

HHS Public Access

J Intern Med. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2019 September 01.

Published in final edited form as:

Author manuscript

J Intern Med. 2018 September ; 284(3): 292–306. doi:10.1111/joim.12767.

Daily adjunctive therapy with vitamin D3 and phenylbutyrate supports clinical recovery from pulmonary tuberculosis: A randomized controlled trial in Ethiopia

Amsalu Bekele1,a, **Nebiat Gebreselassie**2,3,a, **Senait Ashenafi**2, **Endale Kassa**1, **Getachew Aseffa**4, **Wondwossen Amogne**1, **Meron Tefera**1, **Abraham Aseffa**3, **Alemayehu Worku**5, **Rubhana Raqib**6, **Birgitta Agerberth**7, **Ulf Hammar**8, **Peter Bergman**7, **Getachew Aderaye**1, **Jan Andersson**2,9, and **Susanna Brighenti**²

¹Department of Internal Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, Black Lion University Hospital and Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

²Center for Infectious Medicine (CIM), F59, Department of Medicine, Karolinska Institutet, Karolinska University Hospital Huddinge, Stockholm, Sweden

³Armauer Hansen Research Institute (AHRI), Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

⁴Department of Radiology, Faculty of Medicine, Black Lion University Hospital and Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

⁵Department of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, Black Lion University Hospital and Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

⁶Infectious Diseases Division (IDD), International Centre for Diarrhoeal Disease Research, Bangladesh (icddr,b), Dhaka, Bangladesh

⁷Clinical Microbiology, Department of Laboratory Medicine (Labmed), Karolinska Institutet, Stockholm, Sweden

⁸Institute of Environmental Medicine (IMM), Karolinska Institutet, Stockholm, Sweden

⁹Department of Medicine, Division of Infectious Diseases, Karolinska University Hospital Huddinge, Stockholm, Sweden

Author's contributions

Supporting Information

Correspondence: Associate professor Susanna Brighenti, Centre for Infectious Medicine (CIM), Department of Medicine Huddinge, Karolinska Institutet, Karolinska University Hospital Huddinge, 141 86 Stockholm, Sweden. (fax: 0046-8-746 7637; susanna.brighenti@ki.se). Second correspondance: Associate professor Peter Bergman, Department of Laboratory Medicine (LABMED), Karolinska Institutet, Karolinska University Hospital Huddinge, 141 86 Stockholm, Sweden. (peter.bergman@ki.se). A A.B. and N .G. contributed equally to this work.

Conflict of interest statement

No conflict of interest to declare.

S.B., P.B., J.A., S.A., A.B., E.K., W.A., G.Ad., B.A. and R.R. contributed to study design. S.B., P.B. and J.A. wrote the protocol. S.B. acquired funding. S.B., S.A., N.G. and A.B. acquired ethics permissions. N.G., A.B., S.A., M.T., E.K., W.A. and G.Ad. coordinated the clinical work, collected data and participated in data management. G.As. read chest radiographs. N.G. and A.S. coordinated the laboratory analyses. S.B., N.G., S.A. and G.Ad. supervised data collection. S.B., P.B., J.A. participated in data analysis, and data interpretation. U.H. and A.W. performed the statistical analyses. S.B. wrote the manuscript and did the literature search; all other authors critically reviewed the content and approved the final version.

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article:

Abstract

Objective—Immunotherapy using vitamin D (vitD₃) and phenylbutyrate (PBA), may support standard drug regimens used to treat infectious diseases. We investigated if $vitD₃+PBA$ enhanced clinical recovery from pulmonary tuberculosis (TB).

Methods—A randomized controlled trial was conducted in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Patients with smear-positive or smear-negative TB received daily oral supplementation with 5000IU vitD₃ and 2×500mg PBA or placebo for 16 weeks, together with 6-months chemotherapy. Primary endpoint: Reduction of a clinical composite TB score at week 8 compared with baseline using modified intention-to-treat (mITT, n=348) and per-protocol (n=296) analyses. Secondary endpoints: Primary and modified TB scores (week 0, 4, 8, 16, 24), sputum conversion, radiological findings and plasma $25(OH)D_3$ concentrations.

Results—Most subjects had low baseline plasma 25(OH)D₃ levels that increased gradually in the vitD₃+PBA group compared with placebo ($P < 0.0001$) from week 0 to 16 (mean 34.7 vs 127.4 nmol/l). In the adjusted mITT analysis, the primary TB score was significantly reduced in the intervention group at week 8 (−0.52, 95% CI −0.93, −0.10; $P = 0.015$) while the modified TB score was reduced at week 8 (−0.58, 95% CI −1.02, −0.14; $P = 0.01$) and 16 (−0.34, 95% CI -0.64 , -0.03 ; $P = 0.03$). VitD₃+PBA had no effect on longitudinal sputum-smear conversion ($P =$ 0.98). Clinical adverse events were more common in the placebo group (24.3%) compared with the vitD₃+PBA group (12.6%).

Conclusion—Daily supplementation with vitD₃+PBA may ameliorate clinical TB symptoms and disease-specific complications, while the intervention had no effect on bacterial clearance in sputum.

Trial registration—ClinicalTrials.gov NCT01698476

Keywords

clinical trial; tuberculosis; vitamin D; phenylbutyrate; host defense

Introduction

New drug regimens for tuberculosis (TB) are necessary both to prevent TB disease and to treat ongoing active TB [1]. In contrast to single molecular targets, targeting multiple pathways in an attempt to treat chronic infections may reduce the risk for drug-resistance and clinical complications. Immunomodulatory compounds such as vitamin D_3 (vit D_3) and phenylbutyrate (PBA) are attractive therapeutic candidates with the ability to regulate various axes of the immune system [2]. In vitro, vitD₃ can enhance macrophage-mediated killing of Mycobacterium tuberculosis (Mtb) by inducing the antimicrobial peptide LL-37 [3, 4] and autophagy [5]. LL-37 may also exert chemotactic functions to activate migration of immune cells to the site of infection [6]. Similarly, PBA, which is a histone deacetylase (HDAC) inhibitor, induces LL-37 in different cell types [7] and autophagy in macrophages [8] but also exhibits direct bacteriostatic effects on Mtb [9]. Accordingly, the combination of vitD₃ and PBA has been shown to enhance intracellular Mtb-killing in vitro [8] and ex vivo [10, 11]. While both vit D_3 and PBA are potent inducers of innate mucosal immunity, these

compounds also possess important anti-inflammatory properties including inhibition of dendritic cell maturation, Th1/Th17 cell proliferation and cytokine production [2, 12]. Thus, hypothetically vit D_3 +PBA has the potential to reduce bacterial growth and simultaneously resolve pathological inflammation in the Mtb-infected lung.

To test if adjunct therapy with vitD₃+PBA could support clinical recovery in pulmonary TB, we performed a randomized controlled trial (RCT) in Ethiopia. As large bolus doses of vitD₃ generally fail to improve TB outcomes [13–15], we used daily dosing of vitD₃ in combination with PBA for 16 weeks of chemotherapy. Bacteriological confirmation of pulmonary TB mostly involves detection of acid-fast bacilli (AFB) or Mtb-growth in sputum. However, about 20–50% of pulmonary TB patients are smear-negative [16], but qualify for initiation of standard chemotherapy based on a high clinical suspicion and radiographic findings according to the World Health Organization (WHO) criteria [1]. Thus, we designed a longitudinal study to exploit if v itD₃+PBA could improve clinical status in smear-positive and smear-negative TB patients by limiting bacterial load and pathological inflammation in the lung. The response to adjunct vit D_3 +PBA therapy was evaluated using a numerical composite TB score, assessing the reduction in clinical symptoms during the initial 8-weeks intensive-phase treatment with standard drugs. This is a validated score composed of eleven clinical variables used to measure TB patients' clinical status at repeated visits [17] and as an outcome measure in clinical trials [13, 18, 19]. Symptoms effectively improve during the initial 8-weeks intensive-phase standard treatment as a result from rapidly reduced bacterial loads in the lung and bacterial clearance from sputum in about 80% of TB patients [1, 20], and therefore this time-point was used to assess the primary outcome.

Materials and Methods

For details on the Methods, please see the online Supporting Information.

Study design

A randomized, double-blinded, placebo-controlled trial was conducted at the Chest Unit, Department of Internal Medicine, Black Lion University Hospital in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia in collaboration with eleven health centers after ethical approval in Ethiopia and Sweden (Supporting Information). The study was registered at www.clinicaltrials.gov, NCT01698476, prior to inclusion of the first patient.

Patients

Inclusion criteria: HIV-negative patients >18 years, with newly diagnosed pulmonary TB (<5 days chemotherapy). Diagnoses were made from: a) positive sputum-smear microscopy or Mtb-culture, and/or b) clinical symptoms and chest X-ray findings consistent with TB, i.e. clinical TB defined according to WHO criteria. Exclusion criteria: HIV-infection, multidrugresistant TB (MDR-TB) or extrapulmonary TB, anti-TB treatment in the past 2 years, hypercalcemia (serum calcium > 3.0 mmol/l), pregnancy and breast-feeding, liver or renal diseases, malignancies, or treatment with cardiac glycosides. All patients provided written and signed informed consent before enrolment.

Interventions

This was a two-arm intervention trial using daily adjunct therapy with vit D_3 +PBA during the first 16 weeks of 6-months standard chemotherapy including a fixed-dose-combination of isoniazid, rifampicin, pyrazinamide, and ethambutol for 8 weeks (intensive-phase treatment) and isoniazid and rifampicin for an additional 16 weeks. Patients were randomized to receive daily oral supplementation using the following dosing scheme [10, 21]: 1) 5000 IU vitD₃ (five tablets once daily) and 500 mg PBA (one tablet twice daily), or 2) vitD₃ placebo and PBA placebo tablets. VitD₃ tablets were used instead of oil, to control for variations in self-dosage of the oil preparation. Good manufacturing practice-produced vit D_3 tablets (Vigantoletten) and matching placebo were donated by Merck Serono (Darmstadt, Germany); PBA (Sodium Phenylbutyrate) and matching placebo were obtained from Scandinavian Formulas (PA, USA).

Randomization and masking

Subjects were randomized in a one-to-one allocation ratio using computer-generated randomization codes and block randomization with a block size of ten (Karolinska Trial Alliance, Stockholm, Sweden), to ensure that in each block, five subjects were randomized to vit D_3 +PBA and the other five subjects to placebo. Pharmacists at the Black Lion Hospital prepared the study medication and provided the randomization codes that assigned the patients to vitD₃+PBA or placebo treatment. Patients were recruited by senior consultants and a health officer, and they were all blinded to the randomization.

Outcome measures

The primary endpoint was clinical recovery, assessed as the reduction/change of clinical symptoms at week 8 compared to week 0 (baseline). As it is not possible to record improvement of TB disease using a single symptom or laboratory result, we used a previously validated clinical TB score [13, 17]. This is a numerical composite TB score (2 point scale: symptom absent (0p) or present (1p), max 13p) that included self-reported clinical symptoms (cough, night sweats, and chest pain), as well as different variables monitored by the study physician upon clinical examination (anemia, hemoptysis, dyspnea, tachycardia, positive findings at lung auscultation, fever, low body mass index (BMI), and low mid-upper arm circumference (MUAC)). The primary TB score was also grouped into different severity classes as mild (SC-I: 0–5p), moderate (SC-II: 6–7) and severe (SC-III: ≥8p) disease [17].

Secondary endpoints included longitudinal assessments of the primary and a modified TB score (week 0, 4, 8, 16, and 24), sputum-smear microscopy (week 0–4, and 8) and Mtbculture (week 0 and 8) conversion, chest X-ray (week 0, 4, 8, 16 and 24), and levels of 25 hydroxyvitamin D_3 (25(OH) D_3) in plasma (week 0, 4, 8 and 16). The modified TB score (3point scale: symptom absent (0p), improved (1p) or no change/worsened (2p), max 22p) was generated using a more spread grading scale of the primary TB score, aiming to detect and include small but important changes in clinical symptoms (Table S1).

Procedures

Sputum and blood samples were collected for the described laboratory analyses. Sputumsmear microscopy and sputum-culture, erythrocyte sedimentation rate (ESR), total and differential counts, CD4 T cell counts (BD Biosciences, NJ, USA) and blood chemistry analyses were conducted at ICL, which is a Randox International Quality Assessment Scheme (RIQAS)-accredited and Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) certified commercial laboratory in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Adverse events (AEs) included examinations of TB-specific clinical complications (week 4, 8, 16 and 24) and blood chemistry analysis (week 0, 4, 8 and 16) to measure liver and kidney function, and calcium/ phosphate homeostasis. QuantiFERON-TB Gold in-Tube (Cellestis; Statens Serum Institut, Denmark) was assessed in whole blood samples at the Armauer Hansen Research Institute (AHRI) in Adddis Ababa, Ethiopia, according to the manufacturer's instructions, for detection of Mtb-specific IFN- γ release *in vitro*. Levels of 25(OH)D₃ in plasma samples were analyzed at the Department of Clinical Chemistry, Karolinska University Hospital in Stockholm, Sweden using a chemiluminescence immunoassay (CLIA) on a LIAISONinstrument (DiaSorin Inc., Stillwater, MN, USA), detectable range 7.5–175 nmol/l, CV 2– 5%. Plasma 25(OH)D₃ concentrations were used to determine vitD₃ status and to monitor treatment adherence.

Statistical analysis

The sample size calculation was based on a previous study demonstrating that standard TB care will reduce the primary clinical TB score from 6.5 to 3.2 during the initial 8-weeks intensive-phase treatment [17]. To reduce the TB score an additional 25% above the effect of standard chemotherapy at 8-weeks (calculating with a mean TB score of 3.2 in the placebo group and a standard deviation of 2.3 in both intervention groups), a sample size of 131 patients/group was required (80% power, $P < 0.05$, two-sided test). The power calculations included 8-weeks data alone. But as described in the original study protocol, analyses of the primary endpoint was based on a comparison of the change in the TB score between baseline (week 0) and week 8 in the two study groups, which likely increased the power of the analyses. Assuming a dropout rate of approximately 15%, the sample size was increased to 300 patients. To compensate for the proportion of patients with sputum-negative clinical TB to patients with sputum-smear positive TB, the sample size was increased another 20%, resulting in 360 patients.

Results were analyzed following the intention-to-treat (ITT)-concept, using multiple imputation by chained equations to impute outcomes for persons lost to follow-up. We applied modified ITT (mITT) analysis, which is commonly used in antimicrobial/antiinfective trials, when test results obtained after randomization show that some patients were misdiagnosed and/or ineligible. mITT allows for these randomized subjects to be excluded from the analysis in a justified way. Per-protocol analyses included all subjects who completed the study treatment. Primary and secondary analyses were conducted using linear regression, ordinal logistic regression (AFB-grading and radiology) and logistic regression (Mtb-culture conversion). Both crude and adjusted analyses were made. The covariates adjusted for were age, gender, smear-positivity and baseline value of the outcome. Those variables were selected a priori to increase the precision of our estimates, since we believed

them to be associated with the outcome [22]. Time to sputum-microscopy conversion was shown using a Kaplan-Meier-plot and a log rank test. A P -value < 0.05 was considered significant. Analyses were conducted using IBM SPSS Statistics 20.0 and Stata 13 (StataCorp, College Station, Texas, USA).

Results

Enrolment

We screened 894 patients for eligibility from January 2013-May 2015 as described in the trial profile (Fig. 1). Most patients ineligible for randomization were HIV-infected (n=418). After randomization of 390 patients, laboratory testing confirmed that 42 enrolled patients did not fulfill the pre-defined exclusion criteria (other pulmonary diseases (n=18), other concomitant diseases ($n=8$) and MDR-TB ($n=16$)). The remaining 348 subjects constituted the mITT cohort, allocated to vitD₃+PBA (n=175) or placebo (n=173) treatment. A total of 52 patients discontinued the intervention or were lost to follow-up (dropout rate=14.9%). Thus, 296 patients completed the treatment per-protocol, allocated to vitD₃+PBA (n=150) or placebo (n=146) treatment.

Baseline characteristics

Baseline data are presented in Table 1. About 81% of all patients had a positive sputumsmear and/or Mtb-culture result, out of which 10–12% were discordant samples (Table 1). Additional 19% of the patients had a clinical TB diagnosis of whom 94% had a positive QuantiFERON result (Supporting Information). Around 50% of the patients had a BMI below 18 kg/m² while 54% had a MUAC below 22 cm, indicating underweight (Table 2). The primary TB score had a mean of 5–6p, grouping 49.5% of the patients into severity class II–III. Plasma $25(OH)D_3$ concentrations were low, around 35 nmol/l. As an international reference for $25(OH)D_3$ concentrations in blood, we followed the Endocrine Society's Clinical Practice Guideline defining vitD₃ deficiency as a $25(OH)D_3$ levels below 50 nmol/l [23]. Accordingly, most TB patients were vitD₃ deficient (80.6%) or insufficient (15.0%) at baseline. From Table 1, it is also evident that the distribution of gender was slightly skewed. Gender was one of the covariates adjusted for in the primary and secondary analyses.

Primary endpoint: Clinical TB score

In the TB score, cough, night sweats, chest pain, tachycardia, low BMI, and low MUAC were the most common clinical symptoms, while conjunctiva pallor, hemoptysis, and fever were less frequent (Table 2). Longitudinal assessments of the primary TB score are illustrated in Figure 2a and Figure S1, and the differences and 95% CI are shown in Table 3. In the adjusted mITT analysis, the primary TB score was significantly reduced at week $8(P)$ $= 0.015$) and the modified TB score was significantly reduced at weeks 8 ($P = 0.01$) and 16 $(P = 0.03)$ in the vitD₃+PBA group compared with placebo. Similarly, in the adjusted perprotocol analysis, we observed a significant reduction of both the primary ($P = 0.022$) and the modified ($P = 0.016$) TB score at week 8. Overall, the odds ratios of individual clinical symptoms predominantly favored the treatment group (Fig. 2b).

Secondary endpoints: Sputum-conversion analyses and 25(OH)D3 levels in plasma

Sputum-conversion rates and AFB-grading are illustrated in Figure 3 and the odds ratio and 95% CI are shown in Table 4. Longitudinal analysis showed no significant effect of $vitD₃+PBA$ treatment on the time to sputum-microscopy conversion in smear-positive patients ($P = 0.98$) (Fig. 3a). However, AFB-grading demonstrated a significant reduction of smear-positive TB in the intervention group at week 4 using both mITT ($P = 0.017$ and $P =$ 0.037) and per-protocol analyses ($P = 0.024$ and $P = 0.038$), although this difference was no longer detected at week 8 (Fig. 3b and Table 3). Neither, could we detect enhanced Mtbculture conversion (Fig. 3c) or radiological improvement (Fig. S2).

Most subjects had low plasma $25(OH)D₃$ levels at baseline that increased significantly (P 0.0001) in the vitD₃+PBA group compared with placebo at week 4 (mean 38.6 vs 91.5) nmol/l), week 8 (mean 38.4 vs 109.4 nmol/l), and week 16 (mean 40.1 vs 127.4 nmol/l) (Fig. 4), which indicated good adherence. Baseline levels of $25(OH)D₃$ also increased significantly ($P = 0.0014$) in the placebo group at week 16 (mean 35.5 vs 39.9 nmol/l), although this increase was modest compared with the increase in the vitD₃+PBA group at week 16 (4.4 nmol/l vs 92.7 nmol/l). Thus, vitD₃ deficiency in the vitD₃+PBA group was rapidly corrected and most patients reached optimal $25(OH)D₃$ levels >75 nmol/l within 4 weeks of vit D_3 +PBA supplementation. Interestingly, patients who raised their baseline $25(OH)D₃$ levels at week 4, regardless of treatment allocation, were significantly more likely to have reduced AFB in sputum compared with patients who maintained low $25(OH)D₃$ levels ($P = 0.005$ and $P = 0.008$) (Table 4). Thus, the odds of an AFB-positive sputum sample was reduced with 2% per unit increase in $25(OH)D_3$ concentration.

Subgroup analyses: Clinical TB score in patients with vitD3 deficiency and moderate-tosevere TB

A sub-group analysis showed that vitD₃+PBA treatment was most beneficial in vitD₃ deficient patients with moderate-to-severe disease (TB score>5 i.e. severity class II–III) (^P for interaction = 0.016) (Table S2). The primary and modified TB scores in this group are illustrated in Figure 5 and the differences and 95% CI are shown in Table 3. Per-protocol analyses revealed a significant reduction in the primary TB score at week $8 (P = 0.005)$, while the modified TB score was significantly reduced at weeks $8 (P = 0.004$ and $P = 0.003)$ and 16 ($P = 0.036$) in the vitD₃+PBA group. Furthermore, vitamin D responders ie. TB patients with $25(OH)D_3$ levels 50 nmol/l at baseline and >75 nmol/l at week 16, revealed a significant decrease in both primary and modified TB scores at week 8 ($P = 0.034$ and $P =$ 0.014) and week 16 ($P = 0.021$ and $P = 0.023$) (Table S2).

Adverse events

The major clinical AEs observed at follow-up were reported as TB-specific clinical complications listed in Table 5. The most common manifestations in the treatment group were chest pain and anemia while the placebo group patients commonly experienced chest pain, dyspnea, and dyspepsia. Significantly fewer clinical complications were reported in the vitD₃+PBA group compared with placebo (22 vs 42; $P = 0.006$). No clinically relevant changes in blood chemistry (calcium, phosphate, albumin, or creatine) related to the intervention were observed (Table S3 and S4).

Discussion

In this trial, we tested if daily adjunct therapy with $vitD₃+PBA$ could improve clinical symptoms in smear-positive as well as smear-negative patients with pulmonary TB. Supplemented patients had an enhanced clinical recovery assessed as a reduction in clinical TB score during the first 8-weeks of intensive-phase treatment. The intervention did not influence time to sputum-microscopy conversion, although the odds of an AFB-positive result was significantly lower in the vitD₃+PBA group at week 4. The intervention was particularly effective in patients with low $25(OH)D_3$ levels and an elevated TB score at enrolment, suggesting that disease amelioration was more efficient in v itD₃ deficient patients with more pronounced clinical symptoms. Moreover, it was safe to administer vitD3+PBA daily for 16 weeks and clinical AEs were more common in the placebo group. We conclude that adjunct therapy with vit D_3+PBA may contribute to reduced disease severity and reduced clinical complications in patients with pulmonary TB, while the treatment had less effects on bacterial clearance in vivo.

Our study has several limitations. A randomized study does not exclude the possibility of chance imbalances at baseline. In our study, this imbalance was observed in the somewhat skewed distribution of gender in the placebo compared with the vit D_3 +PBA group. However, the adjusted analysis corrected for this imbalance. Furthermore, designing a 2-arm intervention trial enabled an increased sample size per group, but prevented assessment of the individual effects of vit D_3 or PBA. Although the synergistic or additive effects of these compounds have been well-described in vitro [7–9] and ex vivo [10, 11], additional clinical studies will contribute to an increased understanding of vitD₃+PBA treatment effects in vivo.

Furthermore, we used a semi-soft endpoint as primary outcome, a TB score that is a rapid, low-cost method for clinical monitoring of TB in resource-poor settings [17]. This validated score has been successfully used to follow prognosis and treatment outcome especially in smear-negative TB patients [13, 18, 19]. The score correlated with grade of smear-positivity [17], and an elevated TB score at week 8 (i.e. SC-III) was associated to higher mortality and poor prognosis [19]. It is possible that smear-negative TB patients have a milder form of disease, including lower bacterial loads and less severe symptoms. Nevertheless, many of these patients start chemotherapy in line with WHO guidelines. Only including sputumpositive TB patients, representing 40–70% of all cases, may generate a selection bias that is not representative of standard clinical care. Thus, we maintain that a composite clinical score has advantages in measuring TB outcomes, particularly in routine clinical practice where sputum results are frequently negative.

It is difficult to show an effect of vitD₃+PBA on top of the highly effective standard chemotherapy. In this study, an additional 25% reduction of the TB score in the intervention group compared with the standard drugs at 8 weeks, was considered a significant effect. This change in TB score has previously been used to define clinical improvement [17]. The intervention had a significant effect on the composite TB scores, but not on any given symptom alone. The modified TB score was significantly reduced at both weeks 8 and 16 compared with week 8 for the primary TB score, also showing lower P-values. This indicated that using a more nuanced grading scale (3-point instead of 2-point scale) of the

validated primary TB score may increase the likelihood to detect changes in clinical symptoms among the study subjects. About 3–4 weeks extra time was required to reduce the primary TB score in the placebo group to a level comparable with the vitD₃+PBA group at the end of adjunctive therapy at week 16. At the end of standard chemotherapy at week 24, most patients had a TB score below 1, which suggested that the majority of clinical symptoms had disappeared due to the successful effects of lengthy 6-months standard care. Importantly, the reduction in both TB scores were more powerful in the subgroup analyses including one third of the patients with v it D_3 deficiency and more advanced TB disease, which strengthen the results of the primary analysis. Altogether, these data support the clinical relevance of our findings, although continued investigations will need to validate their applicability. Importantly, for a common infectious disease such as TB, even a smallto-moderate clinical effect on top of already existing standard treatment, may have significant positive effects on treatment outcome [24].

This study failed to show significant effects of vitD₃+PBA treatment on sputum conversion rates. The sensitivity and specificity of sputum-smear microscopy is limited, although this is the most common method for TB diagnosis and to follow treatment outcome [25]. Microscopy targets the most infectious cases with a threshold for Mtb detection of <10 000 bacilli/ml of sputum, and therefore fails to diagnose clinical TB in many smear-negative patients [25]. Sputum-culture is more sensitive, but time-consuming and prevents grading of the bacterial load. Possibly, the standard anti-TB drugs are so effective to reduce bacterial growth that the potential anti-mycobacterial effects of vit D_3 +PBA will be masked. Consequently, TB trial results could be misinterpreted if the primary effect of vitD₃+PBA is to modulate inflammatory responses or in other ways affect physiological processes that will improve clinical but not bacteriological outcomes [12, 26]. A recently described role for parent vitD₃, the 25(OH)D₃ proform and the active $1,25(OH)D_3$ metabolite, is to stabilize the endothelium, which is typically activated and destabilized during inflammation [27]. Interestingly, such vascular stabilization occurs independently from the antimicrobial effector functions triggered via intracellular vitD₃ receptor signaling. Such effects may be better assessed using clinical improvement, resolution of inflammation and prevention of relapse.

This study also has several strengths. The majority of TB patients had a vitD₃ deficiency at baseline that was rapidly corrected upon vit D_3+PBA treatment. Compelling evidence suggests that a low vitD₃ status may enhance susceptibility to active TB [28, 29]. Importantly, basal $25(OH)D₃$ levels can vary substantially between different populations and therefore TB patients may respond differently to v itD₃ supplementation. TB patients in Tanzania [30], India [31], and Guinea-Bissau [13] had higher $25(OH)D_3$ levels (ranges: 62– 91 nmol/l), while patients in South Africa [28], Bangladesh [11], Pakistan [18], and the UK [14] were mostly vitD₃ deficient (ranges: 20–34 nmol/l). Therefore, screening for vitD₃ deficiency before start of standard treatment may increase the likelihood of successful adjunctive therapy with vit D_3 and/or PBA.

Another strength was that daily doses of vitD₃ was administered together with PBA instead of using a bolus regimen. Due to the short half-life of parent vitD₃ (12–24h), even large bolus doses are rapidly cleared from the circulation. Moreover, the cellular availability of

vitD₃ and its proform is very different since $25(OH)D_3$ is tightly bound to the vitD₃ binding protein, reducing cellular entry and activation compared with vitD₃ [32]. While daily dosing will sustain stable and physiological concentrations of circulating vit D_3 , high-dose, longinterval dosing will result in large fluctuations in circulating vit D_3 concentrations [32]. The unfavorable consequences of such pharmacological dosing is underappreciated, as this will severely reduce a continuous supply of bioavailable intact vitD₃ as the major source for cellular uptake and conversion to the active metabolite that can maintain optimal functions of vitD₃-induced systems.

Until 2017, eleven randomized trials have been published investigating the therapeutic potential of adjunctive vitD₃ treatment in TB [11, 13–15, 18, 31, 33–37], but consensus on the potential beneficial effects is still lacking. Most trials were too small to demonstrate statistical power, the dosage regimen of $vitD₃$ was highly variable, as were baseline concentrations of $25(OHD)$ ₃. The primary endpoint was mainly time to sputum conversion, while treatment efficacy including smear-negative patients have rarely been reported. Importantly, most studies used bolus doses of $vitD₃$, which have consistently failed to support clinical and microbiological efficacy in TB $[13–15, 31, 36, 37]$. VitD₃ given at an early stage of chemotherapy (0, 14, 28, and 42 days) resulted in enhanced sputum conversion only in patients with the Taq1 tt genotype of the VDR [14], while vitD₃ provided at later time-points $(0, 5,$ and 8 months) failed to increase $25(OH)D₃$ levels and accordingly had no effect compared to placebo [13]. Two doses of 200 000 IU vitD₃ (0 and 4 weeks) showed significant effects on weight gain, BMI, and pulmonary involvement, but had no overall effect on the clinical TB score or smear conversion [18]. However, patients with $25(OH)D₃ < 30$ nmol/l at enrolment revealed significantly lower TB scores and a clear trend towards enhanced bacterial sputum clearance [18]. Similarly, daily vitD₃+PBA treatment reduced both primary and modified TB scores more robustly in v itD₃ deficient patients with moderate-to-severe TB disease. Likewise, v itD₃ supplementation did not affect the time to first exacerbation in patients with COPD, but subgroup analysis revealed significant effects in vitD₃ deficient patients [38, 39]. Consistently, a recent meta-analysis provided evidence that daily-weekly administration of vitD₃ reduced the risk of acute respiratory tract infections, particularly among individuals with low vitD₃ levels [40]. Altogether, these studies underline that the protective effects of v itD₃ supplementation is most likely affected by baseline vit D_3 status.

Conclusion

Our results suggest that a physiological dosing schedule based on daily supplementation with vitD₃ in combination with PBA can be used to ameliorate clinical symptoms and TBspecific AEs, primarily in vitD₃ deficient TB patients. Therefore, although vitD₃+PBA may not be applicable as a therapeutic intervention to a broad range of TB patients, supplementation may turn out promising for certain high-risk groups with vitD₃ deficiency, immunodeficiency diseases, MDR-TB or latent TB. In contrast to treatment of active TB, there is a possibility that nutritional supplementation will have a greater impact on the prevention of disease among individuals with latent TB and vitD₃ deficiency [41]. Such prophylactic studies are complicated to implement, but would shed additional light on the potential benefit of vitD₃+PBA immunotherapy.

Supplementary Material

Refer to Web version on PubMed Central for supplementary material.

Acknowledgments

We thank the local study team at the Black Lion Hospital and the Armauer Hansen Research Institute (AHRI), as well as all the nurses and administrative staff at the collaborative health centers in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. We also thank the members of our Data Monitoring and Safety Board. Finally, we would like to sincerely thank all the patients who participated in this trial. We also thank BioScience Writers (BSW) in Houston, Texas, for assistance with language editing of this manuscript.

Funding

This study was funded by the Swedish Contingency Agency (MSB) and the Swedish International Development Agency (Sida) (2010-7938), the Swedish Research Council (VR) (K2015-56X-20665-08-3), the Swedish Heart and Lung Foundation (HLF) (20140752) and Karolinska Institutet (senior research position of SB). Merck Serono kindly donated Vigantoletten and placebo tablets and also assisted the study with labels. NB was supported in part by the National Institute of Health (NIH) Research Training grant R25TW009337, funded by the Fogarty International Center, the NIH Office of the Director, and the National Institute of Mental Health.

Abbreviations

References

- 1. Nahid P, Dorman SE, Alipanah N, et al. Official American Thoracic Society/Centers for Disease Control and Prevention/Infectious Diseases Society of America Clinical Practice Guidelines: Treatment of Drug-Susceptible Tuberculosis. Clin Infect Dis. 2016; 63:e147–95. [PubMed: 27516382]
- 2. Hewison M. Vitamin D and the immune system: new perspectives on an old theme. Rheum Dis Clin North Am. 2012; 38:125–39. [PubMed: 22525848]
- 3. Liu PT, Stenger S, Tang DH, Modlin RL. Cutting edge: vitamin D-mediated human antimicrobial activity against Mycobacterium tuberculosis is dependent on the induction of cathelicidin. J Immunol. 2007; 179:2060–3. [PubMed: 17675463]
- 4. Martineau AR, Wilkinson KA, Newton SM, et al. IFN-gamma- and TNF-independent vitamin Dinducible human suppression of mycobacteria: the role of cathelicidin LL-37. J Immunol. 2007; 178:7190–8. [PubMed: 17513768]
- 5. Yuk JM, Shin DM, Lee HM, et al. Vitamin D3 induces autophagy in human monocytes/ macrophages via cathelicidin. Cell Host Microbe. 2009; 6:231–43. [PubMed: 19748465]
- 6. Kai-Larsen Y, Agerberth B. The role of the multifunctional peptide LL-37 in host defense. Front Biosci. 2008; 13:3760–7. [PubMed: 18508470]
- 7. Steinmann J, Halldorsson S, Agerberth B, Gudmundsson GH. Phenylbutyrate induces antimicrobial peptide expression. Antimicrob Agents Chemother. 2009; 53:5127–33. [PubMed: 19770273]
- 8. Rekha RS, Rao Muvva SS, Wan M, et al. Phenylbutyrate induces LL-37-dependent autophagy and intracellular killing of Mycobacterium tuberculosis in human macrophages. Autophagy. 2015; 11:1688–99. [PubMed: 26218841]
- 9. Coussens AK, Wilkinson RJ, Martineau AR. Phenylbutyrate is bacteriostatic against Mycobacterium tuberculosis and regulates the macrophage response to infection, synergistically with 25-hydroxyvitamin D3. PLoS pathog. 2015; 11:e1005007. [PubMed: 26133770]
- 10. Mily A, Rekha RS, Kamal SM, et al. Oral intake of phenylbutyrate with or without vitamin D3 upregulates the cathelicidin LL-37 in human macrophages: a dose finding study for treatment of tuberculosis. BMC Pulm Med. 2013; 13:23. [PubMed: 23590701]
- 11. Mily A, Rekha RS, Kamal SM, et al. Significant effects of oral phenylbutyrate and vitamin D3 adjunctive therapy in pulmonary tuberculosis: A randomized controlled trial. PloS one. 2015; 10:e0138340. [PubMed: 26394045]
- 12. Coussens AK, Wilkinson RJ, Hanifa Y, et al. Vitamin D accelerates resolution of inflammatory responses during tuberculosis treatment. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2012; 109:15449–54. [PubMed: 22949664]
- 13. Wejse C, Gomes VF, Rabna P, et al. Vitamin D as supplementary treatment for tuberculosis: a double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled trial. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2009; 179:843– 50. [PubMed: 19179490]
- 14. Martineau AR, Timms PM, Bothamley GH, et al. High-dose vitamin D(3) during intensive-phase antimicrobial treatment of pulmonary tuberculosis: a double-blind randomised controlled trial. Lancet. 2011; 377:242–50. [PubMed: 21215445]
- 15. Ganmaa D, Munkhzul B, Fawzi W, et al. High-Dose vitamin D3 during tuberculosis treatment in Mongolia. A randomized controlled trial. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2017; 196:628–37. [PubMed: 28692301]
- 16. Behr MA, Warren SA, Salamon H, et al. Transmission of Mycobacterium tuberculosis from patients smear-negative for acid-fast bacilli. Lancet. 1999; 353:444–9. [PubMed: 9989714]
- 17. Wejse C, Gustafson P, Nielsen J, et al. TBscore: Signs and symptoms from tuberculosis patients in a low-resource setting have predictive value and may be used to assess clinical course. Scand J Infect Dis. 2008; 40:111–20. [PubMed: 17852907]

- 18. Salahuddin N, Ali F, Hasan Z, Rao N, Aqeel M, Mahmood F. Vitamin D accelerates clinical recovery from tuberculosis: results of the SUCCINCT Study [Supplementary Cholecalciferol in recovery from tuberculosis]. A randomized, placebo-controlled, clinical trial of vitamin D supplementation in patients with pulmonary tuberculosis. BMC Infect Dis. 2013; 13:22. [PubMed: 23331510]
- 19. Janols H, Abate E, Idh J, et al. Early treatment response evaluated by a clinical scoring system correlates with the prognosis of pulmonary tuberculosis patients in Ethiopia: a prospective followup study. Scand J Infect Dis. 2012; 44:828–34. [PubMed: 22812387]
- 20. Parikh R, Nataraj G, Kanade S, Khatri V, Mehta P. Time to sputum conversion in smear positive pulmonary TB patients on category I DOTS and factors delaying it. J Assoc Physicians India. 2012; 60:22–6.
- 21. Bergman P, Norlin AC, Hansen S, et al. Vitamin D3 supplementation in patients with frequent respiratory tract infections: a randomised and double-blind intervention study. BMJ open. 2012; 2:e001663.
- 22. Pocock SJ, Assmann SE, Enos LE, Kasten LE. Subgroup analysis, covariate adjustment and baseline comparisons in clinical trial reporting: current practice and problems. Stat Med. 2002; 21:2917–30. [PubMed: 12325108]
- 23. Holick MF, Binkley NC, Bischoff-Ferrari HA, et al. Evaluation, treatment, and prevention of vitamin D deficiency: an Endocrine Society clinical practice guideline. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2011; 96:1911–30. [PubMed: 21646368]
- 24. Iacobucci G. Vitamin D supplementation does cut respiratory infections, new study suggests. BMJ. 2017; 356:j847. [PubMed: 28209724]
- 25. Keeler E, Perkins MD, Small P, et al. Reducing the global burden of tuberculosis: the contribution of improved diagnostics. Nature. 2006; 444(Suppl 1):49–57.
- 26. Cegielski P, Vernon A. Tuberculosis and vitamin D: what's the rest of the story? Lancet Infect Dis. 2015; 15:489–90. [PubMed: 25863560]
- 27. Gibson CC, Davis CT, Zhu W, et al. Dietary vitamin D and its metabolites non-genomically stabilize the endothelium. PloS one. 2015; 10:e0140370. [PubMed: 26469335]
- 28. Martineau AR, Nhamoyebonde S, Oni T, et al. Reciprocal seasonal variation in vitamin D status and tuberculosis notifications in Cape Town, South Africa. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2011; 108:19013–7. [PubMed: 22025704]
- 29. Liu PT, Stenger S, Li H, et al. Toll-like receptor triggering of a vitamin D-mediated human antimicrobial response. Science. 2006; 311:1770–3. [PubMed: 16497887]
- 30. Tostmann A, Wielders JP, Kibiki GS, Verhoef H, Boeree MJ, van der Ven AJ. Serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D3 concentrations increase during tuberculosis treatment in Tanzania. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis. 2010; 14:1147–52. [PubMed: 20819260]
- 31. Daley P, Jagannathan V, John KR, et al. Adjunctive vitamin D for treatment of active tuberculosis in India: a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial. Lancet Infect Dis. 2015; 15:528–34. [PubMed: 25863562]
- 32. Hollis BW, Wagner CL. Clinical review: The role of the parent compound vitamin D with respect to metabolism and function: Why clinical dose intervals can affect clinical outcomes. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2013; 98:4619–28. [PubMed: 24106283]
- 33. Martineau AR, Wilkinson RJ, Wilkinson KA, et al. A single dose of vitamin D enhances immunity to mycobacteria. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2007; 176:208–13. [PubMed: 17463418]
- 34. Nursyam EW, Amin Z, Rumende CM. The effect of vitamin D as supplementary treatment in patients with moderately advanced pulmonary tuberculous lesion. Acta Med Indones. 2006; 38:3– 5. [PubMed: 16479024]
- 35. Morcos MM, Gabr AA, Samuel S, et al. Vitamin D administration to tuberculous children and its value. Boll Chim Farm. 1998; 137:157–64. [PubMed: 9689902]
- 36. Ralph AP, Waramori G, Pontororing GJ, et al. L-arginine and vitamin D adjunctive therapies in pulmonary tuberculosis: a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial. PloS one. 2013; 8:e70032. [PubMed: 23967066]
- 37. Tukvadze N, Sanikidze E, Kipiani M, et al. High-dose vitamin D3 in adults with pulmonary tuberculosis: a double-blind randomized controlled trial. Am J Clin Nutr. 2015; 102:1059–69. [PubMed: 26399865]
- 38. Lehouck A, Mathieu C, Carremans C, et al. High doses of vitamin D to reduce exacerbations in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a randomized trial. Ann Intern Med. 2012; 156:105–14. [PubMed: 22250141]
- 39. Martineau AR, James WY, Hooper RL, et al. Vitamin D3 supplementation in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (ViDiCO): a multicentre, double-blind, randomised controlled trial. Lancet Respir Med. 2015; 3:120–30. [PubMed: 25476069]
- 40. Martineau AR, Jolliffe DA, Hooper RL, et al. Vitamin D supplementation to prevent acute respiratory tract infections: systematic review and meta-analysis of individual participant data. BMJ. 2017; 356:i6583. [PubMed: 28202713]
- 41. Ganmaa D, Giovannucci E, Bloom BR, et al. Vitamin D, tuberculin skin test conversion, and latent tuberculosis in Mongolian school-age children: a randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled feasibility trial. Am J Clin Nutr. 2012; 96:391–6. [PubMed: 22760564]

 Author ManuscriptAuthor Manuscript

Fig. 1.

Trial profile. Consort flow diagram of patients with suspected pulmonary TB, from screening to analysis. Patients ineligible for randomization included HIV infection (n=418), relocation after diagnosis (n=17), age <18 years (n=16), non-TB pleural effusions (n=16), TB relapse (n=9), too weak/old (n=4), >5 days into TB chemotherapy (n=2), pregnancy $(n=2)$ and mental health problems $(n=1)$. Diseases other than TB included pulmonary fibrosis (n=14), cancer (n=2), and pulmonary thromboembolism (n=2) while other concomitant diseases included HIV infection $(n=2)$, liver disease $(n=3)$ and renal disease $(n=3)$. Discontinued intervention included patients with liver toxicity $(n=3)$, adherence failure (n=5) and cancer (n=1). Lost to follow up included patients who withdraw their consent (n=30), moved from study area (n=12), or were imprisoned (n=1). Patients who dropped out from the placebo treatment at week 0: n=11, week 4: n=9, week 8: n=5 and week 16: n=2. Patients who dropped out the vitD₃+PBA treatment at week 0: n=14, week 4: n=5, week 8: n=5 and week 16: n=1.

Fig. 2.

Primary efficacy analyses. (a) The primary clinical TB score was assessed at baseline and at weeks 4, 8, 16, and 24 after initiation of anti-TB chemotherapy. Adjunct vitD₃+PBA treatment was provided during the first 16 weeks of standard care. The efficacy analysis included comparison of the vitD₃+PBA and placebo treatment between week 0 and week 8. Crude data from the mITT cohort are presented as the mean and 95% CI. The blue line (circles) represents placebo while the red line (triangles) represents vit D_3 +PBA treatment. The horizontal bar indicate the estimated difference (given a linear reduction of the TB score) in weeks that it would take to reduce the primary TB score in the placebo group to a level comparable to the TB score in the vit D_3 +PBA group assessed at the end of adjunct treatment at week 16. (b) Forrest plot showing the odds ratio of the individual diseases symptoms included in the primary efficacy analysis. The estimate and 95% CI at week 8 are shown.

Fig. 3.

Sputum-smear conversion analyses. (a) Longitudinal analysis of time to sputum-smear conversion after initiation of anti-TB chemotherapy in patients who were sputummicroscopy positive at enrolment. Crude data are presented in a Kaplan-Meier curve. The

blue line represents placebo while the red line represents vit D_3 +PBA treatment. The hazard ratio (HR) and 95% CI is shown. (b) AFB-grading among sputum-smear positive TB patients at baseline compared to week 4 and 8 after initiation of anti-TB chemotherapy. AFB-positivity $(+)$ was graded using microscopy as no AFB (negative), scanty $(0-1)$, $+1$, $+2$, or $+3$ AFB. Data are shown in a bar graph with a colour scale from 0 (red) to $3+$ (blue) AFB. The numbers and proportion of AFB+ TB patients in the placebo vs vit D_3 +PBA group at week 4 and 8 are also indicated in the graph. Patients with a negative sputum-smear result at baseline were excluded from the conversion analysis. (c) Sputum-culture conversion among both Mtb-culture positive and negative TB patients at baseline compared to week 8 after initiation of anti-TB chemotherapy. Bar graph showing negative Mtb-culture (red) vs positive Mtb-culture (blue).

Fig. 4.

VitD₃ analysis. Plasma levels of $25(OH)D_3$ in the placebo compared to the vitD₃+PBA group at baseline and at weeks 4, 8, and 16 after initiation of anti-TB chemotherapy. Data are shown in a scatter dot plot with blue symbols for placebo and red symbols for $vitD₃+PBA$ treatment. The solid line indicates the median, and the dashed lines mark the thresholds for $vitD_3$ deficiency and insufficiency.

Fig. 5.

Subgroup analyses. Longitudinal assessment of (a) the primary or (b) the modified TB score in TB patients with $25(OH)D_3$ levels 50 nmol/l and a TB score is at baseline. The primary clinical TB score and the modified TB score were assessed at baseline and at weeks 4, 8, 16, and 24. Crude data from this cohort are presented as the mean and 95% CI. The blue line (circles) represents placebo while the red line (triangles) represents vitD₃+PBA treatment. (c) Forrest plot showing the odds ratio of the individual diseases symptoms included in the primary TB score for TB patients with $25(OH)D_3$ levels 50 nmol/l and a TB score >5 at baseline. The estimate and 95% CI at week 8 are shown.

Baseline characteristics

mITT, modified intention-to-treat; NDA, no data available; BCG, Bacillus Calmette Guerin; IQR, interquartile range; BMI, Body Mass Index; MUAC, Mid-Upper-Arm-Circumference; WBC, white blood cell; ESR, erythrocyte sedimentation rate; SC, severity class; 25(OH)D3, 25 hydroxyvitamin D

 a^2 Data are n (%), mean or median (IQR).

 b
Sputum-microscopy and sputum-culture positivity were not always overlapping, but around 10–12% of the samples were discordant.

 c Three patients had a negative QuantiFERON; vitD3+PBA (n=2) and placebo (n=1), and one patient had no QuantiFERON test taken, vitD3+PBA $(n=1)$.

 d
Treatment with anti-TB drugs >2 years before study enrollment.

Baseline data in clinical TB scores

mITT, modified intention-to-treat; Hb, hemoglobin; BMI, Body Mass Index; MUAC, Mid-Upper-Arm-Circumference

 a Clinical symptoms in the primary TB score are reported as absent (0) or present (1). Data are numbers.

Clinical TB score in vitD₃+PBA versus placebo Clinical TB score in vitD3+PBA versus placebo

J Intern Med. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2019 September 01.

 4 Data are adjusted for gender, age, and TB score and sputum-smear positivity at baseline. Data are adjusted for gender, age, and TB score and sputum-smear positivity at baseline.

Sputum-smear conversion in vitD₃+PBA versus placebo Sputum-smear conversion in vitD3+PBA versus placebo

Adverse events

AE = adverse event

a All AEs were grade 1 or mild, apart from the oral rash that was classified as a grade 2 AE. All AEs were experienced by different individuals.