Chipping away at a mountain: Genomic studies in Common Variable Immunodeficiency

Michael D Keller, MD[1],[*] and **Soma Jyonouchi, MD**[1]

Michael D Keller: kellermd@email.chop.edu; Soma Jyonouchi: Jyonouchi@email.chop.edu

[1]Division of Allergy & Immunology, The Children's Hospital of Philadelphia, Philadelphia, PA, USA

Abstract

Common variable immunodeficiency (CVID) represents one of the most frequently diagnosed disorders of the immune system. Though several causative and associated genes have been identified, the origins of most cases remain unknown. Diagnostic delay is common due to the gradual evolution and wide spectrum of phenotypes, which can include autoimmune disease, enteropathy, and lung disease. A recent genome wide array identified novel gene associations with CVID, and also showed that identification of a genetic signature via a Support Vector Machine algorithm may be a powerful diagnostic tool. Studies utilizing whole genome or exome sequencing have also met with success in identifying new causes of CVID in subgroups of patients.

Keywords

Immunodeficiency; immunoglobulin; genome

Introduction

Primary immunodeficiency disorders (PIDD) are estimated to affect as many as 1 in 4000 people [1], and over 175 unique diseases have now been described [2]. Greater than 50% of cases of PIDD involve defects in antibody production, and among these, common variable immunodeficiency (CVID) is the most frequent disorder requiring clinical intervention [3]. This disorder is defined by decreased immunoglobulins (IgG and IgM and/or IgA), impaired specific antibody production and recurrent infections. CVID generally requires life-long immunoglobulin replacement to reduce infection rates and improve outcome [4,5]. In addition, CVID is associated with a variety of comorbid conditions, including autoimmune disease, enteropathy, lung disease, and increased risk of malignancies (Table 1) [5,6]. Of note, autoimmune disease has also been associated with other antibody isotype deficiencies [7,8].

CVID has a wide age of onset, with peaks in the first and third decades of life [9]. There is often significant delay in the diagnosis of CVID due to the wide spectrum of phenotypes and

[*]Corresponding author address: 3550 Market Street, 3rd Floor, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, Phone: 215-495-5915, Fax: 215-590-4529, kellermd@email.chop.edu.

evolution of laboratory values prior to meeting diagnostic criteria [10]. Cohort studies have demonstrated a significant increase in mortality associated with CVID, due to both infections and non-infectious complications [10,11]. To date, a small number of clinical predictors have been uncovered. Analysis of B-lymphocyte subsets have shown that decreased memory B-cells (CD27+ IgM−) and reduced expression of CD21 correlate with incidence of autoimmune disease [12–14]. However, there are no biomarkers to stratify risk for other complications such as enteropathy or malignancy, which have a profound impact on long-term mortality.

Given its variability in onset and phenotype, CVID has been long suspected to be an "umbrella diagnosis" with likely many underlying etiologies [9]. Familial cases have been described, suggesting rare monogenic causes, though most cases are thought to be polygenic in origin. To date, 10 monogenic causes have been identified, as well as two risk-associated genes [15–22]. Most of these genes encode proteins involved in signaling through the B-cell receptor (CD19, CD21, CD81, PLC-γ2), or proteins involved in co-stimulatory pathways necessary for isotype switching and somatic recombination (ICOS, BAFFR, TACI, MSH5). Of the genes identified, mutations in the transmembrane activator and calcium modulator and cyclophilin ligand interactor (TACI) are most common, being found in 8–10% of CVID cases [23]. However, its role in causation is still unclear, as mutations in TACI occur in many unaffected individuals. The remainder of discovered genes are rare, and thus the cause of nearly 90% of CVID remains unknown.

Genome wide arrays

Recently, the first collaborative genomic-wide array study of CVID sought to look for novel associations with CVID, as well as to address the need for improved diagnostics and prognostic indicators [24]. This study was permitted by the development of the Haplotype Map, a database of over 3 million single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) that occur throughout the human genome at specific frequencies which vary by ethnicity [25]. Unlike genetic sequencing, rare novel mutations would not be uncovered by this method. Analysis of SNPs was paired with determination of copy number variation via the PennCNV Markov model, which allowed detection of deletions and insertions at kilobase resolution [26]. Following analysis of 363 patients and 3031 controls, 8 SNPs were identified with significant over-representation in CVID patients, including polymorphisms in *MHC*, *ADAM28*, *SDK1*, and *UBX10*. Analysis of subphenotypes within CVID patients, including cancer, autoimmune disease, enteropathy among other conditions also correlated with unique SNPs. Assessment of copy number variation showed several significant deletions and duplications, the most notable of which was an intra-exonic duplication in *ORC4L* in 15 patients and none of the controls. *ORC4L* encodes a highly conserved member of the pre-replication complex which is involved in initiation of DNA replication during S-phase [27]. Interestingly, a missense mutation in the same protein has previously been described in association with lymphoproliferative disease [28]. However, there is no known role for ORC4L specific to immunity. Recently, null mutations in *ORC4L* have been described as a cause of Meier-Gorelin syndrome, which is characterized by growth retardation, absent patellae, and microtia [29]. No immunologic phenotype has been described in this disorder.

Perhaps the most striking finding uncovered by Orange *et al.* was the significantly genome-wide burden of copy number variations found in CVID patients, including several with duplications or deletions of greater than 1Mb. As confirmation of germline copy number variation was not performed, it is not clear whether this degree of copy number variation is acquired or inborn. The highly variable age of clinical onset and markedly raised risk of malignancy in CVID resemble diseases of genomic instability. Previous studies have

demonstrated *in vitro* radiosensitivity in CVID patients [30,31], which further supports this premise.

Finally, through the use of a Support Vector Machine (SVM) algorithm, the authors demonstrated that the unique signature of SNPs and copy number variants could be used successfully for diagnosis of CVID with an overall accuracy of 91% and a positive predictive value of 100%. SVM uses multiple forms of data input to form a linear "hyperplane" which can then be used to predict sample grouping. Though it has found use in many fields, SVM is being used increasingly for biomedical applications [32–34].

Whole genome and exome sequencing

With rapid strides in the accuracy and cost of genomic sequencing, a new approach for exploring familial and subphenotype clusters in CVID has become feasible. Whole genome sequencing was recently used in concert with linkage analysis to identify mutations in PLG-γ2 in patients with CVID, cold urticaria, and autoimmunity [17]. Though extremely powerful, the greatest present limitation of whole genome sequencing lies in its interpretation, as a single individual may have as many as 20,000 single nucleotide variations [35]. Whole exome sequencing reduces this burden of data by limiting sequencing to coding regions, which represent only 1% of the genome but roughly 85% of causative mutations. It is important to note that the present methodology of exon capture has limitations on coverage of the exome, with often upwards of 10% of genes poorly covered or missed altogether [36] Further, polygenic diseases may be. problematic for analysis via sequencing, as multi-pathway disorders could make interpretation of novel mutations extremely challenging. Thus, novel findings must be followed by confirmatory mechanistic biology. Despite these limitations, many studies of CVID utilizing these methods are underway.

Future directions

Genomic studies show great promise in probing the group of disorders that comprise common variable immunodeficiency. The use of a unique "genetic fingerprint" of SNPs and copy number variation could be an extremely powerful diagnostic tool. The use of similar algorithms within CVID subpopulations may also permit risk prediction of comorbid conditions such as autoimmune disease or cancer. Risk stratification would be invaluable in permitting increased screening, diagnosis, and early treatment of these complications. Finally, sequencing of familial clusters may yet reveal novel pathways and therapeutic targets. Targeted sequencing of existing pathways has been used with great success in discovering other forms of primary immunodeficiency, and may be prove to be a valuable strategy in CVID. As technology accelerates, perhaps the task of chipping away at this mountain will become an attainable task.

Acknowledgments

References

1. Boyle JM, Buckley RH. Population prevalence of diagnosed primary immunodeficiency diseases in the United States. J Clin Immunol. Sep; 2007 27(5):497–502. [PubMed: 17577648]

2. Al-Herz W, Bousfiha A, Casanova JL, et al. Primary immunodeficiency diseases: an update on the classification from the international union of immunological societies expert committee for primary immunodeficiency. Front Immunol. 2011; 2:54. [PubMed: 22566844]

3. Fried AJ, Bonilla FA. Pathogenesis, diagnosis, and management of primary antibody deficiencies and infections. Clin Microbiol Rev. Jul; 2009 22(3):396–414. [PubMed: 19597006]

4. Kaveri SV. Intravenous immunoglobulin: Exploiting the potential of natural antibodies. Autoimmun Rev. Sep; 2012 11(11):792–794. [PubMed: 22349620]

5. Cunningham-Rundles C. How I treat common variable immune deficiency. Blood. Jul 8; 2010 116(1):7–15. [PubMed: 20332369]

6. Schuetz C, Niehues T, Friedrich W, Schwarz K. Autoimmunity, autoinflammation and lymphoma in combined immunodeficiency (CID). Autoimmun Rev. May; 2010 9(7):477–482. [PubMed: 20146941]

7. Ballow M. Primary immunodeficiency disorders: antibody deficiency. J Allergy Clin Immunol. Apr; 2002 109(4):581–591. [PubMed: 11941303]

8. Duarte-Rey C, Bogdanos DP, Leung PS, Anaya JM, Gershwin ME. IgM predominance in autoimmune disease: genetics and gender. Autoimmun Rev. May; 2012 11(6–7):A404–412. [PubMed: 22178509]

9. Yong PF, Tarzi M, Chua I, Grimbacher B, Chee R. Common variable immunodeficiency: an update on etiology and management. Immunol Allergy Clin North Am. May; 2008 28(2):367–386. ix–x. [PubMed: 18424338]

10. Resnick ES, Moshier EL, Godbold JH, Cunningham-Rundles C. Morbidity and mortality in common variable immune deficiency over 4 decades. Blood. Feb 16; 2012 119(7):1650–1657. [PubMed: 22180439]

11. Lucas M, Lee M, Lortan J, Lopez-Granados E, Misbah S, Chapel H. Infection outcomes in patients with common variable immunodeficiency disorders: relationship to immunoglobulin therapy over 22 years. J Allergy Clin Immunol. Jun; 2010 125(6):1354–1360. e1354. [PubMed: 20471071]

12. Wehr C, Kivioja T, Schmitt C, et al. The EUROclass trial: defining subgroups in common variable immunodeficiency. Blood. Jan 1; 2008 111(1):77–85. [PubMed: 17898316]

13. Al Kindi M, Mundy J, Sullivan T, et al. Utility of peripheral blood B cell subsets analysis in common variable immunodeficiency. Clin Exp Immunol. Feb; 2012 167(2):275–281. [PubMed: 22236004]

14. Yong PL, Orange JS, Sullivan KE. Pediatric common variable immunodeficiency: immunologic and phenotypic associations with switched memory B cells. Pediatr Allergy Immunol. Aug; 2010 21(5):852–858. [PubMed: 20337966]

15. Grimbacher B, Hutloff A, Schlesier M, et al. Homozygous loss of ICOS is associated with adult-onset common variable immunodeficiency. Nat Immunol. Mar; 2003 4(3):261–268. [PubMed: 12577056]

16. Kuijpers TW, Bende RJ, Baars PA, et al. CD20 deficiency in humans results in impaired T cell-independent antibody responses. J Clin Invest. Jan; 2010 120(1):214–222. [PubMed: 20038800]

17. Ombrello MJ, Remmers EF, Sun G, et al. Cold urticaria, immunodeficiency, and autoimmunity related to PLCG2 deletions. N Engl J Med. Jan 26; 2012 366(4):330–338. [PubMed: 22236196]

18. Sekine H, Ferreira RC, Pan-Hammarstrom Q, et al. Role for Msh5 in the regulation of Ig class switch recombination. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. Apr 24; 2007 104(17):7193–7198. [PubMed: 17409188]

19. van Montfrans JM, Hoepelman AI, Otto S, et al. CD27 deficiency is associated with combined immunodeficiency and persistent symptomatic EBV viremia. J Allergy Clin Immunol. Mar; 2012 129(3):787–793. e786. [PubMed: 22197273]

20. van Zelm MC, Smet J, Adams B, et al. CD81 gene defect in humans disrupts CD19 complex formation and leads to antibody deficiency. J Clin Invest. Apr; 2010 120(4):1265–1274. [PubMed: 20237408]

21. Warnatz K, Salzer U, Rizzi M, et al. B-cell activating factor receptor deficiency is associated with an adult-onset antibody deficiency syndrome in humans. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. Aug 18; 2009 106(33):13945–13950. [PubMed: 19666484]

22. Lopez-Herrera G, Tampella G, Pan-Hammarstrom Q, et al. Deleterious mutations in LRBA are associated with a syndrome of immune deficiency and autoimmunity. Am J Hum Genet. Jun 8; 2012 90(6):986–1001. [PubMed: 22608502]

23. Pan-Hammarstrom Q, Salzer U, Du L, et al. Reexamining the role of TACI coding variants in common variable immunodeficiency and selective IgA deficiency. Nat Genet. Apr; 2007 39(4): 429–430. [PubMed: 17392797]

24. Orange JS, Glessner JT, Resnick E, et al. Genome-wide association identifies diverse causes of common variable immunodeficiency. J Allergy Clin Immunol. Jun; 2011 127(6):1360–1367. e1366. [PubMed: 21497890]

25. Frazer KA, Ballinger DG, Cox DR, et al. A second generation human haplotype map of over 3.1 million SNPs. Nature. Oct 18; 2007 449(7164):851–861. [PubMed: 17943122]

26. Wang K, Li M, Hadley D, et al. PennCNV: an integrated hidden Markov model designed for high-resolution copy number variation detection in whole-genome SNP genotyping data. Genome Res. Nov; 2007 17(11):1665–1674. [PubMed: 17921354]

27. Dhar SK, Delmolino L, Dutta A. Architecture of the human origin recognition complex. J Biol Chem. Aug 3; 2001 276(31):29067–29071. [PubMed: 11395502]

28. Radojkovic M, Ristic S, Divac A, Tomic B, Nestorovic A, Radojkovic D. Novel ORC4L gene mutation in B-cell lymphoproliferative disorders. Am J Med Sci. Dec; 2009 338(6):527–529. [PubMed: 20010161]

29. Guernsey DL, Matsuoka M, Jiang H, et al. Mutations in origin recognition complex gene ORC4 cause Meier-Gorlin syndrome. Nat Genet. Apr; 2011 43(4):360–364. [PubMed: 21358631]

30. Aghamohammadi A, Moin M, Kouhi A, et al. Chromosomal radiosensitivity in patients with common variable immunodeficiency. Immunobiology. 2008; 213(5):447–454. [PubMed: 18472053]

31. Palanduz S, Palanduz A, Yalcin I, et al. In vitro chromosomal radiosensitivity in common variable immune deficiency. Clin Immunol Immunopathol. Feb; 1998 86(2):180–182. [PubMed: 9473380]

32. Agliozzo S, De Luca M, Bracco C, et al. Computer-aided diagnosis for dynamic contrast-enhanced breast MRI of mass-like lesions using a multiparametric model combining a selection of morphological, kinetic, and spatiotemporal features. Med Phys. Apr; 2012 39(4):1704–1715. [PubMed: 22482596]

33. Dawson J, Walters M, Delles C, Mischak H, Mullen W. Urinary proteomics to support diagnosis of stroke. PLoS One. 2012; 7(5):e35879. [PubMed: 22615742]

34. Orru G, Pettersson-Yeo W, Marquand AF, Sartori G, Mechelli A. Using Support Vector Machine to identify imaging biomarkers of neurological and psychiatric disease: a critical review. Neurosci Biobehav Rev. Apr; 2012 36(4):1140–1152. [PubMed: 22305994]

35. Bamshad MJ, Ng SB, Bigham AW, et al. Exome sequencing as a tool for Mendelian disease gene discovery. Nat Rev Genet. Nov; 2011 12(11):745–755. [PubMed: 21946919]

36. Sulonen AM, Ellonen P, Almusa H, et al. Comparison of solution-based exome capture methods for next generation sequencing. Genome Biol. 2011; 12(9):R94. [PubMed: 21955854]

Take-home messages

- Common variable immunodeficiency is the most frequently diagnosed form of immunodeficiency requiring clinical intervention, and the cause in 90% of cases is unknown.

- Autoimmune diseases can be a presenting feature of CVID, including autoimmune hemolytic anemia, idiopathic thrombocytopenic purpura, rheumatoid arthritis, inflammatory bowel disease, and granulomatous disease.

- Novel associations between CVID and both single nucleotide polymorphisms and copy number variants have been seen.

- The use of a Support Vector Machine algorithm may permit the genetic fingerprint of CVID to be used diagnostically.

- Genome and exome sequencing are being used successfully to examine familial cases of CVID, though interpretation of single nucleotide variants as well as limitations in genomic coverage remain a challenge.

Table 1

Non-infectious complications of CVID

Category	Condition	Percentage[*]
Pulmonary	Chronic lung disease	28%
	Bronchiectasis	11%
Gastrointestinal	Inflammatory bowel disease	20%
	Malabsorption	6%
	Chronic diarrhea	2%
Autoimmune	Idiopathic thrombocytopenic purpura	14%
	Autoimmune hemolytic anemia	7%
	Evan's syndrome	4%
	Rheumatoid arthritis	3%
	Others: neutropenia, pernicious anemia, diabetes mellitus, multiple sclerosis, juvenile idiopathic arthritis, autoimmune thyroiditis, vasculitis, systemic lupus erythematosus	<1%
Granulomatous disease	Lung, liver, lymph nodes, skin	10%
Malignancy	Lymphoid malignancy	8%
	Breast cancer	2%
	Gastric carcinoma	<1%

[*] From ResnickE. *et al. Blood* (2012) 119: 1650–1657