

doi: 10.1093/toxsci/kfy283 Dryad Digital Repository DOI: https://datadryad.org/review?doi= doi:10.5061/dryad.016gp34 Advance Access Publication Date: November 26, 2018 Research Article

All-trans Retinoic Acid Disrupts Development in Ex Vivo Cultured Fetal Rat Testes. II: Modulation of Mono-(2-ethylhexyl) Phthalate Toxicity

Daniel J. Spade,*,1 Susan J. Hall,* Jeremy D. Wortzel,* Gerardo Reyes,*,† and Kim Boekelheide*

* Department of Pathology and Laboratory Medicine, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island 02912; and † Division of Natural Sciences, College of Mount Saint Vincent, Riverdale, New York 10471

1 To whom correspondence should be addressed at Department of Pathology and Laboratory Medicine, Brown University, Box G-E5, Providence, RI 02912. Fax: (401) 863-9008. E-mail: daniel_spade@brown.edu.

ABSTRACT

Humans are universally exposed to low levels of phthalate esters (phthalates), which are used to plasticize polyvinyl chloride. Phthalates exert adverse effects on the development of seminiferous cords in the fetal testis through unknown toxicity pathways. To investigate the hypothesis that phthalates alter seminiferous cord development by disrupting retinoic acid (RA) signaling in the fetal testis, gestational day 15 fetal rat testes were exposed for 1–3 days to 10 $^{-6}$ M all-trans retinoic acid (ATRA) alone or in combination with 10^{–6}–10^{–4} M mono-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (MEHP) in ex vivo culture. As previously reported, exogenous ATRA reduced seminiferous cord number. This effect was attenuated in a concentrationdependent fashion by MEHP co-exposure. ATRA and MEHP-exposed testes were depleted of DDX4-positive germ cells but not Sertoli cells. MEHP alone enhanced the expression of the RA receptor target Rbp1 and the ovary development-associated genes Wnt4 and Nr0b1, and suppressed expression of the Leydig cell marker, Star, and the germ cell markers, Ddx4 and Pou5f1. In co-exposures, MEHP predominantly enhanced the gene expression effects of ATRA, but the Wnt4 and Nr0b1 concentration-responses were nonlinear. Similarly, ATRA increased the number of cells expressing the granulosa cell marker FOXL2 in testis cultures, but this induction was attenuated by addition of MEHP. These results indicate that MEHP can both enhance and inhibit actions of ATRA during fetal testis development and provide evidence that RA signaling is a target for phthalate toxicity in the fetal testis.

Key words: phthalates; fetal testis; retinoic acid; mixture.

Phthalate esters (phthalates), including di-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), are male reproductive toxicants used in industrial processes and consumer goods, especially to plasticize polyvinyl chloride, but also in products such as solvents, adhesives, and personal care products. Human exposure to phthalates is ubiquitous [\(Kavlock](#page-9-0) et al., 2002, [2006\)](#page-9-0), and phthalate exposure during gestation has been linked to male reproductive tract defects and decreased fertility in later life ([Fisher, 2004;](#page-9-0) [Fisher](#page-9-0) et al., 2003). Phthalates are well-characterized as antiandrogens that reduce fetal testicular testosterone in the rat

(Furr et al.[, 2014](#page-9-0)). However, phthalates alter fetal seminiferous cord development even in the absence of detectable antiandrogenic effects (Gaido et al.[, 2007;](#page-9-0) Habert et al.[, 2014a,b;](#page-9-0) [Heger](#page-9-0) et al., 2012; [Johnson](#page-9-0) et al., 2012; [Mitchell](#page-10-0) et al., 2012; [Spade](#page-10-0) et al.[, 2014](#page-10-0)). It is therefore likely that phthalates have multiple targets in the fetal testis, including a molecular initiating event unrelated to androgen signaling that triggers the adverse effects of phthalates on Sertoli and/or germ cells.

A challenge for describing the mechanisms of phthalate toxicity has been identification of molecular initiating events

© The Author(s) 2018. Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of the Society of Toxicology. All rights reserved. For permissions, please e-mail: journals.permissions@oup.com

([Howdeshell](#page-9-0) et al., 2015). The mechanism of the phthalateinduced anti-androgenic action in the rat fetal testis is reduction of testosterone, without antagonism of the androgen receptor ([Foster](#page-9-0) et al., 2001; Parks et al.[, 2000\)](#page-10-0). Phthalates interact with peroxisome proliferator-activated receptors (PPARs), but there is little evidence that activation of canonical PPAR targets is a major component of the fetal testis toxicity of phthalates ([Hannas](#page-9-0) et al.[, 2012;](#page-9-0) [Howdeshell](#page-9-0) et al., 2015; [Rouiller-Fabre](#page-10-0) et al., 2015). Another possibility is that phthalate toxicity is mediated by disruption of signaling through other nuclear receptors, potentially mediated by crosstalk with PPARs. For example, in mouse Sertoli cells, exposure to mono-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (MEHP) or other peroxisome proliferators prevents translocation of retinoic acid receptors (RARs) into the nucleus, presumably because of competition between PPARs and RARs for access to retinoid X receptors (RXRs), with which both receptors form heterodimers ([Bhattacharya](#page-8-0) et al., 2005; [Dufour](#page-9-0) et al., 2003). Therefore, interaction between phthalates and the retinoic acid (RA) signaling pathway is a potential mechanism of phthalate toxicity in the fetal testis.

RA signaling is critical for gonad development. During fetal development, the testis is protected from high levels of RA by expression of the RA-metabolizing CYP26B1 enzyme, in contrast to the ovary, where RA is present at concentrations that promote ovary development and initiation of germ cell meiosis ([Bowles](#page-8-0) et al., 2006; Li et al.[, 2009\)](#page-10-0). Cyp26b1 levels in the testis are directly under the control of the pro-testis developmental signaling factors Sry and Sox9 [\(Kashimada](#page-9-0) et al., 2011; Li [et al.](#page-10-0), [2014](#page-10-0)), indicating that metabolism of RA is required for testis development. Following RA exposure in vitro, or in systems in which CYP26B1 is knocked out or inhibited in vivo, fetal testis development is disrupted, resulting in decreased Leydig cell function, inappropriate meiotic entry in germ cells, and loss of seminiferous cord structure, with some variation by species (Cupp et al.[, 1999;](#page-8-0) [Hogarth](#page-9-0) et al., 2015; [Jorgensen](#page-9-0) et al., 2015; [Lambrot](#page-9-0) et al., 2006; [Livera](#page-10-0) et al., 2000, [2001,](#page-10-0) [2004](#page-10-0); [Trautmann](#page-10-0) et al.[, 2008](#page-10-0)). The disorganized testicular phenotype caused by all-trans retinoic acid (ATRA) exposure ex vivo is associated with enhanced expression of the ovarian development gene, Wnt4, and the anti-testis transcription factor, Nr0b1, as well as an increase in the number of FOXL2-positive Sertoli cells, indicating aberrant induction of signaling for ovary developmental processes in the testis [\(Spade](#page-10-0) et al., 2018). Because phthalates can interact with the RA signaling pathway, which influences germ cell and seminiferous cord development, and because phthalates have effects on germ cells and seminiferous cords that are not secondary to their anti-androgenic effects, we hypothesized that exposure to MEHP would alter RA signaling and expression of sex determination factors in the rat fetal testis. To test this hypothesis, rat fetal testes were cultured for 1–3 days with ATRA, MEHP, or co-exposure to both ATRA and MEHP, and cultured testes were analyzed for morphological changes and changes in expression of key genes and proteins involved in RA signaling and gonadal cell fate maintenance.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Animals. All procedures involving animals were approved by the Brown University Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee, in accordance with the Guide for the Care and Use of Laboratory Animals. Timed pregnant SAS Sprague Dawley rats (strain code 400) were obtained from Charles River and euthanized on gestational day (GD) 15 by inhalation of isoflurane.

Fetuses were euthanized by decapitation, and sex was determined by examination of gonads under a stereomicroscope.

Testis cultures. GD 15 fetal rat testes were cultured as reported in [Spade](#page-10-0) et al. (2018). Briefly, testes were placed on Millicell-CM cell culture inserts in 24-well cell culture plates with 460μ l DMEM/ F12 media supplemented with $20 \mu g/ml$ gentamicin, 50 units/ml penicillin, 50 μg/ml streptomycin, 50 μg/ml Albumax II, 200 μg/ ml bovine serum albumin, $1 \times$ ITS liquid media supplement, and $50 \,\mu$ g/ml sodium L-ascorbate. Testes were exposed in culture media to vehicle control (1:4000 DMSO), MEHP (10 $^{-6}$, 10 $^{-5}$, or 10^{-4} M), 10^{-6} M ATRA alone, or 10^{-6} M ATRA with MEHP (10^{-6} , 10^{-5} , or 10^{-4} M; referred to hereafter as co-exposure). The testes of each male fetus were divided so that one was cultured in treatment media and the other in vehicle. Sample size for each analysis was 6–7 testis pairs per treatment group, except for FOXL2 IHC, where sample size was 3 testis pairs per treatment group. ATRA and MEHP stock solutions were prepared in DMSO, aliquoted in light-protected vials, and stored at -20° C for up to 14 days before use. Media was prepared daily and changed every 24 h. Stocks and media were protected from excessive exposure to fluorescent light by handling in light-protected vials under low light and/or a yellow lamp. Following 24 h of culture, samples intended for RNA isolation were collected by snap freezing in liquid nitrogen and were stored at -80° C. On day 3 of culture, the remaining samples were collected for histology by fixing in modified Davidson's solution for 15 min, then storing in 70% ethanol at 4°C until processing. MEHP was chosen for this experiment as a model of the testicular toxicity of phthalates. MEHP and its diester parent compound, di-(2-ethylheyxl) phthalate (DEHP) are anti-androgenic in rats and induce multinucleated germ cells (MNGs) in rats, mice, and humans, according to a large body of literature ([Andrade](#page-8-0) et al., 2006; [Chauvigne](#page-8-0) et al.[, 2009, 2011;](#page-8-0) Do et al.[, 2012](#page-8-0); [Dostal](#page-8-0) et al., 1988; [Doyle](#page-8-0) et al., [2013](#page-8-0); Gaido et al.[, 2007;](#page-9-0) [Hannas](#page-9-0) et al., 2011; [Howdeshell](#page-9-0) et al., [2007](#page-9-0); [Muczynski](#page-10-0) et al., 2012; Parks et al.[, 2000;](#page-10-0) [Wang](#page-10-0) et al., 2016). MEHP falls within the 4–6 carbon parent side chain length range that has been determined to have the greatest effect on testosterone levels in rats (Furr et al.[, 2014](#page-9-0)). Phthalate monoesters are considered to be the dominant and toxicologically active phthalate metabolites in vivo [\(Albro, 1986;](#page-8-0) [Calafat](#page-8-0) et al., 2006; [Clewell](#page-8-0) et al., 2010; Jones et al.[, 1993](#page-9-0); [Saillenfait](#page-10-0) et al., 2001), making MEHP the appropriate compound for an in vitro experiment.

Histology and immunohistochemistry. For histology and immunohistochemistry analyses on 3-day testis culture samples, briefly, fixed testes were dehydrated in a series of graded ethanols, followed by xylenes, and embedded in paraffin. About $5 \mu m$ sections were cut from each paraffin-embedded sample at approximately 150, 300, 450, and $600 \mu m$ depths. Cut sections were deparaffinized in xylene and rehydrated through a series of graded ethanols. Sections were stained with hematoxylin and eosin (H&E) for analysis of general histology and counting of seminiferous cord number on an Olympus BH-2 light microscope. Seminiferous cord number per section was quantified for 6–7 testis pairs per treatment group. Sections were also examined for depletion of germ cells and induction of MNGs. Immunohistochemical staining was performed for actin, alpha 2, smooth muscle, aorta (ACTA2, also called smooth muscle aactin) and the ovarian protein, forkhead box L2 (FOXL2), using staining methods and primary and secondary antibodies and concentrations reported in [Spade](#page-10-0) et al. (2018). The IHC labeling protocol for the germ cell marker and VASA homolog, DEADbox helicase 4 (DDX4) was modified as follows: citrate buffer

antigen retrieval and permeabilization steps were omitted; blocking was performed for 60 min in PBS with 8% normal goat serum and 1% BSA; primary and secondary antibody concentrations were both 1:4000. All histological and immunohistochemical images were obtained from slides scanned at $40\times$ magnification on an Aperio ScanScope CS (Aperio Digital Pathology/Leica Biosystems, Buffalo Grove, Illinois). FOXL2 positive cells were counted manually on digital slide images of 1–4 sections per block in Aperio ImageScope software by a scorer who was blind to treatment. The average value for each block was used for statistical analysis $(n = 3$ testis pairs per group). Cleaved caspase-3 IHC labeling is described in the [Supplementary Methods](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data) and [Supplementary Table 1.](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data)

Real-time RT-PCR. For RNA extraction, snap-frozen tissue samples were homogenized by shaking with approximately 100– 200 mg stainless steel beads (Next Advance, Troy, New York) in a Disruptor Genie (Scientific Industries, Bohemia, New York) for 2 min at the highest setting. RNA was isolated and purified using the Qiagen DNA/RNA AllPrep kit, according to the manufacturer's protocol, including the optional on-column DNase digestion. cDNA was prepared from 150 ng total RNA from each sample, using the Qiagen RT^2 First Strand Kit (Qiagen, Valencia, California). cDNA produced from 1.35 ng input RNA was used in each real-time PCR reaction well. Primers for realtime PCR were RT² QPCR Primer Assays, pre-validated primer sets obtained from SA Biosciences/Qiagen ([Supplementary](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data) [Table 2](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data)), and reactions were run with RT^2 Real-Time SYBR Green/ROX PCR Master mix (Qiagen). PCR amplification and quantification was performed on a ViiA 7 Real-Time PCR System (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, California). Target genes selected for known responsiveness to treatment with ATRA or MEHP included the RAR target gene Rbp1, ovary development-related genes Wnt4 and Nr0b1, germ cell marker Ddx4, germ cell pluripotency marker Pou5f1, and the Leydig cell marker/steroidogenesis gene Star. Housekeeping genes were Ldha and B2m.

Each primer assay was first tested as described in [Spade](#page-10-0) et al. [\(2018\)](#page-10-0): the PCR reaction was run with a test pool of rat fetal testis cDNA, products were purified using the QIAquick PCR Purification Kit (Qiagen), then visualized on an agarose gel to confirm amplicon size and specificity. The concentration of purified PCR products was determined using a NanoDrop ND-1000 spectrophotometer, and purified products were serially diluted to create a 7-point standard curve with 10^8 through 10^2 copies of PCR product per reaction. RNA from randomly selected samples was pooled and used as template to create a no reverse transcriptase negative control. All real-time PCR samples and standards were run in triplicate. The real-time PCR reaction included an initial denaturation at 95° C for 15 min, 40 cycles of a 2-step PCR reaction (95 \degree C for 15 sec, 60 \degree C for 1 min), and a denaturation curve analysis. A standard curve was run on each plate, and each plate included no template (water) and no reverse transcriptase negative controls. The SA Biosciences rat genomic DNA negative control primer set was also run to confirm the absence of genomic DNA contamination in all samples. Real-time PCR analyses were based on 6–7 testis pairs per treatment group. Experimental sample concentration (copies/µl) was determined in QuantStudio Real-Time PCR Software v1.3 (Applied Biosystems) by comparison to the standard curve. Target gene concentration was normalized to the geometric mean of concentration for the housekeeping genes, and fold change was determined for each sample relative to the mean of the normalized vehicle control values.

Testosterone analysis. Media samples from the third day of culture with 10 $^{-6}$ M ATRA, 10 $^{-4}$ M MEHP, 10 $^{-6}$ M ATRA $+$ 10 $^{-4}$ M MEHP, and paired vehicle samples were sent to the Ligand Assay and Analysis Core at the University of Virginia for testosterone analysis. Samples were diluted 1:10 or 1:20 to achieve a concentration within the reportable range of 10–1600 ng/dl and tested in duplicate using the mouse and rat testosterone ELISA from Immuno-Biological Laboratories. The intra-assay and inter-assay % CV reported by the Ligand Assay and Analysis Core for this assay in 2017 were 5.4 and 7.8, respectively.

Data analysis and statistics. Statistical analysis was performed using GraphPad Prism 7 (GraphPad Software, San Diego, California). All vehicle samples were treated as a single group, and differences between treatment groups were assessed using 1-way ANOVA, followed by Tukey's test for multiple comparisons, for most analyses. Testosterone data were analyzed by 2 way ANOVA followed by Tukey's test. Data are reported in figures as mean \pm SEM.

RESULTS

MEHP Altered Seminiferous Cord Number and Testicular Gene Expression

Following 3-day ex vivo exposure to MEHP, the seminiferous cord structure of cultured fetal testes remained intact. There was no consistent effect of MEHP on seminiferous cord number; however, the mean cord number was slightly higher in all MEHP-treated groups than vehicle, and this was statistically significant at 10-⁵ M MEHP. ACTA2 was expressed around the basement membranes of seminiferous cords and in the periphery of the section, but a few abnormal patches of ACTA2 expression were present in the interstitium, and broken patterns of ACTA2 expression were present around poorly defined cords ([Figure 1\)](#page-3-0).

Real-time RT-PCR targets were selected based on evidence of response to ATRA [\(Spade](#page-10-0) et al., 2018) or known responsiveness to phthalates in Leydig and germ cells. Following 1 day of MEHP exposure [\(Figure 2\)](#page-3-0), expression of the retinol binding protein and known RA signaling target, Rbp1, was induced in a concentration-dependent manner. The expression levels of Wnt4 and Nr0b1, involved in gonadal sex determination, were also elevated in an apparently concentration-dependent manner, with statistical significance at the highest MEHP dose. The Leydig cell-expressed steroidogenesis marker Star, and the germ cell-expressed genes, Pou5f1 and Ddx4, were decreased in a concentration-dependent manner by MEHP.

MEHP-Opposed ATRA Effect on Cord Structure and Enhanced ATRA-Driven Gene Expression

Following MEHP/ATRA co-exposure, ATRA reduced seminiferous cord number per section, as previously reported. ATRAtreated cultures showed ACTA2 expression exclusively in the periphery of the sample. However, MEHP attenuated the seminiferous cord loss in a concentration-dependent manner. At the highest MEHP co-exposure concentration (10 $^{-4}$ M), cord number was significantly greater than ATRA alone, and there was no significant difference between co-exposure and vehicle-treated cultures. MEHP co-exposure also restored the ACTA2 expressing cells, presumably peritubular myoid cells, surrounding the basement membrane region of seminiferous cords ([Figure 3\)](#page-4-0).

Figure 1. MEHP alone increased or had no effect on seminiferous cord number. Representative images of cultured fetal testes exposed to a concentration range of MEHP for 3 days, stained with hematoxylin and eosin (H&E) or immunohistochemically labeled for smooth muscle alpha actin (ACTA2). Scale bar = 200 µm. The impact of MEHP on the number of seminiferous cords per section was not concentration dependent, but 10^{–5} M MEHP significantly increased cord number versus vehicle. Many cords in MEHP-treated testes had irregular morphology. Values reported in chart are mean \pm SEM. $n = 17$ testes in vehicle control group and 6-7 testes per treated group. Bars not connected by the same letter are significantly different (p < .05) by 1-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's post hoc test. Overall ANOVA p = 0.0159. The fullcolor image is available online.

Figure 2. MEHP altered testicular gene expression. A, MEHP exposure led to a concentration-dependent increase in Rbp1, Wnt4, and Nr0b1 expression. B, MEHP exposure led to a concentration-dependent decrease in Ddx4, Pou5f1, and Star. Values are mean \pm SEM. Dashed line at y = 1. n = 19 testes in vehicle control group and 6-7 testes per treated group. Within each gene, bars not connected by the same letter are significantly different (p < .05) by 1-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's post hoc test.

Figure 3. MEHP opposed the seminiferous cord disrupting effect of ATRA. Representative images of cultured fetal testes exposed to a concentration range of MEHP with or without 10^{–6} M ATRA for 3 days, labeled with hematoxylin and eosin, or immunohistochemically labeled for smooth muscle alpha actin (ACTA2). 10^{–6} M ATRA caused seminiferous cord disorganization and loss of cord structure, but this effect was opposed by MEHP. ACTA2 was expressed only at the periphery of the ATRAtreated testes. MEHP co-exposure prevented the loss of ACTA2 deposition at seminiferous cord basement membranes that was observed in ATRA-treated cultures Scale bar = 200 µm. ATRA decreased the number of identifiable seminiferous cords per section, but cord number was increased in a concentration-dependent manner by MEHP. On x-axis, "—" indicates no ATRA; "+" indicates 10^{–6} M ATRA. Values reported in chart are mean \pm SEM. $n=24$ testes in vehicle control group and 6–7 testes per treated group. Bars not connected by the same letter are significantly different by 1-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's post hoc test. Overall ANOVA $p < .0001$. The full-color image is available online.

Following 1 day of culture, MEHP/ATRA co-exposure samples provided evidence of interaction between ATRA and MEHP on gene expression [\(Figure 4](#page-5-0)), with the presence of MEHP predominantly enhancing the gene expression effects of ATRA. MEHP decreased expression of Star, Pou5f1, and Ddx4, and this was exacerbated in degree and significance by ATRA. The increased expression of Rbp1 appeared to be enhanced by the combination of MEHP and ATRA; however, this effect appeared to plateau at approximately 6-fold induction of Rbp1 and was not significantly different from ATRA alone. The concentration-response curves for Nr0b1 and Wnt4 were nonlinear. Mean fold-induction of these genes increased with 10 $^{-6}$ and 10 $^{-5}$ M MEHP, but fell to a level similar to ATRA alone in the ATRA/ 10^{-4} M MEHP exposure, producing an inverted U-shaped concentration response. For Nr0b1, the difference between the 10 $^{-5}$ M and 10 $^{-6}$ M MEHP co-exposure groups was statistically significant.

Co-Exposure to MEHP and ATRA Resulted in Germ Cell Depletion and Loss of Leydig Cell Function

Intact seminiferous cords from samples cultured in vehicle media had a normal distribution of basally located DMRT1 expressing Sertoli cells and contained DDX4-positive germ cells. Exposure to the high dose of ATRA alone resulted in sections with only a small number of germ cells, not contained within well-defined seminiferous cords, and dispersion of DMRT1 positive cells throughout the section. Exposure to the high dose of MEHP, with or without ATRA, resulted in widespread depletion of germ cells but retention of seminiferous cords with basally located DMRT1-positive Sertoli cells [\(Figure 5](#page-5-0)). Cleaved caspase-3 IHC in samples treated for 1–3 days with high dose of MEHP, alone or in combination with ATRA, confirmed that the mechanism of germ cell loss was apoptosis [\(Supplementary](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data)

[Figure 1\)](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data). Germ cell apoptosis was significantly higher in the coexposure group than ATRA alone day 1 and higher than vehicle on day 3. In all treatments, cleaved caspase-3 labeling of cultured testes persisted longer than in the vehicle samples, in which cleaved caspase-3 labeling was greatest on day 1 and was barely detected on days 2 and 3. MNGs were rarely observed and were not induced by any treatment. In the MEHP concentrationresponse experiment, 2 of 19 vehicle-treated samples and 1 of 19 MEHP-treated samples (from the 10^{-6} M MEHP treatment) had at least 1 MNG. In the co-exposure experiment, 2 of 25 vehicle samples, 3 of 6 ATRA slides, and 4 of 19 samples from any co-exposure group had at least one MNG.

Testosterone concentration in tissue culture media was significantly reduced by all treatments tested on day 3 of culture ([Figure 6](#page-6-0)). Reduction of testosterone by the co-exposure was at least additive, with testosterone levels equal to 44.3%, 11.0%, and 4.4% of control in ATRA, MEHP, and co-exposure groups, respectively. All differences between groups were statistically significant except for the difference between MEHP and the coexposure. Both the ATRA and MEHP factors were significant in the 2-way ANOVA, as was the interaction term. This indicates reduced production of testosterone by Leydig cells in the presence of ATRA, MEHP, or the co-exposure.

ATRA and MEHP Altered Testicular FOXL2 Expression

Following 3 days of culture, exposure of ex vivo fetal testes to 10⁻⁶ M ATRA increased the number and intensity of testicular somatic cells expressing the ovarian transcription factor FOXL2 ([Figure 7\)](#page-6-0). With the addition of MEHP to cultures in the coexposure study, this effect of ATRA was reduced in magnitude. FOXL2-positive cell count was not significantly greater than the vehicle control average for any co-exposure group, and the

Figure 4. MEHP and ATRA altered testicular gene expression interactively. A, All MEHP and ATRA treatment groups enhanced expression of Rbp1. ATRA induction of Wnt4 and Nr0b1 expression was enhanced by 10 $^{-5}$ M MEHP, but not 10 $^{-4}$ MEHP, resulting in an inverted U-shaped concentration-response. B, All treatment groups resulted in suppression of Ddx4 and Pou5f1 expression. Star expression was not significantly suppressed by 10-⁶ M ATRA alone, but was significantly reduced with addition of all MEHP concentrations. On x-axis, "—" indicates no ATRA; "+" indicates 10^{–6} M ATRA. Values reported in chart are mean \pm SEM. Dashed line at y = 1. n = 26 testes in vehicle control group and 6-7 testes per treated group. Within each gene, bars not connected by the same letter are significantly different (p < .05) by 1-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's post hoc test.

Figure 5. Germ cells were depleted by MEHP and co-exposure. A, Following 3 days of culture, DMRT1-expressing Sertoli cells are present in all samples. In ATRA treatment group, Sertoli cells are dispersed throughout section, but in all other groups, defined cords can be observed. B, Immunohistochemical labeling of the germ cell cytoplasmic marker DDX4 confirms that germ cells are present in seminiferous cords of 3-day cultures treated with vehicle media. Germ cells are largely present within well-defined cords, but occasionally present outside of cords. Following treatment with 10⁻⁶ M ATRA, fewer germ cells are visible, and they are outside of defined cords. 10^{-4} M MEHP and 10^{-6} M ATRA $+$ 10^{-4} M MEHP cultures are largely devoid of germ cells, and sections show prominent germ cell-depleted cords. Scale bar = 50 µm. The full-color image is available online.

10-⁵ M MEHP co-exposure group had significantly lower FOXL2 positive cell density than ATRA alone. Notably, the majority of FOXL2-positive cells in all cultures were found in the interstitium or in highly disorganized areas of ATRA-treated sections.

No cells that could be morphologically identified as germ cells were FOXL2-positive. However, a small number of FOXL2-posive cells could be identified as possible Sertoli or peritubular myoid cells, based on morphology and localization relative to the basement membrane of seminiferous cords, especially in coexposure samples where cord architecture was retained. This suggests that multiple somatic cell types account for at least some of the FOXL2-expressing cells in ATRA-treated testis cultures.

Figure 6. ATRA and MEHP reduced testosterone secretion from cultured testes. Testosterone was measured by ELISA in media from the third day of culture, representing secretion from 48–72 h following the initiation of the experiment, in media containing 10^{–4} M MEHP, 10^{–6} M ATRA, or 10^{–4} M MEHP $+$ 10^{–6} M ATRA, or vehicle control. On the third day of culture, testosterone secretion was decreased in all treatment groups, relative to vehicle. MEHP and co-exposure groups had significantly lower testosterone than ATRA alone. All groups differed from each other, except for 10^{-4} M MEHP and the co-exposure. Groups not connected by the same letter are significantly different ($p < .05$) by 2-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's multiple comparison test. ATRA ($p <$.0001), MEHP ($p <$.0001), and the interaction term ($p = .0002$) were all significant by 2-way ANOVA. $n = 7-9$ samples per treatment group and 25 vehicle samples.

DISCUSSION

Using this ex vivo testis culture model, we found that ATRA exposure resulted in disorganization of seminiferous cords in cultured fetal testes through a process in which expression of genes involved in ovary development is enhanced and testicular somatic cell fate maintenance is disrupted ([Spade](#page-10-0) et al., [2018](#page-10-0)). In this study, high-concentration MEHP exposure resulted in some of the same effects, including moderate activation of RA signaling, as evidenced by Rbp1 expression, and enhanced expression of Wnt4 and Nr0b1 ([Figure 2](#page-3-0)). However, MEHP exposure slightly increased seminiferous cord number ([Figure 1](#page-3-0)). In co-exposure experiments, MEHP opposed the disorganizing effect of ATRA [\(Figure 3\)](#page-4-0), but still resulted in germ cell loss ([Figure 5](#page-5-0)), while gene expression results provided further evidence of interaction between ATRA and MEHP ([Figure 4\)](#page-5-0). These results demonstrate that MEHP interacts with ATRA, resulting in both enhancement and inhibition of some ATRA effects, indicating that RA signaling is disrupted by phthalate exposure, contributing to phthalate toxicity.

Phthalate exposure is known to alter seminiferous cord morphology in vivo, resulting in localization of Sertoli cells outside of seminiferous cords and increased seminiferous cord diameter, which is related to inhibition of late gestational seminiferous cord maturation [\(Barlow and Foster, 2003;](#page-8-0) Gaido et al.[, 2007;](#page-9-0) Lara et al.[, 2017;](#page-10-0) [Spade](#page-10-0) et al., 2015). Paradoxically, MEHP exposure in utero enhances basement membrane development and thickness [\(Klinefelter](#page-9-0) et al., 2012). The enhancement of basement membrane thickness suggests effects of phthalates on Sertoli or peritubular myoid cells, which jointly secrete basement membrane components [\(Skinner](#page-10-0) et al., 1985). Seminiferous cord development is a critical event in the development of the bipotential gonad into testis, driven by the expression of Sox9 in Sertoli cells and the self-assembly of Sertoli cells around clusters of germ cells ([Brennan and Capel, 2004](#page-8-0)). That phthalates

Figure 7. ATRA-mediated induction of FOXL2 was weakly opposed by MEHP. Vehicle-treated testis cultures exhibited little FOXL2 expression on day 3 of culture. Across all samples, most FOXL2-positive cells appeared in the interstitium. However, some weakly positive cells appeared to be possible Sertoli cells (arrow) or peritubular myoid cells (arrowheads) based on localization and nuclear morphology. ATRA exposure significantly increased the number of FOXL2-positive cells per unit area in 3-day fetal testis cultures. With addition of MEHP, FOXL2-positive cells appeared to be reduced in number and intensity. This decrease was significant with addition of 10⁻⁵ M MEHP. On x-axis, "-" indicates no ATRA; "+" indicates 10⁻⁶ M ATRA. Bars not connected by the same letter are significantly different (p < .05) by 1-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's test. Overall ANOVA $p = .0002$. Chart depicts mean \pm SEM of 12 testes in vehicle control group and 3 testes per treated group. Scale bar = $200 \mu m$. The full-color image is available online.

oppose the seminiferous cord disorganizing effects of ATRA ([Figure 3\)](#page-4-0) presents significant evidence that altered seminiferous cord development is a significant component of the fetal testis toxicity of phthalates, which may be directly mediated by effects on Sertoli or peritubular myoid cells. This mechanism is consistent with recent publications that have argued that phthalates disrupt signaling for sex determination in the testis by disrupting expression of sex determination factors, such as Sry and Sox9 (Du et al.[, 2017](#page-9-0); [Wang](#page-10-0) et al., 201[5, 2016](#page-10-0)).

The gene expression panel tested in this study was chosen based on the effects of ATRA in this ex vivo testis culture system and genes known to respond to phthalates. Increased Rbp1 is a canonical response to activated RAR signaling ([Balmer and](#page-8-0) [Blomhoff, 2002\)](#page-8-0). It was therefore a novel and surprising finding that MEHP alone enhanced Rbp1 expression. The combination of MEHP and ATRA increased Rbp1 expression slightly beyond the level induced by ATRA alone, but this difference was not statistically significant. More surprisingly still, exposure to the combination of ATRA and MEHP produced complex concentration-response curves for expression of Wnt4 and Nr0b1 ([Figure 4\)](#page-5-0). These two genes, the products of which are critical for determining the balance of signaling between testis and ovary development pathways in gonadal sex determination ([Brennan and Capel, 2004;](#page-8-0) [Minkina](#page-10-0) et al., 2014; [Nicol and Yao,](#page-10-0) [2015](#page-10-0); [Uhlenhaut](#page-10-0) et al., 2009), were up-regulated by ATRA alone. The addition of MEHP produced a nonlinear response in which expression of Wnt4 and Nr0b1 increased, then decreased, indicating that the mechanism by which ATRA-induced expression of these genes can be saturated, or that ATRA and MEHP can act cooperatively or antagonistically at different concentrations.

The nonlinear gene expression response for Wnt4 and Nr0b1 is consistent with the concentration-response of the seminiferous cord number. The presence of FOXL2-expressing cells in testes cultured with ATRA ([Figure 7\)](#page-6-0) is evidence that the disorganized phenotype associated with ATRA exposure is related to a disruption of testicular cell fate maintenance, as our companion paper reported ([Spade](#page-10-0) et al., 2018), and as has been supported by other recent studies [\(Bowles](#page-8-0) et al., 2018; [Nicol](#page-10-0) et al., [2018\)](#page-10-0). In this process, too, there is an antagonistic relationship between the two compounds. The saturation or antagonism observed with exposure to the highest MEHP concentration in the co-exposure study may explain this paradox. Notably, some published studies conducted in in utero exposure models have shown an influence of phthalates on the expression of Nr0b1 ([Euling](#page-9-0) et al., 2013; Liu et al.[, 2005;](#page-10-0) [Plummer](#page-10-0) et al., 2007; [Ungewitter](#page-10-0) et al.[, 2017\)](#page-10-0), as well as targets of RA signaling including Crabp2 ([Plummer](#page-10-0) et al., 2007). In fact, of the 328 genes identified as differentially regulated by DBP in 1 of 4 phthalate studies in a metaanalysis [\(Euling](#page-9-0) et al., 2013), 11 are known or suspected targets of RARs ([Balmer and Blomhoff, 2002](#page-8-0)), including Cryab, Dab2, Egr1, Fbp2, Fos, Gja1, Mapk1, Serpinh1, Star, Tgfb3, and Vcam1.

Exposure of cultured fetal testes to both MEHP and ATRA caused germ cell loss ([Figure 5](#page-5-0)). Cleaved caspase-3 IHC confirmed the mechanism as apoptosis, and indicated that the coexposure resulted in the highest rate of germ cell apoptosis over 3 days of culture ([Supplementary Figure 1](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data)). Notably, during normal testis development, germ cells become quiescent at approximately GD 17.5, after which time both germ cell proliferation and apoptosis cease [\(Culty, 2009,](#page-8-0) [2013\)](#page-8-0). In this experimental system, germ cell death in vehicle-treated samples is consistent with in vivo data, with germ cell death decreasing from the onset of culture at GD 15 over the course of the 3-day culture. In MEHP and co-exposure-treated samples, cleaved caspase-3 IHC labeling persisted into days 2–3 of culture, unlike

the vehicle. We did not observe induction of MNGs following exposure to MEHP and/or ATRA in the present study. MNGs have been reported to be induced by MEHP in cultured GD 20 and PND 3 rat testes ([Boisvert](#page-8-0) et al., 2016; Jones et al.[, 2015\)](#page-9-0). However, the absence of MNGs in rat testes cultured beginning on GD 15 is consistent with the late gestational window of sensitivity for induction of MNGs by phthalates, which appears to begin around the start of the germ cell quiescent period on GD 18 ([Ferrara](#page-9-0) et al., 2006; [Spade](#page-10-0) et al., 2015).

Another previously demonstrated effect of both ATRA and MEHP in the rat fetal testis is a reduction in testicular testosterone ([Habert](#page-9-0) et al., 2014b; [Livera](#page-10-0) et al., 2000). We observed testosterone reduction by both ATRA and MEHP on day 3 of culture, and the interaction term of the 2-way ANOVA was significant ([Figure 6\)](#page-6-0). This is consistent with Star gene expression measured in this study: MEHP alone decreased Star expression, consistent with the in vivo mechanism by which phthalates decrease testicular testosterone, and the addition of MEHP enhanced the reduction of Star expression by ATRA. A possible explanation of this effect is the altered expression of Nr0b1 produced by both MEHP and ATRA exposure, as DAX1, the gene product of Nr0b1, inhibits expression of steroidogenesis genes by inhibiting the transcription factor SF-1 ([Crawford](#page-8-0) et al., 1998; [Goodfellow and Camerino, 1999\)](#page-9-0). The anti-androgenic effect of phthalates has been reliably reproduced by in utero exposure of fetal rats to phthalates with C4-C8 aliphatic side chains [\(Furr](#page-9-0) et al.[, 2014;](#page-9-0) [Hannas](#page-9-0) et al., 2011; Parks et al.[, 2000\)](#page-10-0). However, some of the morphologic effects of phthalates on fetal testis development have been observed in mice or in human tissue models, without significant decreases in testosterone [\(Gaido](#page-9-0) et al., 2007; [Habert](#page-9-0) et al., 2014b; Heger et al.[, 2012;](#page-9-0) [Johnson](#page-9-0) et al., 2012; [Mitchell](#page-10-0) et al., 2012; [Spade](#page-10-0) et al., 2014). Therefore, it appears that reduced testosterone is not necessary or sufficient to produce the seminiferous cord effects that are observed following phthalate exposure. This suggests that the mechanisms of phthalate toxicity depend on other molecular initiating events, potentially including disruption of RA signaling.

This study provided several lines of evidence for interactions between MEHP and ATRA in the fetal testis. However, further mechanistic studies will be required to identify the nature of those interactions, particularly given that some effects of ATRA appeared to be inhibited by MEHP, while others were enhanced. While the genes and proteins selected for analysis in this study are known to respond to both phthalates and RA, it is likely that additional factors mediate this interaction. Phthalates are likely to have primary targets in Leydig, Sertoli, and/or germ cells. Phthalates are peroxisome proliferators, and PPAR activation is involved in phthalate toxicity in the adult testis [\(Gazouli](#page-9-0) et al., 2002; Ward et al.[, 1998](#page-10-0)), but there is little evidence that phthalates activate canonical PPAR signaling in the fetal testis ([Hannas](#page-9-0) et al., [2012](#page-9-0)). It has been reported that phthalate exposure can result in inhibition of RA signaling through PPAR-RAR crosstalk in mouse Sertoli cells ([Bhattacharya](#page-8-0) et al., 2005; [Dufour](#page-9-0) et al., 2003), that phthalates can interfere with RA metabolism [\(Chen and Reese,](#page-8-0) [2016](#page-8-0)), and that phthalates might bind directly to RXRs ([Sarath Josh](#page-10-0) et al.[, 2014](#page-10-0)), all of which indicates that RA signaling is a likely mechanism by which phthalates could exert effects on the testis. This hypothesis is consistent with the interactive effects of ATRA and MEHP on testicular development and function observed in this study. This is also consistent with recent observations that phthalate exposure alters expression of sex determination genes, including Sry, Sox9, and Dazl (Du et al.[, 2017;](#page-9-0) [Wang](#page-10-0) et al., 2016), as well as research on the central role of the transcription factor COUP-TFII in both the response to RA and phthalates and in regression of the

male reproductive tract ([Jorgensen](#page-9-0) et al., 2015; [van den Driesche](#page-10-0) et al.[, 2012;](#page-10-0) [Zhao et al., 2017](#page-10-0)). Alteration of RA signaling by phthalates during development would also potentially be consistent with observations of teratogenic effects in some phthalate studies (Gray et al.[, 2016](#page-9-0); [Ungewitter](#page-10-0) et al., 2017). Further, phthalates have been shown to interact with glucocorticoid receptor signaling (Drake et al., 2009) and estrogen signaling (Jones et al.[, 2015\)](#page-9-0), indicating that disruption of multiple nuclear receptor-mediated signaling pathways could contribute to phthalate toxicity. Future research efforts will investigate the testicular cell types in which ATRA and MEHP alter RA signaling during testis development and the mechanisms by which those changes are initiated.

SUPPLEMENTARY DATA

[Supplementary data](https://academic.oup.com/toxsci/article-lookup/doi/10.1093/toxsci/kfy283#supplementary-data) are available at Toxicological Sciences online.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors thank Melinda Ankerman for processing and cutting of histological samples and Timothy Nolan for assistance with immunohistochemistry scoring. KB does occasional expert consulting with chemical and pharmaceutical companies. KB and SH own stock in a small start-up biotechnology company (Semma Therapeutics) developing a cell-based therapy for diabetes.

FUNDING

This work was supported by The National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences (grant numbers R01ES017272; T32ES007272; K99ES025231), National Institute of General Medical Sciences (grant number T36GM101995), Brown University Royce Fellowship, and Leadership Alliance SR-EIP. The University of Virginia Center for Research in Reproduction Ligand Assay and Analysis Core is supported by the Eunice Kennedy Shriver NICHD/NIH (NCTRI) Grant P50-HD28934.

REFERENCES

- Albro, P. W. (1986). Absorption, metabolism, and excretion of di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate by rats and mice. Environ. Health Perspect. 65, 293–298.
- Andrade, A. J., Grande, S. W., Talsness, C. E., Grote, K., Golombiewski, A., Sterner-Kock, A., and Chahoud, I. (2006). A dose-response study following in utero and lactational exposure to di-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP): Effects on androgenic status, developmental landmarks and testicular histology in male offspring rats. Toxicology 225, 64–74.
- Balmer, J. E., and Blomhoff, R. (2002). Gene expression regulation by retinoic acid. J. Lipid Res. 43, 1773–1808.
- Barlow, N. J., and Foster, P. M. (2003). Pathogenesis of male reproductive tract lesions from gestation through adulthood following in utero exposure to di(n-butyl) phthalate. Toxicol. Pathol. 31, 397–410.
- Bhattacharya, N., Dufour, J. M., Vo, M. N., Okita, J., Okita, R., and Kim, K. H. (2005). Differential effects of phthalates on the testis and the liver. Biol. Reprod. 72, 745–754.
- Boisvert, A., Jones, S., Issop, L., Erythropel, H. C., Papadopoulos, V., and Culty, M. (2016). In vitro functional screening as a

means to identify new plasticizers devoid of reproductive toxicity. Environ. Res. 150, 496–512.

- Bowles, J., Feng, C. W., Ineson, J., Miles, K., Spiller, C. M., Harley, V. R., Sinclair, A. H., and Koopman, P. (2018). Retinoic acid antagonizes testis development in mice. Cell Rep. 24, 1330–1341.
- Bowles, J., Knight, D., Smith, C., Wilhelm, D., Richman, J., Mamiya, S., Yashiro, K., Chawengsaksophak, K., Wilson, M. J., Rossant, J., et al. (2006). Retinoid signaling determines germ cell fate in mice. Science 312, 596–600.
- Brennan, J., and Capel, B. (2004). One tissue, two fates: Molecular genetic events that underlie testis versus ovary development. Nat. Rev. Genet. 5, 509–521.
- Calafat, A. M., Brock, J. W., Silva, M. J., Gray, L. E., Jr, Reidy, J. A., Barr, D. B., and Needham, L. L. (2006). Urinary and amniotic fluid levels of phthalate monoesters in rats after the oral administration of di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate and di-n-butyl phthalate. Toxicology 217, 22–30.
- Chauvigne, F., Menuet, A., Lesne, L., Chagnon, M. C., Chevrier, C., Regnier, J. F., Angerer, J., and Jegou, B. (2009). Time- and doserelated effects of di-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate and its main metabolites on the function of the rat fetal testis in vitro. Environ. Health Perspect. 117, 515–521.
- Chauvigne, F., Plummer, S., Lesne, L., Cravedi, J. P., Dejucq-Rainsford, N., Fostier, A., and Jegou, B. (2011). Mono-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate directly alters the expression of Leydig cell genes and CYP17 lyase activity in cultured rat fetal testis. PLoS One 6, e27172.
- Chen, Y., and Reese, D. H. (2016). Disruption of retinol (vitamin A) signaling by phthalate esters: SAR and mechanism studies. PLoS One 11, e0161167.
- Clewell, R. A., Campbell, J. L., Ross, S. M., Gaido, K. W., Clewell, H. J., 3rd, and Andersen, M. E. (2010). Assessing the relevance of in vitro measures of phthalate inhibition of steroidogenesis for in vivo response. Toxicol. In Vitro 24, 327–334.
- Crawford, P. A., Dorn, C., Sadovsky, Y., and Milbrandt, J. (1998). Nuclear receptor DAX-1 recruits nuclear receptor corepressor N-CoR to steroidogenic factor 1. Mol. Cell. Biol. 18, 2949–2956.
- Culty, M. (2009). Gonocytes, the forgotten cells of the germ cell lineage. Birth Defects Res. C Embryo Today 87, 1–26.
- Culty, M. (2013). Gonocytes, from the fifties to the present: Is there a reason to change the name? Biol. Reprod. 89, 46.
- Cupp, A. S., Dufour, J. M., Kim, G., Skinner, M. K., and Kim, K. H. (1999). Action of retinoids on embryonic and early postnatal testis development. Endocrinology 140, 2343–2352.
- Do, R. P., Stahlhut, R. W., Ponzi, D., Vom Saal, F. S., and Taylor, J. A. (2012). Non-monotonic dose effects of in utero exposure to di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) on testicular and serum testosterone and anogenital distance in male mouse fetuses. Reprod. Toxicol. 34, 614–621.
- Dostal, L. A., Chapin, R. E., Stefanski, S. A., Harris, M. W., and Schwetz, B. A. (1988). Testicular toxicity and reduced Sertoli cell numbers in neonatal rats by di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate and the recovery of fertility as adults. Toxicol. Appl. Pharmacol. 95, 104–121.
- Doyle, T. J., Bowman, J. L., Windell, V. L., McLean, D. J., and Kim, K. H. (2013). Transgenerational effects of di-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate on testicular germ cell associations and spermatogonial stem cells in mice. Biol. Reprod. 88, 112.
- Drake, A. J., van den Driesche, S., Scott, H. M., Hutchison, G. R., Seckl, J. R., and Sharpe, R. M. (2009). Glucocorticoids amplify dibutyl phthalate-induced disruption of testosterone production and male reproductive development. Endocrinology 150, 5055–5064.
- Du, J., Xiong, D., Zhang, Q., Li, X., Liu, X., You, H., Ding, S., Yang, X., and Yuan, J. (2017). Mono-butyl phthalate-induced mouse testis injury is associated with oxidative stress and downregulated expression of Sox9 and Dazl. J. Toxicol. Sci. 42, 319–328.
- Dufour, J. M., Vo, M. N., Bhattacharya, N., Okita, J., Okita, R., and Kim, K. H. (2003). Peroxisome proliferators disrupt retinoic acid receptor alpha signaling in the testis. Biol. Reprod. 68, 1215–1224.
- Euling, S. Y., White, L. D., Kim, A. S., Sen, B., Wilson, V. S., Keshava, C., Keshava, N., Hester, S., Ovacik, M. A., Ierapetritou, M. G., et al. (2013). Use of genomic data in risk assessment case study: II. Evaluation of the dibutyl phthalate toxicogenomic data set. Toxicol. Appl. Pharmacol. 271, 349–362.
- Ferrara, D., Hallmark, N., Scott, H., Brown, R., McKinnell, C., Mahood, I. K., and Sharpe, R. M. (2006). Acute and long-term effects of in utero exposure of rats to di(n-butyl) phthalate on testicular germ cell development and proliferation. Endocrinology 147, 5352–5362.
- Fisher, J. S. (2004). Environmental anti-androgens and male reproductive health: Focus on phthalates and testicular dysgenesis syndrome. Reproduction 127, 305–315.
- Fisher, J. S., Macpherson, S., Marchetti, N., and Sharpe, R. M. (2003). Human 'testicular dysgenesis syndrome': A possible model using in-utero exposure of the rat to dibutyl phthalate. Hum. Reprod. 18, 1383–1394.
- Foster, P. M., Mylchreest, E., Gaido, K. W., and Sar, M. (2001). Effects of phthalate esters on the developing reproductive tract of male rats. Hum. Reprod. Update 7, 231–235.
- Furr, J. R., Lambright, C. S., Wilson, V. S., Foster, P. M., and Gray, L. E., Jr (2014). A short-term in vivo screen using fetal testosterone production, a key event in the phthalate adverse outcome pathway, to predict disruption of sexual differentiation. Toxicol. Sci. 140, 403–424.
- Gaido, K. W., Hensley, J. B., Liu, D., Wallace, D. G., Borghoff, S., Johnson, K. J., Hall, S. J., and Boekelheide, K. (2007). Fetal mouse phthalate exposure shows that gonocyte multinucleation is not associated with decreased testicular testosterone. Toxicol. Sci. 97, 491–503.
- Gazouli, M., Yao, Z. X., Boujrad, N., Corton, J. C., Culty, M., and Papadopoulos, V. (2002). Effect of peroxisome proliferators on Leydig cell peripheral-type benzodiazepine receptor gene expression, hormone-stimulated cholesterol transport, and steroidogenesis: Role of the peroxisome proliferatoractivator receptor alpha. Endocrinology 143, 2571–2583.
- Goodfellow, P. N., and Camerino, G. (1999). DAX-1, an 'antitestis' gene. Cell. Mol. Life Sci. 55, 857–863.
- Gray, L. E., Jr, Furr, J., Tatum-Gibbs, K. R., Lambright, C., Sampson, H., Hannas, B. R., Wilson, V. S., Hotchkiss, A., and Foster, P. M. (2016). Establishing the "biological relevance" of dipentyl phthalate reductions in fetal rat testosterone production and plasma and testis testosterone levels. Toxicol. Sci. 149, 178–191.
- Habert, R., Livera, G., and Rouiller-Fabre, V. (2014). Man is not a big rat: Concerns with traditional human risk assessment of phthalates based on their anti-androgenic effects observed in the rat foetus. Basic Clin. Androl. 24, 14.
- Habert, R., Muczynski, V., Grisin, T., Moison, D., Messiaen, S., Frydman, R., Benachi, A., Delbes, G., Lambrot, R., Lehraiki, A., et al. (2014b). Concerns about the widespread use of rodent models for human risk assessments of endocrine disruptors. Reproduction 147, R119–R129.
- Hannas, B. R., Lambright, C. S., Furr, J., Evans, N., Foster, P. M., Gray, E. L., and Wilson, V. S. (2012). Genomic biomarkers of phthalate-induced male reproductive developmental toxicity: A targeted RT-PCR array approach for defining relative potency. Toxicol. Sci. 125, 544–557.
- Hannas, B. R., Lambright, C. S., Furr, J., Howdeshell, K. L., Wilson, V. S., and Gray, L. E., Jr (2011). Dose-response assessment of fetal testosterone production and gene expression levels in rat testes following in utero exposure to diethylhexyl phthalate, diisobutyl phthalate, diisoheptyl phthalate, and diisononyl phthalate. Toxicol. Sci. 123, 206–216.
- Heger, N. E., Hall, S. J., Sandrof, M. A., McDonnell, E. V., Hensley, J. B., McDowell, E. N., Martin, K. A., Gaido, K. W., Johnson, K. J., and Boekelheide, K. (2012). Human fetal testis xenografts are resistant to phthalate-induced endocrine disruption. Environ. Health Perspect. 120, 1137–1143.
- Hogarth, C. A., Evans, E., Onken, J., Kent, T., Mitchell, D., Petkovich, M., and Griswold, M. D. (2015). CYP26 enzymes are necessary within the postnatal seminiferous epithelium for normal murine spermatogenesis. Biol. Reprod. 93, 19.
- Howdeshell, K. L., Furr, J., Lambright, C. R., Rider, C. V., Wilson, V. S., and Gray, L. E., Jr (2007). Cumulative effects of dibutyl phthalate and diethylhexyl phthalate on male rat reproductive tract development: Altered fetal steroid hormones and genes. Toxicol. Sci. 99, 190–202.
- Howdeshell, K. L., Rider, C. V., Wilson, V. S., Furr, J. R., Lambright, C. R., and Gray, L. E., Jr (2015). Dose addition models based on biologically relevant reductions in fetal testosterone accurately predict postnatal reproductive tract alterations by a phthalate mixture in rats. Toxicol. Sci. 148, 488–502.
- Johnson, K. J., Heger, N. E., and Boekelheide, K. (2012). Of mice and men (and rats): Phthalate-induced fetal testis endocrine disruption is species-dependent. Toxicol. Sci. 129, 235–248.
- Jones, H. B., Garside, D. A., Liu, R., and Roberts, J. C. (1993). The influence of phthalate esters on Leydig cell structure and function in vitro and in vivo. Exp. Mol. Pathol. 58, 179–193.
- Jones, S., Boisvert, A., Francois, S., Zhang, L., and Culty, M. (2015). In utero exposure to di-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate induces testicular effects in neonatal rats that are antagonized by genistein cotreatment. Biol. Reprod. 93, 92.
- Jorgensen, A., Nielsen, J. E., Perlman, S., Lundvall, L., Mitchell, R. T., Juul, A., and Rajpert-De Meyts, E. (2015). Ex vivo culture of human fetal gonads: Manipulation of meiosis signalling by retinoic acid treatment disrupts testis development. Hum. Reprod. 30, 2351–2363.
- Kashimada, K., Svingen, T., Feng, C. W., Pelosi, E., Bagheri-Fam, S., Harley, V. R., Schlessinger, D., Bowles, J., and Koopman, P. (2011). Antagonistic regulation of Cyp26b1 by transcription factors SOX9/SF1 and FOXL2 during gonadal development in mice. FASEB J. 25, 3561–3569.
- Kavlock, R., Barr, D., Boekelheide, K., Breslin, W., Breysse, P., Chapin, R., Gaido, K., Hodgson, E., Marcus, M., Shea, K., et al. (2006). NTP-CERHR expert panel update on the reproductive and developmental toxicity of di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate. Reprod. Toxicol. 22, 291–399.
- Kavlock, R., Boekelheide, K., Chapin, R., Cunningham, M., Faustman, E., Foster, P., Golub, M., Henderson, R., Hinberg, I., Little, R., et al. (2002). NTP center for the evaluation of risks to human reproduction: Phthalates expert panel report on the reproductive and developmental toxicity of di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate. Reprod. Toxicol. 16, 529–653.
- Klinefelter, G. R., Laskey, J. W., Winnik, W. M., Suarez, J. D., Roberts, N. L., Strader, L. F., Riffle, B. W., and Veeramachaneni, D. N. (2012). Novel molecular targets associated with testicular dysgenesis induced by gestational exposure to diethylhexyl phthalate in the rat: A role for estradiol. Reproduction 144, 747–761.
- Lambrot, R., Coffigny, H., Pairault, C., Donnadieu, A. C., Frydman, R., Habert, R., and Rouiller-Fabre, V. (2006). Use of organ

culture to study the human fetal testis development: Effect of retinoic acid. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 91, 2696–2703.

- Lara, N. L. M., Driesche, S. V. D., Macpherson, S., Franca, L. R., and Sharpe, R. M. (2017). Dibutyl phthalate induced testicular dysgenesis originates after seminiferous cord formation in rats. Sci. Rep. 7, 2521.
- Li, H., MacLean, G., Cameron, D., Clagett-Dame, M., and Petkovich, M. (2009). Cyp26b1 expression in murine Sertoli cells is required to maintain male germ cells in an undifferentiated state during embryogenesis. PLoS One 4, e7501.
- Li, Y., Zheng, M., and Lau, Y. F. (2014). The sex-determining factors SRY and SOX9 regulate similar target genes and promote testis cord formation during testicular differentiation. Cell Rep. 8, 723–733.
- Liu, K., Lehmann, K. P., Sar, M., Young, S. S., and Gaido, K. W. (2005). Gene expression profiling following in utero exposure to phthalate esters reveals new gene targets in the etiology of testicular dysgenesis. Biol. Reprod. 73, 180–192.
- Livera, G., Pairault, C., Lambrot, R., Lelievre-Pegorier, M., Saez, J. M., Habert, R., and Rouiller-Fabre, V. (2004). Retinoid-sensitive steps in steroidogenesis in fetal and neonatal rat testes: In vitro and in vivo studies. Biol. Reprod. 70, 1814–1821.
- Livera, G., Rouiller-Fabre, V., Durand, P., and Habert, R. (2000). Multiple effects of retinoids on the development of Sertoli, germ, and Leydig cells of fetal and neonatal rat testis in culture. Biol. Reprod. 62, 1303–1314.
- Livera, G., Rouiller-Fabre, V., and Habert, R. (2001). Retinoid receptors involved in the effects of retinoic acid on rat testis development. Biol. Reprod. 64, 1307–1314.
- Minkina, A., Matson, C. K., Lindeman, R. E., Ghyselinck, N. B., Bardwell, V. J., and Zarkower, D. (2014). DMRT1 protects male gonadal cells from retinoid-dependent sexual transdifferentiation. Dev. Cell 29, 511–520.
- Mitchell, R. T., Childs, A. J., Anderson, R. A., van den Driesche, S., Saunders, P. T., McKinnell, C., Wallace, W. H., Kelnar, C. J., and Sharpe, R. M. (2012). Do phthalates affect steroidogenesis by the human fetal testis? Exposure of human fetal testis xenografts to di-n-butyl phthalate. J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 97, E341–E348.
- Muczynski, V., Cravedi, J. P., Lehraiki, A., Levacher, C., Moison, D., Lecureuil, C., Messiaen, S., Perdu, E., Frydman, R., Habert, R., et al. (2012). Effect of mono-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate on human and mouse fetal testis: In vitro and in vivo approaches. Toxicol. Appl. Pharmacol. 261, 97–104.
- Nicol, B., Grimm, S. A., Gruzdev, A., Scott, G., Ray, M. K., and Yao, H. H. (2018). Genome-wide identification of FOXL2 binding and characterization of FOXL2 feminizing action in the fetal gonads. Hum. Mol. Genet. 27, 4273–4287.
- Nicol, B., and Yao, H. H. (2015). Gonadal identity in the absence of pro-testis factor SOX9 and pro-ovary factor beta-catenin in mice. Biol. Reprod. 93, 35.
- Parks, L. G., Ostby, J. S., Lambright, C. R., Abbott, B. D., Klinefelter, G. R., Barlow, N. J., and Gray, L. E., Jr (2000). The plasticizer diethylhexyl phthalate induces malformations by decreasing fetal testosterone synthesis during sexual differentiation in the male rat. Toxicol. Sci. 58, 339–349.
- Plummer, S., Sharpe, R. M., Hallmark, N., Mahood, I. K., and Elcombe, C. (2007). Time-dependent and compartmentspecific effects of in utero exposure to di(n-butyl) phthalate on gene/protein expression in the fetal rat testis as revealed by transcription profiling and laser capture microdissection. Toxicol. Sci. 97, 520–532.
- Rouiller-Fabre, V., Guerquin, M. J., N'Tumba-Byn, T., Muczynski, V., Moison, D., Tourpin, S., Messiaen, S., Habert, R., and

Livera, G. (2015). Nuclear receptors and endocrine disruptors in fetal and neonatal testes: A gapped landscape. Front. Endocrinol. 6, 58.

- Saillenfait, A. M., Langonne, I., and Leheup, B. (2001). Effects of mono-n-butyl phthalate on the development of rat embryos: In vivo and in vitro observations. Pharmacol. Toxicol. 89, 104–112.
- Sarath Josh, M. K., Pradeep, S., Vijayalekshmi Amma, K. S., Balachandran, S., Abdul Jaleel, U. C., Doble, M., Spener, F., and Benjamin, S. (2014). Phthalates efficiently bind to human peroxisome proliferator activated receptor and retinoid X receptor alpha, beta, gamma subtypes: An in silico approach. J. Appl. Toxicol. 34, 754–765.
- Skinner, M. K., Tung, P. S., and Fritz, I. B. (1985). Cooperativity between Sertoli cells and testicular peritubular cells in the production and deposition of extracellular matrix components. J. Cell. Biol. 100, 1941–1947.
- Spade, D. J., Dere, E., Hall, S. J., Schorl, C., Freiman, R. N., and Boekelheide, K. (2018). Disruption of retinoic acid signaling in ex vivo cultured fetal rat testes. I: Altered seminiferous cord development and maintenance of sex-specific cell fate. Toxicol. Sci. 167, 546–558.
- Spade, D. J., Hall, S. J., Saffarini, C. M., Huse, S. M., McDonnell, E. V., and Boekelheide, K. (2014). Differential response to abiraterone acetate and di-n-butyl phthalate in an androgensensitive human fetal testis xenograft bioassay. Toxicol. Sci. 138, 148–160.
- Spade, D. J., Hall, S. J., Wilson, S., and Boekelheide, K. (2015). Din-butyl phthalate induces multinucleated germ cells in the rat fetal testis through a nonproliferative mechanism. Biol. Reprod. 93, 110.
- Trautmann, E., Guerquin, M. J., Duquenne, C., Lahaye, J. B., Habert, R., and Livera, G. (2008). Retinoic acid prevents germ cell mitotic arrest in mouse fetal testes. Cell Cycle 7, 656–664.
- Uhlenhaut, N. H., Jakob, S., Anlag, K., Eisenberger, T., Sekido, R., Kress, J., Treier, A. C., Klugmann, C., Klasen, C., Holter, N. I., et al. (2009). Somatic sex reprogramming of adult ovaries to testes by FOXL2 ablation. Cell 139, 1130–1142.
- Ungewitter, E., Rotgers, E., Bantukul, T., Kawakami, Y., Kissling, G. E., and Yao, H. H. (2017). From the cover: Teratogenic effects of in utero exposure to di-(2-ethylhexyl)-phthalate (DEHP) in B6: 129S4 mice. Toxicol. Sci. 157, 8–19.
- van den Driesche, S., Walker, M., McKinnell, C., Scott, H. M., Eddie, S. L., Mitchell, R. T., Seckl, J. R., Drake, A. J., Smith, L. B., Anderson, R. A., et al. (2012). Proposed role for COUP-TFII in regulating fetal Leydig cell steroidogenesis, perturbation of which leads to masculinization disorders in rodents. PLoS One 7, e37064.
- Wang, Y., Liu, W., Yang, Q., Yu, M., and Zhang, Z. (2015). Di (2 ethylhexyl) phthalate exposure during pregnancy disturbs temporal sex determination regulation in mice offspring. Toxicology 336, 10–16.
- Wang, Y., Yang, Q., Liu, W., Yu, M., Zhang, Z., and Cui, X. (2016). Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate exposure in utero damages sertoli cell differentiation via disturbance of sex determination pathway in fetal and postnatal mice. Toxicol. Sci. 152, 53–61.
- Ward, J. M., Peters, J. M., Perella, C. M., and Gonzalez, F. J. (1998). Receptor and nonreceptor-mediated organ-specific toxicity of di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP) in peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor alpha-null mice. Toxicol. Pathol. 26, 240–246.
- Zhao, F., Franco, H. L., Rodriguez, K. F., Brown, P. R., Tsai, M. J., Tsai, S. Y., and Yao, H. H. (2017). Elimination of the male reproductive tract in the female embryo is promoted by COUP-TFII in mice. Science 357, 717–720.