

Published in final edited form as:

Pain. 2011 March; 152(3): 477–480. doi:10.1016/j.pain.2010.11.017.

Yoga for Persistent Pain: New Findings and Directions for an Ancient Practice

Anava A. Wren, Melissa A. Wright, James W. Carson, and Francis J. Keefe

Currently, many clinicians treating persistent pain hear about the benefits of yoga from patients who frequent yoga centers. However, pain clinicians and researchers may not be aware of randomized controlled studies examining the efficacy of yoga for managing persistent pain. The purpose of this review is to highlight recent studies that shed light on the potential role that yoga can play in pain management for a range of conditions that can be chronically painful. The review is divided into three sections: 1) a description of the basic components of yoga-based protocols for pain, b) a review of nine of the thirteen randomized studies located that test yoga's efficacy for persistent pain, and c) a discussion of key clinical issues and future directions for yoga-based pain research and practice.

Yoga-Based Protocols for Pain Management

Texts indicate that yoga originated in India and has been practiced for approximately 4,000 years [15]. The term yoga is derived from the Sanskrit verb *yug*, which means to bind or join [6]. This refers to the overarching goal of yoga, which is to unite the mind and body in a way that promotes health. Although there are different schools of yoga, there are key elements that cut across most of these schools, including breathing exercises (*pranayama*), postures (*asanas*), and meditation (*dhyana*).

In popular practice, yoga is often construed as a physical exercise program. However, as applied to the management of persistent pain, yoga protocols are more comprehensive. Recent controlled studies of yoga for managing pain have been based on Hatha or Iyengar yoga. Studies that have used Hatha yoga have concentrated on relaxation techniques and gentle postures tailored to specific patient populations [8,9]. Typical Iyengar yoga protocols have included several basic elements such as physical postures designed for particular patient populations, props to cultivate awareness of body regions, breath control techniques, and home practice [10,19,24,25]. Additionally, many studies have modified these standard yoga protocols to create integrated programs containing practices such as hymns [21], neti pot [12], didactic presentations [2], and therapeutically oriented poses [20,27]. The format for delivering yoga protocols varies but typically involves hourly group sessions led by a trained yoga practitioner once or twice weekly, for approximately 12 weeks.

Controlled Studies of Yoga for Managing Persistent Pain

In one of the earliest controlled studies of a yoga-based protocol, Garfinkel and colleagues [10] assigned 42 patients having pain from carpal tunnel syndrome to either an Iyengar-based Hatha yoga protocol or a control condition (wrist splint). Yoga classes focused on training in postures and relaxation techniques adjusted for the patient population. When

compared to the control, patients receiving yoga showed significant reductions in pain and an increase in grip strength. Trends towards improvement were reported in motor nerve conduction time, Tinel sign, and sleep disturbance among the yoga group, though these were not significant. Garfinkel and colleagues [9] also conducted a controlled study with hand osteoarthritis (OA) patients showing that Iyengar-based Hatha yoga tailored to the patient population produced significant improvements in pain during activity, joint tenderness, and finger range of motion compared to the control. There were no significant differences in hand pain at rest, hand function, hand grip strength, or circumference of finger joints. Taken together, these studies [9,10] were important in stimulating research on yoga for pain control. Although studies appearing in the late 1990s and early years of 2000 supported the potential efficacy of yoga for managing pain conditions, these studies did not use randomized controlled designs [5,11,13].

Several recent randomized controlled studies have tested the efficacy of Iyengar and Hatha yoga for persistent low back pain. Persistent low back pain is a particularly appropriate model for yoga research because it is common and related to musculoskeletal problems (e.g., pain avoidant posturing) and psychosocial stress. Williams and colleagues [25] tailored their Iyengar yoga intervention to address back pain, providing specific protocol adjustments: a) patients practiced poses that used props to relieve tension and bring awareness to body regions, b) training progressed to lengthen, strengthen, and relax core muscle groups in the spine and pelvis, and c) training was provided over a graded series of movements involving twisting, bending, and stretching. Compared to an educational control, patients receiving yoga showed significant reductions in pain, functional disability, and pain medication at post-treatment and 3 month follow-up. No significant between group differences were reported in spinal range of motion, fear of movement, pain attitudes, selfefficacy, and coping strategies. In another study, Williams and colleagues [24] reported that Iyengar yoga, tailored to chronic low back pain patients, produced significant reductions in pain, physical disability, and depression. The yoga group demonstrated a higher success rate than controls in decreasing pain medication, though this was non-significant. At 6-month follow-up, these benefits were maintained with 68% of patients in the yoga condition reporting regular home practice with yoga techniques. In another low back pain study, Sherman and colleagues [20] found that Viniyoga, a therapeutically oriented yoga school, was significantly more effective than either aerobic exercise or an educational control in decreasing the bothersomeness of low back pain and pain-related disability. This study did not find any significant improvements on the SF-36. Additionally, Saper and colleagues [17] reported that a Hatha yoga program designed for low back pain significantly reduced pain scores, back-related function, and pain medications among a diverse population of patients with low back pain (83% racial/ethnic minority). No significant differences were reported on SF-36 scores.

Recently, Carson and colleagues [4] conducted a controlled study evaluating the efficacy of a tailored yoga program (Yoga of Awareness), derived from Kripalu yoga, for female fibromyalgia patients. Compared to the control, the yoga group showed significant improvements in fibromyalgia outcomes including pain, fatigue, vigor, mood, acceptance, pain catastrophizing, and other coping strategies. No significant between-group differences were reported on symptoms of tenderness, balance duration, poor sleep, and distancing and confrontation coping strategies.

The efficacy of yoga for pain control has also been tested among disease populations who have conditions that can be chronically painful. Pain symptoms are a primary complaint among end stage renal disease patients, which has led to a randomized yoga intervention for end stage renal disease-related pain, as well as other symptoms. Yurtkuran and colleagues modified a Hatha yoga protocol to address the fatigue and physical deconditioning

experienced by this chronically ill population (e.g., progressively increasing practice from 15 to 30 minutes, moving from chair-based yoga to standing postures) [27]. To enhance access to treatment, yoga training was provided in the hemodialysis clinic. Compared to standard care, yoga significantly decreased pain, fatigue, and sleep disturbance, and improved grip strength, cholesterol, urea, creatinine, and alkaline phosphatase levels, as well as erythrocyte and hematocrit counts. No significant between group changes in calcium, phosphorus, HDL-cholesterol or triglyceride levels were found. The authors suggest that yoga not only enhances pain management, but also has physical benefits similar to those seen with aerobic exercise.

Although interest in yoga for cancer-related pain management is growing, many studies are uncontrolled [3,6,16]. Recently, Carson and colleagues [2] conducted a randomized study of yoga for breast cancer survivors, based on Kripalu yoga (Yoga of Awareness). Compared to a wait-list control, a yoga intervention, which was tailored for breast cancer survivors, produced significant improvements in joint pain, symptom-related bother, fatigue, sleep disturbance, vigor, and hot flashes post-treatment. No significant between-group differences were reported for negative mood, relaxation, acceptance, or night sweats post-treatment. Interestingly, at 3 months follow-up, significant improvements were reported for patients in the yoga condition for negative mood, relaxation, and acceptance, in addition to the maintenance of previous treatment gains. Daily analyses showed that those who spent more time practicing yoga had the largest improvements in pain-related symptoms.

Of the four RCTs identified and not described in the text of this review, three had positive findings on pain-relevant outcomes [12,19,21] and one reported non-significant outcomes [8]. These studies were not included in the text because in three pain was not a primary outcome measure (e.g., measured via pain-related disability) [8,19,21], and in two the yoga intervention was less generalizable to clinical settings (e.g., met eight hours daily for one week) [12,21].

Key Issues

To date, most of the yoga-based studies have been conducted in populations of middle-aged, Caucasian women who are moderately disabled by chronic back pain. Yet, as we have seen, yoga protocols can be beneficial for patients from varying ethnic/racial backgrounds having disease-related pain and/or who are highly disabled. An advantage of yoga is that it can be modified to meet the specific needs of patients who are quite ill or limited in physical ability (e.g., by using props).

Referral sources for yoga are increasingly available. It is important that a yoga practitioner be certified (e.g., in the USA, certification is offered through the Yoga Alliance, www.yogaalliance.org), and have experience with patients' painful medical conditions. To ensure safety and minimize risk, the referring health care provider should inform the patient and yoga specialist about physical limitations. Insurance coverage for complementary medical services is increasing; however, many patients pay for inexpensive yoga classes in community settings.

Several mechanisms could potentially explain the benefits of yoga for persistent pain conditions. First, it has been speculated that yoga can produce physiological changes that alter the pain experience: decreases in sympathetic nervous system activity (e.g., decreases in heart rate) [22], reductions in inflammatory markers (e.g., tumor necrosis factor, interleukin-II, CRP) [1,14] and stress markers (e.g., cortisol) [26], and increases in flexibility, strength, circulation, and cardiorespiratory capacity [10,27].

Second, yoga may produce behavioral changes that influence pain. Yoga, often delivered in a group format, has the potential to reduce social isolation and foster social networks that reinforce improvements in activity. Yoga home practice sessions build regular physical activity into the day, something many patients avoid, and could effectively communicate to others that the patient can be active. Interestingly, at least one yoga study has shown that the duration of daily practice is related to same day improvements in pain, as well as next day improvements in pain, fatigue, invigoration, acceptance and relaxation [3].

Finally, research has demonstrated that yoga can produce psychological changes, such as increased awareness of mental and physical states [3,8], which may help patients better understand their pain. Yoga has also been shown to increase the frequency of positive emotions [23], which could potentially undo the physiological effects of negative emotions, broaden cognitive processes (e.g., taking a broader perspective on problems), and build physical (e.g., improved sense of health), social (e.g., improved social support) and psychological (e.g., optimism) resources [7]. Yoga may also increase pain acceptance—the willingness to experience pain and acknowledge negative thoughts and emotions [3], while remaining committed to pursuing valued goals. Finally, it is possible that yoga can lead to improvements in self-efficacy for pain control.

Future Research Directions

The patient samples in the majority of studies reviewed are predominantly Caucasian (86%), middle-aged (mean age=46.7), women (72%) of higher socioeconomic status. Future studies (e.g., work by Saper [18]) need to determine whether yoga protocols are efficacious for patients who come from more diverse backgrounds with respect to ethnicity, age, gender, and socioeconomic status. Research also needs to compare the efficacy of protocols based on specific schools of yoga and test whether protocols tailored to specific patient populations are more efficacious than those relying on standard approaches.

Future studies also need to compare yoga protocols to active treatment control conditions (e.g., aerobic exercise, cognitive-behavioral therapy). Additionally, research needs to examine the optimal dose of yoga treatment required to achieve improvements in pain and pain-related outcomes. Finally, long-term follow-up assessments are needed to assess the maintenance of treatment improvements.

Conclusions

Yoga for managing persistent pain is an ancient practice. A small, but growing body of randomized clinical trials suggests that yoga may have promise for persistent pain conditions. Methodologically rigorous research in this area is in its early stages and further research is needed. Yet, clinicians should be aware that yoga could be used as a tool to help patients better address the biological, social, and psychological aspects of persistent pain.

Acknowledgments

There are no conflicts of interest. Preparation of this manuscript was supported in part by NIH Grants R01 CA131148, P01 AR050245, R01 HL065503, R01 NR010777, R01 NS053759, R34 AR056727, R01 AR054626, and R01 CA122704.

References

 Carlson LE, Speca M, Patel KD, Goodey E. Mindfulness-based stress reduction in relation to quality of life, mood, symptoms of stress, and immune parameters in breast and prostate cancer outpatients. Psychosom Med 2003;65:571–81. [PubMed: 12883107]

 Carson JW, Carson KM, Porter LS, Keefe FJ, Seewaldt VL. Yoga of awareness program for menopausal symptoms in breast cancer survivors: results from a randomized trial. Support Care Cancer 2009;17:1301–9. [PubMed: 19214594]

- Carson JW, Carson KM, Porter LS, Keefe FJ, Shaw H, Miller JM. Yoga for women with metastatic breast cancer: results from a pilot study. J Pain Symptom Manage 2007;33:331–41. [PubMed: 17349503]
- Carson JW, Carson KM, Jones KD, Bennett RM, Wright CL, Mist SD. A pilot randomized controlled trial of the yoga of awareness program in the management of fibromyalgia. Pain 2010;151:530–9. [PubMed: 20946990]
- 5. Dash M, Telles S. Improvement in hand grip strength in normal volunteers and rheumatoid arthritis patients following yoga training. Indian J Physiol Pharmacol 2001;45:355–60. [PubMed: 11881576]
- DiStasio SA. Integrating yoga into cancer care. Clin J Oncol Nurs 2008;12:125–30. [PubMed: 18258582]
- Fredrickson BL, Tugade MM, Waugh CE, Larkin GR. What good are positive emotions in crises? A
 prospective study of resilience and emotions following the terrorist attacks on the united states on
 september 11th, 2001. J Pers Soc Psychol 2003;84:365–76. [PubMed: 12585810]
- 8. Galantino ML, Bzdewka TM, Eissler-Russo JL, Holbrook ML, Mogck EP, Geigle P, Farrar JT. The impact of modified hatha yoga on chronic low back pain: a pilot study. Altern Ther Health Med 2004;10:56–9. [PubMed: 15055095]
- Garfinkel MS, Schumacher HR Jr, Husain A, Levy M, Reshetar RA. Evaluation of a yoga based regimen for treatment of osteoarthritis of the hands. J Rheumatol 1994;21:2341–3. [PubMed: 7699639]
- Garfinkel MS, Singhal A, Katz WA, Allan DA, Reshetar R, Schumacher HR Jr. Yoga-based intervention for carpal tunnel syndrome: a randomized trial. JAMA 1998;280:1601–3. [PubMed: 9820263]
- 11. Greendale GA, McDivit A, Carpenter A, Seeger L, Huang MH. Yoga for women with hyperkyphosis: results of a pilot study. Am J Public Health 2002;92:1611–4. [PubMed: 12356608]
- John PJ, Sharma N, Sharma CM, Kankane A. Effectiveness of yoga therapy in the treatment of migraine without aura: a randomized controlled trial. Headache 2007;47:654–61. [PubMed: 17501846]
- Kolasinski SL, Garfinkel M, Tsai AG, Matz W, Van Dyke A, Schumacher HR. Iyengar yoga for treating symptoms of osteoarthritis of the knees: a pilot study. J Altern Complement Med 2005;11:689–93. [PubMed: 16131293]
- 14. Pullen PR, Nagamia SH, Mehta PK, Thompson WR, Benardot D, Hammoud R, Parrott JM, Sola S, Khan BV. Effects of yoga on inflammation and exercise capacity in patients with chronic heart failure. J Card Fail 2008;14:407–13. [PubMed: 18514933]
- 15. Riley D. Hatha yoga and the treatment of illness. Altern Ther Health Med 2004;10:20–1. [PubMed: 15055088]
- 16. Rosenbaum E, Gautier H, Fobair P, Neri E, Festa B, Hawn M, Andrews A, Hirshberger N, Selim S, Spiegel D. Cancer supportive care, improving the quality of life for cancer patients. A program evaluation report Support Care. Cancer 2004;12:293–301.
- 17. Saper RB, Eisenberg DM, Davis RB, Culpepper L, Phillips RS. Prevalence and patterns of adult yoga use in the united states: results of a national survey. Altern Ther Health Med 2004;10:44–9. [PubMed: 15055093]
- 18. Saper RB, Sherman KJ, Cullum-Dugan D, Davis RB, Phillips RS, Culpepper L. Yoga for chronic low back pain in a predominantly minority population: a pilot randomized controlled trial. Altern Ther Health Med 2009;15:18–27. [PubMed: 19943573]
- 19. Sareen S, Kumari V, Gajebasia KS, Gajebasia NK. Yoga: a tool for improving the quality of life in chronic pancreatitis. World J Gastroenterol 2007;13:391–7. [PubMed: 17230607]
- Sherman KJ, Cherkin DC, Erro J, Miglioretti DL, Deyo RA. Comparing yoga, exercise, and a selfcare book for chronic low back pain: a randomized, controlled trial. Ann Intern Med 2005;143:849–56. [PubMed: 16365466]

21. Tekur P, Singphow C, Nagendra HR, Raghuram N. Effect of short-term intensive yoga program on pain, functional disability and spinal flexibility in chronic low back pain: a randomized control study. J Altern Complement Med 2008;14:637–44. [PubMed: 18673078]

- 22. Telles S, Joshi M, Dash M, Raghuraj P, Naveen KV, Nagendra HR. An evaluation of the ability to voluntarily reduce the heart rate after a month of yoga practice. Integr Physiol Behav Sci 2004;39:119–25. [PubMed: 15759599]
- 23. Vadiraja HS, Rao MR, Nagarathna R, Nagendra HR, Rekha M, Vanitha N, Gopinath KS, Srinath BS, Vishweshwara MS, Madhavi YS, Ajaikumar BS, Bilimagga SR, Rao N. Effects of yoga program on quality of life and affect in early breast cancer patients undergoing adjuvant radiotherapy: a randomized controlled trial. Complement Ther Med 2009;17:274–80. [PubMed: 19942107]
- 24. Williams KA, Abildso C, Steinberg L, Doyle EJ, Epstein B, Smith D, Hobbs G, Gross R, Kelly G, Cooper L. Evaluation of the effectiveness and efficacy of iyengar yoga therapy on chronic low back pain. Spine 2009;34:2066–2076. [PubMed: 19701112]
- 25. Williams KA, Petronis J, Smith D, Goodrich D, Wu J, Ravi N, Doyle EJ, Juckett G, Kolar MM, Gross R, Steinberg L. Effect of iyengar yoga therapy for chronic low back pain. Pain 2005;115:107–117. [PubMed: 15836974]
- 26. Woolery A, Myers H, Sternlieb B, Zeltzer L. A yoga intervention for young adults with elevated symptoms of depression. Altern Ther Health Med 2004;10:60–3. [PubMed: 15055096]
- 27. Yurtkuran M, Alp A, Dilek K. A modified yoga-based exercise program in hemodialysis patients: a randomized controlled study. Complement Ther Med 2007;15:164–71. [PubMed: 17709061]

Wren et al.

Table 1

Characteristics of Included Studies

| Study | Design/Methods | Mean Age | Pain Population | Type of Yoga Intervention | Outcome | Outcome Measures | Significant Findings |
|------------------|----------------|----------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|---------|--|---|
| Garfinkel et al. | RCT | 49 | Carpel tunnel syndrome | Iyengar- based Hatha | • | Pain intensity | Yoga group improved more than |
| 1998 [10] | | | | Yoga | • | Grip strength | control in pain reduction and grip strength. |
| | | | | | • | Sleep disturbance | |
| | | | | | • | Phalen sign | |
| | | | | | • | Tinel sign | |
| | | | | | • | Median nerve motor/sensory conduction time | |
| Garfinkel et al. | RCT | 52-79* | Osteoarthritis of the hands | Iyengar- based Hatha | • | Hand pain | Yoga group improved more than |
| 1994 [9] | | | | Yoga | • | Hand function | control in pain during activity, joint tenderness, and finger range of |
| | | | | | • | Range of motion of finger joints | motion. |
| | | | | | • | Hand grip strength | |
| | | | | | • | Tenderness of finger joints | |
| | | | | | • | Circumference of finger joints | |
| Williams et al. | RCT | 48 | Chronic low back pain | Iyengar Yoga | • | Pain intensity | Yoga group showed greater |
| 2005 [25] | | | | | • | Functional disability | reductions in pain intensity, functional disability, and pain |
| | | | | | • | Pain medication usage | medication at post- treatment/3 month follow- up than control. |
| | | | | | • | Pain-related attitudes | 1 |
| | | | | | • | Pain-related behaviors | |
| | | | | | • | Spinal range of motion | |
| Williams et al. | RCT | 48 | Chronic low back pain | Iyengar Yoga | • | Pain intensity | Yoga group showed greater |
| 2009 [24] | | | | | • | Functional disability | reductions in pain, physical disability, and depression than |
| | | | | | • | Depression | control. |
| | | | | | • | Pain medication usage | |
| Sherman et al. | RCT | 44 | Chronic low back pain | Viniyoga | • | Pain-related disability | Yoga group showed greater |
| 2005 [20] | | | | | • | Bothersomeness of pain | reductions in pain-related disability |

Page 7

NIH-PA Author Manuscript

| Study | Design/Methods | Mean Age | Pain Population | Type of Yoga Intervention | Outcome Measures | feasures | Significant Findings |
|-------------------------------|----------------|----------|-------------------------|------------------------------|------------------|---|---|
| | | | | | • | Health status | and bothersome- ness of pain compared to control. |
| Saper et al. 2009 [18] | RCT | 44 | Chronic Iow back pain | Hatha Yoga | | Pain scores Back-related function Medication use Global improvement Quality of life | Yoga group had significant reductions in pain scores, backrelated function, and pain medications. |
| Carson et al. 2010 [4] | RCT | 54 | Fibromyalgia (FM) | Yoga of Awareness | | FM symptoms FM functional deficits Pain coping strategies | Yoga group improved more than control in FM outcomes: pain, fatigue, vigor, mood, acceptance, pain catastrophizing, and coping strategies. |
| Yurtkuran et al. 2007 [27] | RCT | 38 | Hemodialysis | Modified Hatha Yoga | • • • • | Pain intensity Fatigue Sleep disturbance Grip strength Biochemical variables | Yoga group improved more than control in pain, fatigue, sleep disturbance, grip strength, cholesterol, urea, creatinine, alkaline phosphatase levels, erythrocycte count, and hematocrit count. |
| Carson et al. 2009 [2] | RCT | 54 | Breast cancer survivors | Yoga of Awareness | | Hot flashes Joint pain Fatigue Negative mood Sleep disturbance Night sweats Symptom-related bother Relaxation Vigor | Yoga group improved more than control in joint pain, symptom-related bother, fatigue, sleep disturbance, vigor, and hot flashes post- treatment. |
| Sareen et al. 2007[19] | RCT | 50 | Chronic pancreatitis | Iyengar Yoga | • • • | Quality of life (including bodily pain items) Mood Stress | Yoga group improved more than control in overall quality of life, mood, and symptoms of stress. |

Wren et al.

| indings | Yoga group improved more than | | migraine, pain, medication use, | lucincy and intensity of the medication use, the pression. | pency and mensity of the medication use, lepression. | pency and mensity of the medication use, epression. | hency and mensity or in medication use, iepression. | hency and mensity or in medication use, epression. | migraine, pain, medication use, anxiety, and depression. No significant between-group | lepression. the between-group | preney and measury or peression. The pression. The peression has been between group. | perior and mensity of the medication use, lepression. I between-group mproved more than | migraine, pain, medication use, anxiety, and depression. No significant between-group differences. Yoga group improved more than control in pain-related disability and spinal flexibility. |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|--|--|---|---|--|--|--|---|---|---|
| Significant Findings | Yoga group imp | control in freque migraine, pain, 1 | | anxiety, and depression. | anxiety, and dep | anxiety, and dep | anxiety, and dep | anxiety, and dep | anxiety, and dep | anxiety, and dep | anxiety, and dep | anxiety, and dep No significant b differences. Yoga group imp | anxiety, and deprediction of the significant bet differences. Yoga group imprecontrol in pain-relessipinal flexibility. |
| Outcome Measures | Headache frequency | Migraine severity | | Pain | Pain Anxiety | Pain Anxiety Depression | Pain Anxiety Depression Medication usage | Pain Anxiety Depression Medication usage | Pain Anxiety Depression Medication usage Functional impairment | Pain Anxiety Depression Medication usage Functional impairment Pain-related disability | Pain Anxiety Depression Medication usage Functional impairment Pain-related disability Depression | Pain Anxiety Depression Medication usage Functional impairment Pain-related disability Depression Pain-related disability | Pain Anxiety Depression Medication usage Functional impairment Pain-related disability Depression Pain-related disability |
| Outcome | • | • | | • | • • | • • • | | | | | | | |
| Type of Yoga Intervention | Modified Yoga | Frogram (postures, breathing, neti pot) | | | | | | | Hatha Yoga | Hatha Yoga | Hatha Yoga | Hatha Yoga Integrated Approach to | Hatha Yoga Hatha Yoga Integrated Approach to Yoga Therapy (IAYT) |
| Pain Population | Migraine | | | | | | | | Chronic low back pain | Chronic low back pain | Chronic Iow back pain | Chronic Iow back pain Chronic Iow back pain | Chronic low back pain Chronic low back pain |
| Mean Age | 34 | | | - | | | | | 30-65* | 30-65* | 30-65 * | 30-65 * | 30–65* |
| Design/Methods Mean Age Pain | RCT | | | • | | | | | RCT | | | | |
| Study | John et al. | 2007 [12] | | | | | | | | | | | |

 $\stackrel{*}{\mbox{\scriptsize This}}$ This study did not include a mean age, thus an age range is provided.

Page 9