

NIH Public Access

Author Manuscript

Dev Dyn. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 March 01

Published in final edited form as:

Dev Dyn. 2015 March ; 244(3): 367–376. doi:10.1002/dvdy.24235.

Keeping an eye on SOXC proteins

Lakshmi Pillai-Kastoori^{#1}, Wen Wen^{#1}, and Ann C. Morris^{1,*}

¹Department of Biology, University of Kentucky, Lexington, Kentucky, USA

[#] These authors contributed equally to this work.

Abstract

The formation of a mature, functional eye requires a complex series of cell proliferation, migration, induction among different germinal layers, and cell differentiation. These processes are regulated by extracellular cues such as the Wnt/BMP/Hh/Fgf signaling pathways, as well as cell intrinsic transcription factors that specify cell fate. In this review article we provide an overview of stages of embryonic eye morphogenesis, extrinsic and intrinsic factors that are required for each stage, and pediatric ocular diseases that are associated with defective eye development. In addition, we focus on recent findings about the roles of the SOXC proteins in regulating vertebrate ocular development and implicating SOXC mutations in human ocular malformations.

Keywords

Eye development; Ocular morphogenesis; SOXC

I. Introduction

Development of the vertebrate eye is a complex process consisting of a series of highly coordinated events that involve interactions between the neural ectoderm, surface ectoderm, and extraocular mesenchymal cells. Each phase of eye development depends both on inductive signaling pathways and the precise temporal expression of cell-intrinsic factors. Disruptions in these cellular signals or mutations in eye development genes result in a variety of sight-threatening pediatric ocular malformations. Therefore, to better understand anomalies in the structure and the function of the eye it is important to identify the key molecular players in each step of eye formation.

This review will provide an overview of the major stages of vertebrate eye development, highlighting some of the important molecular cues associated with each stage. In addition, we will focus on the emerging roles of SoxC proteins during vertebrate ocular morphogenesis and in human ocular malformations. Throughout the review, we will follow established nomenclature, designating human genes in all capital letters, rodent genes with the first letter capitalized, and zebrafish and Xenopus genes with all lower case letters; italic letters indicate genes, whereas non italicized names refer to proteins.

^{*}Corresponding author: Dr. Ann C. Morris, Department of Biology, University of Kentucky, Lexington, KY 40506-0225, Tel: 859-257-8823, ann.morris@uky.edu.

I.1 Development of the vertebrate eye field

During gastrulation the anterior neural plate is specified into domains that eventually form the eye field, telencephalon, diencephalon, and the hypothalamus. Critical inductive events prepare the presumptive eye field present within the anterior neural plate, which eventually migrates and integrates with nearby tissues. The eye field cells are surrounded rostrally and laterally by telencephalic precursors and medially by cells that will form the hypothalamus. Therefore, one of the first critical steps that eye precursor cells must take is to define their lineage and separate themselves from the surrounding brain tissues.

Formation and specification of naive uncommitted cells into an organized eye field domain requires the contribution of many signaling pathways and transcription factors (TFs). The fibroblast growth factor (FGF), bone morphogenetic protein (BMP), and Wingless (Wnt) pathways guide movement of cells into the eye field and also help maintain the eye field territory (Esteve and Bovolenta, 2006). In addition, both canonical and non-canonical Wnt signaling pathways interact with each other to separate the eye field territory from the diencephalon and the telencephalon (Wilson and Houart, 2004; Cavodeassi et al., 2005; Esteve and Bovolenta, 2006). Balance between BMP and non-canonical Wnt (Wnt5, Wnt11) signaling patterns the anteroposterior axis of the neural plate, and initiates morphogenetic movements of cells in the anterior neural plate, contributing to the formation of the eye field (Wilson and Houart, 2004; Cavodeassi et al., 2005). Simultaneous inhibition of canonical Wnt signaling is also required for suppression of diencephalon fate markers, as misexpression of *Wnt8b* results in poor delineation of the border between the diencephalon and the eye field, and mutation in the Gsk3 binding domain of Axin1 results in conversion of telencephalon and eye field precursors into diencephalon due to constitutive activation of the Wnt/ β -catenin pathway (Heisenberg et al., 2001; Kim et al., 2002; Wilson and Houart, 2004; Cavodeassi et al., 2005; Esteve and Bovolenta, 2006; Adler and Canto-Soler, 2007). FGF modulation of ephrinB1 phosphorylation also plays a role in inducing the prospective progenitors to migrate, coalesce, and assemble themselves as an eye field (Chong et al., 2000; Moore et al., 2004).

In addition to receiving critical signals from the surrounding forebrain tissue, eye field progenitors themselves express the eye field transcription factors (EFTFs) Rx1/Rax, Pax6, Lhx2, Six3, Otx2, ET, tll and Hes1 {Figure 1; (Chow and Lang, 2001)}. Six3, Pax6, Otx2 and Rx1 specify progenitor cells to the retinal lineage, and also regulate morphogenetic cell movements that guide presumptive eye field cells the correct geographic location (Kenyon et al., 2001; Moore et al., 2004). Lhx2 is required to maintain optic identity and suppress alternative fates (Roy et al., 2013). Loss-of-function mutations in EFTFs result not only in the absence of an cup but also cause severe neuro-developmental anomalies in a variety of different animals such as mice, chicken, zebrafish, and humans (Porter et al., 1997; Winkler et al., 2000; Chow and Lang, 2001; Tucker et al., 2001; Stigloher et al., 2006; Lequeux et al., 2008). Notably, there are also TF's (e.g. Hes1 and Otx2) that are expressed outside the eye field domain which influence its formation. Otx2 is not expressed within the Rx positive eye field region, however Otx2 is needed to maintain the expression of Six3 and Hes1 in the anterior neural plate (Simeone et al., 1993; Rhinn et al., 1998; Andreazzoli et al., 1999). Hes1 influences eye development by controlling the formation of the forebrain. HESX1

mutations in humans result in variety of defects including optic nerve hypoplasia, and in mice *Hes1* null mutants display anophthalmia and microphthalmia (Dattani et al., 1998; Chow and Lang, 2001).

I.2 From one eye field to two optic vesicles

The eye field cells undergo cellular proliferation during gastrulation and eventually split into two bilateral domains in response to secreted factors originating from the ventral midline. High-resolution dynamic fate map studies have revealed the substantial structural changes that occur to move the ventral diencephalon anlagen from a posterior to an anterior ventral position resulting in bisection of the eye field {for more in-depth discussion, see (Varga et al., 1999; England et al., 2006). The process of eye field segregation requires axial Nodal/ TGF- β and Hedgehog (Hh) signaling, which in turn establishes optic vesicle boundaries and patterns the proximodistal and ventronasal axes of the optic vesicles by modulating expression of TFs Pax2, Pax6, Vax1, and Vax2 (Nornes et al., 1990; Barth and Wilson, 1995; Ekker et al., 1995; Hyatt et al., 1996; Barbieri et al., 1999; Dressler and Woolf, 1999; Muller et al., 2000; Schulte and Cepko, 2000). Loss of Nodal-related proteins such as Squint, Cyclops, or One-eved pinhead results in cyclopia and holoprosencephaly, underscoring the importance of TGF^β/Nodal signaling for eye field segregation (Zhang et al., 1998; Pei and Feldman, 2009). Likewise, mutations in the Hh signaling ligand SHH result in holoprosencephaly and cyclopia in humans and mice (Belloni et al., 1996; Chiang et al., 1996; Roessler et al., 1996).

I.3 From a flat optic vesicle to a spherical optic cup

In the next phase of eye development, the symmetrical paired optic vesicles (OVs) evaginate from the ventral diencephalon and expand through the extraocular mesenchyme towards the surface ectoderm (Kessler and Melton, 1994; Li et al., 1997; Vogel-Höpker et al., 2000; Fuhrmann, 2010). This evagination step depends critically on paracrine retinoic acid (RA) signaling originating from the temporal mesenchyme (Adler and Canto-Soler, 2007; Cvekl and Wang, 2009). Upon physical contact with the overlying head surface ectoderm, a series of spatially and temporally complex structural changes ensues. The surface ectoderm at the point of contact thickens and forms a lens placode, which continues to invaginate, eventually forming the lens vesicle and detaching from the surface ectoderm. Concomitantly, the distal portion of the OV elongates laterally and undergoes invagination to form a bilayered optic cup (OC), which remains connected to the diencephalon via the optic stalk (for a detailed description see (Fuhrmann, 2010)). Dynamic migratory behavior of cells present within the optic vesicle is crucial for eye morphogenesis (Kwan et al., 2012; Ivanovitch et al., 2013). Formation of the optic cup is an important foundation on which depends the development of the iris, the ciliary body, the retina, and retina pigmented epithelium (RPE). The neural retina originates from the inner layer of the optic cup, whereas the outer layer of the optic cup differentiates into the RPE. A transient channel called the choroid fissure is present along the ventral side of the optic cup and optic stalk. This opening permits the entry of periocular mesenchymal cells (neural crest derived) that later form the blood vessels which provide nourishment to the growing eye; it also allows the axons of the ganglion cells to exit the eye and connect with the brain.

As optic cup morphogenesis and lens induction progresses, overlapping sets of TFs mark the lineage specification of distinct ocular tissues. The presumptive lens expresses *Pax6*, *IGF-2*, *Prox-1*, *Six3*, *Sox1*, and *Sox2*; the nascent neural retina expresses *Pax6*, *Pax2*, *Rx*, *Lhx2*, *Chx10*, and *Optx2*; the developing RPE expresses *Mitf and Otx2*; and the optic stalk expresses *Pax2*, *Vax1*, *Vax2*, and *Six3* (Jean et al., 1999; Chow and Lang, 2001). In addition to establishing the competence of progenitor cells for specific lineages, TFs interact with each other to establish boundaries within and between individual ocular tissues. Within the developing optic vesicle, *Pax6* and *Tbx5* pattern the dorso-ventral axis, and *BF-1/Foxg1* and *BF-2/Foxd2* pattern the anterior-posterior axis. Along the medial-lateral axis, *Pax2*, *Pax6*, *sox4*, *sox11*, and *Vax* regulate the proximo-distal patterning of optic vesicle versus optic stalk territories (Figure 1) (Hatini et al., 1994; Schwarz et al., 2000; Horsford et al., 2005; Adler and Canto-Soler, 2007).

I.4 Optic cup morphogenesis

1. The anterior segment: lens, cornea, iris and ciliary body—All sensory placodes possess the capacity to form the lens before they acquire unique identities (reviewed extensively by (Streit, 2007)). The preplacodal region gets patterned along the anteriorposterior axis, and precursors for the lens placode reside in the anterior region of the surface ectoderm. *Pax6* expression is critical for lens formation from the early preplacodal phase, and its expression is controlled at various stages of lens development by a variety of pathways. BMP and FGF signaling regulate Pax6 expression during placode formation; Six3 and Meis family members regulate Pax6 activity in the presumptive lens ectoderm. Additionally, Pax6 regulates the critical expression of Sox2 in the presumptive lens epithelium, and as the placode is formed there is role reversal and *Pax6* controls the expression of Six3 (Kamachi et al., 1998; Wawersik et al., 1999; Liu et al., 2006; Streit, 2007; Zhao et al., 2008). The last stages of lens formation lead to inductive events resulting in the formation of the cornea endoderm, iris, and the ciliary body stroma. Soon after the lens separates from the overlying surface ectoderm, periocular mesenchymal cells of neural crest origin invade the space between the lens and the surface ectoderm. The mesenchymal cells differentiate and contribute to the formation of the cornea, iris, and the ciliary body (Piatigorsky, 2001; Graw, 2010).

2. The RPE and retina—Concomitant with lens development, profound changes are occurring in the bi-layered optic cup. As mentioned above, the outer layer of the optic cup forms the RPE, and the inner layer forms the neural retina. The cells in the inner layer proliferate (accompanied by some pruning due to programmed cell death) to generate six classes of retinal neurons and one intrinsic glial cell type: retinal ganglion cells (RGCs), amacrine cells, horizontal cells, bipolar cells, cone photoreceptors, rod photoreceptors, and the Müller glia (for more extensive reviews on retinal development, see (Livesey and Cepko, 2001; Fadool and Dowling, 2008; Bassett and Wallace, 2012; He et al., 2012; Gregory-Evans et al., 2013)). The RGCs are present in the ganglion cell layer (GCL), the interneurons (amacrine, horizontal and bipolar cells) and the cell bodies of the Müller glia are present in the inner nuclear layer (INL), and the photoreceptors are present in the outer nuclear layer (ONL). The genesis of the different retinal cell types occurs in a conserved temporal order but species-specific spatial order. In general, RGCs are the first cells born in

the neural retina, followed by amacrine, horizontal cells, and cone photoreceptors. The last retinal cell types to differentiate are the bipolar cells, rod photoreceptors, and the Müller glia. Importantly, in mammals retinal neurogenesis occurs only during embryonic/perinatal development; however cold-blooded vertebrates such as teleost fish and some amphibians experience growth-associated retinal neurogenesis throughout their lifespan. Retinal progenitor cells (RPCs) attain competence to become RGCs by expressing a bHLH TF called *ath5*. In addition, Hh and FGF signaling are required for the proper temporal expression of *ath5* and the generation of RGCs (Martinez-Morales et al., 2005; Masai et al., 2005). Amacrine, horizontal, and bipolar cells are generated by an overlapping network of TFs such as *Prox1, Math5*, NeuroD, *Math3, Ptf1*, Pax6, *Six3, Mash1*, and *Foxn4* (for an extensive review see (Tomita et al., 2000; Dyer et al., 2003; Ohsawa and Kageyama, 2008; DEMB and SINGER, 2012)). Photoreceptors are generated from a pool of *Crx-* and *Otx2-* positive cells, which later acquire competence to form either cone or rod photoreceptors by expressing the TFs *TRβ2* and *RXR* γ for cones, or *Nrl*, Nr2e3, and *Ascl1* for rods {for a more detailed review see (Swaroop et al., 2010)}.

The RPE is characterized by the presence of melanosomes, which produce and store melanin pigment. The RPE lies between the neural retina and the vascular choroid, and is sensitive to signals emanating from the adjacent periocular mesenchyme. The RPE is indispensable for retinal function. It forms part of the blood-retina barrier, facilitates adhesion between the neural retina and the surrounding choroid, captures free radicals, absorbs background light, is critical for retinoid metabolism, and phagocytoses the spent outer segment tips of the photoreceptors (Boulton and Dayhaw-Barker, 2001; Martinez-Morales et al., 2005). Surprisingly, only a handful of TFs have been identified that are required for the development and differentiation of the RPE. These include *Mitf, Otx1/Otx2*, and *Pax6* (Goding, 2000; Baumer et al., 2003; Martinez-Morales et al., 2005; Bharti et al., 2012; Raviv et al., 2014). TGF β , FGF, BMP, and Hh signals from the surrounding mesenchyme also help induce the RPE fate during development (Dohrmann et al., 1993; Feijen et al., 1994; Zhang and Yang, 2001; Müller et al., 2007; Fuhrmann et al., 2014).

3. Ocular vasculature and optic nerve—A mature eye has the highest oxygen demand per unit weight of any human tissue (Saint-Geniez and D'Amore, 2004). Early on, the developing eye is nourished by intraocular vasculature generated by the hyaloid system and the choroid vessels. The hyaloid artery enters the optic cup through the choroid fissure and traverses the primitive vitreous to land on the posterior portion of the developing lens. The hyaloid arteries rapidly spread out and form a dense capillary network and connect with a venous system at the anterior portion of the optic cup. The venous system is provided by the choroidal vasculature derived from the periocular mesenchyme. As soon as the hyaloid system and choroid vasculature merge, the hyaloid vasculature is formed and it provides all the nutrients and metabolites to the growing eye. Around the same time the more permanent retinal vasculature formation is initiated and in mammals hyaloid vasculature starts to regress (for excellent description see (Saint-Geniez and D'Amore, 2004)).

The proper connection between the arterial-venous network is crucial for functional circulation of nutrients and oxygen within the ocular tissue (Haigh et al., 2003; Bussmann et al., 2011). Development and maturation of choroidal blood vessels depends on expression of

Page 6

the angiogenic factors VEGF, bFGF, PDGF and PEDF from the RPE, and neutralization of bFGF and VEGF within the RPE results in incomplete formation of choroid vessels (Rousseau et al., 2003; Le et al., 2010). Misexpression of FGFR1 results in immature choroidal vessels and mutation in VEGF causes severe vascular defects (Carmeliet et al., 1996; Ferrara et al., 1996). Notch signaling is important for capillary bed formation in mice, humans, and zebrafish. VEGF and Delta-like 4 (DII4) interact dynamically to regulate vascular patterning (Shawber and Kitajewski, 2004; Hellstrom et al., 2007). Finally, genetic studies in zebrafish suggest that Hh signaling specifies endothelial cell fate to directly regulate arterial differentiation (Williams et al., 2010).

In summary, organogenesis of the eye is a conserved process that is driven by the complex interaction between the surface ectoderm, neuroepithelia and the extraocular mesenchyme (Chow and Lang, 2001; Fuhrmann, 2010). While the events of ocular morphogenesis are broadly conserved across vertebrates, various stages exhibit species specific differences. For example, in zebrafish, lens development does not progress through a hollow lens vesicle stage as it does in mammals (Greiling et al., 2010). Additionally, unlike mammals, zebrafish retinal vasculature development does not involve regression of the hyaloid vessels (Alvarez et al., 2007). Despite these small differences, the information gathered from different vertebrate animal models has enriched our understanding of the key molecular players and signaling pathways in embryonic eye development.

4. Congenital ocular malformations—Estimates of the prevalence of congenital ocular defects vary by region and method of ascertainment, but in general range from 1-10 cases per 10,000 births (Royal National Institute of Blind People, RNIB; (Gregory-Evans et al., 2004)). Improper execution of any stage of early eye development can result in sightthreatening ocular malformations. For example, abnormal signaling from the midline (caused by defects in Shh, Nodal, and RA signaling or mutations in Six3) can cause failure of the eye field to properly segregate into two bilateral domains, resulting in ocular hypotelorism or cyclopia in extreme cases, as well as holoprosencephaly (Belloni et al., 1996; Roessler et al., 1996). Another group of ocular defects associated with abnormal morphogenesis includes microphthalmia (small eye), anophthalmia (absence of an eye), and coloboma (failure of choroid fissure closure), collectively called MAC. Mutations or altered gene dosage of several of the TFs and signaling molecules active during early eye development, such as VAX, SOX10, OTX2, RAX, SOX2, PAX2, PAX6, SIX3, and SHH can result in MAC phenotypes in humans (Bondurand et al., 1999; Dressler and Woolf, 1999; Lequeux et al., 2008). Although genetic factors contribute significantly to the aetiology of MAC, the causative mutations identified to date account for less than 20% of all cases (Gregory-Evans et al., 2004). Further investigations in animal models should help to identify novel MAC-causing genes.

Defects in ocular morphogenesis may also cause anterior segment dysgenesis, resulting in malformations of the lens, iris, cornea, or ciliary body. Mutations in *PAX2* and *PAX6* can cause aniridia (absence of the iris), isolated cataracts, and Peters anomaly (persistent adhesion between the cornea and lens) (Glaser et al., 1992; Hill et al., 1992; Otteson et al., 1998; Abouzeid et al., 2009; Bower et al., 2012). Mutations in *PITX, FOX* and *MAF* family members cause cataracts, anterior segment mesenchymal dysgenesis, and severe iris

anomaly (Blixt et al., 2000; Semina et al., 2001; Komatireddy et al., 2003; Cheong et al., 2007; Shaham et al., 2009). Congenital cataracts are also highly prevalent in patients carrying mutations in lens intrinsic membrane proteins, gap-junction membrane channel proteins, and crystallins (Shiels and Bassnett, 1996; Berry et al., 2000; Graw, 2003).

Finally, ocular malformations are often associated with more extensive syndromes that involve defects in the development of the heart, nervous system, skeleton, or other tissues. Some examples are CHARGE syndrome (coloboma, heart anomaly, choanal atresia, retardation, genital and ear anomalies), Anophthalmia-Esohageal-Genital (AEG) syndrome, and Coffin-Siris syndrome (systemic abnormalities like skeletal defects, neurologic defects, cardiac malformations, renal and genital defects) (Onwochei et al., 2000; Hornby et al., 2003; Gregory-Evans et al., 2004; Kelberman et al., 2006).

II. SOXC proteins

II.1 SOX subfamilies in vertebrates

The SOX proteins are transcription factors named after a shared motif called the SRY box, a high-mobility-group (HMG) DNA binding domain homologous to the DNA-binding domain of the mammalian sex determining region on the Y chromosome (*SRY*). SOX proteins are found extensively throughout the animal kingdom, including nematodes, arthropods, birds, fish, reptiles, amphibians, and mammals (Bowles et al., 2000). In vertebrates about 30 *SOX* genes have been identified that are placed into 8 subgroups (A-H) on the basis of sequence similarity and genomic arrangements (Bowles et al., 2000; Schepers et al., 2002). Two new subgroups I and J have been introduced to include *Xenopus sox31* and a new invertebrate *C. elegans sox* gene. The HMG box allows SOX proteins to recognize a specific linear DNA sequence 5'-(A/T)(A/T)CAA(A/T)G-3'in the minor grove of the DNA helix, and it also helps SOX proteins to bind four-way DNA junctions without any sequence specificity (Ferrari et al., 1992). The DNA bending causes the width of the minor grove to widen and also results in possible unstacking of base pairs.

By regulating target gene transcription or posttranslational modification, SOX proteins are involved in multiple developmental processes (Wegner, 2010), including embryonic eye development. Mutations in SOX2, which belongs to the SOXB subfamily, cause anophthalmia or microphthalmia (Faivre et al., 2006). Sox2 is also required for the induction of the first lens specific gene δ -crystallin (Kamachi et al., 2001). Sox9, a SOXE family member, is required for expression of several retinal genes (such as calb2a, calb2b, crx, neurod, rx1, sox4a and vsx1) and for the differentiation of Müller glia and photoreceptors (Yokoi et al., 2009). In addition, Sox9 can also regulate visual cycle gene expression in the RPE (Masuda et al., 2014), and a recent study in Sox9^{-/-} mice demonstrates that Sox9 and Sox10 are both required for the formation of lacrimal gland (Chen et al., 2014).

II.2 SOXC proteins and their known target genes

Recently, a role for the SOXC proteins in regulating eye development has emerged from studies in animal models and in humans. The SOXC family in invertebrate animal species consists of a single member (Cremazy et al., 2001). In most vertebrates, the SOXC family includes three intronless genes: *SOX4* [MIM: 184430], *SOX11* [MIM: 600898], and *SOX12*

[MIM: 601947] (Penzo-Mendez, 2010). SOXC proteins are known as transcriptional activators. Apart from the HMG domain in the N-terminus, a transactivation domain (TAD) in the C-terminus is present among the SOXC members. Like other *SOX* members, the HMG domain of *SOX4, SOX11*, and *SOX12* is greater than 50% identical to the corresponding domain of SRY, both at nucleotide and amino acid level. Within the subgroup, SOXC proteins share a high degree of similarity within the HMG box domain as well as flanking sequences and the TAD domain (Koopman et al., 1991; Bhattaram et al., 2010), and are strongly conserved across vertebrate species. Among SOXC proteins, SOX4 is the most efficient in DNA binding due to the lack of the acidic domain and SOX11 has the highest transactivation activity because of its continuous α -helical structure (van de Wetering et al., 1993; Wiebe et al., 2003; Dy et al., 2008; Hoser et al., 2008; Penzo-Mendez, 2010).

Although they are essential and play multiple roles in embryonic development and tissue differentiation, very few SOXC target genes have been identified. One known target gene is classIII β -tubulin (known as *Tubb3* or *Tuj1*). It is a pan-neuronal gene expressed specifically in the nervous system and is critical for neurogenesis (Memberg and Hall, 1995). Sox4 and Sox11 can transactivate the lacZ reporter driven by the *Tubb3* promoter and directly interact with the sequence upstream of Tubb3 in DNA-binding gel shift assays (Bergsland et al., 2006). Sox12 can also bind to Tubb3 but with a relatively lower transactivation activity (Hoser et al., 2008). Another SoxC target gene is *Tead2*, a downstream mediator of the Hippo signaling pathway. Several SoxC binding motifs are present in the promoter region and first exon of *Tead2*, and direct binding has been detected both in vitro and in vivo by EMSA and chromatin immunoprecipitation assay (ChIP) (Bhattaram et al., 2010). In addition, Sox4 can bind to the T-cell specific enhancer at the 3' end of the CD2 gene and transactivate CD2 (Wotton et al., 1995). Moreover, SoxC proteins are also involved in target gene stability. For example, in response to DNA damage, Sox4 can directly bind to p53 and enhance its acetylation, thus inhibiting Mdm2-mediated p53 ubiquitination (Pan et al., 2009).

SOXC family members are expressed extensively in the developing vertebrate nervous system and are known to regulate neuronal and mesenchymal progenitor survival, neuronal cell fate determination and differentiation in a highly redundant manner (Dy et al., 2008; Bhattaram et al., 2010; Bergsland et al., 2011). Expression of *SoxC* is strong in the ventricular region of the brain, particularly in cells that have exited the cell cycle but have not yet differentiated into mature neurons (Bhattaram et al., 2010). As development progresses, *SoxC* expression is limited to the forebrain and caudal part of the spinal cord suggesting that *SoxC* is downregulated as the nervous system matures (Jankowski et al., 2006).

III. SOXC proteins and their functions during vertebrate eye development

III.1 SOXC expression in the developing vertebrate eye

In the embryonic vertebrate eye, *SoxC* genes are expressed in a partially overlapping pattern in both time and space (Maschhoff et al., 2003; Dy et al., 2008; Cizelsky et al., 2013; Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014; Uy et al., 2014) (W.Wen, unpubl.data, 2014). They are expressed in

the neuroepithelium of the optic cup, in the cells of the surface ectoderm and lens placode, and also in the surrounding neural crest derived mesenchymal cells (Table 1). Their expression is initiated in the retina in the first group of cells that exit cell cycle to differentiate into RGCs. Their expression subsequently spreads throughout the ganglion cell layer and into the inner nuclear layer, along with the progression of retinal cell differentiation (Cizelsky et al., 2013; Jiang et al., 2013; Usui et al., 2013; Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014) Expression of *Sox4* and *Sox11* coincides with the onset of expression of the ganglion cell marker *Brn3b* and amacrine cell marker *Islet1* (Jiang et al., 2013; Usui et al., 2013) (W.Wen, unpubl.data, 2014). In addition, *sox11* is also expressed in the developing lens (Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014). As retinal neurogenesis progresses, *SoxC* expression is downregulated in mature retinal neurons. Very little expression is detected in the mammalian adult eye. In vertebrates that display persistent retinal neurogenesis, such as *Xenopus* and zebrafish, *sox4* and *sox11* continue to be expressed in the retinal progenitor cell niche called the ciliary marginal zone (CMZ) throughout adulthood (Cizelsky et al., 2013; Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014) (W.Wen, unpubl.data, 2014).

III.2 Functional studies of SOXC proteins in animal models

In mice, global knockout of *Sox11* and/or *Sox4* is lethal due to common trunk defect in the ventricular chamber of the heart. However, *Sox12* knockouts are viable and fertile (Schilham et al., 1996; Dy et al., 2008; Hoser et al., 2008). Compound *Sox11^{+/-}; Sox4^{+/-}* heterozygotes also die at birth, suggesting that optimal gene dosage of both *Sox4* and *Sox11* is critical for cardiac development.

 $Sox11^{-/-}$ homozygous mutant mice embryos exhibit a range of ocular abnormalities, including Peter's anomaly, open eyelids, microphthalmia, and coloboma (Sock et al., 2004; Wurm et al., 2008). No eye defects were reported in $Sox4^{-/-}$ mutant mice, however this may be due to the early embryonic lethality of this model. Morpholino-mediated knockdown of sox4 and/or sox11 in zebrafish also causes ocular coloboma, indicating a conserved role for soxC proteins in regulating early ocular morphogenesis. Experiments in zebrafish revealed that the ocular phenotypes in Sox4-and Sox11-deficient embryos are caused by elevated Hedgehog signaling, and further demonstrated that Sox4 and Sox11 are required to negatively regulate expression of the Hh pathway ligands *shha* and *ihhb* (Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014) (W.Wen, unpubl.data, 2014).

A persistent lens stalk and delayed lens maturation are also observed in SoxC knockout mice as well as in zebrafish and *Xenopus soxC* morphants (Wurm et al., 2008; Cizelsky et al., 2013; Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014) (W.Wen, unpubl.data, 2014). Immunohistochemical analysis of $Sox11^{-/-}$ embryos revealed reduced mitotic profiles in the lens placode during lens invagination, suggesting that Sox11 is required for the separation of the lens vesicle from the surface ectoderm (Wurm et al., 2008). A recent study using lens-specific *Pax6* conditional knockout mice suggests that as lens development progresses, *Pax6* is required to suppress the expression of *Sox11* in the lens via *miR-204* (Shaham et al., 2013).

In addition to ocular morphogenesis and lens defects, retinal neurogenesis is also disrupted in SoxC-deficient animals. Jiang and others created *Sox4*, *Sox11*, and *Sox4/Sox11* conditional knockout mice using a *Six3*-Cre line, thereby removing *Sox4* and/or *Sox11* in the

eye field and ventral forebrain from E9 onwards. They observed a modest reduction in RGCs in the single knockouts, and a complete loss of RGCs as well as significant reductions in other retinal neurons in the *Sox4/Sox11*-null retina (Jiang et al., 2013). Loss of Sox4 and Sox11 function in mice also resulted in reduction in the expression of histone H3 acetylation at proneural genes such as *NeuroD*, suggesting that Sox4 and Sox11 may influence retinal progenitor cell competence and differentiation by creating a specific epigenetic state. The expression of the RGC marker *pouf4f1* was absent in the retinas of both Sox4- and Sox11- deficient *Xenopus* embryos, indicating a defect in RGC differentiation (Cizelsky et al., 2013). Apoptosis was also significantly increased in Sox4- and Sox11- deficient *Xenopus* retinas, indicating a potential cause for the smaller eye phenotype and the retinal disorganization in these animals (Cizelsky et al., 2013). Surprisingly, Sox4- and Sox11- deficient zebrafish embryos did not exhibit significant changes in the neurogenesis of RGCs in zebrafish, although ectopic retinal progenitor proliferation in the GCL was observed (Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014) (W.Wen, unpubl.data, 2014).

Sox4 and *sox11* are both upregulated in a zebrafish model of chronic rod photoreceptor degeneration and regeneration (Morris et al., 2011), suggestive of their potential involvement in rod photoreceptor differentiation. Sox4- and Sox11-deficient zebrafish also display a reduction mature rod photoreceptors in the developing retina, supporting a role for SoxC factors in photoreceptor differentiation (Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014). In contrast, gain-of-function studies using mouse retinal explants demonstrated that overexpression of SoxC factors interferes with the maturation and terminal differentiation of rods and cones (as well as Müller glia), suggesting that SoxC factors inhibit photoreceptor differentiation (Usui et al., 2013). It may be that SoxC factors have species-specific functions in photoreceptor development, or that photoreceptor progenitors are exquisitely sensitive to *SoxC* expression levels, such that too much or too little significantly compromises terminal differentiation.

IV. SOXC and human ocular defects

In conjunction with the data from animal models, evidence implicating SOXC factors in human diseases that affect eye development is beginning to emerge. In a sequencing screen of 79 patients with MAC phenotypes, we identified two coloboma patients with novel heterozygous mutations within the *SOX11* coding region (a G145C missense mutation and an in-frame 4 amino acid duplication at S351-354). We also defined a small segmental deletion, within which *SOX11* is the only protein-coding locus, in a patient with microphthalmia and agenesis of the optic nerve (Lo-Castro et al., 2009; Pillai-Kastoori et al., 2014). Tsurusaki et al. performed whole-exome sequencing on DNA samples from 92 patients with Coffin-Siris syndrome, a disorder characterized by developmental delay abnormalities of the fingers and/or toes, and abnormal facial features). Two patients were identified with two novel *de novo* heterozygous mutations in the HMG domain of *SOX11*. One of the patients exhibited vision defects, along with several other clinical features of Coffin-Siris syndrome (Tsurusaki et al., 2014).

One of the most common syndromes among coloboma patients is CHARGE syndrome. Mutations in Chromatin remodeler chromodomain-helicase-DNA-binding protein 7 (*CHD7*) are identified in 65% of patients with CHARGE syndrome (Vissers et al., 2004; Chang et

al., 2006). CHD7 regulates neurogenesis by epigenetically changing the chromatin structure of target genes and modifying their transcription activity (Kim and Roberts, 2013). Loss of CHD7 in mouse neural stem cells results in a significant reduction in neurogenesis as well as a loss of *SoxC* gene expression (Feng et al., 2013). Computational analysis of gene expression profiling data from the Cancer Genome Atlas Project (TCGA) revealed that *SOX4* and *SOX11* display the strongest correlation with *CHD7* expression (Feng et al., 2013). Several lines of evidence suggest that SOX4 and SOX11 are direct targets of CHD7. Given the coloboma phenotype present in Sox11 mutant mice and sox4/11-deficient zebrafish, it is tempting to speculate that altered expression of *SOX4* and *SOX11* also underlies the coloboma observed in CHARGE syndrome patients.

V. Conclusions and Perspectives

Extensive work has across several vertebrate models has begun to unravel the intricacies of ocular morphogenesis. One thing that we have learned from these studies is that a handful of signaling pathways control various aspects of oculogenesis and they are deployed reiteratively throughout the course of embryonic eye development. These signaling pathways regulate the expression of several key TFs to pattern the developing eye into tissue-specific domains, and to control the precise and timely specification of progenitor cells for differing fates. SOX family members are critical regulators of embryonic development, and the SOXC family has been recently implicated in eye development in a variety of animal models. Although it is clear that mutation or loss of SOXC proteins results in defects in ocular morphogenesis, lens development, and retinal neurogenesis, we do not know all of the transcriptional targets of SOXC proteins in the eye. The future lies in the investigation and identification of SOXC target genes, and in understanding their mechanism of action during ocular development.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank Sara Perkins and Stephen G. Wilson for assistance with editing the manuscript, and every member of the Morris lab for helpful discussions.

Funding:

NIH R01EY021769

Knights Templar Foundation

Pew Biomedical Scholars Program

University of Kentucky Lyman T. Johnson and Academic Year graduate fellowships

REFERENCES

- Abouzeid H, Youssef MA, ElShakankiri N, Hauser P, Munier FL, Schorderet DF. PAX6 aniridia and interhemispheric brain anomalies. Molecular vision. 2009; 15:2074–2083. [PubMed: 19862335]
- Adler R, Canto-Soler MV. Molecular mechanisms of optic vesicle development: Complexities, ambiguities and controversies. Developmental Biology. 2007; 305:1–13. [PubMed: 17335797]
- Alvarez Y, Cederlund ML, Cottell DC, Bill BR, Ekker SC, Torres-Vazquez J, Weinstein BM, Hyde DR, Vihtelic TS, Kennedy BN. Genetic determinants of hyaloid and retinal vasculature in zebrafish. BMC developmental biology. 2007; 7:114. [PubMed: 17937808]

- Andreazzoli M, Gestri G, Angeloni D, Menna E, Barsacchi G. Role of Xrx1 in Xenopus eye and anterior brain development. Development. 1999; 126:2451–2460. [PubMed: 10226004]
- Barbieri AM, Lupo G, Bulfone A, Andreazzoli M, Mariani M, Fougerousse F, Consalez GG, Borsani G, Beckmann JS, Barsacchi G, Ballabio A, Banfi S. A homeobox gene, vax2, controls the patterning of the eye dorsoventral axis. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America. 1999; 96:10729–10734. [PubMed: 10485894]
- Barth KA, Wilson SW. Expression of zebrafish nk2.2 is influenced by sonic hedgehog/vertebrate hedgehog-1 and demarcates a zone of neuronal differentiation in the embryonic forebrain. Development. 1995; 121:1755–1768. [PubMed: 7600991]
- Bassett EA, Wallace VA. Cell fate determination in the vertebrate retina. Trends in Neurosciences. 2012; 35:565–573. [PubMed: 22704732]
- Baumer N, Marquardt T, Stoykova A, Spieler D, Treichel D, Ashery-Padan R, Gruss P. Retinal pigmented epithelium determination requires the redundant activities of Pax2 and Pax6. Development. 2003; 130:2903–2915. [PubMed: 12756174]
- Belloni E, Muenke M, Roessler E, Traverse G, Siegel-Bartelt J, Frumkin A, Mitchell HF, Donis-Keller H, Helms C, Hing AV, Heng HHQ, Koop B, Martindale D, Rommens JM, Tsui LC, Scherer SW. Identification of Sonic hedgehog as a candidate gene responsible for holoprosencephaly. Nature genetics. 1996; 14:353–356. [PubMed: 8896571]
- Bergsland M, Ramskold D, Zaouter C, Klum S, Sandberg R, Muhr J. Sequentially acting Sox transcription factors in neural lineage development. Genes Dev. 2011; 25:2453–2464. [PubMed: 22085726]
- Bergsland M, Werme M, Malewicz M, Perlmann T, Muhr J. The establishment of neuronal properties is controlled by Sox4 and Sox11. Genes Dev. 2006; 20:3475–3486. [PubMed: 17182872]
- Berry V, Francis P, Kaushal S, Moore A, Bhattacharya S. Missense mutations in MIP underlie autosomal dominant 'polymorphic' and lamellar cataracts linked to 12q. Nature genetics. 2000; 25:15–17. [PubMed: 10802646]
- Bharti K, Gasper M, Ou J, Brucato M, Clore-Gronenborn K, Pickel J, Arnheiter H. A Regulatory Loop Involving PAX6, MITF, and WNT Signaling Controls Retinal Pigment Epithelium Development. PLoS Genet. 2012; 8:e1002757. [PubMed: 22792072]
- Bhattaram P, Penzo-Mendez A, Sock E, Colmenares C, Kaneko KJ, Vassilev A, Depamphilis ML, Wegner M, Lefebvre V. Organogenesis relies on SoxC transcription factors for the survival of neural and mesenchymal progenitors. Nat Commun. 2010; 1:9. [PubMed: 20596238]
- Blixt Å, Mahlapuu M, Aitola M, Pelto-Huikko M, Enerbäck S, Carlsson P. A forkhead gene, FoxE3, is essential for lens epithelial proliferation and closure of the lens vesicle. Genes & Development. 2000; 14:245–254. [PubMed: 10652278]
- Bondurand N, Kuhlbrodt K, Pingault V, Enderich J, Sajus M, Tommerup N, Warburg M, Hennekam RCM, Read AP, Wegner M, Goossens M. A Molecular Analysis of the Yemenite Deaf-Blind Hypopigmentation Syndrome: SOX10 Dysfunction Causes Different Neurocristopathies. Human Molecular Genetics. 1999; 8:1785–1789. [PubMed: 10441344]
- Boulton M, Dayhaw-Barker P. The role of the retinal pigment epithelium: Topographical variation and ageing changes. Eye. 2001; 15:384–389. [PubMed: 11450762]
- Bower M, Salomon R, Allanson J, Antignac C, Benedicenti F, Benetti E, Binenbaum G, Jensen UB, Cochat P, DeCramer S, Dixon J, Drouin R, Falk MJ, Feret H, Gise R, Hunter A, Johnson K, Kumar R, Lavocat MP, Martin L, Moriniere V, Mowat D, Murer L, Nguyen HT, Peretz-Amit G, Pierce E, Place E, Rodig N, Salerno A, Sastry S, Sato T, Sayer JA, Schaafsma GC, Shoemaker L, Stockton DW, Tan WH, Tenconi R, Vanhille P, Vats A, Wang X, Warman B, Weleber RG, White SM, Wilson-Brackett C, Zand DJ, Eccles M, Schimmenti LA, Heidet L. Update of PAX2 mutations in renal coloboma syndrome and establishment of a locus-specific database. Human mutation. 2012; 33:457–466. [PubMed: 22213154]
- Bowles J, Schepers G, Koopman P. Phylogeny of the SOX family of developmental transcription factors based on sequence and structural indicators. Dev Biol. 2000; 227:239–255. [PubMed: 11071752]

- Bussmann J, Wolfe SA, Siekmann AF. Arterial-venous network formation during brain vascularization involves hemodynamic regulation of chemokine signaling. Development. 2011; 138:1717–1726. [PubMed: 21429983]
- Carmeliet P, Ferreira V, Breier G, Pollefeyt S, Kieckens L, Gertsenstein M, Fahrig M, Vandenhoeck A, Harpal K, Eberhardt C, Declercq C, Pawling J, Moons L, Collen D, Risau W, Nagy A. Abnormal blood vessel development and lethality in embryos lacking a single VEGF allele. Nature. 1996; 380:435–439. [PubMed: 8602241]
- Cavodeassi F, Carreira-Barbosa F, Young RM, Concha ML, Allende ML, Houart C, Tada M, Wilson SW. Early Stages of Zebrafish Eye Formation Require the Coordinated Activity of Wnt11, Fz5, and the Wnt/β-Catenin Pathway. Neuron. 2005; 47:43–56. [PubMed: 15996547]
- Chang L, Blain D, Bertuzzi S, Brooks BP. Uveal coloboma: clinical and basic science update. Curr Opin Ophthalmol. 2006; 17:447–470. [PubMed: 16932062]
- Chen Z, Huang J, Liu Y, Dattilo LK, Huh SH, Ornitz D, Beebe DC. FGF signaling activates a Sox9-Sox10 pathway for the formation and branching morphogenesis of mouse ocular glands. Development. 2014; 141:2691–2701. [PubMed: 24924191]
- Cheong HI, Cho HY, Kim JH, Yu YS, Ha IS, Choi Y. A clinico-genetic study of renal coloboma syndrome in children. Pediatric nephrology. 2007; 22:1283–1289. [PubMed: 17541647]
- Chiang C, Litingtung Y, Lee E, Young KE, Corden JL, Westphal H, Beachy PA. Cyclopia and defective axial patterning in mice lacking Sonic hedgehog gene function. Nature. 1996; 383:407– 413. [PubMed: 8837770]
- Chong LD, Park EK, Latimer E, Friesel R, Daar IO. Fibroblast Growth Factor Receptor-Mediated Rescue of x-Ephrin B1-Induced Cell Dissociation in XenopusEmbryos. Molecular and Cellular Biology. 2000; 20:724–734. [PubMed: 10611251]
- Chow RL, Lang RA. Early eye development in vertebrates. Annual review of cell and developmental biology. 2001; 17:255–296.
- Cizelsky W, Hempel A, Metzig M, Tao S, Hollemann T, Kuhl M, Kuhl SJ. sox4 and sox11 function during Xenopus laevis eye development. PLoS One. 2013; 8:e69372. [PubMed: 23874955]
- Cremazy F, Berta P, Girard F. Genome-wide analysis of Sox genes in Drosophila melanogaster. Mech Dev. 2001; 109:371–375. [PubMed: 11731252]
- Cvekl A, Wang W-L. Retinoic acid signaling in mammalian eye development. Experimental Eye Research. 2009; 89:280–291. [PubMed: 19427305]
- Dattani MT, Martinez-Barbera JP, Thomas PQ, Brickman JM, Gupta R, Martensson IL, Toresson H, Fox M, Wales JK, Hindmarsh PC, Krauss S, Beddington RS, Robinson IC. Mutations in the homeobox gene HESX1/Hesx1 associated with septo-optic dysplasia in human and mouse. Nature genetics. 1998; 19:125–133. [PubMed: 9620767]
- DEMB JB, SINGER JH. Intrinsic properties and functional circuitry of the AII amacrine cell. Visual Neuroscience. 2012; 29:51–60. [PubMed: 22310372]
- Dohrmann CE, Hemmati-Brivanlou A, Thomsen GH, Fields A, Woolf TM, Melton DA. Expression of activin mRNA during early development in Xenopus laevis. Developmental Biology. 1993; 157:474–483. [PubMed: 8500654]
- Dressler GR, Woolf AS. Pax2 in development and renal disease. The International journal of developmental biology. 1999; 43:463–468. [PubMed: 10535325]
- Dy P, Penzo-Mendez A, Wang H, Pedraza CE, Macklin WB, Lefebvre V. The three SoxC proteins--Sox4, Sox11 and Sox12--exhibit overlapping expression patterns and molecular properties. Nucleic Acids Res. 2008; 36:3101–3117. [PubMed: 18403418]
- Dyer MA, Livesey FJ, Cepko CL, Oliver G. Prox1 function controls progenitor cell proliferation and horizontal cell genesis in the mammalian retina. Nature genetics. 2003; 34:53–58. [PubMed: 12692551]
- Ekker SC, Ungar AR, Greenstein P, von Kessler DP, Porter JA, Moon RT, Beachy PA. Patterning activities of vertebrate hedgehog proteins in the developing eye and brain. Current biology: CB. 1995; 5:944–955. [PubMed: 7583153]
- England SJ, Blanchard GB, Mahadevan L, Adams RJ. A dynamic fate map of the forebrain shows how vertebrate eyes form and explains two causes of cyclopia. Development. 2006; 133:4613–4617. [PubMed: 17079266]

- Esteve P, Bovolenta P. Secreted inducers in vertebrate eye development: more functions for old morphogens. Current Opinion in Neurobiology. 2006; 16:13–19. [PubMed: 16413771]
- Fadool JM, Dowling JE. Zebrafish: A model system for the study of eye genetics. Progress in Retinal and Eye Research. 2008; 27:89–110. [PubMed: 17962065]
- Faivre L, Williamson KA, Faber V, Laurent N, Grimaldi M, Thauvin-Robinet C, Durand C, Mugneret F, Gouyon JB, Bron A, Huet F, Hayward C, Heyningen V, Fitzpatrick DR. Recurrence of SOX2 anophthalmia syndrome with gonosomal mosaicism in a phenotypically normal mother. Am J Med Genet A. 2006; 140:636–639. [PubMed: 16470798]
- Feijen A, Goumans MJ, van den Eijnden-van Raaij AJ. Expression of activin subunits, activin receptors and follistatin in postimplantation mouse embryos suggests specific developmental functions for different activins. Development. 1994; 120:3621–3637. [PubMed: 7821227]
- Feng W, Khan MA, Bellvis P, Zhu Z, Bernhardt O, Herold-Mende C, Liu HK. The chromatin remodeler CHD7 regulates adult neurogenesis via activation of SoxC transcription factors. Cell Stem Cell. 2013; 13:62–72. [PubMed: 23827709]
- Ferrara N, Carver-Moore K, Chen H, Dowd M, Lu L, O'Shea KS, Powell-Braxton L, Hillan KJ, Moore MW. Heterozygous embryonic lethality induced by targeted inactivation of the VEGF gene. Nature. 1996; 380:439–442. [PubMed: 8602242]
- Ferrari S, Harley VR, Pontiggia A, Goodfellow PN, Lovell-Badge R, Bianchi ME. SRY, like HMG1, recognizes sharp angles in DNA. Embo j. 1992; 11:4497–4506. [PubMed: 1425584]
- Fuhrmann S. Eye morphogenesis and patterning of the optic vesicle. Current topics in developmental biology. 2010; 93:61–84. [PubMed: 20959163]
- Fuhrmann S, Zou C, Levine EM. Retinal pigment epithelium development, plasticity, and tissue homeostasis. Experimental Eye Research. 2014; 123:141–150. [PubMed: 24060344]
- Glaser T, Walton DS, Maas RL. Genomic structure, evolutionary conservation and aniridia mutations in the human PAX6 gene. Nature genetics. 1992; 2:232–239. [PubMed: 1345175]
- Goding CR. Mitf from neural crest to melanoma: signal transduction and transcription in the melanocyte lineage. Genes & Development. 2000; 14:1712–1728. [PubMed: 10898786]
- Graw J. The genetic and molecular basis of congenital eye defects. Nature reviews. Genetics. 2003; 4:876–888.
- Graw J. Eye development. Current topics in developmental biology. 2010; 90:343–386. [PubMed: 20691855]
- Gregory-Evans CY, Wallace VA, Gregory-Evans K. Gene networks: Dissecting pathways in retinal development and disease. Progress in Retinal and Eye Research. 2013; 33:40–66. [PubMed: 23128416]
- Gregory-Evans CY, Williams MJ, Halford S, Gregory-Evans K. Ocular coloboma: a reassessment in the age of molecular neuroscience. Journal of medical genetics. 2004; 41:881–891. [PubMed: 15591273]
- Greiling TMS, Aose M, Clark JI. Cell Fate and Differentiation of the Developing Ocular Lens. Investigative Ophthalmology & Visual Science. 2010; 51:1540–1546. [PubMed: 19834024]
- Haigh JJ, Morelli PI, Gerhardt H, Haigh K, Tsien J, Damert A, Miquerol L, Muhlner U, Klein R, Ferrara N, Wagner EF, Betsholtz C, Nagy A. Cortical and retinal defects caused by dosagedependent reductions in VEGF-A paracrine signaling. Developmental Biology. 2003; 262:225– 241. [PubMed: 14550787]
- Hatini V, Tao WF, Lai E. Expression of Winged Helix Genes, Bf-1 and Bf-2, Define Adjacent Domains within the Developing Forebrain and Retina. Journal of Neurobiology. 1994; 25:1293– 1309. [PubMed: 7815060]
- He J, Zhang G, Almeida Alexandra D, Cayouette M, Simons Benjamin D, Harris William A. How Variable Clones Build an Invariant Retina. Neuron. 2012; 75:786–798. [PubMed: 22958820]
- Heisenberg C-P, Houart C, Take-uchi M, Rauch G-J, Young N, Coutinho P, Masai I, Caneparo L, Concha ML, Geisler R, Dale TC, Wilson SW, Stemple DL. A mutation in the Gsk3-binding domain of zebrafish Masterblind/Axin1 leads to a fate transformation of telencephalon and eyes to diencephalon. Genes & Development. 2001; 15:1427–1434. [PubMed: 11390362]
- Hellstrom M, Phng LK, Gerhardt H. VEGF and Notch signaling: the yin and yang of angiogenic sprouting. Cell adhesion & migration. 2007; 1:133–136. [PubMed: 19262131]

- Hill RE, Favor J, Hogan BL, Ton CC, Saunders GF, Hanson IM, Prosser J, Jordan T, Hastie ND, van Heyningen V. Mouse Small eye results from mutations in a paired-like homeobox-containing gene. Nature. 1992; 355:750. [PubMed: 1346927]
- Hornby SJ, Dandona L, Jones RB, Stewart H, Gilbert CE. The familial contribution to non-syndromic ocular coloboma in south India. British Journal of Ophthalmology. 2003; 87:336–340. [PubMed: 12598450]
- Horsford DJ, Nguyen M-TT, Sellar GC, Kothary R, Arnheiter H, McInnes RR. Chx10 repression of Mitf is required for the maintenance of mammalian neuroretinal identity. Development. 2005; 132:177–187. [PubMed: 15576400]
- Hoser M, Potzner MR, Koch JM, Bosl MR, Wegner M, Sock E. Sox12 deletion in the mouse reveals nonreciprocal redundancy with the related Sox4 and Sox11 transcription factors. Mol Cell Biol. 2008; 28:4675–4687. [PubMed: 18505825]
- Hyatt GA, Schmitt EA, Marsh-Armstrong N, McCaffery P, Drager UC, Dowling JE. Retinoic acid establishes ventral retinal characteristics. Development. 1996; 122:195–204. [PubMed: 8565830]
- Ivanovitch K, Cavodeassi F, Wilson Stephen W. Precocious Acquisition of Neuroepithelial Character in the Eye Field Underlies the Onset of Eye Morphogenesis. Developmental Cell. 2013; 27:293– 305. [PubMed: 24209576]
- Jankowski MP, Cornuet PK, McIlwrath S, Koerber HR, Albers KM. SRY-box containing gene 11 (Sox11) transcription factor is required for neuron survival and neurite growth. Neuroscience. 2006; 143:501–514. [PubMed: 17055661]
- Jean D, Bernier G, Gruss P. Six6 (Optx2) is a novel murine Six3-related homeobox gene that demarcates the presumptive pituitary/hypothalamic axis and the ventral optic stalk. Mechanisms of Development. 1999; 84:31–40. [PubMed: 10473118]
- Jiang Y, Ding Q, Xie X, Libby RT, Lefebvre V, Gan L. Transcription factors SOX4 and SOX11 function redundantly to regulate the development of mouse retinal ganglion cells. J Biol Chem. 2013; 288:18429–18438. [PubMed: 23649630]
- Kamachi Y, Uchikawa M, Collignon J, Lovell-Badge R, Kondoh H. Involvement of Sox1, 2 and 3 in the early and subsequent molecular events of lens induction. Development. 1998; 125:2521–2532. [PubMed: 9609835]
- Kamachi Y, Uchikawa M, Tanouchi A, Sekido R, Kondoh H. Pax6 and SOX2 form a co-DNA-binding partner complex that regulates initiation of lens development. Genes Dev. 2001; 15:1272–1286. [PubMed: 11358870]
- Kelberman D, Rizzoti K, Avilion A, Bitner-Glindzicz M, Cianfarani S, Collins J, Chong WK, Kirk JMW, Achermann JC, Ross R, Carmignac D, Lovell-Badge R, Robinson ICAF, Dattani MT. Mutations within Sox2/SOX2 are associated with abnormalities in the hypothalamo-pituitarygonadal axis in mice and humans. The Journal of Clinical Investigation. 2006; 116:2442–2455. [PubMed: 16932809]
- Kenyon KL, Zaghloul N, Moody SA. Transcription Factors of the Anterior Neural Plate Alter Cell Movements of Epidermal Progenitors to Specify a Retinal Fate. Developmental Biology. 2001; 240:77–91. [PubMed: 11784048]
- Kessler DS, Melton DA. Vertebrate embryonic induction: mesodermal and neural patterning. Science. 1994; 266:596–604. [PubMed: 7939714]
- Kim KH, Roberts CW. CHD7 in charge of neurogenesis. Cell Stem Cell. 2013; 13:1–2. [PubMed: 23827700]
- Kim S-H, Shin J, Park H-C, Yeo S-Y, Hong S-K, Han S, Rhee M, Kim C-H, Chitnis AB, Huh T-L. Specification of an anterior neuroectoderm patterning by Frizzled8a-mediated Wnt8b signalling during late gastrulation in zebrafish. Development. 2002; 129:4443–4455. [PubMed: 12223403]
- Komatireddy S, Chakrabarti S, Mandal AK, Reddy AB, Sampath S, Panicker SG, Balasubramanian D. Mutation spectrum of FOXC1 and clinical genetic heterogeneity of Axenfeld-Rieger anomaly in India. Molecular vision. 2003; 9:43–48. [PubMed: 12592227]
- Koopman P, Gubbay J, Vivian N, Goodfellow P, Lovell-Badge R. Male development of chromosomally female mice transgenic for Sry. Nature. 1991; 351:117–121. [PubMed: 2030730]
- Kwan KM, Otsuna H, Kidokoro H, Carney KR, Saijoh Y, Chien C-B. A complex choreography of cell movements shapes the vertebrate eye. Development. 2012; 139:359–372. [PubMed: 22186726]

- Le YZ, Bai Y, Zhu M, Zheng L. Temporal requirement of RPE-derived VEGF in the development of choroidal vasculature. Journal of neurochemistry. 2010; 112:1584–1592. [PubMed: 20067573]
- Lequeux L, Rio M, Vigouroux A, Titeux M, Etchevers H, Malecaze F, Chassaing N, Calvas P. Confirmation of RAX gene involvement in human anophthalmia. Clinical Genetics. 2008; 74:392– 395. [PubMed: 18783408]
- Li H, Tierney C, Wen L, Wu JY, Rao Y. A single morphogenetic field gives rise to two retina primordia under the influence of the prechordal plate. Development. 1997; 124:603–615. [PubMed: 9043075]
- Liu, W.; Lagutin, OV.; Mende, M.; Streit, A.; Oliver, G. Six3 activation of Pax6 expression is essential for mammalian lens induction and specification. 2006. p. 5383-5395.
- Livesey FJ, Cepko CL. Vertebrate neural cell-fate determination: Lessons from the retina. Nat Rev Neurosci. 2001; 2:109–118. [PubMed: 11252990]
- Lo-Castro A, Giana G, Fichera M, Castiglia L, Grillo L, Musumeci SA, Galasso C, Curatolo P. Deletion 2p25.2: A cryptic chromosome abnormality in a patient with autism and mental retardation detected using aCGH. European Journal of Medical Genetics. 2009; 52:67–70. [PubMed: 18992374]
- Martinez-Morales J-R, Del Bene F, Nica G, Hammerschmidt M, Bovolenta P, Wittbrodt J. Differentiation of the Vertebrate Retina Is Coordinated by an FGF Signaling Center. Developmental Cell. 2005; 8:565–574. [PubMed: 15809038]
- Masai I, Yamaguchi M, Tonou-Fujimori N, Komori A, Okamoto H. The hedgehog-PKA pathway regulates two distinct steps of the differentiation of retinal ganglion cells: the cell-cycle exit of retinoblasts and their neuronal maturation. Development. 2005; 132:1539–1553. [PubMed: 15728672]
- Maschhoff KL, Anziano PQ, Ward P, Baldwin HS. Conservation of Sox4 gene structure and expression during chicken embryogenesis. Gene. 2003; 320:23–30. [PubMed: 14597385]
- Masuda T, Wahlin K, Wan J, Hu J, Maruotti J, Yang X, Iacovelli J, Wolkow N, Kist R, Dunaief JL, Qian J, Zack DJ, Esumi N. Transcription factor SOX9 plays a key role in the regulation of visual cycle gene expression in the retinal pigment epithelium. J Biol Chem. 2014; 289:12908–12921. [PubMed: 24634209]
- Memberg SP, Hall AK. Dividing neuron precursors express neuron-specific tubulin. J Neurobiol. 1995; 27:26–43. [PubMed: 7643073]
- Moore KB, Mood K, Daar IO, Moody SA. Morphogenetic Movements Underlying Eye Field Formation Require Interactions between the FGF and ephrinB1 Signaling Pathways. Developmental Cell. 2004; 6:55–67. [PubMed: 14723847]
- Morris AC, Forbes-Osborne MA, Pillai LS, Fadool JM. Microarray analysis of XOPS-mCFP zebrafish retina identifies genes associated with rod photoreceptor degeneration and regeneration. Invest Ophthalmol Vis Sci. 2011; 52:2255–2266. [PubMed: 21217106]
- Muller F, Albert S, Blader P, Fischer N, Hallonet M, Strahle U. Direct action of the nodal-related signal cyclops in induction of sonic hedgehog in the ventral midline of the CNS. Development. 2000; 127:3889–3897. [PubMed: 10952887]
- Müller F, Rohrer H, Vogel-Höpker A. Bone morphogenetic proteins specify the retinal pigment epithelium in the chick embryo. Development. 2007; 134:3483–3493. [PubMed: 17728349]
- Nornes HO, Dressler GR, Knapik EW, Deutsch U, Gruss P. Spatially and temporally restricted expression of Pax2 during murine neurogenesis. Development. 1990; 109:797–809. [PubMed: 1977575]
- Ohsawa R, Kageyama R. Regulation of retinal cell fate specification by multiple transcription factors. Brain Research. 2008; 1192:90–98. [PubMed: 17488643]
- Onwochei BC, Simon JW, Bateman JB, Couture KC, Mir E. Ocular Colobomata. Survey of Ophthalmology. 2000; 45:175–194. [PubMed: 11094243]
- Otteson DC, Shelden E, Jones JM, Kameoka J, Hitchcock PF. Pax2 expression and retinal morphogenesis in the normal and Krd mouse. Developmental Biology. 1998; 193:209–224. [PubMed: 9473325]

- Pan X, Zhao J, Zhang WN, Li HY, Mu R, Zhou T, Zhang HY, Gong WL, Yu M, Man JH, Zhang PJ, Li AL, Zhang XM. Induction of SOX4 by DNA damage is critical for p53 stabilization and function. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2009; 106:3788–3793. [PubMed: 19234109]
- Pei W, Feldman B. Identification of common and unique modifiers of zebrafish midline bifurcation and cyclopia. Developmental Biology. 2009; 326:201–211. [PubMed: 19046963]
- Penzo-Mendez AI. Critical roles for SoxC transcription factors in development and cancer. Int J Biochem Cell Biol. 2010; 42:425–428. [PubMed: 19651233]
- Piatigorsky J. Enigma of the abundant water-soluble cytoplasmic proteins of the cornea: the "refracton" hypothesis. Cornea. 2001; 20:853–858. [PubMed: 11685065]
- Pillai-Kastoori L, Wen W, Wilson SG, Strachan E, Lo-Castro A, Fichera M, Musumeci SA, Lehmann OJ, Morris AC. Sox11 Is Required to Maintain Proper Levels of Hedgehog Signaling during Vertebrate Ocular Morphogenesis. PLoS Genet. 2014; 10:e1004491. [PubMed: 25010521]
- Porter FD, Drago J, Xu Y, Cheema SS, Wassif C, Huang SP, Lee E, Grinberg A, Massalas JS, Bodine D, Alt F, Westphal H. Lhx2, a LIM homeobox gene, is required for eye, forebrain, and definitive erythrocyte development. Development. 1997; 124:2935–2944. [PubMed: 9247336]
- Raviv S, Bharti K, Rencus-Lazar S, Cohen-Tayar Y, Schyr R, Evantal N, Meshorer E, Zilberberg A, Idelson M, Reubinoff B, Grebe R, Rosin-Arbesfeld R, Lauderdale J, Lutty G, Arnheiter H, Ashery-Padan R. PAX6 Regulates Melanogenesis in the Retinal Pigmented Epithelium through Feed-Forward Regulatory Interactions with MITF. PLoS Genet. 2014; 10:e1004360. [PubMed: 24875170]
- Rhinn M, Dierich A, Shawlot W, Behringer RR, Le Meur M, Ang SL. Sequential roles for Otx2 in visceral endoderm and neuroectoderm for forebrain and midbrain induction and specification. Development. 1998; 125:845–856. [PubMed: 9449667]
- Roessler E, Belloni E, Gaudenz K, Jay P, Berta P, Scherer SW, Tsui LC, Muenke M. Mutations in the human Sonic Hedgehog gene cause holoprosencephaly. Nature genetics. 1996; 14:357–360. [PubMed: 8896572]
- Rousseau B, Larrieu-Lahargue F, Bikfalvi A, Javerzat S. Involvement of fibroblast growth factors in choroidal angiogenesis and retinal vascularization. Experimental Eye Research. 2003; 77:147–156. [PubMed: 12873444]
- Roy A, de Melo J, Chaturvedi D, Thein T, Cabrera-Socorro A, Houart C, Meyer G, Blackshaw S, Tole S. LHX2 Is Necessary for the Maintenance of Optic Identity and for the Progression of Optic Morphogenesis. The Journal of Neuroscience. 2013; 33:6877–6884. [PubMed: 23595746]
- Saint-Geniez M, D'Amore PA. Development and pathology of the hyaloid, choroidal and retinal vasculature. The International journal of developmental biology. 2004; 48:1045–1058. [PubMed: 15558494]
- Schepers GE, Teasdale RD, Koopman P. Twenty pairs of sox: extent, homology, and nomenclature of the mouse and human sox transcription factor gene families. Dev Cell. 2002; 3:167–170. [PubMed: 12194848]
- Schilham MW, Oosterwegel MA, Moerer P, Ya J, de Boer PA, van de Wetering M, Verbeek S, Lamers WH, Kruisbeek AM, Cumano A, Clevers H. Defects in cardiac outflow tract formation and pro-B-lymphocyte expansion in mice lacking Sox-4. Nature. 1996; 380:711–714. [PubMed: 8614465]
- Schulte D, Cepko CL. Two homeobox genes define the domain of EphA3 expression in the developing chick retina. Development. 2000; 127:5033–5045. [PubMed: 11060230]
- Schwarz M, Cecconi F, Bernier G, Andrejewski N, Kammandel B, Wagner M, Gruss P. Spatial specification of mammalian eye territories by reciprocal transcriptional repression of Pax2 and Pax6. Development. 2000; 127:4325–4334. [PubMed: 11003833]
- Semina EV, Brownell I, Mintz-Hittner HA, Murray JC, Jamrich M. Mutations in the human forkhead transcription factor FOXE3 associated with anterior segment ocular dysgenesis and cataracts. Human Molecular Genetics. 2001; 10:231–236. [PubMed: 11159941]
- Shaham O, Gueta K, Mor E, Oren-Giladi P, Grinberg D, Xie Q, Cvekl A, Shomron N, Davis N, Keydar-Prizant M, Raviv S, Pasmanik-Chor M, Bell RE, Levy C, Avellino R, Banfi S, Conte I, Ashery-Padan R. Pax6 regulates gene expression in the vertebrate lens through miR-204. PLoS Genet. 2013; 9:e1003357. [PubMed: 23516376]

- Shaham O, Smith AN, Robinson ML, Taketo MM, Lang RA, Ashery-Padan R. Pax6 is essential for lens fiber cell differentiation. Development. 2009; 136:2567–2578. [PubMed: 19570848]
- Shawber CJ, Kitajewski J. Notch function in the vasculature: insights from zebrafish, mouse and man. BioEssays. 2004; 26:225–234. [PubMed: 14988924]
- Shiels A, Bassnett S. Mutations in the founder of the MIP gene family underlie cataract development in the mouse. Nature genetics. 1996; 12:212–215. [PubMed: 8563764]
- Simeone A, Acampora D, Mallamaci A, Stornaiuolo A, D'Apice MR, Nigro V, Boncinelli E. A vertebrate gene related to orthodenticle contains a homeodomain of the bicoid class and demarcates anterior neuroectoderm in the gastrulating mouse embryo. The EMBO journal. 1993; 12:2735–2747. [PubMed: 8101484]
- Sock E, Rettig SD, Enderich J, Bosl MR, Tamm ER, Wegner M. Gene targeting reveals a widespread role for the high-mobility-group transcription factor Sox11 in tissue remodeling. Mol Cell Biol. 2004; 24:6635–6644. [PubMed: 15254231]
- Stigloher C, Ninkovic J, Laplante M, Geling A, Tannhäuser B, Topp S, Kikuta H, Becker TS, Houart C, Bally-Cuif L. Segregation of telencephalic and eye-field identities inside the zebrafish forebrain territory is controlled by Rx3. Development. 2006; 133:2925–2935. [PubMed: 16818451]
- Streit A. The preplacodal region: an ectodermal domain with multipotential progenitors that contribute to sense organs and cranial sensory ganglia. International Journal of Developmental Biology. 2007; 51:447–461. [PubMed: 17891708]
- Swaroop A, Kim D, Forrest D. Transcriptional regulation of photoreceptor development and homeostasis in the mammalian retina. Nat Rev Neurosci. 2010; 11:563–576. [PubMed: 20648062]
- Tomita, K.; Moriyoshi, K.; Nakanishi, S.; Guillemot, F.; Kageyama, R. Mammalian achaete-scute and atonal homologs regulate neuronal versus glial fate determination in the central nervous system. 2000. p. 5460-5472.
- Tsurusaki Y, Koshimizu E, Ohashi H, Phadke S, Kou I, Shiina M, Suzuki T, Okamoto N, Imamura S, Yamashita M, Watanabe S, Yoshiura K, Kodera H, Miyatake S, Nakashima M, Saitsu H, Ogata K, Ikegawa S, Miyake N, Matsumoto N. De novo SOX11 mutations cause Coffin-Siris syndrome. Nat Commun. 2014; 5:4011. [PubMed: 24886874]
- Tucker P, Laemle L, Munson A, Kanekar S, Oliver ER, Brown N, Schlecht H, Vetter M, Glaser T. The eyeless mouse mutation (ey1) removes an alternative start codon from the Rx/rax homeobox gene. genesis. 2001; 31:43–53. [PubMed: 11668677]
- Usui A, Mochizuki Y, Iida A, Miyauchi E, Satoh S, Sock E, Nakauchi H, Aburatani H, Murakami A, Wegner M, Watanabe S. The early retinal progenitor-expressed gene Sox11 regulates the timing of the differentiation of retinal cells. Development. 2013; 140:740–750. [PubMed: 23318640]
- Uy BR, Simoes-Costa M, Koo DE, Sauka-Spengler T, Bronner ME. Evolutionarily conserved role for SoxC genes in neural crest specification and neuronal differentiation. Dev Biol. 2014
- van de Wetering M, Oosterwegel M, van Norren K, Clevers H. Sox-4, an Sry-like HMG box protein, is a transcriptional activator in lymphocytes. Embo j. 1993; 12:3847–3854. [PubMed: 8404853]
- Varga ZM, Wegner J, Westerfield M. Anterior movement of ventral diencephalic precursors separates the primordial eye field in the neural plate and requires cyclops. Development. 1999; 126:5533– 5546. [PubMed: 10572031]
- Vissers LE, van Ravenswaaij CM, Admiraal R, Hurst JA, de Vries BB, Janssen IM, van der Vliet WA, Huys EH, de Jong PJ, Hamel BC, Schoenmakers EF, Brunner HG, Veltman JA, van Kessel AG. Mutations in a new member of the chromodomain gene family cause CHARGE syndrome. Nat Genet. 2004: 36:955–957. [PubMed: 15300250]
- Vogel-Höpker A, Momose T, Rohrer H, Yasuda K, Ishihara L, Rapaport DH. Multiple functions of fibroblast growth factor-8 (FGF-8) in chick eye development. Mechanisms of Development. 2000; 94:25–36. [PubMed: 10842056]
- Wawersik S, Purcell P, Rauchman M, Dudley AT, Robertson EJ, Maas R. BMP7 acts in murine lens placode development. Developmental Biology. 1999; 207:176–188. [PubMed: 10049573]
- Wegner M. All purpose Sox: The many roles of Sox proteins in gene expression. Int J Biochem Cell Biol. 2010; 42:381–390. [PubMed: 19631281]

- Wiebe MS, Nowling TK, Rizzino A. Identification of novel domains within Sox-2 and Sox-11 involved in autoinhibition of DNA binding and partnership specificity. J Biol Chem. 2003; 278:17901–17911. [PubMed: 12637543]
- Williams C, Kim S-H, Ni TT, Mitchell L, Ro H, Penn JS, Baldwin SH, Solnica-Krezel L, Zhong TP. Hedgehog signaling induces arterial endothelial cell formation by repressing venous cell fate. Developmental Biology. 2010; 341:196–204. [PubMed: 20193674]
- Wilson SW, Houart C. Early Steps in the Development of the Forebrain. Developmental Cell. 2004; 6:167–181. [PubMed: 14960272]
- Winkler S, Loosli F, Henrich T, Wakamatsu Y, Wittbrodt J. The conditional medaka mutation eyeless uncouples patterning and morphogenesis of the eye. Development. 2000; 127:1911–1919. [PubMed: 10751179]
- Wotton D, Lake RA, Farr CJ, Owen MJ. The high mobility group transcription factor, SOX4, transactivates the human CD2 enhancer. J Biol Chem. 1995; 270:7515–7522. [PubMed: 7706298]
- Wurm A, Sock E, Fuchshofer R, Wegner M, Tamm ER. Anterior segment dysgenesis in the eyes of mice deficient for the high-mobility-group transcription factor Sox11. Exp Eye Res. 2008; 86:895–907. [PubMed: 18423449]
- Yokoi H, Yan YL, Miller MR, BreMiller RA, Catchen JM, Johnson EA, Postlethwait JH. Expression profiling of zebrafish sox9 mutants reveals that Sox9 is required for retinal differentiation. Dev Biol. 2009; 329:1–15. [PubMed: 19210963]
- Zhang J, Talbot WS, Schier AF. Positional Cloning Identifies Zebrafish one-eyed pinhead as a Permissive EGF-Related Ligand Required during Gastrulation. Cell. 1998; 92:241–251. [PubMed: 9458048]
- Zhang XM, Yang XJ. Temporal and spatial effects of Sonic hedgehog signaling in chick eye morphogenesis. Developmental Biology. 2001; 233:271–290. [PubMed: 11336495]
- Zhao H, Yang T, Madakashira BP, Thiels CA, Bechtle CA, Garcia CM, Zhang H, Yu K, Ornitz DM, Beebe DC, Robinson ML. Fibroblast growth factor receptor signaling is essential for lens fiber cell differentiation. Developmental Biology. 2008; 318:276–288. [PubMed: 18455718]



Figure 1.

Vertebrate ocular morphogenesis. A schematic representation of the major stages of eye development is shown, with the presumptive telencephalon (T, red), eye field (EF, yellow), hypothalamus (H, green), and diencephalon (D, purple) indicated within the anterior neural plate. The transcription factors (TF's) associated with each stage of eye development are indicated in blue boxes on the left of the figure. OV, optic vesicle; L, lens; NR, neural retina; RPE, retinal pigmented epithelium; CF, choroid fissure; A, anterior; P, posterior; N, nasal; T, temporal.

	Eye (in general)	Lens	GCL	INL	ONL	CMZ	РОМ
Mouse	Sox4 Sox11 Sox12	Sox11 Sox12	Sox4 Sox11 Sox12	Sox4 Sox11			ND
Xenopus	sox4 sox11	sox11	sox4 sox11	sox4	ND	sox4 sox11	ND
Zebrafish	sox4 sox11	sox11b	sox4b sox11a	sox4a sox4b sox11a	sox11a sox11b (regeneration)	sox4a sox4b sox11a sox11b	sox4a
Chick	Sox4						
Lamprey	Sox4 Sox11 Sox12						

		Table 1
SoxC expression	n in the developing	vetebrate eye

GCL: ganglion cell layer; INL: inner nuclear layer; ONL: outter nuclear layer; CMZ: ciliary marginal zone; POM: periocular mesenchyme; ND: not described.