



Published in final edited form as:

Anesthesiology. 2016 June ; 124(6): 1414–1415. doi:10.1097/ALN.0000000000001091.

Reply to MS #ALN-D-16-00130

Martin S. Angst, M.D.^{1,†}, Gabriela K. Fragiadakis, B.A.^{2,3}, Brice Gaudillière, M.D., Ph.D.^{1,2}, Nima Aghaeepour, Ph.D.², and Garry P. Nolan, Ph.D.^{2,3}

¹Department of Anesthesiology, Perioperative and Pain Medicine, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA 94305, USA

²Baxter Laboratory in Stem Cell Biology, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305, USA

³Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305, USA

We appreciate the opportunity to respond to Dr. Laudanski's critical commentary. The key result of our study suggests that signaling activity of the Toll-like receptor 4 (TLR4) in a pre-surgical whole blood sample predicts the speed at which patients regain function of their operated hip.¹ We agree with Dr. Laudanski that NFκB is ubiquitous. However, our findings are related to specific signaling events downstream of TLR4, including MAPKAPK2, CREB, and rpS6, that occurred in a precisely phenotyped subset of monocytes.^{1,2} The detected signaling patterns were highly specific with respect to pathway and cell type, which diverges from Dr. Laudanski's view that "activation of the immune system is often non-specific". Our findings further highlight the sentinel role of TLR4 in detecting tissue damage and mediating sterile inflammation, and extend previous work by linking TLR4 activation patterns to patients' functional recovery.^{3,4} Functional recovery is at the very core of current ERAS (enhanced recovery after surgery) protocols, and delays of weeks, as reported by us and others, matter greatly to patients and health care providers.^{2,5,6} A blood test identifying patients at risk for delayed functional recovery is an important step toward providing individualized, effective, cost-conscious, and high-value care in the context of the perioperative surgical home.⁷ While we agree that the blood test used an external or "artificial" TLR4 ligand (LPS) that may not recapitulate biology as it unfolds during surgery, the use of LPS to activate a specific signaling pathway does not negate the predictive value of the test.

The scientific endeavor never stops and interesting results will always trigger the next set of important questions. While our strong correlative findings provide a link to relevant biology, we agree that they do not prove cause and effect - and we never in our report suggested such a relationship. This is the next obvious question that we need to address. The prospect of validating TLR4 as a therapeutic target is exciting in light of preclinical studies suggesting that preemptive dampening of TLR4 with a non-toxic agonist attenuated pro-inflammatory

[†]Address correspondence to: Martin S. Angst, Department of Anesthesia, Office S276, Grant Building, 300 Pasteur Drive, Stanford, CA 94305-5117, ang@stanford.edu, Telephone: (650)498-5109, Fax: (650)725-8052.

Competing interests

Dr. Nolan has a personal financial interest in Fluidigm (South San Francisco, California), the manufacturer of the mass cytometer used in this article. The other authors declare no competing interests.

events and enhanced host resistance to infection and survival in models of burn injury and systemic infection.^{8,9}

There is certainly important work ahead of us and room to improve on all fronts. However, our bets have been placed and we see a clear light at the end of the tunnel.

Acknowledgments

Funding disclosure

G.K.F. is supported by the Stanford Bio-X graduate research fellowship and the US National Institute of Health (T32GM007276). B.G. is supported by the US National Institute of Health (1K23GM111657-01, T32GM089626). N.A. is supported by an Ann Schreiber Mentored Investigator Award from the Ovarian Cancer Research Fund (OCRF 292495), a Canadian Institute of Health Research Postdoctoral Fellowship (CIHR 321510), and an International Society for Advancement of Cytometry Scholarship. This work was supported by grants from the US National Institutes of Health (NIH) (U19 AI057229, U54CA149145, N01-HV-00242, 1U19AI100627, 5R01AI07372405, R01CA184968, 1 R33 CA183654, R33 CA183692, 1R01GM10983601, 201303028, 1R01NS08953301), NIH-the Baylor Research Institute (41000411217), the NIH-Northrop Grumman Corp. (7500108142), the California Institute for Regenerative Medicine (CIRM) (DR1-01477), the US Department of Defense (OC110674), the European Commission (Health.2010.1.2-1), the US Food and Drug Administration (HHSF223201210194C), the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation (OPP 1017093, OPP1113682), the Alliance for Lupus Research, the Lymphoma Research Foundation, the Entertainment Industry Foundation (National Women's Cancer Research Alliance grant) and the Stanford Department of Anesthesiology, Perioperative and Pain Medicine.

References

1. Fragiadakis GK, Gaudilliere B, Ganio EA, Aghaeepour N, Tingle M, Nolan GP, Angst MS. Patient-specific Immune States before Surgery Are Strong Correlates of Surgical Recovery. *Anesthesiology*. 2015; 123:1241–55. [PubMed: 26655308]
2. Gaudilliere B, Fragiadakis GK, Bruggner RV, Nicolau M, Finck R, Tingle M, Silva J, Ganio EA, Yeh CG, Maloney WJ, Huddleston JI, Goodman SB, Davis MM, Bendall SC, Fantl WJ, Angst MS, Nolan GP. Clinical recovery from surgery correlates with single-cell immune signatures. *Sci Transl Med*. 2014; 6:255ra131.
3. Mollen KP, Anand RJ, Tsung A, Prince JM, Levy RM, Billiar TR. Emerging paradigm: toll-like receptor 4-sentinel for the detection of tissue damage. *Shock*. 2006; 26:430–7. [PubMed: 17047512]
4. Levy RM, Prince JM, Yang R, Mollen KP, Liao H, Watson GA, Fink MP, Vodovotz Y, Billiar TR. Systemic inflammation and remote organ damage following bilateral femur fracture requires Toll-like receptor 4. *Am J Physiol Regul Integr Comp Physiol*. 2006; 291:R970–6. [PubMed: 16675630]
5. Feldman LS, Lee L, Fiore J Jr. What outcomes are important in the assessment of Enhanced Recovery After Surgery (ERAS) pathways? *Can J Anaesth*. 2015; 62:120–30. [PubMed: 25391733]
6. Lee L, Dumitra T, Fiore JF Jr, Mayo NE, Feldman LS. How well are we measuring postoperative “recovery” after abdominal surgery? *Qual Life Res*. 2015
7. Vetter TR, Jones KA. Perioperative Surgical Home: Perspective II. *Anesthesiol Clin*. 2015; 33:771–84. [PubMed: 26610629]
8. Bohannon JK, Hernandez A, Enkhbaatar P, Adams WL, Sherwood ER. The immunobiology of toll-like receptor 4 agonists: from endotoxin tolerance to immunoadjuvants. *Shock*. 2013; 40:451–62. [PubMed: 23989337]
9. Romero CD, Varma TK, Hobbs JB, Reyes A, Driver B, Sherwood ER. The Toll-like receptor 4 agonist monophosphoryl lipid a augments innate host resistance to systemic bacterial infection. *Infect Immun*. 2011; 79:3576–87. [PubMed: 21646453]