

HHS Public Access

Author manuscript *JAMA Surg.* Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 December 21.

Published in final edited form as:

JAMA Surg. 2016 December 01; 151(12): 1183–1186. doi:10.1001/jamasurg.2016.2839.

Computer-Assisted Process Modeling to Enhance Intraoperative Safety in Cardiac Surgery

Christopher L. Tarola, MD, MPH, Jacquelyn A. Quin, MD, MPH, Miguel E. Haime, MD, Jennifer M. Gabany, MSN, Kristin B. Taylor, PA-C, Kay B. Leissner, MD, and Marco A. Zenati, MD, MSc

Harvard School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts (Tarola); Harvard Medical School, Boston, Massachusetts (Quin, Haime, Leissner, Zenati); Veterans Affairs Boston Healthcare System, West Roxbury, Massachusetts (Tarola, Quin, Haime, Gabany, Taylor, Leissner, Zenati).

The operating room is a common site for adverse events in the hospital, which are largely related to communication breakdowns and surgical flow disruptions leading to error cycles.¹⁻⁴ To reduce the rate of preventable adverse events and enhance patient safety, we present what is, to our knowledge, the first clinical use of the HUB,⁵ a computer-assisted system designed to support intraoperative team performance.

Methods

We designed a single-site, prospective pilot investigation to determine the feasibility of the HUB⁵ mobile workflow management system (3Si Systems LLC), which uses speech-recognition technology to support intraoperative team communication and adherence to best-practice guidelines. Based on prior audio recordings of 9 cardiac procedures, process models composed of major procedural steps were developed onto software and preloaded on the HUB preoperatively (Table). The HUB recognizes voice commands (derived from the audio recordings and specific to each team member) by key team members fitted with high-fidelity microphones (earpiece or clip-on) that correspond to procedural steps that initiate appropriate algorithms (**Figure,** A) or alert the team if inadvertently omitted (Figure, B).

Critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content: Quin, Haime, Taylor, Leissner, Zenati.

Corresponding Author: Christopher L. Tarola, MD, MPH, Veterans Affairs Boston Healthcare System, Division Cardiac Surgery, 1400 VFW Pkwy, Mail Code 112, West Roxbury, MA 02132 (christopher.tarola@londonhospitals.ca).

Author Contributions: Drs Tarola and Zenati had full access to all the data in the study and take responsibility for the integrity of the data and the accuracy of the data analysis.

Concept and design: Tarola, Haime, Leissner, Zenati.

Acquisition, analysis, or interpretation of data: All Authors.

Drafting of the manuscript: Tarola, Haime, Gabany, Zenati.

Statistical analysis: Tarola.

Obtaining funding: Zenati.

Administrative, technical, or material support: Haime, Gabany, Taylor, Leissner, Zenati.

Study supervision: Quin, Gabany, Zenati.

Conflict of Interest Disclosures: Dr Zenati is the inventor of the original intellectual property, the HUB System, a communication management system that is licensed by Harvard University to Surgical Safety Solutions LLC. Dr Zenati additionally owns founder's shares. No other disclosures are reported.

Additional Contributions: We thank Annette Phillips, RN, Veterans Affairs Boston Healthcare System, West Roxbury, Massachusetts, for her clerical assistance and Michael Grumbine of 3si Surgical Safety Solutions (http://www.3sisystems.com) for technical assistance in HUB operations. Neither party received financial compensation for their efforts.

Tarola et al.

Functionality of the HUB was tested between May 2015 and March 2016 during 5 procedures: minimally invasive coronary artery bypass grafting, 2 conventional coronary artery bypass graftings, aortic valve replacement/coronary artery bypass grafting, and isolated aortic valve replacement. The primary outcome measured was the qualitative ability of the HUB to distinguish commands from conversational speech. The study was approved by the Veterans Affairs Boston Healthcare System institutional review board, and all research participants provided written informed consent.

Results

The HUB system registered key surgical team members using the phrase "check-in [team member name]." Collectively, 62 major steps and 216 subtasks were tested in the procedural algorithms. All task phrases were distinguished from conversational speech and recorded appropriately by the HUB; however, 62 steps required repetition before system acknowledgment.

During the procedures, the potential for 3 errors occurred: 2 recommended surgical steps were omitted, and 1 communication loop was not closed. In each instance, the HUB appropriately displayed alerts, successfully prompting the surgical team to correct the errors.

Discussion

Surgical safety interventions often fail to account for the multidisciplinary nature of surgery. The HUB is designed to facilitate multidisciplinary team communication, recognize sentinel steps of high-consequence surgical procedures, and alert the operating room team to communication failures and procedural omissions. The feasibility test we present is encouraging and supports further intraoperative analysis of the HUB, particularly speech recognition, because standard Microsoft speech recognition software was used in this investigation and requires upgrade for a marketed system. Although false-step recognition did not occur in this investigation, future speech recognition software may use a command to prompt the system to distinguish commands directed toward the HUB from commands uttered in conversational speech. Furthermore, should an intraoperative complication occur, the HUB user can request a preloaded surgical checklist to assist with correcting the complication. This does not interfere with the procedure algorithm, although a pause function may be introduced.

Although we tested the HUB in cardiac surgery, HUB algorithms can be developed and applied across all surgical specialties. Unique algorithms can also be tailored for complex procedures involving multiple surgical teams, where communication is critical and susceptible to error. Each team member may check in and check out of the procedure at any time, provided their profile is uploaded to the system preoperatively. Although no final product cost can be estimated at this time, use of the HUB across multiple surgical specialties may reduce the additional cost per case.

Ultimately, surgical safety interventions endeavor to reduce morbidity and mortality. The logical next step is to apply the HUB to a larger series of cardiac surgical procedures to determine whether the HUB achieves this goal.

JAMA Surg. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 December 21.

References

- Wahr JA, Prager RL, Abernathy JH III, et al. American Heart Association Council on Cardiovascular Surgery and Anesthesia, Council on Cardiovascular and Stroke Nursing, and Council on Quality of Care and Outcomes Research. Patient safety in the cardiac operating room: human factors and teamwork: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association. Circulation. 2013; 128(10):1139–1169. [PubMed: 23918255]
- 2. Gurses AP, Kim G, Martinez EA, et al. Identifying and categorising patient safety hazards in cardiovascular operating rooms using an interdisciplinary approach: a multisite study. BMJ Qual Saf. 2012; 21(10):810–818.
- Wiegmann DA, ElBardissi AW, Dearani JA, Daly RC, Sundt TM III. Disruptions in surgical flow and their relationship to surgical errors: an exploratory investigation. Surgery. 2007; 142(5):658– 665. [PubMed: 17981185]
- 4. Allers JC, Hussein AA, Ahmad N, et al. Evaluation and impact of workflow interruptions during robot-assisted surgery. Urology. 2016; 92:33–37. [PubMed: 26966039]
- Conboy, HM.; Maron, JK.; Christov, SC., et al. Process modeling of aortic cannulation in cardiac surgery: towards a smart checklist to mitigate the risk of stroke. Presented at: MICCAI International Conference on Medical Image Computing and Computer-Assisted Intervention; Boston, MA. September 14, 2014;

Tarola et al.

SURGICAL SAFETY SOLUTION		10:28:03		
OR MARCO ZENATI		ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8		
		CANNULATION		00.05.29
			go on pump on pump	00:03:04
			on pump pump at full flow	36%
		STOP VENTILATION	come off ventilator ventilation off	01:29:14
		CROSS CLAMP AND CARDIOPLEGIA	ready for cross clamp cross clamp complete	
			cross clamp complete start grafts grafts complete	
			start pump wean pump off	
OR O RESTOPHER TAROL				
			verification complete start stemal closure stemal closure complete	
		DE-BRIEFING CHECKLIST	start sign out sign out complete	
			sign out complete	
HUB system aler	rt messag	e		
HUB system aler	rt message	e		
HUB system aler	rt messagi wstto	е SATURDAY, МАКМАР ОТ, 20 10:25:48	6	CAIL
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	rt messagi MS LLC	SATURDAY, JANUARY 09, 201	6 COMMANDS	CATT
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	ONS. LLC	SATURDAY, JAALUARY 09, 201 10:25:48	6 COMMANDS	
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	ONS: LLC] CASE: 022916	SATURDAY, MALAARY 09, 201 10:25:48 ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8	e COMMANDS	
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	ONS, ELC CASE: 02:29:16 00:11:02	SATURDAY, MARANY OF, 20 10:25:48 ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8 ☑ STERNOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING	6 COMMANDS	00.03:15
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	ONS, LLC CASE: 02:29:16 00:11:02 00:00:01	SATURCAY TANLING OF 20 1025:48 ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8 27 STERNOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING I HEPARINIZATION		00:03:15
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	CNUS. LLC) CASE: 02:29:16 00:11:02 00:00:01 00:40:01	ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI VB SOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI VB STENOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING HERABINIZATION	heparin ready act on target start pusestring carnulation ready	00.03:15
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	CNVS, LLC () CASE: 00:11:02 00:00:01 00:40:01 00:02:00	ISOLATED CABG ON FUMP - ZENATI V8 G STERNOTOW AND CONDUCT HARVESTING HEPARINZATION INITIAT CB	heparin ready act on larget start generating con on particular on partic	00:03:15
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	CNUS. LLC) CASE: 02:29:16 00:11:02 00:00:01 00:40:01	SOLATED CABG ON PUMP - 2ENATI V8 STENOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING HEMARINZATION MITLATE CP8 GROSS CLAMP AND CARDIOPLEGIA	hopenin mady set on larget start perioding gr on participant on participant ready for cross clamp ready for cross clamp	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	CNVS, LLC () CASE: 00:11:02 00:00:01 00:40:01 00:02:00	ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8 ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8 IS STERNOTOW AND CONDUIT HARVESTING CANNULATION CANNULATION CANNULATION CANNULATION ANNATOMOCOS	heparin ready act on larget start generating con on particular on partic	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
	2NIS. LLC 02:29:16 00:11:02 00:00:01 00:00:01 00:02:00 00:02:04 00:11:06	ISOLATED CAGG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8 STERNOTOW AND CONDUIT HARVESTING HEPARINIZATION CANNULATION DINTIATE CB CAROSS CLAMP AND CARDIOPLEGIA ANATOMOSS STERAM And Cardiotec Meanter	hopenin mady set on larget start perioding gr on participant on participant ready for cross clamp cross clamp complete	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
URGICAL SAFETY SOLUTIO	2NIS. LLC 02:29:16 00:11:02 00:00:01 00:00:01 00:02:00 00:02:04 00:11:06	ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8 STERNOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING GRANULATION GRANULATI	Negatin nashy sct on langet sant puractions gar on and gar on and ready sub-cost campo ready	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
	2NK5, LLC (229:16 00:00:01 00:00:01 00:00:01 00:00:00 00:02:04 00:01:01 00:11:06	LINEARC MANAGE OF AN 1022-48 ISOLATED CASE OF UMJP - ZENATI V8 STERNOTOW AND CONDUIT HARVESTING HEPARIUZATION INITIAT CES ROSS CLAMB AND CANDIOREGIA AMASTOMOSES SERMAL Administra Hapate	hopenin mady set on larget start perioding gr on participant on participant ready for cross clamp cross clamp complete	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
	CNS, LLC CASE: 029816 009000 000000 000000 000000 000000	ISOLATED CABG ON PUMP - ZENATI V8 STERNOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING GRANULATION GRANULATI	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
ANDREAC AS MET SOLUTION	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF	Negatin nashy sct on langet sant puractions gar on and gar on and ready sub-cost campo ready	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
ANDREAC AS MET SOLUTION	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 005000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 0050000 00500000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 0050000 00500000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
ANDREAC AS MET SOLUTION	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 0050000 00500000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
ANDREAC AS MET SOLUTION	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 0050000 00500000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
ANDREAC AS MET SOLUTION	CNNS, LLC (C29816 001102 0050001 0050200 00500 0050000 00500000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 0050000 00500000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	heparin ready act on langed care bayconings go on participant many for costs clarge costs clarge complete part and set and set of the set of th	00.03:15 00.00:50 7%
	CNUS, LLC CASE: 022915 0011.02 0050301 005030 005250 0041301 0041401 00414000 00410000000000	LOGATED CABO (VMUMP - ZENATI V8) STENDOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING HEANINZATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION AND CARDIOPLEGIA ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATION ANNATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONAT	Regards mody of an legat with representation of the analysis of the analysis	000375 000000 7% 020976
	CNUS, LLC CASE: 022915 0011.02 0050301 005030 005250 0041301 0041401 00414000 00410000000000	CONTRACT ADDATE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF THE DATE OF THE OF TH	Regards mody of an legat with representation of the analysis of the analysis	000315 00050 7% 0.07%
	CNUS, LLC CASE: 022915 0011.02 0050301 005030 005250 0041301 0041401 00414000 00410000000000	LOGATED CABO (VMUMP - ZENATI V8) STENDOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING HEANINZATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION AND CARDIOPLEGIA ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATION ANNATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONAT	Regards mody of an legat with representation of the analysis of the analysis	000375 000000 7% 020976
Alexandro Janet	CNUS, LLC CASE: 022915 0011.02 0050301 005030 005250 0041301 0041401 00414000 00410000000000	LOGATED CABO (VMUMP - ZENATI V8) STENDOTOMY AND CONDUIT HARVESTING HEANINZATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION AND CARDIOPLEGIA ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATION ANNATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATION ANNATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONATIONAT	Regards mody of an legat with representation of the analysis of the analysis	000375 000000 7% 020976

Figure 1. HUB System Display Screen

A, HUB system display screen demonstrating surgical team on left (highlighted if checked in), procedural algorithm in the center (highlighted if completed), and progress bar on right. B, Example of an alert message displayed by HUB system secondary to omitted step.

Table

Procedure Algorithm for Conventional Coronary Artery Bypass Grafting

Task	Subtask	Description	Start Command ^a	End Command ^{<i>a</i>,<i>b</i>}
1		Patient in the room	"Patient in the room"	NA
2		Preinduction checklist	"Start time-out"	NA
	2.1	Patient confirmation	NA	"Patient is confirmed"
	2.2	Preanesthesia check	NA	"Anesthesia checklist complete"
	2.3	Perfusion check	NA	"Pump checklist complete"
	2.4	Sponge/sharps/ instrument count	NA	"Instrument count complete"
3		Anesthesia induction	"Start induction"	"Induction complete"
4		Preincision time-out	"Incision time-out"	
	4.1	Confirm patient and procedure	NA	"Site and procedure confirmed"
	4.2	Surgeon review of operating plan	NA	"Review of operating plan"
	4.3	Anesthesia review of plan	NA	"Any anesthesia concerns?"
	4.4	Nursing review of plan	NA	"Any nursing concerns?"
	4.5	Prophylactic antibiotics	NA	"Antibiotic has been given"
5		Sternotomy and conduit harvesting	"Scalpel"	NA
	5.1 ^c	Sternotomy and ventilator off	"Sternal saw"	"Vent off"
	5.2 ^c	Turn ventilator on	"Vent back on"	"Vent on"
	5.3	Mammary artery harvest	NA	"LIMA retractor"
	5.4	Saphenous vein harvest	NA	"Vein ready"
6		Epiaortic scan	NA	"Epiaortic probe"
7		Heparinization	"Give heparin"	"Heparin given"
	7.1	Activated clotting time check	"ACT Check"	"ACT on target"
8		Cannulation	"Let's cannulate"	NA
	8.1	Arterial cannulation	NA	"Arterial cannula"
	8.2	Venous cannulation	NA	"Venous cannula"
	8.3	Antegrade cardioplegia	NA	"Antegrade cannula"
9 <i>c</i>		Initiate cardiopulmonary bypass	"Start bypass"	"Full flow"
10		Cross clamp and cardioplegia	"Cross clamp"	NA
	10.1 ^c	Turn flow down	"Flow down"	"Pump flow down"
	10.2 ^C	Cross clamp aorta	"Clamp on, flow up"	"Flow back up"
	10.3 ^c	Administer antegrade cardioplegia	"Start antegrade"	"Cardioplegia flowing"
11		Distal anastomoses	"Can I have the vein"	"Distals complete"
12		Proximal anastomoses	"Side-biting clamp"	"Proximals compete"

JAMA Surg. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 December 21.

Task	Subtask	Description	Start Command ^a	End Command ^{<i>a</i>,<i>b</i>}
13		Separation from cardiopulmonary bypass	"Wean pump"	NA
	13.1 ^c	Restart ventilation	"Restart vent"	"Vent on"
	13.2 ^c	Reduce pump flow	"Pump flow down"	"Half flow"
	13.3 ^c	Terminate bypass	"Come off pump"	"We are off pump"
	13.4	Check graft patency		"Graft check"
	13.5 ^c	Administer protamine	"Start protamine"	"Protamine is going in"
	13.6 ^c	Discontinue pump sucker	"Stop pump suckers"	"Pump suckers off"
14		Incision closure	"Start sternal closure"	NA
	14.1	Final instrument count	NA	"Instrument count correct"
	14.2	Check bleeding sites	NA	"Bleeding sites ok"
	14.3	Place chest tubes	NA	"Chest tubes"
	14.4	Skin closure	NA	"Skin closed"
15		Transfer patient to intensive care	NA	"Let's go to ICU"

Abbreviations: ACT, activated clotting time; ICU, intensive care unit; LIMA, left internal mammary artery; NA, not applicable.

 a All commands are derived from the natural operating language of the surgeons partaking in this study.

^bAn "End Command" can both initiate and end a phase or subtask. On completion of all "Subtasks," a "Task" is automatically ended.

^cIdentifies a step requiring confirmation from another team member (end command expected from anesthesia or perfusion).

JAMA Surg. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2016 December 21.