# Utilization of Exogenous Inorganic Carbon Species in Photosynthesis by Chlorella pyrenoidosa<sup>1</sup>

Received for publication August 9, 1979 and in revised form December 6, 1979

BARRY J. SHELP AND DAVID T. CANVIN

Department of Biology, Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario K7L 3N6 Canada

## ABSTRACT

The nature of the inorganic carbon utilized during photosynthesis by Chlorella pyrenoidosa was investigated using three experimental techniques (open gas analysis system with "artificial leaf' or "aqueous" chambers and 02 electrode system) to measure carbon assimilation. Photosynthesis was studied as a function of pH and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration. The  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration was inadequate to meet the requirements of photosynthesis only when HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was added at high pH. Under all other conditions, the low and constant  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>), in contrast to the highly variable  $K_m$  (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>), suggested that  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was the major species utilized.

Higher rates of photosynthesis were observed under limiting  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  conditions above pH 7.5 but rates of hydration of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  were not consistent with the view that the stimulation in photosynthesis was supported by HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. In the same pH region lower rates of photosynthesis were observed under saturating  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  conditions. These conflicting changes seemed not to be related to pH but to some as yet undetermined effect of bicarbonate. No support was obtained for the view that the quantum efficiency was different under conditions where  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was assimilated compared to conditions where  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  could be assimilated, although at saturating C02, lower maximal rates of photosynthesis were observed in the latter conditions.

Several workers have reported that freshwater algae grown at air-levels of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  exhibit a low  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  compensation point (8, 22, 38), little  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  evolution in the light (22) and little  $O<sub>2</sub>$  sensitivity of photosynthesis (6, 16, 22). Since air-adapted Chlorella (3, 17) and Chlamydomonas cells (7) have been shown to fix carbon via the Calvin cycle, it has been suggested that this apparent lack of photorespiration is achieved by a  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrating mechanism, not based on the dicarboxylic acid transport prevalent in C4 plants, but rather on the utilization of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  (1, 2, 4, 7, 15). In this explanation  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  ions are actively transported into the cell, thus keeping the internal  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  concentrations higher than those that would be in equilibrium with the ambient  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration.

Bicarbonate utilization has been conclusively demonstrated in algae (see refs. cited by Raven [30]) such as Scenedesmus (13), Hydrodictyon (29), and Chara (24), and further indicated in studies with Chlamydomonas (1, 2, 4) and Anabaena (2). With Chlorella, early work summarized by Rabinowitch (28) suggested that it was a  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  utilizer; more recent evidence by Steeman-Nielson and Jensen (35), Findenegg (14), and Bidwell (5) suggested that  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> could also be used.

As air-grown Chlorella do not exhibit any characteristics of photorespiration it is important to determine whether it can utilize  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  and whether this  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  uptake is sufficient to suppress photorespiration. Here, we report on the nature of the inorganic carbon sources used by Chlorella, using three experimental systems to measure carbon assimilation.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

Plant Material. Axenic cultures of Chlorella pyrenoidosa Chick (strain 252), obtained from the Culture Collection of Algae at the University of Texas (Austin) were grown in a semicontinuous system (36) in 6-liter Erlenmeyer flasks containing 3 liters Gorham's culture medium No. <sup>11</sup> (19). Cultures were maintained in a growth cabinet (model 16S, Controlled Environments Ltd., Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada) at a temperature of 25 C, illuminated continuously with a quantum flux density of 185-235  $\mu$ E  $m^{-2}$  s<sup>-1</sup>. An air stream was bubbled through the continuously stirred culture at a rate of 790 ml min-'. Cultures were harvested during exponential growth, centrifuged at 600g for 10 min, washed with deionized  $H_2O$ , resuspended in 25 ml of the appropriate medium (except where stated otherwise), and stored at room temperature.

Gas Exchange Techniques. Photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> fixation was determined in the open gas analysis system described by Canvin (10) using both the artificial leaf technique of Lloyd et al. (22) and an aqueous method which allowed measurements to be obtained from algal cells suspended in liquid medium. For the artificial leaf, cells equivalent to 100  $\mu$ g Chl were suspended on 16 cm<sup>2</sup> of filter paper (Whatman No. 3MM) and the rate of gas flow over the leaf was 235 ml  $min^{-1}$ .

The photosynthesis chamber (Fig. 1) used for the aqueous method was made of Plexiglas and consisted of: (a) the main section housing a thin inner sample chamber (6 mm thick  $\times$  116 mm wide  $\times$  112 mm high to give a total volume of 78 ml) with outlet and thermocouple ports (brass machined); and  $(b)$  an end section which when attached to the main section by 10 inset screws (separated by a rubber gasket prepared from an inner tube), covered the end of the sample chamber. The chamber had water jackets on both sides to assist in temperature control. The gas mixture was passed at a flow rate of 1.08 liters min-' through the end into the sample chamber via a course sintered glass tubular filter (15.8 mm dia  $\times$  102 mm length of fritted section (171 mm total length), Coming Glass Works, Coming, New York) which fitted securely into the base of the inner chamber (prepared specifically to fit the filter tightly against a piece of rubber). The filter was changed after every set of measurements on a single sample of algae. The assembled chamber was supported with retort stands and the algal suspension (360  $\mu$ g Chl in 25 ml) was illuminated from one side.

The algae were permitted to equilibrate in the open systems at a temperature of 25 C, a quantum flux density of  $400 \mu \text{E m}^{-2} \text{s}^{-1}$ a RH in excess of 90%, and an inlet  $CO_2$  concentration of 350  $\mu$ I  $1^{-1}$  (11.7  $\mu$ M dissolved CO<sub>2</sub>). Measurements were started when the

<sup>&#</sup>x27;This investigation was supported by a research grant to D. T. C. and post graduate fellowship to B. J. S. from the National Science and Engineering Research Council of Canada.



FIG. 1. Side view of chamber for determining photosynthesis of algae in liquid suspensions using the open gas analysis system. A: main section; B: end section; C: inner sample chamber (volume 6 mm  $\times$  116 mm  $\times$  112  $mm = 78 cm<sup>3</sup>$ ; D: water jacket (only front water jacket is shown); E: gas entrance; F: gas exit; G: sintered glass tubular filter; H: water inlet port; I: water outlet port; J: thermocouple port; K: sample removal port (normally clamped off); L: rubber "O" ring seals; M: rubber piece; N: rubber gasket; O: inset screws;  $(\rightarrow)$  shows direction of gas flow.

CO2 depletion on the trace remained constant, which was about <sup>1</sup> h after the algae had been placed in the leaf chamber, and continued for a period of 2 h. All experiments were conducted at 21% 02. pH on the artificial leaf was determined with a combination pH microelectrode (Bio-Rad).

Photosynthesis was also measured as  $O_2$  evolution in an  $O_2$ electrode chamber (Yellow Springs Instruments, model 5331) using a light intensity of 600  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> provided by a projector (Hanimex 500). A constant temperature circulator bath maintained the cuvette temperature at 25 C. Assays were performed in a total volume of 2.0 ml which included 100  $\mu$ l Chlorella (20  $\mu$ g Chl) in the appropriate <sup>50</sup> mm buffer and pH. These buffers were prepared  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ -free as described by Lorimer et al. (23). After the algae depleted the endogenous  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (contained in the medium or as a pool in the cells [4]) the background rate of  $O<sub>2</sub>$  evolution, which remained constant for periods of at least <sup>1</sup> h, was typically 4–5  $\mu$ mol O<sub>2</sub> mg<sup>-1</sup> Chl h<sup>-1</sup>. Since similar rates of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-dependent  $O<sub>2</sub>$  evolution were obtained at any time during this period,  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> was routinely added 5-10 min after the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was depleted.

The concentrated algal cells (1  $\mu$ g Chl/5  $\mu$ l) were stored at room temperature in deionized H<sub>2</sub>O and bubbled with air. They maintained their photosynthetic rate over an 8-h period.

 $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations in the open and  $O<sub>2</sub>$  electrode systems were calculated according to Buch (9). Kinetic constants were calculated using a nonlinear regression computer program following the methods of Wilkinson (39). Chl was extracted with boiling  $100\%$  methanol and MgCO<sub>3</sub> and the concentration determined using the extinction coefficients for Chl  $a$  and  $b$  (18).

### RESULTS

A concentration of Mes buffer higher than <sup>25</sup> mm was necessary to maintain pH <sup>5</sup> in the aqueous system but no difference in photosynthetic rates were observed between cells suspended in 0.05 and 0.1 M Tricine at pH 8.5. Subsequently, cells were resuspended in 0.1 M buffer at the appropriate pH. Of the buffers tested (Mes, citrate, Tes, Mops<sup>2</sup>, Hepes, Taps, Tricine, Caps, glycine), only citrate and Caps substantially reduced the rate of CO<sub>2</sub> fixation. The presence of growth medium with the buffer and the order of exposure to  $CO_2$  concentrations had no effect on the  $CO_2$ response curves for photosynthesis.

Since the ratio of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  present in solution is altered by changing pH, the measurement of photosynthesis as a function of inorganic carbon concentration and pH allows one to infer which form  $(CO_2$  or  $HCO_3^-$ ) is utilized in photosynthesis (4, 30). Rates of photosynthesis of Chlorella were measured as a function of pH at different  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  or added  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  (total inorganic carbon) concentrations (Figs. 2-4). In all experimental methodologies, the photosynthetic rates at saturating or near saturating  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations were higher at pH 5.0 than at pH 8.5. At  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations equal or below atmospheric levels (10  $\mu$ M) CO<sub>2</sub> fixation was greatest at pH 8.5.

CO2 compensation points, determined by interpolation to the point of zero net photosynthesis (22), were about 0.3  $\mu$ M (Table I) regardless of the pH, except where CA was added. When CA was added the compensation point declined to about 0.11  $\mu$ M CO<sub>2</sub>, though the variation was large in the case of the aqueous system (Table I). In the  $O_2$  electrode system, the photosynthetic rate extrapolated to zero  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ .  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  evolution into  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ -free air in the light  $(22)$  was low, amounting in most cases to less than  $10\%$  of the photosynthetic rate under normal atmospheric conditions (Table I).

Assuming full equilibration of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$ , the Michaelis-Menten kinetic parameters for photosynthesis ( $V_{max}$ , the maximum rate of photosynthesis;  $K_m$ , the concentration of CO<sub>2</sub> at which the rate of photosynthesis attains one-half of its maximum value) were calculated using nonlinear regression analysis according to Wilkinson (39) (Table II). In the open systems, the  $K_m$  $(CO<sub>2</sub>)$  remained fairly constant over the pH range 5.0-8.5, al-



FIG. 2.  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  response curves for C. pyrenoidosa photosynthesis as a function of pH using artificial leaf technique in the open gas analysis system. Measurements were conducted at 25 C, a quantum flux density of  $400 \ \mu \text{E m}^{-2} \text{ s}^{-1}$  and 21% O<sub>2</sub>. Mes, Hepes, and Taps buffers (0.1 M) were used at pH 5.0, 7.0, and 8.5, respectively.  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$  represents the average dissolved  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration. Bars are  $SE$  of mean with the number of measurements shown beside each point. (.): measurements where sample number was less than 3. (-): fitted according to Wilkinson (39).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Abbreviations: Mops: morpholinopropane sulfonic acid; Taps: tris(hydroxymethyl)methylaminopropanesulfonic acid: Caps: cyclohexylaminopropanesulfonic acid; CA: carbonic anhydrase.



FIG. 3.  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  response curves for C. pyrenoidosa photosynthesis as a function of pH using the aqueous technique in the open gas analysis system. Measuring conditions and explanations as for Figure 2. CA (260 Wilbur-Anderson units) from bovine erythrocytes (Sigma) were added to experiments at pH 8.5.



FIG. 4. Bicarbonate-dependent  $O<sub>2</sub>$  evolution for C. pyrenoidosa as a function of pH. Measurements were performed at 25 C, 600  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and an  $O_2$  concentration of 18-21% using a sealed  $O_2$  electrode system. The background rate was subtracted from the  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ -dependent rate of 02 evolution. [Total inorganic carbon] represents the concentration of added  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$ ; the  $[CO<sub>2</sub>]$  in equilibrium with the  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  is shown for comparative purposes. Remainder of explanation as for Figure 2.

though when CA was added in the aqueous technique, the  $K_m$  $(CO_2)$  decreased to a value of 3.2  $\mu$ M as compared to 11.9  $\mu$ M at pH 5.0. In contrast, the  $K_m$  (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) changed by several hundredfold when the pH was changed from 5 to 8.5. When  $O_2$  evolution as a function of pH was examined in the closed system, the  $K_m$  $(CO_2)$  decreased and the  $K_m$   $(HCO_3^-)$  increased with increasing pH, but the change in  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) was much less than the change in  $K_m$  (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>). All of these results suggest that  $CO_2$  was the carbon species utilized in photosynthesis  $(4, 30)$  although there may be some contribution from  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  at the high pH, especially in the  $O<sub>2</sub>$  electrode system, where the inorganic carbon was added as  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$ .

The addition of CA, which facilitates the establishment of the equilibrium between  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$ , appeared to cause a reduction in the  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) (Table II). The effect of CA addition was investigated further using the artificial leaf with the cells suspended in buffer and in fresh medium plus buffer. (Table III). Without CA, the  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) in each resuspension condition was

Table I. Compensation Points and  $CO_2$  Evolution Into  $CO_2$ -Free Air in the Light by C. pyrenoidosa



<sup>a</sup> Wilbur-Anderson units (260) of CA from bovine erythrocytes were added to the resuspension medium.

 $<sup>b</sup>$  Mean  $\pm$  sp.</sup>

'Numbers in parentheses represent the sample number.

<sup>d</sup> Equivalent to 10.7  $\mu$ 1 1<sup>-1</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> in the gas phase.

Table II. Influence of pH upon Kinetic Parameters of Photosynthetic Carbon Dioxide Fixation and Oxygen Evolution by C. pyrenoidosa

pН	$K_m$ <sup>a, f</sup> (Total)	$K_{m}^{a,f}$ $(HCO3-)$	$K_m$ <sup>a, f</sup> (CO <sub>2</sub> )	$V_{\text{max}}^{\text{a}}$
		μM		$\mu$ mol $mg^{-1}Chl$ $h^{-1}$
Artificial leaf				
5.0	10.7	0.5	$10.2 \pm 0.9^e$	$177.3 \pm 3.6^{\circ}$
7.0	48.1	39.3	$8.8 \pm 0.9$	$181.5 \pm 5.9^{\circ}$
8.5	765.3	743.1	$5.4 \pm 0.6$	$148.2 \pm 4.9^b$
Aqueous technique				
5.0	12.4	0.5	$11.9 \pm 1.2$	$192.0 \pm 6.4^{\circ}$
$8.5 + CAd$	439.3	426.6	$3.2 \pm 0.7$	$164.0 \pm 9.7$ <sup>b</sup>
Oxygen electrode				
5.0	$22.5 \pm 1.6$	0.8	21.8	$132.6 \pm 1.9^{\circ}$
8.5	$97.7 \pm 0.0$	94.9	0.7	$97.5 \pm 2.2$ <sup>c</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Kinetic constants were calculated from data in Figures 2-4, according to Wilkinson (39); compensation point was subtracted from the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ concentration before calculation.

 $<sup>b</sup>$  µmol CO<sub>2</sub> mg<sup>-1</sup>Chl h<sup>-1</sup>.</sup>

 $c$   $\mu$ mol O<sub>2</sub> mg<sup>-1</sup>Chl h<sup>-1</sup>.

<sup>d</sup> CA (260 Wilbur-Anderson units) added to suspension.

'Numbers represent mean ± SD.

 $f$  Assuming equilibrium the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, and total carbon concentration were calculated according to Buch (9).

the same at pH 7 and 8.5 whereas the  $K_m$  (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) changed over 20-fold. With CA addition, the change in the  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) between pH 7 and 8.5 was again much less than the change in  $K_m (HCO_3^-)$ . These results are again consistent with  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  being the carbon species utilized in photosynthesis (4). Both the  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) and  $K_m$  $(HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>)$  were reduced by the addition of CA (Table III). The stimulation of photosynthesis at low  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations by addition of CA to the suspension medium has been noticed before (5, 25) and in one case (5) it was suggested that the cells were using  $HCO<sub>3</sub>^-$  rather than  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ . With CA present, the  $HCO<sub>3</sub>^$ concentration may be higher and the utilization of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  may be increased, thereby resulting in a decrease in the  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) and  $K_m$  (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>). This possible explanation rests on the assumption, that without CA, the system was far out of equilibrium and the  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  concentration present was not that shown (Table III) but was less than that observed when CA was present. Although the system without CA may not be in equilibrium, the large change in  $K_m$  (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) between pH 7 and 8.5 suggests that any differences in  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  concentration brought about by the addition of CA

Table III. Influence of Addition of CA to the Resuspension Medium upon Kinetic Parameters of Subsequent Photosynthetic Rates by C. pyrenoidosa Using the Artificial Leaf

Measurements were performed at 25 C and 400  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup>s<sup>-1</sup>. Experiments on ± CA conditions were performed on the same day. Remainder of explanation as for Table II.

Resuspension Conditions	$K_m$ <sup>a</sup> (Total)	$K_m$ <sup>a</sup> $(HCO3-)$	$K_m$ <sup>a</sup> (CO <sub>2</sub> )	$V_{max}$ <sup>a</sup>
		μM		$\mu$ mol CO <sub>2</sub> $mg^{-1}$ Chl $h^{-1}$
<b>Buffer</b>				
Hepes $(pH 7.0)$				
$-CA$	29.0	23.7	$5.3 \pm 0.6$	$105.0 \pm 31$
$+ CA$	19.7	16.0	$3.6 \pm 0.4$	$118.0 \pm 3.0$
Taps $(pH 8.5)$				
$-CA$	609.9	592.2	$4.3 \pm 0.4$	$110.7 \pm 3.1$
$+CA$	255.3	247.9	$1.8 \pm 0.2$	$105.8 \pm 2.6$
Fresh medium buffer				
Mops $(pH 7.0)$				
– CA	47.0	38.4	$8.6 \pm 1.5$	$162.6 \pm 10.1$
$+ CA$	33.3	27.2	$6.1 \pm 0.9$	$178.3 \pm 7.9$
Tricine $(pH 8.5)$				
$-CA$	1276.5	1239.5	$9.0 \pm 1.3$	$210.0 \pm 10.5$
$+CA$	283.7	275.7	$2.0 \pm 0.1$	$178.0 \pm 3.0$

 $a$  Eight to 11 different  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations with a total sample number ranging from 11 to 22, were used to calculate the kinetic constants; compensation point was subtracted from the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration before calculation.

(especially at pH 8.5) are not likely to have much effect on photosynthesis. An alternative explanation for the effect of CA addition to the medium has been presented by Shiraiwa and Miyachi (34). They propose that in regions of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  depletion CA can increase the  $CO_2$  concentration by indirect supply of  $CO_2$ from the  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  present. The net effect of the combination of direct and indirect  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  supply is that the apparent concentration of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  required is decreased. This explanation would be consistent with our observations.

Another way of evaluating the relative importance of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  or  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  to photosynthesis is to compare the rate of formation of the species not added to the rate of photosynthesis. For the data on photosynthesis at pH 8.5 in Figure 2, where  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was added, the rate of formation of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  can be compared to the photosynthetic rate. To calculate the production of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$ , the rate constant of Watt and Pasche (37) was used which included both water and OH<sup>-</sup>-catalyzed  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  formation (21). For the data on photosynthesis at pH 8.5 (Fig. 4) where  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  was added, the rate at which  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  could be produced was calculated using the equations derived by Lucas (24) using constants for freshwater after Buch (9). The calculated rates would be maximum rates as the solutions involved the assumption that all  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  produced would be consumed, thus keeping their concentrations at zero.

The rates of hydration and dehydration together with the photosynthetic rates are shown in Figure 5. In the artificial leaf,  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> production was clearly insufficient to maintain photosynthesis. In the  $O_2$  electrode,  $CO_2$  production was sufficient to maintain photosynthesis above 0.5 mm total carbon. Below that concentration  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  production was not sufficient, suggesting that  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  may also be utilized.

When photosynthetic rate and the hydration rate of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  are determined over the pH range 5-10.5, it is clear that the rate of production of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  is not sufficient to maintain photosynthesis (Fig. 6). In contrast the rate of production of  $CO_2$  from  $HCO_3^$ was sufficient to maintain photosynthesis at all pH values below pH 8.3 (Fig. 7). Above this pH photosynthesis would appear to depend on  $HCO_3^-$  utilization (Fig. 7). At saturating inorganic



FIG. 5. Rates of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  production ( $\longrightarrow$ ) from the other carbon species and rates of photosynthesis for C. pyrenoidosa  $(--)$  at pH 8.5. In the artificial leaf (AL), Chl concentration was  $100 \mu$ g and volume was  $0.3$  ml, and in the  $O_2$  electrode, Chl concentration and volume were 20 ug and 2.0 ml, respectively. Photosynthesis data taken from Figures 2 and 4.



FIG. 6. Rates of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  hydration (---) and photosynthesis of C. pyren $oidosa$  ( $\longrightarrow$ ) as a function of pH at near saturating and limiting dissolved  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations. Measurements were performed at 25 C, 400  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, and 21% O<sub>2</sub> using the artificial leaf; A:  $[CO_2] = 46.8 \mu M$ ; B:  $[CO_2] =$ 11.7  $\mu$ M. (.): Mes; (O): Hepes; (A): Taps; ( $\triangle$ ): glycine. Volume and Chl concentration were  $0.3$  ml and  $100 \mu g$ , respectively.

carbon concentrations, photosynthesis was depressed at the higher pH values (Figs. 6A and 7). It seems unlikely that this is <sup>a</sup> direct effect of pH on photosynthesis because at limiting  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations, <sup>a</sup> stimulation of photosynthesis at higher pH values was observed (Fig. 6B). It is tempting to ascribe the stimulation in the rate of photosynthesis observed above pH 7.5 (Fig. 6B) to the increased utilization of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  in addition to  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , but  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ production was not sufficient to accomodate the increase in pho-



FIG. 7. Rates of dehydration  $(--)$  and photosynthesis of C. pyrenoi $dosa$  ( $-$ ) as a function of pH. Measurements were performed at 25 C, 600  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, and 21% O<sub>2</sub> by addition of 0.5 mm  $HCO_3$ <sup>-</sup> to the O<sub>2</sub> electrode. The background rate of  $O<sub>2</sub>$  evolution was subtracted from the HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-dependent rate. (O): Mes; ( $\bullet$ ): Hepes; ( $\triangle$ ): Taps. Errors quoted are the SE of the mean. Sample number was 6-10 for each pH.

tosynthetic rate.

At saturating  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations, photosynthesis was higher under conditions where only  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was available than under conditions where both  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  was available (Figs. 6A and 7). Other authors, who have also observed <sup>a</sup> similar phenomenon, suggested from light intensity experiments, that the lower rate of photosynthesis in the presence of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  indicates that more light was required to fix a mole of carbon supplied as  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  than was needed for a mole supplied as  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (24, 29). For the conditions used in this study, it was found that especially at high light intensities, photosynthesis was greater when  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was supplied (Fig. 8). However, photosynthesis was saturated at a light intensity of 400  $\mu$ E m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> at both pH values and in the region of limiting light similar quantum efficiencies were observed. The quantum efficiencies calculated on the basis of incident light (0.02 mol CO<sub>2</sub>)  $E^{-1}$ ) were low, probably because all of the light was not absorbed by the thin layer of algae.

## **DISCUSSION**

Investigation of photosynthetic rates as <sup>a</sup> function of pH and several  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations in the open gas analysis system (Figs. 2 and 3 and Table II) show that comparable results were obtained using the artificial leaf and aqueous techniques. There is no evidence that results with the artificial leaf are unreliable due to drying, pH changes, or limitation in  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  diffusion during the course of the experiments. Measurements on photosynthesis in these two systems were comparable to those obtained with an  $O<sub>2</sub>$ electrode system where the inorganic carbon was supplied as  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ 

With the three systems, the response of photosynthesis to inorganic carbon concentration as a function of pH (Figs. 2-4) indicated that in most circumstances  $CO_2$  and not  $HCO_3$ <sup>-</sup> was the



FIG. 8. Effect of light intensity on the rate of photosynthesis in C. pyrenoidosa using artificial leaf technique. Measurements were performed at 25 C, 21%  $O_2$ , and a dissolved  $CO_2$  concentration of 60.2  $\mu$ M at both pH 5.0 (0.1 M Mes) and pH 8.5 (+ <sup>260</sup> Wilbur-Anderson units of bovine CA were added to the resuspension medium) (0.1 M Taps).

species taken up by the cells to be used in photosynthesis. The  $K_m$  $(CO<sub>2</sub>)$  usually ranged from about 2 to 12  $\mu$ M regardless of the pH, and this  $K_m$  was similar to that found for ribulose-1,5-bisP carboxylase activity in isolated chloroplasts (20) and purified enzyme preparations  $(23)$ . Only in the  $O<sub>2</sub>$  electrode measurements where the inorganic carbon was added as  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  did the  $K<sub>m</sub>$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) fall outside those values. In contrast to the observed stability of the  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>), the  $K_m$  (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) changed many hundredfold from pH 5 to 8.5 (Table II). Such changes in the observed affinity of the cells for the two inorganic carbon species are more consistent with  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  being the species utilized (4, 30). Earlier work (8, 12, 25–27, 38) also indicated a low  $K_m$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) for *Chlorella* photosynthesis and a lack of dependence of photosynthesis on  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$  concentration. These authors had also concluded that  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was the carbon species utilized by Chlorella. This conclusion is further supported in the present work, because when  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  was supplied to the cells, the rate of formation of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  in all conditions was not adequate to supply the carbon fixed in photosynthesis (Figs 5 and 6).

Conclusions that  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  is utilized in addition to  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  seem to be based either on measuring systems where the inorganic carbon was added as  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  (4, 14) or on the stimulation of photosynthesis at low  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations that is observed upon the addition of CA to the suspending medium (5). Findenegg (14) observed that the photosynthetic rate of Chlorella fusca as a function of pH did not follow the calculated rate of dehydration of carbonic acid. At total carbon concentrations below  $0.5$  mm, we confirm that  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  production from  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  was not adequate to sustain the rate of photosynthesis (Fig. 5) and under these conditions  $HCO_3^$ absorption by the cells may be a source of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  for photosynthesis. If  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$  is utilized by the algae it cannot be used very effectively as the apparent affinity for  $\text{HCO}_3$ <sup>-</sup> above pH 6.5 is low as the  $K_{\text{m}}$  $(HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>)$  exceeds the  $K<sub>m</sub>$  (CO<sub>2</sub>) be severalfold (4; Tables II and III). If the inorganic carbon had been added as  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  to these systems an opposite conclusion may have been reached as, in that case, the hydration rate of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  is much too slow to supply the  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  that would be required for photosynthesis (Figs. 5 and 6). We also confirm that photosynthesis of Chlorella at low concentrations of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and high pH is stimulated by the addition of  $CA$ to the suspension medium (Table III). The decrease in  $K<sub>m</sub>$  values  $(CO_2$  or  $\text{HCO}_3$ <sup>-</sup>) suggests that, in these circumstances,  $\text{HCO}_3$ <sup>-</sup> utilization supplements  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  utilization and the resultant higher  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration in the cell gives rise to higher photosynthetic

The stimulation of photosynthesis at pH values above 7.5 and low CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations does not appear to be due to a direct effect of pH on photosynthesis because at saturating  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentrations and inhibition of photosynthesis was observed (Figs. 6 and 7). It seems that low  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  concentrations stimulate photosynthesis and high  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  concentrations inhibit photosynthesis but a logical explanation of the observations is not apparent.

This inhibition of photosynthesis at saturating  $\overline{CO_2}$  and high pH has been observed by Lucas (24) and Raven (30) who suggested that HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> uptake required more light energy than did  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  uptake. Raven (30) has suggested from inhibitor studies that a metabolic  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  pump related to a light dependent reaction may be involved; the reaction is dependent on PSII, but independent of ATP. However, these studies show that in the light limiting region there is no difference in the quantum efficiency of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation at pH 5 and 8.5 (Fig. 8). This result is again consistent with the conclusion that  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  is the major species of inorganic carbon being utilized at each pH and that  $HCO<sub>3</sub>^-$  if used at all, plays only a minor role.

Chlorella is a  $C_3$  plant based on the ratio of ribulose-1,5-bisP carboxylase to phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase (11, 31, 32) or the analysis of products after short periods of  ${}^{14}CO_2$  fixation (3, 17). Yet the low  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  compensation points, the apparent scarcity of  $CO_2$  evolution into  $CO_2$ -free air (Table II and ref. 22) and the apparent lack of sensitivity of photosynthesis to  $O<sub>2</sub>$  discussed in an accompanying paper (33) indicate that photorespiration is low or absent. An elegant case, based on studies of low  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and high C02-grown algae, has been presented that photorespiration in low  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ -grown algae is suppressed as a result of  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  accumulation and a subsequent high internal  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration (1, 2). If, as this work shows, *Chlorella* uses  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and has only a low affinity for  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ , it will be necessary to examine closely this proposal as the explanation for the apparent lack of photorespiration in airgrown algae.

#### LITERATURE CITED

- 1. BADGER MR, A KAPLAN, JA BERRY 1977 The internal CO<sub>2</sub> pool of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii: response to external CO2. Carnegie Inst Wash Year Book 76: 462-466
- 2. BADGER MR, A KAPLAN, JA BERRY 1978 A mechanism for concentrating CO<sub>2</sub> in Chlamydomonas reinhardtii and Anabaena variabilis and its role in photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> fixation. Carnegie Inst Wash Year Book 77: 251-261
- 3. BASSHAM JA, M CALVIN <sup>1957</sup> The path of Carbon in Photosynthesis. Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ
- 4. BERRY J, <sup>J</sup> BOYNTON, A KAPLAN, M BADGER <sup>1976</sup> Growth and photosynthesis of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii Carnegie Inst Wash Year Book 75: 423-432
- 5. BIDWELL RGS <sup>1977</sup> Photosynthesis and light and dark respiration in freshwater algae. Can <sup>J</sup> Bot 55: 809-818
- BJÖRKMAN O 1966 The effect of oxygen concentration on photosynthesis in higher plants. Physiol Plant 19: 618-633
- 7. BowEs G, JA BERRY 1972 The effect of oxygen on photosynthesis and glycolate excretion in Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Carnegie Inst Wash Year Book 71: 148-157
- 8. BROWN DL, EB TREGUNNA <sup>1967</sup> Inhibition of respiration during photosynthesis

by some algae. Can J Bot 45: 1135-1143

- 9. BUCH K 1960 Dissoziation der Kohlensäure, Gleichgewichte Puffersysteme. In W Ruhland, ed, Encyclopedia of Plant Physiology, Vol <sup>5</sup> Part I. Springer-
- Verlag, Berlin, pp 1-11 10. CANVIN DT <sup>1978</sup> Photorespiration and the effect of oxygen on photosynthesis. In HW Seigelman, G. Hind, eds, Photosynthetic Carbon Assimilation. Plenum Publ Corp, New York, pp 61-75
- 11. COLEMAN B, KH CHENG, RK INGLE <sup>1976</sup> The relative activities of PEP carboxylase and RuDP carboxylase in blue-green algae. Plant Sci Lett 6: 123-127
- 12. EMERSON R, L GREEN 1938 Effect of hydrogen-ion concentration on Chlorella photosynthesis. Plant Physiol 13: 157-168
- 13. FINDENEGG G <sup>1976</sup> Correlations between accessibility of carbonic anhydrase for external substrate and regulation of photosynthetic use of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and  $\text{HCO}_3^-$  by Scenedesmus obliquus. Z Pflanzenphysiol 79: 428-437
- 14. FINDENEGG GR 1976 Zur Frage eines HCO<sub>3</sub>-/OH--austausches im Plasmalemma von Scenedesmus obliquus. Ber Deutsch Bot Ges 89: 277-284
- 15. FINDENEGG GR, K FISCHER 1978 Apparent photorespiration of Scenedesmus obliquus: Decrease during adaptation to low  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  level. Z Pflanzenphysiol 89: 363-37 <sup>1</sup>
- 16. FOCK H, DT CANVIN, BR GRANT <sup>1971</sup> Effects of oxygen and carbon dioxide on photosynthetic  $O_2$  evolution and  $CO_2$  uptake in sunflower and Chlorella. Photosynthetica 5: 389-394
- 17. HOGETSU D, S MIYACHI 1977 Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> concentration during growth and subsequent photosynthetic fixation in Chlorella. Plant Cell Physiol 18: 347-352
- 18. HOLDEN M 1976 Chlorophylls. In TW Goodwin, ed, Chemistry and Biochemistry of Plant Pigments, Vol 2, Academic Press, New York, pp 1-37
- 19. HUGHES EO, PR GORHAM, A. ZEHNDER <sup>1958</sup> Toxicity of uni-algal culture of Microcystis aeruginosa. Can J Microbiol 4: 225-236
- 20. JENSEN RG, JT BAHR 1977 Ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase. Annu Rev Plant Physiol 28: 379-406.
- 21. KERN, DM <sup>1960</sup> The hydration of carbon dioxide. <sup>J</sup> Chem Education 37: 14-23 22. LLOYD NDH, DT CANVIN, DA CULVER <sup>1977</sup> Photosynthesis and photorespira-
- tion in algae. Plant Physiol 59: 936-940 23. LORIMER, GH, MR BADGER, TJ ANDREWS <sup>1977</sup> D-Ribulose-1, 5-bisphosphate
- carboxylase-oxygenase. Anal Biochem 78: 66–75<br>24. Lucas WJ 1975 Photosynthetic use of <sup>14</sup>Carbon by internodal cells of *Chara*
- corallina J Exp Bot 26: 331-346
- 25. MIYACHI S, Y SHIRAIWA 1979 Form of inorganic carbon utilized for photosynthesis in Chlorella vulgaris <sup>11</sup> h cells. Plant Cell Physiol 20: 341-348
- 26. OSTERLIND S 1950 Inorganic carbon sources ofgreen algae I. Growth experiments with Scenedesmus quadricauda and Chlorella pyrenoidosa. Physiol Plant 3: 353-360
- 27. OSTERLIND S 1951 Inorganic carbon sources of green algae III Measurements of photosynthesis in Scenedesmus quadricauda and Chlorella pyrenoidosa. Physiol Plant 4: 242-254
- 28. RABINOWITCH El 1956 Photosynthesis and Related Processes. Interscience Publ Inc, New York
- 29. RAVEN JA 1968 The mechanism of photosynthetic use of bicarbonate by  $Hy$ drodictyon africanum. J Exp Bot 19: 193-206
- 30. RAVEN JA 1970 Exogenous inorganic carbon sources in plant photosynthesis. Biol Rev 45: 167-221
- 31. RAVEN JA, SM GLIDEWELL 1978  $C_4$  characteristics of photosynthesis in the  $C_3$ alga Hydrodictyon africanum. Plant Cell Environ 1: 185-187
- 32. REED ML, D GRAHAM <sup>1977</sup> Carbon dioxide and the regulation of photosynthesis: activities of photosynthetic enzymes and carbonate dehydratase (carbonic anhydrase) in Chlorella after growth or adaptation in different carbon dioxide concentrations. Aust J Plant Physiol 4: 87-98
- 33. SHELP BJ, DT CANVIN <sup>1979</sup> Photorespiration and oxygen inhibition of photosynthesis in Chlorella pyrenoidosa Plant Physiol 65: 780-784
- 34. SHIRAIWA Y, S MIYACHI 1979. Enhancement of ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylation reaction by carbonic anhydrase. FEBS Lett 106: 243-246
- 35. STEEMAN-NIELSEN E, PK JENSEN <sup>1958</sup> Concentration of carbon dioxide and rate of photosynthesis in Chlorella. Physiol Plant 11: 170-180
- 36. UKELEs R <sup>1973</sup> Continous culture-a method for the production of unicellular algal foods. In <sup>J</sup> Stein, ed, Handbook of Phycological Methods. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge pp 233-254
- 37. WATT WD, E PAASCHE 1963 An investigation of the conditions for distinguishing between  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  utilization by algae according to the methods of Hood and Park. Physiol Plant 16: 674-681
- 38. WHITTINGHAM CP <sup>1952</sup> Rate of photosynthesis and concentration of carbon dioxide in Chlorella. Nature 170: 1017-1018
- 39. WILKINSON GN <sup>1961</sup> Statistical estimation in enzyme kinetics. Biochem <sup>J</sup> 80: 324-332