**RESEARCH PAPER** 



## Effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on phosphorus nutrition of phosphatedeficient *Arabidopsis thaliana* (L.) Heynh under different nitrogen forms

## Yaofang Niu<sup>1,\*</sup>, Rushan Chai<sup>1,\*</sup>, Huifen Dong<sup>1</sup>, Huan Wang<sup>2</sup>, Caixian Tang<sup>3</sup> and Yongsong Zhang<sup>1,2,†</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Ministry of Education Key Laboratory of Environmental Remediation and Ecosystem Health, College of Environmental and Resource Sciences, Zhejiang University, Hangzhou 310058, China

<sup>2</sup> Zhejiang Provincial Key Laboratory of Subtropical Soil and Plant Nutrition, College of Environmental and Resource Sciences, Zhejiang University, Hangzhou 310058, China

<sup>3</sup> Department of Agricultural Sciences/Centre for AgriBioscience, La Trobe University, Melbourne Campus, Vic 3086, Australia

\* These authors contributed equally to this work.

<sup>†</sup> To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: yszhang@zju.edu.cn

Received 4 September 2012; Revised 29 October 2012; Accepted 30 October 2012

## Abstract

Phosphorus (P) nutrition is always a key issue regarding plants responses to elevated  $CO_2$ . Yet it is unclear of how elevated  $CO_2$  affects P uptake under different nitrogen (N) forms. This study investigated the influence of elevated  $CO_2$  (800 µl  $\Gamma^1$ ) on P uptake and utilization by *Arabidopsis* grown in pH-buffered phosphate (P)-deficient (0.5 µM) hydroponic culture supplying with 2mM nitrate (NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) or ammonium (NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>). After 7 d treatment, elevated  $CO_2$  enhanced the biomass production of both NO<sub>3</sub><sup>--</sup> and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants but decreased the P amount absorbed per weight of roots and the P concentration in the shoots of plants supplied with NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>. In comparison, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased the amount of P absorbed per weight of roots, as well as the P concentration in plants and alleviated P deficiency-induced symptoms of plants supplied with NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> also increased the root/shoot ratio, total root surface area, and acid phosphatase activity, and enhanced the expression of genes or transcriptional factors involving in P uptake, allocation and remobilization in P deficient plants. Furthermore, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased the nitric oxide (NO) level in roots of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>--</sup> fed plants but decreased it in NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants. NO scavenger 2-(4-carboxyphenyl)-4,4,5,5-tetramethylimidazoline-1-oxyl-3-oxide (cPTIO) inhibited plant P acquisition by roots under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Considering all of these findings, this study concluded that a combination of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>--</sup> nutrition can induce a set of plant adaptive strategies to improve P status from P-deficient soluble sources and that NO may be a signalling molecule that controls these processes.

**Key words:** ammonium, anthocyanin, *atnos1*, elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, nitrate, nitrate reductase, nitric oxide, nitric oxide synthase, *nr*, phosphorus acquisition, phosphate deficiency.

## Introduction

Concentrations of atmospheric  $CO_2$  have risen from about 270 µl l<sup>-1</sup> in pre-industrial times to over 380 µl l<sup>-1</sup> at present, and are predicted to reach between 530 and 970 µl l<sup>-1</sup> by the

end of this century (IPCC, 2007). It has been demonstrated that increasing atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration has a profound impact on the growth and development of plants.

Abbreviations: APase, acid phosphatase; cPTIO, 2-(4-carboxyphenyl)-4,4,5,5-tetramethylimidazoline-1-oxyl-3-oxide; DAF-FM DA, diaminofluorescein-FM diacetate; N, nitrogen; NO, nitric oxide; NOS, nitric oxide synthase; NR, nitrate reductase; P, phosphorus; SNP, sodium nitroprusside; *AtPHR1, PHOSPHATE STARVATION RESPONSE 1; AtPHT1, PHOSPHATE TRANSPORTER 1; AtPHO1, PHOSPHATE 1; AtPHO2, PHOSPHATE 2. AtPAP2, PURPLE ACID PHOSPHATASE 2.* © 2012 The Authors.

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/ by-nc/2.0/uk/) which permits unrestricted noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Many studies have investigated plant responses to elevated  $CO_2$  on ecosystem, community, population, physiological, and molecular scales (Gibeaut *et al.*, 2001; Teng *et al.*, 2006; Jin *et al.*, 2009; Niu *et al.*, 2011*a*). However, relatively little information exists on the effects of elevated  $CO_2$  on nutrition acquisition and metabolism. Previous studies have shown that elevated  $CO_2$  generally stimulates the rates of carboxylation but suppresses the rate of oxygenation of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) in C3 plants, thereby increasing plant growth and crop yield (Stitt *et al.*, 1991; Drake *et al.*, 1997). However, sustaining these increased rates requires increased nutrient uptake. Consequently, the role of nutrition availability is a key unresolved issue regarding plant responses to elevated  $CO_2$ .

Phosphorus is an essential element for plant growth and development. It plays important roles in energy transfer, signal transduction, photosynthesis, enzyme activation/inactivation, membrane synthesis and stability, and respiration, and is a structural component of nucleic acids and phospholipids (Abel et al., 2002; Vance et al., 2003; Chiou and Lin, 2011; Péret et al., 2011). However, the low solubility and high sorption capacity of phosphate in soils make it relatively unavailable to plant roots. In soil solution, concentrations of available P (mainly H<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> and HPO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>) are generally less than 10 µM, which is well below the critical level needed for the optimal performance of crops (Schachtman et al., 1998; Batjes, 1997). The problem of P deficiency is mitigated by the application of concentrated fertilizers that provide soluble P to plants. This practice, however, is inherently inefficient due to chemical immobilization and surface runoff of P (Abel et al., 2002). Hence, low P availability is one of the major growth-limiting factors for plants in many natural and agricultural ecosystems (Barber et al., 1963; Raghothama, 1999).

When soil phosphorus availability is low, phosphorus uptake is increased by elevated CO<sub>2</sub>; however, higher foliar phosphorus concentrations are also required to realize the maximum growth potential at elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Conroy et al., 1990). Although the absolute increase in growth is greatest at high nutrient availability, relatively large gains in productivity can also be achieved at lower nutrient availability (Conroy et al., 1992). Notably, P deficiency reduces the assimilation of  $NO_3^{-}$  into the proteins, which might cause negative feedback on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> influx and/or stimulate NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> efflux (Schjørring, 1986). Therefore, it seems that, under conditions of nutrition deficiency and elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, plants sense changes in nutrition availability and trigger a set of plant adaptive responses to increase nutrition uptake and recycling. Numerous studies indicate that plants enhance P acquisition and mobilization to cope with low P availability by inducing a series of biochemical, physiological, and molecular adaptation strategies (Raghothama, 1999; Mukatira et al., 2001; Abel et al., 2002; Rubio et al., 2009; Ramaekers et al., 2010; Péret et al., 2011; Jin et al., 2012; Veneklaas et al., 2012). However, it is unclear how plants sense and respond to P deficiency under conditions of elevated  $CO_2$ .

Nitrogen (N) has been the centre of attention not only because it is the primary limiting nutrition in most temperate ecosystems, but also because the form of N supply can modify the response of plant growth to nutrition acquisition and elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. It has been reported that N forms  $(NO_3^{-} versus NH_4^{+})$  can lead to contrasting responses of plant growth and metabolism to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. For example, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> uptake and nitrate reductase activity when tobacco was fed with NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> but increased  $NH_4^+$  uptake and inhibited nitrate reductase activity with an NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> supply (Matt et al., 2001). Likewise, under elevated  $CO_2$ ,  $NH_4^+$ -fed wheat showed greater increases in leaf area and smaller decreases in shoot protein concentration than NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants (Bloom et al., 2002, 2010). Pharmacological experiments and studies of mutants with low activity of NIA (encoding nitrate reductase) showed that nitric oxide (NO) production was induced by NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Gojon et al., 1998), but was inhibited by ammonium, glutamine, or related downstream products of nitrate assimilation (Gojon et al., 1998). Recently, Carlisle et al. (2012) reported that both CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and N form strongly affected biomass production in hydroponically grown wheat, as well as nutrient concentrations in above- and below-ground tissues. Consequently, these differences between  $NO_3^-$  and  $NH_4^+$ nutrition led us to investigate how N form regulates the responses of P homeostasis of plants grown under elevated  $CO_2$ . Therefore, the aim of this study was to investigate the interactive effects of N form and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on plant P uptake and utilization in a P-deficient medium. Arabidopsis was used as the test plant.

## Materials and methods

#### Plant material and growth conditions

Seeds of Arabidopsis thaliana wild-type ecotype and mutants nr, AT1G77760 and AT1G37130 locus (Wang et al., 2004) and atnos1, AT3G47450 locus (Guo et al., 2003), were surface-sterilized, and germinated on Petri plates containing 0.8% agar medium supplemented with one-fifth-strength nutrition solution (Niu *et al.*, 2011*a*). After 7 d, seedlings of uniform size were transferred to 1.5 ml Eppendorf tubes whose bottoms were cut about 0.7 cm from the bottom to allow root growth into the nutrition solution. The tubes were inserted in holes of plastic boxes containing 200 ml of a half-strength nutrition solution, and plants were grown for 14 d. Then, each seedling was transferred to each pot containing 300 ml of nutrition solution. The composition  $(\mu M)$  of the nutrition solution was as follows: 1500 KNO<sub>3</sub>, 500 MgSO<sub>4</sub>, 1000 CaCl<sub>2</sub>, 500 NaH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>, 250 (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, 10 H<sub>3</sub>BO<sub>3</sub>, 0.5 MnSO<sub>4</sub>, 0.5 ZnSO<sub>4</sub>, 0.1 CuSO<sub>4</sub>, 0.1 (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>6</sub>Mo<sub>7</sub>O<sub>24</sub>, and 25 Fe-EDTA (Hoagland and Arnon, 1938). The nutrition solution was renewed every 3 d and its pH was adjusted daily to 6.0 using 1 M NaOH. All plants were grown in controlled-environment growth chambers (Conviron E7/2, Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada) with a humidity of 80%, a daily cycle of 22 °C/10h day and 20 °C/14h night. The daytime light intensity was 120 µmol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. At least eight independent replicates were used for each treatment.

After plants were further grown in pots for 14 d, treatments commenced. Plants were grown in chambers with a CO<sub>2</sub> concentration of either  $350\pm50$  (ambient) or  $800\pm50 \ \mu l \ l^{-1}$  (elevated CO<sub>2</sub>). Meanwhile, N and P treatments were initiated. One set of plants were fully supplied with 2 mM NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> as KNO<sub>3</sub>, while the other was fully supplied with 2 mM NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> in each CO<sub>2</sub> treatment. For the treatment of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> as the sole N source, 1 mM (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and 1 mM K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> were added. The low-P treatment had 0.5  $\mu$ M NaH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>. The solution pH was buffered with 2 mM HEPES at pH 6.8 to minimize pH change, and was adjusted daily to 6.8 using 1 M NaOH. The treatment solutions were renewed every 2 d.

The NO-related treatments on wild-type plants were also initiated as follows: (i) ambient treatment: plants were grown continuously under ambient CO<sub>2</sub>; (ii) elevated CO<sub>2</sub> treatment: plants were transferred to a chamber with a CO<sub>2</sub> concentration of  $800 \pm 50 \,\mu l l^{-1}$ ; (iii) ambient+sodium nitroprusside (SNP) treatment: plants were transferred to the nutrition solution containing 100  $\mu$ M SNP under ambient CO<sub>2</sub>; and (iv) elevated CO<sub>2</sub>+2-(4-carboxyphenyl)-4,4,5,5-tetramethylimidazoline-1-oxyl-3-oxide (cPTIO) treatment: plants were transferred to the nutrition solution containing 100  $\mu$ M cPTIO under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>.

#### Analysis of total P in plant tissue

After 7 d treatment with ambient or elevated  $CO_2$ , plants from various treatments were harvested, washed thoroughly with deionized water, divided into shoots and roots, and dried in an oven at 75 °C for 1 d. The samples were then weighed, digested in sulfuric acid/hydrogen peroxide, and analysed for total P concentration using the vanadium-molyb-denum blue photometric method. The 'P absorbed per unit weight of roots' was calculated as the total amount of P per plant/root dry weight.

#### Chlorophyll concentration in leaves

After 7 d treatment, a portable chlorophyll meter (SPAD-502, Minolta, Japan) was used to measure chlorophyll content (Jin *et al.*, 2009). Three leaves were selected randomly from each treatment and two SPAD readings were recorded for each leaf, avoiding the main veins during measurement.

#### Anthocyanins

Total anthocyanins in leaves were extracted and determined as described by Hodges *et al.* (1999) with minor modifications. Approximately 0.1 g of fresh leaves was homogenized in 3 ml of methanol-1% HCl. Samples were centrifuged and 1 ml of the supernatant appropriately diluted in methanol-1% HCl was used for analysis. The difference in absorbance at 536 and 600 nm was used to calculate total anthocyanin content. Results were expressed as cyanidin 3-glucoside equivalents (mmol  $g^{-1}$  of fresh weight) using an extinction coefficient of 0.449 mol  $l^{-1}$  at 536 nm (Fiorani *et al.*, 2005).

#### Root morphology

After 7 d treatment, the root parameters of individual plants were measured using a root analysis instrument (WinRHIZO, Regent, Canada). The number and length of root hairs in each segment were measured using light microscopy with differential interference contrast optics. Micrographs were recorded on a CCD camera (Nikon Eclipse E600, Melville, NY, USA).

#### Activity of acid phosphatases (APases)

The activity of APases in shoots and roots was determined according to the method of McLachlan et al. (1987) with minor modifications. After 7 d in low-P treatment, the seedlings were washed thoroughly with deionized water, divided into shoots and roots, weighed, and then chilled immediately on ice. About 0.1-0.2 g of fresh samples was frozen with liquid nitrogen and homogenized in a cold mortar, and the powder was macerated with 5 ml of extraction buffer (0.2 M glacial acetic acidsodium acetate buffer, pH 5.8). The extract was centrifuged at 27 000g at 4 °C for 10 min, and the supernatant was used for an assay of APase activity. APase activity was determined by measuring enzyme activity in extraction buffer. Briefly, the APase reaction mixture contained 0.05 ml of enzyme extract, 0.45 ml of buffer solution and 4.5 ml of 5 M p-nitrophenyl phosphate. All APase reaction mixtures were incubated at 30 °C for 30 min in the dark. The reaction mixtures were stopped by the addition of 2ml of 2M NaOH. After this, the concentration of p-nitrophenol in the APase reaction mixtures was determined in a spectrophotometer at 405 nm. The APase activity was expressed as mol substrate hydrolysed g<sup>-1</sup> of fresh weight min<sup>-1</sup>.

#### In situ measurement of NO in the root

NO was imaged using diaminofluorescein-FM diacetate (DAF-FM DA) and epifluorescence microscopy. DAF-FM DA has been used successfully to detect NO production in both plants and animals. Roots were loaded with 5  $\mu$ M DAF-FM DA in 20 mM HEPES-NaOH buffer (pH 7.4) for 30 min, washed three times in fresh buffer and observed under a microscope (Nikon Eclipse E600, Nikon; excitation 488 nm, emission 495–575 nm). A 100 W high-pressure mercury-vapour lamp was used as a light source (HB-10103AF-Hg, Nikon). Fifteen roots of each treatment were measured each time. The signal intensities of green fluorescence in the images of the root tip and young root-hair zone were quantified using Image J.

#### Determination of nitric oxide synthase (NOS) activity

The activity of NOS was determined as described by Tian et al. (2007) with some modifications. The activity of NOS was determined with an NOS assay kit (Beyotime, Haimen, China). Briefly, 0.1 g of roots was frozen in liquid nitrogen and ground to a fine powder. The powder was homogenized in 1 ml of extraction buffer containing 100 mM HEPES-KOH (pH 7.5), 1 mM EDTA, 10% glycerol, 5 mM dithiothreitol, 0.1% Triton X-100, 0.5 mM phenylmethylsulfonyl, 20 µM flavin adenine dinucleotide, 25 µM leupeptin, 5 µM Na<sub>2</sub>MoO<sub>4</sub>, and 1% polyvinylpyrrolidone. The contents were centrifuged at 13 000g for 20 min at 4 °C and 0.2 ml of clear supernatant was then added to 0.1 ml of assay mixture (containing NADPH, L-arginine, NOS assay buffer, and DAF-FM DA) and reacted at 37 °C in the dark for 1 h. The NO content was detected under a microscope as described above. The fluorescence intensity was expressed as colour level on a scale ranging from 0 to 255, and the fluorescence intensity was quantified by using Image J. Data are presented as the mean of fluorescence intensity relative to the control treatment. The control treatment was the plant grown in ambient CO<sub>2</sub>.

#### Determination of maximum nitrate reductase (NR) activity

The activity of maximum NR was determined as described by Tian *et al.* (2007) with some modifications. Briefly, a total of 0.2 ml of clear supernatant prepared as described above was added into 0.4 ml of pre-warmed assay buffer containing 100 mM HEPES-KOH (pH 7.5), 5 mM KNO<sub>3</sub>, and 0.25 mM NADPH. The mixed solution was reacted at 30 °C for 1 h, and the reaction was stopped by adding zinc acetate. The nitrite produced was measured colorimetrically at 540 nm by adding 1 ml of 1% sulfanilamide in 3 M HCl plus 1 ml of 0.2% *N*-(1-naphthyl) ethylenediamine.

#### Quantitative PCR analysis

Total RNA was extracted using RNA iso Plus (Takara, Otsu, Shiga, Japan) from about 70 mg of fresh root tissues. At least five plants were used for extraction. All RNA samples were checked for DNA contamination before cDNA synthesis. cDNA was synthesized, and possible residual genomic DNA contamination was verified as described by us previously (Niu et al., 2011a). The mRNA levels of the genes PHOSPHATE STARVATION RESPONSE 1 (AtPHR1), PHOSPHATE TRANSPORTER 1 (AtPHT1), PHOSPHATE 1 (AtPHO1), PHOSPHATE 2 (AtPHO2), and PURPLE ACID PHOSPHATASE 2 (AtPAP2) were detected using a SYBR Green RT-PCR kit (Takara) with the following pairs of gene-specific primers: AtPHR1, forward: 5'-ACAGCAATAACGGAACGGGCAAG-3' and reverse: 5'-GCTCTTTCACTACCGCCAAGACTG-3'; AtPHT1, forward: 5'-GCCAAGGTAGACGCAGGATA-3' and reverse: 5'-AACCTCAG CCTCACCAGAGA-3'; AtPHO1, forward: 5'-TACGCGAGAGAAAA ACAACGA-3' and reverse: 5'-TTCCGGAGAACCAAATTGTC-3'; AtPHO2, forward: 5'- TTTTACACAAGCCACCAAAGC-3' and reverse: 5'-TCACGAGCATGTCCAACAA-3'; AtPAP2, forward: 5'-CATCAAGTTCCTTTGAGAGC-3' and reverse: 5'-TTGGACCGG TGTTGTAGGAG-3'.

Real-time PCR was carried out similar to as described by Niu *et al.* (2011*a*). A pair of primers for the housekeeping gene *UBQ10* (forward: 5'-GGTTCGTACCTTTGTCCAAGCA-3', reverse: 5'-CCTTCGTTA

AACCAAGCTCAGTATC-3') was used for a control reference gene for the PCR (Gan *et al.*, 2006). Melting-curve analysis and gel electrophoresis of the PCR products were used to confirm the absence of non-specific amplification products. Relative expression levels were calculated by subtracting the threshold cycle ( $C_t$ ) values for *UBQ10* from those of the target gene (to give  $\Delta C_t$ ) and then calculating  $2^{-\Delta Ct}$ , where  $C_t$  was the cycle number at which the fluorescence rose above the set threshold of the quantitative PCR.

#### Statistical analyses

All statistical analyses were conducted with DPS software (Stirling Technologies Inc., China). Means were compared using Student's *t*-test or Fisher's least significant difference test at P=0.05 in all cases.

## Results

## Plant growth and P uptake in low-P culture

After 7 d growth in ambient  $CO_2$  and P-deficient medium containing  $NO_3^-$  supplement as the sole N source, *Arabidopsis* leaves were dark green with a SPAD reading of 33. By comparison, the leaves of plants grown under the same nutrition conditions but with elevated  $CO_2$  were a normal green colour (Fig. 1a) with SPAD readings of 26 (see Supplementary Fig. S2a at *JXB* online). Elevated  $CO_2$  decreased the concentration of anthocyanins in leaves of  $NO_3^-$ -supplied plants (see Supplementary Fig. S3a at *JXB* online), indicating that elevated  $CO_2$  alleviated the P-deficiency-induced symptoms of the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-supplied plants. However, with a supply of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> as the sole N source, plants grown in the low-P solution had a similar appearance under both ambient and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> treatments (Fig. 1a). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> did not change the concentrations of chlorophyll and anthocyanins (Supplementary Figs S2a and S3a). Furthermore, ammonium toxicity was not evident in the NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants.

Elevated  $CO_2$  enhanced shoot growth exclusively under  $NH_4^+$  nutrition (Fig. 1b), whereas it enhanced root growth under  $NO_3^-$  nutrition (Fig. 1c). Elevated  $CO_2$  decreased the P concentration in shoots by 27% but did not alter it in the roots of  $NH_4^+$ -supplied plants. However, elevated  $CO_2$  increased the P concentration by 32 and 21%, respectively, in the shoots and roots of  $NO_3^-$ -fed plants (Fig. 1d, e). Meanwhile, elevated  $CO_2$  increased the amount of P absorbed per unit weight of roots of  $NO_3^-$ -fed plants by 56% but decreased that of  $NH_4^+$ -fed plants by 33% (Fig. 1g), indicating that  $NO_3^-$  nutrition facilitates P uptake in roots.

After 7 d growth in P-adequate medium with either N source, the leaves were a normal green colour (data not shown).  $CO_2$  treatment did not affect the concentration of anthocyanins in leaves, but  $NH_4^+$  supply significantly increased SPAD readings (Supplementary Figs S2b and S3b). Elevated  $CO_2$  increased biomass production (Supplementary Fig. S1a, b), but decreased the P concentration and the amount of P absorbed per weight of roots,



**Fig. 1.** Images (a), fresh biomass production of shoots (b) and roots (c), concentration of P in shoots (d) and roots (e), total P content (f), and amount of P absorbed per weight of roots (g) of 5-week-old wild-type *Arabidopsis* grown for 7 d in P-deficient nutrition solutions with  $NO_3^-$  or  $NH_4^+$  exposed to ambient  $CO_2$  ( $350 \pm 50 \ \mu l \ l^{-1}$ ) or elevated  $CO_2$  ( $800 \pm 50 \ \mu l \ l^{-1}$ ). Data are means  $\pm SD$  (n=5). Asterisks indicate that the mean values are significantly different between the ambient and elevated  $CO_2$  treatments (P < 0.05). DW, dry weight.

with the decrease being greater in the  $NO_3^-$  than in the  $NH_4^+$  treatment (Fig. S1c, d).

## Physiological and morphological responses to P deficiency

Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> greatly enhanced the number of lateral roots in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-supplied plants but restrained it in the NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-supplied plants (Fig. 2a). The root/shoot ratio of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants was greater and that of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants was lower under elevated compared with ambient CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 2b). Furthermore, compared with ambient CO<sub>2</sub>, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased the total root surface area and root/shoot ratio of the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-supplied plants but not that of the NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-supplied plants (Fig. 2b). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> did not affect the length or density of root hairs of plants grown in either N treatment (data not shown).

Another general response of plants to P starvation is the enhanced activity of APases. APase activity in both the shoots and roots of  $NH_4^+$ -supplied plants was similar between the ambient and elevated  $CO_2$  treatments (Fig. 3a, b). However, elevated  $CO_2$  strongly increased APase activity in the shoots and roots of  $NO_3^-$ -fed plants (Fig. 3a, b).

## Expressions of genes involved in P uptake, translocation, and allocation in P-deficient plants

Increased expression of genes involved in P uptake, transport, allocation, and remobilization is a significant adaptive response of plants to facilitate external P acquisition and internal P utilization under P-limited conditions (Rubio *et al.*, 2001; Vance *et al.*, 2003; Chiou and Lin, 2011). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> enhanced the expression of the P-uptake gene AtPHRI and the P-transport gene AtPHTI; their expression in shoots were increased by 8-fold and 3.7-fold, respectively (Fig. 4a–d). By contrast, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> did not change the expression of AtPHRI and AtPHTI in the roots of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants, and decreased their expression in the shoots (Fig. 4a–d).

In order to observe the allocation and retranslocation of internal P between shoots and roots, the expression of *AtPHO1* and *AtPHO2* was analysed. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased *AtPHO1* expression in the shoots and roots of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-supplied plants by 2.6-fold and 32%, respectively. In comparison, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased *AtPHO1* expression in the shoots by 4.7fold but decreased it by 34% in the roots of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants (Fig. 4e, f). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased the expression of *AtPHO2* by 8.8-fold in the shoots but decreased it by 76% in the roots of



**Fig. 2.** Root morphology (a), and root length, number of root tips, root surface area, and root/shoot ratio (b) of 5-week-old wildtype *Arabidopsis* grown for 7 d in P-deficient nutrition solutions containing  $NO_3^-$  or  $NH_4^+$  exposed to ambient  $CO_2$  ( $350 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) or elevated  $CO_2$  ( $800 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ). Data are means  $\pm SD$  (*n*=8) of two independent experiments. Asterisks indicate that the mean values are significantly different between the ambient and elevated  $CO_2$  treatments (*P* <0.05).



**Fig. 3.** APase activity in shoots (a) and roots (b) of 5-week-old wild-type *Arabidopsis* grown for 7 d in P-deficient nutrition solutions containing  $NO_3^-$  or  $NH_4^+$  exposed to ambient  $CO_2$  ( $350 \pm 50 \ \mu l \ l^{-1}$ ) or elevated  $CO_2$  ( $800 \pm 50 \ \mu l \ l^{-1}$ ). Data are means  $\pm SD$  (*n*=5). Asterisks indicate that the mean values are significantly different between the ambient and elevated  $CO_2$  treatments (*P* <0.05). FW, fresh weight.



**Fig. 4.** Relative expression levels of the genes *AtPHR1*, *AtPHT1*, *AtPHO1*, *AtPHO2*, and *AtPAP2* in the shoots and roots of 5-weekold wild-type *Arabidopsis* grown for 7 d in P-deficient nutrition solutions with NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> or NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> exposed to ambient CO<sub>2</sub> ( $350 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) or elevated CO<sub>2</sub> ( $800 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ). Relative expression levels were calculated and normalized with respect to expression of *UBQ10* mRNA. Data are means  $\pm$ SD (*n*=5). Asterisks indicate that the mean values are significantly different between the ambient and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> treatments (*P* <0.05).

 $NO_3^-$ -supplied plants, whereas it did not significantly change its expression in the shoots of  $NH_4^+$ -fed plants (Fig. 4g, h).

# Possible role of NO in P nutrition under P deficiency and elevated $CO_2$

NO was demonstrated recently to be a signal molecule involved in the regulation of root growth during P deficiency (Wang et al., 2010). We observed that elevated CO<sub>2</sub> resulted in stronger fluorescence intensity in the root tip and root-hair region in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants but decreased it in NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants, compared with results under ambient  $CO_2$  (Fig. 5a). To confirm the observation, the fluorescence of 15 roots from each treatment was measured. As shown in Fig. 5b, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> significantly increased the NO level in the roots of  $NO_3^{-}$ -supplied plants but decreased it in NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-supplied plants. A correlation was found between endogenous NO level and P concentration in the roots. Whereas the application of SNP (a NO donor) to the plants under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> tended to promote the P concentration to levels below those measured under elevated  $CO_2$  (Fig. 6a), the addition of the NO scavenger cPTIO under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> reduced the amount of P absorbed per unit weight of roots in both NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>- and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-supplied plants and inhibited it to levels significantly below those measured under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 6c), suggesting some involvement of NO in modulating P uptake in roots. The treatment effect of total P uptake followed the same pattern (data not shown). These results implied that an appropriate concentration of endogenous NO in roots is critical for the regulation of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>-induced P uptake in both NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> medium.

To confirm the above findings further, the effects of elevated  $CO_2$  on the activity of NR and NOS were studied (Fig. 7). In the  $NO_3^-$  treatment, elevated  $CO_2$  increased NR activity in the shoots but decreased it in the roots (Fig. 7a, b). Elevated  $CO_2$  also increased NOS activity in both the shoots and roots of the  $NO_3^-$ -fed plants (Fig. 7c, d). In the  $NH_4^+$  treatment, elevated  $CO_2$  did not affect the NOS and NR activity in shoots but inhibited their activity in roots (Fig. 7).

To further verify the role of NO in mediating elevated  $CO_2$ -induced uptake of P during P deficiency, mutants *nr* (an NR-reduced mutant) and *atnos1* (an NOS-reduced mutant) were used to observe their capacity of P uptake compared with wild-type *Arabidopsis*. Overall, the P concentrations of mutants *nr* and *atnos1* grown in both NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>- and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-supplied media were similar under ambient and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 8a, b). Specially, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased the P concentration in shoots of the *nr* mutant supplied with NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. These results demonstrated that NO is the signal involved in the regulation of elevated CO<sub>2</sub>-induced uptake of P during P deficiency.

### Discussion

Previous studies have indicated that  $CO_2$ -dependent stimulation of growth is likely to enhance the requirements of plants for macronutrients such as N and P (Baxter *et al.*, 1994; Kogawara *et al.*, 2006; Lagomarsino *et al.*, 2008). This study demonstrated that a combination of elevated  $CO_2$  and nitrate induced a set of morphological, physiological, and molecular responses that enabled the plants to better access and utilize P and to alleviate P-deficiency symptoms.



**Fig. 5.** NO production of 5-week-old wild-type *Arabidopsis* grown for 7 d in P-deficient nutrition solutions containing NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> or NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> exposed to ambient CO<sub>2</sub> ( $350 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) or elevated CO<sub>2</sub> ( $800 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ). (a) Photographs of NO production shown as green fluorescence in the root tips and root-hair region of representative roots of plants supplied with NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and exposed to ambient or elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, and with NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> exposed to ambient or elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Bar, 500 µm. (b) Effects of N form and CO<sub>2</sub> treatment on NO production expressed as relative fluorescence. NO production was visualized with DAF-FM DA dye. Data are means ±SD (*n*=15). Means followed by the same letter within a root segment are not significantly different at *P* <0.05.



**Fig. 6.** Effect of SNP under ambient CO<sub>2</sub> ( $350 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) (a) and cPTIO under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> ( $800 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) (b) on P concentration per plant, and the effect of cPTIO under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> ( $800 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) (c) on the amount of P absorbed per weight of roots of 5-week-old wild-type *Arabidopsis* treated with P-deficient nutrition solutions containing NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> or NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>. Data are means ±SD (*n*=5). Asterisks indicate that the mean values are significantly different between the ambient and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> treatments (*P* <0.05).



**Fig. 7.** NR activity in shoots (a) and roots (b) and NOS activity in shoots (c) and roots (d) of 5-week-old wild-type *Arabidopsis* treated with P-deficient nutrition solutions containing  $NO_3^-$  or  $NH_4^+$  exposed to ambient  $CO_2$  ( $350 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) or elevated  $CO_2$  ( $800 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) for 7 d. Data are means  $\pm SD$  (n=5 for NR; n=10 for NOS). Asterisks indicate that the mean values are significantly different between the ambient and elevated  $CO_2$  treatments (P < 0.05).

# Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> improves P nutrition under a nitrate supply

The promotion of plant growth under elevated  $CO_2$  would be associated with increased requirements for mineral nutrition to optimize the nutrition balance in plants. This was the case in a 6-year Free Air  $CO_2$  Enrichment (FACE) experiment in which photosynthetic stimulation by elevated  $CO_2$  was largely regulated by N and P availability in the soil (Lagomarsino



**Fig. 8.** P concentration in shoots (a, c) and roots (b, d) of *Arabidopsis* NR-reduced mutant *nr* and nitric oxide synthase-reduced mutant *atnos1* treated with P-deficient nutrition solutions containing  $NO_3^-$  or  $NH_4^+$  exposed to ambient  $CO_2$  ( $350 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) or elevated  $CO_2$  ( $800 \pm 50 \mu l l^{-1}$ ) for 7 d. Data are means  $\pm SD$  (*n*=5). Asterisks indicate that the mean values are significantly different between the ambient and elevated  $CO_2$  treatments (*P* < 0.05).

*et al.*, 2008). In the present study, elevated  $CO_2$  enhanced biomass production in both  $NO_3^-$  and  $NH_4^+$ -fed *Arabidopsis* plants during P deficiency (Fig. 1). However, elevated  $CO_2$  preferentially stimulated specific P (pool) concentration as well as total P concentration and reduced the accumulation of anthocyanins in  $NO_3^-$ -fed plants. This result is consistent with the findings of Carlisle *et al.* (2012) that  $NH_4^+$ -supplied plants tended to have decreased nutrient concentrations with increasing  $CO_2$  concentration, while  $NO_3^-$ -supplied plants varied widely across  $CO_2$  treatments. The present study concluded that  $NO_3^-$  nutrition facilitates the P uptake of roots under elevated  $CO_2$ .

To test whether the improved P uptake occurred only in  $NO_3^-$ -fed P-deficient plants under elevated  $CO_2$  conditions, we further examined the influence of elevated  $CO_2$  on P nutrition of P-adequate *Arabidopsis* supplied with different N forms. Interestingly, elevated  $CO_2$  only increased the shoot biomass, but decreased specific P uptake with the decrease being greater in the  $NO_3^-$  than the  $NH_4^+$  treatment (Fig. S1). Numerous studies have elucidated that plants adapt to P deficiency through modifications of root architecture, carbon metabolism and membrane structure; exudation of carboxylates, protons and enzymes; and enhanced expressions of genes (Raghothama, 1999; Vance *et al.*, 2003; Shenoy

and Kalagudi, 2005; Shulaev *et al.*, 2008; Wang *et al.*, 2010). Therefore, the increase in P concentration in  $NO_3^-$ -fed *Arabidopsis* plants by elevated  $CO_2$  cannot be attributed to increased photosynthesis alone but also to the improved P nutrition of the plants through morphological, physiological, and molecular responses to P deficiency.

This study showed that NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants had more lateral roots but a shorter taproot under elevated compared with ambient CO2, whereas NH4+-fed plants had longer roots with fewer lateral roots under elevated  $CO_2$  (Fig. 2). In the field, particularly with no-till systems, P concentration is great in topsoil and declines substantially with depth (Lynch and Brown, 2001; Ao et al., 2010). The reduced primary root and increased lateral roots, resulting in a shallower root system, is a positive adaptive response to low-P availability by reducing inter-root competition within the same plant (Miller et al., 2003; Lynch, 2007). In addition, the greater root/shoot ratios seen in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>- compared with NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>supplied plants during P deficiency under high CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (Fig. 2) also favour P acquisition. Nevertheless, favourable root architecture may only play a minor role in increasing P uptake of plants under the combined conditions of P limitation and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in the hydroponic culture supplied with  $H_2PO_4^{-}$ .

Another general response of plants to P starvation is the enhanced activity of APases (Richardson et al., 2009; Tran et al., 2010). In bean plants, a high activity of APases contributes to the increased P-utilization efficiency through remobilization of P from old leaves to young tissues (Kouas et al., 2009). Similarly, the physiological function of root APases has also been demonstrated by Xiao et al. (2006) and Wang et al. (2009) where transgenic plants overexpressing APase genes exhibited greater P acquisition from an organic P resource than wild-type plants. Our results showed that elevated CO<sub>2</sub> increased APase activity in both the shoots and roots of *Arabidopsis* plants supplied with  $NO_3^-$ , which is consistent with results reported in the literature (Lagomarsino et al., 2008). The enhanced APase activity, especially in the root of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants, under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> conditions (Fig. 3) would be expected to facilitate hydrolysis of organic P and thus plant P uptake in the field.

Biochemical and molecular studies have identified a number of genes that are involved in plant alteration in response to P starvation. PHR1 is a key transcriptional activator in controlling P uptake, allocation, and anthyocyanin accumulation (Rubio et al., 2001; Nilsson et al., 2007). The enhanced expression of AtPHR1 under elevated CO2 could activate numerous P-deficiency-response genes, which in turn change molecular, cellular, and physiological processes to cope with P deficiency. P assimilation is initiated by the transport of P into the roots and the number of P transporters present in the roots reflects the complexity and significance of the process. In Arabidopsis, the reduced P uptake activity is caused by a defect in targeting the PHT1 transporter to the plasma membrane (González et al., 2005; Jain et al., 2007). Our present study showed that elevated  $CO_2$  enhanced the expression of AtPHT1 genes in the shoots and roots of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants with expression being much greater in the roots (Fig. 4), indicting that P transport was stimulated by elevated CO<sub>2</sub> in the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> medium.

Partitioning and allocation of internal P is also crucial for maintenance of P homeostasis within plants. AtPHO1 was first identified in Arabidopsis as a gene playing an important role in P transport from the roots to the shoots (Poirier et al., 1991), while AtPHO2 is responsible for P translocation from the shoots to the roots. It was reported that a pho1 mutant plant accumulated adequate P in the roots but less P in the shoots (Poirier et al., 1991; Hamburger et al., 2002; Stefanovic et al., 2007). The downregulated expression of AtPHO1 in the roots and the similar expression of AtPHO2 in the shoots of  $NH_4^+$ -supplied plants in the present study (Fig. 4) probably form a negative-feedback loop against internal P recycling between shoots and roots. In contrast, the PHO2 gene, which regulates P uptake, allocation, and remobilization, is a target gene of miR399s pho2, which displays P toxicity with excessive P accumulation in the shoots of Arabidopsis (Aung et al., 2006). Accordingly, the high expression of AtPHO1 in the roots and AtPHO2 in the shoots of the  $NO_3^{-}$ -supplied plants under elevated  $CO_2$ (Fig. 4) indicated that internal P recycling between shoots and roots was stimulated by elevated CO<sub>2</sub> during the onset of P starvation. Furthermore, the enhanced AtPAP2 expression in shoots under elevated  $CO_2$  (Fig. 4) indicated that elevated  $CO_2$  could excite intracellular P remobilization during P deficiency.

#### A possible role of NO

It has been shown that P deficiency significantly increases the endogenous NO concentration in roots of white lupin (Wang *et al.*, 2010). In this study, we observed that elevated  $CO_2$  increased the NO level in roots of  $NO_3^-$ -supplied plants, while the NO scavenger cPTIO inhibited specific P uptake by the root. In contrast, the  $NH_4^+$  supply was associated with a rapid decrease in NO production under elevated  $CO_2$ , while the NO scavenger cPTIO inhibited specific P uptake (Figs 5 and 6). These results are supported by recent observations that  $NO_3^-$  but not  $NH_4^+$  increased the NO level in the roots of tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum*) in both cadmium-free and cadmium-supplemented growth solutions (Luo *et al.*, 2012). These results suggest that NO is partly responsible for  $NO_3^-$ facilitated P accumulation in plants.

It is unclear how elevated CO<sub>2</sub> changes the NO levels in roots under P deficiency. It is recognized that NR and NOS are two potential enzymatic sources of NO in plants (Neill et al., 2008). Although NOS genes have not yet been identified in plants (Neill et al., 2008), several studies support the presence of NOS activity in plants (Corpas et al., 2006; Valderrama et al., 2007). As shown in Fig. 7, NR activity in the shoots of NO<sub>3</sub>-fed plants was greater under elevated compared with ambient CO<sub>2</sub>, while NR activity in the roots was lower under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, irrespective of N form. These results are in accordance with the findings of other studies (Buchanan et al., 2000; Poonnachit and Darnell, 2004). Nitrate supply has been shown to enhance NR activity (Shaner and Boyer, 1976), whereas  $NH_4^+$  is an inhibitor of NR (Jin et al., 2011). On the one hand, increasing NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> availability should enhance the NR-dependent NO production. Accordingly, a higher NO level in the roots of the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants and a lower NO level in the roots of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants under elevated  $CO_2$  is partly due to the change in NR activity. On the other hand, elevated  $CO_2$  enhanced the root uptake capacity for  $NO_3^-$ , but not for  $NH_4^+$ , in field-grown loblolly pine saplings (Bassirirad et al., 1996). Therefore, it is reasonable to propose that stimulated NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> uptake under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> may facilitate NO production in roots, form a positive feedback loop, and upregulate P uptake.

Elevated  $CO_2$  also increased the NOS activity of *Arabidopsis* plants supplied with NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> but decreased it in NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants (Fig. 7). It is well established that elevated CO<sub>2</sub> represses *NIA* in NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants and increases NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> uptake and assimilation, and the synthesis of glutamine (Gojon *et al.*, 1998; Stitt and Krapp, 1999). Thus, increased NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> uptake and assimilation under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> may restrain the activity of NR, and possibly of NOS. Furthermore, in mutants with low *NIA* activity, NO production was suppressed by NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> (Gojon *et al.*, 1998; Stitt and Krapp, 1999), which supports our findings.

In Arabidopsis, two mutants defective in NO production displayed altered phenotypes. The *nr* mutant had a deletion

of the major NR gene, NIA2, and an insertion in the NIA1 NR gene (Wang et al., 2004), and the atnos1 mutant has a mutation in an NOS structural gene NOS1 (Guo et al., 2003). In this study, the P concentrations of both mutants, nr and nos, were similar under elevated and ambient  $CO_2$  (Fig. 8), suggesting that regulation of P nutrition under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> is NO-signalling dependent. However, relative to the ambient CO<sub>2</sub> condition, elevated CO<sub>2</sub> tended to increase the P concentration in both the shoots and roots of  $NO_3^{-}$ -fed plants. These results are consistent with a major or general role of NO in the regulation of plant development and metabolism. The results also support our hypothesis that elevated  $CO_2$ increases P uptake in NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-fed plants but suppresses it in NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-fed plants through the effect on the activity of NR and/ or NOS, leading to changes in NO production and physiology. However, the details about how NO exerts its effects on P nutrition remain unclear. The studies by Neill *et al.* (2003) and Niu *et al.* (2011b) on interrelations between NO,  $Ca^{2+}$ , cyclic ADP ribose, cyclic GMP, salicylic acid, reactive oxygen species, hydrogen peroxide signalling, and protein kinases have provided an important focal point for future research.

Overall, although previous reports have provided other evidence concerning  $NH_4^+$  nutrition facilitating P uptake in the roots of different plant species. Here, using wild-type *Arabidopsis* plants, we demonstrated that  $NO_3^-$  nutrition facilitates the P uptake in roots from P-deficient soluble sources under elevated  $CO_2$  by upregulating plant adaptive strategies. The increase in NO production may be a signalling pathway controlling the above process. To our knowledge, this finding uncovers a mechanism that has not been described previously and provides a new insight into N forms regulating P nutrition under elevated  $CO_2$ , an important part of climate change in the 21st century. This study also helps to determine whether the carbon costs of P efficiency under elevated  $CO_2$ should be prioritized in crop improvement programmes.

## Supplementary data

Supplementary data are available at JXB online.

Supplementary Fig. S1. Effect of elevated  $CO_2$  and N form on shoot and root fresh biomass production, P concentration in whole plants, and amount of P absorbed per weight of roots.

Supplementary Fig. S2. Effect of elevated  $CO_2$  and N form on chlorophyll content (SPAD readings) of wild-type *Arabidopsis* grown in P-deficient (0.5  $\mu$ M) (a) and P-adequate (0.5 mM) (b) nutrition solutions containing NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> or NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>.

Supplementary Fig. S3. Effect of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and N form on anthocyanin content of wild-type *Arabidopsis* grown in P-deficient (0.5  $\mu$ M) (a) and P-adequate (0.5 mM) (b) nutrition solutions containing NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> or NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>.

## Acknowledgements

We thank the anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments. This work was financially supported by the National Key Project on Science and Technology of China (2012BAC17B02), the State Key Development Program for Basic Research of China (973 Program, no. 2009CB119003), and the Project of Transformation Fund for Agricultural Scientific and Technological Achievements of China (2010GB23600669). C.T. was supported by the Australian Research Council through the Linkage Projects funding scheme.

## References

Abel S, Ticconi CA, Delatorre CA. 2002. Phosphate sensing in higher plants. *Physiologia Plantarum* **115**, 1–8.

Ao JH, Fu JB, Tian J, Yan XL, Liao H. 2010. Genetic variability for root morph-architecture traits and root growth dynamics as related to phosphorus efficiency in soybean. *Functional Plant Biology* **37**, 304–312.

Aung K, Lin SI, Wu CC, Huang YT, Su CL, Chiou TJ. 2006. *pho2*, a phosphate overaccumulator, is caused by a nonsense mutation in a MicroRNA399 target gene. *Plant Physiology* **141**, 1000–1011.

**Barber SA, Walker JM, Vasey EH.** 1963. Mechanisms for movement of plant nutrients from soil and fertilizer to plant root. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry* **11**, 204–207.

**Bassirirad H, Thomas RB, Reynolds JF, Strain BR.** 1996. Differential responses of root uptake kinetics of  $NH_4^+$  and  $NO_3^-$  to enriched atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration in field-grown loblolly pine. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **19,** 367–371.

**Batjes NH.** 1997. A world data set for derived soil properties by FAO-UNESCO soil unit for global modelling. *Soil Use and Management* **13**, 9–16.

**Baxter R, Gantley M, Ashenden TW, Farrar JF.** 1994. Effects of elevated carbon dioxide on three grass species from montane pasture. Nutrient uptake, allocation and efficiency of use. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **45**, 1267–1278.

**Bloom AJ, Burger M, Asensio JSR, Cousins AB.** 2010. Carbon dioxide enrichment inhibits nitrate assimilation in wheat and *Arabidopsis. Science* **328,** 899–903.

**Bloom AJ, Smart DR, Nguyen DT, Searles PS.** 2002. Nitrogen assimilation and growth of wheat under elevated carbon dioxide. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences U S A* **99,** 1730–1735.

**Buchanan BB, Gruissem W, Jones RL.** 2000. *Biochemistry and molecular biology of plants*. Rockville, MD: American Society of Plant Physiologists.

**Carlisle E, Myers S, Raboy V, Bloom A.** 2012. The effects of inorganic nitrogen form and CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on wheat yield and nutrient accumulation and distribution. *Frontiers in Plant Science* **3**, 195.

**Chiou TJ, Lin SI.** 2011. Signaling network in sensing phosphate availability in plants. *Annual Review of Plant Biology* **62**, 185–206.

**Conroy JP, Milham PJ, Barlow EWR.** 1992. Effect of nitrogen and phosphorus availability on the growth response of *Eucalyptus grandis* to high CO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **15**, 843–847.

**Conroy JP, Milham PJ, Reed ML, Barlow EWR.** 1990. Increases in phosphorus requirements for CO<sub>2</sub>-enriched pine species. *Plant Physiology* **92**, 977–982.

Corpas FJ, Barroso JB, Carreras A, Valderrama R, Palma JM, León AM, Sandalio LM, del Río LA. 2006. Constitutive argininedependent nitric oxide synthase activity in different organs of pea seedlings during plant development. *Planta* **224**, 246–254.

**Drake BG, Gonzàlez-Meler MA, Long SP.** 1997. More efficient plants: a consequence of rising atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>? *Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology* **48,** 609–639.

Fiorani F, Umbach AL, Siedow JN. 2005. The alternative oxidase of plant mitochondria is involved in the acclimation of shoot growth at low temperature. A study of *Arabidopsis AOX1a* transgenic plants. *Plant Physiology* **139**, 1795–1805.

**Gan YB, Kumimoto R, Liu C, Ratcliffe O, Yu H, Broun P.** 2006. GLABROUS INFLORESCENCE STEMS modulates the regulation by gibberellins of epidermal differentiation and shoot maturation in *Arabidopsis. The Plant Cell* **18**, 1383–1395.

**Gibeaut DM, Cramer GR, Seemann JR.** 2001. Growth, cell walls, and UDP-Glc dehydrogenase activity of *Arabidopsis thaliana* grown in elevated carbon dioxide. *Journal of Plant Physiology* **158**, 569–576.

**Gojon A, Dapoigny L, Lejay L, Tillard P, Rufty TW.** 1998. Effects of genetic modification of nitrate reductase expression on <sup>15</sup>NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> uptake and reduction in *Nicotiana* plants. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **21,** 43–53.

**González E, Solano R, Rubio V, Leyva A, Paz-Ares J.** 2005. PHOSPHATE TRANSPORTER TRAFFIC FACILITATOR1 is a plantspecific SEC12-related protein that enables the endoplasmic reticulum exit of a high-affinity phosphate transporter in *Arabidospis*. *The Plant Cell* **17**, 3500–3511.

**Guo FQ, Okamoto M, Crawford NM.** 2003. Identification of a plant nitric oxide synthase gene involved in hormonal signaling. *Science* **302,** 100–103.

Hamburger D, Rezzonico E, Petétot JMC, Somerville C, Poirier Y. 2002. Identification and characterization of the Arabidopsis *PHO1* gene involved in phosphate loading to the xylem. *The Plant Cell* **14**, 889–902.

**Hoagland DR, Arnon DI.** 1938. *The water-culture method for growing plants without soil*. Circ. 347 Berkeley, CA: University of California, College of Agriculture.

Hodges DM, DeLong JM, Forney CF, Prange RK. 1999. Improving the thiobarbituric acid-reactive-substances assay for estimating lipid peroxidation in plant tissues containing anthocyanin and other interfering compounds. *Planta* **207**, 604–611.

**IPCC.** 2007. *Climate change 2007: the fourth IPCC assessment report.* Valencia, Spain: Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.

Jain A, Poling MD, Karthikeyan AS, Blakeslee JJ, Peer WA, Titapiwatanakun B, Murphy AS, Raghothama KG. 2007. Differential effects of sucrose and auxin on localized phosphate deficiency-induced modulation of different traits of root system architecture in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiology* **144**, 232–247.

Jin CW, Du ST, Chen WW, Li GX, Zhang YS, Zheng SJ. 2009. Elevated carbon dioxide improves plant iron nutrition through enhancing the iron-deficiency-induced responses under iron-limited conditions in tomato. *Plant Physiology* **150**, 272–280.

Jin CW, Du ST, Shamsi IR, Luo BF, Lin XY. 2011. NO synthasegenerated NO acts downstream of auxin in regulating Fe-deficiency induced root branching that enhances Fe-deficiency tolerance in tomato plants. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **62,** 3875–3884.

**Jin J, Tang CX, Armstrong R, Sale P.** 2012. Phosphorus supply enhances the response of legumes to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> (FACE) in a phosphorus-deficient Vertisol. *Plant and Soil* **358**, 91–104.

**Kogawara S, Norisada M, Tange T, Yagi H, Kojima K.** 2006. Elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration alters the effect of phosphate supply on growth of Japanese red pine (*Pinus densiflora*) seedlings. *Tree Physiology* **26**, 25–33.

Kouas S, Debez A, Slatni T, Labidi N, Drevon JJ, Abdelly C. 2009. Root proliferation, proton efflux, and acid phosphatase activity in common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris*) under phosphorus shortage. *Journal of Plant Biology* **52**, 395–402.

**Lagomarsino A, Moscatelli MC, Hoosbeek MR, De Angelis P, Grego S.** 2008. Assessment of soil nitrogen and phosphorous availability under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and N-fertilization in a short rotation poplar plantation. *Plant and Soil* **308,** 131–147.

Luo BF, Du ST, Lu KX, Liu WJ, Lin XY, Jin CW. 2012. Iron uptake system mediates nitrate-facilitated cadmium accumulation in tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum*) plants. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **63**, 3127–3136.

Lynch JP. 2007. Roots of the second green revolution. *Australian Journal of Botany* **55**, 493–512.

Lynch JP, Brown KM. 2001. Topsoil foraging—an architectural adaptation of plants to low phosphorus availability. *Plant and Soil* 237, 225–237.

Matt P, Geiger M, Walch-Liu P, Engels C, Krapp A, Stitt

**M.** 2001. Elevated carbon dioxide increases nitrate uptake and nitrate reductase activity when tobacco is growing on nitrate, but increases ammonium uptake and inhibits nitrate reductase activity when tobacco is growing on ammonium nitrate. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **24**, 1119–1137.

McLachlan KD, Elliott DE, De Marco DG, Garran JH. 1987. Leaf acid-phosphatase isozymes in the diagnosis of phosphorus status in field-grown wheat. *Australian Journal of Agricultural Research* **38**, 1–13.

Miller CR, Ochoa I, Nielsen KL, Beck D, Lynch JP. 2003. Genetic variation for adventitious rooting in response to low phosphorus availability: potential utility for phosphorus acquisition from stratified soils. *Functional Plant Biology* **30**, 973–985.

Mukatira UT, Liu CM, Varadarajan DK, Raghothama KG. 2001. Negative regulation of phosphate starvation-induced genes. *Plant Physiology* **127**, 1854–1862.

Neill S, Bright J, Desikan R, Hancock J, Harrison J, Wilson I. 2008. Nitric oxide evolution and perception. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **59**, 25–35.

Neill SJ, Desikan R, Hancock JT. 2003. Nitric oxide signalling in plants. *New Phytologist* **159**, 11–35.

Nilsson L, Müller R, Nielsen TH. 2007. Increased expression of the MYB-related transcription factor, *PHR1*, leads to enhanced phosphate uptake in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **30**, 1499–1512.

Niu YF, Jin CW, Jin GL, Zhou QY, Lin XY, Tang CX, Zhang YS. 2011a. Auxin modulates the enhanced development of root hairs in

Arabidopsis thaliana (L.) Heynh. under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **34**, 1304–1317.

Niu YF, Jin GL, Chai RS, Wang H, Zhang YS. 2011b. Responses of root hair development to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant Signaling and Behavior* **6**, 1414–1417.

Péret B, Clément M, Nussaume L, Desnos T. 2011. Root developmental adaptation to phosphate starvation: better safe than sorry. *Trends in Plant Science* **16**, 442–450.

**Poirier Y, Thoma S, Somerville C, Schiefelbein J.** 1991. A mutant of *Arabidopsis* deficient in xylem loading of phosphate. *Plant Physiology* **97**, 1087–1093.

**Poonnachit U, Darnell R.** 2004. Effect of ammonium and nitrate on ferric chelate reductase and nitrate reductase in *Vaccinium* species. *Annals of Botany* **93**, 399–405.

Raghothama KG. 1999. Phosphate acquisition. *Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology* **50**, 665–693.

Ramaekers L, Remans R, Rao IM, Blair MW, Vanderleyden J. 2010. Strategies for improving phosphorus acquisition efficiency of crop plants. *Field Crops Research* **117**, 169–176.

**Richardson AE, Hocking PJ, Simpson RJ, George TS.** 2009. Plant mechanisms to optimise access to soil phosphorus. *Crop Pasture Science* **60**, 124–143.

Rubio V, Bustos R, Irigoyen ML, Cardona-López X, Rojas-Triana M, Paz-Ares J. 2009. Plant hormones and nutrient signaling. *Plant Molecular Biology* **69**, 361–373.

Rubio V, Linhares F, Solano R, Martín AC, Iglesias J, Leyva A, Paz-Ares J. 2001. A conserved MYB transcription factor involved in phosphate starvation signalling both in vascular plants and in unicellular algae. *Genes & Development* **15**, 2122–2133.

Schachtman DP, Reid RJ, Ayling SM. 1998. Phosphorus uptake by plants: from soil to cell. *Plant Physiology* **116**, 447–453.

**Schjørring JK.** 1986. Nitrate and ammonium absorption by plants growing at a sufficient or insufficient level of phosphorus in nutrient solutions. *Plant and Soil* **91**, 313–318.

Shaner DL, Boyer JS. 1976. Nitrate reductase activity in maize (*Zea mays* L.) leaves. I. Regulation by nitrate flux. *Plant Physiology* 58, 499–504.

**Shenoy VV, Kalagudi GM.** 2005. Enhancing plant phosphorus use efficiency for sustainable cropping. *Biotechnology Advances* **23**, 501–513.

Shulaev V, Cortes D, Miller G, Mittler R. 2008. Metabolomics for plant stress response. *Physiologia Plantarum* **132**, 199–208.

Stefanovic A, Ribot C, Rouached H, Wang Y, Chong J, Belbahri L, Delessert S, Poirier Y. 2007. Members of the *PHO1* gene family

show limited functional redundancy in phosphate transfer to the shoot, and are regulated by phosphate deficiency via distinct pathways. *Plant Journal* **50**, 982–994.

**Stitt M, Krapp A.** 1999. The interaction between elevated carbon dioxide and nitrogen nutrition: the physiological and molecular background. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **22,** 583–621.

Stitt M, Quick WP, Schurr U, Scheibe R, Schulze ED, Rodermel SR, Bogorad L. 1991. Decreased ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase in transgenic tobacco transformed with 'antisense' rbcS. *Planta* **183**, 542–554.

**Teng NJ, Wang J, Chen T, Wu XQ, Wang YH, Lin JX.** 2006. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> induces physiological, biochemical and structural changes in leaves of *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *New Phytologist* **172**, 92–103.

Tian QY, Sun DH, Zhao MG, Zhang WH. 2007. Inhibition of nitric oxide synthase (NOS) underlies aluminum-induced inhibition of root elongation in *Hibiscus moscheutos*. *New Phytologist* **174**, 322–331.

**Tran HT, Hurley BA, Plaxton WC.** 2010. Feeding hungry plants: the role of purple acid phosphatases in phosphate nutrition. *Plant Science* **179,** 14–27.

Valderrama R, Corpas FJ, Carreras A, Fernandez-Ocana A, Chaki M, Luque F, Gómez-Rodríguez MV, Colmenero-Varea P,del Río LA, Barroso JB. 2007. Nitrosative stress in plants. *FEBS Letters* **581**, 453–461.

Vance CP, Uhde-Stone C, Allan DL. 2003. Phosphorus acquisition and use: critical adaptations by plants for securing a nonrenewable resource. *New Phytologist* **157**, 423–447.

**Veneklaas EJ, Lambers H, Bragg J, et al.** 2012. Opportunities for improving phosphorus-use efficiency in crop plants. *New Phytologist* **195,** 306–320.

Wang BL, Tang XY, Cheng LY, Zhang AZ, Zhang WH, Zhang FS, Liu JQ, Cao Y. 2010. Nitric oxide is involved in phosphorus deficiency-induced cluster-root development and citrate exudation in white lupin. *New Phytologist* **187**, 1112–1123.

Wang RC, Tischner R, Gutiérrez RA, Hoffman M, Xing XJ, Chen MS, Coruzzi G, Crawford NM. 2004. Genomic analysis of the nitrate response using a nitrate reductase-null mutant of Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiology* **136**, 2512–2522.

Wang X, Wang Y, Tian J, Lim BL, Yan X, Liao H. 2009. Overexpressing *AtPAP15* enhances phosphorus efficiency in soybean. *Plant Physiology* **151**, 233–240.

Xiao K, Zhang JH, Harrison MJ, Wang ZY. 2006. Ectopic expression of a phytase gene from *Medicago truncatula* barrel medic enhances phosphorus absorption in plants. *Journal of Integrative Biology* **48**, 35–43.