Update on the Basic Helix-Loop-Helix Transcription Factor Gene Family in *Arabidopsis thaliana*

Basic helix-loop-helix (bHLH) transcription factors represent a family of proteins that contain a bHLH domain, a motif involved in binding DNA. Recently, two groups independently analyzed the BHLH gene family of Arabidopsis thaliana (Heim et al., 2003; Toledo-Ortiz et al., 2003). These analyses revealed that this family is one of the largest transcription factor gene families in Arabidopsis thaliana. Although both analyses intended to give complete overviews of AtBHLH genes, some discrepancies were detected when the data sets were compared. After careful re-examination, we have resolved these discrepancies. In Table 1, we provide a uniform nomenclature for all of the genes that are mentioned in our two articles, and we encourage the use of this nomenclature in future reports concerning bHLH domain transcription factors (e.g., AtBHLH042/TT8).

Cross-referencing between the two data sets and further analysis have extended the total number of detected AtBHLH genes to 162 (Table 1). We assume that this count is very close to the final number of AtBHLH genes present in the Arabidopsis thaliana genome, but clearly, corrections or additions to the "complete" Arabidopsis thaliana genome sequence in the future still may cause this number to change. During examination and comparison of the data sets, we observed some common problems that contributed to the discrepancies. These problems arise commonly during the handling of large data sets and are discussed here to aid future attempts at gene family annotation. The main reasons for discrepancies were as follows.

(1) Differences between TIGR (www.tigr. org) or TAIR (www.arabidopsis.org) and MIPS (MAtDB; mips.gsf.de/projects/plants). Such differences are not easy to avoid, despite the best efforts of the database providers. Most problematic are differences in Arabidopsis Genome Initiative

Table 1.	. Summary of the AtBHLH Genes Detected						
Species ^a	Generic Name	AGI Gene Code	Entry Number ^ь	Synonym(s)	Accession Number ^c	Referenced	
At	BHLH001	At5g41315	31	GL3	AF246291	Payne et al., 2000	
At	BHLH002	At1g63650	30	EGL1/EGL3/AtMYC146	AF027732	Zhang et al., 2003	
At	BHLH003	At4g16430	34		AF251688		
At	BHLH004	At4g17880	37	AtMYC4	AF251689	Abe et al., 2003	
At	BHLH005	At5g46760	36	ATR2/AtMYC3	AF251690	Smolen et al., 2002	
At	BHLH006	At1g32640	38	AtMYC2/RAP1	X99548	Abe et al., 2003	
At	BHLH007	At1g03040	92		AF251692		
At	BHLH008	At1g09530	100	PIF3	AF251693	Ni et al., 1998	
At	BHLH009	At2g43010	102	PIF4	AF251694	Huq and Quail, 2002	
At	BHLH010	At2g31220	23		AF251695		
At	BHLH011	At4g36060	137		AF251696		
At	BHLH012	At4g00480	58	AtMYC1	AF251697	Urao et al., 1996	
At	BHLH013	At1g01260	39	Myc7E	AY120752	GenBank entrye	
At	BHLH014	At4g00870	33		AJ519812		
At	BHLH015	At2g20180	101	PIL5	AF488560	Yamashino et al., 2003	
At	BHLH016	At4g00050	108		AF488561		
At	BHLH017	At2g46510	35		AY094399		
At	BHLH018	At2g22750	28		AF488562		
At	BHLH019	At2g22760	26		AF488563		
At	BHLH020	At2g22770	27		AF488564		
At	BHLH021	At2g16910	48	AMS	AF488565	Sorensen et al., 2003	
At	BHLH022	At4g21330	49		NM_118253		
At		At4g28790	107		AF488566		
At		At4g36930	99	SPATULA	AF319540	Heisler et al., 2001	
At		At4g37850	29		AF488567		
At		At1g02340	68	HFR1	AF488568	Fairchild et al., 2000	
At		At4g29930	42		AF488569		
At		At5g46830	40		AF252636		
At		At2g28160	43		AF488570		
At		At1g68810	53		AY072161		
At		At1g59640	88	ZCW32	AB028232	GenBank entry ^e	
At		At3g25710	54		AF488571	,	
At		At1g12860	44		AF488572		
At		At3g23210			AF488573		
At		At5g57150	41		AF488574		
At		At5g51780	6		AF488575		
At		At3g50330			NM_114893		
At		At3g56970	8	ORG2	AF488576	Kang et al., 2003	
At		At3g56980	9	ORG3	AF488577	Kang et al., 2003	
At		At4g00120			AF488578		
At		At5g56960	51		NM_125078		
At		At4g09820	32	TT8	AJ277509	Nesi et al., 2000	
At		At5g09750			NM_121012	1001 01 01., 2000	
At		At1g18400	77	BEE1	AF488579	Friedrichsen et al., 2002	
At		At3g06120	20		AF488580	Theunonsen et al., 2002	
At		At5g08120			AF488581		
At		At3g47640					
		•			AF488582		
At	DHLHU48	At2g42300	97		AF488583		

<u>**The Plant Cell</u></u></u>**

Continued

(AGI) codes for the same gene between the different databases.

(2) Positions on pseudochromosomes that are not stable as a result of corrections in single BAC sequences that affect the entire area "downstream" of the corrected locus.

(3) BAC identifiers and BAC sequence coordinates that differ for the same gene when either the upper or the lower strand is considered. One option is to keep the gene orientation according to the direction of transcription; the other is to keep the original BAC sequence in its 5' to 3' arrangement. Clearly consistency is very important.

(4) Genes located at BAC borders that can result in either double entries of the same gene or failure to detect the gene as a result of the destruction of a continuous signature pattern.

(5) Sequence errors in the genome sequence that destroy open reading frames.

(6) Differences in the detailed definition of what constitutes a bHLH domain.

The Plant (

Both studies started with a subset of known bHLH domain transcription factors and used a consensus sequence described by Atchley et al. (1999) as a reference. However, whereas one analysis was based on bHLH proteins similar to Zea mays Sn (e.g., ZmR) that are involved in secondary metabolism and cell identity pathways (Heim et al., 2003), the other used a subset based on PHYTOCHROME-INTERACT-ING FACTOR3 (PIF3) as a starting point (Toledo-Ortiz et al., 2003). In addition, the set of databases used was not completely overlapping. Consequently, some genes were identified as encoding true bHLHs by one group but not by the other, and vice versa. These differences have been removed; there are now only two BHLH genes listed in Table 1 (AtBHLH136/At5g39860 and AtBHLH160/At1g71200) that fit the criteria of Heim et al. (2003) but not those of Toledo-Ortiz et al. (2003). A third article analyzing plant bHLH domain proteins ap-

	Generic	AGI Gene	Entry		Accession	
Species ^a	Name	Code	Number ^b	Synonym(s)	Number ^c	Reference ^d
At		At1g68920	82		AF488584	
At		At1g73830	76	BEE3	AF488585	Friedrichsen et al., 2002
At		At4g02590	93		AF488592	
At		At3g57800	91		AF488593	
At		At5g10570	46		AF488594	
At		At3g07340	85		AF488595	
At		At4g34530	84		AF488596	
At		At2g18300	79	-	AF488597	
At		At3g59060		PIL6	AF488598	Yamashino et al., 2003
At		At2g24260	95		AF488599	
At		At3g61950	11		AF488600	
At		At4g29100	60		AF488634	
At		At4g30980	94		AF488601	
At		At2g46810	13		AF488602	
At		At5g46690	17		AF488603	
At		At5g61270			AF488604	Deirai and Oradama an 000
At		At5g67110	98	ALCATRAZ	AF488605	Rajani and Sundaresan, 200
At		At1g10120	90 70		AF488606	
At		At1g25330	78		AF488607	
At		At1g26260	83		AF488608	
At		At3g23690	87 86		AF488609	
At At		At5g48560	86 81		AF488610	
At		At5g62610	71		AF488611	
At		At1g35460 At4g09180	72		AF488612 AF488613	
At		At5g58010	96		AF488614	
At		At1g66470			AF488615	
At		At2q14760	112		AJ577584	
At		At4g33880	115		AF488616	
At		At5g37800			NM_123139	
At		At3g21330			AF488617	
At		At5g67060			AF488618	
At		At1g06170	24		AF488619	
At		At1g10610	50		AF488620	
At		At2g31210	25		AJ519809	
At		At5g43650	22		AY065390	
At		At5g65640	47		AF488621	
At		At1g22490	16		AF488622	
At		At1g49770	21		AF488623	
At		At1g72210	15		AJ459771	
At		At3g24140	14		AF488624	
At		At5g53210	19		NM_124700	
At		At5q65320	18		AF488625	
At		At2g41240	7		AF488626	
At		At5g04150	10		AJ519810	
At		At1q69010			AF488627	
At		At4g21340	62		AY065362	
At		At4g14410			AF488628	
At		At5g54680			AF488629	
At		At2g41130	56		AY074639	
At		At3g56770	55		NM_115536	

BHLH108 At1g25310 132

59

66

BHLH109 At1g68240

BHLH110 At1g27660

BHLH111 At1g31050

At

At

At

At

Continued

NM 102341

NM_102531

AA395190

AJ577585

peared recently (Buck and Atchley, 2003) reporting $\sim\!118$ AtBHLH genes. Of these, 116 correspond to those listed in Table 1. The remaining two (At1g49830 and At5g33210) do not fit the criteria used for Table 1.

Search engines have been greatly improved in the last few years, but they still often are not exact enough to identify certain motifs. This is not necessarily the result of deficiencies in the search algorithms but may result from the structure of matrices that describe known motifs (e.g., AtBHLH125 spanned two separate BAC ends, and two separate predictions had to be fused). Even the continuous optimization of our bHLH domain matrix never resulted in the identification of all 162 AtBHLH genes in one search. Additionally, gene prediction tools are sometimes not flexible enough to respond to variable intron lengths and exon distribution (e.g., the prediction NM_105789 for AtBHLH160 contains an intron that causes an overestimate of the length of the loop structure). It sounds obvious, but it is worth emphasizing that cDNA sequences, even from reverse transcriptase-mediated PCR experiments, should be deposited in GenBank (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/) or EMBL (http://www.ebi.ac.uk/Databases/) even if the genomic sequence is already in the database, and the "metadata" of the database entry should be written with care. The most unambiguous identifier of any given gene (unless a sequence-identical duplication exists) is its DNA sequence, and only this information allows designations and identifier assignments to be checked and rechecked.

It is an interesting and critical point that even with a combination of all available BLAST (Basic Local Alignment Search Tool) tools, both groups were unable to obtain a full set of Arabidopsis bHLH domain transcription factors in their initial analyses. Both studies relied on BLAST search capabilities (TBLASTN and BLASTP) and subsequent evaluation of the hits for the respective bHLH consensus sequences. In addition, position-specific iterated BLAST was used by one of the two groups to identify remaining unidentified bHLH domain–encoding sequences. Nevertheless, several true BHLH

	(continued).							
Speciesª	Generic Name	AGI Gene Code	Entry Number ^ь	Synonym(s)	Accession Number ^c	Reference ^d		
At	BHLH112	At1g61660	64		AF488630			
At		At3g19500	61		AF488631			
٩t		At4g05170	65		NM_116756			
At		At1g51070	134		AF488632			
٩t		At3g26744	45	ICE1	AY079016	Chinnusamy et al., 2003		
٩t		At3g22100	140		NM_113106			
At		At4g25400	5		NM 118672			
At		At4g28811	104		AJ519811			
At		At5g51790	4		NM_124558			
٨t		At3q19860	138		AF488633			
At		At1g51140	70		AY063120			
At		At3g20640	63		AU238908			
At		At2g46970		PIL1	AB090873	Yamashino et al., 2003		
۰۰ ۸t		At1g62975	2		AF506369			
At		At4g25410	3		Z46563			
Nt .		At4g28815	5		AJ577586			
Nt .		At1g05805	74		AY045907			
At .		At2g43140	73		AU237473			
At .		At2g42280	69		NM_129790			
Nt .		At4g38071	00		AJ577587			
Nt .		At3g62090	111	PIL2	AB090874	Yamashino et al., 2003		
Nt .		At2q20095			AJ577588			
Nt .		At5g15160	52		AK118887			
Nt .		At1g74500	67		AY088286			
Nt .		At5g39860	01		AY088246			
Nt .		At5g50915	89		AY087602			
Nt .		At2g31215			NM_179830			
Nt .		At5g43175	116		NM_148080			
۰۰ ۸t		At5g01310			NM_120209			
At		At5g38860			NM_123247			
At .		At5g64340			AY062561			
۰۰ ۸t		At5g09460			BT000009			
At .		At1g29950			AF361607			
۰۰ ۸t		At5g50010			BT005301			
۰۰ ۸t		At4g30180			AU237244			
Nt .		At3g17100			NM_180270			
Nt .		At3g06590			NM_111535			
Nt .		At1g09250			BT003052			
۰۰ ۸t		At3g05800			NM_111454			
At .		At2g47270			NM_130295			
At .		At1g22380			NM_102088			
At .		At1g05710			AJ576040			
At .		At2g31730			AJ576040 AJ576041			
nt.		At2g31730 At2g31280			AJ576041 AJ576042			
Nt.		At2g27230			AJ576042 AJ576043			
At		At1g64625			AJ576043 AJ576044			
At		At2g43060			AJ576044 AJ576045			
At		At4g30410			AJ576045 AJ576046			
At		At1g71200			NM 105789			
AL At		0			-			
		At3g47710			NM_114639			

^a The prefix At indicates Arabidopsis thaliana (see text).

^bBHLH "entry numbers" (Toledo-Ortiz et al., 2003).

^c GenBank accession number of the cDNA sequence representing the open reading frame used to evaluate the presence or absence of a proper bHLH domain signature.

^dReferences for the synonyms that are used in the literature.

e The synonym was found only in a GenBank entry but not in an article.

genes were not detected. Some of these initial false negatives were found by searching for the term "helix-loop-helix" in the annotation databases (e.g., AtBHLH134 and AtBHLH136). However, this search also resulted in many false positives that had to be excluded as a result of misannotations based on weak homology or of "inherited misannotation," in which a single wrong annotation text had been used as a reference during annotation. In essence, we were unable to detect slightly divergent or mispredicted BHLH genes. The only solution to this problem may involve systematic annotation by expert annotators, comprehensive EST data production from normalized libraries, and the generation of full-length cDNA at least for proteincoding gene sequences. A significant part of the improvement of the data set presented in Table 1 is based on the reannotation of the Arabidopsis genome by the TIGR group, which followed this approach.

We were able to improve gene annotation further by comparing closely related BHLH genes for their exon/intron structures. This powerful similarity-based approach (used here within a single species) led to the correction of some gene annotations and, consequently, to a further increase in the total number of AtBHLH genes detected. Several of the genes that escaped the initial screens by both groups contain short introns in the region that encodes the loop of the HLH region. These comparably short introns, and also short exons that are part of the bHLH open reading frame, resulted in mispredictions that were a significant cause of false negatives in our initial analyses. One example is AtBHLH160, for which we found a formerly unpredicted intron after comparison with the most closely related genes AtBHLH038/ORG2, AtBHLH039/ ORG3, AtBHLH100, and AtBHLH101.

The combined effort of our two groups and the lessons we have learned from the comparison of the two data sets have resulted in an (almost) complete view of the *AtBHLH* transcription factor gene family, now provided with unambiguous generic names and reference to synonyms. We hope that this work will serve as a solid foundation for further investigations into the functions of the different members of this interesting gene family in plants.

Paul C. Bailey and Cathie Martin John Innes Centre Colney Lane NR4 7UH Norwich, UK

Gabriela Toledo-Ortiz and Peter H. Quail Department of Plant and Microbial Biology University of California Berkeley, CA 94720 and United States Department of Agriculture Agricultural Research Service Plant Gene Expression Center Albany, CA 94710

> Enamul Huq Section of Molecular Cell and Developmental Biology University of Texas 1 University Station, A6700 Austin, TX 78712

Marc A. Heim, Marc Jakoby, and Martin Werber Max-Planck-Institute for Plant Breeding Research, 50829 Köln, Germany

Bernd Weisshaar Institute for Genome Research, Bielefeld University, 33594 Bielefeld, Germany

REFERENCES

- Abe, H., Urao, T., Ito, T., Seki, M., Shinozaki, K., and Yamaguchi-Shinozaki, K. (2003). Arabidopsis AtMYC2 (bHLH) and AtMYB2 (MYB) function as transcriptional activators in abscisic acid signaling. Plant Cell 15, 63–78.
- Atchley, W.R., Terhalle, W., and Dress, A. (1999). Positional dependence, cliques, and predictive motifs in the bHLH protein domain. J. Mol. Evol. 48, 501–516.
- Buck, M.J., and Atchley, W.R. (2003). Phylogenetic analysis of plant basic helix-loop-helix proteins. J. Mol. Evol. 56, 742–750.
- Chinnusamy, V., Ohta, M., Kanrar, S., Lee,

B.H., Hong, X., Agarwal, M., and Zhu, J.K. (2003). ICE1: A regulator of cold-induced transcriptome and freezing tolerance in Arabidopsis. Genes Dev. **17**, 1043–1054.

- Fairchild, C.D., Schumaker, M.A., and Quail, P.H. (2000). HFR1 encodes an atypical bHLH protein that acts in phytochrome A signal transduction. Genes Dev. **14**, 2377–2391.
- Friedrichsen, D.M., Nemhauser, J., Muramitsu, T., Maloof, J.N., Alonso, J., Ecker, J.R., Furuya, M., and Chory, J. (2002). Three redundant brassinosteroid early response genes encode putative bHLH transcription factors required for normal growth. Genetics 162, 1445–1456.
- Heim, M.A., Jakoby, M., Werber, M., Martin,
 C., Weisshaar, B., and Bailey, P.C. (2003).
 The basic helix-loop-helix transcription factor family in plants: A genome-wide study of protein structure and functional diversity. Mol. Biol. Evol. 20, 735–747.
- Heisler, M.G., Atkinson, A., Bylstra, Y.H., Walsh, R., and Smyth, D.R. (2001). SPAT-ULA, a gene that controls development of carpel margin tissues in Arabidopsis, encodes a bHLH protein. Development 128, 1089–1098.
- Huq, E., and Quail, P.H. (2002). PIF4, a phytochrome-interacting bHLH factor, functions as a negative regulator of phytochrome B signaling in Arabidopsis. EMBO J. 21, 2441– 2450.
- Kang, H.G., Foley, R.C., Onate-Sanchez, L., Lin, C., and Singh, K.B. (2003). Target genes for OBP3, a Dof transcription factor, include novel basic helix-loop-helix domain proteins inducible by salicylic acid. Plant J. 35, 362–372.
- Nesi, N., Debeaujon, I., Jond, C., Pelletier, G., Caboche, M., and Lepiniec, L. (2000). The TT8 gene encodes a basic helix-loop-helix domain protein required for expression of DFR and BAN genes in Arabidopsis siliques. Plant Cell **12**, 1863–1878.
- Ni, M., Tepperman, J.M., and Quail, P.H. (1998). PIF3, a phytochrome-interacting factor necessary for normal photoinduced signal transduction, is a novel basic helix-loop-helix protein. Cell 95, 657–667.
- Payne, C.T., Zhang, F., and Lloyd, A.M. (2000). GL3 encodes a bHLH protein that regulates trichome development in Arabidopsis through interaction with GL1 and TTG1. Genetics **156**, 1349–1362.
- Rajani, S., and Sundaresan, V. (2001). The Arabidopsis myc/bHLH gene ALCATRAZ enables cell separation in fruit dehiscence. Curr. Biol. 11, 1914–1922.

- Smolen, G.A., Pawlowski, L., Wilensky, S.E., and Bender, J. (2002). Dominant alleles of the basic helix-loop-helix transcription factor ATR2 activate stress-responsive genes in Arabidopsis. Genetics 161, 1235–1246.
- Sorensen, A.M., Krober, S., Unte, U.S., Huijser, P., Dekker, K., and Saedler, H. (2003). The Arabidopsis ABORTED MICROSPORES (AMS) gene encodes a MYC class transcription factor. Plant J. 33, 413–423.
- **Toledo-Ortiz, G., Huq, E., and Quail, P.H.** (2003). The Arabidopsis basic/helix-loop-helix transcription factor family. Plant Cell **15,** 1749–1770.
- Urao, T., Yamaguchi-Shinozaki, K., Mitsukawa, N., Shibata, D., and Shinozaki, K. (1996). Molecular cloning and characterization of a gene that encodes a MYC-related protein in Arabidopsis. Plant Mol. Biol. **32**, 571–576.

Yamashino, T., Matsushika, A., Fujimori, T.,

- Sato, S., Kato, T., Tabata, S., and Mizuno, T. (2003). A link between circadian-controlled bHLH factors and the APRR1/TOC1 quintet in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. Plant Cell Physiol. **44**, 619–629.
- Zhang, F., Gonzalez, A., Zhao, M., Payne, C.T., and Lloyd, A.M. (2003). A network of redundant bHLH proteins functions in all TTG1dependent pathways of Arabidopsis. Development 130, 4859–4869.