_R35$  generation *in vivo* would occur predominantly in inflammatory or disease environments where optimally stimulated  $nT_{regs}$  might be secreting high amounts of IL-35. Infection with *Trichuris muris*, an intestinal nematode, is known to promote  $T_{regs}$  responses at the site of infection, the large intestine<sup>31</sup>. Thus, we assessed whether  $iT_R35$  could be detected following *Trichuris muris* infection, using the CD4<sup>+</sup>/Foxp3<sup>-</sup>/*Ebi3*<sup>+</sup>/*II12a*<sup>+</sup> iT\_R35 signature. *Foxp*<sup>gfp</sup> mice were infected with *Trichuris muris* and Foxp3<sup>+</sup> and Foxp3<sup>-</sup> T cells were purified from spleens, small intestines and large intestines 14 days post-infection. Both *Ebi3* and *II12a* (p35) expression were dramatically increased in Foxp3<sup>+</sup>  $T_{regs}$ , in both the small and large intestines, compared with splenic  $T_{regs}$ , consistent with our previous observations that  $nT_{regs}$  increase IL-35 expression ~10-fold in the presence of  $T_{conv}$  cells<sup>15</sup> (Fig. 6a,b). While essentially no *Ebi3/II12a* expression was observed in splenic

Foxp3<sup>-</sup>CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells, expression was substantial in comparable isolates from the small and, especially, the large intestines (the primary site of infection). Indeed, *Ebi3/II12a* expression in Foxp3<sup>+</sup> T<sub>regs</sub> and Foxp3<sup>-</sup>CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells from the large intestines was statistically indistinguishable. It should be emphasized that we have never observed IL-35 expression by naïve, activated or memory CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells<sup>15</sup>, and Foxp3<sup>-</sup>CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells from the intestines or MLN of uninfected mice do not express *Ebi3/II12a* (data not shown) raising the possibility that iT<sub>R</sub>35 are being generated by T<sub>regs</sub> within this inflammatory microenvironment.

The inflammation induced by solid tumors is known to attract  $T_{regs}^{32-37}$ . Using B16 melanoma and MC38 colorectal adenocarcinoma as model systems<sup>25, 38, 39</sup>, tumor cells were inoculated into Foxp<sup>gfp</sup> mice, solid tumors resected 15–17 days (for B16) or 12 days (for MC38) post-transfer and Foxp3<sup>+</sup> and Foxp3<sup>-</sup> T cells purified from spleens and tumors. Interestingly, tumor-infiltrating Foxp3<sup>+</sup> T<sub>regs</sub> had substantially increased expression of both Ebi3 and Il12a (Fig. 6c-f). Surprisingly, tumor-infiltrating Foxp3<sup>-</sup> T cells also dramatically upregulated *Ebi3* and *Il12a* expression. It is noteworthy that comparable observations were made in two distinct tumor types. We further analyzed IL-35 secretion and its physiological relevance using the B16 melanoma system. While a moderate amount of IL-35 secretion by splenic Foxp3<sup>+</sup> T<sub>regs</sub> was observed ex vivo, a substantial and comparable amount of IL-35 was secreted by both Foxp3<sup>+</sup> T<sub>regs</sub> and Foxp3<sup>-</sup>CD4<sup>+</sup> tumor-infiltrating T cells (Fig. 6e). Lastly, we assessed whether tumor-infiltrating CD4<sup>+</sup>/Foxp3<sup>-</sup>/Ebi3<sup>+</sup>/Il12a<sup>+</sup> T cells were able to suppress the proliferation of fresh responder T<sub>conv</sub> in vitro. Although their suppressive capacity was not as potent as that of tumor-infiltrating Foxp3<sup>+</sup> T cells, our results clearly demonstrate that tumor-derived Foxp3<sup>-</sup>CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells can mediate effective suppression in vitro in an IL-35-dependent manner (Fig. 6f).

### iT<sub>R</sub>35 contribute to the regulatory milieu in vivo

Finally, we assessed the physiological contribution of iT<sub>R</sub>35 to the T<sub>reg</sub>-induced regulatory milieu. We reasoned that if  $iT_R35$  development within the tumor played a significant role in blocking anti-tumor immunity, then mice reconstituted with T<sub>conv</sub> cells that lacked the ability to be converted into iT<sub>R</sub>35 would develop smaller tumors. Therefore,  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice were reconstituted with wild type CD8 cells, with or without wild type  $T_{regs}$  plus either wild type or  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  CD4<sup>+</sup> T<sub>conv</sub> cells. As expected, tumor size was reduced in CD4<sup>+</sup>/CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell recipients lacking  $T_{regs}$  (50–90mm<sup>3</sup>) regardless of whether wild type or *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* CD4  $T_{conv}$  cells were transferred. Co-transfer of  $nT_{regs}$  with wild type CD4<sup>+</sup>/CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells blocked anti-tumor immunity resulting in aggressive tumor growth (470mm<sup>3</sup>) (Fig. 7). Analysis of congenically-marked tumor-infiltrating CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells confirmed high Ebi3/III2a expression that was comparable to the Tregs (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 17). Thus it should be noted that in this instance both IL-35-producing nT<sub>regs</sub> and iT<sub>R</sub>35 contribute to the suppressive milieu (Fig. 6, 7 and Supplementary Fig. 17). Strikingly, co-transfer of  $nT_{regs}$  and CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells with  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  CD4<sup>+</sup>  $T_{conv}$  (which are unable to be converted to IL-35-producing iT<sub>R</sub>35) only partially blocked anti-tumor immunity resulting in intermediate tumor growth (220mm<sup>3</sup>). These results suggest that  $T_{reg}$ mediated induction of  $iT_R35$  development has a significant impact on tumor burden and is responsible for approximately half the regulatory milieu within the tumor microenvironment (as the tumor burden is reduced from 470mm<sup>3</sup> to 220mm<sup>3</sup>). Furthermore, these data suggest that  $nT_{regs}$  mediate their suppressive activity, in part, by inducing iT<sub>R</sub>35.

# DISCUSSION

 $iT_R35$  cells represent a new and unique member of the regulatory T cell family that are generated by, and mediate their suppression via, IL-35. They do not express Foxp3 and are quite distinct from the currently known induced regulatory populations, TGF $\beta$  iT<sub>R</sub> and IL-10 iT<sub>R</sub> (see Supplementary Information and Supplementary Fig. 18). The concept of infectious

tolerance, whereby  $T_{reg}$  confer a suppressive phenotype upon  $T_{conv}$  cells, has been previously described in both murine and human systems<sup>27, 29</sup>. It has been suggested that TGF $\beta$  may play a critical role in mediating infectious tolerance<sup>40</sup>. Since IL-35-secreting  $T_{regs}$  can convert  $T_{conv}$  cells into i $T_R$ 35, a suppressed  $T_{conv}$  population with regulatory potential, this raises the possibility that IL-35 and i $T_R$ 35 may represent additional, important mediators of infectious tolerance. Indeed, our data suggest that up to half the regulatory microenvironment within the tumor is mediated by  $T_{reg}$ -induced i $T_R$ 35. This also suggests that i $T_R$ 35 may contribute to tumor progression. While i $T_R$ 35 may play a significant physiological contribution to the regulatory milieu established by  $T_{reg}$ , further studies will be required to fully elucidate their contribution in diverse disease settings.

Whether a similar system operates in humans remains to be determined, but may be controversial given recent studies suggesting that human  $T_{regs}$  do not make IL-35<sup>41, 42</sup>, findings that await further confirmation. Nevertheless, human iT<sub>R</sub>35 can be generated and can suppress primary human T cell proliferation in an IL-35-dependent manner. The potential therapeutic application of *ex vivo* generated IL-10 iT<sub>R</sub> and TGF $\beta$  iT<sub>R</sub> is complicated by complexities in their generation, their short half-life and reversal of their suppressive capacity in time or by IL-2 (see Supplementary Information)<sup>13, 43, 44</sup>. Although additional experiments are needed to fully assess the clinical potential of iT<sub>R</sub>35, our data suggest that they represent a new, stable iT<sub>R</sub> population that may have significant therapeutic utility.

## METHODS

Methods and any associated references are available in the online version of the paper at http://www.nature.com/natureimmunology/.

## Supplementary Material

Refer to Web version on PubMed Central for supplementary material.

# Acknowledgments

The authors wish to thank Doug Green, Terrence Geiger and Hongbo Chi for advice and critical discussion, and Samir Burns for technical guidance, regarding EAE experiments. We also thank Terrence Geiger, Jim Ihle, Richard Blumberg, Vijay Kuchroo and Alexander Rudensky for mice, Dario Campana for the 8E permeabilization buffer, Alan Korman and Mark Selby for MC38 cells and advice, Brandon Triplett, Michelle Howard, and Melissa McKenna at St. Louis Cord Blood Bank for cord blood samples, and staff of the St. Jude Blood Donor Center for aphaeresis rings. We are also grateful to Karen Forbes, Tara Moore and Amy Krause for maintenance and breeding of mouse colonies, Andrea Szymczak-Workman for IBD histological analysis, Lindsay Jones for Ab testing for IP/WB and ELISA, Richard Cross, Greig Lennon and Stephanie Morgan for FACS, the staff of the Shared Animal Resource Center at St Jude for the animal husbandry, and the Hartwell Center for Biotechnology and Bioinformatics at St Jude for real-time PCR primer/probe synthesis and MOG synthesis and purification. This work was supported by the National Institutes of Health (R01 AI39480, to D.A.A.V.) and (R01 AI61570 / R01 AI74878, D.A.), an Individual NRSA (F32 AI072816, L.W.C.), the Australian National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) Overseas Biomedical Fellowship program (P.G.), NCI Comprehensive Cancer Center Support CORE grant (CA21765, D.A.A.V.), and the American Lebanese Syrian Associated Charities (ALSAC, D.A.A.V.).

### References

- Fontenot JD, et al. Regulatory T cell lineage specification by the forkhead transcription factor foxp3. Immunity 2005;22:329–341. [PubMed: 15780990]
- 2. Gavin MA, et al. Foxp3-dependent programme of regulatory T-cell differentiation. Nature 2007;445:771–775. [PubMed: 17220874]
- Hori S, Nomura T, Sakaguchi S. Control of regulatory T cell development by the transcription factor Foxp3. Science 2003;299:1057–1061. [PubMed: 12522256]

- Shevach EM, et al. The lifestyle of naturally occurring CD4+ CD25+ Foxp3+ regulatory T cells. Immunol Rev 2006;212:60–73. [PubMed: 16903906]
- Waldmann H, Adams E, Fairchild P, Cobbold S. Infectious tolerance and the long-term acceptance of transplanted tissue. Immunol Rev 2006;212:301–313. [PubMed: 16903922]
- Selvaraj RK, Geiger TL. Mitigation of experimental allergic encephalomyelitis by TGF-beta induced Foxp3+ regulatory T lymphocytes through the induction of anergy and infectious tolerance. J Immunol 2008;180:2830–2838. [PubMed: 18292504]
- Nguyen KD, Vanichsarn C, Nadeau KC. Impaired IL-10-dependent induction of tolerogenic dendritic cells by CD4+CD25hiCD127lo/- natural regulatory T cells in human allergic asthma. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2009;180:823–833. [PubMed: 19679691]
- Bluestone JA, Abbas AK. Natural versus adaptive regulatory T cells. Nat Rev Immunol 2003;3:253–257. [PubMed: 12658273]
- 9. Shevach EM. From vanilla to 28 flavors: multiple varieties of T regulatory cells. Immunity 2006;25:195–201. [PubMed: 16920638]
- 10. Workman CJ, Szymczak-Workman AL, Collison LW, Pillai MR, Vignali DA. The development and function of regulatory T cells. Cell Mol Life Sci. 2009
- Roncarolo MG, et al. Interleukin-10-secreting type 1 regulatory T cells in rodents and humans. Immunol Rev 2006;212:28–50. [PubMed: 16903904]
- 12. Verbsky JW. Therapeutic use of T regulatory cells. Curr Opin Rheumatol 2007;19:252–258. [PubMed: 17414951]
- Chen W, et al. Conversion of peripheral CD4+CD25- naive T cells to CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells by TGF-beta induction of transcription factor Foxp3. J Exp Med 2003;198:1875–1886. [PubMed: 14676299]
- Groux H, et al. A CD4+ T-cell subset inhibits antigen-specific T-cell responses and prevents colitis. Nature 1997;389:737–742. [PubMed: 9338786]
- Collison LW, et al. The inhibitory cytokine IL-35 contributes to regulatory T-cell function. Nature 2007;450:566–569. [PubMed: 18033300]
- Sakaguchi S. Regulatory T cells: key controllers of immunologic self-tolerance. Cell 2000;101:455–458. [PubMed: 10850488]
- Fontenot JD, Gavin MA, Rudensky AY. Foxp3 programs the development and function of CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells. Nat Immunol 2003;4:330–336. [PubMed: 12612578]
- Huter EN, et al. TGF-beta-induced Foxp3+ regulatory T cells rescue scurfy mice. Eur J Immunol 2008;38:1814–1821. [PubMed: 18546144]
- Workman CJ, et al. In vivo Treg Suppression Assays. Regulatory T cells: Methods and Protocols. 2010 In Press.
- 20. Annacker O, Pimenta-Araujo R, Burlen-Defranoux O, Bandeira A. On the ontogeny and physiology of regulatory T cells. Immunol Rev 2001;182:5–17. [PubMed: 11722620]
- Workman CJ, et al. Lymphocyte activation gene-3 (CD223) regulates the size of the expanding T cell population following antigen activation in vivo. J Immunol 2004;172:5450–5455. [PubMed: 15100286]
- Izcue A, Coombes JL, Powrie F. Regulatory T cells suppress systemic and mucosal immune activation to control intestinal inflammation. Immunol Rev 2006;212:256–271. [PubMed: 16903919]
- Kohm AP, Carpentier PA, Anger HA, Miller SD. Cutting edge: CD4+CD25+ regulatory T cells suppress antigen-specific autoreactive immune responses and central nervous system inflammation during active experimental autoimmune encephalomyelitis. J Immunol 2002;169:4712–4716. [PubMed: 12391178]
- McGeachy MJ, Stephens LA, Anderton SM. Natural recovery and protection from autoimmune encephalomyelitis: contribution of CD4+CD25+ regulatory cells within the central nervous system. J Immunol 2005;175:3025–3032. [PubMed: 16116190]
- 25. Turk MJ, et al. Concomitant tumor immunity to a poorly immunogenic melanoma is prevented by regulatory T cells. J Exp Med 2004;200:771–782. [PubMed: 15381730]

- 26. Zhang P, Cote AL, de Vries VC, Usherwood EJ, Turk MJ. Induction of postsurgical tumor immunity and T-cell memory by a poorly immunogenic tumor. Cancer Res 2007;67:6468–6476. [PubMed: 17616708]
- Jonuleit H, et al. Infectious tolerance: human CD25(+) regulatory T cells convey suppressor activity to conventional CD4(+) T helper cells. J Exp Med 2002;196:255–260. [PubMed: 12119350]
- Milojevic D, Nguyen KD, Wara D, Mellins ED. Regulatory T cells and their role in rheumatic diseases: a potential target for novel therapeutic development. Pediatr Rheumatol Online J 2008;6:20. [PubMed: 19046457]
- 29. Waldmann H. Tolerance can be infectious. Nat Immunol 2008;9:1001-1003. [PubMed: 18711438]
- Collison LW, Pillai MR, Chaturvedi V, Vignali DA. Regulatory T cell suppression is potentiated by target T cells in a cell contact, IL-35- and IL-10-dependent manner. J Immunol 2009;182:6121– 6128. [PubMed: 19414764]
- D'Elia R, Behnke JM, Bradley JE, Else KJ. Regulatory T cells: a role in the control of helminthdriven intestinal pathology and worm survival. J Immunol 2009;182:2340–2348. [PubMed: 19201888]
- 32. Di Stasi A, et al. T lymphocytes coexpressing CCR4 and a chimeric antigen receptor targeting CD30 have improved homing and antitumor activity in a Hodgkin tumor model. Blood 2009;113:6392–6402. [PubMed: 19377047]
- Liyanage UK, et al. Prevalence of regulatory T cells is increased in peripheral blood and tumor microenvironment of patients with pancreas or breast adenocarcinoma. J Immunol 2002;169:2756–2761. [PubMed: 12193750]
- North RJ, Bursuker I. Generation and decay of the immune response to a progressive fibrosarcoma. I. Ly-1+2- suppressor T cells down-regulate the generation of Ly-1-2+ effector T cells. J Exp Med 1984;159:1295–1311. [PubMed: 6232335]
- 35. Olkhanud PB, et al. Breast cancer lung metastasis requires expression of chemokine receptor CCR4 and regulatory T cells. Cancer Res 2009;69:5996–6004. [PubMed: 19567680]
- Zou W. Immunosuppressive networks in the tumour environment and their therapeutic relevance. Nat Rev Cancer 2005;5:263–274. [PubMed: 15776005]
- Zou W. Regulatory T cells, tumour immunity and immunotherapy. Nat Rev Immunol 2006;6:295– 307. [PubMed: 16557261]
- Kocak E, et al. Combination therapy with anti-CTL antigen-4 and anti-4-1BB antibodies enhances cancer immunity and reduces autoimmunity. Cancer Res 2006;66:7276–7284. [PubMed: 16849577]
- Peggs KS, Quezada SA, Chambers CA, Korman AJ, Allison JP. Blockade of CTLA-4 on both effector and regulatory T cell compartments contributes to the antitumor activity of anti-CTLA-4 antibodies. J Exp Med 2009;206:1717–1725. [PubMed: 19581407]
- 40. Andersson J, et al. CD4+ FoxP3+ regulatory T cells confer infectious tolerance in a TGF-betadependent manner. J Exp Med 2008;205:1975–1981. [PubMed: 18710931]
- Allan SE, Song-Zhao GX, Abraham T, McMurchy AN, Levings MK. Inducible reprogramming of human T cells into Treg cells by a conditionally active form of FOXP3. Eur J Immunol 2008;38:3282–3289. [PubMed: 19039775]
- Bardel E, Larousserie F, Charlot-Rabiega P, Coulomb-L'Hermine A, Devergne O. Human CD4+ CD25+ Foxp3+ regulatory T cells do not constitutively express IL-35. J Immunol 2008;181:6898– 6905. [PubMed: 18981109]
- 43. Horwitz DA, et al. Regulatory T cells generated ex vivo as an approach for the therapy of autoimmune disease. Semin Immunol 2004;16:135–143. [PubMed: 15036237]
- 44. Schwartz RH. Models of T cell anergy: is there a common molecular mechanism? J Exp Med 1996;184:1–8. [PubMed: 8691122]



# Figure 1. Human IL-35 treatment of $\rm T_{conv}$ induces autocrine IL-35 expression and confers a regulatory phenotype

T<sub>conv</sub> purified by FACS from cord blood were treated with IL-35 or control at 25% of total culture volume for 9 days during activation ( $\alpha$ CD3/CD28, and IL-2). (a) RNA was extracted, cDNA generated and qPCR performed. Relative Ebi3 (left panel) and Il12a (right panel) mRNA expression. (b) Cytokine treated cells were re-purified and stained with an isotype or a p35-specific antibody following 4h activation with PMA and ionomycin. Intracellular staining of IL-35 was determined by FACS. (c) Microscopic analysis of p35 expression was similarly determined following 4h activation with PMA and ionomycin. Anti- p35 or isotype control antibodies (shown in red), phalloidin (shown in green) and DAPI (shown in blue). (d) Proliferation of cytokine treated cells was determined by [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine incorporation (e) T<sub>conv</sub> cells were mixed at indicated ratios (T<sub>conv</sub>: suppressor) with control or IL-35 treated T<sub>conv</sub>, hIL-2 and anti-CD3- + anti-CD28-coated latex beads for 9 days. Proliferation was determined by [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine incorporation. The mean of 4 representative experiments with similar cpm is shown. (f) Control or IL-35 treated T<sub>conv</sub> were cultured in the top chambers of a Transwell<sup>™</sup> culture plate as indicated. Freshly purified responder T<sub>conv</sub> were cultured in the bottom chamber of the 96-well flat bottom plates in medium containing hIL-2 and anti-CD3- + anti-CD28-coated latex beads. Top chambers were removed and [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine was added directly to the responder  $T_{conv}$  cells in the bottom chambers of the original Transwell<sup>TM</sup> plate for the final 8 h of the 9 day assay. (g)  $T_{conv}$  cells were activated in the presence of IL-35 at 25% of total culture volume. Following conversion with cytokines, suppression assays were supplemented with neutralizing IL-10, TGFB, or IL-35 to assess their requirement for indicated cytokines to mediate suppression. Counts per minute of T<sub>conv</sub> cells activated alone, in the absence of control or IL-35, were 20,000–125,000 (f) and 25,000 – 570,000 (g). Data represent the mean  $\pm$  SEM of (a)10 (b) 4, (c-g) independent experiments [\* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.005, \*\*\* p < 0.001, NS = not significant].



# Figure 2. Murine IL-35 treatment of $\rm T_{conv}$ converts cells to an IL-35 producing suppressive population

 $T_{conv}$  purified by FACS from C57BL/6, *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* or *Il10<sup>-/-</sup>* mice were treated with indicated cytokines for 72 h during activation (aCD3/CD28). (a) RNA was extracted and cDNA generated from  $T_{conv}$  following control or IL-35 treatment. Relative *Ebi3* (left panel) and Ill2a (right panel) mRNA expression. (b) T<sub>conv</sub> cells were cultured with control protein or IL-35 for 72 h. Cells were re-purified and cultured for an additional 24 h to facilitate IL-35 secretion. Culture supernatants from indicated cultures, or T<sub>conv</sub> and T<sub>reg</sub> as control, were immunoprecipitated with anti-p35 mAb, resolved by SDS-PAGE and probed with anti-Ebi3 mAb to identify IL-35 secretion. (c) Proliferative capacity, determined by [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine incorporation, of T<sub>conv</sub> treated with indicated cytokines for 72 h. (d) T<sub>conv</sub> cells were mixed at indicated ratios ( $T_{conv}$ : suppressor) with control or IL-35 treated  $T_{conv}$  and anti-CD3- + anti-CD28-coated latex beads for 72 h. Proliferation was determined by [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine incorporation (e) Control or IL-35 treated T<sub>conv</sub> were cultured in the top chambers of a Transwell<sup>™</sup> culture plate as indicated. Freshly purified wild-type responder T<sub>conv</sub> were cultured in the bottom chamber of the 96-well flat bottom plates in medium containing anti-CD3- + anti-CD28-coated latex beads. After 60 h in culture, top chambers were removed and  $[^{3}H]$ -thymidine was added directly to the responder  $T_{conv}$  cells in the bottom chambers of the original Transwell<sup>TM</sup> plate for the final 8 h of the 72 h assay. (f)  $T_{conv}$  from C57BL/6,  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  or  $II10^{-/-}$  mice were activated in the presence of IL-35 at 25% of total culture

volume, for 72 h to generate suppressive cells. Cells were re-purified and mixed at 4:1 ratio ( $T_{conv}$ : suppressor) and proliferation was determined. (g) Wild-type  $T_{conv}$  cells were activated in the presence of IL-35 at 25% of total culture volume. Following conversion with cytokines, suppression assays were supplemented with neutralizing IL-10, TGF $\beta$ , or IL-35 to assess their requirement for indicated cytokines to mediate suppression. Cells were cultured at a 4:1 ratio in suppression assays as described in e. (h) Suppressive capacity of IL-35 treated  $T_{conv}$  cells supplemented with titrations of isotype control or neutralizing IL-35 mAbs. Counts per minute of  $T_{conv}$  cells activated alone were 21,000–64,000 (e-h). Data represent the mean ± SEM of 4–8 independent experiments [\* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.005, \*\*\* p < 0.001, NS = not significant].



### Figure 3. iT<sub>R</sub>35 are suppressive in vivo

Control treated (iT<sub>R</sub>control), IL-35 treated (iT<sub>R</sub>35) or TGF $\beta$  treated (TGF $\beta$  iT<sub>R</sub>) cells were generated from FACS purified T<sub>conv</sub> from wild type C57BL/6 or *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* mice. (a-c) Cells were injected i.p. into 2–3 day old *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mice. Recovery from disease was monitored and reported by reduction in (a) clinical score (b) splenic CD4<sup>+</sup> T cell number as determined by flow cytometric analysis and (c) combined histological score from lungs, liver and skin (d) Representative histopathology images of ear pinna following T cell transfer into *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mice. Panel 1: Wild type mouse receiving no T<sub>regs</sub> is normal and has no inflammatory cells in the dermis. Panel 2: *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mouse receiving no T<sub>regs</sub> is thickened with a dense inflammatory cell infiltrate causing distortion of the cartilage. Panel 3: *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mouse receiving nT<sub>regs</sub> is mildly thickened with mild edema and a sparse inflammatory cell infiltrate. Panel 4: *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mouse receiving TGF $\beta$  iT<sub>R</sub> cells is moderately thickened with inflammatory cells separated by edema fluid. Panel 5: *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mouse receiving iT<sub>R</sub>control cells is markedly thickened with edema dispersed inflammatory cells causing distortion of the cartilage. Panel 6: *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mouse receiving iT<sub>R</sub>35 cells is

mildly thickened with edema and a mild inflammatory cell infiltrate. (e-j) iT<sub>R</sub> control or  $iT_R35$  were generated from FACS purified  $T_{conv}$  from C57BL/6 or *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* (Thy1.2) or B6.PL (Thy1.1) mice. (e) Homeostatic expansion was monitored by i.v. injection of Thy1.1<sup>+</sup> T<sub>conv</sub> cells alone or with Thy1.2<sup>+</sup> iT<sub>R</sub>control or iT<sub>R</sub>35 cells (as regulatory cells) into  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice. Seven days after transfer, splenic T cell numbers were determined by flow cytometry. Thy1.2<sup>+</sup> regulatory T cell numbers (e). Thy1.1<sup>+</sup> target T<sub>conv</sub> cell numbers (f). (g) EAE was induced by immunizing mice with MOG35-55 peptide in complete Freund's adjuvant followed by pertussis toxin administration.  $iT_R$  control,  $iT_R$  35 or  $nT_{reg}$  (10<sup>6</sup>) were transferred i.v. into C57BL/6 mice 12-18 hours prior to disease induction. Clinical disease was monitored daily. (h)  $Rag 1^{-/-}$  mice received indicated cells via the tail vein on day -1 of experiment. On day 0, all were injected with 120,000 B16 cells i.d. in the right flank. Tumor diameter was measured daily for 15 days and is reported as mm<sup>3</sup>. (i-j) IBD was induced by injecting  $Rag 1^{-/-}$  mice with T<sub>conv</sub> cells via the tail vein. After 3–4 weeks, mice developed clinical symptoms of IBD and were given iTR control or iTR35 cells. Percentage weight change after iT<sub>R</sub>control or iT<sub>R</sub>35 cell transfer (i). (j) Colonic histology scores of experimental mice. Data represent the mean  $\pm$  SEM of 8–12 mice per group from at least 2 independent experiments [\* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.005, \*\*\* p < 0.001, NS = not significant].



Figure 4. Comparative stability of iT<sub>R</sub>35 and TGF<sub>β</sub> iT<sub>R</sub> in vivo

iT<sub>R</sub>35 or TGFβ iT<sub>R</sub> were generated *in vitro* with CD45.2<sup>+</sup> T<sub>conv</sub> cells and adoptively transferred into CD45.1<sup>+</sup> C57BL/6 mice to assess stability. (a) Splenic iT<sub>R</sub> cell number was determined by flow cytometric analysis of CD45.2<sup>+</sup> cells. Percentage of total cells injected that were recovered 25 days post-transfer. (b) T<sub>conv</sub> cells were mixed at indicated ratios (T<sub>conv</sub>: suppressor) with either freshly generated iT<sub>R</sub> cells (pre-transfer) or iT<sub>R</sub> cells recovered after *in vivo* resting (post-transfer) and anti-CD3- + anti-CD28-coated latex beads for 72 h. Proliferation was determined by [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine incorporation. (c) Natural T<sub>regs</sub> or iT<sub>R</sub> were injected into 2–3 day old *Foxp3<sup>-/-</sup>* mice. Mice were monitored for clinical signs of sickness and scored accordingly. Mice obtaining a clinical score of 4 were considered moribund. Survival, based on longevity of mice, was significantly less in recipients of TGFβ iT<sub>R</sub> when compared to nT<sub>regs</sub>. Conversely, mice that received iT<sub>R</sub>35 survived significantly longer than those that received nT<sub>regs</sub> (p < 0.005). Counts per minute of T<sub>conv</sub> cells activated alone were 18,000–44,000 (b). Data represent the mean ± SEM of 5–12 mice per group from at least 2 independent experiments [\* p < 0.05, \*\*\* p < 0.005].



#### Figure 5. $T_{regs}$ generate i $T_R$ 35 in an IL-35- and IL-10-dependent manner

T<sub>conv</sub> were activated in the presence of T<sub>reg</sub> at a 4:1 ratio (responder: suppressor) for 72 h. (a) RNA was extracted and cDNA generated from resting or activated T<sub>conv</sub> cells or from  $T_{conv}$ :  $T_{reg}$  co-cultures (resorted based on differential Thy1 markers). *Ebi3* (a) and *Il12a* (b) expression of the populations indicated. (c) Following co-culture, suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> were repurified and cultured for an additional 24 h. Secretion of IL-35 was determined by IP/WB of culture supernatants and compared to that of freshly cultured T<sub>conv</sub> and T<sub>reg</sub>. (d) Following co-culture, suppressed  $T_{conv}$  were re-purified and activated ( $\alpha CD3/CD28$ ). Proliferative capacity was assayed by [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine incorporation. (e) The suppressive capacity of suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> upon fresh responder T<sub>conv</sub> cells was determined by [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine incorporation. (f) Anti-IL-10, anti-TGF\beta, or anti-IL-35 neutralizing antibodies were added to co-cultures to inhibit cytokine driven "conversion" into suppressed  $T_{conv}$  (top panel) or added in secondary proliferation assays to inhibit cytokine driven suppression of "function" (bottom panel). (g)  $T_{conv}$  cells alone or with C57BL/6, *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup>* suppressed  $T_{conv}$  (as regulatory cells) were injected into  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice. Seven days after transfer, splenic T cell numbers were determined by flow cytometry. (h) EAE was induced by immunizing mice with MOG35-55 peptide in complete Freund's adjuvant followed by pertussis toxin administration.  $1 \times 10^6$  suppressed T<sub>conv</sub> or natural T<sub>reg</sub> were transferred i.v. into C57BL/6 mice 12-18 hours prior to disease induction. Clinical disease was monitored daily. Clinical score was statistically significant between mice receiving saline control and T<sub>reg</sub> or

suppressed  $T_{conv}$  at days 16–18. Counts per minute of  $T_{conv}$  cells activated alone were 14,000–34,000 (e, f). Data represent the mean  $\pm$  SEM of 8–12 mice per group from at least 2 independent experiments [\* p < 0.05, \*\*\* p < 0.005, \*\*\* p < 0.001, NS = not significant].



## Figure 6. IL-35-producing Foxp3<sup>-</sup> iT<sub>R</sub>35 develop *in vivo*

*Foxp3<sup>gtp</sup>* mice were infected with *Trichuris muris*. CD4<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>-</sup> and CD4<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>+</sup> cells were purified from spleen, small intestine IEL and LPL, or large intestine IEL and LPL by FACS, RNA extracted and cDNA generated. Ebi3 (a) and Ill2a (b) expression of the populations indicated. (c, d, g, h) *Foxp3<sup>gfp</sup>* mice or *Ebi3<sup>-/-</sup> Foxp3<sup>gfp</sup>* were injected with 120,000 B16 cells i.d. on the right flank. Tumors and spleens were excised after 15–17 days, CD4<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>-</sup> and CD4<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>+</sup> cells, purified by FACS, RNA extracted and cDNA generated. Ebi3 (c) and Il12a (d) expression of the populations indicated. (e, f) Foxp3gfp mice or  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  Foxp $3^{gfp}$  were injected with  $2 \times 10^6$  MC38 cells subcutaneously on the right flank. Tumors and spleens were excised after 12 days, CD4<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>-</sup> and CD4<sup>+</sup>Foxp3<sup>+</sup> cells purified by FACS, RNA extracted and cDNA generated. Ebi3 (e) and Il12a (f) expression of the populations indicated. (g) Following B16 cell inoculation, purified T cells from the spleen or tumor were cultured for 24 h to allow secretion of IL-35. Culture supernatants from indicated cultures were immunoprecipitated with anti-p35 mAb, resolved by SDS-PAGE and probed with anti-Ebi3 mAb to identify IL-35 secretion. No IL-35 secretion was seen in either the splenic or tumor-infiltrating lymphocytes from  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  mice (g). Purified cells were assayed for regulatory capacity by mixing populations indicated at a 4:1 ratio with fresh responder  $T_{conv}$  cells for 72 h. Proliferation was determined by [<sup>3</sup>H]-thymidine incorporation. Counts per minute of T<sub>conv</sub> cells activated alone were 16,000–33,000 (h). Data represent the mean  $\pm$  SEM of 8–10 mice per group from 2–3 independent experiments (B16) and 1 experiment (MC38) [\* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.005, \*\*\* p < 0.001, NS = not significant].



Figure 7. The suppressive T cell milieu in the tumor microenvironment is largely due to iT<sub>R</sub>35  $Rag1^{-/-}$  mice were reconstituted with wild type C57BL/6 CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells and wild type or  $Ebi3^{-/-}$  T<sub>conv</sub> cells with or without wild type T<sub>regs</sub>. The following day, all mice were injected with 120,000 B16 cells i.d. on the right flank. Tumors were excised on day 15 post-inoculation to facilitate analysis of tumor infiltrating lymphocytes and tumor diameter reported as mm<sup>3</sup>. Data represent the mean ± SEM of 6–12 mice per group from at least 2 independent experiments [\* p < 0.05, \*\*\* p < 0.005, NS = not significant].