Biased T-Cell Receptor 8 Element Recombination in scid Thymocytes

ANN M. CARROLL,* JILL K. SLACK, AND WEN-TEH CHANG

Department of Microbiology, Immunology and Molecular Genetics, Albany Medical College, Albany, New York ¹²²⁰⁸

Received 10 December 1992/Returned for modification 26 January 1993/Accepted 15 March 1993

Thymocytes in mutant mice with severe combined immunodeficiency (scid thymocytes) show ongoing recombination of some T-cell receptor 8 gene elements, generating signal joints quantitatively and qualitatively indistinguishable from those in wild-type fetal thymocytes. Excised D82-J81 and D81-D82 rearrangements are detectable at levels equivalent to or greater than those in thymocytes from wild-type mice on fetal day 15. Signal junctional modification, shown here to occur frequently in wild-type adult but not newborn excised D82-J&1 junctions, can occur normally in adult scid thymocytes. Excised D81-D82 scid junctions, similar to wild-type thymocytes, include pseudonormal coding junctions as well as signal junctions. Inversional D81-D82 rearrangements, generating conventional hybrid junctions, are also reproducibly detectable in scid thymus DNA. These hybrids, unlike those reported for artificial recombination constructs, do not show extensive nucleotide loss. In contrast to the normal or high incidences of D81-, D82-, and J81-associated signal junctions in scid thymocytes, V δ 1, V γ 3, and V γ 1.2 signal products are undetectable in scid thymocytes or are detectable at levels at least 10-fold lower than the levels in wild-type fetal thymocytes. These findings confirm biased T-cell receptor element recombination by V(D)J recombinase activity of nontransformed scid thymocytes and indicate that analysis of in vivo-mediated gene rearrangements is important for full understanding of how the scid mutation arrests lymphocyte development.

V(D)J recombinase activity mediates somatic recombination of antigen receptor gene segments in developing B and T lymphocytes. The standard products of this recombination process are coding junctions and their reciprocal signal junctions. These junctions are formed by paired ligation events following cleavage at the border of coding and conserved recombination signal sequence segments (reviewed in references 2, 27, and 29). Recombination consensus signal sequences (RSS), which confer recognition for lymphoid-specific recombinase activity, consist of strongly conserved heptamer and moderately conserved nonamer sequences, separated by either 12 or 23 bases (18). In deletional recombination, coding junctions are retained in the genome and signal junctions are chromosomally excised. Whereas coding junctions are commonly modified by base loss and addition, signal junction formation is usually precise (27, 29). Nonstandard resolution of coding and signal ends, generating hybrid junctions in which the signal sequence of one segment is joined to the coding sequence of another segment, has also been reported $(28, 33)$.

In mice homozygous for the scid mutation (5) , $V(D)J$ recombinase activity is severely impaired (30, 42), resulting in the failure to generate both T and B lymphocytes. Definition of V(D)J recombinase impairment by the scid mutation has been derived largely from studies of transformed scid lymphoid cell lines. In Abelson murine leukemia virustransformed scid bone marrow cell lines, recombined immunoglobulin heavy-chain genes show gross deletions (>1 kb) of coding sequence (16, 25, 32). Spontaneous scid thymic lymphomas contain similar gross deletions for T-cell receptor (TCR) γ and TCR β genes (41, 42). Transfection of artificial recombination substrates into scid transformed lymphoid cell lines further indicated severe impairment of scid V(D)J recombinase activity; coding junction formation is undetectable or extremely rare (15, 30). Signal junction formation of transfected recombination substrates occurs at a normal frequency, but signal joints commonly show excessive nucleotide loss (30). Hybrid junctions formed in scid lymphoid cell lines also show excessive base loss (30).

Recent studies of TCR gene rearrangement in nontransformed scid thymocytes have indicated less severe qualitative and quantitative impairment of coding junction formation (7). Developmentally arrested scid thymocytes invariably show rearrangement at the TCR ⁸ locus but not at TCR α , β , and γ loci. These findings supported evidence that the TCR ⁸ locus is the earliest TCR gene to undergo ordered recombination (10) and suggested that only the earliest V(D)J recombination events are completed. scid thymocytes show rearrangement of specific TCR δ elements, notably D81, D82, and J81; V81 element-associated coding junction formation, believed to occur concurrently with DS2 and Jb1 recombination (10), has not been detected (7). The basis of selective TCR δ element participation in coding joint formation in scid thymocytes has been unclear. scid thymocytes may mirror the actual ordered sequence of rearrangement for at least one wave of thymic ontogeny; alternatively, the scid mutation may bias toward initiation and resolution of recombination complexes for specific TCR gene elements.

Notably, sequence analysis of cloned scid thymocyte D₈₂-J₈₁ coding junctions of an individual thymus from a mouse with severe combined immunodeficiency showed that rearrangements were clonally heterogeneous and that most were indistinguishable from normal coding junctions (7). The apparently normal structure and high incidence of TCR ⁸ coding junctions in nontransformed scid thymocytes indicated that Abelson murine leukemia virus-transformed scid bone marrow cells do not accurately represent how the scid mutation manifests in vivo. The present studies were designed to further address how the *scid* mutation manifests in

^{*} Corresponding author.

nontransformed, developing thymocytes. Since the scid defect has not been shown to impair the incidence of signal joint formation, we have further analyzed the incidence and structure of excised signal junctions to assess the frequency of initiation and completion of V(D)J recombination events for specific TCR loci and elements. We have used ^a sensitive polymerase chain reaction (PCR) assay to qualitatively and semiquantitatively analyze the formation of specific TCR δand TCR γ -associated coding, signal, and hybrid junctions. The present studies show that scid thymocytes mediate ongoing recombination of TCR Dδ1, Dδ2, and Jδ1 elements and that signal junctions formed are quantitatively and qualitatively equivalent to those of wild-type fetal thymocytes. TCR ^b signal junction modification, detected in wildtype thymocytes from adult but not newborn mice, occurs normally in scid thymocytes. In contrast, recombination of V δ 1 and V γ elements is not routinely detectable.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Mice. C.B.-17 (an immunoglobulin heavy-chain congenic strain of BALB/c) wild-type and scid mice were purchased from specific-pathogen-free breeder stocks from Taconic Laboratory Animals and Services, Germantown, N.Y. They were bred and maintained in specific-pathogen-free animal rooms in microisolator cages with autoclaved food and water. Newborn mice were obtained within 48 h of parturition.

PCR amplification. PCR primers were based on published sequence and were purchased from National Biosciences, Plymouth, Minn. Sequences for reverse-oriented V_{γ} 3-J $_{\gamma}$ 1 primers (pll and p12) were obtained from published primer sequences (1). Primer sequences for β_2 -microglobulin are as follows: ⁵', AGCATGACAGTATGGCCGA; ³', GCTGAT CACATGTCTCGATC. TCR primers, with internal (int) primers used in secondary PCR noted, are as follows: pl, CAGTGGGTATGGCAGAGGGT; pl-int, GGGATCCGGT GATGGCAAAATGCCAA; p2, ATTCTAGACAGAGGC CAGCAAGTGGA; p3, CTGAATCCGTCACTGTTAGTC CGCT; p3-int, ATCTGCAGTCCGCTTGATCAATATTGA GGA; p4, CTTAAGTACCCAGGTCAAGTCT; p4-int, AAA AGATCTGGCCTGAACTAACTGCCA; p6, CTGTACCTC CTGTAAGCTAACCCAT; p6-int, GTAGATCTGGATGAG TAACACATGCTGT; p7, CAGGACGGTCTCATCTCAGA TGT; p8, CTCGACATTCAGAAGGCAACA; p9, GGAAG Cl'l'lTCCAGATGGAGACTCCT; p10, TTCATCACTGGA ATAAAGCAG; pll, CAGGTTCCTCCAGATGCTGAGA; p12, TGCAATGACT'ICTAAGGAACC; p13, TTCTGGGT GCAGGAGACAGT; p14, GGGGGGGATCCAAGAGGAT GTGGGTG; p15, CATGTAATGGCCTTCT. In genomic DNA PCR amplification (38), reactions were carried out in 50- μ l volumes in the presence of 100 μ M (each) dATP, dCTP, dGTP, and dTTP; $1 \mu M$ each oligonucleotide primer; 50 mM KCl; 10 mM Tris-HCl (pH 8.3); 1.5 mM MgCl₂; and 0.01% gelatin. Primary PCR was carried out with DNA from thymocyte lysates prepared by the method of Schlissel and Baltimore (40). The genome equivalent of 2×10^4 cells per reaction was used as a template. Reactions were done for an appropriate number of cycles predetermined to be within the exponential range of amplification for each primer set used. For cloning, secondary PCR was carried out with $2 \mu l$ of the primary PCR reactant mixture and one primer (p-int) internal to the one used for primary PCR. Cycling was carried out in ^a DNA Thermal Cycler (Perkin Elmer Cetus, Norwalk, Conn.) by using the following protocol: 2 cycles at 94°C for 3 min, 50 to 63°C for 1 min, and 72°C for 1 min; and then 19

to 33 cycles at 95°C for 1 min, 50 to 63°C for 1 min, and 72°C for 1 min. For template titration analysis, serial dilutions $(10⁴, 10³,$ and $10²)$ of each template were used. For amplification of the β_2 -microglobulin gene in titration experiments, the cycle number (21 cycles) was predetermined to ensure semiquantitative analysis over the template dilution range.

Analysis of DNA PCR amplification. PCR products of genomic DNA amplification were analyzed on 1% agarose gels, Southern blotted, and hybridized as described previously (7). Probes were labeled by the random-prime method (11). Labeled probe hybridization on blots was quantitated by using a Betascope (Betagen, Waltham, Mass.). Quantitative values for TCR gene rearrangement products for ^a given template were derived by normalization against activity quantitated for parallel-amplified β_2 -microglobulin.

Cloning and sequencing. Secondary PCR products containing TCR ⁸ rearrangements were cloned directly by using the TA cloning kit as specified by the manufacturer (Invitrogen, San Diego, Calif.). Transformants were screened by colony hybridization, as described previously (9). Double-stranded plasmid DNA was generated and sequenced by the dideoxychain termination method (39) with appropriate primers and the Sequenase version 2.0 DNA sequencing kit (United States Biochemical Corp., Cleveland, Ohio). Labeled DNA was run on Long Ranger (AT Biochem, Malvern, Pa.) sequencing gels.

Hybridization probes. 5'D₆₂ and DJ₆ probes were derived from pJb7, a 7.5-kb EcoRI fragment spanning the sequence 5' of D δ 2 to 3' of J δ 1, as described previously (7). 5'D δ 2 is a 2-kb PstI fragment, and DJ_b is a 1-kb PCR-amplified fragment that spans the region between $D\delta 2$ and $J\delta 1$. Probe V $\delta 1$ (pVM9), a 410-bp XbaI-EcoRV fragment (10), was kindly provided by Y. Chien. Probe V_{γ} 1.2 was derived from the cDNA clone $p8/10-2y1.1$ (20). The following probes were produced by PCR amplification with appropriate primers: $5'$ -3'-V γ 3, 5'-3'-J γ 1, and β_2 -microglobulin.

Restriction and Southern blot analysis. Genomic DNA was prepared by the method of Blin and Stafford (4), and digested DNA $(10 \mu g)$ was analyzed by Southern analysis as described previously (7).

RESULTS

Ongoing recombination of TCR D81, D82, and J81 in scid thymocytes. D δ 1-, D δ 2-, and J δ 1-associated coding junctions are routinely detectable in scid thymus DNA preparations (7; data not shown), and PCR-amplified $D\delta2-J\delta1$ coding joints from an individual thymus from a mouse with severe combined immunodeficiency are clonally variable and indistinguishable from the wild type (7). To confirm that these TCR δ elements undergo ongoing recombination, we analyzed independent scid thymic lysates by PCR, using primers designed to amplify excised, circular signal junctions. Results of PCR amplification of D82-J81 and D81-D82 excision products are shown in Fig. 1. The TCR δ primers used and their relative orientations are shown; primers with the opposite orientation on the germ line could amplify circular excision products. For each template, parallel amplification of the single-copy β_2 -microglobulin gene provided an internal normalizing control. Individual scid thymic lysates, derived from newborn or 4-week-old mice, reproducibly showed amplification of excised, circular D82-J81 and D81-D82 reciprocal junctions. Wild-type thymic lysates from newborn mice or 15-day-old fetuses also showed amplification of TCR δ excision products. Since scid thymocytes show surface marker expression equivalent to normal fetal

FIG. 1. scid thymocytes mediate ongoing recombination of TCR D81, D82, and J81 elements, generating D82-J81 and D81-D82 signal junctions. PCR-amplified circular excision products of $D\delta 2-J\delta 1$ (A) and D81-D82 (B) rearrangements, with parallel amplification of the β_2 -microglobulin single-copy gene, from individual thymic lysates of wild-type mice $(+/+)$ and mice with severe combined immunodeficiency (Scid), aged fetal day 15 (Fe), newborn (Nb), or 4 weeks. (A) D₈₂-J₈₁ excision products were amplified with primers p₂ and p₆, generating a 372-bp fragment, detectable by hybridization with the DJ δ probe. (B) Excised D δ 1-D δ 2 rearrangements were amplified with primers p3 and p4. Unmodified signal junctions would result in a 425-bp amplification fragment, detectable by hybridization with the 5'D₈₂ probe.

day ¹⁵ thymocytes (8, 14), we compared the incidences of TCR δ rearrangements in individual scid thymocyte samples with those in wild-type fetal thymocytes. The estimated incidence of D82-Jb1 and D51-D82 excised (signal) junction formation in all scid thymic lysates tested was reproducibly equal to or higher (2- to 10-fold) than that of wild-type fetal thymus.

scid TCR δ signal junctions are indistinguishable from wild type and show age-associated junctional modification. Cloning and sequence analysis of PCR-amplified D82-J81 signal junctions from *scid* thymocytes showed them to be indistinguishable from age-matched wild-type thymocytes (Fig. 2A). All cloned D₈₂-J₈₁ signal junctions from wild-type thymic lysates from newborn mice showed precise heptamer-heptamer fusion, with no nucleotide insertion or excision. Of 11 scid thymic junctions from newborn mice, 10 were also precise. Notably, however, a high percentage of both wildtype and scid adult thymus-derived signal junctions showed junctional modification. Three of six sequenced wild-type adult thymocyte clones showed nonprecise junctions, characterized by nontemplated nucleotide insertion. One clone also showed excision of the D₆₂-associated heptamer. Heptamer excision, previously reported as characteristic of scidbut not wild-type-mediated signal junction formation on artificial substrates (30), has also been detected at a low frequency in other wild-type TCR δ junctions (9). scid thymic $D\delta2$ -J $\delta1$ signal junctions from adult mice also showed frequent junctional modification. Of 29 sequenced clones of an individual scid thymic lysate from a 4-week-old mouse, 14 showed nontemplated junctional insertion; 2 of 29 also showed nucleotide loss (2 to 3 bp). The sequence data also indicate the clonal heterogeneity of signal junctions from the DNA of an individual thymus from ^a mouse with severe combined immunodeficiency. The generality of age-associated modification of D82-J81 signal junctions was indicated by restriction analysis of PCR-amplified rearrangements with the enzyme *ApaLI*, which cleaves the consensus site generated by perfect heptamer-heptamer fusion (GTGCAC); a higher incidence of $ApaL$ I restriction was detected for fetal and newborn thymic amplified signal junctions (70 to 95%) than for adult thymic amplified junctions (40 to 50%) (data not shown).

PCR-amplified D81-D82 excision junctions also were cloned and sequenced from scid thymocyte DNA (Fig. 2B). The predicted excision product for deletional D₈₁-D₈₂ rearrangement is a signal junction formed by fusion of recombination signal sequence heptamers 3' of D δ 1 and 5' of D δ 2. As reported previously, however, D81-D82 recombination in wild-type thymocytes generates a high incidence of nonstandard products, probably as a result of participation of two short (11- to 16-bp) coding elements, each flanked by two recombination signal sequences (9). These nonstandard products include pseudonormal rearrangements in which external signal sequences (5'D δ 1 and 3'D $\overline{\delta}$ 2) fuse, generating signal joints which are retained on the chromosome. Excised rearrangements thus include coding joints. They also include hybrid junctions, and some rearrangements show evidence for open-shut or oligonucleotide capture events (9). scid thymocyte D81-D82 excision products also showed pseudonormal coding joints (Fig. 2B). One adult scid thymusderived clone contained both D81 and D82 coding segments, with limited base loss and insertion of a single base. One newborn scid thymus-derived clone probably represents an additional coding joint in which homologous overlapping nucleotides (ATC) of D δ 2 and D δ 1 participated in junctional resolution (although we cannot rule out its alternative derivation by hybrid joint formation). Other scid clones included signal junctions and additional nonstandard products, similar to those seen for wild-type thymus. $D\delta 1-D\delta 2$ excised signal joints characteristically retained CA nucleotides, presumably derived from D81 coding sequence, as previously reported for wild-type junctions (9, 43).

scid thymocytes form D81-D82 inversional hybrid junctions. The sequenced D₈₁-D₈₂ amplified clones shown above were products of deletional recombination, in which cleavage occurred at RSS either external or internal to D₆₁ and D₆₂ elements. Inversional recombination could also occur between these elements; if cleavage occurred at either internal or external RSS, in concordance with the 12/23 spacer rule, the expected products would be paired (reciprocal) hybrid junctions, as shown in Fig. 3A. On the basis of studies with artificial recombination substrates, reciprocal hybrids were predicted to occur at a low incidence in normal cells (28). To determine whether D81-D82 reciprocal hybrids were generated in wild-type or scid thymocytes in vivo, we amplified template DNA of individual thymic lysates by PCR with primers oriented in the same direction. Amplification should result only if inversional recombination has occurred. As shown in Fig. 3B, all scid thymic lysates, but neither wild-type thymic lysate, showed amplification of a fragment of the predicted size (259 to 265 bp) for an inversional hybrid rearrangement.

TGTTTTTGTACGGCTGTGTTTCACTGTGCTGCATATCACACACCOTTCAA

GERMLINE SEQUENCE:

Dð1

FIG. 2. Junctional sequences for scid D82-J81 and D81-D82 excised rearrangements are indistinguishable from wild-type sequences. Germ line sequences for D81, D82, and J81 (partial) are shown, with coding sequences in boldface type and flanking signal heptamer and nonamer sequences underlined. (A) Junctional sequences of PCR-amplified D82-J81 signal junctions from wild-type $(+)$ and scid newborn and adult (4 to 8 weeks) thymic lysates, with primers p2 and p6. Sequences from newborn mice derive from pools of two thymuses each; sequences from adult mice derive from single individual mice. Junctional insertions are indicated a circular excision products show conventional signal junctions, excised coding junctions, and hybrid junctions. Primers p3 and p4 were used for amplification. Junctional insertions are indicated as N.

Secondary PCR was done with amplified DNA of an individual *scid* newborn thymus template (G), and amplified DNA was cloned and sequenced (Fig. 3C). As illustrated in Fig. 3A, cleavage at alternate sites (rows a and b), both of which obey the 12/23 spacer rule, would yield similar products, differing only in the positions of the D_δ elements themselves. Cloned *scid* inversional rearrangements showed both types of product, in which the 5'D81-5'D82 hybrids retained either the Dô1 (4/6) or Dô2 (1/6) coding element. Base loss and addition were minimal, with two Do1-containing hybrids (G3, of identical sequence) containing a single nucleotide insertion. Base loss occurred only at coding ends and was not excessive $(2, 3, or 8$ bp). An additional clone (G2) lacked any D₀ coding sequence and had lost four D₀1-associated heptamer bases. We cannot rule out the possibility that more than two recombinase-mediated cuts, as shown in Fig. 3A, occurred. In this case, excision of a D δ coding segment would result in generation of a signal joint. It is notable, however, that wild-type reciprocal hybrid junctions formed on artificial substrates also showed large deletions (up to 28 bp) of coding flank sequence and loss of signal heptamer bases (28). The expected reciprocal product of a 5'D81-5'D82 inversional hybrid would be a 3'D81-3'D82

hybrid. These were also detected in scid thymic lysates by amplification with the appropriate primers (data not shown).

scid thymocytes do not show ongoing rearrangement of V81. V81-associated rearrangements were undetectable or quantitatively reduced relative to the situation for wild-type thymocytes (Fig. 4A). In contrast to D81-D82- and D82-J81associated rearrangements, V81-D82 coding junctions were rarely detectable, and when they were detectable they occurred at levels at least 10-fold lower than those of wild-type fetal thymus DNA. Concordant with these results, $V\delta1-\overrightarrow{D}\delta2$ signal junctions were not reproducibly amplified from scid lysates. These signal products were more frequently amplified from newborn scid thymic lysates than from 4-week-old scid thymic lysates. When detectable, they occurred at levels generally 10-fold lower than in the wildtype fetal thymus.

The relative quantitative differences in recombination of $D\delta$ 2-J δ 1 and V δ 1-D δ 2 elements in *scid* and wild-type thymocytes were more specifically examined by PCR amplification of titrated DNA templates, as shown in Fig. 4B. Excised circular D82-J81 and V81-D82 signal junctions, and the β ₂-microglobulin single-copy control gene were amplified in parallel from titrated template $(10^4, 10^3,$ and 10^2 genomes) of

FIG. 3. D81-D82 inversional recombination generates conventional hybrid junctions in scid thymocytes. (A) Schematic of inversional D81-D82 recombination and predicted products. The black elongated triangle indicates altered orientation conferred by inversional recombination. Small rectangles indicate Dô coding segments flanked on either side by consensus signal sequences (small triangles). Germ line 5' signal sites contain 12-bp spacer segments, and 3' signal sites contain 23-bp spaces. Alternative paired cuts which would obey the 12/23 spacer rule are shown. (B) PCR amplification of inversional recombination with primers to 5'D81 (p1) and 5'D82 (p4), generating products within the predicted size range (259 to 265 bp). Results, detected by Southern analysis with the 5'D82 probe, are shown, derived from independent thymic lysates, as follows: lane A, wild-type $(+/+)$ newborn; lane B, $+/+$ fetal; lanes C to E, scid adult; lanes F to H, scid newborn. (C) Cloned and sequenced scid thymic 5'D81-5'D82 inversional rearrangements from sample G. Germ line sequence shows the 5' RSS for Dol and Do2 elements, with both heptamer and nonamer sequences underlined. The D8 coding sequence is shown in boldface type. Both coding and noncoding strands are shown to facilitate analysis of sequences (below) generated by inversional rearrangement. Sequence G3 was present in duplicate clones, with a single-base insertion (designated N).

wild-type fetal thymus and representative scid thymic lysates, one each from mice which were newborn or 4 weeks of age. D82-J81 excision circles were amplifiable for all template dilutions of the scid thymic lysates as well as the wild-type fetal thymic lysate. In contrast, Vδ1-Dδ2 excision circles, amplified for all template dilutions of the wild-type thymic lysate, were detectable only from amplification of the most concentrated scid thymic lysate from newborn mice $(10⁴$ genomes) and not at all from the *scid* thymic lysate from 4-week-old mice. Thus, within individual scid thymic lysates, D82-J81 excision products were quantitatively equivalent to (or higher than) those from wild-type fetal thymic lysate, whereas $V\delta1-D\delta2$ excision products were 1 or 2 orders of magnitude lower.

Another indicator of initiated TCR element recombination

FIG. 4. V81-D82 gene rearrangement is rare in scid thymocytes. (A) PCR-amplified coding junctions and excised signal junctions for $V\delta$ 1-D δ 2 rearrangement, with parallel amplification of the β_2 -microglobulin single-copy gene control $(\beta-2)$, from individual thymic lysates of wild-type mice and mice with severe combined immunodeficiency. Coding junctions were amplified with primers p8 and p2, generating a 249-bp product; signal junctions were amplified with primers p7 and p4, generating a 289-bp product. Lysates in individual lanes are as follows: A, wild-type newborn thymus; B, scid liver (germ line control); C, wild-type fetal day 15 thymus; D to G, scid newborn thymus; H to K, scid 4-week thymus. (B) Titration of selected templates (wild-type fetal day 15 thymus, scid newborn thymus, and scid 4-week-old thymus) for genome equivalents of $10⁴$. 10³, and 10², for PCR amplification of D82-J81 (p2 and p6) and V81-D82 (p7 and p4) signal joints. Results for the parallel amplified β_2 -microglobulin single-copy gene (β -2) are also shown. Hybridization probes used were V δ 1, 5'D δ 2, and DJ8 for detection of amplified coding and signal junctions.

in scid thymocytes is the presence of cleaved, unresolved coding-end intermediates (36). Southern analysis of restricted scid thymocyte DNA with probes to D82 and J81 routinely detects non-germ line fragments unique to scid thymus (7). Non-germ line Jδ1 hybridizing EcoRI fragments of scid thymus DNA are shown in Fig. 5. Two of these restriction fragments $(-4.0$ and 4.9 kb) were recently identified as cleaved, unresolved coding-end intermediates generated by cleavage at RSS 5' of D82 and J81 segments, which have been modified by hairpin formation (36). If scid thymocytes generate similar cleaved, unresolved V81 coding intermediates, Southern analysis of EcoRI-restricted scid thymus DNA with a V₈₁-specific probe should detect, in addition to a germ line band of 7.2 kb, an additional fragment of -4.8 kb. A duplicate sample of *EcoRI*-restricted *scid* thymus DNA, probed with a V₈₁-specific probe, showed no detectable non-germ line band which would correspond to a coding intermediate.

FIG. 5. scid thymus DNA shows the germ line V81 sequence only. Southern analysis of EcoRI-restricted DNA of liver (germ line control; lanes A) and scid thymus (lanes B) DNA with probes to J81 and V₈1. Liver DNA shows germ line bands. scid thymus DNA shows cleaved coding intermediates for 5'Jo1 (4.0 kb) and 5'Do2 (4.9 kb) but not for V₈₁. DNA size markers are indicated.

Recombinogenic inactivity of the TCR γ locus in scid thymocytes. Others have reported TCR γ rearrangements cloned from pooled scid thymus DNA preparations and have suggested that ongoing recombination of TCR γ , as well as TCR δ , loci may occur in scid thymocytes (23). To address this possibility, we did semiquantitative PCR analysis of specific TCR γ elements with individual scid thymic lysates as templates (Fig. ⁶ and 7). We first examined PCR amplification of coding and excised signal products for TCR V_{γ} 3- $Jy1$ rearrangements, which are reported to occur in the earliest stages of thymic ontogeny (13) , generating the first wave of functional TCR γ/δ receptor-bearing cells. As shown in Fig. 6A, three independent scid thymic lysates failed to generate any detectable coding junctions, despite abundant amplification in wild-type thymus lysates. Use of reverseoriented primers to amplify excised signal rearrangements (Fig. 6B) showed that only 2 of 10 scid lysates tested, both from scid thymic templates from newborn mice, generated a faintly detectable amplification signal. Betagen analysis indicated that this signal was at least 10-fold lower than the signal for the wild-type template.

We similarly determined the incidence of $V_{\gamma}1.2-J_{\gamma}2$ gene rearrangement. Coding and signal products of these elements were more reproducibly detectable from scid thymic lysates, notably the lysates from the older (4-week-old) mice (Fig. 7A). PCR titration analysis of TCR V_{γ} 1.2-J $_{\gamma}$ 1 coding and signal junctions, relative to the wild-type fetal thymus template, however, showed that levels in scid lysates were generally lower by ¹ to 2 orders of magnitude (Fig. 7A).

DISCUSSION

The present studies confirm that developing nontransformed scid thymocytes initiate V(D)J recombination, selectively recombining specific TCR δ elements. Previous studies indicated a high incidence of $D\delta1$, $D\delta2$, and $J\delta1$ coding

FIG. 6. $V\gamma3-J\gamma1$ rearrangement is rare in scid thymocytes. (A) PCR-amplified V γ 3-J γ coding junctions, amplified with primers p9 and plO, from three individual wild-type newborn thymic lysates and three individual scid thymic lysates (one from a newborn mouse and two from 4-week-old mice). The hybridization probe used was $5'$ -3'V γ 3, and the unmodified amplified product is 418 bp. (B) PCR-amplified V γ 3-J γ 1 excised signal junctions (165 bp), amplified with primers p11 and p12, with parallel amplification of β_2 -microglobulin (β -2). Results shown, hybridized with the 5'-3'J γ 1 probe, are from the following templates: scid liver, wild-type newborn thymus, five scid lysates from newborn mice, and five scid lysates from 3- to 4-week-old mice.

joint formation (7), and a recent report has identified cleaved coding intermediates for D₆₂ and J₆₁ elements in scid thymocytes (36). The present studies show that signal junction formation for Dδ1-Dδ2 and Dδ2-Jδ1 occurs at the same incidence as (and frequently at a higher incidence than) in phenotypically similar wild-type thymocytes of 15-day fetuses. In contrast to the signal junctions formed by transiently transfected recombination constructs in scid transformed lymphoid cell lines, endogenous rearrangements of nontransformed scid thymocytes are indistinguishable from wild-type rearrangements. The present data also show that TCR δ signal junctions show age-associated modification, principally by nontemplated nucleotide addition, and that the scid mutation does not affect imprecise signal junction resolution.

Although junctional modification of signal joints has been noted to occur at a low frequency, signal ends are generally unmodified prior to ligation (30, 31). In the present study, insertion of nontemplated nucleotides into cloned and sequenced D82-Jb1 signal junctions was seen in thymocytes from adult but not newborn mice. Thus, nontemplated addition to TCR D82-J81 signal junctions, apparently mediated by terminal deoxynucleotidyltransferase (22), corresponds to age-associated expression of terminal deoxynucleotidyltransferase in thymic ontogeny (37) and to insertion of nontemplated nucleotides into coding junctions (26). Impre-

FIG. 7. V γ 1.2-J γ 2 rearrangements are rare in scid thymocytes and, when detected, occur in adult (versus newborn) scid thymic lysates. (A) PCR-amplified $V\gamma$ 1.2-J γ 2 coding junctions, amplified with primers p13 and p10, from individual thymic lysates of wildtype $(+/+)$ newborn (Nb) and fetal day 15 (Fe) mice and newborn (Nb) and 4-week-old mice with severe combined immunodeficiency. Hybridization was with the V γ 1.2 probe, detecting an unmodified coding junction of 499 bp. Templates were amplified in parallel with primers for β_2 -microglobulin (β -2). (B) Titration of selected templates (thymuses from a wild-type fetal day 15 mouse and newborn and 4-week-old mice with severe combined immunodeficiency) for genome equivalents of 10^4 , 10^3 , and 10^2 , for PCR amplification of \bar{V}_{γ} 1.2-J γ 2 coding junctions and excised signal junctions (182 bp). Results for a parallel-amplified β_2 -microglobulin control (β -2) are also shown. The hybridization probes used were V_{γ} 1.2 (coding) and $5'$ -3'J γ 1 (signal).

cision for some excised TCR δ signal junctions has been shown (19, 43), and a similar age-associated imprecision of TCR γ signal junctions was recently reported (21). Notably, addition of nontemplated nucleotides to cleaved signal ends in scid thymocytes occurs normally. This indicates that biased resolution of signal versus coding ends in scid cells is not simply due to the ability to resolve unmodified versus modified strand intermediates.

scid thymic lysates also showed formation of reciprocal inversional DS1-D52 hybrid junctions. Although reciprocal hybrid joint formation is detectable for artificial recombination substrates in wild-type cells, the incidence of the reciprocal (inversional) event versus a single hybrid (deletional) event is considerably reduced in frequency (approximately 100-fold) (28). This predicted low incidence (<1%) could account for our failure to detect 5'DS1-5'D52 hybrids in wild-type thymocytes. scid hybrid-type junctions have been detected in immunoglobulin loci in scid Abelson murine leukemia virus-transformed cell lines, within stably integrated recombination cassettes (17), or in endogenous im-

munoglobulin heavy-chain gene rearrangements (25, 34), in some cases with excessive base loss (17). They have also been detected within transiently transfected substrates (15, 30), and in these studies coding and signal ends showed excessive nucleotide deletion (30) . In contrast, scid thymocyte hybrid junctions showed no excessive base loss for signal or coding ends. These results indicate that in nontransformed scid thymocytes, interaction with a signal end is sufficient to enable normal resolution of a coding end. Similar to signal joint formation, excessive base loss for both coding and signal ends is likely to be exaggerated by the artificial recombination substrate and perhaps by the transformation phenotype as well. The actual incidence of hybrid joint formation in scid relative to wild-type thymocytes is not known, but their invariable detection in scid thymic lysates may be due to an increased ratio of completed hybrid versus coding joints in scid cells.

The present findings that V δ 1-D δ 2, V γ 3-J γ 1, and V γ 1.2- $Jy2$ signal junctions are not readily amplifiable in scid thymic lysates confirm the TCR element specificity of scid thymocyte V(D)J recombinase activity. Unlike D82-J81 and D81-D52 signal junctions, whose incidence was up to 10-fold higher for scid than for wild-type thymic lysates, scid V_δand V_{γ} -associated signal joints, when detectable, were generally 10-fold lower in incidence. Further, we did not find any evidence of cleaved, unresolved V81 coding ends by Southern analysis.

The basis for this biased TCR δ element recombination in scid thymocytes remains unclear. Examination of recombination signal sequences flanking the relevant elements does not indicate that deviation from consensus sequence is a factor. One possible explanation is that the scid mutation itself directly or indirectly imposes a bias for recombination of specific elements, for example based on distance between elements or specifically involving V elements. The latter possibility is supported by data of Ferrier et al. (12), who found that transgenic TCR β D-J and V-D gene recombination was differentially regulated in T- and B-lineage cells. Alternatively, the locus and element bias of scid $V(D)J$ recombinase activity may mirror ^a normal ordered, regulated gene rearrangement, possibly for a specific subset, or ontogenic wave, of thymocytes. In this case, V_o recombination would be regulated similar to immunoglobulin heavychain and TCR β loci, in which D-to-J-element-associated recombination precedes V element recombination (2). Within a regulated model, failure to initiate the recombination of V elements could be due to ^a low incidence of productive D or ^J 8-associated rearrangements or to progressive alteration of recombinase activity in scid cells, as suggested previously (7). TCR δ is probably the first TCR locus to recombine in thymic ontogeny, but ordered recombination of elements within the TCR δ locus has been considered unlikely. This is due to evidence for V-D rearrangement within normal fetal TCR ⁸ alleles which maintain J δ in the germ line configuration (10). However, specific information about the incidence and timing of TCR δ element recombination for both TCR ⁸ alleles, within clonal cell lineages, is not known, and this explanation remains viable. The detectability of PCR-amplified immunoglobulin heavychain gene D-J coding and signal junctions from scid bone marrow cells and their normal junctional sequences (44) support this interpretation.

The low levels of detectable V δ 1- and V γ -associated signal and coding joint formation in individual scid thymic lysates are in contrast with conclusions of Kienker et al. (23, 24) that V δ 1 and V γ elements show ongoing recombination in scid

thymocytes. Their findings were based on nonquantitative PCR amplification and cloning of coding junctions from pools of multiple adult thymuses from mice with severe combined immunodeficiency. Also, sequences reported as independent, yet containing identical junctions (eg., $V\delta1$ and $V\gamma$ 3-associated coding joints), may have been derived from ^a very restricted number of DNA templates. Although we have not looked at additional V δ or V_{γ} elements, our results show that recombination of V81, V γ 3, and V γ 1.2 is generally 1 to 2 orders of magnitude lower than for $D\delta$ and J δ 1 elements. These V element rearrangements may represent rearrangements within phenotypically distinct thymic populations. These could include "leaky" cells (6) which have undergone phenotypic reversion of the scid mutation (35) or cells with normal D-J&-associated rearrangements which have progressed to the next stage of ordered recombination, as discussed above.

The present data confirm that aberrancies of the scid V(D)J recombinase activity are exaggerated in studies based on transient transfection of artificial recombination substrates into transformed scid lymphoid cells. In vivo-generated signal junctions, as well as both signal and coding ends of in vivo-generated hybrid junctions, are indistinguishable from normal ones. Over 50% of scid signal junctions in the transient transfection studies showed extensive nucleotide loss, commonly of entire heptamer sequences (30). This difference is probably due to the nonintegrated versus chromosomally integrated recombination substrates; precise signal junctions have been detected in scid Abelson murine leukemia virus-transformed cell lines which contain stably integrated recombination substrates (3, 17). Additional distortion of scid activity by the transformation phenotype also cannot be ruled out. The present results suggest that the incidence of coding joint formation estimated for transformed scid cell lines (1/5,000 that of wild type cells [15]) may be similarly exaggerated. This could account for apparently higher incidences of detectable TCR δ D- and J-element-associated coding junctions (7; data not shown). Further quantitative and qualitative study of in vivo-mediated antigen receptor gene rearrangements within nontransformed lymphocytes is important to the determination of how the scid mutation causes developmental arrest in vivo.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We acknowledge helpful discussions with J. Petrini in the initial phases of the work.

This work was supported by grant CTR-3074 from the Council for Tobacco Research to A.M.C. A.M.C. is a recipient of American Cancer Society Junior Faculty Award JFRA-379.

REFERENCES

- 1. Aguilar, L. K., and J. W. Belmont. 1991. $V\gamma3$ T cell receptor rearrangement and expression in the adult thymus. J. Immunol. 146:1348-1352.
- 2. Blackwell, T. K., and F. W. Alt. 1989. Mechanism and developmental program of immunoglobulin gene rearrangement in mammals. Annu. Rev. Genet. 23:605-636.
- 3. Blackwell, T. K., B. A. Malynn, R. A. Pollack, P. Ferrier, L. R. Covey, G. M. Fulop, R. A. Phillips, G. D. Yancopoulos, and F. W. Alt. 1989. Isolation of scid pre-B cells that rearrange kappa light chain genes: formation of normal signal and abnormal coding joints. EMBO J. 8:735-742.
- 4. Blin, N., and D. W. Stafford. 1976. A general method for isolation of high molecular weight DNA from eukaryotes. Nucleic Acids Res. 3:2302-2308.
- 5. Bosma, G. C., R. P. Custer, and M. J. Bosma. 1983. A severe combined immunodeficiency mutation in the mouse. Nature

(London) 301:527-530.

- 6. Bosma, G. C., M. Fried, R. P. Custer, A. Carroll, D. Gibson, and M. J. Bosma. 1988. Appearance of functional T cells in some "leaky") scid mice. J. Exp. Med. 167:1016-1033.
- 7. Carroll, A. M., and M. J. Bosma. 1991. T lymphocyte development in scid mice is arrested shortly after the initiation of T-cell receptor 8 recombination. Genes Dev. 5:1357-1366.
- 8. Carroll, A. M., R. R. Hardy, and M. J. Bosma. 1989. Occurrence of mature B $(IgM+)$ and T $(CD3+)$ lymphocytes in scid mice. J. Immunol. 143:1087-1093.
- 9. Carroll, A. M., J. K. Slack, and X. Mu. 1993. V(D)J recombination generates ^a high frequency of non-standard TCR Dbassociated rearrangements in thymocytes. J. Immunol. 150: 2222-2230.
- 10. Chien, Y. H., M. Iwashima, D. A. Weltstein, K. B. Kaplan, J. F. Elliott, W. Born, and M. M. Davis. 1987. T cell receptor δ rearrangements in early thymocytes. Nature (London) 330:722- 727.
- 11. Feinberg, A. P., and B. Vogelstein. 1983. A technique for radiolabeling DNA endonuclease restriction fragments to high specific activity. Anal. Biochem. 132:6-13.
- 12. Ferrier, P., B. Krippl, T. K. Blackwell, A. J. W. Furley, H. Suh, A. Winoto, W. D. Cook, L. Hood, F. Constantini, and F. W. Alt. 1990. Separate elements control DJ and VDJ rearrangement in ^a transgenic recombination substrate. EMBO J. 9:117-125.
- 13. Garman, R. D., P. J. Doherty, and D. H. Raulet. 1986. Diversity, rearrangement and expression of murine T cell gamma genes. Cell 45:733-742.
- 14. Garni Wagner, B. A., P. L. Witte, M. M. Tutt, W. A. Kuziel, P. W. Tucker, M. Bennett, and V. Kumar. 1990. Natural killer cells in the thymus: studies in mice with severe combined immune deficiency. J. Immunol. 144:796-803.
- 15. Harrington, J., C.-L. Hsieh, J. Gerton, G. Bosma, and M. R. Lieber. 1992. Analysis of the defect in DNA end joining in the murine scid mutation. Mol. Cell. Biol. 12:4758-4768.
- 16. Hendrickson, E. A., D. G. Schatz, and D. T. Weaver. 1988. The scid gene encodes a trans-acting factor that mediates the rejoining event of Ig gene rearrangement. Genes Dev. 2:817-829.
- 17. Hendrickson, E. A., M. S. Schlissel, and D. T. Weaver. 1990. Wild-type V(D)J recombination in scid pre-B cells. Mol. Cell. Biol. 10:5397-5407.
- 18. Hesse, J. E., M. R. Lieber, K. Mizuuchi, and M. Gellert. 1989. V(D)J recombination: a functional definition of the joining signals. Genes Dev. 3:1053-1061.
- 19. Hockett, R. D., G. Nunez, and S. J. Korsmeyer. 1989. Evolutionary comparison of murine and human 8 T-cell receptor deleting elements. New Biol. 1:266-274.
- 20. Iwamoto, A. F., F. Rupp, P. S. Ohashi, C. L. Walker, H. Pircher, R. Johs, H. Hengartner, and T. W. Mak. 1986. T cell specific γ genes in C57Bl/10 mice. J. Exp. Med. 163:1203-1212.
- 21. Iwasoto, T., and H. Yamegishi. 1992. Novel excision products of T cell receptor γ gene rearrangements and developmental stage specificity implied by the frequency of nucleotide insertion at joints. Eur. J. Immunol. 22:101-106.
- 22. Kallenbach, S., N. Doyen, M. Fanton D'Andon, and F. Rougeon. 1992. Three lymphoid-specific factors account for all junctional diversity characteristic of somatic assembly of T-cell receptor and immunoglobulin genes. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 89: 2799-2803.
- 23. Kienker, L. J., W. A. Kuziel, B. A. Garni-Wagner, V. Kumar, and P. W. Tucker. 1991. T cell receptor γ and δ gene rearrangements in scid thymocytes. Similarity to those in normal thymocytes. J. Immunol. 147:4351-4359.
- 24. Kienker, L. J., W. A. Kuziel, and P. W. Tucker. 1991. T cell receptor γ and δ gene junctional sequences in scid mice: excessive P nucleotide insertion. J. Exp. Med. 174:769-773.
- 25. Kim, M. G., W. Schuler, M. J. Bosma, and K. Marcu. 1988. Abnormal recombination of IgH D and ^J segments in transformed pre-B cells of scid mice. J. Immunol. 141:1341-1347.
- 26. LaFaille, J. J., A. DeCloux, M. Bonneville, Y. Takagaki, and S. Tonegawa. 1989. Junctional sequences of T cell receptor $\gamma\delta$ genes: implications for $\gamma\delta$ T cell lineages and for a novel intermediate of V-(D)-J joining. Cell 59:859-870.
- 27. Lewis, S., and M. Gellert. 1989. The mechanism of antigen receptor gene assembly. Cell 59:585-588.
- 28. Lewis, S. M., J. E. Hesse, K. Mizuuchi, and M. Gellert. 1988. Novel strand exchanges in V(D)J recombination. Cell 55:1099- 1107.
- 29. Lieber, M. R. 1992. The mechanism of $V(D)J$ recombination: a balance of diversity, specificity and stability. Cell 70:873-875.
- 30. Lieber, M. R., J. E. Hesse, S. Lewis, G. Bosma, N. Rosenberg, K. Mizuuchi, M. Bosma, and M. Gellert. 1988. The defect in murine severe combined immune deficiency: joining of signal sequences but not coding segments in V(D)J recombination. Cell 55:7-16.
- 31. Lieber, M. R., J. E. Hesse, K. Mizuuchi, and M. Gellert. 1988. Lymphoid V(D)J recombination: nucleotide insertion at signal joints as well as coding joints. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 85:8588-8592.
- 32. Malynn, B., T. K. Blackwell, G. Fulop, G. Rathbun, A. Furley, P. Ferrier, L. B. Heinke, R. Phillips, G. Yancopoulos, and F. Alt. 1088. The scid defect affects the final step of the immunoglobulin VDJ recombinase mechanism. Cell 54:5453-5460.
- 33. Morzycka-Wroblewska, E., F. Lee, and S. Desiderio. 1988. Unusual immunoglobulin gene rearrangement leads to replacement of recombinational signal sequences. Science 242:261-263.
- 34. Okazaki, K., S. Nishikawa, and H. Sakano. 1988. Aberrant immunoglobulin gene rearrangements in scid mouse bone marrow cells. J. Immunol. 141:1348-1352.
- 35. Petrini, J., A. Carroll, and M. Bosma. 1990. T cell receptor gene rearrangements in functional T cell clones from scid mice: reversion of the scid phenotype in individual lymphocyte pro-

genitors. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 87:3450-3452.

- 36. Roth, D. B., J. P. Menetski, P. J. Nakajima, M. J. Bosma, and M. Gellert. 1992. V(D)J recombination: broken DNA molecules with covalently sealed (hairpin) coding ends in scid mouse thymocytes. Cell 70:983-991.
- 37. Rothenberg, E., and D. Triglia. 1983. Clonal proliferation unlinked to terminal deoxynucleotidyl transferase in thymocytes of young mice. J. Immunol. 130:1627-1633.
- 38. Saiki, R., D. Gelfland, S. Stoffel, S. Scharf, R. Higushi, G. Horn, K. Mullis, and H. Erlich. 1988. Primer-directed enzymatic amplification of DNA with thermostable polymerase. Science 239:487-494.
- 39. Sanger, F., S. Nicklen, and A. R. Coulson. 1977. DNA sequencing with chain-terminating inhibitors. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 74:5463-5467.
- 40. Schlissel, M. S., and D. Baltimore. 1989. Activation of immunoglobulin kappa gene rearrangement correlates with induction of germline kappa transcription. Cell 58:1001-1007.
- Schuler, W., A. Schuler, and M. J. Bosma. 1990. Defective V to J recombination of T cell receptor γ chain genes in scid mice. Eur. J. Immunol. 20:545-550.
- 42. Schuler, W., I. Weiler, A. Schuler, R. Phillips, N. Rosenberg, T. Mak, J. Kearney, R. Perry, and M. Bosma. 1986. Rearrangement of antigen receptor genes is defective in mice with severe combined immune deficiency. Cell 46:963-972.
- 43. Takeshita, S., M. Toda, and H. Yamegishi. 1989. Excision products of the T cell receptor gene support ^a progressive rearrangement model of the α/δ locus. EMBO J. 8:3261-3270.
- 44. Wu, G. Personal communication.