

CROSSTALK

CrossTalk opposing view: Diffusion limitation of O₂ from microvessels into muscle does not contribute to the limitation of $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$

Carsten Lundby^{1,2} and David Montero¹

¹Center for Integrative Human Physiology, Institute of Physiology, University of Zürich, Zürich, Switzerland

²Department of Food and Nutrition, and Sport Science, Gothenburg University, Gothenburg, Sweden

Email: carsten.lundby@uzh.ch

Oxygen is transferred from air to mitochondria in sequential steps by means of diffusion and convection. The theoretical ceiling for whole body aerobic uptake may be determined by any factor influencing the O₂ transport and utilization chain. The dispute considered here is whether peripheral O₂ diffusion from microvessels, particularly capillaries, into active skeletal muscle fibres limits/regulates maximal oxygen uptake ($\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$) in healthy humans.

Peripheral O₂ diffusion does not limit $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$

$\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ is experimentally determined by the levelling off in O₂ uptake observed with increasing workload during dynamic exercise involving more than half of total muscle mass (e.g. running, cycling) (Levine, 2008). This indicates that, empirically, $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ is limited, i.e. primarily restricted prior to peak muscle activation. Moreover, such limitation is attributed to a finite oxygen supply to muscle given that mitochondrial oxidative capacity exceeds that of oxygen delivery at $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ (Boushel *et al.* 2011). Thus, any factor related to the transport of O₂ into the mitochondria might limit $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$. In this regard, there is sound evidence that $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ is proportionally modified in accordance with acute changes

in blood O₂-carrying capacity and content (Calbet *et al.* 2006a). In contrast, a decrease in arterial O₂ partial pressure, and thereby reducing the driving force for O₂ diffusion, does not affect maximal O₂ uptake if O₂ delivery to the exercising limbs at the same time remains preserved (Calbet *et al.* 2003, 2009). Importantly, these observations were not associated with any particular individual's fitness status. Accordingly, at $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ in healthy individuals there must be a physiologically relevant reserve in muscle O₂ diffusing capacity, which also precludes that $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ is limited by peripheral O₂ diffusion from capillary into muscle.

Does muscle O₂ diffusion regulate $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$?

While peripheral O₂ diffusion does not limit $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$, the question arises as to whether $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ could be influenced by muscle O₂ diffusing capacity in healthy individuals. This would be entirely refuted if O₂ were fully extracted from capillaries supplying active muscle fibres. However, such level of resolution for O₂ extraction within human muscle fibres is beyond reach with current methods (Koga *et al.* 2014). Instead, the large body of empirical evidence derives from O₂ measures in venous blood exiting the active limb (Rud *et al.* 2012), in which a 100% O₂ extraction seems unachievable considering temporal and spatial characteristics (Heinonen *et al.* 2015). For instance, the high intramuscular pressure generated during the contraction phase partly diverts blood flow toward less metabolically active tissue (Clark *et al.* 2000). Also, the perfusion of active muscle fibres is inherently inefficient as regards O₂ delivery, since microvascular units (i.e. terminal arteriole and downstream capillaries) are not spatially coordinated with individual motor units and this may result in the overperfusion of inactive fibres (Emerson & Segal, 1997).

In addition, O₂ extraction may be a function of the physiological distribution of blood flow among active/inactive muscle fibres and other tissues (Kalliokoski *et al.* 2001, 2005; Calbet *et al.* 2006b). Of note, blood flow distribution is determined by the complex interplay of factors including the sympathetic drive, concentration of vasoactive substances, arterial dilator/constrictor function and microvascular structure. Therefore, a perfect matching between leg O₂ delivery and metabolic demand during exercise is not expected even if neglecting the previously mentioned temporal and spatial intrinsic constraints; here, blood flow distribution is improved and O₂ extraction enhanced within exercising muscles in long-term trained individuals (Kalliokoski *et al.* 2001). Ignoring or trivializing this fact may have distorted the contribution of muscle O₂ diffusion to the limitation of $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ (Piiper, 2000; Koga *et al.* 2014). Yet O₂ extraction across the leg commonly rises to 85% or more at $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ in untrained and trained individuals (Lundby *et al.* 2006; Rud *et al.* 2012), attaining an astonishing 97% in some elite athletes (Calbet *et al.* 2005). It follows that for muscle O₂ diffusing capacity to contribute to the limitation of $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$, an average of approximately 85% or more of leg blood flow should be *continuously* perfusing active muscle fibres.

If leg O₂ extraction, and thus $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$, were regulated by leg muscle O₂ diffusing capacity, any increase in diffusion capacity would be reflected, at least to a degree, in an augmented leg O₂ extraction. In this respect, one-leg training studies have provided compelling evidence because the impact of peripheral adaptations on $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ may be isolated from central haemodynamic adaptations (Gleser, 1973; Saltin *et al.* 1976; Klausen *et al.* 1982; Rud *et al.* 2012). All these studies have shown marked increases in one-legged cycling peak blood flow, O₂ diffusing capacity, and uptake in individuals

Carsten Lundby (left) and David Montero (right) both work at the University of Zürich in a small team focusing on Oxygen Transport and Utilization in its broadest sense. The strength of the group is its integrative approach which allows them to study O₂ as it is transported all the way from inspired air and until it is oxidized in the mitochondrion. Their most recent work has focused on the relative importance of skeletal muscle and circulatory adaptations to exercise training for improvements in $\dot{V}_{O_2\max}$ and hence is in direct line with the current cross talk.



who, before training, had $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$ in the normal range (Gleser, 1973; Saltin *et al.* 1976; Klausen *et al.* 1982; Rud *et al.* 2012). However, peak O_2 uptake during two-legged cycling (i.e. $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$) remained unaltered in the presence of unchanged maximal cardiac output (\dot{Q}_{max}) following one-legged training (Gleser, 1973). In line with this, the increase in $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$ following two-legged training was reverted to the baseline level after negating the training-induced gain in \dot{Q}_{max} by means of phlebotomy (Bonne *et al.* 2014). Likewise, $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$ was identical prior to and after one-legged training despite the fact that blood flow, O_2 extraction and uptake were enhanced during two-legged cycling in the trained *versus* control leg (Rud *et al.* 2012). This strongly suggests that two-legged O_2 extraction ($\sim 85\%$) was maximized relative to blood flow at $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$, irrespective of any training adaptation in muscle O_2 diffusing capacity. Overall, these data indicate that $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$ is not modulated by muscle O_2 diffusing capacity. Rather, $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$ seems to be governed, in a tyrannical manner, by the amount of blood flowing into the exercising limbs.

Several canine studies have been aimed at examining the contribution of muscle O_2 diffusing capacity to O_2 extraction (Schumacker *et al.* 1985; Barclay, 1986; Hogan *et al.* 1989, 1991; Richardson *et al.* 1998). In these, blood flow or haemoglobin O_2 affinity (P_{50}) have been manipulated while maintaining O_2 delivery constant to contracting muscle. Hence a regulatory role for O_2 diffusion from capillary into muscle in O_2 extraction could be pinpointed, provided that O_2 delivery to active muscle fibres is not influenced by blood flow or P_{50} (Schumacker *et al.* 1987). Regardless, the majority of the evidence comparing experimental *versus* control conditions indicates that muscle O_2 uptake is uniquely dependent on O_2 delivery (Schumacker *et al.* 1985, 1987; Barclay, 1986; Richardson *et al.* 1998). Furthermore, the presence of statistical procedures raising the likelihood for type I errors to occur (i.e. the probability of making false discoveries) in divergent findings is noteworthy (Hogan *et al.* 1989). Taken together, the proposed regulatory role for O_2 diffusion from capillary into muscle during exercise (Wagner, 1992) cannot be induced from the above animal experiments, let alone extrapolating it to humans exercising at $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$, in which, as a matter of fact, such a role is empirically absent (Calbet *et al.* 2003; Lundby *et al.* 2006).

Call for comments

Readers are invited to give their views on this and the accompanying CrossTalk articles in this issue by submitting a brief (250 word) comment. Comments may be submitted up to 6 weeks after publication of the article, at which point the discussion will close and the CrossTalk authors will be invited to submit a 'Last Word'. Please email your comment, including a title and a declaration of interest to jphysiol@physoc.org. Comments will be moderated and accepted comments will be published online only as 'supporting information' to the original debate articles once discussion has closed.

References

- Barclay JK (1986). A delivery-independent blood flow effect on skeletal muscle fatigue. *J Appl Physiol* (1985) **61**, 1084–1090.
- Bonne TC, Doucende G, Fluck D, Jacobs RA, Nordsborg NB, Robach P, Walther G & Lundby C (2014). Phlebotomy eliminates the maximal cardiac output response to six weeks of exercise training. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* **306**, R752–R760.
- Boushel R, Gnaiger E, Calbet JA, Gonzalez-Alonso J, Wright-Paradis C, Sondergaard H, Ara I, Helge JW & Saltin B (2011). Muscle mitochondrial capacity exceeds maximal oxygen delivery in humans. *Mitochondrion* **11**, 303–307.
- Calbet JA, Boushel R, Radegran G, Sondergaard H, Wagner PD & Saltin B (2003). Why is VO_{2max} after altitude acclimatization still reduced despite normalization of arterial O_2 content? *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* **284**, R304–R316.
- Calbet JA, Holmberg HC, Rosdahl H, vanHall G, Jensen-Urstad M & Saltin B (2005). Why do arms extract less oxygen than legs during exercise? *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* **289**, R1448–R1458.
- Calbet JA, Lundby C, Koskolou M & Boushel R (2006a). Importance of hemoglobin concentration to exercise: acute manipulations. *Respir Physiol Neurobiol* **151**, 132–140.
- Calbet JA, Lundby C, Sander M, Robach P, Saltin B & Boushel R (2006b). Effects of ATP-induced leg vasodilation on VO_{2peak} and leg O_2 extraction during maximal exercise in humans. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol* **291**, R447–R453.
- Calbet JA, Radegran G, Boushel R & Saltin B (2009). On the mechanisms that limit oxygen uptake during exercise in acute and chronic hypoxia: role of muscle mass. *J Physiol* **587**, 477–490.
- Clark MG, Rattigan S, Clerk LH, Vincent MA, Clark AD, Youd JM & Newman JM (2000). Nutritive and non-nutritive blood flow: rest and exercise. *Acta Physiol Scand* **168**, 519–530.
- Emerson GG & Segal SS (1997). Alignment of microvascular units along skeletal muscle fibers of hamster retractor. *J Appl Physiol* (1985) **82**, 42–48.
- Gleser MA (1973). Effects of hypoxia and physical training on hemodynamic adjustments to one-legged exercise. *J Appl Physiol* **34**, 655–659.
- Heinonen I, Koga S, Kalliokoski KK, Musch TI & Poole DC (2015). Heterogeneity of muscle blood flow and metabolism: influence of exercise, aging and disease states. *Exerc Sport Sci Rev* (in press).
- Hogan MC, Bebout DE & Wagner PD (1991). Effect of increased Hb- O_2 affinity on VO_{2max} at constant O_2 delivery in dog muscle in situ. *J Appl Physiol* (1985) **70**, 2656–2662.
- Hogan MC, Roca J, West JB & Wagner PD (1989). Dissociation of maximal O_2 uptake from O_2 delivery in canine gastrocnemius in situ. *J Appl Physiol* (1985) **66**, 1219–1226.
- Kalliokoski KK, Knuuti J & Nuutila P (2005). Relationship between muscle blood flow and oxygen uptake during exercise in endurance-trained and untrained men. *J Appl Physiol* (1985) **98**, 380–383.
- Kalliokoski KK, Oikonen V, Takala TO, Sipila H, Knuuti J & Nuutila P (2001). Enhanced oxygen extraction and reduced flow heterogeneity in exercising muscle in endurance-trained men. *Am J Physiol Endocrinol Metab* **280**, E1015–E1021.
- Klausen K, Secher NH, Clausen JP, Hartling O & Trap-Jensen J (1982). Central and regional circulatory adaptations to one-leg training. *J Appl Physiol Respir Environ Exerc Physiol* **52**, 976–983.
- Koga S, Rossiter HB, Heinonen I, Musch TI & Poole DC (2014). Dynamic heterogeneity of exercising muscle blood flow and O_2 utilization. *Med Sci Sports Exerc* **46**, 860–876.
- Levine BD (2008). $\dot{V}_{O_{2max}}$: what do we know, and what do we still need to know? *J Physiol* **586**, 25–34.
- Lundby C, Sander M, vanHall G, Saltin B & Calbet JA (2006). Maximal exercise and muscle oxygen extraction in acclimatizing lowlanders and high altitude natives. *J Physiol* **573**, 535–547.
- Piiper J (2000). Perfusion, diffusion and their heterogeneities limiting blood-tissue O_2 transfer in muscle. *Acta Physiol Scand* **168**, 603–607.
- Richardson RS, Tagore K, Haseler LJ, Jordan M & Wagner PD (1998). Increased VO_{2max} with right-shifted Hb- O_2 dissociation curve at a constant O_2 delivery in dog muscle in situ. *J Appl Physiol* (1985) **84**, 995–1002.
- Roca J, Hogan MC, Story D, Bebout DE, Haab P, Gonzalez R, Ueno O & Wagner PD (1989). Evidence for tissue diffusion limitation of VO_{2max} in normal humans. *J Appl Physiol* (1985) **67**, 291–299.

- Rud B, Foss O, Krstrup P, Secher NH & Hallén J (2012). One-legged endurance training: leg blood flow and oxygen extraction during cycling exercise. *Acta Physiol (Oxf)* **205**, 177–185.
- Saltin B, Nazar K, Costill DL, Stein E, Jansson E, Essen B & Gollnick D (1976). The nature of the training response; peripheral and central adaptations of one-legged exercise. *Acta Physiol Scand* **96**, 289–305.
- Schumacker PT, Long GR & Wood LD (1987). Tissue oxygen extraction during hypovolemia: role of hemoglobin P50. *J Appl Physiol (1985)* **62**, 1801–1807.
- Schumacker PT, Suggett AJ, Wagner PD & West JB (1985). Role of hemoglobin P50 in O₂ transport during normoxic and hypoxic exercise in the dog. *J Appl Physiol (1985)* **59**, 749–757.
- Wagner PD (1992). Gas exchange and peripheral diffusion limitation. *Med Sci Sports Exerc* **24**, 54–58.

Additional information

Competing interests

None declared.