## By T. Petrie

INSTITUTE FOR DEFENSE ANALYSES, VON NEUMANN HALL, PRINCETON, NEW JERSEY

## Communicated by David Blackwell, January 9, 1967

These papers<sup>\*</sup> are statistically motivated; the content is mathematical. The motivation is this: Given is an  $s \times s$  stochastic matrix  $A = ((a_{ij}))$  and an  $s \times r$  stochastic matrix  $B = ((b_{jk}))$  where A generates a stationary Markov process  $\{X_i\}$  according to  $a_{ij} = P[X_{t+1} = j|X_t = i]$  and B generates a process  $\{Y_t\}$  described by  $P[Y_t = k|X_t = j] = b_{jk}$ , so if R is the set of integers 1, 2...r and  $R^{\infty} = \prod_{t=1}^{\infty} R_t$ ,  $R_t = R$  (a point  $Y \in R^{\infty}$  has coordinates  $Y_t$ ), then the matrices A and B define a measure  $P_{(A,B)}$  on  $R^{\infty}$ , for  $k_i \in R$ 

$$P_{(A,B)}\{Y_1 = k_1, Y_2 = k_2 \dots Y_n = k_n\} = \sum_{i_0=1, i_1, i_2 \dots i_n=1}^{s \dots s} a_{i_0} a_{i_0 i_1} b_{i_1 k_1} a_{i_1 i_2} b_{i_2 k_2} \dots a_{i_{n-1} i_n} b_{i_n k_n}$$

where  $\{a_{i_0}\}$  is the stationary absolute distribution for A. The resulting process  $\{Y_t\}$  is called a probabilistic function of the Markov process  $\{X_t\}$ . Let  $\Lambda_1$  be the space of  $s \times s$  ergodic stochastic matrices,  $\Lambda_2$  the space of  $s \times r$  stochastic matrices and  $\Pi = \Lambda_1 \times \Lambda_2$ . The above associates to  $\pi = (A, B) \epsilon \Pi$  and a stationary vector a for A a measure  $P_{\pi}$  on  $R^{\infty}$ .

The Problem.—Fix  $\pi_0 \in \Pi$  and let a sample  $Y_1, Y_2 \dots Y_n$  be generated according to the distribution  $P_{\pi_0}$ . From the sample  $Y \dots Y_n$  obtain an estimate  $\Pi_n(Y)$  of  $\pi_0$  so that  $\Pi_n(Y) \to \pi_0$  a.e.,  $P_{\pi_0}$ . Throughout this paper  $\pi_0$  is fixed and  $\pi$  varies in  $\Pi$ .

The Mathematics.—Part I (classification of equivalent processes) demonstrates that the problem has a solution in the following sense: Let  $M[\pi_0] = \{\pi \epsilon \Pi | P_{\pi} = P_{\pi_0} \text{ as measures on } R^{\infty} \}$ . Clearly the points of  $M[\pi_0]$  cannot be distinguished by any finite or infinite sample. The description of  $M[\pi_0]$  is crucial in our study. Let  $\mathfrak{C}_s$  be the symmetric group of degree *s* operating on the integers 1 through *s*.  $\mathfrak{C}_s$  acts on  $\Pi$  by  $\sigma(A,B) = (\sigma A,\sigma B), (\sigma A)_{ij} = a_{\sigma(i),\sigma(j)} (\sigma B)_{jk} = b_{\sigma(j)k}$  for  $\sigma \in \mathfrak{C}_s$ . Observe that  $P_{\sigma\pi} = P_{\pi}$  as measures on  $R^{\infty}$ . The main result of part I is

THEOREM 1. There is an open subset  $\Pi_0$  of  $\Pi$  of Euclidean measure 1 such that for  $\pi_0 \in \Pi_0, M[\pi_0] = \mathfrak{S}_s \pi_0$ , i.e.,  $\pi_0$  is distinguishable up to permutation by the measure  $P_{\pi_0}(\mathfrak{S}_s \pi_0 = \{\sigma \pi_0 | \sigma \in \mathfrak{S}_s\})$ .

Part II (limit theorems and statistical analysis) extends and generalizes the results of reference 1. For each n and each  $Y \in \mathbb{R}^{\infty}$  there is a function  $H_n[\pi, Y]$  on  $\Pi$  defined by  $H_n[\pi, Y] = \frac{1}{n} \log P_{\pi} \{Y_1, Y_2 \dots Y_n\}$ ; thus, each  $H_n[\pi, \ ]$  is a random variable on the probability space  $(\mathbb{R}^{\infty}, \mathbb{P}_{\pi_0})$ . The value  $H_n[\pi, Y]$  is a function on  $\Pi$ . These random variables hold the solution to our problem, as the following shows.

THEOREM 2.  $\lim H_n[\pi, Y] = H_{\pi_0}(\pi)$  exists a.e.,  $P_{\pi_0}$ .

THEOREM 3.  $H_{\pi_0}(\pi) \leq H_{\pi_0}(\pi_0)$  and  $H_{\pi_0}(\pi) = H_{\pi_0}(\pi_0)$  iff  $\pi \in M[\pi_0]$ . Define  $\Pi_n(Y) = \{\pi' \in \Pi | \pi' \text{ maximizes } H_n[\pi, Y] \}$ . THEOREM 4.  $\Pi_n(Y) \to M[\pi_0]$  a.e.,  $P_{\pi_0}$ .

Theorems 1 through 4 theoretically solve our problem. Note in particular the importance of the function  $H_{\pi 0}(\pi)$  in view of Theorems 1 and 3.

Part III (Morse theory) makes a further study of the function  $H_{\pi_0}(\pi)$  for  $\pi \epsilon \Pi_{\delta} =$ 

 $\{(A,B) \in \pi | a_{ij} \geq \delta, b_{jk} \geq \delta\}, \delta > 0$  and ties the theory together with the following theorem of reference 2:  $\exists$  a class of functions 3 on  $\Pi$  such that if  $f \in 3$ , there is a transformation  $\tau_f: \Pi \to \Pi$  with the property that  $f\tau_f(\pi) \geq f(\pi)$  and  $f\tau_f(\pi) = f(\pi)$ iff  $\pi$  is a critical point of f. The class 3 contains each  $H_n[\pi, Y]$ ; thus, a procedure which is naturally suggested for dealing with the problem is: Given  $Y_1 \dots Y_n$ , let  $f = H_n[\pi, Y]$  and take  $\Pi^n(\pi, Y) = \lim_{k \to \infty} \tau_f^k(\pi)$  for any  $\pi \in \Pi_{\delta}$ . (In great generality this limit exists; for complete validity let  $\Pi^n(\pi, Y)$  be the accumulation points of  $\{\tau_f^k(\pi)\}$ .) How good is this estimate of  $\pi_0$ ? The main theorem of part III answers

this with THEOREM 5. Let  $\pi_0 \in \Pi_0 \cap \Pi_{\delta}$ .  $\exists$  an open set  $U_{\pi_0}$  containing  $M[\pi_0]$  such that given  $\epsilon > 0$ ,  $\exists N(\epsilon) \supseteq P\{Y | \Pi^n(\pi', Y) \in M[\pi, \epsilon]\} > 1 - \epsilon$  for  $n > N(\epsilon)$ ,  $\forall \pi' \in U_{\pi_0}$ .

given  $\epsilon > 0$ ,  $\exists N(\epsilon) \supseteq P\{Y | \Pi^n(\pi', Y) \in M[\pi, \epsilon]\} > 1 - \epsilon$  for  $n > N(\epsilon)$ ,  $\forall \pi' \in U_{\pi \circ}$ .  $(M[\pi_0, \epsilon] \text{ is the set of points of } \Pi_{\delta} \text{ whose Euclidean distance from some point of } M[\pi_0]$ is less than  $\epsilon$ .)

The proof of Theorem 5 rests on a study of the critical points of  $H_{\pi \bullet}(\pi)$ , in particular,

THEOREM 6.  $H_{\pi \epsilon}(\pi)$  is an analytic function of the coordinates of  $\pi$  for  $\pi \in \Pi_{\delta}$ .

THEOREM 7. The critical point set  $M'[\pi_0]$  of  $H_{\pi_0}(\pi)$  (as a function of  $\pi$ ) is an analytic variety, and the points of  $M'[\pi_0]$  which are absolute maxima, i.e., the points of  $M[\pi_0]$ , are isolated critical points if  $\pi_0 \in \Pi_0 \cap \Pi_{\delta}$ .

Conjecture.—All critical points of  $H_{\tau_0}(\pi)$  are nondegenerate for  $\pi_0 \in \Pi_0 \cap \Pi_{\delta}$ , and the critical points which are local maxima are precisely the elements of  $M[\pi_0]$ .

Corollary of Conjecture.—Theorem 5 holds for any  $\pi' \in \Pi_{\delta}$ .

\* Petrie, T., "Probabilistic functions of finite-state Markov chains: I. Classification of equivalent processes; II. Limit theorems and statistical analysis; III. Morse theory," to appear.

<sup>1</sup> Baum, L. E., and T. Petrie, "Statistical inference for probabilistic functions of finite-state Markov chains," Ann. Math. Stat., to appear.

<sup>2</sup> Baum, L. E., and J. A. Eagon, "An inequality with applications to statistical estimations for probabilistic functions of Markov processes and to a model for ecology," *Bull. Am. Math. Soc.*, to appear.

<sup>3</sup> Billingsley, Patrick, Statistical Inference for Markov Processes (Chicago, Illinois: University of Chicago Press, 1961).