

# **HHS Public Access**

Author manuscript *Biochemistry*. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2015 June 02.

Published in final edited form as: *Biochemistry*. 2013 October 15; 52(41): 7184–7195. doi:10.1021/bi400560p.

# A Robust Genetic System for Producing Heterodimeric Native and Mutant Cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub>

### Bahia Khalfaoui-Hassani, Pascal Lanciano, and Fevzi Daldal\*

Department of Biology, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, United States

# Abstract

The ubihydroquinone:cytochrome c oxidoreductase, or cytochrome  $bc_1$ , is central to the production of ATP by oxidative phosphorylation and photophosphorylation in many organisms. Its three-dimensional structure depicts it as a homodimer with each monomer composed of the Fe-S protein, cytochrome b, and cytochrome  $c_1$  subunits. Recent genetic approaches successfully produced heterodimeric variants of this enzyme, providing insights into its mechanism of function. However, these experimental setups are inherently prone to genetic rearrangements as they carry repeated copies of cytochrome  $bc_1$  structural genes. Duplications present on a single replicon (one-plasmid system) or a double replicon (two-plasmid system) could yield heterogeneous populations via homologous recombination or other genetic events at different frequencies, especially under selective growth conditions. In this work, we assessed the origins and frequencies of genetic variations encountered in these systems and describe an improved variant of the twoplasmid system. We found that use of a recombination-deficient background (recA) minimizes spontaneous formation of co-integrant plasmids and renders the homologous recombination within the cytochrome b gene copies inconsequential. On the basis of the data, we conclude that both the newly improved RecA-deficient and the previously used RecA-proficient two-plasmid systems reliably produce native and mutant heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants. The two-plasmid system developed here might contribute to the study of "mitochondrial heteroplasmy"-like heterogeneous states in model bacteria (e.g., *Rhodobacter* species) suitable for bioenergetics studies. In the following paper (DOI 10.1021/bi400561e), we describe the use of the two-plasmid system to produce and characterize, in membranes and in purified states, an active heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variant with unusual intermonomer electron transfer properties.

#### Notes

The interest. authors declare no competing financial

Corresponding Author: fdaldal@sas.upenn.edu. Telephone: (215) 898-4394. Fax: (215) 898-8780.

**Supporting Information** 

Plasmids and strains used in this work (Table S1) and photosynthetic (Ps) and respiratory (Res) colony forming abilities of appropriate strains that produce mutant cytochrome  $bc_1$  heterodimers (Table S2). This material is available free of charge via the Internet at http:// pubs.acs.org.



The ubihydroquinone:cytochrome *c* oxidoreductase (cytochrome  $bc_1$  or mitochondrial complex III) is a multisubunit membrane integral enzyme required for both photo synthetic (Ps) and respiratory (Res) electron transfer in many organisms. It oxidizes hydroquinones (QH<sub>2</sub>) to produce quinones (Q) and reduces metalloprotein electron carriers, which are often *c*-type cytochromes. This reaction is coupled with the translocation of protons across the membrane for ATP production. The three-dimensional structures of various cytochrome  $bc_1$  forms are symmetrical homodimers.<sup>1–4</sup> In most bacteria, each monomer consists of three conserved subunits: cytochrome *b*, the Fe-S (also called Rieske) protein, and cytochrome  $c_1$ . Cytochrome *b* has two *b*-type hemes (a low-potential  $b_L$  heme and a high-potential  $b_H$  heme) located on the *p* and *n* sides of the membrane. The Fe-S protein and cytochrome  $c_1$  carry a high-potential [2F–2S] cluster and a *c*-type heme, respectively.<sup>4</sup>

The modified Q cycle describes the mechanism of electron transfer and proton translocation within cytochrome  $bc_1$ .<sup>5–7</sup> Accordingly, two QH<sub>2</sub> molecules are oxidized, one Q molecule is reduced, and the resulting electrons are conveyed to the terminal acceptors (e.g., cytochrome c oxidase or mitochondrial complex IV in respiration) via a complex series of reactions.<sup>8,9</sup> As generally described, the Q cycle mechanism is confined to a single monomer of the dimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  and does not consider any possible interaction between the monomers.<sup>10</sup> A mechanism with pathways of electrons through a dimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$ was first formulated by De Vries et al.,<sup>11</sup> and a dimeric organization of this enzyme was observed by electron microscopy.<sup>12</sup> Similar ideas were rejuvenated after its dimeric architecture was established firmly via its three-dimensional structures.<sup>1-4</sup> Various interesting features of the dimeric enzyme raised intriguing questions, including electron transfer possibilities between the monomers through the  $b_{\rm L}$ - $b_{\rm L}$  hemes because of their proximity to each other, or conformational changes during the catalytic steps of a dimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$ . These observations, together with experimental data<sup>13–18</sup> and theoretical calculations,<sup>19</sup> led to models that invoked allosteric interactions and electron transfer reactions between the monomers of cytochrome  $bc_1$ .<sup>13–15</sup>

Recently, the intermonomer electron transfer issue was experimentally probed by various groups,<sup>20,21</sup> including ours,<sup>22</sup> using genetic approaches aimed at breaking the symmetry of the dimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$ . Using *Rhodobacter capsulatus*, Osyczka's group produced a cytochrome  $bc_1$  variant (*b*-*bc*<sub>1</sub>) in which two cytochromes *b* were genetically fused together with an amino acid linker. A single plasmid (termed the one-plasmid system) carrying this engineered *petAB1-B2C* operon yielded a heterodimeric cytochrome *b*-*bc*<sub>1</sub>, which was

purified using an epitope tag added to the cyt *b-b* fusion subunit<sup>21</sup> (Figure 1A). Independently, we developed a different genetic setup that duplicated the entire *petABC* operon (encoding the three catalytic subunits of cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub>) on two separate plasmids (termed the two-plasmid system), in which each *petB* gene is marked with a different epitope tag<sup>22</sup> (Figure 1B). This system produced two-homodimeric (i.e., same tag and same mutation on both monomers) and one-heterodimeric (i.e., different tags and different mutations in each monomer) cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> variants in the same cell. Using judiciously chosen mutations inactivating the Q<sub>0</sub> site of one monomer and the Q<sub>i</sub> site of the other monomer, both one-plasmid and two-plasmid systems produced heterodimeric variants to expose the occurrence of the *b*<sub>L</sub>-*b*<sub>L</sub> heme intermolecular electron transfer<sup>21,22</sup>. Salient properties of these genetic systems were reviewed recently.<sup>23</sup>

A more recent study by Hong et al.<sup>24</sup> attempted to reproduce Osyczka's work<sup>25</sup> using *Rhodobacter sphaeroides* instead of *R. capsulatus*. These authors<sup>24</sup> reported the occurrence of genetically rearranged forms of cytochrome *b* fusions that were thought to arise from homologous recombination. On the basis of these data, they questioned the validity of the one-plasmid system<sup>21</sup> and the occurrence of intermonomer electron transfer in cytochrome  $bc_1$ .<sup>21,22</sup> Furthermore, they extended their skepticism to the two-plasmid system<sup>20,22</sup> for which they had no experimental data. Unfortunately, in this work, the authors<sup>24</sup> used inappropriate experimental conditions (i.e., Ps growth), which is strongly selective for better growing cells, invalidating their findings. The basis of the strong growth disadvantage seen with the one-plasmid system is not yet understood<sup>23</sup> and may not necessarily originate from the intermonomer electron transfer in cytochrome  $bc_1$ . Thus, no conclusion about the occurrence or rate of intermonomer electron transfer can be reached on the basis of the work by Hong et al.<sup>24</sup>

Following the course of our work, we report here a detailed assessment of the genetic rearrangements exhibited by R. capsulatus strains harboring the one- and two-plasmid systems. In each case, we monitored the growth phenotype that they confer, the frequency of the "revertants" that they form under selective (Ps) and nonselective (Res) growth conditions, and the molecular nature of the DNA rearrangements and sequence changes that they undergo. Furthermore, we isolated a R. capsulatus strain lacking the RecA-dependent homologous recombination pathway to assess its role in the observed genetic rearrangements. We found that a RecA<sup>-</sup> background minimized to different extents the frequency of DNA rearrangements observed with both the one- and two-plasmid systems. We conclude that the earlier RecA<sup>+</sup> and the newly developed RecA<sup>-</sup> versions of the twoplasmid system reliably produce native and mutant forms of heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$ . In the following paper (DOI 10.1021/bi400561e), we describe the production, purification, and characterization of an active heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  with interesting electron transfer properties. Our findings are discussed with respect to the capabilities of the twoplasmid system to produce reliably heterodimeric multisubunit protein complexes and to generate heterogeneous populations of cytochrome  $bc_1$  in a bacterial model.

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

### **Growth Conditions and Genetic Crosses**

*Escherichia coli* strains were grown at 37 °C on LB medium supplemented with antibiotics [100  $\mu$ g/mL ampicillin (Amp), 50  $\mu$ g/mL kanamycin (Kan), and 12.5  $\mu$ g/mL tetracycline (Tet)]. *R. capsulatus* wild-type and mutant strains were grown at 35 °C under respiratory (Res, aerobic dark) or photosynthetic (Ps, anaerobic light) conditions in liquid or solid enriched MPYE medium, supplemented with antibiotics as needed [10  $\mu$ g/mL Kan, 2.5  $\mu$ g/mL Tet, 10  $\mu$ g/mL spectinomycin (Spe), and 1  $\mu$ g/mL gentamicin (Gen)] as described previously.<sup>26</sup> For Ps growth, completely filled culture vessels or solid medium-containing plates were placed in anaerobic jars with gas packs generating H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> (Becton, Dickinson Inc.) and incubated in temperature-controlled Percival light incubators.

*R. capsulatus* strains harboring a single plasmid, or coharboring two plasmids, were obtained by conjugation between appropriate *E. coli* HB101 derivatives used as donors and *R. capsulatus* RecA<sup>+</sup> strain MT-RBC1 with a complete chromosomal deletion of the *petABC* operon (a  $bc_1^-$  mutant)<sup>27</sup> or its RecA<sup>-</sup> derivative BK-RBC1 as recipients. For the two-plasmid system, plasmids marked with different antibiotic resistance (Kan<sup>R</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup>) genes were introduced into appropriate recipients by consecutive conjugative transfer. Strains coharboring two plasmids were maintained in the presence of one-half of the normal concentration of the antibiotics used (i.e., 5 µg/mL Kan and 1.25 µg/mL Tet).

### **Plasmids and Strains Used**

All strains and plasmids used are listed in Table S1 of the Supporting Information. Molecular genetic techniques were performed using standard proce dures.<sup>28</sup> All constructs were confirmed using appropriate restriction enzyme digestions and DNA sequencing. For the isolation of a RecA<sup>-</sup> derivative of MT-RBC1, the R. capsulatus ORF RCC01751 encoding the recA gene was first amplified via polymerase chain reaction (PCR) using the recAFor (5'-GTCGTCGCGGGTACCGAAGCGATA-3' with the KpnI site - TCTAGA underlined) and recARev (5'-CGTCATCGGTGTTCTAGACGGTGACCA-3' with the XbaI site underlined) primers. The PCR product thus obtained was digested with KpnI and XbaI restriction enzymes and cloned into the similarly digested plasmid pBluescript to yield plasmid pWX1 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). The 600 bp SmaI-HindIII portion within recA carried by pWXI was deleted and replaced with a gentamycin (gen) resistance gene digested with the same restriction enzymes to yield pWX2. Plasmid pWX2 was digested with KpnI and XbaI, and the DNA fragment carrying the (recA::gen) allele was cloned into a similarly digested pRK415, to yield plasmid pCWX3 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). This plasmid was conjugated into gene transfer agent (GTA) overproducer strain Y262,29 and a chromosomal RecA null derivative of MT-RBC1 carrying the (recA::gen) and (petABC::spe) alleles, named BK-RBC1 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information), was obtained by GTA crosses.<sup>26</sup> Strain BK-RBC1 subsequently received the one- or two-plasmid systems by conjugative transfer.

### **Construction of the One-Plasmid Genetic System**

The one-plasmid system was generated as described in refs 21 and 25. The *petAB1-B2C* fusion plasmid (pBK6) contained a 12-amino acid (ASIAGGRTASGP) linker with a NotI site between *petB1* and *petB2* and a Strep tag at the C-terminus of *petB2* (Figure 1A). First, the *petA* and *petB1* genes were amplified via PCR using the pet-BamHI (5'-AAATATCTGTCGCTGGATCCGCTGCGCTATG-3') and petL2 (5'-

AACAGCCACTACGGCAATCCGGCGTCGATCGCCG<u>GCGGCCGC</u>ACCG-3') forward and reverse primers, with the NotI site underlined. Primer petL2 is located at the end of the *petB* gene where it overlapped Pro435 of cytochrome *b* and contained a NotI restriction site. The PCR product obtained was cloned into the pBluescript plasmid after digestion with the BamHI and NotI restriction enzymes, to yield plasmid pBK8 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). Separately, a *petB2* gene with a Strep (-S) tag at its C-terminus and the adjacent *petC* gene was amplified via PCR using petL1 (5'-

GCCG<u>GCCGGCCGC</u>ACCGCATCGGGCCCGTCCGGAATTCCGCACGACCAT-3', with the NotI site underlined) and pet-HindIII (5'-

CGCCACACAGGAAGCTTTGATAGGCATCGA-3') primers, respectively. The petL1 primer is located at the beginning of the *petB2* gene where Ser2 of cytochrome *b* was linked to the second part of the NotI linker. The PCR product obtained was also cloned into the pBluescript plasmid after digestion with NotI and HindIII restriction enzymes, to yield plasmid pBK7 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). Plasmids pBK7 and pBK8 were digested with the NotI and HindIII enzymes and the NotI and BamHI enzymes, respectively, to yield the *petAB1*-(NotI linker 1) and (NotI linker 2)-*petB2C* DNA fragments. These fragments were ligated into pMTSI (Kan<sup>R</sup> derivative of plasmid pRK415) digested with the HindIII and BamHI enzymes to yield pBK6 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). Plasmid pBK6 harbored the fused form of *petB1-B2* (in the *petAB1*-Linker 1 NotI Linker 2-*petB2C* operon) with a NotI linker between *petB1* and *petB2* (Figure 1A).

Similarly, plasmid pBK32 ( $petAB1^{F144R}-B2^{H217L}C$ ) containing the Q<sub>o</sub> site cyt *b* F144R mutation in  $petB1^{30}$  and the Q<sub>i</sub> site cyt *b* H217L mutation in  $petB2^{31}$  was constructed. Plasmid pBK8 ( $petA-petB1^{wt}$ ) was used as a template for PCR-mediated site-directed mutagenesis to generate the  $petB1^{F144R}$  mutation using the F144For (5'-TGATGGGCACCGCCCGCATGGGCTACGTGC-3') and F144Rev (5'-TGATGGGCACCGCCCGCATGGGCTACGTGC-3') primers, yielding plasmid pBK22 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). Plasmid pBK7 ( $petB2^{wt}-petC$ ) was used as a template for PCR-mediated site-directed mutagenesis to generate the  $petB2^{H217L}$  mutation using the H217LFor2 (5'-ATCTGGGCCTTCCTCACCACCGGCAAC-3') and H217LRev2 (5'-ATCTGGGCCTTCCTCACCACCGGCAAC-3') primers, yielding plasmid pBK27 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). As described above, plasmids pBK22 and pBK27 were digested with the NotI and HindIII enzymes and the NotI and BamHI enzymes, respectively. The  $petAB1^{F144R}$  and  $petB2^{H217L}C$  DNA fragments obtained were ligated into plasmid pMTS1 digested with HindIII and BamHI enzymes to yield pBK32 (Table S1 of the Supporting Information).

## **Construction of the Two-Plasmid Genetic System**

The two-plasmid system was generated as described previously,<sup>22</sup> except that the previously used pRK-pPET1 composite plasmid was replaced with the smaller pRK415 (Tet<sup>R</sup>) derivative. Plasmid pMTS1-S or pMTS1-F carrying *petABC* with a Strep or a Flag tag at the carboxyl end of *petB* was digested with the HindIII and BamHI restriction enzymes, and the 3.5 kb DNA fragments containing the *petABC* operon were cloned into a similarly digested pRK415 (Tet<sup>R</sup>), yielding plasmids pBK20 and pBK21, respectively. The previously described plasmids pPET1-F and pPET1-S<sup>22</sup> were used as templates to introduce the cyt *b* H217L mutation into pPET1-F using primers H217LFor2 and H217LRev2 to yield pBK18 and the cyt *b* F144R mutation into pPET1-S using primers F144RFor and F144RRev to yield pBK19, respectively. Plasmid pBK19 was digested with EcoRI and HindIII enzymes to produce the *petAB<sup>F144R</sup>C* fragment, which was used to replace its wild-type counterpart in pMTS1 (Kan<sup>R</sup>) to yield plasmid pBK20 to yield plasmid pBK28-S (Table S1 of the Supporting Information).

### **Biochemical Techniques**

Cultures (1 L) of freshly controlled cells were grown by Res to prepare intracytoplasmic (chromatophore) membranes. Frozen washed cell pellets resuspended in MOPS-KCl buffer [50 mM MOPS (pH 7.0), 1 mM KCl, and 1 mM EDTA] were broken via two passages through a French press, as described in ref 32. Protein concentrations were determined using bicinchoninic acid with bovine serum albumin as a standard.<sup>33</sup> Sodium dodecyl sulfate-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (SDS-PAGE) (12.5%) was conducted as described in ref 34, and prior to being loaded, samples were solubilized in a loading buffer to obtain final concentrations of 62.5 mM Tris-HCl (pH 6.8), 2% SDS, 0.1 M dithiothreitol, 25% glycerol, and 0.01% bromophenol blue by incubation at room temperature for 10 min. Immunoblot analyses were conducted as described in ref 35 using polyclonal antibodies against *R. capsulatus* cytochrome *b* and commercially available monoclonal anti-Flag (Sigma-Aldrich, Inc.) and anti-Strep II (Novagen, Inc.) antibodies.

Steady-state cytochrome  $bc_1$  activity was measured using decylbenzohydroquinone (DBH<sub>2</sub>) as an electron donor and horse heart cytochrome c as an electron acceptor at 25 °C. The reaction was initiated by enzyme addition and monitored at 550 nm for 1 min, and the portion of the initial rate that is famoxadone sensitive was taken as the enzyme activity. Optical spectra were recorded on a Cary 60 spectrophotometer (Agilent Technologies Inc.). Absorption difference spectra for the c- and b-type cytochromes were obtained using chromatophore membranes (0.3 mg of total protein/mL), oxidized with potassium ferricyanide, and reduced with sodium ascorbate or sodium dithionite, as appropriate.<sup>27</sup>

# RESULTS

### Isolation of a RecA<sup>-</sup> Mutant of *R. capsulatus*

During our previous work using the two-plasmid system, we observed that *R. capsulatus* strains that produce heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants yield large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies at a

frequency of  $\sim 10^{-4}$  among a predominantly small Ps<sup>+/-</sup> population.<sup>22</sup> We sought a RecA<sup>-</sup> mutant to evaluate the role of homologous recombination in the occurrence of the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies. We thought that abolishing homologous recombination between the multiple copies of *petABC* might decrease the frequency of large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies produced by these strains. As a R. capsulatus RecA<sup>-</sup> mutant was unavailable, we scanned its genome and found ORF RCC01751 that is homologous to the recA gene encoding RecA in many organisms.<sup>36,37</sup> We cloned and knocked out this chromosomal gene in a cytochrome  $bc_1$ null mutant (MT-RBC1) to isolate strain BK-RBC1 [ - (petABC::spe) (recA::gen)] (Materials and Methods). E. coli RecA<sup>-</sup> strains exhibit slower growth than their wild-type counterparts and are hypersensitive to alkylating agents like methylmethanesulfonate (MMS) because of their DNA repair deficiency.<sup>38</sup> As expected, BK-RBC1 was Ps<sup>-</sup> due to the absence of cytochrome  $bc_1$ , grew slowly (~50% slower rate compared to that of its parent) under the Res growth conditions, and was sensitive to MMS unlike its parent MT-RBC1 [ (*petABC::spe*)]. The two isogenic MT-RBC1 (RecA<sup>+</sup>) and BK-RBC1 (RecA<sup>-</sup>) strains were used comparatively in all subsequent studies to assess the role of homologous recombination in the genetic rearrangements that occur in strains carrying the one- or twoplasmid systems.

### **One-Plasmid System**

*R. capsulatus* strains pBK6/MT-RBC1 and pBK6/BK-RBC1 carrying plasmid pBK6 with the *petAB1-B2C* operon (two fused copies of wild-type *petB*) were taken to be "wild-type" analogues for the one-plasmid system (Figure 1A and Table S1 of the Supporting Information). They were compared with pMTS1/MT-RBC1 and pMTS1/BK-RBC1 (native *petABC* operon) with respect to their cytochrome  $bc_1$ -dependent Ps growth ability, frequency of large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies that they yielded, and the molecular nature of the genetic rearrangements and amounts of heterodimeric enzymes that they produced, as described below.

# Growth Properties of Strains Carrying the One-Plasmid System in RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> Backgrounds

The Res growth phenotypes of pBK6/MT-RBC1 and pBK6/BK-RBC1 (*petAB1-B2C*) strains were similar to those of pMTS1/MT-RBC1 and pMTS1/BK-RBC1 (*petABC*). However, their Ps growth abilities were remarkably different (Figure 2A,B). The strains carrying pBK6 formed colonies under Ps growth conditions only upon prolonged incubation (~5 days for pBK6 vs ~2 days for pMTS1 derivatives, and longer incubation was needed for the RecA<sup>-</sup> derivatives). Thus, a fused *petB1-petB2* construct was deficient for Ps growth, although it contained two wild-type *petB* alleles. The basis of this growth defect was not studied, but a possibility is that these strains may contain inadequate amounts of cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> to sustain Ps growth of *R. capsulatus*.<sup>39</sup> In addition, pBK6-containing strains exhibited larger Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies at frequencies of ~10<sup>-2</sup> and ~10<sup>-3</sup> in the RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> backgrounds, respectively (Table S2A of the Supporting Information). Moreover, when plasmid pBK32 carrying the fused form of the *petAB1<sup>F144R-B2H217LC* operon with the Q<sub>0</sub> site cyt *b* F144R<sup>30</sup> and Q<sub>i</sub> site cyt *b* H217L<sup>31</sup> mutations [for detailed properties of these mutations, see the following paper (DOI 10.1021/bi400561e)] was tested, both pBK32/MT-RBC1 (RecA<sup>+</sup>) and pBK32/BK-RBC1 (RecA<sup>-</sup>) showed no Ps growth but produced few</sup>

large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies (Figure 2C). Thus, neither pBK6-nor pBK32-containing strains were able to support adequate Ps growth, and the contribution of the RecA pathway upon abolishing the formation of large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies was approximately an order of magnitude (Table S2A of the Supporting Information).

# Genetic Rearrangements in Strains Carrying the One-Plasmid System in RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> Backgrounds

In strains containing a plasmid-borne *petAB1-B2C* operon, genetic instability could originate from DNA events that occur either on the plasmid (e.g., pBK6 and pBK32) or on the host chromosome. Here, only the plasmid-borne events were examined. Plasmid DNA isolated from both large and small Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies after subculture under Res conditions (i.e., one colony inoculated into 1 mL, and after overnight incubation, here transferred to 10 mL for another overnight incubation, and cells harvested for DNA extraction) was subjected to PCR amplification together with a control plasmid carrying the native *petABC* operon (pMTS1) using appropriate primers located on *petA* and *petC*, respectively (Figure 3A). The data showed that plasmids extracted from the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies (lane 3) yielded a DNA fragment of a size (~1.5 kb) identical to that seen with a control plasmid (lane 2) carrying a single petB gene (Figure 1A). On the other hand, plasmids extracted from the small Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies yielded a larger DNA fragment (~3.0 kb), indicating that they still carried the intact petB1petB2 fusion (lane 4). Under Res growth conditions, colonies harboring the one-plasmid system showed no readily discernible phenotype on solid media (Figure 2B). However, a similar analysis using randomly chosen Res grown colonies indicated that they also exhibited heterogeneity, producing both the ~1.5 and ~3.0 kb DNA PCR fragments in variable amounts (Figure 3A, lanes 5–11). DNA sequencing of the plasmids yielding the 1.5 kb fragment confirmed that they carried only one copy of *petB* with its 3' end still tagged with the DNA sequence corresponding to the Strep epitope used. Data similar to those described above were observed with the large Ps<sup>+</sup> (Figure 2C) derivatives of pBK32/MT-RBC1 harboring the *petA-B1<sup>F144R</sup>B2<sup>H217L</sup>-C operon* (data not shown). DNA sequencing indicated that the plasmids extracted from these colonies contained only one copy of the wild-type *petB* gene without the cvt b F144R or cvt b H217L mutation but still contained the Strep tag. This finding implied that rare double-crossover events between the petB1<sup>F144R</sup> and *petB2<sup>H217L</sup>* copies occurred in these cells to yield a wild-type *petB* copy. Overall, the data indicated that complex intramolecular genetic events occur in strains carrying *petB1petB2* fusions under both selective (i.e., cytochrome  $bc_1$ -dependent Ps) and nonselective (i.e., cyto chrome  $bc_1$ -independent Res via an alternative quinol oxidase) growth conditions to yield heterogeneous populations of fused and nonfused forms of cytochrome b variants.

### Production of Heterodimeric Cytochrome *b*-*bc*<sub>1</sub> with the One-Plasmid System

Cytochrome b- $bc_1$  production by strain pBK6/MT-RBC1 carrying the *petAB1-B2C* operon grown under Ps or Res growth conditions was examined. Chromatophore membranes of appropriate strains were prepared and analyzed by SDS-PAGE and immunoblots using *R*. *capsulatus* cytochrome *b* polyclonal and Strep epitope monoclonal antibodies (Figure 3B). Compared with a strain lacking cytochrome  $bc_1$  (MT-RBC1, lane 2), membranes of pMTS1/MT-RBC1 carrying the native *petABC* operon produced an ~40 kDa band corresponding to a cytochrome *b* monomer detected by both antibodies (lane 1). A similar

pattern was observed with membranes of all large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies of pBK6/MT-RBC1 (lanes 3–5). Importantly, membranes from randomly chosen Res-grown colonies of pBK6/MT-RBC1 produced variable amounts of the ~40 kDa band corresponding to cytochrome b and of a larger band corresponding to a relative molecular mass of 75–100 kDa under our experimental conditions (lanes 6–8). The molecular nature(s) of the higher-molecular mass band, possibly corresponding to the fused forms of cytochrome *b* dimers, was not pursued further. In a manner independent of the higher-molecular mass band, all strains harboring the *petB1-B2* fusion also produced varying amounts of the ~40 kDa band corresponding to the size of the native cytochrome *b* monomer.

### **Two-Plasmid System**

Strains carrying the two-plasmid system were also examined with respect to their cytochrome  $bc_1$ -dependent Ps growth ability, the frequency of large (Ps<sup>+</sup>) and small (Ps<sup>+/-</sup>) colonies that they yielded, and the molecular nature of the genetic rearrangements and the amounts of heterodimeric enzymes that they produced (Figure 1B). The two-plasmid system used here was similar to that reported previously,<sup>22</sup> except that two identical plasmids (i.e., with the same pRK replicon) were chosen instead of two different replicons (e.g., pRK and "pRK-composite" plasmids).

# Growth Properties of Strains Carrying the Two-Plasmid System in a RecA<sup>+</sup> or RecA<sup>-</sup> Background and Production of Heterodimeric Cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub>

As a wild-type control, Kan<sup>R</sup> pMTS1 (*petAB-SC*) and Tet<sup>R</sup> pBK21 (*petAB-FC*) were introduced into the RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> backgrounds to yield the (pMTS1-S + pBK21-F/MT-RBC1) and (pMTS1-S + pBK21-F/BK-RBC1) strains, respectively (Table S1 of the Supporting Information). Comparison of the Ps and Res growth phenotypes on solid media of these strains with those carrying only one of the plasmids (pMTS1-S) showed no discernible difference in terms of colony size or population homogeneity under either growth condition (Figure 4A). The Ps growth conferred by this "wild-type" two-plasmid system was robust, unlike that conferred by the one-plasmid system carrying a fused "wildtype" petB1-petB2, which had very poor Ps growth (Figure 2B). In addition, both RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> derivatives (pBK25-S + pBK28-F/MT-RBC1) and (pBK25-S + pBK28-F/BK-RBC1), respectively, harboring the two-plasmid system with the cyt b-S F144R and cyt b-F H217L mutations exhibited predominantly slightly smaller Ps<sup>+/-</sup> colonies together with rare large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies [following paper (DOI 10.1021/bi400561e)]. The frequency of the large  $Ps^+$  colonies was around  $10^{-4}$  for both RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> backgrounds (Table S2B of the Supporting Information). Furthermore, both Ps- and Res-grown liquid cultures of these strains formed approximately the same number of colonies in a manner independent of their sizes (n = 7 cultures,  $1.5 - 1.9 \times 10^8$  and  $2.2 - 2.3 \times 10^8$  colony forming units/mL under Ps and Res growth conditions, respectively). Thus, only the rare large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies probably underwent a genetic event(s) to exhibit a different (large vs small) growth phenotype (see below).

Strains (pMTS1-S + pBK21-F/MT-RBC1) and (pMTS1-S + pBK21-F/BK-RBC1) carried two wild-type *petABC* operons in which only *petB* is tagged with Strep or Flag epitopes. Thus, cells would produce wild-type but tagged homodimeric (Strep-Strep and Flag-Flag)

and heterodimeric (Strep-Flag and Flag-Strep) cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants. SDS-PAGE analyses (Figure 4B) indicated that, unlike a cytochrome  $bc_1$ -lacking strain (MT-RBC1), the strains harboring only pMTS1-S or pBK21-F and those harboring the two-plasmid system in RecA<sup>+</sup> (pMTSI-S + pBK21-F/MT-RBC1) or RecA<sup>-</sup> (pMTSI-S + pBK21-F/BK-RBC1) backgrounds produced all subunits of cytochrome  $bc_1$ . Immunoblot analyses with antibodies against cytochrome b detected this subunit in all cases except MT-RBC1, whereas the anti-Strep and anti-Flag epitope-specific antibodies detected it only in pMTS1-S and pBK21-F, respectively, and in both RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> strains with the two-plasmid system (Figure 4C).

# Genetic Rearrangements Seen with Strains Carrying the Two-Plasmid System in a RecA<sup>+</sup> or RecA<sup>-</sup> Back ground

The genetic rearrangements that occur in the two-plasmid system were examined by extracting plasmid DNA from appropriate cells grown under Res conditions. Extracted DNA was transformed into E. coli RecA<sup>-</sup> strain HB101, and Kan<sup>R</sup> or Tet<sup>R</sup> transformants were selected separately. The frequency of Tet<sup>R</sup> clones found among the selected Kan<sup>R</sup> clones and the frequency of Kan<sup>R</sup> clones found among the selected Tet<sup>R</sup> clones were scored after purification on the appropriate plates. The plasmids harbored by these clones were also analyzed by DNA sequencing (Table 1). When the DNA originated from the RecA<sup>+</sup> strain (pMTS1-S + pBK21-F/MT-RBC1) grown under Res conditions, approximately one-half of the transformants were  $\operatorname{Kan}^{R}\operatorname{Tec}^{S}$  or  $\operatorname{Kan}^{S}\operatorname{Tec}^{R}(n = 6$  independent experiments) and harbored the initial plasmids; 165 of 210 selected Kan<sup>R</sup> transformants were also Tet<sup>R</sup>, and 80 of 148 selected Tet<sup>R</sup> transformants were also Kan<sup>R</sup> (i.e., simultaneously Kan<sup>R</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup>). The latter transformants remained Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> despite extensive purification, suggesting that they were not cotransformants with two coresiding plasmids in the same cell (Table 1, entry a). DNA sequencing of the Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>S</sup> and Kan<sup>S</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> plasmids indicated that the antibiotic resistance markers with respect to the epitope tags were frequently (3 of 8 and 0 of 3) exchanged between the plasmids to generate pMTS1-F and pBK21-S instead of pMTS1-S and pBK21-F (Table 1, entry a). Given that in most bacteria the RecA-dependent recombination pathway is involved in the formation of the co-integrant between identical plasmids and their resolution,<sup>40,41</sup> the RecA<sup>-</sup> strain (pMTS1-S + pBK21-F/BK-RBC1) carrying the same plasmids was examined. Among the ~600 clones tested after Kan<sup>R</sup> or Tet<sup>R</sup> selection from three repeat cultures (n = 3), no Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> colonies (0 of 224 and 0 of 341, respectively) were found (Table 1, entry b). DNA sequencing of the plasmids extracted from the Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>S</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup> Kan<sup>S</sup> clones showed no antibiotic resistance marker or epitope tag exchange between the plasmids (0 of 3 in each case with n = 3). Thus, inactivation of the RecA pathway in a strain harboring the two-plasmid system drastically decreased the frequency of occurrence of Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> co-integrant plasmid formation seen in the RecA<sup>+</sup> background (Table 1, entry b).

Similar analyses were also performed using a two-plasmid system carrying two cytochrome *b* mutations to assess the degree of segregation between the mutations on the different plasmids or between a given mutation and its associated epitope tag on the same plasmid. RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> strains (pBK25-S + pBK28-F/MT-RBC1) and (pBK25-S + pBK28-F/BK-RBC1) (Table S1 of the Supporting Information) carrying a two-plasmid system with

cyt b-S F144R<sup>30</sup> and cyt b-F H217L mutations<sup>31</sup> were examined. The data indicated that the formation of Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> co-integrant plasmids and epitope tag exchange were seen again only in RecA<sup>+</sup> [74 of 100 and 36 of 50 (n = 3)], not in RecA<sup>-</sup> [0 of 1734 and 0 of 1366 (n = 3)] 6)], backgrounds (Table 1, entries c and d). In the case of the RecA<sup>+</sup> background, DNA sequencing of the plasmids extracted from Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>S</sup> [i.e., pBK25-S (cyt *b*-S F144R)] or Kan<sup>S</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> [i.e., pBK28-F (cyt *b*-F H217L)] indicated that 2 of 10 of the Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>S</sup> clones contained the cyt b-F H217L mutation and 3 of 13 TetR KanS clones contained the cyt b-S F144R mutation (n = 3). Although the Kan<sup>R</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup> markers were exchanged between the two plasmids, no segregation was seen between given mutations and their associated epitope on the same copy of *petB*. In other words, in all instances (~70 sequences), the cyt b F144R mutation remained linked to the Strep epitope tag and the cyt b H217L mutation to the Flag epitope tag, regardless of the exchange of antibiotic resistance markers between the plasmids (Table 1, entry c). With the RecA<sup>-</sup> background, indeed no Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> colony and no segregation between the cytochrome b mutations and their associated epitope tags were seen among the  $\sim$ 3000 clones (*n* = 6) tested (Table 1, entry d). This finding suggested that in the RecA<sup>+</sup> background, co-integrants between the two resident plasmids (pMTS1-S and pBK21-F or pBK25 and pBK28/MT-RBC1) of quasi-identical DNA sequences (except the cytochrome b mutations and their associated epitope tags) could be continuously formed and resolved, leading to frequent antibiotic marker exchanges between the plasmids.<sup>40,41</sup> Importantly, because of the short distances that separate the cytochrome b mutations and their associated tags, the genetic rearrangements did not segregate them at a detectable rate.

# Large Ps<sup>+</sup> Clones Observed Using the Two-Plasmid System in a RecA<sup>-</sup> Background are Co-Integrants between the Two Plasmids

We inquired about the correlation between the occurrence of the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies Although these colonies appear in both RecA<sup>+</sup> and RecA<sup>-</sup> backgrounds, we analyzed them in the latter case in which the two-plasmid system is more robust (Table 1). Using strain pBK25-S + pBK28-F/BK-RBC1, we deliberately sought large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies, which appeared only after multiple subcultures, in agreement with their low frequency (approximately  $<10^{-4}$ ) (Table S2B of the Supporting Information). We purified these derivatives under Ps growth conditions and examined the genetic rearrangements that they underwent. Transformation of plasmid DNA extracted from these large Ps<sup>+</sup> clones into an *E. coli* strain (HB101) almost exclusively yielded Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> transformants independent of the initial Kan<sup>R</sup> or Tet<sup>R</sup> selection (only ~1 of 1000 clones was Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>S</sup> upon Kan<sup>R</sup> selection, and 2 of 400 clones were Tet<sup>R</sup> Kan<sup>S</sup> upon Tet<sup>R</sup> selection) (Table 1, entry e). Furthermore, DNA analyses revealed that the Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup> clones contained large co-integrant plasmids formed by the fusion of the two initial plasmids (Figure 5A, lane 5) but frequently not resolved back to the initial plasmids. Upon digestion with the appropriate restriction enzyme, religation, and transformation into E. coli, the large co-integrant plasmids regenerated the initial Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>S</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup> Kan<sup>S</sup> plasmids. DNA sequence analyses of several (n = 23) such plasmids revealed that those carrying the cyt b-S F144R mutation remained associated with their Strep tag and those carrying the cyt b-F H217L mutation remained associated with their Flag tag. As observed with the RecA<sup>+</sup> background, although exchange of antibiotic resistance markers (Tet<sup>R</sup> and Kan<sup>R</sup>) could be seen, in no instances did we detect any plasmid carrying a wild-type cytochrome b or an allele with both mutations (i.e., cyt b F144R and cyt b

H217L carried by a single *petB*), or any segregation between a cytochrome *b* mutation and its associated epitope tag (Table 1, entry e). The data demonstrated that the large  $Ps^+$  colonies were not due to the loss of cytochrome *b* mutations by reversion or recombination and implied that they resulted from the formation of RecA-dependent co-integrants between the two resident plasmids. Importantly, the co-integrated plasmids also carried faithfully the initial cytochrome *b* mutations and their associated epitope tags and produced the expected heterodimeric cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> variants (Figure 6).

Better Ps<sup>+</sup> growth of the large colonies suggested that they might contain increased amounts of active heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants. Optical redox difference spectra at 560 and 550 nm, visualizing the total amounts of cytochromes b and c, respectively, indicated that both the selected large Ps<sup>+</sup> and the normal smaller Ps<sup>+/-</sup> clones had comparable amounts of total cytochrome  $bc_1$  (Figure 5B). Similar data were also obtained via SDS-PAGE analyses using chromatophore membranes of Ps<sup>+</sup> and Ps<sup>+/-</sup> derivatives of pBK25-S + pBK28-F/BK-RBC1 (Figure 5C). However, immunoblot analyses using antibodies against cytochrome b and Strep and Flag epitopes revealed that these clones showed different levels of Strep and Flag epitope tag contents (Figure 5D). The Strep-tagged subpopulation (homodimers and heterodimers) was larger in the Ps<sup>+</sup> clones than in the Ps<sup>+/-</sup> clones. Conversely, the amount of the Flag-tagged subpopulation (homodimers and heterodimers) was larger in the  $Ps^{+/-}$ clones than in the Ps<sup>+</sup> clones. Moreover, the chromatophore membranes of the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies exhibited a cytochrome  $bc_1$  activity (0.33 and 0.24  $\mu$ mol of cytochrome c reduced per minute per milligram of total membrane proteins, respectively, which correspond to 36 and 26%, respectively, of the wild-type activity) higher than that of the smaller  $Ps^{+/-}$ colonies (Figure 5E). The data suggested that the formation of co-integrants between the two resident plasmids (Figure 6) increased the level of production of the Strep-tagged cytochrome b subunits in comparison to that of their Flag-tagged counterparts and consequently yielded an increased level of active heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants that supported better Ps<sup>+</sup> growth.

# DISCUSSION

In this work, we assessed the two genetic systems<sup>20–22</sup> previously reported to successfully produce heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants. Because of the dimeric structure of the enzyme, these systems carry DNA duplications that are naturally prone to genetic rearrangements, including homolo gous and nonhomologous recombination.<sup>40,41</sup> We aimed to elucidate the genetic events that could occur using these genetic systems and to evaluate their impact(s) on the production of heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants. A thorough assessment of the properties of these systems is of critical importance because the validity of the information gained about dimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  directly depends on their experimental reliability and proper use. Their misuse could lead to erroneous conclusions, as reported in ref 24.

### **One-Plasmid System**

Using the one-plasmid system, with a fusion of two "wild-type" or two mutant alleles of cytochrome *b*, we observed extremely slow or no Ps growth, respectively. Frequent genetic

rearrangements were seen under both selective (Ps) and nonselective (Res) growth conditions. Both "wild-type" and mutant petB1-B2 fusions yielded better growing derivatives that carried a single copy of cytochrome b at a frequency of  $\sim 10^{-2}$  under our conditions. A RecA<sup>-</sup> background minimized the occurrence of these genetic rearrangements by approximately an order of magnitude ( $\sim 10^{-3}$ ). Consequently, strains carrying the oneplasmid system seem to be under strong selective growth pressure and propagate as heterogeneous populations.<sup>25</sup> In an attempt to reproduce the one-plasmid system in R. sphaeroides, the Crofts group reported that they obtained only wild-type-like derivatives while growing their strains under Ps conditions.<sup>24</sup> This finding is not surprising, but rather expected, as the Ps growth conditions are strongly selective against even slightly Psdefective mutants, including those carrying the one-plasmid system. Failure to produce a heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  under inappropriate experimental conditions using a fragile genetic system is expected. Therefore, the findings reported in ref 24 are inconclusive for the production of heterodimeric cytochrome  $b - bc_1$  variants or the occurrence and rate of intermonomer electron transfer in cytochrome  $bc_1$ . Genetic systems using mutants should not be exposed to selective conditions. Otherwise, mutant populations rapidly "evolve" better-adapted variants that supersede the initial populations. Heterogeneous microbial populations are not suitable for many studies, especially for biophysical and biochemical characterizations.

The molecular basis underlying the strong selective pressure seen with strains carrying the one-plasmid system is unknown. Although they were not studied here beyond documenting that this system leads to marked population heterogeneity, a possible explanation is that the selection is not caused solely by inadequate cytochrome  $bc_1$  activity (e.g., slow intermonomer electron transfer) or exclusively by RecA-dependent recombination events, and its molecular basis may lie elsewhere. Indeed, even a wild-type *petB1-petB2* fusion is defective for Ps growth. A Ps growth defect could only indicate that heterodimeric cytochrome b- $bc_1$  variants are insufficiently functional (or not maintained in sufficient amounts) if this phenotype is directly correlated with the absence of an active cytochrome  $bc_1$ . Nonetheless, meticulously controlled short culture periods seem to minimize the observed heterogeneity to allow purification of cytochrome b- $bc_1$  variants.<sup>39</sup> It has been reported that different cytochrome b fusions exhibit different "levels of engineering tolerance" because of the type of mutation(s) in cytochrome b or the size of the artificial linker sequence fusing the two copies of *petB*.<sup>25</sup> Moreover, a variant of the one-plasmid system, which uses a R. sphaeroides cytochrome b fused with that of R. capsulatus (petBspetBc instead of petB1-petB2), was recently described to provide enhanced stability and Psproficient growth.42

### **Two-Plasmid System**

Our previously reported two-plasmid system based on two different replicons produced mutant heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  that supported slow Ps growth via the intermonomer electron transfer pathway.<sup>22</sup> In an attempt to produce comparable amounts of homodimeric and heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  in a given cell, we tested a variant of this system in which the two plasmids used have the same type of replicon. However, biogenesis of cytochrome  $bc_1$  is complex and not well-known.<sup>43</sup> The cytochrome b mutations and their associated

epitope tags (e.g., Strep vs Flag) might interfere differently with the replication, expression, biogenesis, and degradation processes *in vivo*. Expecting that cells with a two-plasmid system would produce predetermined amounts of homodimers and heterodimers is unreasonable.<sup>24</sup> In cells carrying two plasmids with the same type of replicons, the copy number of each plasmid might vary, although the total copy number of plasmids per cell is constant. Consequently, the amount of homo- and heterodimers produced can vary. In contrast, when a co-integrant plasmid is formed, the copies of the two plasmids are "equalized" as they become parts of the same molecule maintained at a given copy number, and the amounts of homo- and heterodimers are more similar, as seen here with the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies.

The two-plasmid system yields a population of predom inantly small  $Ps^{+/-}$  and fewer (at a frequency of  $\sim 10^{-4}$ ) large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies.<sup>22</sup> RecA is important for frequent co-integrant formation and resolution; however, in the absence of RecA, co-integrants are still formed but apparently not resolved. More detailed studies are required to better define this process. In a population, the frequency of colonies with a different phenotype (e.g., small  $Ps^{+/-}$  vs large  $Ps^+$ ) reflects how rapidly such colonies arise. This phenotype might originate from various molecular events, and this "reversion" should not be equated with a "wild-type" genotype. Hong et al.<sup>24</sup> postulated that the small Ps<sup>+/-</sup> colonies might correspond to cells that have already reverted, rendering them partially Ps-proficient, and that the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies acquired a second mutation that further improved their Ps growth ability. The observed frequency of this event already indicates that this cannot be the case. Moreover, cultures carrying the two-plasmid system produce the same number of colonies (independent of their size) on solid media under both Ps and Res growth conditions. With each colony being the result of successive divisions of a single cell, the data demonstrate that all cells are capable of growth under both selective (Ps) and nonselective (Res) growth conditions. The small  $Ps^{+/-}$  colonies are formed at a frequency of ~1, demonstrating that they cannot be "revertants" even though their Ps phenotype (i.e., colony size) is different than a wild-type strain. Only the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies that appear at a low frequency reflect cells that underwent genetic rearrangement(s) (i.e., revertants). Monitoring the frequency of these events is the key to ensuring the proper production of heterodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  variants using oneor two-plasmid systems.

Duplicated genetic materials usually undergo homologous recombination, which is a "distance-dependent" event. The frequency of homologous recombination segregating two genetic markers is lower when the markers are closer to each other. In the two-plasmid system carrying two  $Q_0$  site defective cytochrome *b* mutations (cyt *b*-S F144R and cyt *b*-F T288S), no Ps<sup>+</sup> colony was observed. Also, this strain did not produce any Ps<sup>+/-</sup> colonies as both  $Q_0$  sites are defective (Table 1, entry f) [see also the following paper (DOI 10.1021/ bi400561e)]. Similarly, the large number (~70) of plasmids thus far sequenced consistently showed the initial cytochrome *b* mutations linked to their associated epitope tags, in a manner independent of their phenotype. Thus, no recombination between two mutations in *petB* or a mutation and its associated epitope tag carried by *petB* is readily detected, whereas similar RecA-dependent exchanges between the antibiotic resistance markers (Kan<sup>R</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup>) are often observed between the two plasmids (Table 1 and Figure 6). This finding is

Page 15

not unexpected given that the distance separating the cytochrome *b* mutations or a mutation and its associated epitope tag (~1 kb) is ~10 times shorter than that separating the Kan<sup>R</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup> markers (~10 kb) on co-integrant plasmids. However, an increased recombination frequency might be seen between genetic markers that are physically far apart (e.g., a mutation located at the N-terminus of the Fe-S protein together with one at the C-terminus of cytochrome  $c_1$ ), although the use of a RecA<sup>-</sup> background might minimize such events (Figure 6).

A two-plasmid system that is very similar to that analyzed here was also used in Paracoccus denitrificans.<sup>20</sup> That study suggested that one Q<sub>0</sub> site is sufficient for the activity of cytochrome  $bc_1$  and that the intermonomer electron transfer might occurs via the  $b_{\rm L}$ - $b_{\rm L}$ hemes. This genetic setup has not been analyzed further, and the results obtained with R. capsulatus may not be directly translatable to the P. denitrificans system. The recombination pathways might differ between different organisms and their plasmids. The occurrence of co-integrant plasmids and the determination of the recombination frequency yielding a wildtype homodimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  would be useful for further evaluation of this system. We note that the two-plasmid system developed here could be useful not only for the study of electronic communication between the monomers of a dimeric cytochrome  $bc_1$  but also for other homodimeric multisubunit enzymes. For example, it could be informative in the case of the dimeric cytochrome c nitrite reductase (ccNiR) or the dimeric photosynthetic reaction center type I (PSI) for which dimer interactions are not well-known. The three-dimensional structure of ccNiR is a homodimer in which the distance separating the hemes located at the edge of the dimer interface is short (~12 Å),<sup>44,45</sup> whereas that of PSI is a pseudohomodimer containing similar but not identical (PsaA and PsaB) monomers.<sup>46,47</sup>

Finally, we note that the two-plasmid system, which can generate heterogeneous populations, has the potential to contribute to the study of the mitochondrial "heteroplasmy state" seen in mammalian cells. In the case of cytochrome  $bc_1$ , analyses of heteroplasmic cytochrome b often require the generation of "cybrid" lines.<sup>48,49</sup> Using the *R. capsulatus* two-plasmid system, generation of heterogeneous populations might provide an alternative approach, and comparative studies using bacteria and cybrids carrying human disease-causing mutations might be very informative.<sup>49,50</sup>

# **Supplementary Material**

Refer to Web version on PubMed Central for supplementary material.

## Acknowledgments

We thank Xiaomin Wu for isolation of the recA gene and construction of a RecA<sup>-</sup> mutant.

#### Funding

This work was supported by National Institutes of Health Grant GM 38237 and the Division of Chemical Sciences, Geosciences and Biosciences, Office of Basic Energy Sciences of the U.S. Department of Energy, via Grant DE-FG02-91ER20052 to F.D.

# ABBREVIATIONS

Q	quinone
SQ	semiquinone
QH <sub>2</sub>	hydroquinone
Res	respiration
Ps	photosynthesis
Kan <sup>R</sup>	kanamycin resistance
TetR	tetracycline resistance

## References

- Xia D, Yu CA, Kim H, Xia JZ, Kachurin AM, Zhang L, Yu L, Deisenhofer J. Crystal structure of the cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub> complex from bovine heart mitochondria. Science. 1997; 277:60–66. [PubMed: 9204897]
- 2. Zhang Z, Huang L, Shulmeister VM, Chi YI, Kim KK, Hung LW, Crofts AR, Berry EA, Kim SH. Electron transfer by domain movement in cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub>. Nature. 1998; 392:677–684. [PubMed: 9565029]
- Iwata S, Lee JW, Okada K, Lee JK, Iwata M, Rasmussen B, Link TA, Ramaswamy S, Jap BK. Complete structure of the 11-subunit bovine mitochondrial cytochrome bc1 complex. Science. 1998; 281:64–71. [PubMed: 9651245]
- Berry EA, Huang LS, Saechao LK, Pon NG, Valkova-Valchanova M, Daldal F. X-ray structure of *Rhodobacter* capsulatus cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub>: Comparison with its mitochondrial and chloroplast counterparts. Photosynth Res. 2004:251–275. [PubMed: 16034531]
- Mitchell P. Possible molecular mechanisms of the protonmotive function of cytochrome systems. J Theor Biol. 1976; 62:327–367. [PubMed: 186667]
- Crofts AR, Meinhardt SW, Jones KR, Snozzi M. The role of the quinone pool in the cyclic electrontransfer chain of *Rhodopseudomonas sphaeroides*: A modified Q-cycle mechanism. Biochim Biophys Acta. 1983; 723:202–218. [PubMed: 21494412]
- Trumpower BL. The protonmotive Q cycle. Energy transduction by coupling of proton translocation to electron transfer by the cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub> complex. J Biol Chem. 1990; 265:11409–11412. [PubMed: 2164001]
- Darrouzet E, Valkova-Valchanova M, Moser CC, Dutton PL, Daldal F. Uncovering the [2Fe2S] domain movement in cytochrome bc1 and its implications for energy conversion. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 2000; 97:4567–4572. [PubMed: 10781061]
- Darrouzet E, Daldal F. Movement of the iron-sulfur subunit beyond the *ef* loop of cytochrome *b* is required for multiple turnovers of the *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex but not for single turnover Q<sub>0</sub> site catalysis. J Biol Chem. 2002; 277:3471–3476. [PubMed: 11707449]
- Crofts AR, Holland JT, Victoria D, Kolling DR, Dikanov SA, Gilbreth R, Lhee S, Kuras R, Kuras MG. The Q-cycle reviewed: How well does a monomeric mechanism of the *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex account for the function of a dimeric complex? Biochim Biophys Acta. 2008; 1777:1001–1019. [PubMed: 18501698]
- De Vries S, Albracht SP, Berden JA, Slater EC. The pathway of electrons through QH<sub>2</sub>:cytochrome *c* oxidoreductase studied by pre-steady-state kinetics. Biochim Biophys Acta. 1982; 681:41–53. [PubMed: 6288082]
- Weiss H, Leonard K, Neupert W. Puzzling subunits of mitochondrial cytochrome reductase. Trends Biochem Sci. 1990; 15:178–180. [PubMed: 2163130]
- Gopta OA, Feniouk BA, Junge W, Mulkidjanian AY. The cytochrome bc1 complex of *Rhodobacter capsulatus*: Ubiquinol oxidation in a dimeric Q-cycle? FEBS Lett. 1998; 431:291– 296. [PubMed: 9708922]

- 14. Trumpower BL. A concerted, alternating sites mechanism of ubiquinol oxidation by the dimeric cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex. Biochim Biophys Acta. 2002; 1555:166–173. [PubMed: 12206910]
- Cooley JW, Lee DW, Daldal F. Across membrane communication between the Q<sub>0</sub> and Q<sub>i</sub> active sites of cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub>. Biochemistry. 2009; 48:1888–1899. [PubMed: 19254042]
- 16. Covian R, Gutierrez-Cirlos EB, Trumpower BL. Anti-cooperative oxidation of ubiquinol by the yeast cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex. J Biol Chem. 2004; 279:15040–15049. [PubMed: 14761953]
- 17. Cooley JW, Ohnishi T, Daldal F. Binding dynamics at the quinone reduction Q<sub>i</sub> site influence the equilibrium interactions of the iron sulfur protein and hydroquinone oxidation Q<sub>o</sub> site of the cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex. Biochemistry. 2005; 44:10520–10532. [PubMed: 16060661]
- Covian R, Trumpower BL. Rapid electron transfer between monomers when the cytochrome bc1 complex dimer is reduced through center N. J Biol Chem. 2005; 280:22732–22740. [PubMed: 15833742]
- Shinkarev VP, Wraight CA. Intermonomer electron transfer in the bc<sub>1</sub> complex dimer is controlled by the energized state and by impaired electron transfer between low and high potential hemes. FEBS Lett. 2007; 581:1535–1541. [PubMed: 17399709]
- 20. Castellani M, Covian R, Kleinschroth T, Anderka O, Ludwig B, Trumpower BL. Direct demonstration of half-of-the-sites reactivity in the dimeric cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub> complex: Enzyme with one inactive monomer is fully active but unable to activate the second ubiquinol oxidation site in response to ligand binding at the ubiquinone reduction site. J Biol Chem. 2010; 285:502–510. [PubMed: 19892700]
- Swierczek M, Cieluch E, Sarewicz M, Borek A, Moser CC, Dutton PL, Osyczka A. An electronic bus bar lies in the core of cytochrome bc1. Science. 2010; 329:451–454. [PubMed: 20651150]
- Lanciano P, Lee DW, Yang H, Darrouzet E, Daldal F. Intermonomer electron transfer between the low-potential *b* hemes of cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub>. Biochemistry. 2011; 50:1651–1663. [PubMed: 21261281]
- Khalfaoui-Hassani B, Lanciano P, Lee DW, Darrouzet E, Daldal F. Recent advances in cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub>: Inter monomer electronic communication? FEBS Lett. 2011; 586:617–621. [PubMed: 21878327]
- 24. Hong S, Victoria D, Crofts AR. Inter-monomer electron transfer is too slow to compete with monomeric turnover in *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex. Biochim Biophys Acta. 2012; 1817:1053–1062. [PubMed: 22465023]
- 25. Czapla M, Borek A, Sarewicz M, Osyczka A. Fusing two cytochromes b of Rhodobacter capsulatus cytochrome bc1 using various linkers defines a set of protein templates for asymmetric mutagenesis. Protein Eng Des Sel. 2011; 25:15–25. [PubMed: 22119789]
- Daldal F, Cheng S, Applebaum J, Davidson E, Prince RC. Cytochrome c<sub>2</sub> is not essential for photosynthetic growth of *Rhodopseudomonas capsulata*. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 1986; 83:2012–2016. [PubMed: 16593675]
- Atta-Asafo-Adjei E, Daldal F. Size of the amino acid side chain at position 158 of cytochrome b is critical for an active cytochrome bc1 complex and for photosynthetic growth of *Rhodobacter capsulatus*. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 1991; 88:492–496. [PubMed: 1846443]
- 28. Sambrook, J.; Russell, DW. Molecular Cloning: A laboratory manual. 3. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press; Plainview, NY: 2001.
- 29. Yen HC, Hu NT, Marrs BL. Characterization of the gene transfer agent made by an overproducer mutant of *Rhodopseudomonas capsulata*. J Mol Biol. 1979; 131:157–168. [PubMed: 490646]
- Ding H, Daldal F, Dutton PL. Ion pair formation between basic residues at 144 of the cyt *b* polypeptide and the ubiquinones at the Q<sub>0</sub> site of the cyt *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex. Biochemistry. 1995; 34:15997–16003. [PubMed: 8519755]
- Gray KA, Dutton PL, Daldal F. Requirement of histidine 217 for ubiquinone reductase activity (Qi site) in the cytochrome bc1 complex. Biochemistry. 1994; 33:723–733. [PubMed: 8292600]
- 32. Gray KA, Davidson E, Daldal F. Mutagenesis of methionine-183 drastically affects the physicochemical properties of cytochrome c<sub>1</sub> of the bc<sub>1</sub> complex of *Rhodobacter capsulatus*. Biochemistry. 1992; 31:11864–11873. [PubMed: 1332776]

- Smith PK, Krohn RI, Hermanson GT, Mallia AK, Gartner FH, Provenzano MD, Fujimoto EK, Goeke NM, Olson BJ, Klenk DC. Measurement of protein using bicinchoninic acid. Anal Biochem. 1985; 150:76–85. [PubMed: 3843705]
- Laemmli UK. Cleavage of structural proteins during the assembly of the head of bacteriophage T4. Nature. 1970; 227:680–685. [PubMed: 5432063]
- 35. Davidson E, Ohnishi T, Tokito M, Daldal F. *Rhodobacter capsulatus* mutants lacking the Rieske FeS protein form a stable cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub> subcomplex with an intact quinone reduction site. Biochemistry. 1992; 31:3351–3358. [PubMed: 1313293]
- 36. Radding CM. Recombination activities of *E. coli* RecA protein. Cell. 1981; 25:3–4. [PubMed: 7023698]
- 37. Cox MM. The bacterial RecA protein as a motor protein. Annu Rev Microbiol. 2003; 57:551–577. [PubMed: 14527291]
- Todd PA, Brouwer J, Glickman BW. Influence of DNA-repair deficiencies on MMS- and EMSinduced mutagenesis in *Escherichia coli* K-12. Mutat Res. 1981; 82:239–250. [PubMed: 7022177]
- Czapla M, Borek A, Sarewicz M, Osyczka A. Enzymatic Activities of Isolated Cytochrome bc1like Complexes Containing Fused Cytochrome b Subunits with Asymmetrically Inactivated Segments of Electron Transfer Chains. Biochemistry. 2012; 51:829–835. [PubMed: 22233445]
- 40. Bedbrook JR, Ausubel FM. Recombination between bacterial plasmids leading to the formation of plasmid multimers. Cell. 1976; 9:707–716. [PubMed: 797459]
- 41. Potter H, Dressler D. On the mechanism of genetic recombination: The maturation of recombination intermedi ates. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA. 1977; 74:4168–4172. [PubMed: 270661]
- Czapla M, Cieluch E, Borek A, Sarewicz M, Osyczka A. Catalytically-relevant electron transfer between two hemes b<sub>L</sub> in the hybrid cytochrome bc<sub>1</sub>-like complex containing a fusion of *Rhodobacter sphaeroides* and *capsulatus* cytochromes b. Biochim Biophys Acta. 2013; 1827:751– 760. [PubMed: 23428397]
- 43. Smith PM, Fox JL, Winge DR. Biogenesis of the cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> complex and role of assembly factors. Biochim Biophys Acta. 2012; 1817:276–286. [PubMed: 22138626]
- 44. Einsle O, Messerschmidt A, Stach P, Bourenkov GP, Bartunik HD, Huber R, Kroneck PM. Structure of cytochrome *c* nitrite reductase. Nature. 1999; 400:476–480. [PubMed: 10440380]
- 45. Youngblut M, Judd ET, Srajer V, Sayyed B, Goelzer T, Elliott SJ, Schmidt M, Pacheco AA. Laue crystal structure of *Shewanella oneidensis* cytochrome *c* nitrite reductase from a high-yield expression system. JBIC, J Biol Inorg Chem. 2012; 17:647–662.
- Jordan P, Fromme P, Witt HT, Klukas O, Saenger W, Krauss N. Three-dimensional structure of cyanobacterial photosystem I at 2.5 Å resolution. Nature. 2001; 411:909–917. [PubMed: 11418848]
- Jagannathan B, Golbeck JH. Breaking biological symmetry in membrane proteins: The asymmetrical orientation of PsaC on the pseudo-C2 symmetric Photosystem I core. Cell Mol Life Sci. 2009; 66:1257–1270. [PubMed: 19132290]
- King MP, Attardi G. Human cells lacking mtDNA: Repopulation with exogenous mitochondria by complementation. Science. 1989; 246:500–503. [PubMed: 2814477]
- 49. Ghelli A, Tropeano CV, Calvaruso MA, Marchesini A, Iommarini L, Porcelli AM, Zanna C, De Nardo V, Martinuzzi A, Wibrand F, Vissing J, Kurelac I, Gasparre G, Selamoglu N, Daldal F, Rugolo M. The cytochrome b p. 278Y > C mutation causative of a multisystem disorder enhances superoxide production and alters supramolecular interactions of respiratory chain complexes. Hum Mol Genet. 2013; 22:2141–51. [PubMed: 23418307]
- Lanciano P, Khalfaoui-Hassani B, Selamoglu N, Ghelli A, Rugolo M, Daldal F. Molecular mechanisms of superoxide production by complex III: A bacterial versus human mitochondrial comparative case study. Biochim Biophys Acta. 2013; 1827:1332–1339. [PubMed: 23542447]
- 51. Ditta G, Schmidhauser T, Yakobson E, Lu P, Liang XW, Finlay DR, Guiney D, Helinski DR. Plasmids related to the broad host range vector, pRK290, useful for gene cloning and for monitoring gene expression. Plasmid. 1985; 13:149–153. [PubMed: 2987994]

petC

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript





### Figure 1.

Genetic systems producing cytochrome  $bc_1$  heterodimers. (A) In the one-plasmid system, the *petB* gene was duplicated (*petB1* and *petB2*) and linked together with the 12-amino acid NotI linker (ASIAGGRTASGP). The *petB2* gene is C-terminally tagged with the Strep epitope (boxed). For the sake of simplicity, the remaining part of plasmid pMTS1 (Kan<sup>R</sup> derivative of pRK415) carrying these constructs is not shown. (B) In the two-plasmid system, two *petABC* operons are carried by two plasmids (solid and dashed lines) marked with different antibiotic resistance cassettes, as indicated by boxes labeled Kan (kanamycin) and Tet (tetracycline). The *petB* genes of the Kan and Tet plasmids are C-terminally tagged with the Strep and Flag tags, respectively.



### Figure 2.

Growth phenotypes of strains carrying the one-plasmid system. Photosynthetic (Ps) and respiration (Res) growth on enriched medium of *R. capsulatus* strains MT-RBC1 (RecA<sup>+</sup>) and BK-RBC1 (RecA<sup>-</sup>) harboring plasmid (A) pMTS1 carrying a wild-type *petABC* operon, (B) pBK6 carrying *petAB1-B2C*, and (C) pBK32 carrying the mutated *petAB1<sup>F144R</sup>*- $B2^{H217L}C$  fusion operons. In each case, the appropriate operon constructs are shown below the colony pictures, and mutations cyt *b* F144R and cyt *b* H217L are indicated with stars. Primers petA3 and petB4 (see the text) were used for PCR amplification.



### Figure 3.

Genetic rearrangements in a strain carrying the one-plasmid system. (A) PCR-amplified DNA mixtures using the petA3 and petB4 primers were run on a 1% agarose gel, and each lane corresponds to plasmid DNA extracted from independent colonies of strain pBK6/MT-RBC1 grown under Ps and Res conditions (Materials and Methods): lane 1, DNA size markers; lane 2, control plasmid pMTS1 carrying the *petABC* operon; lane 3, plasmid extracted from a colony carrying the one-plasmid system and growing as a wild type under photosynthetic (Ps) conditions; lane 4, plasmid extracted from a colony carrying the one-plasmid system and growing sextracted from similar colonies growing under respiratory (Res) conditions. The 1.5 and 3 kb bands correspond to wild-type *petB* and the *petB1-petB2* fusion, respectively. (B) SDS-PAGE and immunoblot analyses of chromatophore membranes (40  $\mu$ g of total proteins) from cells harboring the one-plasmid system: lane 1, pMTS1/MT-RBC1; lane 2, MT-RBC1; lanes 3–8, Ps- and Res-grown colonies of pBK6/MT-RBC1 compared for their cytochrome *b* (anti *b*) and anti-Strep (anti Strep) antibodies.



#### Figure 4.

Growth and biochemical properties of strains carrying the two-plasmid system. (A) Photosynthetic (Ps) and respiration (Res) growth on enriched medium of wild-type *R. capsulatus* strain pMTS1/MT-RBC1 compared to that on MT-RBC1 (RecA<sup>+</sup>) and BK-RBC1 (RecA<sup>-</sup>) strains harboring the two-plasmid system (pMTS1-S + pBK21/MT-RBC1 and pMTS1-S + pBK21/BK-RBC1). In each case, the plasmids carrying the *petABC* operon are shown below the colony pictures. (B) SDS-PAGE and (C) immunoblot analyses of cytochrome *bc*<sub>1</sub> subunits in a strain carrying the two-plasmid system. Chromatophore membranes (40  $\mu$ g of total proteins per lane, from left to right) from pMTS1-S/MT-RBC1, MT-RBC1, pBK21-F/MT-RBC1, (pMTS1-S + pBK21)/MT-RBC1, and (pMTS1-S + pBK21)/BK-RBC1 were probed with polyclonal anti-cytochrome *b* and monoclonal anti-Flag and anti-Strep antibodies (see Materials and Methods).



### Figure 5.

Large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies produced by a strain carrying the two-plasmid system contain large cointegrant plasmids. (A) Agarose gel showing the plasmid DNA extracted from RecA<sup>-</sup> cells carrying the pRK415 vector (lane 2), pMTSI-S (lane 3), pBK21-F (lane 4), and a cointegrant plasmid formed between two resident plasmids found in the large Ps<sup>+</sup> colonies carrying both plasmids from strain pBK25-S + pBK28-F/BK-RBC1 (lane 5). In each case, the upper band corresponds to the pRK415 derivatives and the identity of the lower band is not defined. DNA size markers are shown in lane 1. (B) Optical redox difference spectra of total *b*-type (dithionite minus ferricyanide colored red) and *c*-type (ascorbate minus ferricyanide colored black) cytochrome contents of chromatophore membranes obtained from a large  $Ps^+$  and a small  $Ps^{+/-}$  colony derivative of pBK25-S + pBK28-F/BK-RBC1. (C) SDS-PAGE and (D) immunoblot analyses of the chromatophore membranes obtained from the same large  $Ps^+$  and a small  $Ps^{+/-}$  as described for panel B using cytochrome b polyclonal antibodies and commercially available monoclonal antibodies against the Strep and Flag epitope tags. (E) Steady-state DBH2:cytochrome c reduction activity (Materials and Methods) monitored at 550 nm exhibited by the same chromatophore membranes as in panel B, and the corresponding rates obtained using the same amounts of proteins (see the text).



#### Figure 6.

Formation of co-integrants between the resident plasmids in cells carrying the two-plasmid system. Continuous co-integrant plasmid formation and resolution via the homologous recombination (RecA) pathway between two plasmids carrying the same type of replicon coresiding in a cell are depicted. The frequency of occurrence of these single-recombination events is decreased drastically in the absence of the RecA protein (RecA<sup>-</sup> background). Segregations of the genetic markers carried by the co-integrant plasmids formed are distance-dependent. In a RecA<sup>+</sup> background, exchange between the antibiotic resistance markers is detected upon the formation and resolution of the co-integrants, but no recombination or segregation between the cytochrome b mutations or the mutations and their associated epitope tags is seen, because of the short distances that separate these markers.

# Table 1

Production of Native, Active, and Inactive Cytochrome bc1 Heterodimers Ps mutation

two-plasmid system	(petABC)	Ps growth <sup>a</sup>	plasmid selection in E. coli	tag exchange	mutation exchange
			Wild-Type Heterodimers		
(a) pMTS1-S $(Kan^R) + pBK21-F (Tet^R)$	$\operatorname{RecA}^+$	$Ps^+$	165 of 210 <u>Kan<sup>R</sup> Tet<sup>R</sup></u>	yes (3 of 8 Kan <sup>R</sup> -Flag; 0 of 3 Tet <sup>R</sup> -Strep)	$NA^{C}$
			80 of 148 $\underline{\text{Tet}}^{\mathbb{R}} \underline{\text{Kan}}^{\mathbb{R}} (n = 6)^{b}$		
(b) pMTS1-S $(Kan^R) + pBK21-F (Tet^R)$	RecA <sup>-</sup>	$\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{S}^+}$	0 of 224 $\underline{Kan}^{R} \operatorname{Tet}^{R}$	no (0 of 3 $\underline{Kan}^{\mathbb{R}}$ -Flag; 0 of 3 Tet <sup><math>\mathbb{R}</math>-Strep)</sup>	$NA^{C}$
			0 of 341 $\overline{\text{Tet}}^{\text{R}}$ Kan <sup>R</sup> $(n = 3)$		
			Mutant Heterodimers		
(c) cyt <i>b</i> -S F144R + cyt <i>b</i> -F H217L	$RecA^+$	$\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{S}^{+/-}}$	74 of 100 $\underline{Kan}^{R} \operatorname{Tet}^{R}$	yes (2 of 10 Kan <sup>R</sup> -Flag; 3 of 13 Tet <sup>R</sup> -Strep)	tag-linked <sup>d</sup>
			36 of 50 $\overline{\text{Tet}^{R}}$ Kan <sup>R</sup> $(n = 3)$		
small Ps colonies	RecA <sup>-</sup>	$\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{S}^{+/-}}$	0 of 1734 <u>Kan</u> <sup>R</sup> Tet <sup>R</sup>	no (0 of 10 Kan <sup>R</sup> -Flag; 0 of 10 Tet <sup>R</sup> -Strep)	no <sup>e</sup>
(d) cyt <i>b</i> -S F144R + cyt <i>b</i> -F H217L			0 of 1366 $\overline{\text{Tet}}^{\text{R}}$ Kan <sup>R</sup> $(n = 6)$		
large Ps colonies	RecA <sup>-</sup>	$\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{S}^+}$	999 of 1000 <u>Kan</u> <sup>R</sup> Tet <sup>R</sup>	yes (9 of 10 Kan <sup>R</sup> -Flag; 9 of 13 Tet <sup>R</sup> Strep)	tag-linked <sup>d</sup>
(e) cyt $b$ -S F144R + cyt $b$ -F H217L			398 of 400 <u>Tet</u> <sup>R</sup> Kan <sup>R</sup>		
no Ps colonies					
(f) cyt $b$ -S F144R + cyt $b$ -F T288S	$RecA^+$	$\mathrm{Ps}^{-}$	$NA^{C}$	NA <sup>C</sup>	

Biochemistry. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2015 June 02.

b is the number of cultures of R. capsulatus used to extract the plasmids; Kan<sup>R</sup> and Tet<sup>R</sup> indicate resistance to kanamycin and tetracycline, respectively, obtained after transformation of HB101 with plasmids from R. capsulatus. Clones were selected on Kan or Tet (underlined) and scored for the unselected marker (not underlined).

 $^{c}$ Not applicable.

 $d_{\rm Tag-linked}$ , cytochrome b mutations and their associated tags remained together.

<sup>e</sup>In the 10 Kan<sup>R</sup> and 10 Tet<sup>R</sup> plasmids sequenced, all mutations were associated with their tags. No tag or mutation exchange was seen among the 10 Kan<sup>R</sup> and 10 Tet<sup>R</sup> clones sequenced.