

# Hydrogen Photoproduction by Immobilized N<sub>2</sub>-Fixing Cyanobacteria: Understanding the Role of the Uptake Hydrogenase in the Long-Term Process

## Sergey Kosourov,<sup>a</sup> Hannu Leino,<sup>a</sup> Gayathri Murukesan,<sup>a</sup> Fiona Lynch,<sup>a</sup> Kaarina Sivonen,<sup>b</sup> Anatoly A. Tsygankov,<sup>c</sup> Eva-Mari Aro,<sup>a</sup> Yagut Allahverdiyeva<sup>a</sup>

Molecular Plant Biology, Department of Biochemistry, University of Turku, Turku, Finland<sup>a</sup>; Division of Microbiology and Biotechnology, Department of Food and Environmental Sciences, University of Helsinki, Finland<sup>b</sup>; Institute of Basic Biological Problems, RAS, Pushchino, Russia<sup>c</sup>

We have investigated two approaches to enhance and extend  $H_2$  photoproduction yields in heterocystous,  $N_2$ -fixing cyanobacteria entrapped in thin alginate films. In the first approach, periodic CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation was provided to alginate-entrapped, N-deprived cells. N deprivation led to the inhibition of photosynthetic activity in vegetative cells and the attenuation of  $H_2$  production over time. Our results demonstrated that alginate-entrapped  $\Delta hupL$  cells were considerably more sensitive to high light intensity, N deficiency, and imbalances in C/N ratios than wild-type cells. In the second approach, *Anabaena* strain PCC 7120, its  $\Delta hupL$  mutant, and *Calothrix* strain 336/3 films were supplemented with N<sub>2</sub> by periodic treatments of air, or air plus CO<sub>2</sub>. These treatments restored the photosynthetic activity of the cells and led to a high level of H<sub>2</sub> production in *Calothrix* 336/3 and  $\Delta hupL$  cells (except for the treatment air plus CO<sub>2</sub>) but not in the *Anabaena* PCC 7120 strain (for which H<sub>2</sub> yields did not change after air treatments). The highest H<sub>2</sub> yield was obtained by the air treatment of  $\Delta hupL$  cells. Notably, the supplementation of CO<sub>2</sub> under an air atmosphere led to prominent symptoms of N deficiency in the  $\Delta hupL$  strain but not in the wild-type strain. We propose that uptake hydrogenase activity in heterocystous cyanobacteria not only supports nitrogenase activity by removing excess O<sub>2</sub> from heterocysts but also indirectly protects the photosynthetic apparatus of vegetative cells from photoinhibition, especially under stressful conditions that cause an imbalance in the C/N ratio in cells.

**M** any species of cyanobacteria and eukaryotic microalgae are capable of water biophotolysis, a light-dependent photosynthetic reaction that results in water oxidation with concomitant generation of molecular H<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub>. Among cyanobacteria, N<sub>2</sub>fixing heterocystous species are the most promising candidates as potential H<sub>2</sub> producers (1). In these species, H<sub>2</sub> is generated mainly by the nitrogenase enzyme as an obligatory by-product of N<sub>2</sub> fixation (2). Although nitrogenase is sensitive to inactivation by O<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub> fixation in heterocyst-forming species is protected by localization in specialized heterocyst cells. The maintenance of microoxic conditions within heterocyst cells enables efficient N<sub>2</sub> fixation, even under atmospheric levels of O<sub>2</sub> (2, 3).

Hydrogen formed in heterocysts is usually recycled by uptake hydrogenase (Hup) (4, 5). The uptake of H<sub>2</sub> may contribute to the decrease in partial pressure of oxygen inside the heterocyst cells via a Knallgas (oxyhydrogen) reaction, which is beneficial for sustained  $N_2$  fixation (6), and may also serve as an additional source of electrons for the nitrogenase enzyme and other processes (3). As a result, the vast majority of heterocystous strains isolated from the natural environment show very little net H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction under ambient air conditions (1, 2). Under nitrogen deficiency, nitrogenase catalyzes solely the reduction of protons to  $H_2$  (2), thus improving  $H_2$  photoproduction yields (7). In addition to uptake hydrogenase, many heterocystous cyanobacteria contain bidirectional (Hox) hydrogenase. This enzyme may also participate in  $H_2$  recycling, though at substantially lower rates (4, 5, 8, 9). The primary function of the bidirectional hydrogenase in cyanobacteria is for regeneration of  $NAD(P)^+$  from NAD(P)H during dark fermentation with concomitant evolution of  $H_2$  (8). This enzyme, however, is also responsible for short-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction and is believed to prevent overreduction of the photosynthetic electron transport chain at the onset of illumination, especially in anaerobic environments (9-11).

The real potential of cyanobacterial  $H_2$  photoproduction has yet to be fully explored. This is at least partly due to criticism of the high-energy requirement of nitrogenase-dependent  $H_2$  photoproduction, which requires at least 4 mol of ATP per mole of  $H_2$ produced (12). Heterocystous species are the most promising cyanobacteria for  $H_2$  photoproduction as they are the only organisms capable of driving the  $H_2$  photoproduction process under strictly autotrophic conditions, in the presence of atmospheric levels of  $O_2$ , and for extended periods of up to a few months under solar light intensities and periodic light conditions (13, 14). While the efficiency of  $H_2$  photoproduction by any known species is currently far below requirements for commercial application, there are several promising approaches for significant improvement.

The  $H_2$  photoproduction yields in cultures of heterocystous cyanobacteria can be significantly enhanced via elimination of uptake hydrogenase activity in cells. A good example of this is the PK84 strain, a chemically induced mutant of *Anabaena variabilis* 

Received 3 June 2014 Accepted 9 July 2014

Published ahead of print 11 July 2014

Editor: G. Voordouw

Address correspondence to Yagut Allahverdiyeva, allahve@utu.fi.

Supplemental material for this article may be found at http://dx.doi.org/10.1128 /AEM.01776-14.

Copyright © 2014, American Society for Microbiology. All Rights Reserved. doi:10.1128/AEM.01776-14

with impaired hydrogenases that, in contrast to the parental strain, is able to produce  $H_2$  in air containing 2% CO<sub>2</sub> (15, 16). This mutant has also demonstrated H<sub>2</sub> generation under outdoor conditions, where it has performed successfully for up to 40 days (14). There have been other mutant strains lacking HupL or HupS subunits of uptake hydrogenase which have also demonstrated more efficient  $H_2$  photoproduction (17–19). Among these are the  $\Delta hupL$  and  $\Delta hupL \Delta hoxH$  mutants of *Anabaena* strain PCC 7120 (20) that were used in the current study. The inactivation of uptake hydrogenase in cyanobacteria not only affects H<sub>2</sub> production but also results in a prominent loss of nonrecycled metabolic energy that leads to a significant change in the overall metabolic equilibrium. This change induces a cascade of compensatory mechanisms affecting both oxygen reduction mechanisms in heterocysts and processes providing reducing equivalents for different metabolic activities, including N<sub>2</sub> fixation (21).

Another promising approach for improving H<sub>2</sub> production yields in cyanobacteria is to screen for strains with naturally high H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction activity. The H<sub>2</sub> production capacity of promising strains can be further enhanced using genetic engineering techniques, including elimination of the hup genes (as described above), modification of the active center of nitrogenase (22, 23), and changes in the light-absorbing properties of both vegetative cells and heterocysts in a similar manner to approaches employed in green algae (24) and purple bacteria (25). Our recent screening of the University of Helsinki Cyanobacteria Collection (UHCC) revealed several cyanobacterial strains with promising  $H_2$  photoproduction rates (26). One of these strains, *Calothrix* strain 336/3, a filamentous N2-fixing cyanobacterium, showed efficient H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction both in suspension cultures and immobilized films (26, 27). The yields and the rates of  $H_2$  photoproduction of Calothrix 336/3 were higher than in most other N<sub>2</sub>-fixing heterocystous species and were comparable to the rates in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant of Anabaena PCC 7120 (26, 27).

Future efforts into improving H<sub>2</sub> yield should also target the development of better light utilization capacities in cyanobacterial cultures and the direction of absorbed light energy solely into H<sub>2</sub> production rather than biomass accumulation. For better light utilization per surface area unit, future technology requires the entrapment of algae and cyanobacteria in thin films consisting of a few layers of photosynthetic cells. The concept of an artificial leaf has been recognized (28), and approaches for making such a leaf are under development. There are several different techniques that can be considered for further improvements, including natural biofilm formation on translucent matrices and latex coatings (29). Latex coatings (28, 30), including the wet coalescence approach (31), are promising methods for the entrapment of phototrophic organisms, but these methods are not usually as efficient as hydrogels for the immobilization of H2-producing microalgae and cyanobacteria. Recently, a technique for entrapment of eukaryotic microalgae within thin-layer alginate matrices has been developed, which has demonstrated 1.5% conversion efficiency of light energy to  $H_2$  (32). This same technique has also worked efficiently for immobilization of N2-fixing heterocystous cyanobacteria (27). The entrapment of cyanobacterial cells within thin alginate matrices under nitrogen-deficient conditions reduced the accumulation of cell biomass, improved H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields, and prolonged the duration of the H<sub>2</sub> production process.

In the present work, we evaluate possible routes to long-term and efficient  $H_2$  photoproduction by immobilized cells of  $N_2$ -

fixing heterocystous cyanobacteria by (i) supplementing  $CO_2$  periodically to the films producing  $H_2$  under an Ar atmosphere, (ii) investigating the effect of different gas atmospheres (Ar, air, and  $N_2$ ) on  $H_2$  production and cell fitness, and (iii) applying periodic short-term air treatments to the films producing  $H_2$  under an Ar atmosphere. We demonstrate that  $H_2$  photoproduction yield can be enhanced through the restoration of cell metabolism, particularly photosynthetic activity in N-starved immobilized cells, by periodic  $CO_2$  additions and air treatments. Our results also demonstrate the important role of uptake hydrogenase in photoprotection of the photosynthetic apparatus in the long-term process.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

Strains and growth conditions. The wild-type (WT) Anabaena PCC 7120 strain was obtained from the Pasteur Culture Collection (Paris, France). The  $\Delta hupL$  and  $\Delta hupL \Delta hoxH$  mutants of Anabaena PCC 7120 lacking uptake hydrogenase and both uptake and bidirectional hydrogenases, respectively, were kindly provided by H. Sakurai. The Calothrix 336/3 strain was selected from the UHCC as has been described previously (26). In this study, we always used cells grown under diazotropic conditions. Stock cultures of all strains were pregrown at room temperature in 150-ml Erlenmeyer flasks containing 50 ml of Z8 medium (33) without combined nitrogen (Z8x). The medium for growing stock cultures of the  $\Delta hupL$  and  $\Delta hupL \Delta hoxH$  strains was supplemented with 25 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> spectinomycin or 25  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup> spectinomycin plus 10  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup> neomycin, respectively. The flasks were illuminated from the top with cool-daylight fluorescence lamps (Lumilux T8 15W/865; Osram) with light intensity of about 30  $\mu$ mol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> photosynthetic active radiation (PAR). Before immobilization, cultures were transferred into 500-ml Erlenmeyer flasks containing 300 ml of Z8x medium and grown under  $\sim$ 50 µmol photons  $m^{-2} s^{-1}$  in a growth chamber at 22°C. During this stage, antibiotics were not added to the  $\Delta hupL$  and  $\Delta hupL \Delta hoxH$  mutant cultures. All flasks were sparged continuously with sterile air.

Cell immobilization and H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction experiments. The details of the immobilization technique, which was originally developed for the entrapment of green algae in thin Ca<sup>2+</sup>-alginate films (32) and later adapted for cyanobacterial cells, are described in Leino et al. (27). After immobilization, the 3-cm<sup>2</sup> Ca<sup>2+</sup>-alginate strips were transferred into 23-ml vials containing 5 ml of Z8x medium, purged with Ar for 20 min, supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, and placed in a growth chamber at 26°C under continuous overhead illumination with cool-white fluorescent lamps (~150 µmol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>; Philips Master TL-D T8 15W/840). During long-term experiments, the medium in the vials was periodically changed to avoid general (nonnitrogen) nutrient deprivation.

At the beginning of each experiment, the headspace of all vials contained Ar supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>. This CO<sub>2</sub> concentration was selected based on our previous data (27) that showed the optimal H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction activities in Anabaena and Calothrix 336/3 cultures. Depending on the approach used, the gas phase in the headspace of the vials was replaced periodically (at the beginning of each incubation cycle) with the following: a new portion of Ar supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (Ar plus  $CO_2$ ), pure air (air), air supplemented with 6%  $CO_2$  (air plus  $CO_2$ ), or N<sub>2</sub> supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (N<sub>2</sub> plus CO<sub>2</sub>). In the case of air treatments, the headspace in the vial was regenerated using Ar with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> after 16 to 20 h. This was performed to restore efficient H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction by the films. The H<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> contents in the headspace of vials were monitored once a day using a gas chromatograph (GC) (Clarus 500; PerkinElmer, Inc.) equipped with a thermal conductivity detector and a molecular sieve 5A column (60/80 mesh). All experiments were repeated several times with at least three vials for each individual set.

**Cell fitness.** After 12 days of incubation under different atmospheres (as described above), cells were recovered from alginate by solubilization of the films in 50 mM Na-EDTA solution (pH 7.0). The cells were washed three times using Z8x medium and centrifuged (16,100 relative centrifu-

gal force [RCF] for 2 min). The cells were diluted with Z8x to adjust the optical density at 750 nm (OD<sub>750</sub>) to values of 0.25, and 2 ml was transferred to the wells of a 24-well cell culture plate. The cells were then regrown under standard growth conditions at 50  $\mu$ mol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> for 6 days, and the OD<sub>750</sub> was measured daily to identify differences in cell fitness.

**Nitrogenase activity assay.** Nitrogenase activity was determined by an acetylene reduction assay (34). The alginate films with entrapped cells were transferred into 23-ml vials containing 5 ml of Z8x medium, purged with Ar, supplemented with 10% acetylene, and placed in a growth chamber at 26°C under continuous overhead illumination with cool-white fluorescent lamps (~150  $\mu$ mol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>; Philips Master TL-D T8 15W/840) for 18 h. For ethylene determination, 10- $\mu$ l samples from the headspace were injected into a GC (PerkinElmer Autosystem) equipped with a flame ionization detector (FID) and a CP-CarboBond column (Varian). Helium was used as a carrier gas, and calibration was performed with 1% ethylene (AGA, Finland). Enzyme activity was calculated on the basis of the chlorophyll (Chl) *a* content of the cells and per film area.

**Chl determination.** The Chl *a* content in the alginate films was assayed in randomly chosen strips after solubilization of the alginate matrices in 50 mM Na-EDTA solution (pH 7.0). The cells were washed once with Z8x medium by centrifugation. Then, Chl *a* was extracted from the pelleted cells with 90% methanol and determined either spectrophotometrically at 665 nm (35) or using high-performance liquid chromatography (HPLC). The data obtained spectrophotometrically were used for determination of the specific rates of H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction (see Fig. 2A), while the data obtained using HPLC are presented in Fig. 5.

For HPLC analysis, the harvested cell pellets were frozen in liquid nitrogen and stored at  $-80^{\circ}$ C before processing. The pigments were separated from 100% methanol extracts by HPLC (model 1100; Agilent Technologies, Germany) equipped with a diode array detector and a reverse-phase C<sub>18</sub> end-capped column (LiChroCART 125-4; Merck KGaA, Darmstadt, Germany). An acetonitrile-methanol-Tris buffer mixture (720:80:30) was used as a mobile phase. The Chl *a* standard was purchased from DHI Lab Products (Hørsholm, Denmark).

**Photochemical activity.** The photochemical performance of cyanobacteria entrapped in alginate films was evaluated using a Dual-PAM 100 system (Walz, Effelrich, Germany). The films were removed from vials and placed in the center of a leaf holder (Dual-BA; Walz). The steady-state Chl *a* fluorescence level ( $F_t$ ) was determined during the application of actinic red light intensity of ~50 or 150 µmol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> for 5 min. Saturating light pulses of 300-ms duration and light intensity of 3,000 µmol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> were applied to determine a maximum fluorescence level at light ( $F_m'$ ). The effective photosystem II (PSII) yield, Y(II), was calculated as ( $F_m' - F_t/F_m'$ ).

**Statistical testing.** Student *t* tests were applied for significance at 95% using GraphPad Prism, version 5, for Windows (GraphPad Software, San Diego, CA, USA).

#### RESULTS

The effect of CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation cycles on long-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction activity. Efficient H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction in N<sub>2</sub>-fixing heterocystous cyanobacteria is only possible in the absence of N<sub>2</sub>, where nitrogenase catalyzes solely the reduction of protons to H<sub>2</sub> (2). This activity also requires the presence of CO<sub>2</sub> (27). Therefore, in the first approach to achieving long-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction, the alginate films with entrapped wild-type and  $\Delta hupL$  cells of *Anabaena* PCC 7120 were subjected to a number of CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation cycles, where each cycle was initiated by the change of gas phase in the headspace of vials to Ar containing 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 1). A lack of CO<sub>2</sub> has previously resulted in a significant attenuation of H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction starting from the first cycle and loss of H<sub>2</sub> evolution on the conclusion of the next cycle (27). As shown in Fig. 1, CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation cycles allowed extension of the over-



FIG 1 Kinetics of long-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction (A) and changes in specific (B) and per area (C) rates of acetylene reduction by *Anabaena* PCC 7120 and its  $\Delta hupL$  mutant entrapped in thin Ca<sup>2+</sup>-alginate films. For H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction, arrows indicate the points where the atmosphere of the vials was replaced with Ar supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>. For acetylene reduction, white bars indicate *Anabaena* PCC 7120, and black bars indicate the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant. Error bars show the standard deviations of triplicate samples. In the case of acetylene reduction, the difference between two strains was significant (P < 0.001) only for the 290-h point, when activities were calculated on a per area basis (C).

all  $H_2$  photoproduction period of immobilized  $\Delta hupL$  cells to at least 600 h. Nevertheless, both strains demonstrated a gradual loss of  $H_2$  photoproduction activity over the time of the experiment, whereby supplementation of 6% CO<sub>2</sub> could not completely recover earlier production rates (Fig. 1 and Table 1).

As expected,  $H_2$  photoproduction activity was more pronounced in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant due to the lack of uptake hydrogenase in this strain (20). Indeed, in the beginning of the first cycle, the nitrogenase activity measured as  $C_2H_2$  reduction and calculated on the basis of Chl (specific nitrogenase activity) or per area unit was only slightly higher in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant than in the wild-type strain (Fig. 1B and C). After 290 h, nitrogenase activity calculated per area unit declined about 2-fold in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant but increased slightly in the wild-type strain (Fig. 1C). However, no significant changes were observed in specific rates of  $C_2H_2$ reduction between the two strains (Fig. 1B, 290-h samples).

The maximum specific H<sub>2</sub> production rates for both strains (Table 1) were highest in the first cycle, with the  $\Delta hupL$  strain demonstrating a significantly higher maximum rate (32 µmol H<sub>2</sub> mg Chl  $a^{-1}$  h<sup>-1</sup>) than Anabaena PCC 7120 (~7 µmol H<sub>2</sub> mg Chl

Cycle no.	Strain/genotype	Kinetic profile"			
		Maximum specific rate of H <sub>2</sub> production (μmol/mg Chl <i>a</i> /h)	Net $H_2$ photoproduction yield (mol/m <sup>2</sup> )	Maximum specific rate of $O_2$ evolution (µmol/mg Chl <i>a</i> /h)	Net O <sub>2</sub> evolution yield (mol/m <sup>2</sup> )
1	Anabaena PCC 7120	$7.1 \pm 3.0^{***}$	$0.07 \pm 0.02^{***}$	$60.0 \pm 8.8^{***}$	$0.19 \pm 0.01^{**}$
	$\Delta hupL$	$31.9 \pm 9.1$	$0.31\pm0.08$	$78.1\pm10.0$	$0.33\pm0.06$
2	Anabaena PCC 7120	$2.9 \pm 2.1^{***}$	$0.03 \pm 0.02^{**}$	$18.2 \pm 8.3$	$0.15\pm0.01$
	$\Delta hupL$	$16.6 \pm 4.5$	$0.23 \pm 0.09$	$21.4\pm8.2$	$0.24\pm0.09$
3	Anabaena PCC 7120	$1.8 \pm 0.8^{**}$	$0.01 \pm 0.01^{\star}$	$19.4 \pm 9.4$	$0.16 \pm 0.04$
	$\Delta hupL$	$10.9 \pm 5.2$	$0.08\pm0.05$	$22.3 \pm 5.1$	$0.19\pm0.03$
4	Anabaena PCC 7120	$1.5 \pm 1.1^{*}$	$0.002 \pm .0.001$	15.6 ± 9.3	$0.13 \pm 0.06^{*}$
	$\Delta hupL$	$9.2 \pm 7.0$	$0.05\pm0.04$	$12.8 \pm 7.2$	$0.07\pm0.01$
5	Anabaena PCC 7120	$1.1 \pm 0.8$	$0.001 \pm 0.001^{*}$	13.5 ± 9.1	$0.12 \pm 0.07$
	$\Delta hupL$	$4.9\pm3.8$	$0.02\pm0.01$	$14.4 \pm 4.4$	$0.11\pm0.06$
Total	Anabaena PCC 7120		$0.12 \pm 0.02^{***}$		$0.74 \pm 0.11^{*}$
	$\Delta hupL$		$0.70\pm0.18$		$0.93\pm0.14$

TABLE 1 Summary of kinetic parameters of  $O_2$  evolution and  $H_2$  photoproduction in the wild-type Anabaena PCC 7120 and the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant entrapped in thin Ca<sup>2+</sup>-alginate films

<sup>*a*</sup> The long-term  $H_2$  photoproduction activities in immobilized cells were maintained by periodic purging of the headspaces of the vials with Ar supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>. Values represent an average of three independent experiments (with three vials in each) ± the standard deviations. Significant differences between the two strains are indicated as follows: \*, P < 0.05; \*\*, P < 0.01; \*\*\*, P < 0.001.

 $a^{-1}$  h<sup>-1</sup>). In five cycles (three independent experiments) (Table 1),  $\Delta hupL$  cells entrapped in alginate film produced a total 0.7 mol m<sup>-2</sup> of H<sub>2</sub> in 780 h (~33 days), while the films with *Anabaena* PCC 7120 produced only around 0.12 mol m<sup>-2</sup> of H<sub>2</sub> in 600 h (25 days).

As was observed for H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction, immobilized cells also demonstrated a decline in O<sub>2</sub> evolution over the course of experimental cycles (Table 1). The most pronounced change in the O<sub>2</sub> production rate occurred after the first cycle, where a decrease of about 70% was observed for both strains. In later cycles, the maximum O<sub>2</sub> production activity stabilized, and the gap between rates and yields of the two strains decreased (Table 1). The sum of final O<sub>2</sub> yields was higher in vials with  $\Delta hupL$  mutant films than in vials containing *Anabaena* PCC 7120 films (0.93 and 0.74 mol m<sup>-2</sup> after 5 cycles, respectively). The reason for this is not clear since both O<sub>2</sub> evolution by photosystem II (PSII) and its consumption in respiratory pathways are responsible for the final O<sub>2</sub> yields.

The effects of different gas compositions (Ar, air, and  $N_2$ ) in CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation cycles on cell fitness. To study the possible negative effects of nitrogen deficiency on H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction activity in immobilized cyanobacteria and to clarify the role of uptake hydrogenase in adaptation processes, films with entrapped cells of *Anabaena* PCC 7120 and its  $\Delta hupL$  mutant were placed under different atmospheres (Ar, air, or N<sub>2</sub>). All atmospheres were supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, and the gas phase in the headspace of vials was regenerated to its initial composition every fourth day.

Under our experimental conditions, the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant significantly outperformed the wild-type strain in H<sub>2</sub> production (see Fig. S1 in the supplemental material). In contrast to the wild-type strain, which produced H<sub>2</sub> only under the Ar atmosphere, the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant also produced H<sub>2</sub> under atmospheres both with N<sub>2</sub> plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> and air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, but at substantially reduced rates compared to the samples with Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>. The loss of

 $H_2$  photoproduction yields in the presence of  $N_2$  is a well-known phenomenon for  $N_2$ -fixing cyanobacteria and is caused by the change in the stoichiometry of  $H^+$  reduction by the nitrogenase enzyme (2). Nevertheless, these experiments allowed us to compare cell fitness of immobilized *Anabaena* PCC 7120 and  $\Delta hupL$ cells under different experimental conditions.

Despite a very high volumetric cell density in the films (24), the alginate matrix did not completely prevent cell growth in the presence of high levels of N<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub>, where significant increases in Chl *a* content (Fig. 2A, air and  $N_2$  samples) and  $OD_{750}$  (data not shown) were determined. However, under the Ar atmosphere, where immobilized cells were subject to N deficiency, both Anabaena PCC 7120 and  $\Delta hupL$  strains demonstrated a decline in Chl a over the course of the experiment. This was more pronounced in the films containing  $\Delta hupL$  mutant cells, where Chl *a* decreased by  $\sim$ 35% (Fig. 2A). Interestingly, under the atmosphere of air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, the Chl *a* content of the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant did not change, but a significant increase was observed for the wild-type strain. Both conditions led to a significant inhibition of the effective PSII yield in the entrapped  $\Delta hupL$  cells, where Y(II) declined from  $\sim 0.34$  to 0.15 (Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>) and 0.17 (air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>) after 284 h ( $\sim$ 12 days) of continuous treatments with respective gas compositions (Fig. 2B). The replacement of air with  $N_2$  in the headspace of vials improved both Chl *a* content (Fig. 2A) and Y(II) (Fig. 2B) in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant.

After 12 days, the alginate-entrapped cells were recovered from the films to suspensions and equilibrated to the same cell density. Cell fitness was then monitored as regrowth under standard conditions for another 6 days (Fig. 3). Cells that were recovered from the films immediately after immobilization (i.e., not undergoing pretreatment) were used as a control. The results of the regrowth experiment confirmed that the cells recovered from the  $\Delta hupL$ mutant films were indeed adversely affected under Ar and air atmospheres supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, with final OD<sub>750</sub> values





FIG 2 Chl *a* content (A) and effective PSII yield (B) in alginate films with entrapped *Anabaena* PCC 7120 and  $\Delta hupL$  cells. The measurements were performed before (0 h) and after (12 days) the treatment of the samples under Ar, air, and N<sub>2</sub> atmospheres supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>. The Chl *a* contents in films were measured spectrophotometrically (34). The average values from three films are presented  $\pm$  standard deviations. Significant differences between the pre- and posttreated samples are indicated as follows: \*, *P* < 0.05; \*\*, *P* < 0.01; \*\*\*, *P* < 0.001.

that were significantly less than those of the respective control. The wild-type strain grew slowly only after pretreatment with Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> but still recovered considerably faster than the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant. Indeed, following a 3-day lag period under standard growth conditions, the wild type pretreated with Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> finally reached an OD<sub>750</sub> that was not significantly different from that of the control. The pretreatment of the  $\Delta hupL$  films under N<sub>2</sub> plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> did not significantly affect cell fitness compared to the control  $\Delta hupL$  cells which were grown under standard conditions without any pretreatment. It is worth mentioning that the control  $\Delta hupL$  cells without any pretreatment regrew significantly more slowly (one-sided *t* test, *P* < 0.001) than the control wild-type *Anabaena* PCC 7120 (Fig. 3).

To further determine the possible impact of deletion of HupL on growth, we inoculated the control cells at two different values of  $OD_{750}$  (0.1 and 0.5) and cultivated them under standard growth conditions (air with light intensity of 50 µmol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>). When the cells were inoculated at an  $OD_{750}$  of 0.5, only a very small difference was observed between the growth of wild-type



FIG 3 Regrowth (OD<sub>750</sub>) of the cells recovered from alginate films. Control films did not undergo any treatment (0 h), whereas treated films were subject to 12 days under an Ar, air, or N<sub>2</sub> atmosphere supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>. The suspension cultures were regrown diazotrophically in 24-well plates under 50 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and an air atmosphere. Error bars indicate the means  $\pm$  standard deviations from three biological repetitions. Significant differences between the treated and nontreated samples are indicated as follows: \*, *P* < 0.05; \*\*, *P* < 0.01; \*\*\*, *P* < 0.001. d, days.

Anabaena PCC 7120 and the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant cells after the second day (see Fig. S2 in the supplemental material). The highest difference in the growth of the WT and  $\Delta hupL$  cells was observed when the cells were inoculated at the lowest OD<sub>750</sub> of 0.1, indicating a possible high light sensitivity of the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant cells.

The effects of periodic short-term treatments with air and air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> on long-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction activities in immobilized cultures. The results obtained from the experiments described above indicated that long-term and efficient H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction might be achieved by protecting the fitness of immobilized cells through periodic and short-term exposure of films to a N<sub>2</sub>-containing atmosphere. It was decided that these treatments should be applied between CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation cycles (Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>) and for a time that is short enough to ensure the recovery of photosynthetic and nitrogenase activities in immobilized cyanobacteria. This condition was achieved by changing the gas phase to air for a short treatment of 16 to 20 h.

Since the continuous treatment with air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> applied in the cell fitness experiments adversely affected the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant (Fig. 2 and 3), our next approach involved two conditions: periodically (every 3 to 4 days) changing the gas phase of the vials to contain (i) air with ambient levels of CO<sub>2</sub> (air sample) or (ii) air supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (air plus CO<sub>2</sub>). After about 16 to 20 h of either treatment to restore some level of cell fitness (Fig. 4, insets), the headspace was returned to Ar supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> in order to achieve maximal H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction capacity. In this experiment, the effect of treatments with air or air plus CO<sub>2</sub> on H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction was evaluated for four different strains: *Anabaena* PCC 7120, *Calothrix* 336/3, and  $\Delta hupL$  and  $\Delta hupL \Delta hoxH$  mutants of *Anabaena* PCC 7120. Since the  $\Delta hupL \Delta hoxH$  strain demonstrated very similar results as the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant, the data are not shown.

Periodic treatments of immobilized cells with air, or air con-



FIG 4 Long-term H<sub>2</sub> (A, C, and E) and O<sub>2</sub> (B, D, and F) photoproduction yields from *Calothrix* 336/3 (A and B), *Anabaena* PCC 7120 (C and D), and the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant of *Anabaena* PCC 7120 (E and F) entrapped in alginate films. In contrast to the experiment shown in Fig. 1, the cumulative yields are presented. The gas phase in the headspace of the vials was renewed periodically with Ar supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (Ar + CO<sub>2</sub>), air (air), or air supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (air + CO<sub>2</sub>). In the case of *Calothrix* 336/3, the kinetic curves from the films treated with air plus CO<sub>2</sub> with lower Chl *a* content per area unit are also presented. The insets represent the typical H<sub>2</sub> (inset E) and O<sub>2</sub> (inset F) photoproduction curves during a single cycle of air treatment.

taining 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, significantly increased H<sub>2</sub> production yield in *Calothrix* 336/3 compared to the N-deprived control cells (Fig. 4A, Ar + CO<sub>2</sub>). With periodic air treatments, entrapped *Calothrix* 336/3 cells produced 0.17 mol H<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> (600 h), and the addition of CO<sub>2</sub> to air treatments increased the yield to 0.26 mol H<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup>. The effect of air treatments was even more pronounced in thin films of *Calothrix* 336/3 with a lower Chl *a* content per surface area unit (113 versus 215 mg Chl m<sup>-2</sup> in the original films). When treated with air supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, the low-Chl *a* thin films with entrapped *Calothrix* 336/3 cells reached more than 0.5 mol H<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> by 650 h (Fig. 4A).

In contrast to the *Calothrix* strain, no significant changes were observed in *Anabaena* PCC 7120 under any treatments (Fig. 4C). For this strain, the rate of H<sub>2</sub> production declined dramatically after ~70 h in all samples, but cells continued producing H<sub>2</sub> at very low rates (similar to the Ar-treated curves presented in Fig. 1 and in Fig. S1 in the supplemental material) to a final value of approximately 0.1 mol H<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup>. As expected, H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields were significantly higher in the vials with the *ΔhupL* mutant (Fig. 4E). The *ΔhupL* cells entrapped in alginate produced the highest level of H<sub>2</sub> (1.06 mol m<sup>-2</sup>) when treated with air. In line with the effects observed during extended H<sub>2</sub> production under CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation treatments (Fig. 2 and 3), the supplementation of 6% CO<sub>2</sub> during the periodic 16- to 20-h air treatments actually decreased the H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yield of this  $\Delta hupL$  strain (0.61 mol m<sup>-2</sup>) (Fig. 4E). However, this yield was still higher than that of both wild-type strains.

Cyanobacterial cells entrapped in films did not produce any (both wild-type strains) or only negligible amounts ( $\Delta hupL$  mutant) of H<sub>2</sub> during periods of air treatment (Fig. 4E, inset). These results were independent of the presence or absence of introduced CO<sub>2</sub>. Indeed, during exposure to air, cyanobacterial cells entrapped in the films actively fixed N<sub>2</sub> (as detected by GC) (data not shown) and therefore demonstrated significantly diminished stoichiometry of H<sub>2</sub> production (2, 4, 5). Interestingly, during the periods of air treatment (no CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation), all strains also demonstrated decreased O<sub>2</sub> evolution (Fig. 4F, inset). The inhibitory effect often remained noticeable during the first ~24 h after the return of the gas to Ar. After this lag period, the O<sub>2</sub>-evolving ability of the cells recovered and led to accumulation of O<sub>2</sub> in the headspace of vials.

Although air treatments, through restoring the fitness of immobilized cells, improved overall H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields of *Calothrix* 336/3 and  $\Delta hupL$  cells, this approach could not drive continuous H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction. All strains finally stopped producing H<sub>2</sub> although this endpoint was reached at different times for the different strains (Fig. 4A, C, and E). Importantly, the periodic treatments of cells with air supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> significantly improved the O<sub>2</sub> production yields in all strains (Fig. 4B, D, and F), but the effect was less pronounced in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant films (Fig. 4F). The air-only treatments slightly improved O<sub>2</sub> yields in both wild-type strains compared to untreated cells (Fig. 4B and D), with the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant (Fig. 4F) demonstrating a more pronounced increase. These results demonstrate the potential benefit of periodic air treatments for the recovery of photosynthetic apparatus and cell fitness in N-starved cells. However, we cannot directly link the O<sub>2</sub> yield determined from the head-space with the photosynthetic activity of the cells due to difficulties in distinguishing between photosynthetic O<sub>2</sub> evolution and O<sub>2</sub> consumption by terminal oxidases.

Changes in chlorophyll content and photochemical activity of immobilized cells during the long-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction experiment. For a more sensitive study of photosynthetic machinery, we measured Chl *a* content and effective PSII yield, Y(II), of the samples during long-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction experiments where treatments with air or air plus CO<sub>2</sub> were applied. Changes in the pigment composition of immobilized cyanobacteria during experiments were easily seen in the color of the films (Fig. 5A). The first noticeable change in the pigment composition occurred soon after the second cycle and progressed thereafter. To quantify Chl *a* more accurately, we used HPLC (Fig. 5B).

Under N deprivation, both the Anabaena PCC 7120 strain and its  $\Delta hupL$  mutant demonstrated not only progressive decreases in H<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> production activities but also significant degradation of Chl a in the films (Fig. 5B,  $Ar + CO_2$ ). The most noticeable degradation of Chl *a* was detected in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant, in which Chl *a* degraded by 70% compared to the same culture in the beginning of the experiment (0 h). Interestingly, this mutant also showed significant Chl bleaching when the cells were regularly treated by air supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (Chl a degraded by almost 80% on average), replicating the effect observed for the continuous treatment with air plus 6%  $CO_2$  (Fig. 2). The treatments of the films with air only supported the Chl a contents in both Anabaena PCC 7120 and its  $\Delta hupL$  mutant, with that of the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant remaining approximately constant and that of the wild type slightly increasing (Fig. 5B, air). In the control (Ar plus CO<sub>2</sub>) films with entrapped Calothrix 336/3, the Chl a level actually increased from the beginning of the experiment by approximately 20%. Air treatments further increased the Chl content in the immobilized Calothrix 336/3 films by around 50 and 60% in samples treated with air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> and air, respectively. Therefore, it is possible that some minor growth of Calothrix 336/3 occurred in the alginate films, although at a considerably lower rate than would occur in suspension cultures.

Measurements of photochemical activity from the surface of the films using the Dual-PAM 100 system were performed at the beginning (1 h) and in the middle (~455 h) of long-term experiments. These measurements demonstrated that photosynthetic activity was significantly impaired in all studied strains under long-term N deprivation conditions (Fig. 6, Ar + CO<sub>2</sub> films). In these films, the effective PSII yield, *Y*(II), declined from 0.33 to 0.16 for *Anabaena* PCC 7120, from 0.29 to 0.18 for *Calothrix* 336/3, and from 0.34 to 0.06 the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant after ~455 h of the experiment. The periodic treatments of all three entrapped strains with air, which brought nitrogen back to the system, considerably restored PSII yield *Y*(II) to levels of 0.32 in *Anabaena* PCC 7120, 0.38 in *Calothrix* 336/3, and 0.39 in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant. Periodic changes of the medium during long-term experiments did not



FIG 5 The visual changes in the pigment composition (A) and Chl *a* content (B) in alginate films with entrapped *Calothrix* 336/3, *Anabaena* PCC 7120, and  $\Delta hupL$  cells during the long-term experiment. The experimental conditions are the same as described in the legend of Fig. 4. The Chl *a* contents in films were measured at the end of the experiment (~600 h) by HPLC. The average values from three films are presented  $\pm$  the standard deviations. Significant differences between the 0 h and posttreatment samples are indicated as follows: \*, P < 0.05; \*\*, P < 0.01; \*\*\*, P < 0.001.

impart a noticeable effect on the restoration of photosynthetic apparatus (data not shown), thus eliminating the possible effects of a shortage of other nutrients. Interestingly, the entrapped cells periodically treated by air supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> adjusted their photochemical activity differently: *Anabaena* PCC 7120 demonstrated a similar PSII yield (0.30), and *Calothrix* 336/3 showed an even higher activity (0.44), whereas the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant demonstrated significantly decreased PSII yield (0.12) compared to the cells treated with only air (Fig. 6).

## DISCUSSION

Supplementation of  $CO_2$  prolongs  $H_2$  production in immobilized  $N_2$ -fixing heterocystous cyanobacteria under an Ar atmosphere.  $H_2$  photoproduction in heterocystous, filamentous  $N_2$ -



**FIG 6** The effect of different treatments on the PSII yield, *Y*(II), in alginate films with entrapped *Calothrix* 336/3, *Anabaena* PCC 7120, and  $\Delta hupL$  mutant cells. Measurements of photochemical activity from the surface of the films were performed after 1 h and in the middle (~455 h) of the long-term experiment. The experimental conditions are the same as described in the legend of Fig. 4.

fixing cyanobacteria is mediated mainly by the nitrogenase enzyme located in the heterocyst cells, where H<sub>2</sub> is coproduced in the reaction of N<sub>2</sub> fixation. It is a highly energy-demanding process requiring 16 mol of ATP for every mole of N<sub>2</sub> fixed and H<sub>2</sub> produced. Although the efficiency of the reaction toward H<sub>2</sub> evolution improves significantly in the absence of N<sub>2</sub> (see Fig. S1 in the supplemental material), where nitrogenase exclusively catalyzes ATP-dependent reduction of H<sup>+</sup> to H<sub>2</sub>, 4 mol of ATP is still required for every mole of H2 evolved. Consequently, under photoautotrophic conditions, where CO<sub>2</sub>/HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> is the only carbon source, H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction in heterocystous cyanobacteria depends solely on the photosynthetic activity of vegetative cells that fix CO<sub>2</sub> and provide heterocysts with energy in the form of sucrose (36). Thus, long-term H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction by cyanobacteria requires  $CO_2$  supply into the cultures (37, 38). Indeed, periodic supplementations of 6% CO<sub>2</sub> into vials containing Ca<sup>2+</sup>-alginate films with entrapped Anabaena PCC 7120 and  $\Delta hupL$  mutant cells under an Ar atmosphere allowed us to sustain H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction for 600 h and 780 h, respectively (Fig. 1 and Table 1). The effect of 6% CO<sub>2</sub> supplementations was similar to that observed previously by our group for Calothrix 336/3 (27), where supplementations prolonged H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction for even longer periods (936 h) than the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant in the present work, but at lower maximum  $H_2$  yields per cycle.

Although supplementation of the cells with CO<sub>2</sub> does prolong H<sub>2</sub> production in heterocystous cyanobacteria, this is clearly not the only factor influencing the long-term performance of this process. Indeed, under an Ar atmosphere, we observed H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields to steadily decline in each subsequent cycle of CO<sub>2</sub> supplementation for both *Anabaena* strains (Fig. 1). Since the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant does not have uptake hydrogenase, the decline of H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields for this strain could not be linked to an increase of H<sub>2</sub> uptake activity. Additionally, the  $\Delta hupL \Delta hoxH$  mutant of *Anabaena* PCC 7120, deficient in both hydrogenases, showed approximately equivalent kinetics of H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction as the  $\Delta hupL$  strain (data not shown), indicating that the bidirectional hydrogenase is not involved either. The specific nitrogenase

activity of the wild-type and  $\Delta hupL$  strains did not show significant changes during treatments (Fig. 1B). Moreover, there was no significant difference in the specific nitrogenase activity between the wild-type and  $\Delta hupL$  strains, which agrees well with previous data that Masukawa and coauthors obtained for suspension cultures (20). However, when the activity was calculated per area of film (Fig. 1C), a decrease in nitrogenase activity was observed in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant. This decrease could be due to the lysis of  $\Delta hupL$  cells under N-deprived conditions. Thus, the decline of H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields in each subsequent cycle is likely caused by nitrogen, rather than carbon, deficiency.

Long-term nitrogen deprivation, but not anaerobiosis, affects cell fitness of immobilized cells under conditions suitable for efficient H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction. Comparison of cell fitness of Anabaena PCC 7120 and its  $\Delta hupL$  mutant after 12 days under Ar and N2 atmospheres supplemented with 6% CO2 clearly showed that Anabaena cultures entrapped in alginate films do not suffer from microoxic conditions since the immobilized cells continue growing under an atmosphere with  $N_2$  plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 2). These cells also showed the fastest recovery of growth in suspension culture after treatment (Fig. 3). The situation changed dramatically under the atmosphere of Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, where the cells suffer from nitrogen deficiency leading to imbalance in the C/N ratio. The incubation of both wild-type and  $\Delta hupL$  cells under an Ar atmosphere in the presence of high CO<sub>2</sub> was harmful to cell fitness, as determined by regrowth experiments (Fig. 3). The situation was more dramatic in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant films, where the cell fitness was affected not only under Ar but also under air atmospheres supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 3). It should be noted that the decrease of O2 partial pressure in vials, achieved by changing the headspace atmosphere to  $N_2$  plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, recovered the Chl *a* content (Fig. 2A), *Y*(II) (Fig. 2B), and cell fitness (Fig. 3) of this strain. These results indicate that the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant might be more sensitive to excess  $O_2$  than the wild-type strain.

Long-term nitrogen deprivation decreases photosynthetic yield and H<sub>2</sub> production activity in immobilized cyanobacteria, particularly in the  $\Delta hupL$  strain. Prolonged cultivation of alginate-entrapped cyanobacterial cells in N-deprived conditions caused a significant loss of photochemical activity in Calothrix 336/3 and in both Anabaena cell types, with a more pronounced effect observed in the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant (Fig. 2B and 6, Ar plus CO<sub>2</sub> films). Under these conditions, presumably due to impaired protein biosynthesis, cyanobacteria could not efficiently repair the photosynthetic apparatus. A distinct loss of Chl a was also observed in both Anabaena cell lines under the atmosphere with Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (Fig. 2 and 5). Contrasting this, the Chl *a* content in the Calothrix 336/3 strain was not affected by N deficiency. Moreover, this strain demonstrated a very small amount of growth, even under an Ar atmosphere (Fig. 5, Calothrix films with Ar plus  $CO_2$ ).

The prolonged (Fig. 2B) or periodic (Fig. 6) treatments of two wild-type and  $\Delta hupL$  cells with air, which brought nitrogen back to the system, allowed the cells to restore the photosynthetic apparatus. Interestingly, treatments with air supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> had different effects on the different species, whereby the treatment further improved (*Calothrix* 336/3), did not change significantly (*Anabaena* PCC 7120), or negatively affected ( $\Delta hupL$  mutant), PSII yield compared to that of air-treated cells (Fig. 6). In the case of the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant, this negative effect was accompanied by a pronounced bleaching of the films (Fig. 2 and 5). Under

prolonged incubation with air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, the  $\Delta hupL$  cells were undergoing lysis, which was confirmed by the extremely slow recovery of the cells during the regrowth experiment (Fig. 3).

The response of H<sub>2</sub> production to periodic 16- to 20-h air treatments was strain specific. For example, the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant produced more H<sub>2</sub> when treated with air only (Fig. 4E), Calothrix 336/3 required the continuous presence of  $CO_2$  in the headspace of the vials for improved production (Fig. 4C), and the wild-type Anabaena strain did not improve H<sub>2</sub> production under any condition tested (Fig. 4A). It has previously been shown that continuous supplementation of cells with N2 suppressed the H2-producing activity of Anabaena PCC 7120 and its hydrogenase(s)deficient mutants (38). In that experiment, cultures were supplemented with 1% N2 every day, which could have led to inhibition of H<sub>2</sub> production due to allocation of electrons to N<sub>2</sub> fixation and/or caused a metabolic shift in the C/N balance of microoxic cultures. A similar suppression was observed in our experiments under N<sub>2</sub> and air atmospheres supplemented with 6% CO<sub>2</sub> (see Fig. S1 in the supplemental material), whereas periodic 16- to 20-h air treatments, which were employed to provide nitrogen to the cultures for restoration of photosynthetic activity and cell metabolism, enabled some high H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields in  $\Delta hupL$  and Calothrix 336/3 strains (Fig. 4).

While declines in photochemical activity were observed under nitrogen deficiency, the increase of H<sub>2</sub> uptake capacity over the time period of experiments could also influence H<sub>2</sub> production levels for the wild-type strains. It is known that the alginate matrix significantly restricts diffusion of gas both to and from immobilized cells (32, 39), thus increasing intracellular levels of  $H_2$  and  $O_2$ . Such elevations in  $H_2$  may enhance the activity (40, 41) and expression level of the uptake hydrogenase enzyme (42), while  $O_2$ accumulated inside the films may favor the oxyhydrogen or Knallgas reaction (5, 6). However, not all heterocystous cyanobacteria show positive regulation of *hupSL* genes by  $H_2$  (43). Since the nitrogenase activity (both specific and per area basis) in the films with the entrapped wild-type strain of Anabaena PCC 7120 did not change significantly by the time of the sharp decline in net H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yield at around 100 h (Fig. 1 and 4C; see also Fig. S1 in the supplemental material), the decrease could only be caused by an increase in the rate of H<sub>2</sub> consumption. Clearly, more investigations are required for resolving the role of hydrogenase(s) in this process.

Uptake hydrogenase protects filaments during long-term N deprivation. Comparison of net H<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> yields in the wild-type strain of Anabaena PCC 7120 and its uptake hydrogenase mutant (Table 1) demonstrates a direct link between H<sub>2</sub> uptake and respiration in these strains. Over five cycles, the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant produced a total of 0.58 mol m<sup>-2</sup> more H<sub>2</sub> than the wild-type strain. Assuming 100% consumption of H<sub>2</sub> in the oxyhydrogen reaction with a molar ratio of 2 to  $1 H_2/O_2$ , the absence of this process would bring an additional 0.29 mol  $m^{-2}$  O<sub>2</sub> into the final O<sub>2</sub> yields for the wild-type strain, yielding almost equivalent O2 production in both strains (0.93 versus 1.03, respectively). However, this link between H<sub>2</sub> uptake and respiration was not as pronounced in air-treated samples (Fig. 4) due to a high sensitivity of the  $H_2$ production and H<sub>2</sub> uptake enzymes to O<sub>2</sub>. Similar results have been observed for Anabaena variabilis ATCC 29413 and its hydrogenase-impaired PK84 mutant (44). Thus, the decline in the rate of H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction in the wild-type strain over time is partly caused by the recycling of H<sub>2</sub> through the oxyhydrogen reaction.

The other wild-type strain evaluated in our study, *Calothrix* 336/3, also demonstrated  $H_2$  uptake activity in vials treated with Ar plus  $CO_2$  by the end of each  $CO_2$  supplementation cycle (Fig. 4A). This cyanobacterium possesses the genes encoding the uptake hydrogenase enzyme and demonstrates *in vitro*  $H_2$  uptake activity (45). Therefore, it is likely that  $H_2$  uptake in *Calothrix* 336/3 is also connected to the respiratory chain although the oxyhydrogen reaction in this strain might be less pronounced, leading to higher  $H_2$  photoproduction yields (Fig. 4A) than in the *Anabaena* PCC 7120 wild-type strain (Fig. 4C).

When linked to the respiratory chain, uptake hydrogenase removes excess O2 in heterocysts and provides the cells with ATP via the oxyhydrogen reaction. Both conditions are beneficial for the nitrogenase enzyme (3, 5). The importance of this reaction becomes clear in our long-term experiments, especially during periods of air treatment, when cyanobacterial cells experience an excess of  $O_2$ . Indeed, the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant lacking uptake hydrogenase showed significant degradation of Chl a and photochemical activity not only in the films treated with Ar plus CO<sub>2</sub> but also, most importantly, in the films that were treated periodically with air supplemented with 6% CO2 (Fig. 5 and 6). After prolonged incubation under an atmosphere with air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, the immobilized  $\Delta hupL$  mutant cultures showed reduced cellular fitness (Fig. 3). In contrast, the cell fitness of the Anabaena PCC 7120 strain was affected only under the atmosphere with Ar plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub>, while still recovering significantly faster than the  $\Delta hupL$  strain. The reduction of  $O_2$  partial pressure by placing the films under the atmosphere with  $N_2$  plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> was the only treatment able to fully recover the cell fitness of the mutant (Fig. 3).

We suggest that an increased level of O<sub>2</sub> inside the vegetative cells of the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant, occurring due to efficient photosynthesis (in air plus  $CO_2$ ) and to limited gas exchange through the alginate matrix, led to the penetration of a significant amount of O<sub>2</sub> into the heterocysts via narrow terminal pores that connect heterocysts with vegetative cells (46). In this case, the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant was unable to fix N2 efficiently during the treatment with air plus 6% CO<sub>2</sub> and thus failed to restore the photosynthetic apparatus. Subsequently, a dramatic shift in the intracellular C/N ratio would have caused a strong metabolic imbalance for  $\Delta hupL$  cells. Under this condition, the  $\Delta hupL$  mutant demonstrates significant chlorosis (Fig. 5) and pronounced inactivation of the photosynthetic apparatus (Fig. 6) in contrast to both wild-type strains, which possess active uptake hydrogenase. A similar protective role of uptake hydrogenase has been demonstrated in the unicellular cyanobacterium Cyanothece strain PCC 7822, where its involvement in the protection of nitrogenase is clear due to a single compartmentalization whereby, under diazotrophic conditions, the  $\Delta hupL$  strain failed to grow even under atmospheric air (47).

In the absence of 6% CO<sub>2</sub> during air treatments, films with entrapped  $\Delta hupL$  cells do not produce O<sub>2</sub> efficiently (Fig. 4F, inset) and can maintain microoxic conditions, probably through the upregulation of alternative pathways (21). This may include the expression of heterocyst-specific flavodiiron proteins, which are known to be involved in the protection of nitrogenase by redirecting excess electrons to O<sub>2</sub> (48–50). It is also possible that under low CO<sub>2</sub> levels, highly inducible Flv1A and Flv3A flavodiiron proteins, localized to the vegetative cells of *Anabaena* PCC 7120 (48) and an active photorespiratory pathway (51, 52), could contribute to lowering intracellular O<sub>2</sub> levels in vegetative cells, thereby also protecting heterocyst nitrogenase when uptake hydrogenase is absent. As a result, short-term, air-only treatments of  $\Delta hupL$  mutant films resulted in the highest H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yields in immobilized cultures (Fig. 4E).

We propose that the uptake hydrogenase in heterocystous cyanobacteria is not only important for supporting the high activity of the nitrogenase system by removing excess O2 in heterocysts and providing cells with ATP via the oxyhydrogen reaction but also indirectly involved in protecting the photosynthetic apparatus of vegetative cells, especially under N-deprived conditions. Indeed, the diazotrophic filament heterocysts and vegetative cells are completely interdependent, and changes within one cell type affect dramatically another cell type. Although the absence of uptake hydrogenase in heterocysts can be partly compensated for by the upregulation of alternative mechanisms, these may fail to satisfy cyanobacteria in long-term culture, especially immobilized cultures, where the matrix polymer significantly restricts diffusion of gases and nutrients in both directions. In this context, the elimination of uptake hydrogenase in cells, while increasing H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction yield and rate, may significantly decrease the duration of the process. Clearly, more detailed studies are required for understanding the role of the H2 uptake mechanism in immobilized strains.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was financially supported by the Kone Foundation (Y.A.), Academy of Finland mobility grant 267409 (Y.A.), Maj and Tor Nessling Foundation grant 2014050 (S.K.), FCoE projects 118637 and 271832 (E.-M.A.), and the Nordic Energy Research AquaFEED project.

## REFERENCES

- Schütz K, Happe T, Troshina O, Lindblad P, Leitao E, Oliveira P, Tamagnini P. 2004. Cyanobacterial H<sub>2</sub> production—a comparative analysis. Planta 218:350–359. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00425-003-1113-5.
- Tsygankov AA. 2007. Nitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria: a review. Appl. Biochem. Microbiol. 43:279–288. http://dx.doi.org/10.1134/S000368380 7030040.
- Bothe H, Schmitz O, Yates MG, Newton WE. 2010. Nitrogen fixation and hydrogen metabolism in cyanobacteria. Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev. 74:529–554. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/MMBR.00033-10.
- Tamagnini P, Axelsson R, Lindberg P, Oxelfelt F, Wunschiers R, Lindblad P. 2002. Hydrogenases and hydrogen metabolism of cyanobacteria. Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev. 66:1–20. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128 /MMBR.66.1.1-20.2002.
- Tamagnini P, Leitao E, Oliveira P, Ferreira D, Pinto F, Harris D, Heidorn T, Lindblad P. 2007. Cyanobacterial hydrogenases: diversity, regulation and applications. FEMS Microbiol. Rev. 31:692–720. http://dx .doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6976.2007.00085.x.
- Rao KK, Hall DO. 1996. Hydrogen production by cyanobacteria: potential, problems and prospects. J. Mar. Biotechnol. 4:10–15.
- Weissman JC, Benemann JR. 1977. Hydrogen production by nitrogenstarved cultures of *Anabaena cylindrica*. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 33: 123–131.
- Carrieri D, Wawrousek K, Eckert C, Yu J, Maness P-C. 2011. The role of the bidirectional hydrogenase in cyanobacteria. Bioresour. Technol. 102:8368-8377. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2011.03.103.
- Appel J, Schulz R. 1998. Hydrogen metabolism in organisms with oxygenic photosynthesis: hydrogenases as important regulatory devices for a proper redox poising? J. Photochem. Photobiol. B Biol. 47:1–11. http://dx .doi.org/10.1016/S1011-1344(98)00179-1.
- Appel J, Phunpruch S, Steinmuller K, Schulz R. 2000. The bidirectional hydrogenase of *Synechocystis* sp. PCC 6803 works as an electron valve during photosynthesis. Arch. Microbiol. 173:333–338. http://dx.doi.org /10.1007/s002030000139.
- Cournac L, Guedeney G, Peltier G, Vignais PM. 2004. Sustained photoevolution of molecular hydrogen in a mutant of *Synechocystis* sp. strain PCC 6803 deficient in the type I NADPH-dehydrogenase complex. J.

Bacteriol. 186:1737–1746. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JB.186.6.1737-1746 .2003.

- Benemann J. 1996. Hydrogen biotechnology: progress and prospects. Nat. Biotechnol. 14:1101–1103. http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nbt0996-1101.
- Borodin VB, Tsygankov AA, Rao KK, Hall DO. 2000. Hydrogen production by Anabaena variabilis PK84 under simulated outdoor conditions. Biotechnol. Bioeng. 69:478–485. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/1097 -0290(20000905)69:5<478::AID-BIT2>3.0.CO;2-L.
- Tsygankov AA, Fedorov AS, Kosourov SN, Rao KK. 2002. Hydrogen production by cyanobacteria in an automated outdoor photobioreactor under aerobic conditions. Biotechnol. Bioeng. 80:777–783. http://dx.doi .org/10.1002/bit.10431.
- Mikheeva LE, Schmitz O, Shestakov SV, Bothe H. 1995. Mutants of the cyanobacterium *Anabaena variabilis* altered in hydrogenase activities. Z. Naturforsch. C Biosci. 50:505–510.
- Tsygankov AA, Borodin VB, Rao KK, Hall DO. 1999. H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction by batch culture of *Anabaena variabilis* ATCC 29413 and its mutant PK84 in a photobioreactor. Biotechnol. Bioeng. 64:709–715. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1097-0290(19990920)64:6<709::AID-BIT10 >3.0,CO;2-C.
- Happe T, Schütz K, Böhme H. 2000. Transcriptional and mutational analysis of the uptake hydrogenase of the filamentous cyanobacterium *Anabaena variabilis* ATCC 29413. J. Bacteriol. 182:1624–1631. http://dx .doi.org/10.1128/JB.182.6.1624-1631.2000.
- Lindberg P, Schütz K, Happe T, Lindblad P. 2002. A hydrogen producing, hydrogenase-free mutant strain of *Nostoc punctiforme* ATCC 29133. Int. J. Hydrogen Energy 27:1291–1296. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0360 -3199(02)00121-0.
- Khetkorn W, Lindblad P, Incharoensakdi A. 2012. Inactivation of uptake hydrogenase leads to enhanced and sustained hydrogen production with high nitrogenase activity under high light exposure in the cyanobacterium *Anabaena siamensis* TISTR 8012. J. Biol. Eng. 6:19. http://dx.doi .org/10.1186/1754-1611-6-19.
- Masukawa H, Mochimaru M, Sakurai H. 2002. Disruption of the uptake hydrogenase gene, but not of the bidirectional hydrogenase gene, leads to enhanced photobiological hydrogen production by the nitrogen-fixing cyanobacterium *Anabaena* sp. PCC 7120. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 58:618–624. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00253-002-0934-7.
- Ekman M, Ow SY, Holmqvist M, Zhang X, van Wagenen J, Wright PC, Stensjö K. 2011. Metabolic adaptations in a H<sub>2</sub> producing heterocystforming cyanobacterium: potentials and implications for biological engineering. J. Proteome Res. 10:1772–1784. http://dx.doi.org/10.1021 /pr101055v.
- Masukawa H, Inoue K, Sakurai H, Wolk CP, Hausinger RP. 2010. Sitedirected mutagenesis of the *Anabaena* sp. strain PCC 7120 nitrogenase active site to increase photobiological hydrogen production. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 76:6741–6750. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/AEM.01056-10.
- Weyman PD, Pratte B, Thiel T. 2010. Hydrogen production in nitrogenase mutants in *Anabaena variabilis*. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 304:55–61. http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6968.2009.01883.x.
- Kosourov SN, Ghirardi ML, Seibert M. 2011. A truncated antenna mutant of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* can produce more hydrogen than the parental strain. Int. J. Hydrogen Energy 36:2044–2048. http://dx.doi .org/10.1016/j.ijhydene.2010.10.041.
- Elisova Z, Vasilieva L, Tsygankov A. 2010. Hydrogen production by recombinant strains of *Rhodobacter sphaeroides* using a modified photosynthetic apparatus. Appl. Biochem. Microbiol. 46:487–491. http://dx.doi .org/10.1134/S0003683810050042.
- Allahverdiyeva Y, Leino H, Saari L, Fewer D, Shunmugam S, Sivonen K, Aro E-M. 2010. Screening for biohydrogen production by cyanobacteria isolated from the Baltic Sea and Finnish lakes. Int. J. Hydrogen Energy 35:1117–1127. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhydene.2009.12.030.
- Leino H, Kosourov SN, Saari L, Sivonen K, Tsygankov AA, Aro E-M, Allahverdiyeva Y. 2012. Extended H<sub>2</sub> photoproduction by N<sub>2</sub>-fixing cyanobacteria immobilized in thin alginate films. Int. J. Hydrogen Energy 37:151–161. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhydene.2011.09.088.
- Gosse JL, Engel BJ, Hui JC-H, Harwood CS, Flickinger MC. 2010. Progress toward a biomimetic leaf: 4,000 h of hydrogen production by coating-stabilized nongrowing photosynthetic *Rhodopseudomonas palustris*. Biotechnol. Prog. 26:907–918. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/btpr.406.
- Tsygankov A, Kosourov S. 2014. Chapter 14. Immobilization of photosynthetic microorganisms for efficient hydrogen production, p 321–347.

*In* Zannoni D, De Philippis R (ed), Microbial bioenergy: hydrogen production. Springer, Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

- Gosse JL, Engel BJ, Rey FE, Harwood CS, Scriven LE, Flickinger MC. 2007. Hydrogen production by photoreactive nanoporous latex coatings of nongrowing *Rhodopseudomonas palustris* CGA009. Biotechnol. Prog. 23:124–130.
- Gosse JL, Chinn MS, Grunden AM, Bernal OI, Jenkins JS, Yeager C, Kosourov S, Seibert M, Flickinger MC. 2012. A versatile method for preparation of hydrated microbial-latex biocatalytic coatings for gas absorption and gas evolution. J. Ind. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 39:1269–1278. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10295-012-1135-8.
- Kosourov SN, Seibert M. 2009. Hydrogen photoproduction by nutrientdeprived *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* cells immobilized within thin alginate films under aerobic and anaerobic conditions. Biotechnol. Bioeng. 102:50–58. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/bit.22050.
- Kótai J. 1972. Instructions for preparation of modified nutrient solution Z8 for algae, publication B-11/69. Norwegian Institute for Water Research, Oslo, Norway.
- Dilworth MJ. 1966. Acetylene reduction by nitrogen fixing preparations from *Clostridium pasteurianum*. Biochim. Biophys. Acta 127:285–294. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0304-4165(66)90383-7.
- Meeks JC, Castenholz RW. 1971. Growth and photosynthesis in an extreme thermophile, *Synechococcus lividus (Cyanophyta)*. Arch. Mikrobiol. 78:25–41. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF00409086.
- Lopez-Igual R, Flores E, Herrero A. 2010. Inactivation of a heterocyst specific invertase indicates a principal role of sucrose catabolism in heterocysts of *Anabaena* sp. J. Bacteriol. 192:5526–5533. http://dx.doi.org/10 .1128/JB.00776-10.
- Markov SA, Bazin MJ, Hall DO. 1995. Hydrogen photoproduction and carbon dioxide uptake by immobilized *Anabaena variabilis* in a hollowfiber photobioreactor. Enzyme Microb. Technol. 17:306–310. http://dx .doi.org/10.1016/0141-0229(94)00010-7.
- Marques AE, Barbosa AT, Jotta J, Coelho MC, Tamagnini P, Gouveia L. 2011. Biohydrogen production by *Anabaena* sp. PCC 7120 wild-type and mutants under different conditions: light, nickel, propane, carbon dioxide and nitrogen. Biomass Bioenergy 35:4426–4434. http://dx.doi .org/10.1016/j.biombioe.2011.08.014.
- Sabra W, Zeng AP, Lunsdorf H, Deckwer WD. 2000. Effect of oxygen on formation and structure of *Azotobacter vinelandii* alginate and its role in protecting nitrogenase. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 66:4037–4044. http: //dx.doi.org/10.1128/AEM.66.9.4037-4044.2000.
- Houchins JP, Burris RH. 1981. Physiological reactions of the reversible hydrogenase from *Anabaena* 7120. Plant Physiol. 68:717–721. http://dx .doi.org/10.1104/pp.68.3.717.
- 41. Oxelfelt F, Tamagnini P, Salema R, Lindblad P. 1995. Hydrogen uptake

in Nostoc strain PCC 73102: effects of nickel, hydrogen, carbon and nitrogen. Plant Physiol. Biochem. **33**:617–623.

- Axelsson R, Lindblad P. 2002. Transcriptional regulation of *Nostoc* hydrogenases: effects of oxygen, hydrogen and nickel. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 68:444–447. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/AEM.68.1.444-447.2002.
- Weyman PD, Pratte B, Thiel T. 2008. Transcription of *hupSL* in Anabaena variabilis ATTC 29143 is regulated by NtcA and not by hydrogen. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 74:2103–2110. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128 /AEM.02855-07.
- 44. Tsygankov AA, Serebryakova LT, Rao KK, Hall DO. 1998. Acetylene reduction and hydrogen photoproduction by wild-type and mutant strains of *Anabaena* at different CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> concentrations. FEMS Microbiol. Lett. 167:13–17. http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6968.1998.tb13201.x.
- 45. Leino H, Shunmugam S, Isojarvi J, Oliveira P, Mulo P, Saari L, Sivonen K, Battchikova N, Lindblad P, Aro E-M, Allahverdiyeva Y. 2014. Characterization of ten highly H<sub>2</sub> producing cyanobacteria isolated from the Baltic Sea and Finnish lakes. Int. J. Hydrogen Energy 39:8983–8991. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhydene.2014.03.171.
- Walsby AE. 2007. Cyanobacterial heterocysts: terminal pores proposed as sites of gas exchange. Trends Microbiol. 15:340–349. http://dx.doi.org/10 .1016/j.tim.2007.06.007.
- Zhang X, Sherman DM, Sherman L. 2014. The uptake hydrogenase in the unicellular diazotrophic cyanobacterium *Cyanothece* sp. strain PCC 7822 protects nitrogenase from oxygen toxicity. J. Bacteriol. 196:840–849. http://dx.doi.org/10.1128/JB.01248-13.
- Ermakova M, Battchikova N, Allahverdiyeva Y, Aro E-M. 2012. Novel heterocyst-specific flavodiiron proteins in *Anabaena* sp. PCC 7120. FEBS Lett. 587:82–87. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.febslet.2012.11.006.
- 49. Ermakova M, Battchikova N, Richaud P, Leino H, Kosourov S, Isojärvi J, Peltier G, Flores E, Cournac L, Allahverdiyeva Y, Aro EM. 2014. Heterocyst-specific flavodiiron protein Flv3B enables oxic diazotrophic growth of the filamentous cyanobacterium *Anabaena* sp. PCC 7120. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1407327111.
- Allahverdiyeva Y, Mustila H, Ermakova M, Bersanini L, Richaud P, Ajlani G, Batchikova N, Cournac L, Aro EM. 2013. Flavodiiron proteins Flv1 and Flv3 enable cyanobacterial growth and photosynthesis under fluctuating light. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 110:4111–4116. http://dx .doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1221194110.
- Allahverdiyeva Y, Ermakova M, Eisenhut M, Zhang P, Richaud P, Hagemann M, Cournac L, Aro EM. 2011. Interplay between flavodiiron proteins and photorespiration in *Synechocystis* sp. PCC 6803. J. Biol. Chem. 286:24007–24014. http://dx.doi.org/10.1074/jbc.M111.223289.
- Bauwe H, Hagemann M, Kern R, Timm S. 2012. Photorespiration has a dual origin and manifold links to central metabolism. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol. 15:269–275. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pbi.2012.01.008.