

Carbon Dioxide Compensation Points of Flowering Plants¹

Received for publication November 27, 1973 and in revised form March 25, 1975

EUGENE G. KRENZER JR.,² DALE N. MOSS, AND R. KENT CROOKSTON

Department of Agronomy and Plant Genetics, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, Minnesota 55108

ABSTRACT

Carbon dioxide compensation points of several hundred species of monocotyledons and dicotyledons have been measured during the course of various experiments in our laboratory over a period of several years. These have been classified into two groups: high, compensation points of 40 $\mu\text{l/l}$ or greater; and low, compensation points of 10 $\mu\text{l/l}$ or less. They are listed alphabetically both by families and species for monocotyledons and dicotyledons. Only two species did not unequivocally fit into the above established groups. These were *Moricandia arvensis* (L.) DC., which had an average compensation point of 26 $\mu\text{l/l}$ and *Panicum milioides* Nees ex Trin., which was variable, but most often equilibrated between 12 to 20 $\mu\text{l/l}$ CO₂.

Since the discovery of the C₄-dicarboxylic acid (C₄) pathway for CO₂ fixation in higher plants (13, 17), there has been much interest in the distribution of the C₄ pathway in the plant kingdom. Species which have the C₄ pathway have CO₂ compensation points near 0 $\mu\text{l/l}$ CO₂ in contrast to the Γ^3 of near 50 $\mu\text{l/l}$ CO₂ for species which operate via the Calvin (C₃) cycle (8, 13, 18-20). CO₂ compensation points can be measured relatively easily; thus, they have provided a convenient means of classifying species for CO₂ fixation pathway. During the course of experiments extending over several years, we have made measurements of Γ on several hundred species. In response to numerous inquiries about specific species, we have prepared this manuscript listing all species on which we have made measurements of Γ .

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Seed for many of the grass species were obtained from United States Department of Agriculture Plant Introduction Stations and other locations as specified in Table I. Some of the dicotyledon species were collected locally; others were obtained from greenhouses operated by other departments at the University of Minnesota or were obtained from various botanical gardens and seed companies. These numerous sources for the dicotyledons have not been identified in Table II.

To determine Γ , a healthy, fully expanded leaf was excised under air-free water and placed in a glass test tube held vertically with the leaf base in about 5 ml of air-free water. This tube was placed in a closed circuit consisting of an air-cir-

culating pump, a drying column, and an infrared gas analyzer. Either copper or glass tubing was used to join the components of the circuit. The tube was illuminated by 150-w incandescent lamps filtered by a least 10 cm of water. To maintain a constant leaf temperature the tube containing the leaf was submerged in a water bath. The water bath temperature differed somewhat for different experiments, ranging from 23 to 30 C, which affected the Γ of the C₃ species, but had little effect on the Γ of C₄ species.

In many experiments, air was circulated through the closed system containing the illuminated leaf until the CO₂ concentration in the air came to equilibrium. This equilibrium concentration was taken as Γ . Since the rate of change approached zero as the concentration of CO₂ in the closed system approached Γ , it often took 1 hr or more before an equilibrium was reached. Some of the results reported herein were obtained during surveys of several hundred species (4, 18). Often in those experiments, the absolute Γ was not determined; rather, to conserve time, measurements were discontinued when the concentration of CO₂ in the system came near to equilibrium. Therefore, if the rate of change of CO₂ in the system had slowed and the CO₂ concentration was less than 10 $\mu\text{l/l}$, the species was classified as low, and if it was greater than 40 $\mu\text{l/l}$, it was classified as high. Such measurements could be made in about 10 min.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Tables I and II list the monocotyledons and dicotyledons, respectively, on which Γ measurements were made in this study, with each species classified as high (40 $\mu\text{l/l}$ or greater) or low (10 $\mu\text{l/l}$ or less).

Carbon dioxide compensation points have been reported in the literature for nearly 200 species in addition to those listed in Tables I and II. Table III summarizes these according to family and gives the reference where the information on individual species can be found.

Several workers have reported species with Γ between 10 and 40 $\mu\text{l/l}$ (2, 12, 14). Chen *et al.* (2) found several species to have intermediate Γ , between 10 and 40 $\mu\text{l/l}$. Three of these were *Helianthus annuus* L., *Datura stramonium* L., and an *Ipomea* species which had Γ of 26, 26, and 28 $\mu\text{l/l}$ CO₂, respectively. In repeated measurements at 29 C, Γ of 55 and 56 $\mu\text{l/l}$ have been found in our laboratory for *Helianthus annuus* L. and *Datura stramonium* L. and 53 $\mu\text{l/l}$ for *Ipomea aquatica* Forsk. Goldsworthy and Day (12) found *Lycopersicon esculentum* Mill. to have a Γ of 33 $\mu\text{l/l}$ and it was 52 in our experiments. Heichel and Musgrave (14) have reported values of 9 to 26 $\mu\text{l/l}$ for Γ of different maize genotypes. In a survey of 114 maize genotypes including many common to Heichel and Musgrave's experiment, we found a mean Γ of 1.3 $\mu\text{l/l}$ with a standard deviation of 1.2 $\mu\text{l/l}$ (21). The reason for differences between our results and those of others is unknown. We found remarkably little variation for Γ within a species, or for that matter, among high compensating species

¹ Minnesota Agricultural Experiment Station Journal Series No. 8496.

² Present address: Agriculture Extension Service, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, N.C. 27607.

³ Abbreviation: Γ : CO₂ compensation points.

Table I. *Classification of CO₂ Compensation Points of Monocotyledoneae*TABLE I.—*Continued*

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴	Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
Amryllidaceae				A. rigidum Beauv.			
Agave americana L.	GH		H	A. scabriglume (Hack.) Parodi	WR	238225	H
Commelinaceae				A. semicostatum (Steud.) Nees ex Boiss.			
Zebrina pendula Schnizl.	GH		H	A. sibiricum (Willd.) Beauv.	NC	269862	H
Cyperaceae				A. smithii Rydb.			
Cyperus alternifolius L.	GH		H	A. spicatum (Pursh) Scribn. & Smith	WR	232123	H
C. esculentus L.	GH		L	A. striatum (Steud.) P. Candargy	NC	207452	H
C. papyrus L.	GH		L	A. subulatum R. & S.	WR	204379	H
Gramineae				A. tenerum Vasey			
Aegilops caudata L.	NC	219868	H	A. trichophorum (Link) Richt.	NC	206253	H
A. columnaris Zhuk.	NC	170192	H	A. violaceum Vasey	WR	276712	H
A. crassa Boiss.	NC	219958	H	Agrostis alba L.	LO		H
A. cylindrica Host.	NC	172358	H	A. hyemalis (Walt.) B.S.P.	LO		H
A. heldreichii Holzm.	NC	221899	H	Alopecurus pratensis L.	VS		H
A. ligustica (Savign.) Coss.	NC	170203	H	Andropogon cirratus Hack.	SR	216107	L
A. speltoides Tausch.	NC	219867	H	A. condensatus H.B. & K.	SR	203595	L
A. squarrosa L.	NC	220326	H	A. gerardi Vitman	VS		L
A. triaristata Willd.	NC	170194	H	A. hassleri Hack.	SR	203721	L
A. triuncialis L.	NC	170197	H	A. hirtiflorus (Nees) Kunth	SR	228507	L
A. umbellulata Zhuk.	NC	116294	H	A. lateralis Nees	SR	309932	L
Agropyron acutum R. & S.	NC	202727	H	A. papillosus Hochst. ex A. Rich.	SR	221427	L
A. buonapartis Th. Dur. & Schinz	NC	219970	H	A. selloanus Hack.	SR	283001	L
A. campestre Godr. & Gren.	WR	276708	H	A. ternatus Nees	SR	283002	L
A. cristatum (L.) Gaertn.	NC	229574	H	A. virgatus Desv.	SR	309935	L
A. desertorum (Fisch.) Schult.	NC	249143	H	Antheophora pubescens Nees	SR	208282	L
A. elongatiforme Drobov	NC	207451	H	Arrhenatherum elatius (L.) Presl	NC	251946	H
A. elongatum Host ex Beauv.	NC	98526	H	Arthraxon hispidus (Thunb.) Makino	SR	225986	L
A. glaucum R. & S.	WR	302828	H	Arundinella hirta L.	SR	263693	L
A. inerme (Scribn. & Smith) Rydb.	WR	236668	H	Avena abyssinica Hochst. ex A. Rich.	GH		H
A. intermedium (Host) Beauv.	WR	172688	H	A. barbata Brot.	GH		H
A. junceum (L.) Beauv.	WR	276566	H	A. clauda Dur. in Duch.	GH		H
A. kosanini Nabelek	NC	237636	H	A. fatua L.	SR	202673	H
A. latiglume (Scribn. & Smith) Rydb.	WR	232117	H	A. longiglumis Dur. in Duch.	GH		H
A. leptourum (Nevski) Grossheim	WR	229520	H	A. pilosa Bieb.	GH		H
A. littorale Dum.	WR	277185	H	A. sativa L.	LO		H
A. lolioides (Karel. & Kir.)	NC	223325	H	A. sterilis L.	GH		H
A. obtusiusculum Lange P. Candargy	NC	261099	H	A. strigosa Schreb.	GH		H
A. orientale R. & S.	NC	219963	H	A. ventricosa Balansa	GH		H
A. panormitanum Parl. ex Boiss.	NC	197569	H	Bothriochloa alta (Hitchcock) Henrard	SR	204128	L
A. pectiniforme R. & S.	NC	273734	H	B. barbinodis Herter	SR	216060	L
A. pseudorepens Scribn. & Smith	WR	236676	H	B. decipiens (Hackel) C.E. Hubb.	SR	239152	L
A. pungens (Pers.) R. & S.	NC	229674	H	B. ewartiana (Domin) C.E. Hubb.	SR	283004	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>B. glabra</i> (Roxb.) A. Camus	SR	209168	L
<i>B. insculpta</i> (Hochst.) A. Camus	SR	207977	L
<i>B. intermedia</i> (R. Br.) A. Camus	SR	173636	L
<i>B. ischaemum</i> (L.) Keng	SR	172373	L
<i>B. laguroides</i> (DC.) Herter	SR	283006	L
<i>B. pertusa</i> (Willd.) A. Camus	SR	212802	L
<i>B. springfieldii</i> (Gould) L. Parodi	SR	216163	L
<i>Bouteloua curtispindula</i> (Michx.) Torr.	SR	216219	L
<i>B. filiformis</i> (Fourn.) Griffiths	SR	255233	L
<i>B. hirsuta</i> Lag.	SR	255232	L
<i>Brachiaria erucaeformis</i> (J.E. Smith) Griseb.	SR	151838	L
<i>B. laeta</i> (Mez) A. Camus	SR	238236	L
<i>B. ramosa</i> Stapf	SR	180484	L
<i>Bromus biebersteinii</i> R. & S.	NC	172390	H
<i>B. catharticus</i> Vahl	VS		H
<i>B. inermis</i> Leyss.	LO		H
<i>B. rigidus</i> Roth	VS		H
<i>B. tectorum</i> L.	GH		H
<i>Buchloe dactyloides</i> (Nutt.) Engelm.	VS		L
<i>Calamagrostis canadensis</i> (Michx.) Beauv.	LO		H
<i>Cenchrus biflorus</i> Roxb.	SR	215637	L
<i>C. ciliaris</i> L.	SR	299513	L
<i>C. myosuroides</i> H.B. & K.	SR	216375	L
<i>C. pauciflorus</i> Benth.	VS		L
<i>C. pilosus</i> H.B. & K.	VS		L
<i>C. setigerus</i> Vahl	SR	193444	L
<i>Chloris acicularis</i> Lind. L. in Mitch.	SR	238258	L
<i>C. argentina</i> (Hack.) Lillo & Parodi	SR	309959	L
<i>C. canterai</i> Arech.	SR	202366	L
<i>C. caribaea</i> Spreng.	SR	203626	L
<i>C. distichophylla</i> Lag.	SR	162637	L
<i>C. gayana</i> Kunth	SR	151008	L
<i>C. inflata</i> Link	SR	233832	L
<i>C. pectinata</i> Benth.	SR	238260	L
<i>C. petraea</i> Sw.	SR	204168	L
<i>C. pilosa</i> Schum. & Thonn.	SR	212386	L
<i>C. polydactyla</i> (L.) Sw.	SR	309963	L
<i>C. pycnothrix</i> Trin.	SR	194312	L
<i>C. radiata</i> (L.) Sw.	SR	309970	L
<i>C. submutica</i> H.B. & K.	SR	216386	L
<i>C. truncata</i> R. Br.	SR	212389	L
<i>C. uliginosa</i> Hack.	SR	203625	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>Chrysopogon montanus</i> Trin.	SR	196210	L
<i>C. serrulatus</i> Trin.	SR	219580	L
<i>Coelorachis cimicina</i> (L.) Nees ex Jacks.	SR	206330	L
<i>C. selloana</i> (Hack.) A. Camus	SR	309987	L
<i>Cymbopogon martini</i> (Roxb.) W. Watson	SR	279582	L
<i>Cynodon arcuatus</i> F. & C. Presl	SR	287135	L
<i>C. dactylon</i> (L.) Pers.	SR	251809	L
<i>Dactylis glomerata</i> L.	GH		H
<i>Dactyloctenium aegyptiacum</i> Willd.	SR	215592	L
<i>Danthonia montevidensis</i> Hack. & Arech.	WR	284681	H
<i>D. pilosa</i> R. Br.	WR	212237	H
<i>Deschampsia caespitosa</i> (L.) Beauv.	WR	250961	H
<i>Dichanthium annulatum</i> Stapf	SR	180804	L
<i>D. sericeum</i> A. Camus	SR	213880	L
<i>D. superciliatum</i> A. Camus	SR	238285	L
<i>Digitaria adscendens</i> Henrard	SR	260639	L
<i>D. argyrograpta</i> Stapf	SR	198578	L
<i>D. bicornis</i> R. & S. ex Loud.	SR	175134	L
<i>D. brownei</i> Hughes	SR	238286	L
<i>D. diagonalis</i> Stapf	SR	209234	L
<i>D. eriantha</i> Steud.	SR	153403	L
<i>D. eriostachya</i> Mez	SR	204178	L
<i>D. gazensis</i> Rendle	Sr	258431	L
<i>D. glauca</i> Stent	SR	208379	L
<i>D. horizontalis</i> Willd.	SR	204179	L
<i>D. iburua</i> Stapf	SR	238288	L
<i>D. ischaemum</i> (Schreb.) Schreb. ex Muhl.	SR	196213	L
<i>D. kilimandscharica</i> Mez	SR	196343	L
<i>D. milaniana</i> Stapf	SR	299061	L
<i>D. pentzii</i> Stent	SR	196346	L
<i>D. phaeothrix</i> Parodi	SR	162674	L
<i>D. sanguinalis</i> (L.) Scop.	LO		L
<i>D. seriata</i> Stapf	SR	208925	L
<i>D. smutsii</i> Stent	SR	208928	L
<i>D. swazilandensis</i> Stent	SR	238290	L
<i>D. valida</i> Stent	SR	196342	L
<i>Echinochloa crusgalli</i> (L.) Beauv.	NC	173754	L
<i>E. frumentacea</i> (Roxb.) W. F. Wight	NC	183332	L
<i>E. haploclada</i> Stapf	NC	226065	L
<i>E. holubii</i> Stapf	SR	207924	L
<i>E. pyramidalis</i> Hitchc. & Chase	NC	256044	L
<i>E. spiralis</i> Vasinger	NC	250392	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>Ehrharta calycina</i> J.E. Smith	WR	208290	H
<i>E. longiflora</i> Sm.	WR	208941	H
<i>Eleusine compressa</i> Aschers. & Schweinf. ex Christensen			
	SR	275326	L
<i>E. coracana</i> (L.) Gaertn.	SR	205130	L
<i>E. flagellifera</i> Nees	SR	245371	L
<i>E. floccifolia</i> Spreng.	SR	196853	L
<i>E. indica</i> (L.) Gaertn.	SR	226270	L
<i>E. jaegeri</i> Pilger	SR	273888	L
<i>E. multiflora</i> Hochst.	SR	226067	L
<i>E. tristachya</i> (Lam.) Lam.	SR	203641	L
<i>Elymus agropyroides</i> Presl	WR	202147	H
<i>E. angustus</i> Trin. ex. Ledeb.	WR	271893	H
<i>E. antarcticus</i> Hook.	WR	286201	H
<i>E. arenarius</i> L.	WR	272126	H
<i>E. canadensis</i> L.	WR	232249	H
<i>E. carolinianus</i> Walt.	WR	272130	H
<i>E. cinereus</i> Scribn. & Merr.	WR	232252	H
<i>E. crinitus</i> Schreb.	WR	204577	H
<i>E. dahuricus</i> Turcz.	WR	221900	H
<i>E. glaucus</i> Buckl.	WR	232256	H
<i>E. innovatus</i> Beal	WR	232282	H
<i>E. junceus</i> Fisch.	WR	75737	H
<i>E. paboanus</i> Claus	WR	272135	H
<i>E. virginicus</i> L.	WR	272137	H
<i>Eragrostis acutiflora</i> Nees	WR	204196	L
<i>E. acutiglumis</i> Parodi	WR	203644	L
<i>E. airoides</i> Nees	WR	203656	L
<i>E. atherstonei</i> Stapf	WR	295687	L
<i>E. bahiensis</i> Schrad.	WR	203646	L
<i>E. bicolor</i> Nees	WR	190310	L
<i>E. brasiliensis</i> Nees	WR	203725	L
<i>E. chalcantha</i> Trin.	WR	276035	L
<i>E. chariis</i> (Schult.) Hitchc.	WR	217616	L
<i>E. chloromelas</i> Steud.	WR	156047	L
<i>E. cilianensis</i> (All.) Lutati	WR	202373	L
<i>E. collocarpa</i> K. Schum. ex Engl.	WR	209384	L
<i>E. curvula</i> (Schrad.) Nees	WR	156051	L
<i>E. denudata</i> Hack. ex Schinz	WR	208229	L
<i>E. dielsii</i> Pilg. ex Diels & Pritz.	WR	238301	L
<i>E. diffusa</i> Buckl.	WR	216408	L
<i>E. ferruginea</i> Beauv.	WR	295695	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>E. flaccida</i> Lindm.	WR	203649	L
<i>E. gummiiflua</i> Nees	WR	299931	L
<i>E. heteromera</i> Stapf	WR	208129	L
<i>E. horizontalis</i> Peter	WR	299934	L
<i>E. intermedia</i> Hitchc.	WR	216398	L
<i>E. lappula</i> Nees	WR	209187	L
<i>E. lehmanniana</i> Nees	WR	203350	L
<i>E. margaritacea</i> Stapf	WR	208131	L
<i>E. mexicana</i> (Hornem.) Link	WR	216414	L
<i>E. nigra</i> Nees ex Steud.	WR	217610	L
<i>E. obtusa</i> Munro	WR	208166	L
<i>E. oxylepis</i> (Torr.) Torr.	WR	295692	L
<i>E. papposa</i> Steud.	WR	219589	L
<i>E. patentissima</i> Hack. ex Schinz	WR	299949	L
<i>E. plana</i> Nees	WR	208293	L
<i>E. poaeoides</i> Beauv. ex R. & S.	WR	180835	L
<i>E. polytricha</i> Nees	WR	202443	L
<i>E. rigidior</i> Pilger	WR	209188	L
<i>E. robusta</i> Stent	WR	207951	L
<i>E. rufescens</i> R. & S.	WR	164024	L
<i>E. secundiflora</i> Presl	WR	216405	L
<i>E. starosselskyi</i> Grossheim	WR	211029	L
<i>E. stenophylla</i> Hochst.	WR	213255	L
<i>E. superba</i> Peyr.	WR	156049	L
<i>E. tremula</i> Hochst.	WR	220220	L
<i>E. trichodes</i> (Nutt.) Wood	WR	276056	L
<i>E. truncata</i> Hack.	WR	299962	L
<i>E. unioloides</i> (Retz.) Nees	WR	217615	L
<i>E. virescens</i> Presl	WR	203652	L
<i>Eremopyrum buonapartis</i> (Spreng.) Nevski	NC	219962	H
<i>E. distans</i> (K. Koch) Nevski	NC	193264	H
<i>E. orientale</i> Jaub. & Spach	NC	220568	H
<i>Euchlaena mexicana</i> Schrad.	NC	162704	L
<i>Festuca megalura</i> Nutt.	LO		H
<i>F. rubra</i> L.	LO		H
<i>Helictotrichon hookeri</i> (Scribn.) Henr.	NC	234878	H
<i>Heteropogon contortus</i> Beauv. ex R. & S.	SR	213517	L
<i>Hordeum bogdani</i> Wilensky	WR	269406	H
<i>H. brevisubulatum</i> Link	WR	229447	H
<i>H. bulbosum</i> L.	NC	204579	H
<i>H. comosum</i> Presl	WR	264405	H
<i>H. compressum</i> Griseb.	WR	283380	H

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>H. hystrix</i> Roth	NC	203462	H
<i>H. jubatum</i> L.	NC	234683	H
<i>H. marinum</i> Huds.	NC	223324	H
<i>H. spontaneum</i> Koch	NC	219796	H
<i>H. stebbinsii</i> Covas	NC	206686	H
<i>H. vulgare</i> L.	LO		H
<i>Hyparrhenia hirta</i> (L.) Stapf	SR	203356	L
<i>H. rufa</i> (Nees) Stapf	SR	200554	L
<i>Iseilema membranacea</i> Domin	SR	240840	L
<i>I. vaginiflora</i> Domin	SR	257762	L
<i>I. wightii</i> Anderss.	SR	213524	L
<i>Koeleria cristata</i> (L.) Pers.	NC	229463	H
<i>K. phleoides</i> (Vill.) Pers.	WR	223268	H
<i>K. setacea</i> DC.	NC	234759	H
<i>K. valesiaca</i> Gaud.	WR	287942	H
<i>Leersia oryzoides</i> (L.) Sw.	GH		H
<i>Leptochloa dubia</i> (H.B. & K.) Nees	SR	204205	L
<i>L. fascicularis</i> (Lam.) A. Gray	LO		L
<i>L. fusca</i> Kunth	SR	208222	L
<i>Lolium multiflorum</i> Lam.	NC	162455	H
<i>L. perenne</i> L.	NC	170521	H
<i>L. persicum</i> Boiss. & Hohen.	NC	163283	H
<i>L. rigidum</i> Gaud.	NC	250803	H
<i>L. strictum</i> Presl	WR	204080	H
<i>L. temulentum</i> L.	NC	165555	H
<i>Muhlenbergia racemosa</i> (Michx.) B.S.P.	LO		L
<i>Panicum amarulum</i> Hitchc. & Chase	MS	2191	L
<i>P. ambiguum</i> Haussk.	SR	271024	L
<i>P. anceps</i> Michx.	TX	PMT1262	L
<i>P. antidotale</i> Retz.	NM	A-16851	L
<i>P. bergii</i> Arech.	SR	285216	L
<i>P. bisulcatum</i> Thunb.	NC	286485	H
<i>P. capillare</i> L.	NC	220025	L
<i>P. clandestinum</i> L.	MI	MS 1737	H
<i>P. coloratum</i> Cav.	SR	300628	L
<i>P. cymbiforme</i> D.K. Hughes	NC	238344	L
<i>P. decompositum</i> R. Br.	AU	Q196	L
<i>P. deustum</i> Thunb.	SR	208244	L
<i>P. dichotomiflorum</i> Michx.	LO		L
<i>P. effusum</i> R. Br.	AU	C1181	L
<i>P. firmulum</i> Hitchc. & Chase	NM	NM-270	L
<i>P. hallii</i> Vasey	NM	A-8002	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>P. havardii</i> Vasey	NM	NM-528	L
<i>P. hemitomon</i> Schult.	GA	1585	H
<i>P. laevifolium</i> Hack.	SR	209196	L
<i>P. lanipes</i> Mez	NC	238346	L
<i>P. larcomianum</i> D.K. Hughes	AU	Q270	L
<i>P. longijubatum</i> Stapf	SR	189614	L
<i>P. makarikariense</i>	SR	184776	L
<i>P. maximum</i> Jacq.	NM	P-15578	L
<i>P. miliaceum</i> L.	NC	163298	L
<i>P. milioides</i> Nees ex Trin.	SR	285219	L ⁵
<i>P. minus</i> Nash	NM	A-11966	L
<i>P. molle</i> Michx.	SR	306277	L
<i>P. obtusum</i> H.B. & K.	TX	PMT1023	L
<i>P. oligosanthos</i> Schult.	LO		H
<i>P. pacificum</i> Hitchc. & Chase	SP	1161	H
<i>P. plenum</i> Hitchc. & Chase	TX	PMT1266	L
<i>P. polygonatum</i> Schrad	SR	203869	L
<i>P. praecocius</i> Hitchc. & Chase	LO		H
<i>P. prolutum</i> F. Muell.	NC	208687	L
<i>P. queenslandicum</i> Domin	SR	257775	L
<i>P. reverchonii</i> Vasey	TX	PMT771	L
<i>P. stapfianum</i> Fourc.	NC	300058	L
<i>P. texanum</i> Buckl.	MI	MS358	L
<i>P. trachyrhachis</i> Benth.	AU	C974	L
<i>P. trichanthum</i> Nees	SR	206329	H
<i>P. turgidum</i> Forsk.	NC	221079	L
<i>P. virgatum</i> L.	NC	204907	L
<i>P. whitei</i> J. M. Black	AU	Q228	L
<i>P. wilcoxianum</i> Vasey	LO		H
<i>Pappophorum bicolor</i> Fourn.	SR	216527	L
<i>Paspalum alnum</i> Chase	SR	284523	L
<i>P. boscianum</i> Flüegge	SR	310046	L
<i>P. brunneum</i> Mez	SR	303960	L
<i>P. ciliatifolium</i> Michx.	LO		L
<i>P. conjugatum</i> Bergius	SR	282801	L
<i>P. dilatatum</i> Poir.	SR	202188	L
<i>P. distichum</i> L.	SR	276244	L
<i>P. geminiflorum</i> Steud.	SR	303985	L
<i>P. intermedium</i> Munro ex Morong	SR	310111	L
<i>P. juegensii</i> Hack.	SR	303994	L
<i>P. mandiocanum</i> Trin.	SR	303996	L
<i>P. nicorae</i> Parodi	SR	304004	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>P. notatum</i> Flüegge	SR	296005	L
<i>P. paniculatum</i> L.	SR	304006	L
<i>P. paucispicatum</i> Vasey	SR	304014	L
<i>P. platyphyllum</i> Griseb.	SR	162905	L
<i>P. plicatum</i> Michx.	SR	276253	L
<i>P. polystachyum</i> Kuntze	SR	224996	L
<i>P. pubiflorum</i> Rupr. ex Fourn.	SR	304147	L
<i>P. pumilum</i> Nees	SR	310250	L
<i>P. quadrifarium</i> Lam.	SR	283022	L
<i>P. rojasii</i> Hack.	SR	282806	L
<i>P. scrobiculatum</i> L.	SR	197275	L
<i>P. umbrosum</i> Trin.	SR	203755	L
<i>P. urvillei</i> Steud.	SR	202299	L
<i>P. virgatum</i> L.	SR	196482	L
<i>P. yaguaronense</i> Henr.	SR	304055	L
<i>Pennisetum ciliare</i> (L.) Link	VS		L
<i>P. flaccidum</i> Griseb. in Goett.	SR	220606	L
<i>P. glaucum</i> (L.) R. Br.	SR	250215	L
<i>P. macrourum</i> Trin.	SR	273257	L
<i>P. massaicum</i> Stapf	SR	214061	L
<i>P. orientale</i> Rich.	SR	218097	L
<i>P. pedicellatum</i> Trin.	SR	213275	L
<i>P. polystachyum</i> Schult.	SR	189347	L
<i>P. spicatum</i> R. & S.	SR	295126	L
<i>P. typhoideum</i> Rich.	SR	300088	L
<i>Phalaris arundinacea</i> L.	LO		H
<i>Phleum pratense</i> L.	LO		H
<i>Poa annua</i> L.	LO		H
<i>P. pratensis</i> L.	LO		H
<i>P. trivialis</i> L.	VS		H
<i>Saccharum officinarum</i> L.	GH		L
<i>Secale montanum</i> Guss.	NC	240286	H
<i>S. vavilovii</i> Grossheim	NC	253957	H
<i>Setaria adhaerens</i> (Forsk.) Chiov.	SR	216575	L
<i>S. almaspicata</i> de Wit	SR	208946	L
<i>S. argentina</i> Herrm.	NC	284689	L
<i>S. faberii</i> Herrm.	GH		L
<i>S. glauca</i> (L.) Beauv.	NC	204629	L
<i>S. holstii</i> Herrm.	SR	208300	L
<i>S. italica</i> (L.) Beauv.	NC	173103	L
<i>S. lutescens</i> (Weigel) Hubb.	NC	223293	L
<i>S. neglecta</i> de Wit	NC	300110	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>S. pallidifusca</i> Stapf & C.E. Hubb.	SR	195037	L
<i>S. palmifolia</i> (Koen.) Stapf	NC	239197	L
<i>S. phaneroocca</i> Stapf	SR	299072	L
<i>S. sphacelata</i> (Schum.) Stapf & C.E. Hubb.	NC	213277	L
<i>S. verticillata</i> (L.) Beauv.	NC	204626	L
<i>S. viridis</i> (L.) Beauv.	NC	204624	L
<i>Sitanion hystrix</i> (Nutt.) J.G. Smith	WR	232353	H
<i>Sorghastrum nutans</i> (L.) Nash	LO		L
<i>S. pellitum</i> Parodi	SR	310306	L
<i>Sorghum alnum</i> Parodi	NC	190579	L
<i>S. arundinaceum</i> R. & S.	SR	302113	L
<i>S. bicolor</i> Moench	NC	305081	L
<i>S. caffrorum</i> Beauv.	SR	291381	L
<i>S. caudatum</i> Stapf	SR	302131	L
<i>S. controversum</i> (Steud.) Snowden	SR	302136	L
<i>S. dochna</i> (Forsk.) Snowden	SR	302137	L
<i>S. drummondii</i> Nees	SR	302141	L
<i>S. gambicum</i> Snowden	SR	302150	L
<i>S. halepense</i> (L.) Pers.	SR	209217	L
<i>S. hewisonii</i> (Piper) Longley	SR	302173	L
<i>S. japonicum</i> (Hackel) Roshev.	SR	302174	L
<i>S. nigricans</i> Hort. ex R. & S.	SR	302177	L
<i>S. saccharatum</i> Moench	SR	302198	L
<i>S. sudanense</i> (Piper) Stapf	NC	220969	L
<i>S. technicum</i> (Koern.) Battand. & Trab.	SR	209792	L
<i>S. verticilliflorum</i> Stapf	NC	300117	L
<i>S. virgatum</i> (Hack.) Stapf	SR	302232	L
<i>Spartina pectinata</i> Link	LO		L
<i>Sporobolus capensis</i> Kunth	WR	258455	L
<i>S. contractus</i> Hitchc.	WR	241073	L
<i>S. cryptandrus</i> (Torr.) A. Gray			L
<i>S. elongatus</i> R. Br.	WR	194864	L
<i>S. fimbriatus</i> Nees	WR	198597	L
<i>S. helvola</i> Th. Dur. & Schinz	WR	219620	L
<i>S. indicus</i> (L.) R. Br.	WR	310309	L
<i>S. ioclados</i> Nees	WR	300124	L
<i>S. jacquemontii</i> Kunth	WR	310012	L
<i>S. phyllotrichus</i> Hochst.	WR	226098	L
<i>S. poiretii</i> (R. & S.) Hitchc.	WR	310312	L
<i>S. pyramidatus</i> (Lam.) Hitchc.	WR	196075	L
<i>S. usitatus</i> Stent	WR	198598	L
<i>Trichachne californica</i> (Benth.) Chase	SR	216617	L

TABLE I.—Continued

Species ¹	Source ²	I.D. No. ³	r ⁴
<i>Trichloris crinita</i> (Lag.) Parodi	SR	306285	L
<i>Tricholaena monachne</i> Stapf & C.E. Hubb.	NC	166381	L
<i>T. repens</i> (Willd.) Hitchc.	SR	186430	L
<i>Trisetum flavescens</i> (L.) Beauv.	WR	235458	H
<i>Triticum aestivum</i> L.	LO		H
<i>T. dicoccum</i> Schrank	GH		H
<i>T. durum</i> Desf.	GH		H
<i>T. monococcum</i> L.	GH		H
<i>T. vulgare</i> Vill.	GH		H
<i>Urochloa mosambicensis</i> (Hackel) Dandy	SR	209228	L
<i>U. pullulans</i> Stapf	SR	208954	L
<i>Vaseyochloa multinervosa</i> (Vasey) Hitchc.	SR	216663	L
<i>Vetiveria zizanioides</i> (L.) Nash	SR	302300	L
<i>Zea mays</i> L.	LO		L
<i>Zizania aquatica</i> L.	GH		H
Liliaceae			
<i>Allium cepa</i> L.	GH		H
<i>A. fistulosum</i> L.	GH		H
<i>A. odorum</i> L.	GH		H
<i>A. sativum</i> L.	GH		H
<i>A. schoenoprasum</i> L.	GH		H
<i>Asparagus officinalis</i> L.	LO		H
<i>Chlorophytum capense</i> (L.) Voss	GH		H
<i>Hymenocallis occidentalis</i> Kunth	LO		H
<i>Lilium longiflorum</i> Thunb.	GH		H
Typhaceae			
<i>Typha angustifolia</i> L.	LO		H
<i>T. latifolia</i> L.	LO		H

¹ Much of the seed came with an identification number and genus and species names but with no authority listed. We have listed the species names with an authority, using Hitchcock (15), Index Kewensis, and the Gray Herbarium Card Index as the sources of the authorities.

² Sources of the species are: AU, Division of Plant Industries, CSIRO, Canberra City, A.C.T., Australia; GA, Americus Plant Materials Center, P.O. Box 680, Americus, Ga. 31709; GH, obtained in various University of Minnesota greenhouses; LO, collected locally; MI, Soil Conservation Service, P.O. Box D, Coffeeville, Miss. 38922; NC, North Central Regional Plant Introduction Station, Ames, Iowa 50510; NM, Plant Materials Center, Route 1, Box 28, Los Lunas, N. M. 87031; SP, Dr. Richard Spellenberg, Department of Biology, Box 3AF, Las Cruces, N. M. 88001; SR, Southern Regional Plant Introduction Station, Experiment, Ga. 30212; TX, Soil Conservation Service, James E. "Bud" Smith, Plant Materials Center, Knox City, Texas 79529; VS, Valley Seed Service, 2007 Alameda Avenue, Davis, Calif. 95616; WR, Western Regional Plant Introduction Station, Pullman, Wash. 26421.

³ Identification numbers are the catalogue numbers assigned to the seed by the supplier.

⁴ Species classified as low (L) had compensation points of 10 μ l/l CO₂ or less; those classified as high (H) had compensation points of 40 μ l/l or greater.

⁵ Compensation point actually greater than 10 μ l/l CO₂; see text.

Table II. Classification of CO₂ Compensation Points of Dicotyledoneae

Species ¹	r ²
Acanthaceae	
<i>Fittonia verschaffeltii</i> Coem.	H
<i>Graptophyllum pictum</i> Griff.	H
Aceraceae	
<i>Acer negundo</i> L.	H
<i>A. platanoides</i> L.	H
<i>A. saccharum</i> L.	H
Aizoaceae	
<i>Mesembryanthemum cordifolium</i> L.	H
<i>M. criniflorum</i> L.	H
<i>M. crystallinum</i> L.	H
<i>M. tricolorum</i> Haw.	H
<i>Mollugo verticillata</i> L.	H
<i>Trianthema portulacastrum</i> L.	L
<i>T. triquetra</i> Rottl. & Willd.	L
Alismaceae	
<i>Sagittaria latifolia</i> Willd.	H
Amaranthaceae	
<i>Amaranthus albus</i> L.	L
<i>A. graecizans</i> L.	L
<i>A. hybridus</i> L.	L
<i>A. powellii</i> S. Wats.	L
<i>A. retroflexus</i> L.	L
<i>A. spinosus</i> L.	L
<i>Celosia argentea</i> L.	H
<i>Gomphrena globosa</i> L.	L
Anacardiaceae	
<i>Rhus glabra</i> L.	H
<i>R. radicans</i> L.	H
<i>R. typhina</i> L.	H
Apocynaceae	
<i>Apocynum androsaemifolium</i> L.	H
<i>Nerium oleander</i> L.	H
Aquifoliaceae	
<i>Ilex verticillata</i> (L.) Gray	H
Araceae	
<i>Pistia stratiotes</i> L.	H
Araliaceae	
<i>Hedera helix</i> L.	H
Asclepiadaceae	
<i>Asclepias ovalifolia</i> Dcne.	H

TABLE II.—Continued

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	r ²	Species ¹	r ²
<i>A. syriaca</i> L.	H	<i>Chenopodium album</i> L.	H
<i>A. tuberosa</i> L.	H	<i>Kochia scoparia</i> (L.) Roth	L
		<i>Salsola kali</i> L.	L
		<i>Spinacia oleracea</i> L.	H
<i>Impatiens balsamina</i> L.	H		
			Compositae
		<i>Achillea millefolium</i> L.	H
		<i>Ambrosia trifida</i> L.	H
<i>Begonia semperflorens</i> Link & Otto	H	<i>Arctium minus</i> (Hill) Bernh.	H
		<i>Bidens vulgata</i> Greene	H
		<i>Centaurea cyanus</i> L.	H
		<i>C. dealbata</i> Willd.	H
		<i>C. gymnocarpa</i> Moris & De Not.	H
		<i>C. jacea</i> L.	H
		<i>C. macrocephala</i> Puschk.	H
<i>Berberis pruinosa</i> Franch.	H	<i>C. maculosa</i> Lam.	H
<i>Mahonia aquifolium</i> Nutt.	H	<i>C. moschata</i> L.	H
		<i>C. pulcherrima</i> Willd.	H
		<i>Chrysanthemum morifolium</i> Ramat.	H
		<i>C. spatiosum</i> Bailey	H
		<i>Cirsium discolor</i> (Muhl.) Spreng.	H
		<i>C. vulgare</i> (Savi) Tenore	H
		<i>Eupatorium altissimum</i> L.	H
		<i>Galinsoga ciliata</i> (Raf.) Blake	H
		<i>G. parviflora</i> Cav.	H
		<i>Grindelia squarrosa</i> (Pursh) Dunal	H
		<i>Helianthus annuus</i> L.	H
		<i>Iva xanthifolia</i> Nutt.	H
		<i>Lactuca pulchella</i> (Pursh) DC.	H
		<i>L. scariola</i> L.	H
		<i>Liatris ligulistylis</i> (Nels.) K. Schum.	H
		<i>Matricaria chamomilla</i> L.	H
		<i>Solidago memorialis</i> Ait.	H
		<i>S. rigida</i> L.	H
		<i>Tagetes erecta</i> L.	H
		<i>Taraxacum officinale</i> Weber	H
		<i>Zinnia elegans</i> Jacq.	H
			Convolvulaceae
<i>Atriplex breweri</i> Wats.	L	<i>Convolvulus sepium</i> L.	H
<i>A. glabriuscula</i> Edmondston	H	<i>Ipomoea aquatica</i> Forsk.	H
<i>A. nummularia</i> Lindl.	L		
<i>A. patula</i> L.	H		Cornaceae
<i>A. rosea</i> L.	L	<i>Cornus alternifolia</i> L.	H
<i>A. semibaccata</i> Moq.	L		
			Corylaceae
		<i>Corylus americana</i> Walt.	H

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	r ²
<i>Ostrya virginiana</i> (Mill.) K. Koch	H
Crassulaceae	
<i>Kalanchoe blossfeldiana</i> Poelln.	H
<i>K. daigremontiana</i> Hamet & Perrier.	H
Cruciferae	
<i>Barbarea vulgaris</i> R. Br.	H
<i>Berteroa incana</i> DC.	H
<i>Brassica napobrassica</i> Mill.	H
<i>B. oleracea</i> L.	H
<i>B. rapa</i> L.	H
<i>B. septiceps</i> Bailey	H
<i>Capsella bursa-pastoris</i> Medic.	H
<i>Cheiranthus cheiri</i> L.	H
<i>Crambe maritima</i> L.	H
<i>Farsetia clypeata</i> R. Br.	H
<i>Moricandia arvensis</i> (L.) DC.	H ³
<i>Raphanus sativus</i> L.	H
<i>Thlaspi arvense</i> L.	H
Cucurbitaceae	
<i>Cucumis melo</i> L.	H
Dipsacaceae	
<i>Dipsacus fullonum</i> L.	H
<i>Scabiosa africana</i> L.	H
<i>S. atropurpurea</i> L.	H
<i>S. graminifolia</i> L.	H
<i>S. prolifera</i> Mazziani	H
<i>S. ucranica</i> L.	H
Droseraceae	
<i>Dionaea muscipula</i> Ellis	H
Elaeagnaceae	
<i>Elaeagnus angustifolia</i> L. ₃	H
Ericaceae	
<i>Arctostaphylos uva-ursi</i> (L.) Spreng.	H
<i>Rhododendron mucronulatum</i> Turcz.	H
Euphorbiaceae	
<i>Euphorbia corollata</i> L.	H
<i>E. cyparissias</i> L.	H
<i>E. dentata</i> Michx.	H
<i>E. esula</i> L.	H
<i>E. forbesii</i> Sherff	L
<i>E. geyeri</i> Engelm.	L
<i>E. glyptosperma</i> Engelm.	L

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	r ²
<i>E. heterophylla</i> L.	H
<i>E. hexagona</i> Nutt.	H
<i>E. lactea</i> Haw.	H
<i>E. maculata</i> L.	L
<i>E. marginata</i> Pursh	H
<i>E. missurica</i> Raf.	L
<i>E. pulcherrima</i> Willd.	H
<i>E. serpyllifolia</i> Pers.	L
<i>E. splendens</i> Boj.	H
<i>E. supina</i> Raf.	L
<i>Ricinus communis</i> L.	H
Fagaceae	
<i>Quercus ellipsoidalis</i> E. J. Hill	H
<i>Q. macrocarpa</i> Michx.	H
<i>Q. muehlenbergii</i> Engelm.	H
Geraniaceae	
<i>Pelargonium peltatum</i> Soland.	H
<i>P. zonale</i> L'Herit.	H
Gesneriaceae	
<i>Saintpaulia ionantha</i> Wendl.	H
Ginkgoaceae	
<i>Ginkgo biloba</i> L.	H
Hippocastanaceae	
<i>Aesculus glabra</i> Willd.	H
Hydrophyllaceae	
<i>Ellisia nyctelea</i> L.	H
Juglandaceae	
<i>Juglans nigra</i> L.	H
Labiatae	
<i>Coleus thyrsoideus</i> Baker	H
<i>Leonurus cardiaca</i> L.	H
<i>Monarda punctata</i> L.	H
<i>Perilla frutescens</i> (L.) Britt.	H
<i>Prunella vulgaris</i> L.	H
<i>Salvia splendens</i> Ker	H
<i>Thymus vulgaris</i> L.	H
Leguminosae	
<i>Amopha canescens</i> Pursh	H
<i>Caragana arborescens</i> Lam.	H
<i>Crotalaria axillaris</i> Dryand.	H
<i>C. capensis</i> Jacq.	H
<i>C. crassipes</i> Hook.	H

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	r ²
<i>C. dissitiflora</i> Benth.	H
<i>C. juncea</i> L.	H
<i>C. mitchellii</i> Benth.	H
<i>C. mysorensis</i> Roth	H
<i>C. retusa</i> L.	H
<i>Dolichos lablab</i> L.	H
<i>Genista aethnensis</i> DC.	H
<i>G. horrida</i> DC.	H
<i>G. monosperma</i> Lam.	H
<i>G. monspessulana</i> (L.) L.A.S. Johnson	H
<i>G. pilosa</i> L.	H
<i>G. radiata</i> Scop.	H
<i>G. sagittalis</i> L.	H
<i>G. tinctoria</i> L.	H
<i>Gleditsia triacanthos</i> L.	H
<i>Glycine max</i> (L.) Merr.	H
<i>Indigofera australis</i> Willd.	H
<i>I. cylindrica</i> DC.	H
<i>I. cytisoides</i> L.	H
<i>I. dosua</i> Buch.-Ham.	H
<i>I. filifolia</i> Thunb.	H
<i>I. frutescens</i> L.	H
<i>I. kirilowii</i> Maxim.	H
<i>I. orthocarpa</i> Presl	H
<i>I. splendens</i> Ficalho & Hiern	H
<i>I. viscosa</i> Lam.	H
<i>Lespedeza capitata</i> Michx.	H
<i>L. leptostachya</i> Engelm.	H
<i>Lotus corniculatus</i> L.	H
<i>L. hispidus</i> Desf.	H
<i>L. ornithopodioides</i> L.	H
<i>L. requienii</i> Hort.	H
<i>L. uliginosus</i> Schkuhr	H
<i>Medicago sativa</i> L.	H
<i>Mimosa pudica</i> L.	H
<i>Pisum sativum</i> L.	H
<i>Robinia pseudo-acacia</i> L.	H
<i>Spartium junceum</i> L.	H
<i>Vicia angustifolia</i> Reichard	H
<i>V. faba</i> L.	H
<i>V. sativa</i> L.	H
Linaceae	
<i>Linum usitatissimum</i> L.	H

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	r ²
Lythraceae	
<i>Lythrum salicaria</i> L.	H
Malvaceae	
<i>Abutilon theophrasti</i> Medic.	H
<i>Malva neglecta</i> Wallr.	H
Menispermaceae	
<i>Menispermum canadense</i> L.	H
Moraceae	
<i>Cannabis sativa</i> L.	H
<i>Ficus lyrata</i> Warb.	H
<i>Morus alba</i> L.	H
Nyctaginaceae	
<i>Boerhaavia coccinea</i> Mill.	L
<i>B. diffusa</i> L.	L
<i>B. paniculata</i> Rich.	L
<i>B. torreyana</i> Standley	L
<i>Bougainvillea spectabilis</i> Willd.	H
<i>Mirabilis jalapa</i> L.	H
Nymphaeaceae	
<i>Nuphar variegatum</i> Engelm.	H
Oleaceae	
<i>Ligustrum vulgare</i> L.	H
<i>Syringa vulgaris</i> L.	H
Onagraceae	
<i>Oenothera biennis</i> L.	H
Oxalidaceae	
<i>Oxalis stricta</i> L.	H
Papaveraceae	
<i>Macleaya cordata</i> (Willd.) R. Br.	H
Parkeriaceae	
<i>Ceratopteris thalictroides</i> Brongn.	H
Passifloraceae	
<i>Passiflora caerulea</i> L.	H
Pinaceae	
<i>Juniperus communis</i> L.	H
<i>Larix laricina</i> (Du Roi) K. Koch	H
<i>Picea glauca</i> (Moench) Voss	H
<i>Pinus nigra</i> Arnold	H
<i>Thuja occidentalis</i> L.	H
Plantaginaceae	
<i>Plantago lanceolata</i> L.	H
<i>P. rugelii</i> Dcne.	H

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	r ²
Polemoniaceae	
<i>Cobaea scandens</i> Cav.	H
<i>Collomia biflora</i> Brand	H
<i>Gilia abrotanifolia</i> Nutt.	H
<i>G. achilleaefolia</i> Benth.	H
<i>G. capitata</i> Sims	H
<i>G. grandiflora</i> A. Gray	H
<i>G. micrantha</i> Steud.	H
<i>G. multicaulis</i> Benth.	H
<i>G. rubra</i> (L.) Heller	H
<i>G. tricolor</i> Benth.	H
<i>Phlox drummondii</i> Hook.	H
<i>Polemonium flavum</i> Greene	H
<i>P. pauciflorum</i> Wats.	H
<i>P. richardsonii</i> R. Grah.	H
Polygonaceae	
<i>Polygonum aviculare</i> L.	H
<i>P. convolvulus</i> L.	H
<i>P. erectum</i> L.	H
<i>P. pennsylvanicum</i> L.	H
<i>P. persicaria</i> L.	H
<i>P. Reynoutria</i> Makino	H
<i>Rheum rhaponticum</i> L.	H
<i>Rumex acetosella</i> L.	H
<i>Rumex crispus</i> L.	H
Portulacaceae	
<i>Portulaca grandiflora</i> Hook.	L
<i>P. oleracea</i> L.	L
Primulaceae	
<i>Anagallis linifolia</i> L.	H
<i>Primula alpicola</i> Stapf	H
<i>P. denticulata</i> Sm.	H
<i>P. florindae</i> F. K. Ward	H
Punicaceae	
<i>Punica granatum</i> L.	H
Ranunculaceae	
<i>Clematis verticillaris</i> DC.	H
<i>Delphinium ajacis</i> L.	H
<i>Paeonia lactiflora</i> Pall.	H
Resedaceae	
<i>Reseda odorata</i> L.	H
Rhamnaceae	
<i>Rhamnus cathartica</i> L.	H

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	r ²
Rosaceae	
<i>Fragaria vesca</i> L.	H
<i>Malus ioensis</i> Britton	H
<i>Physocarpus opulifolius</i> (L.) Maxim.	H
<i>Potentilla fruticosa</i> L.	H
<i>P. norvegica</i> L.	H
<i>P. simplex</i> Michx.	H
<i>Prunus persica</i> (L.) Batsch	H
<i>P. triloba</i> Lindl.	H
<i>Rosa pimpinellifolia</i> L.	H
<i>Rubus idaeus</i> L.	H
<i>Sorbus americana</i> Marsh.	H
<i>Spiraea alba</i> Du Roi	H
Rutaceae	
<i>Citrus limon</i> Burm.	H
<i>Fortunella japonica</i> Swingle	H
<i>Ruta graveolens</i> L.	H
<i>Zanthoxylum americanum</i> Mill.	H
Salicaceae	
<i>Populus alba</i> L.	H
<i>Salix amygdaloides</i> Anderss.	H
<i>Salix interior</i> Rowlee	H
Sapindaceae	
<i>Cardiospermum halicacabum</i> L.	H
Saururaceae	
<i>Saururus cernuus</i> L.	H
Saxifragaceae	
<i>Heuchera sanguinea</i> Engelm.	H
<i>Ribes alpinum</i> L.	H
Scrophulariaceae	
<i>Antirrhinum majus</i> L.	H
<i>Linaria vulgaris</i> Mill.	H
<i>Pentstemon barbatus</i> Roth	H
Simaroubaceae	
<i>Ailanthus altissima</i> (Mill.) Swingle	H
Solanaceae	
<i>Datura stramonium</i> L.	H
<i>Lycopersicon esculentum</i> Mill.	H
<i>Nicotiana glauca</i> Graham	H
<i>N. tabacum</i> L.	H
<i>Petunia hybrida</i> Hort.	H
<i>Physalis heterophylla</i> Nees	H

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	Γ ²
<i>Solanum dulcamara</i> L.	H
<i>S. melongena</i> L.	H
<i>S. nigrum</i> L.	H
<i>S. tuberosum</i> L.	H
Taxaceae	
<i>Taxus canadensis</i> Marsh.	H
<i>T. cuspidata</i> Sieb. & Zucc.	H
Taxodiaceae	
<i>Taxodium distichum</i> Rich.	H
Tiliaceae	
<i>Tilia americana</i> L.	H
Tropaeolaceae	
<i>Tropaeolum majus</i> L.	H
Ulmaceae	
<i>Celtis occidentalis</i> L.	H
<i>Ulmus americana</i> L.	H
<i>Ulmus pumila</i> L.	H
Umbelliferae	
<i>Daucus carota</i> L.	H
<i>Pastinaca sativa</i> L.	H
Urticaceae	
<i>Parietaria pensylvanica</i> Muhl.	H
<i>Pilea microphylla</i> Liebm.	H
Verbenaceae	
<i>Verbena bracteata</i> Lag. & Rodr.	H
<i>V. stricta</i> Vent.	H
Violaceae	
<i>Viola tricolor</i> L.	H
Vitaceae	
<i>Parthenocissus tricuspidata</i> (Sieb. & Zucc.) Planch.	H
<i>Vitis argentifolia</i> (Munson) Fern.	H
<i>V. riparia</i> Michx.	H
Zygophyllaceae	
<i>Kallstroemia maxima</i> L.	L
<i>K. pubescens</i> (G. Don) Dandy	L
<i>K. rosei</i> Rydb.	L
<i>Tribulus cistoides</i> L.	L
<i>T. hystrix</i> R. Br.	L
<i>T. terrestris</i> L.	L
<i>Zygophyllum aurantiacum</i> F. Muell.	H
<i>Z. coccineum</i> L.	H
<i>Z. dumosum</i> Boiss.	H

TABLE II.—Continued

Species ¹	Γ ²
<i>Z. fabago</i> L.	H
<i>Z. howittii</i> F. Muell.	H
<i>Z. iodocarpum</i> F. Muell.	H
<i>Z. simplex</i> L.	L

¹ Dicotyledon species were supplied by many sources, both locally and abroad. Bailey (1), Fernald (9), Index Kewensis, and Gray Herbarium Card Index were used as sources of authority when authorities were not supplied to us with the species name.

² Species classified as low (L) had Γ of 10 μl/l CO₂ or less, and those classified as high (H) had Γ of 40 μl/l CO₂ or greater.

³ Compensation point actually less than 40 μl/l CO₂; see text.

as a group, when measured in a given environment. As mentioned previously, high Γ are affected by temperature and are strongly dependent on O₂ concentration (10, 11, 19). The Γ of C₃ species were near 45 μl/l CO₂ at 23 C and near 60 μl/l at 30 C. It is unlikely, however, that either temperature or O₂ concentration were greatly different in our experiments and those mentioned above.

Two species in our experiments did respond differently from all others that we measured. One of these, *Moricandia arvensis* (L.) DC., a crucifer, had a Γ of 25 μl/l under conditions where barley had a Γ of 45 μl/l and maize had a Γ of 0 μl/l. The Γ of *M. arvensis* was checked numerous times on leaves from many different plants grown in several environments and its Γ was always intermediate between that of high and low groups. The values obtained in various conditions ranged from 23 to 29 μl/l. In one experiment, *M. arvensis* and seven other Cruciferae—*Brassica napobrassica* Mill., *B. oleracea* L., *B. rapa* L., *B. septiceps* Bailey, *Crambe maritima* L., *Raphanus sativas* L., and *Farsetia clypeata* R. Br.—were grown at the same time. The seven species had Γ greater than 40 μl/l, while *M. arvensis* had a Γ of 26 μl/l. In further experiments, *Moricandia*'s pathway of carbon fixation, photosynthetic response to light, leaf anatomy, and metabolism of glycolate were investigated (3). In all cases, the response was typical of C₃ plants; therefore, *M. arvensis* is classified as a high Γ species in Table II, although its Γ was actually less than 40 μl/l.

The second species which responded differently from all others was *Panicum milioides* Nees ex Trin. In an earlier publication (22), this species was classified as having a high Γ. It was drawn to our attention by Dr. Tom Neales (personal communication) that he had found *P. milioides* to have the enzyme composition of a C₄ plant. As a result, this species has been checked repeatedly, and a range of Γ between 12 and 50 μl/l has been obtained. Most often the Γ has been between 12 and 20 μl/l. In other respects, including leaf anatomy (7) and enzymic composition as mentioned above, *P. milioides* appears to be typical of C₄ species and therefore has been classified as low Γ in Table I.

Dr. J. Raynal of the Museum of Natural History in Paris pointed out that our report on *Cyperus papyrus* L. as having a high Γ (22) did not agree with other characteristics of the species such as leaf anatomy (personal communication). We rechecked our material and found that the species which we identified as *C. papyrus* in the earlier publication was actually *C. alternifolius* L. *Cyperus papyrus* has a low Γ as shown in Table I.

Table III. List of Families and Number of Species for Which CO₂ Compensation Points Have Been Reported in Addition to Those Listed in Tables I and II

Family	Total species	High Γ	Low Γ	References
Monocotyledons				
Cyperaceae	28	9	19	2,3,16,25 ¹
Gramineae	43	20	23	2,6,8,16
Musaceae	1	1		16
Palmae	1	1		16
Pontederiaceae	1	1		2
Dicotyledons				
Aceraceae	3	3		5
Amaranthaceae	19	5	14	16,24
Chenopodiaceae	20	11	9	2,8,23,24,25
Commelinaceae	1	1		2
Compositae	3	3		2 ¹
Convolvulaceae	1	1		2 ¹
Corylaceae	2	2		5
Cruciferae	1	1		2
Euphorbiaceae	7	5	2	16
Fagaceae	9	9		5
Hippocastanaceae	1	1		5
Juglandaceae	1	1		5
Leguminosae	12	12		2,5,8 ¹
Magnoliaceae	2	2		5
Malvaceae	3	3		2 ¹
Nyctaginaceae	1	1		16
Oleaceae	3	3		5
Phytolacaceae	1	1		5
Pinaceae	10	10		5
Platanaceae	1	1		5
Portulacaceae	4	1	3	16,24
Rosaceae	1	1		5
Rubiaceae	1	1		2
Salicaceae	1	1		5

¹Chen *et al.* (2) reported intermediate values for some species in this family.

In several genera, there are both high and low Γ species. Among monocotyledons, these occur in *Panicum* (Gramineae) and in *Cyperus* (Cyperaceae). Among dicotyledons, both types are found in *Atriplex* (Chenopodiaceae), *Bassia* (Chenopodiaceae), *Euphorbia* (Euphorbiaceae), and *Zygophyllum* (Zygophyllaceae). The *Cyperus*, *Panicum*, and *Euphorbia* are very large genera and are composed of several subgenera. Classification into taxa has been difficult in these genera, and

the different Γ types are found in different subgenera. It may be that the different types represent major evolutionary shifts which should be classified as separate genera. In fact, it is possible that measuring Γ might be a useful tool in organizing the taxa of these complex genera.

Acknowledgments—Much of the technical work and identification of local species was done by Mrs. Sui-tsun Hsi, which we gratefully acknowledge. We also acknowledge the help of Mr. Eugene Hsi in making some of the identifications.

LITERATURE CITED

1. BAILEY, L. H. 1958. Manual of Cultivated Plants, Macmillan Co., Toronto.
2. CHEN, T. M., R. H. BROWN, AND C. C. BLACK. 1970. CO₂ Compensation concentration, rate of photosynthesis, and carbonic anhydrase activity in plants. *Weed Sci.* 18: 399-403.
3. CROOKSTON, R. K. 1972. Physiological characteristics and leaf anatomy of C₄ and C₃ species. Ph.D. thesis. University of Minnesota, St. Paul.
4. CROOKSTON, R. K. AND D. N. MOSS. 1970. The relation of carbon dioxide compensation and chlorenchymatous vascular bundle sheaths in leaves of dicots. *Plant Physiol.* 46: 564-567.
5. DICKMANN, D. I. AND D. H. GJERSTAD. 1973. Application to woody plants of a rapid method for determining leaf CO₂ compensation concentrations. *Can. J. For. Res.* 3: 237-242.
6. DOWNTON, J., J. BERRY, AND E. B. TREGUNNA. 1969. Photosynthesis: temperate and tropical characteristics within a single grass genus. *Science* 163: 78-79.
7. DOWNTON, W. J. S. 1971. Checklist of C₄ species. In: M. D. Hatch, C. B. Osmond, and R. O. Slatyer, eds., *Photosynthesis and Photorespiration*. Wiley-Interscience, New York, pp. 554-558.
8. DOWNTON, W. J. S. AND E. B. TREGUNNA. 1968. Carbon dioxide compensation—its relation to photosynthetic carboxylation reactions, systematics of the Gramineae, and leaf anatomy. *Can. J. Bot.* 46: 207-215.
9. FERNALD, M. L. 1950. *Gray's Manual of Botany*, Ed. 8. American Book Company, New York.
10. FORRESTER, M. L., G. KROTKOV, AND C. D. NELSON. 1966. Effect of oxygen on photosynthesis, photorespiration and respiration in detached leaves. I. Soybean. *Plant Physiol.* 41: 422-427.
11. FORRESTER, M. L., G. KROTKOV, AND C. D. NELSON. 1966. Effect of oxygen on photosynthesis, photorespiration and respiration in detached leaves. II. Corn and other monocotyledons. *Plant Physiol.* 41: 428-431.
12. GOLDSWORTHY, A. AND P. R. DAY. 1970. A simple technique for the rapid determination of plant CO₂ compensation points. *Plant Physiol.* 46: 850-851.
13. HATCH, M. D., C. R. SLACK, AND H. S. JOHNSON. 1967. Further studies on a new pathway of photosynthetic carbon dioxide fixation in sugarcane and its occurrence in other plant species. *Biochem. J.* 102: 417-422.
14. HEICHEL, G. H. AND R. B. MUSGRAVE. 1969. Relation of CO₂ compensation concentration to apparent photosynthesis in maize. *Plant Physiol.* 44: 1724-1728.
15. HITCHCOCK, A. S. 1971. *Manual of the Grasses of the United States*. Dover Publications, Inc., New York.
16. HOFSTRA, J. J., S. AKSORNKOAE, S. ATMOWIDJOJO, J. F. BANAAG, SANTOSA, R. A. SASTROHOETOMO, AND L. T. N. THU. 1972. A study on the occurrence of plants with a low CO₂ compensation point in different habitats in the tropics. *Ann. Bogor.* 5: 143-157.
17. KORTSCHAK, H. P., C. E. HARTT, AND G. O. BURR. 1965. Carbon dioxide fixation in sugarcane leaves. *Plant Physiol.* 40: 209-213.
18. KRENZER, E. G., JR., AND D. N. MOSS. 1969. Carbon dioxide compensation in grasses. *Crop Sci.* 9: 619-621.
19. MEIDNER, H. 1962. The minimum intercellular-space CO₂-concentration (Γ) of maize leaves and its influence on stomatal movements. *J. Exp. Bot.* 13: 284-293.
20. MOSS, D. N. 1962. The limiting carbon dioxide concentration for photosynthesis. *Nature* 193:587.
21. MOSS, D. N., C. M. WILLMER, AND R. K. CROOKSTON. 1971. CO₂ compensation in maize (*Zea mays* L.) genotypes. *Plant Physiol.* 47: 847-848.
22. MOSS, D. N., E. G. KRENZER, JR., AND W. A. BRUN. 1969. Carbon dioxide compensation points in related plant species. *Science* 164: 187-188.
23. TREGUNNA, E. B., B. N. SIMTHER, J. A. BERRY, AND W. J. S. DOWNTON. 1970. Some methods for studying the photosynthetic taxonomy of the angiosperms. *Can. J. Bot.* 48: 1209-1214.
24. TREGUNNA, E. B. AND J. DOWNTON. 1967. Carbon dioxide compensation in members of the Amaranthaceae and some related families. *Can. J. Bot.* 45: 2385-2387.
25. TREGUNNA, E. B., J. DOWNTON, AND P. JOLLIFFE. 1969. Genetic and environmental control of photorespiration. In: H. Metzner, ed., *Progress in Photosynthesis Research*. International Union of Biological Sciences, Tübingen, pp. 488-495.