

# rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org

# Research



**Cite this article:** Pearse DE, Miller MR, Abadía-Cardoso A, Garza JC. 2014 Rapid parallel evolution of standing variation in a single, complex, genomic region is associated with life history in steelhead/rainbow trout. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **281**: 20140012. http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2014.0012

Received: 2 January 2014 Accepted: 25 February 2014

Subject Areas:

evolution, genomics, behaviour

#### **Keywords:**

anadromy, salmonid, polymorphism, phenotypic plasticity, adaptation

#### Author for correspondence:

Devon E. Pearse e-mail: devon.pearse@noaa.gov

Electronic supplementary material is available at http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2014.0012 or via http://rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org.



# Rapid parallel evolution of standing variation in a single, complex, genomic region is associated with life history in steelhead/rainbow trout

# Devon E. Pearse<sup>1,2</sup>, Michael R. Miller<sup>3,4</sup>, Alicia Abadía-Cardoso<sup>1,2</sup> and John Carlos Garza<sup>1,2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Fisheries Ecology Division, Southwest Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, 110 Shaffer Road, Santa Cruz, CA 95060, USA

 $^2 {\rm Institute}$  of Marine Sciences, University of California, Santa Cruz, CA 95060, USA

<sup>3</sup>Institute of Molecular Biology, University of Oregon, Eugene, OR 97403, USA

 $^4$ Department of Animal Science, University of California, One Shields Avenue, Davis, CA 95616, USA

Rapid adaptation to novel environments may drive changes in genomic regions through natural selection. Such changes may be population-specific or, alternatively, may involve parallel evolution of the same genomic region in multiple populations, if that region contains genes or co-adapted gene complexes affecting the selected trait(s). Both quantitative and population genetic approaches have identified associations between specific genomic regions and the anadromous (steelhead) and resident (rainbow trout) lifehistory strategies of Oncorhynchus mykiss. Here, we use genotype data from 95 single nucleotide polymorphisms and show that the distribution of variation in a large region of one chromosome, Omy5, is strongly associated with life-history differentiation in multiple above-barrier populations of rainbow trout and their anadromous steelhead ancestors. The associated loci are in strong linkage disequilibrium, suggesting the presence of a chromosomal inversion or other rearrangement limiting recombination. These results provide the first evidence of a common genomic basis for life-history variation in O. mykiss in a geographically diverse set of populations and extend our knowledge of the heritable basis of rapid adaptation of complex traits in novel habitats.

# 1. Introduction

It is now clear that evolutionary change can be very rapid, especially in response to strong selection or during invasion of novel habitats [1–6], and that this in turn can influence ecological and environmental conditions [7,8]. In addition, when the same traits respond to similar selective pressures in multiple species or populations, parallel evolution may lead to similar phenotypic changes [9–11]. In such cases, these parallel phenotypic changes may have the same underlying genetic basis [12–17] or may involve different genetic changes that cause similar phenotypic responses [18,19]. While parallel adaptation may stem from novel mutations in the same gene or gene region, it is often attributed to concordant changes in the frequencies of existing alleles [14–16,20,21] or to parallel regulatory changes in gene expression [22,23]. However, the relative importance and frequency of these different underlying genomic responses to adaptive evolution in natural populations is largely unknown.

The identification of specific genomic regions under selection in natural populations is a fundamental goal of evolutionary genetics research and is essential for understanding the genetic basis of local adaptation [16,24]. However, most traits of interest are complex and controlled by a large number of genetic and environmental influences, and dissection of the genetic architecture underlying their expression is challenging [15,25]. This is especially true of traits associated with multiple phenotypic, behavioural or physiological effects [26]. In addition, demonstrating associations between a phenotype and a genotype, or fitness differences between genotypes, may not be sufficient to conclude that an allele confers an adaptive advantage in a given environment [27]. Nonetheless, combining population genomics approaches, such as genome screens, with gene mapping and next-generation sequencing can provide strong inferential evidence of adaptation in a specific genomic region [27,28], ultimately providing the ability to relate selection on phenotypic variation to the underlying adaptive genomic variation in natural populations.

Animal migration has been the focus of many evolutionary genetic studies, and it is now widely understood that a significant proportion of phenotypic variation in migratory traits has a genetic basis [29]. Migration and its associated phenotypic and physiological characteristics are considered threshold traits [30,31], with expression dependent on the interaction between the environment, individual growth and development, and the underlying genetic architecture [6]. However, despite this complexity, single-gene effects on migration have been identified. For example, the candidate gene Clock was found to be associated with a substantial proportion of the variation in migratory timing in a Pacific salmonid [32]. Similarly, Mueller et al. [33] identified a candidate locus associated with 'migratory restlessness' in multiple populations of blackcaps (Sylvia atricapilla), although polymorphism in this gene explained only approximately 3% of the variation in migratory activity.

The salmonid Oncorhynchus mykiss is one of the world's most widely distributed fish species, and also one of the top aquaculture species, with commercial production growing exponentially since the 1950s [34]. In nature, O. mykiss exhibits extensive variation in migratory life history, from resident rainbow trout that never leave freshwater, to anadromous steelhead, which undergo one or more sea migrations but spawn in freshwater. Within this spectrum are populations in which individuals display a range of life-history trajectories [35-37]. It has long been known that these differences in 'migratory habit' are at least partially heritable [38], and that the resident life history has evolved repeatedly in different regions. As a result, resident and anadromous O. mykiss in the same watershed are generally each other's closest relatives [39-41]. However, their differences are profound. In addition to the complex combination of behavioural traits associated with migration [29], steelhead undergo a suite of physiological and morphological changes known as 'smoltification' that includes osmoregulatory adaptation to the salinity of the ocean as well as physical adaptations to the highly mobile life of a pelagic marine fish. Conversely, resident trout retain traits adapted for freshwater, including paedomorphic morphology and the development of reproductive maturity in as little as 1 year [25].

In a previous study, we sampled a pair of *O. mykiss* populations isolated above and below a natural waterfall barrier approximately 100 years ago [40], and screened 298 microsatellite loci using an  $F_{ST}$ -outlier approach [42]. The locus with the highest pairwise  $F_{ST}$  value was in complete linkage disequilibrium (LD) with a second outlier locus, and both loci map to the same position on *O. mykiss* chromosome Omy5 [43,44]. A third outlier locus on Omy5 was also in LD with the first two [42]. Subsequent analysis of genotype data for 96 single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) identified three

SNP loci that displayed LD and allelic frequency patterns consistent with the microsatellite outliers in the same pair of populations, as well as in additional *O. mykiss* populations ([45], D.E.P. and J.C.G. 2013, unpublished data). Importantly, these results are consistent with mapping studies that have localized QTL for early maturation, growth rate and smoltification, to this region of Omy5 [17,43,46–48].

Based on these data, we hypothesized that Omy5 contains a genomic region that is strongly associated with the expression of resident and anadromous life histories in *O. mykiss*, and that this region would undergo divergent natural selection in populations isolated above and below barriers. Here, we show that a subset of loci located on chromosome Omy5 follow a clear and concordant pattern of divergence between habitats favouring the resident or anadromous life histories. This pattern probably results from strong parallel natural selection acting on lifehistory traits influenced by one or more genes in this region. These results demonstrate repeated evolutionary change in response to similar selective environments, suggesting that a common genetic mechanism is involved in the life-history transition from anadromy to residency in *O. mykiss* through independent adaptation based on standing genetic variation.

# 2. Material and methods

#### (a) Population samples

Samples from 21 populations located above and below natural (waterfall) and artificial (dam) barriers to upstream anadromous fish migration were selected from locations in five watersheds throughout California and southern Oregon, as well as from three hatchery rainbow trout strains commonly used in California (figure 1 and table 1). The population samples represent various life stages and individual life histories, including juveniles and adults, as well as summer and winter steelhead ecotypes (table 1). The above-barrier populations are a mixture of coastal steelhead lineage fish isolated above waterfalls (Cutfinger, Willow and Big creeks) or dams (populations in the Salinas, Santa Ynez and Santa Clara rivers), and inland trout populations (Bauers, Buckboard and Butcherknife creeks). Although all of these abovebarrier populations appear to be primarily natural-origin fish [39,40,49], introgression by stocked hatchery trout is impossible to rule out and may be significant in some populations.

#### (b) Marker development, genotyping and analysis

Miller *et al.* [17] identified 344 polymorphic SNPs that mapped to chromosome Omy5 with Restriction-site Aided DNA (RAD) sequencing in two divergent strains of hatchery trout. We developed 55 new SNPtype assays (Fluidigm Corporation, So. San Francisco, CA, USA) from these polymorphisms by aligning the flanking sequence around each SNP with up to 150 bp of flanking sequence derived from BAC clones of the Swanson (Sw) strain [17]. In addition to these RAD-derived SNPs, we used assays for five chromosome Omy5 loci developed by Castaño-Sánchez *et al.* [50], as well as for the three putative Omy5 loci identified by Abadía-Cardoso *et al.* [45].

To complement the Omy5 loci, we used a set of assays for 32 additional SNP loci located on 17 of the 28 other *O. mykiss* linkage groups. All loci were genotyped with 96.96 Dynamic SNP Genotyping Arrays on an EP1 system (Fluidigm) following the manufacturer's recommended protocols. Two negative (no template) controls were included in each array, and genotypes called using Genotyping Analysis Software v. 3.1.1 (Fluidigm). Details, including map positions, primer sequences and summary statistics,



Figure 1. Map showing locations of the major California watersheds with above-barrier (square) and below-barrier (round) sample sites indicated by numbers corresponding to table 1. Greyscale shows the frequency of the AD haplotype at each site.

as well as genotypes for all SNP loci, are provided in the electronic supplementary material, appendix.

Tests for Hardy-Weinberg (H-W) equilibrium and LD were conducted using Genepop [51]. Because of the large number of pairwise tests for LD, only p-values less than the Bonferonicorrected critical value were considered to be statistically significant. We then used the allelic correlation coefficient,  $(r^2)$  [52,53], to quantify the pattern of LD among the Omy5 loci in three ways. First, we ranked the 55 Omy5 loci using the mean  $r^2$  value for each locus compared with all other loci. Second, we visualized the LD among Omy5 loci in each population using the statistical packages 'genetics' [54] and 'LDheatmap' [55] in the R programming language [56]. Finally, we counted the number of pairwise linkage associations exceeding a critical value that each locus shared with other loci. For these analyses, we used the Scott Creek anadromous adults as a reference population because it had the largest sample size and the most polymorphic loci (54/55 loci).

To quantify the association between Omy5 alleles and lifehistory, we compared the patterns of allele frequency variation in all populations, considering all SNP loci independently. For each locus, the allele with the highest frequency among the Scott Creek anadromous adults was used as a reference to calculate the frequency, p, of that same allele in all populations.

# 3. Results and analysis

#### (a) Genetic data

Of the 95 SNPs evaluated, eight failed to amplify, were not polymorphic, or not consistent with Mendelian segregation, all among the newly developed RADseq loci (failed: R13309, R17718; heterozygous in all individuals: R14387, R37798, R37851; monomorphic in all populations: R23404, R24167, R37101). After removing these loci from the dataset,

**Table 1.** Sample and location information for all populations. *N* denotes number of individuals sampled and Hap denotes the frequency of AD haplotype in each population, as defined in the text.

no.	site	watershed	life history	notes	N	Нар
1	Bauers Creek	Goose Lake	above barrier	inland resident trout	16	0.0
2	Buckboard Creek	Klamath River	above barrier	inland resident trout	15	0.0
3	Butcherknife Creek	McCloud River	above barrier	inland resident trout	16	0.0
4	Cutfinger Creek	Eel River	above barrier	waterfall	23	0.0
5	Willow Creek	Eel River	above barrier	waterfall	24	2.1
6	MF Eel River	Eel River	below barrier	summer steelhead	23	58.7
7	Eel River	Eel River	below barrier	winter steelhead	24	75.0
8	Big Creek	Scott Creek	above barrier	waterfall	47	33.7
9	Scott Creek	Scott Creek	below barrier	winter steelhead	47	84.0
10	San Lorenzo River	San Lorenzo	below barrier	winter steelhead	23	86.4
11	Nacimiento River	Salinas River	above barrier	dam	24	75.0
12	Tassajera Creek	Salinas River	below barrier	juveniles	23	25.0
13	Carmel River	Carmel River	below barrier	juveniles	24	95.8
14	NF Juncal Creek	Santa Ynez	above barrier	dam	23	100.0
15	Santa Cruz Creek	Santa Ynez	above barrier	dam	24	8.3
16	Hilton Creek	Santa Ynez	below barrier	downstream migrants	24	72.9
17	Salsipuedes Creek	Santa Ynez	below barrier	downstream migrants	23	84.1
18	Upper Piru Creek	Santa Clara	above barrier	dam	24	12.5
19	Piru Creek	Santa Clara	above barrier	dam	23	45.7
20	Sespe Creek	Santa Clara	above barrier	juveniles	24	35.4
21	Santa Paula Creek	Santa Clara	above barrier	juveniles	23	28.3
—	Eagle		hatchery trout	—	16	6.3
—	Mount Whitney		hatchery trout	—	16	62.5
—	Kamloops		hatchery trout	—	15	0.0
					total 564	mean 41.3

the remaining 87 loci consisted of 55 markers on Omy5 and 32 loci on other linkage groups (electronic supplementary material, appendix). Four loci displayed significant deviations from H–W equilibrium when considered over all surveyed populations (R30220, p < 0.05; R37229, R37560, p < 0.001; OMS00121, p = 'highly significant').

#### (b) Population structure

Patterns of genetic divergence based on the 32 non-Omy5 loci, as measured by  $F_{\rm ST}$  and phylogenetic network analysis (electronic supplementary material, figure S1), were consistent with previous studies showing close relationships between populations above and below barriers within a watershed and increasing divergence with distance along the California coast [39,40,57–60]. By contrast, analysis of loci located on Omy5 showed high divergence between above- and below-barrier populations within the same basin, and nearly complete reciprocal monophyly between above- and below-barrier populations (electronic supplementary material, figure S1).

#### (c) Linkage disequilibrium

None of the 495 pairwise tests for LD among the 32 non-Omy5 loci were significant after Bonferroni correction for multiple tests (p < 0.0001), even among pairs located on the same chromosome (23 loci on eight chromosomes). By contrast, 602

of the 1430 possible pairwise comparisons among the 55 Omy5 loci were significant (42%; p < 0.000034). This analysis included SNPs mapped to chromosome Omy5 as well as the three loci developed by Abadía-Cardoso *et al.* [45], confirming their strong linkage to loci on chromosome Omy5.

The allelic correlation coefficient,  $r^2$ , ranged from 0.008 to 0.53 over all 55 Omy5 loci, and was used to order all loci to visualize LD among Omy5 loci in each population (figure 2). In addition, 14 loci had  $r^2$  values greater than a critical value of 0.9 with 10 or more other loci, and 16 additional loci had  $r^2$  values greater than 0.5 with 19 or more loci (electronic supplementary material, appendix). Together these analyses clearly identify a block of loci in strong LD with each other, while other loci on Omy5 segregate more independently (figure 2). Although the exact boundaries of the linkage block are difficult to define in the absence of a physical map, the concordant patterns of LD and allele frequency variation across the populations of coastal *O. mykiss* surveyed here support the hypothesis that physical linkage is involved.

# (d) Allele frequency and haplotype variation among populations

The patterns of allele frequency variation are consistent with the LD analysis, and identify a subset of loci on Omy5 whose allele frequencies are both highly correlated and strongly



**Figure 2.** LD heatmap for all locus pairs among anadromous adults in Scott Creek. The loci are ordered by mean pairwise LD ( $r^2$ ). One locus (R30355) is monomorphic in Scott Creek and is arbitrarily ranked last. See text for details.

associated with the above- or below-barrier status of each population (table 1 and figure 3; electronic supplementary material, appendix). Thus, in the absence of relative position information from a physical map, we defined the 30 SNP loci with the highest mean pairwise  $r^2$  values (figure 2; electronic supplementary material, appendix) as a single, linked haplotype. These loci also had a large number of pairwise  $r^2$  values greater than 0.50, while the remaining 25 loci on Omy5 each had less than seven such relationships (electronic supplementary material, appendix). With few exceptions, these loci had nearly identical, population-specific allele frequencies that were highly correlated with each population's presumed life-history strategy (figure 3).

We designated the two major haplotypes identified in this region of Omy5 and associated with resident and anadromous life-history as RS and AD, respectively, and used their mean allele frequency to calculate the 'haplotype frequency' for each population. Above-barrier populations had significantly lower mean frequencies of the AD haplotype than below-barrier populations (table 1; *t*-test, 26.2 versus 72.7, *p* < 0.01). Significantly, the highest mean frequency of the AD haplotype (75.5) was observed among the four below-barrier populations with samples of known anadromous-phenotype individuals (i.e. adult steelhead; table 1).

Finally, we compared natural, presumably long-established, resident trout populations (Bauers, Buckboard, Butcherknife,

Cutfinger and Willow creeks) with recent, anthropogenically established, above-barrier populations (Sespe, Santa Paula, Upper Piru, Piru, Santa Cruz and Big creeks). Four of the five natural resident populations were fixed for the RS haplotype, while all of the recently established above-barrier populations remain polymorphic, and the natural resident populations had significantly lower mean frequency of the AD haplotype (table 1; *t*-test, 0.42 versus 42.4, p < 0.01).

# 4. Discussion

It is now clear that evolutionary change and adaptive divergence in natural populations can occur very rapidly, responding to strong selection over relatively short ecological timescales [2,4]. In addition, it is clear that human-induced selection often exerts far greater pressure than is typical of natural selection [3,61]. What is less clear is how selection affects the genetic architecture underlying these traits, i.e. whether parallel trait evolution also indicates parallel genetic evolution. Here, we provide evidence of parallel evolution affecting a large genomic region of Omy5 in populations of coastal *O. mykiss* and propose that it is due to parallel natural selection acting against the anadromous life history in populations of trout above barriers. Allele frequencies of a subset of the SNPs located on Omy5 display strong non-random



Figure 3. Allele frequency heatmap for the 55 SNP loci on Omy5. Loci are ordered left to right as in figure 2. Missing data for locus R21285 for the San Lorenzo, Carmel, Tassajera and Nacimiento samples are indicated by 'dots'.

associations with population life-history patterns, providing concordant evidence of strong selection operating on one region of this chromosome and repeated parallel change in the frequency of an existing haplotype in response to similar selective environments.

The observed patterns of parallel adaptive evolution at the genomic level are similar to those documented for the loss of armor plates in multiple populations of sticklebacks transitioning from marine to freshwater environments [14] and for parallel evolution of pigmentation in vertebrates [62], and imply a significant reduction in fitness of the anadromous phenotype in the above-barrier populations. For example, in Scott Creek, given an estimated above-barrier population size of 200–800 [63], simulations suggest that a relative fitness of approximately 0.85 would be required to drive the observed reduction in AD haplotype frequency over 20–50 generations (results not shown [64]). Thus, our data are consistent with the hypothesis that individual expression of life-history pattern is directly influenced by one or more genes in this region of Omy5.

Our results provide data from natural populations in California and Oregon that support prior studies on diverse *O. mykiss* lineages using candidate genes, genome wide association and QTL mapping to explore the genetic architecture of traits associated with life history in *O. mykiss*, including

migration [17,32,42,46,48,65–76]. Many of these studies have identified QTL or significant associations between markers on Omy5 and life-history traits such as spawn timing [47,65,68], smoltification [42,46] and development rate or early maturation [17,66,67,70]. Thus, this study supports previous suggestions that the LD block on chromosome Omy5 represents a 'master control region' influencing residency and anadromy in *O. mykiss* [46,72] and is a parallel selected region [21] that has experienced repeated selection in multiple populations.

Population genomic surveys may provide improved mapping resolution for genomic regions underlying adaptive phenotypes by taking advantage of numerous generations of recombination in nature [24]. For example, 310 of the 344 SNP loci identified by RAD on Omy5 mapped to a single location in the crossing families of Miller et al. [17], the highest number of such tightly linked loci found on any chromosome in that study, consistent with previous studies that have had little success in resolving the relative positions of markers located within this region [17,43,46,66,70]. By contrast, our analysis of 55 of these loci clearly differentiated loci within a cohesive linkage block from those segregating normally on other parts of the chromosome. Thus, despite the lack of resolution from QTL mapping studies, our population genomic results provide relative position information about a subset of the Omy5 loci.

Regions of reduced recombination may arise from a variety of mechanisms and are common throughout the genomes of many organisms [77]. However, Phillips et al. [43] noted that chromosome Omy5 was a 'major exception' to the general patterns of recombination among O. mykiss chromosomes, suggesting that there is strong suppression of recombination along at least part of its length. Chromosomal inversions have long been suspected to contribute to local adaptation as the loss of recombination in such regions effectively joins co-adapted alleles at multiple loci into larger haplotypes and prevents them from being separated [78-81]. Although we do not know the specific genes or mutations under selection in the Omy5 region, a Clock gene is known to map to this region, and Clock genes have been shown to be associated with life-history variation in salmonids [32,65,69]. However, the complexity of the smolting phenotype suggests the presence of multiple genes involved in a co-adapted gene complex affecting a variety of traits.

#### (a) Conservation implications

Recognition of the extent and pace of contemporary evolution is critical to conservation efforts [82]. The present survey includes representatives from four steelhead Distinct Population Segments in California [83], as well as three divergent O. mykiss lineages and three of the hatchery rainbow trout strains most commonly stocked in California. Almost all California steelhead are protected by the 1973 US Endangered Species Act (ESA), but this protection extends only to 'naturally spawned anadromous O. mykiss (steelhead) populations below natural and man-made impassable barriers'. Thus, despite clear evidence that O. mykiss above and below barriers in the same coastal basins always share recent common ancestry [39,40,57,84], that offspring of both resident and anadromous O. mykiss parents can express the alternate phenotype [85], and that fish in abovebarrier populations may still undergo smoltification [37,86,87], all fish above natural or artificial barriers to fish passage are excluded from the management units afforded ESA protection [83].

Despite the consistency of the association between Omy5 and life-history pattern, several populations showed allele frequency patterns counter to our initial prediction. Interestingly, these patterns appear to indicate the life-history type that actually contributes most to successful reproduction in these populations. For example, we initially designated two populations from the Santa Clara River, Sespe and Santa Paula creeks, as 'below barrier', but both displayed moderately high frequencies of the RS haplotype. In fact, both of these populations are located above the Vern Freeman Diversion Dam, which, along with other water diversion activities in the lower Santa Clara River, has 'effectively impeded or block[*ed*] fish passage to spawning and rearing habitat in the major tributaries of the Santa Clara River' since 1900, despite the presence of a fish ladder [88]. Thus, our results are consistent with selection from this dam contributing to the almost complete loss of the anadromous life history in the Santa Clara River. Similarly, habitat modifications probably select against anadromy in the headwaters of the Salinas River; the below-barrier Tassajera population is above sections of the river that are completely dewatered in many years.

The significantly lower frequency of the AD haplotype in older, natural, above-barrier populations relative to more recently established populations suggests that given enough time, strong selection against the migratory life history may remove the AD haplotype from these populations as well. The distinction between populations above waterfall barriers and those above dams may also be significant if dams differ from natural barriers in their ability to allow individual fish to express life-history decisions. For example, if the design or operation of a particular dam limits downstream passage of smolts, individuals that might have left the above-barrier habitat are instead forced to remain. Moreover, large reservoirs may provide ocean-like growth and rearing habitat, supporting an adfluvial life history [86,87] that preserves some aspects of anadromy and favours the AD haplotype even in a closed freshwater system. This phenomenon could explain the high frequency of the AD haplotype in the Nacimiento and North Fork Juncal populations, both of which are above large reservoirs, although the potential role of drift in creating such patterns in small above-barrier populations cannot be dismissed. The present data provide a basis for prediction of the life history favoured in a given population and a method for genomic data to contribute to the delineation of appropriate management units in this species [89,90], as well as providing a measurable indicator of the life history favoured by the ecological conditions in a given stream.

Acknowledgements. We thank Anthony Clemento (NMFS/UCSC), Sean Hayes, David Boughton and Heidi Fish (NMFS), Steve Jacobs and Stephanie Gunckle (ODFW) and Bernie May (UC Davis) for providing samples used in this study; and Sara Paddock and Travis Apgar for help with the GIS map. We also thank Eric Anderson, Anthony Clemento, Libby Gilbert-Horvath and Victoria Pritchard for discussions and assistance with data analysis and interpretation.

# References

- Phillips BL, Brown GP, Webb JK, Shine R. 2006 Invasion and the evolution of speed in toads. *Nature* 439, 803. (doi:10.1038/439803a)
- Carroll SP, Hendry AP, Reznick DN, Fox CW.
  2007 Evolution on ecological time-scales. *Funct. Ecol.* 21, 387–393. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-2435.2007. 01289.x)
- Darimont CT, Carlson SM, Kinnison MT, Paquet PC, Reimchen TE, Wilmers CC. 2009 Human predators outpace other agents of trait change in the wild.

*Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **106**, 952–954. (doi:10. 1073/pnas.0809235106)

- Ramstad KM, Woody CA, Allendorf FW. 2010 Recent local adaptation of sockeye salmon to glacial spawning habitats. *Evol. Ecol.* 24, 391–411. (doi:10.1007/s10682-009-9313-5)
- Westley PAH, Ward EJ, Fleming IA. 2013 Fine-scale local adaptation in an invasive freshwater fish has evolved in contemporary time. *Proc. R. Soc. B* 280, 20122327. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2012.2327)
- Phillis C, Moore J, Buoror M, Hayes SA, Garza JC, Pearse DE. 2013 Submitted. Shifting thresholds: rapid evolution of migratory life histories in steelhead/rainbow trout, *Oncorhynchus mykiss. Proc. R. Soc. B*
- Palkovacs EP, Kinnison MT, Correa C, Dalton CM, Hendry AP. 2012 Fates beyond traits: ecological consequences of human-induced trait change. *Evol. Appl.* 5, 183–191. (doi:10.1111/j.1752-4571.2011. 00212.x)

rspb.royalsocietypublishing.org Proc. R. Soc. B 281: 20140012

8

- Schoener TW. 2011 The newest synthesis: understanding the interplay of evolutionary and ecological dynamics. *Science* 331, 426–429. (doi:10.1126/science.1193954)
- Pearse DE, Pogson GH. 2000 Parallel evolution of the melanic form of the California legless lizard, *Anniella pulchra*, inferred from mitochondrial DNA sequence variation. *Evolution* 54, 1041–1046. (doi:10.1554/ 0014-3820(2000)0541041:peotmf]2.3.co;2)
- Waples RS, Teel DJ, Myers JM, Marshall AR. 2004 Lifehistory divergence in Chinook salmon: historic contingency and parallel evolution. *Evolution* 58, 386–403. (doi:10.1111/j.0014-3820.2004.tb01654.x)
- Rosenblum EB, Harmon LJ. 2011 'Same same but different': replicated ecological speciation at white sands. *Evolution* 65, 946–960. (doi:10.1111/j.1558-5646.2010.01190.x)
- Cresko WA, Amores A, Wilson C, Murphy J, Currey M, Phillips P, Bell MA, Kimmel CB, Postlethwait JH. 2004 Parallel genetic basis for repeated evolution of armor loss in Alaskan threespine stickleback populations. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **101**, 6050–6055. (doi:10.1073/pnas.0308479101)
- Mundy NI, Badcock NS, Hart T, Scribner K, Janssen K, Nadeau NJ. 2004 Conserved genetic basis of a quantitative plumage trait involved in mate choice. *Science* **303**, 1870–1873. (doi:10.1126/science. 1093834)
- Colosimo PF *et al.* 2005 Widespread parallel evolution in sticklebacks by repeated fixation of ectodysplasin alleles. *Science* **307**, 1928–1933. (doi:10.1126/science.1107239)
- Hohenlohe PA, Bassham S, Currey M, Cresko WA. 2012 Extensive linkage disequilibrium and parallel adaptive divergence across threespine stickleback genomes. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B* 367, 395–408. (doi:10.1098/rstb.2011.0245)
- Jones FC *et al.* 2012 The genomic basis of adaptive evolution in threespine sticklebacks. *Nature* 484, 55–61. (doi:10.1038/nature10944)
- Miller MR, Brunelli JP, Wheeler PA, Liu SX, Rexroad CE, Palti Y, Doe CQ, Thorgaard GH. 2012 A conserved haplotype controls parallel adaptation in geographically distant salmonid populations. *Mol. Ecol.* 21, 237–249. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-294X.2011.05305.x)
- Hoekstra HE, Nachman MW. 2003 Different genes underlie adaptive melanism in different populations of rock pocket mice. *Mol. Ecol.* **12**, 1185–1194. (doi:10.1046/j.1365-294X.2003.01788.x)
- Steiner CC, Rompler H, Boettger LM, Schoneberg T, Hoekstra HE. 2009 The genetic basis of phenotypic convergence in beach mice: similar pigment patterns but different genes. *Mole. Biol. Evol.* 26, 35–45. (doi:10.1093/molbev/msn218)
- Barrett RDH, Schluter D. 2008 Adaptation from standing genetic variation. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 23, 38-44. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2007.09.008)
- Chan YF, Jones FC, McConnell E, Bryk J, Bunger L, Tautz D. 2012 Parallel selection mapping using artificially selected mice reveals body weight control loci. *Curr. Biol.* 22, 794–800. (doi:10.1016/j.cub.2012.03.011)
- 22. Aubin-Horth N, Landry CR, Letcher BH, Hofmann HA. 2005 Alternative life histories shape brain gene

expression profiles in males of the same population. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **272**, 1655–1662. (doi:10.1098/rspb. 2005.3125)

- 23. Whitehead A, Pilcher W, Champlin D, Nacci D. 2012 Common mechanism underlies repeated evolution of extreme pollution tolerance. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **279**, 427–433. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2011.0847)
- Stinchcombe JR, Hoekstra HE. 2008 Combining population genomics and quantitative genetics: finding the genes underlying ecologically important traits. *Heredity* **100**, 158–170. (doi:10.1038/sj.hdy. 6800937)
- Thrower FP, Hard JJ, Joyce JE. 2004 Genetic architecture of growth and early life-history transitions in anadromous and derived freshwater populations of steelhead. *J. Fish Biol.* 65, 286–307. (doi:10.1111/j.1095-8649.2004.00551.x)
- Barrett RDH, Vines TH, Bystriansky JS, Schulte PM. 2009 Should I stay or should I go? The *Ectodysplasin* locus is associated with behavioural differences in threespine stickleback. *Biol. Lett.* 5, 788–791. (doi:10.1098/rsbl.2009.0416)
- Barrett RDH, Hoekstra HE. 2011 Molecular spandrels: tests of adaptation at the genetic level. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 12, 767–780. (doi:10.1038/nrg3015)
- Stapley J *et al.* 2010 Adaptation genomics: the next generation. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 25, 705–712. (doi:10. 1016/j.tree.2010.09.002)
- Liedvogel M, Akesson S, Bensch S. 2011 The genetics of migration on the move. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 26, 561–569. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2011.07.009)
- Dodson JJ, Aubin-Horth N, Thériault V, Páez DJ. 2013 The evolutionary ecology of alternative migratory tactics in salmonid fishes. *Biol. Rev.* 88, 602–625. (doi:10.1111/brv.12019)
- Pulido F. 2011 Evolutionary genetics of partial migration—the threshold model of migration revis(it)ed. *Oikos* **120**, 1776–1783. (doi:10.1111/j. 1600-0706.2011.19844.x)
- O'Malley KG, Ford MJ, Hard JJ. 2010 Clock polymorphism in Pacific salmon: evidence for variable selection along a latitudinal gradient. *Proc. R. Soc. B* 277, 3703–3714. (doi:10.1098/ rspb.2010.0762)
- Mueller JC, Pulido F, Kempenaers B. 2011 Identification of a gene associated with avian migratory behaviour. *Proc. R. Soc. B* 278, 2848–2856. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2010.2567)
- Cowx IG. 2005–2013 Cultured Aquatic Species Information Programme. *Oncorhynchus mykiss*. FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department online. See http://www.fao.org/fishery/culturedspecies/ Oncorhynchus\_mykiss.
- Olsen JB, Wuttig K, Fleming D, Kretschmer EJ, Wenburg JK. 2006 Evidence of partial anadromy and resident-form dispersal bias on a fine scale in populations of *Oncorhynchus mykiss. Conserv. Genet.* 7, 613–619. (doi:10.1007/s10592-005-9099-0)
- McPhee MV, Utter F, Stanford JA, Kuzishchin KV, Savvaitova KA, Pavlov DS, Allendorf FW. 2007 Population structure and partial anadromy in Oncorhynchus mykiss from Kamchatka: relevance for conservation strategies around the Pacific Rim. Ecol.

Freshwater Fish **16**, 539–547. (doi:10.1111/j.1600-0633.2007.00248.x)

- Hayes SA, Hanson CV, Pearse DE, Bond MH, Garza JC, MacFarlane RB. 2012 Should I stay or should I go? The influence of genetic origin on emigration behavior and physiology of resident and anadromous juvenile *Oncorhynchus mykiss. North Am. J. Fish. Manag.* 32, 772–780. (doi:10.1080/02755947.2012.686953)
- Neave F. 1944 Racial characteristics and migratory habits in *Salmo gairdneri*. J. Fish. Board Can. 6, 245–251. (doi:10.1139/f42-030)
- Clemento AJ, Anderson EC, Boughton D, Girman D, Garza JC. 2009 Population genetic structure and ancestry of *Oncorhynchus mykiss* populations above and below dams in south-central California. *Conserv. Genet.* **10**, 1321–1336. (doi:10.1007/ s10592-008-9712-0)
- Pearse DE, Hayes SA, Bond MH, Hanson CV, Anderson EC, Macfarlane RB, Garza JC. 2009 Over the falls? Rapid evolution of ecotypic differentiation in steelhead/ rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *J. Heredity* **100**, 515–525. (doi:10.1093/jhered/esp040)
- Heath DD, Bettles CM, Jamieson S, Stasiak I, Docker MF. 2008 Genetic differentiation among sympatric migratory and resident life history forms of rainbow trout in British Columbia. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* 137, 1268–1277. (doi:10.1577/T05-278.1)
- Martínez A, Garza JC, Pearse DE. 2011 A microsatellite genome screen identifies chromosomal regions under differential selection in steelhead and rainbow trout. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* 140, 829–842. (doi:10.1080/00028487. 2011.588094)
- Phillips RB *et al.* 2006 Assignment of rainbow trout linkage groups to specific chromosomes. *Genetics* **174**, 1661–1670. (doi:10.1534/genetics.105.055269)
- Rexroad CE, Palti Y, Gahr SA, Vallejo RL. 2008 A second generation genetic map for rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *BMC Genet.* 9, 74. (doi:10. 1186/1471-2156-9-74)
- Abadía-Cardoso A, Clemento AJ, Garza JC. 2011 Discovery and characterization of single nucleotide polymorphisms in steelhead/rainbow trout, *Oncorhynchus mykiss. Mol. Ecol. Resour.* 11(Suppl. 1), 31–49. (doi:10.1111/j.1755-0998.2010.02971.x)
- Nichols KM, Edo AF, Wheeler PA, Thorgaard GH.
  2008 The genetic basis of smoltification-related traits in *Oncorhynchus mykiss. Genetics* **179**, 1559–1575. (doi:10.1534/genetics.107.084251)
- O'Malley KG, Sakamoto T, Danzmann RG, Ferguson MM. 2003 Quantitative trait loci for spawning date and body weight in rainbow trout: testing for conserved effects across ancestrally duplicated chromosomes. J. Hered. 94, 273 – 284. (doi:10.1093/ jhered/esg067)
- Robison BD, Wheeler PA, Sundin K, Sikka P, Thorgaard GH. 2001 Composite interval mapping reveals a major locus influencing embryonic development rate in rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). J. Hered. **92**, 16–22. (doi:10.1093/jhered/ 92.1.16)
- 49. Clemento AJ. 2006 Subpopulation structure of steelhead trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) in the

Middle Fork Eel River as determined by microsatellite DNA polymorphisms. MS Thesis, Humboldt State University.

- Castaño-Sánchez C, Smith T, Wiedmann R, Vallejo R, Salem M, Yao J, Rexroad C. 2009 Single nucleotide polymorphism discovery in rainbow trout by deep sequencing of a reduced representation library. *BMC Genomics* **10**, 559. (doi:10.1186/1471-2164-10-559)
- Raymond M, Rousset F. 1995 GENEPOP (version 1.2): population genetics software for exact tests and ecumenicism. *J. Hered.* 86, 248–249.
- Hill W, Robertson A. 1968 Linkage disequilibrium in finite populations. *Theoret. Appl. Genet.* 38, 226–231. (doi:10.1007/BF01245622)
- Pritchard JK, Przeworski M. 2001 Linkage disequilibrium in humans: models and data.
   Am. J. Hum. Genet. 69, 1–14. (doi:10.1086/321275)
- Warnes G, Leisch F. 2005 genetics: Population Genetics. R package version 1.2.0. See http://cran.rproject.org/web/packages/genetics/index.html.
- Shin J-H, Blay S, McNeney B, Graham J. 2006 LDheatmap: an R Function for graphical display of pairwise linkage disequilibria between single nucleotide polymorphisms. *J. Stat. Softw.* (16 Code Snippet 13) 1–10.
- R Development Core Team. 2011 A language and environment for statistical computing. Vienna, Austria: R Foundation for Statistical Computing.
- Pearse DE, Donohoe CJ, Garza JC. 2007 Population genetics of steelhead (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) in the Klamath River. *Environ. Biol. Fish.* **80**, 377–387. (doi:10.1007/s10641-006-9135-z)
- Pearse DE, Martinez E, Garza JC. 2011 Disruption of historical patterns of isolation by distance in coastal steelhead. *Conserv. Genet.* 12, 691–700. (doi:10. 1007/s10592-010-0175-8)
- Pearse DE, Gunckel SL, Jacobs SE. 2011 Population structure and genetic divergence of coastal rainbow and redband trout in the Upper Klamath Basin. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* **140**, 587–597. (doi:10.1080/ 00028487.2011.583538)
- Garza JC, Gilbert-Horvath EA, Spence BC, Williams TH, Fish H, Gough SA, Anderson JH, Hamm D, Anderson EC. 2014 Population structure of steelhead in coastal California. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* 143, 134–152. (doi:10.1080/00028487.2013.822420)
- Brown CR, Brown MB. 2013 Where has all the road kill gone? *Curr. Biol.* 23, R233 – R234. (doi:10.1016/ j.cub.2013.02.023)
- Manceau M, Domingues VS, Linnen CR, Rosenblum EB, Hoekstra HE. 2010 Convergence in pigmentation at multiple levels: mutations, genes and function. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B* 365, 2439–2450. (doi:10. 1098/rstb.2010.0104)
- Anderson EC, Slatkin M. 2007 Estimation of the number of individuals founding colonized populations. *Evolution* 61, 972–983. (doi:10.1111/j. 1558-5646.2007.00080.x)
- 64. Felsenstein J, Horino H, Lamont S, Bill Alford MW, Palczewski M, Buxton D, Walkup E. 2008 PopG v 3.3. See http://evolution.gs.washington.edu/popgen/.
- 65. Leder EH, Danzmann RG, Ferguson MM. 2006 The candidate gene, *Clock*, localizes to a strong

spawning time quantitative trait locus region in rainbow trout. *J. Hered.* **97**, 74–80. (doi:10.1093/ jhered/esj004)

- Nichols KM, Broman KW, Sundin K, Young JM, Wheeler PA, Thorgaard GH. 2007 Quantitative trait loci x maternal cytoplasmic environment interaction for development rate in *Oncorhynchus mykiss*. *Genetics* **175**, 335–347. (doi:10.1534/genetics. 106.064311)
- Haidle L, Janssen JE, Gharbi K, Moghadam HK, Ferguson MM, Danzmann RG. 2008 Determination of quantitative trait loci (QTL) for early maturation in rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *Mar. Biotechnol.* **10**, 579–592. (doi:10.1007/s10126-008-9098-5)
- Colihueque N, Cardenas R, Ramirez L, Estay F, Araneda C. 2010 Analysis of the association between spawning time QTL markers and the biannual spawning behavior in rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *Genet. Mol. Biol.* **33**, 578– 582. (doi:10.1590/s1415-47572010000300032)
- Paibomesai MI, Moghadam HK, Ferguson MM, Danzman RG. 2010 Clock genes and their genomic distributions in three species of salmonid fishes: associations with genes regulating sexual maturation and cell cycling. *BMC Res. Notes* 3, 215–235. (doi:10.1186/1756-0500-3-215)
- Easton AA, Moghadam HK, Danzmann RG, Ferguson MM. 2011 The genetic architecture of embryonic developmental rate and genetic covariation with age at maturation in rainbow trout *Oncorhynchus mykiss. J. Fish Biol.* **78**, 602–623. (doi:10.1111/j. 1095-8649.2010.02881.x)
- Hecht BC, Campbell NR, Holecek DE, Narum SR. 2013 Genome-wide association reveals genetic basis for the propensity to migrate in wild populations of rainbow and steelhead trout. *Mol. Ecol.* 22, 3061–3076. (doi:10.1111/mec.12082)
- Hecht BC, Thrower FP, Hale MC, Miller MR, Nichols KM. 2012 Genetic architecture of migration-related traits in rainbow and steelhead trout, *Oncorhynchus mykiss. G3-Genes Genomes Genet.* 2, 1113–1127. (doi:10.1534/g3.112.003137)
- Le Bras Y *et al.* 2011 Detection of QTL with effects on osmoregulation capacities in the rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *BMC Genet.* **12**, 46. (doi:10. 1186/1471-2156-12-46)
- Narum SR, Zendt JS, Frederiksen C, Campbell N, Matala A, Sharp WR. 2011 Candidate genetic markers associated with anadromy in *Oncorhynchus mykiss* of the Klickitat River. *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* 140, 843–854. (doi:10.1080/00028487.2011. 588131)
- Limborg MT, Blankenship SM, Young SF, Utter FM, Seeb LW, Hansen MH, Seeb JE. 2012 Signatures of natural selection among lineages and habitats in Oncorhynchus mykiss. Ecol. Evol. 2, 1–18. (doi:10. 1002/ece3.59)
- Hale MC, Thrower FP, Berntson EA, Miller MR, Nichols KM. 2013 Evaluating adaptive divergence between migratory and non-migratory ecotypes of a salmonid fish, *Oncorhynchus mykiss. G3-Genes Genomes Genet.* 3, 1273 – 1285. (doi:10.1534/g3. 113.006817)

- Wall JD, Pritchard JK. 2003 Haplotype blocks and linkage disequilibrium in the human genome. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 4, 587–597. (doi:10.1038/nrg1123)
- Lowry DB, Willis JH. 2010 A widespread chromosomal inversion polymorphism contributes to a major life-history transition, local adaptation, and reproductive isolation. *PLoS Biol.* 8, e1000500. (doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.1000500)
- 79. Dobzhansky T. 1937 *Genetics and the origin of species*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.
- Feder JL, Nosil P. 2009 Chromosomal inversions and species differences: when are genes affecting adaptive divergence and reproductive isolation expected to reside within inversions? *Evolution* 63, 3061–3075. (doi:10.1111/j.1558-5646.2009.00786.x)
- Kirkpatrick M, Kern A. 2012 Where's the money? Inversions, genes, and the hunt for genomic targets of selection. *Genetics* **190**, 1153–1155. (doi:10. 1534/genetics.112.139899)
- Ashley MV, Willson MF, Pergams OR, O'Dowd DJ, Gende SM, Brown JS. 2003 Evolutionarily enlightened management. *Biol. Conserv.* 111, 115–123. (doi:10.1016/S0006-3207(02)00279-3)
- NOAA. 2006 Endangered and threatened species: final listing determinations for 10 distinct population segments of west coast steelhead (ed. NOAA), pp. 833–862. Portland, OR: US Federal Register.
- Deiner K, Garza JC, Coey R, Girman DJ. 2007 Population structure and genetic diversity of trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) above and below natural and man-made barriers in the Russian River, California. *Conserv. Genet.* 8, 437–454. (doi:10.1007/s10592-006-9183-0)
- Zimmerman CE, Reeves GH. 2000 Population structure of sympatric anadromous and nonanadromous *Oncorhynchus mykiss*: evidence from spawning surveys and otolith microchemistry. *Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci.* 57, 2152–2162. (doi:10. 1139/cjfas-57-10-2152)
- Thrower FP, Joyce JE, Celewycz AG, Malecha PW. 2008 The potential importance of reservoirs in the western United States for the recovery of endangered populations of anadromous steelhead. *Am. Fish. Soc. Symp.* 62, 309–324.
- Holecek DE, Scarnecchia DL, Miller SE. 2012 Smoltification in an impounded, adfluvial redband trout population upstream from an impassable dam: does it persist? *Trans. Am. Fish. Soc.* 141, 68–75. (doi:10.1080/00028487.2011.651550)
- NMFS. 2012 Southern California Steelhead Recovery Plan. National Marine Fisheries Service, Southwest Region, Protected Resources Division.
- Allendorf FW, Hohenlohe PA, Luikart G. 2010 Genomics and the future of conservation genetics. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* **11**, 697–709. (doi:10.1038/ nrg2844)
- Funk WC, McKay JK, Hohenlohe PA, Allendorf FW. 2012 Harnessing genomics for delineating conservation units. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 27, 489–496. (doi:10.1016/j.tree.2012.05.012)