

LETTER TO THE EDITOR

Reply: *ATAD1* encephalopathy and stiff baby syndrome: a recognizable clinical presentation

Juliette Piard,^{1,2} George K. Essien Umanah,^{3,4} Frederike L. Harms,⁵ Leire Abalde-Atristain,^{3,6} Daniel Amram,⁷ Melissa Chang,^{3,4} Rong Chen,^{3,4} Malik Alawi,^{8,9} Vincenzo Salpietro,¹⁰ Mark I. Rees,¹¹ Seo-Kyung Chung,¹¹ Henry Houlden,¹⁰ Alain Verloes,¹² Ted M. Dawson,^{3,4,6,13,14} Valina L. Dawson,^{3,4,6,13,15} Lionel Van Maldergem^{1,2,16} and Kerstin Kutsche⁵

- 1 Centre de génétique humaine, Université de Franche-Comté, Besançon, France
- 2 Integrative and Cognitive Neurosciences Research Unit EA481, University of Franche-Comté, Besançon, France
- 3 Neuroregeneration and Stem Cell Programs, Institute for Cell Engineering, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD 21205, USA
- 4 Department of Neurology, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD 21205, USA
- 5 Institute of Human Genetics, University Medical Center Hamburg-Eppendorf, 20246 Hamburg, Germany
- 6 Cellular and Molecular Medicine Graduate Program, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD 21205, USA
- 7 Unité fonctionnelle de génétique clinique, Centre hospitalier intercommunal, Créteil, France
- 8 University Medical Center Hamburg-Eppendorf, Bioinformatics Core Facility, 20246 Hamburg, Germany
- 9 Heinrich-Pette-Institute, Leibniz-Institute for Experimental Virology, Virus Genomics, Hamburg, Germany
- 10 Department of Molecular Neuroscience, UCL Institute of Neurology, London, UK
- 11 Neurology Research Group, Institute of Life Science, Swansea University Medical School, Swansea University, Swansea, UK
- 12 Department of Genetics, Robert-Debré Hospital, Paris, France
- 13 Solomon H. Snyder Department of Neuroscience, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD 21205, USA
- 14 Department of Pharmacology and Molecular Sciences, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD 21205, USA
- 15 Department of Physiology, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD 21205, USA
- 16 Clinical Investigation Center 1431, National Institute of Health and Medical Research (INSERM), University of Franche-Comté, Besançon, France

Correspondence to: Kerstin Kutsche

The University Medical Center Hamburg-Eppendorf, Institute of Human Genetics, Martinistrasse 52, 20246 Hamburg, Germany
E-mail: kkutsche@uke.de

Sir,

We welcome the letter by Wolf *et al.* (2018). They report a third family with *ATAD1*-related lethal encephalopathy, further confirming *ATAD1* as a disease gene for the well recognizable stiff baby syndrome. *ATAD1* encodes thorase, an AAA + ATPase that helps control postsynaptic AMPA receptor internalization by disassembling complexes between glutamate receptor interacting protein (GRIP1) and the AMPA receptor subunit GluA2 (Zhang *et al.*, 2011). The common clinical features shared by all affected members in the three reported families comprise hypertonia, absence of spontaneous movements, almost no motor

development, and death within the first months of life (Ahrens-Nicklas *et al.*, 2017; Piard *et al.*, 2018; Wolf *et al.*, 2018). Myoclonic jerks and seizures have been noticed in the affected children reported by Ahrens-Nicklas *et al.* (2017) and the female described by Wolf *et al.* (2018), but in none of the three affected infants we reported (Piard *et al.*, 2018). We agree with Wolf *et al.* (2018) that *ATAD1*-related encephalopathy should be a first-line diagnosis in extremely stiff neonates with or without seizures. However, we are aware of another infantile epileptic encephalopathy, known as rigidity and multifocal seizure syndrome, lethal neonatal (RMFSL; MIM 614498),

showing an overlapping clinical picture. This phenotype is characterized by intractable seizures, hypertonia, and early death and caused by biallelic mutations in *BRAT1* (Puffenberger *et al.*, 2012; Saunders *et al.*, 2012; Saitsu *et al.*, 2014). We therefore recommend *ATAD1* and *BRAT1* to be preferentially analysed by Sanger-sequencing or in next-generation sequencing panels in the diagnostic work-up of stiff neonates.

The *ATAD1* variant identified by Wolf *et al.* (2018), a homozygous c.162G>C transversion predicting the amino acid substitution p.(Gln54His), has not been tested in the patient's parents to demonstrate that both are heterozygous carriers. Moreover, Wolf *et al.* (2018) did not comment on minor allele frequency or pathogenicity predictions of the *ATAD1* variant. By doing so, we noticed that the c.162G>C change is absent from population databases (ExAC and gnomAD Browsers) and predicted to be damaging by three *in silico* tools combining previous pathogenicity scores [CADD (Kircher *et al.*, 2014), REVEL (Ioannidis *et al.*, 2016), and M-CAP (Jagadeesh *et al.*, 2016)]. As the G-to-C change affects the last nucleotide of exon 2, splicing of the *ATAD1* pre-mRNA has been postulated to be altered (Wolf *et al.*, 2018). We investigated the effect of this sequence change on splicing using four splice site prediction programs: all of them detected the wild-type donor site (<http://www.umd.be/HSF3/HSF.shtml>; <http://www.cbs.dtu.dk/services/NetGene2/>; http://www.fru.itfly.org/seq_tools/splice.html; <http://bioinfo.itb.cnr.it/oriel/splice-view.html>). Three recognized the donor site in the mutant sequence with reduced splicing efficiency, while one predicts the complete loss of the donor site. The effect of the *ATAD1* mutation c.162G>C on pre-mRNA splicing and protein function is difficult to predict in the absence of mRNA and functional studies. Nonetheless, it is tempting to speculate that both aberrant *ATAD1* mRNAs, possibly subjected to nonsense-mediated mRNA decay, and mutant *ATAD1*^{Gln54His} protein had been produced in the affected infant and likely caused (nearly) complete *ATAD1* loss-of-function. Similarly, the homozygous *ATAD1* mutation reported by Ahrens-Nicklas *et al.* (2017) also was a loss-of-function mutation as the c.826G>T change predicted the introduction of a premature termination codon [p.(Glu276*)]. A drastically decreased *ATAD1* mRNA amount and the absence of thorase protein in lymphoblastoid cells derived from one patient further underscored *ATAD1* null alleles in the affected individuals of this family (Ahrens-Nicklas *et al.*, 2017). In contrast, we would like to emphasize that the *ATAD1* mutation c.1070_1071delAT/p.(His357Argfs*15) reported in our family turned out to have a gain-of-function effect, a rarely observed mechanism in autosomal recessively inherited disorders (Piard *et al.*, 2018). Although at first glance the frameshift variant gives the impression of an *ATAD1* loss-of-function mutation, the functional work presented in our study indicated that the encoded thorase

mutant^{His357Argfs*15} is expressed in patient cells and gained a novel function of its C-terminal end. We demonstrated decreased levels of surface AMPA receptors in unstimulated mutant^{His357Argfs*15}-expressing neuronal cells compared to wild-type-expressing neurons. We put forward the hypothesis that the thorase mutant^{His357Argfs*15} may inhibit the recycling back and/or reinsertion of AMPA receptors to the surface following endocytosis resulting in a decrease in the steady-state levels of these receptors at the cell surface (Piard *et al.*, 2018). In contrast, biallelic *ATAD1* loss-of-function mutations likely increase the population of excitatory postsynaptic AMPA receptors in neurons as shown in *Atad1*^{-/-} mice (Zhang *et al.*, 2011). In the latter scenario, perampanel, an AMPA receptor antagonist, was shown to decrease tonic activity and prevent seizures in two individuals with the homozygous *ATAD1* nonsense mutation p.(Glu276*) (Ahrens-Nicklas *et al.*, 2017). Taken together, these data demonstrate clear benefits of the individualized medicine approach in the two severely affected children reported by Ahrens-Nicklas *et al.* (2017), as also pointed out by Wolf and colleagues (2018). However, we respectfully but strongly disagree with the statement by Wolf *et al.* (2018) to ‘...ensue a therapeutic trial with perampanel, even before genetic confirmation’ in an extremely stiff infant. As both loss- as well as gain-of-function *ATAD1* mutations give rise to the shared neurological features of stiffness and absence of spontaneous movements, we recommend (i) genetic testing in the affected neonates, including *ATAD1* and *BRAT1*, to unravel the genetic basis of the disease; and (ii) determining the consequences of the *ATAD1* mutation, at least on mRNA and protein level in cells obtained from patients. Absence or reduced amount of mutated *ATAD1* transcripts and/or thorase protein in patient-derived cells provide evidence for *ATAD1* deficiency, thus opening up the therapeutic potential of perampanel in these patients. On the other hand, therapy with perampanel is not an option in individuals with an *ATAD1* gain-of-function variant, such as the p.(His357Argfs*15) frameshift mutation reported in our study (Piard *et al.*, 2018). Wolf *et al.* (2018) pointed out the importance of detailed clinical work-up for rare neurological disorders and we agree. Beyond that, the work by Ahrens-Nicklas *et al.* (2017) and our work (Piard *et al.*, 2018) highlight the need for determining the molecular basis of rare and devastating neurological disorders and their underlying pathophysiological mechanisms to develop a targeted therapy.

Funding

This work was supported by a grant from the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (KU 1240/10-1 to K.K.) and National Institutes of Health – National Institute on Drug Abuse, P50DA000266 to V.L.D and T.M.D.

References

- Ahrens-Nicklas RC, Umanah GK, Sondheimer N, Deardorff MA, Wilkens AB, Conlin LK, et al. Precision therapy for a new disorder of AMPA receptor recycling due to mutations in *ATAD1*. *Neurol Genet* 2017; 3: e130.
- Ioannidis NM, Rothstein JH, Pejaver V, Middha S, McDonnell SK, Baheti S, et al. REVEL: an ensemble method for predicting the pathogenicity of rare missense variants. *Am J Hum Genet* 2016; 99: 877–85.
- Jagadeesh KA, Wenger AM, Berger MJ, Guturu H, Stenson PD, Cooper DN, et al. M-CAP eliminates a majority of variants of uncertain significance in clinical exomes at high sensitivity. *Nat Genet* 2016; 48: 1581–6.
- Kircher M, Witten DM, Jain P, O’roak BJ, Cooper GM, Shendure J. A general framework for estimating the relative pathogenicity of human genetic variants. *Nat Genet* 2014; 46: 310–15.
- Piard J, Umanah GKE, Harms FL, Abalde-Atristain L, Amram D, Chang M, et al. A homozygous *ATAD1* mutation impairs postsynaptic AMPA receptor trafficking and causes a lethal encephalopathy. *Brain* 2018; 141: 651–61.
- Puffenberger EG, Jinks RN, Sougnéz C, Cibulskis K, Willert RA, Achilly NP, et al. Genetic mapping and exome sequencing identify variants associated with five novel diseases. *PLoS One* 2012; 7: e28936.
- Saito H, Yamashita S, Tanaka Y, Tsurusaki Y, Nakashima M, Miyake N, et al. Compound heterozygous *BRAT1* mutations cause familial Ohtahara syndrome with hypertonia and microcephaly. *J Hum Genet* 2014; 59: 687–90.
- Saunders CJ, Miller NA, Soden SE, Dinwiddie DL, Noll A, Alnadi NA, et al. Rapid whole-genome sequencing for genetic disease diagnosis in neonatal intensive care units. *Sci Transl Med* 2012; 4: 154ra35.
- Wolf NI, Zschocke J, Jakobs C, Rating D, Hoffmann GF. *ATAD1* encephalopathy and stiff baby syndrome: a recognizable clinical presentation. *Brain* 2018; 141: e49.
- Zhang J, Wang Y, Chi Z, Keuss MJ, Pai YM, Kang HC, et al. The AAA+ ATPase Thorase regulates AMPA receptor-dependent synaptic plasticity and behavior. *Cell* 2011; 145: 284–99.