# Biotechnology Reports



journal homepage: <www.elsevier.com/locate/btre>es/ $\mathcal{L}$ 

# Production of nitrogen fixing Azotobacter (SR-4) and phosphorus solubilizing Aspergillus niger and their evaluation on Lagenaria siceraria and Abelmoschus esculentus

Misbahud Din<sup>e,\*</sup>, Rubina Nelofer<sup>b</sup>, Muhammad Salman<sup>c</sup>, Abdullah<sup>a</sup>, Faisal Hayat Khan<sup>a</sup>, Asad Khan<sup>a</sup>, Munib Ahmad<sup>a</sup>, Fazal Jalil<sup>a</sup>, Jalal Ud Din<sup>a</sup>, Mudassir Khan<sup>d</sup>

a Department of Biotechnology, Abdul Wali Khan University, Mardan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan<br>b Food and Biotechnology Research Centre, Pakistan Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (PCSIR), Laboratories Complex Pakistan

<sup>c</sup> Department of Microbiology and Biotechnology, Abasyn University Peshawar, Pakistan

d Department of Healthcare Biotechnology, Atta-Ur-Rahman School of Applied Biosciences (ASAB), National University of Science and Technology (NUST), Islamabad Pakistan

<sup>e</sup> Department of Biotechnology, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad 44000, Pakistan

#### A R T I C L E I N F O

Article history: Received 4 June 2018 Received in revised form 5 March 2019 Accepted 5 March 2019

Keywords: Biofertilizers Azotobacter A. niger Bottle gourd and okra

## A B S T R A C T

Aims: Current study was aimed to produce nitrogen fixing Azotobacter sp. (SR-4) and phosphorus solubilizers Aspergillus niger (A. niger) and to evaluate their efficiency as biofertilizers for agricultural practices.

Methods: Two biofertilizer including nitrogen fixing and phosphorus solubilizing were grown. The nitrogen fixing efficiency of Azotobacter (SR-4) was determined by Kjeldahl method. Similarly, Vanadomoybdate method was used to measure the soluble phosphorus while Heinonen method was used to analyze concentration of phytase and phosphatase in the cultures. Furthermore, both biofertilizers were tested in a field trail on Lagenaria siceraria (bottle gourd) and Abelmoschus esculentus (okra).

Results: The Azotobacter (SR-4) strain was found efficient nitrogen fixer as 35.08 mg of nitrogen per gram of carbon was produced after 72 h of fermentation. Similarly, A. niger strain excrete extracellular phosphate solubilizing enzymes such as phytase (133UI in 48 h of fermentation) and phosphatase (170UI in 48 h of fermentation) which can solubilize the rock phosphate and make it available to plants. In field trials on selected plants (L. siceraria and A. esculentus), both biofertilizers showed significant increase in plant height, leaf length/width, fruit size and number of fruits per plant when compared with controls/ untreated plants. Furthermore, plants co-inoculated with both the N fixing Azotobacter and phosphorus solubilizing A. niger have enhanced performance than those treated with each biofertilizer alone.

Conclusion: The inoculation of seeds with A. niger and Azotobacter may replace costly and environment toxic chemical fertilizers with environment friendly and cost effective biofertilizers.

© 2019 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license [\(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)).

#### 1. Background

Nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) are well-known fundamental nutrients needed by plant for their growth and development. To achieve high yield, farming practices require chemical fertilizers that are very costly and may also create environmental problems. Owed to environmental alarm and fear for consumer health, the use of chemical fertilizers in agriculture

for the plants. \* Corresponding author. E-mail address: [misbah@bs.qau.edu.pk](mailto:misbah@bs.qau.edu.pk) (M. Din).

is presently under debate. Consequently, a specific group of fertilizers were discovered that are known as biofertilizers or bioinoculants and are consisted of microorganisms with plant growth-promoting abilities. Some of these microbial strains are capable of phosphorus solubilizing, nitrogen fixing from air and some produce cellulytic enzymes. Biofertilizers are applied in several ways to soil, to enhance the nutrient availability to the plants. One way is their direct application in soil, other way is seed treatment or application with composite. In either way the biofertilizers are used, they increase the numbers of beneficial microorganisms in the soil to enhance the nutrients availability

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.btre.2019.e00323>

2215-017X/© 2019 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license [\(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)).

A number of free-living nitrogen fixing bacteria have been reported as biofertilizers previously [\[1](#page-3-0)–3]. These bacteria greatly influence the plant growth when used as seed inoculants [[4](#page-4-0)]. Some of them may affect the plants growth directly through synthesis of growth hormones, fixing nitrogen and solubilizing rock phosphates, when used as biofertilizers [5–[7\]](#page-4-0). On the other hand, plant growth is also stimulated by phosphate-solubilizing microbes that enhance the available phosphorus and increase the uptake rate of nitrogen, potassium  $(K)$ , and iron  $(Fe)$  [[8](#page-4-0)]. These phosphate solubilizing microbes convert the insoluble phosphates into soluble form using different processes such as exchange reaction, acidification and chelation [[9](#page-4-0)]. It has been reported in an earlier study that plants co-inoculated with biofertilizers have a significance increase in root and shoot biomass, nitrogenase activity and nitrogen fixation [10–[14\]](#page-4-0). Moreover, combined inoculation of P-solubilizing and N-fixing biofertilizers were more effective compared to single inoculation due to the availability of more balanced nutrition for plants [[15](#page-4-0)].

Therefore, in the present study, a bacterial strain Azotobacter (SR-4) and a fungal strain A. niger were used for nitrogen fixation and phosphorus-solubilization, respectively.

#### 2. Methodology

# 2.1. Collection of cultures

The bacterial culture Azotobacter (SR-4) and fungal culture A. niger was obtained from the Food and Biotechnology Research Center (FBRC) of PCSIR, Labs. Complex, Lahore, Pakistan. This bacterial strain was previously isolated and identified at the same institute [[16](#page-4-0)].

#### 2.2. Inoculum preparation for nitrogen fixer

Stock culture of Azotobacter (SR-4) was maintained on nutrient agar slants and glycerol cultures in nutrient broth and was stored at  $-80^{\circ}$ C. Inoculum was developed in Erlenmeyer flasks using nitrogen free (N-free) medium (2 g sucrose,  $0.06$  g  $K<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub>$ , 0.016 g KH2PO4, 0.02 g NaCl, 0.02 g MgSO4, 0.05 g yeast extract, 0.01 g  $K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$ , pH 7) and was incubated on a rotary shaker (360 rpm) at  $30^{\circ}$ C for 24 h.

#### 2.3. Inoculum preparation for phosphorus-solubilizer

A. niger was cultured in potato dextrose agar (PDA) slants for 3– 4 days at 30 °C and fully-grown slants were stored at 4 °C for future use. 25 mL Pikovskayas agar (PVK) medium with following composition (g/L) [glucose, 10; yeast extract, 0.5;  $(NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$ , 0.5; MgSO<sub>4</sub>.7H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.1; KCl, 0.2; NaCl, 0.2; FeSO<sub>4</sub>.7H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.002; MnSO<sub>4</sub>.7H<sub>2</sub>O, 0.002; Ca<sub>3</sub> (PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>5</sub>, 5 (pH 7)] was taken in 250 mL Erlenmeyer flask and fungal culture was transferred to flask under aseptic conditions in LFH. The flasks were incubated for 7 days on a rotary shaker (200 rpm) at 30 $\degree$ C. All the ingredients of media were obtained from FBRC department of PCSIR Lahore, Pakistan. The

efficiency of the culture was calculated for phosphorus solubilization in the inoculums medium.

### 2.4. Production of Azotobacter in small bioreactor

For fermentation, 1 L N-free media (2 g sucrose, 0.06 g  $K_2HPO_4$ , 0.016 g KH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>, 0.02 g NaCl, 0.02 g MgSO<sub>4</sub>, 0.05 g yeast extract, 0.01 g  $K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$ , pH 7) was prepared in 1L bioreactor. 50 ml Azotobacter (SR-4) inoculum, maintained in N-free media, was transferred to bioreactor. Samples were collected from bioreactor daily up to 6 days and were then analyzed for nitrogen.

#### 2.5. Solid-State Fermentation for A. niger

For solid-state fermentation, 1 kg wheat bran was moistened with 500 ml water and was sterilized in autoclave at  $121 \text{ }^{\circ}$ C for 15 min. After cooling to room temperature, the culture of A. niger was inoculated as inoculum and then incubated for 8 days at  $30^{\circ}$ C in a static inclined position in a steel tray covered with aluminum foil having small pores.

# 2.6. Evaluation of biofertilizers

The effect of these biofertilizers on plant's height, length and width of leaf and the number of fruits per plant was tested in L. siceraria and A. esculentus. For this purpose, three treatments were applied; In  $1<sup>st</sup>$  treatment, 500 g plant seeds were inoculated with 250 g phosphorus solubilizing biofertilizer, in the  $2<sup>nd</sup>$  treatment seeds were treated with 250 mL nitrogen fixing biofertilizer and in the 3<sup>rd</sup> treatment seeds were co-inoculated with both phosphorus (250 g) and nitrogen biofertilizers (250 mL) (Table 1). The biofertilizers were used to make slurry with water (phosphorus solubilizing) and soil (nitrogen fixing), and the slurry coated seeds were then air dried and were sown in soil. However, same quantity of untreated seeds was used as control.

#### 2.7. Analytical methods

#### 2.7.1. Efficiency of Azotobacter as nitrogen fixer

The nitrogen fixing efficiency of Azotobacter (SR-4) is equal to the mg of nitrogen produced per gram of carbon utilized. The nitrogen efficiency of Azotobacter (SR-4) was determined by the Kjeldahl method [\[17](#page-4-0)]. The samples were centrifuged at 4000 rpm and  $4^{\circ}$ C for 10 min. Then 2 ml of supernatant was mixed with 10 ml  $K_2Cr_2O_7$  solution and 20 ml of  $H_2SO_4$  and was heated for 1 min. In the following step, 200 ml of  $H<sub>2</sub>O$  was added again with 4-5 drops of ferroin indicator. Titration of the above solution was conducted against  $0.5$  N FeSO<sub>4</sub> solution and total carbon was measured from the total volume of  $FeSO<sub>4</sub>$  solution used.

## 2.7.2. Efficiency of A. niger as phosphorus solubilizer

Similarly, in determination of phosphorus solubilizing activity, the samples were centrifuged at 4000 rpm and  $4^{\circ}$ C for 10 min and supernatant was collected. Vanadomolybdate reagent was prepared by mixing ammonium molybdate 5% (W/V), ammonium

#### Table 1

Treatments scheme for 500 g seed of Lagenaria siceraria and Abelmoschus esculentus plants.



<span id="page-2-0"></span>vanadate 0.25% (W/V) and diluted nitric acid with water in 1:3 ratios and was used to measure the soluble phosphorus [\[18](#page-4-0)]. However, Heinonen method was used to analyze phytase and phosphatase [[19\]](#page-4-0). 1 mL of supernatant was incubated with same quantity of phytic acid and tricalcium phosphate (substrate for phytase and phosphatase) in 200 mM glycine buffer (pH 5) at 35  $\degree$ C for 1 h. After incubation, 1 mL citric acid (1 M) was added to stop enzyme activity. In the last step, 4 mL of reagent mixture containing 2.5% (W/V) solution of ammonium molybdate, 5 N  $H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$  and acetone in 1:1:2 ratio was added, vortexed and the optical density was observed at 400 nm. 1 IU for phosphatase and phytase was equal to 1  $\mu$ M of phosphorus released/mL/min.

## 2.7.3. Statistical analysis

The findings were statistically compared through LSD test using SPSS V16. The significant difference was represented with different letters and non-significant difference was represented with similar letters with yield values.

## 3. Results

## 3.1. Nitrogen fixing efficiency of Azotobacter

Carbon utilization and nitrogen fixation was determined at different intervals of fermentation. For this purpose, samples  $(n=6)$  were collected after every 12h for 3 days of fermentation. After 12h of incubation, carbon utilization was 0.34g/100mL and was increased to 0.61 g/100 mL by 72 h. Similarly, N fixation capacity was increased from 8.0mg/100mL to 21.40mg/100mL by 72h of incubation. Consequently, with increase in cell mass the carbon contents of mediumdecreases lead to increased utilization of carbon. The efficiency of Azotobacter (SR-4) (mg of nitrogen produced per gram of carbon utilized) was 23.52 N mg/gC after 12 h and increased to 35.08 N mg/gC with increase in fermentation time to 72 h (Table 2).

#### 3.2. Phosphorus solubilizing efficiency of A. niger

Phosphorus solubilizing efficiency was measured in solid state fermentation at different intervals of fermentation. Enzymatic

Table 2 Nitrogen fixing efficiency of Azotobacter (SR-4).

activity was increased from 0-170IU for phosphatase and 0-133IU for phytase during 0–48 h of incubation. However, decline in concertation of both phosphatase and phytase was observed after 48 h. Similarly, maximum soluble phosphorus of 835 ppm was observed after 48 h of incubation which support the increased production of phosphate degrading enzymes by A. niger (Table 3)

## 3.3. Biofertilizers effect on Lagenaria siceraria and Abelmoschus esculentus

The field trials of biofertilizers on selected plants (L. siceraria and A. esculentus) showed significant increase in plant height, leaf length/width, fruit size and number of fruits per plant when compared with controls/untreated plants. Furthermore, plants coinoculated with both the N fixing Azotobacter and phosphorus solubilizing A, niger have enhanced performance than those treated with each biofertilizer alone ([Tables](#page-3-0) 4 and 5).

#### 4. Discussion

The bio-fertilizers due their environment friendly nature as compared to the chemical fertilizers is a method of choice for the modern agriculture. Therefore, the present research work was aimed to produce and evaluate Azotobacter (SR-4) as a nitrogen fixer and A. niger as phosphorus solubilizer, that are important constituents needed by the plants. These strains were obtained from the Food and Biotechnology Research Center (FBRC) of PCSIR, Labs. Complex, Lahore, Pakistan. Their inoculums were developed and maintained and were grown in large scale. Then their efficiency as biofertilizers were evaluated and tested in field trails on selected plants in three different treatment schemes.

Azotobacter species have been known to releases variety of growth-promoting substances in addition to nitrogen like indole acetic acid, vitamins B and gibberellins [[20,21\]](#page-4-0). Similarly, Azotobacter species excrete ammonia in the rhizosphere hence helps in plant improvement [\[22\]](#page-4-0). In the present study, the Nfixation capacity of Azotobacter (SR-4) was measured by analyzing the concertation of nitrogen in the medium using Kjildhal method [\[17](#page-4-0)]. It has been reported that the excess of carbon compound and

Sr. No.	Fermentation Time	Measured nitrogen (mg/100 mL)	Carbon utilized (g/100 mL)	Efficiency (mg of $N/g$ of carbon)
	12 h	08.00	0.34	23.52
	24 h	10.60	0.42	25.23
	36 h	14.00	0.49	28.57
	48 h	16.20	0.54	30.00
	60 h	18.80	0.58	32.41
	72 h	21.40	0.61	35.08

Table 3

Phosphorus solubilizing efficiency of A. niger.

Sr. No.	Fermentation time (h)	Phosphorus (ppm)	Phosphatase (IU)	Phytase (IU)
		165		
		275	18	
		360	42	19
	16	400	84	58
	20	475	117	112
	24	710	145	125
	36	785	154	131
	48	835	170	133
10	60	775	152	125
	72	690	136	120

<span id="page-3-0"></span>Table 4





The values with different letters are significantly different.

Table 5 Effects of biofertilizers on Abelmoschus esculentus.

Parameters	Treatment 1 (P)	Treatment 2 (N)	Treatment 3 $(P+N)$	Control
Number of plants	$(66$ plants)	$(63$ plants)	$(108 \text{ plants})$	$(36 \text{ plants})$
Plant height	$35.7 + 3.2^b$	$35.76 + 3.21^{\mathrm{b}}$	$43 + 2.82^c$	$26.2 + 3.72^a$
Leaf length/ width	$5.8 \pm 0.51^{\rm bc}$	$5.3 + 0.49^b$	$6.4 + 0.32^c$	$3.84 + 0.2a$
Fruit length/ width	$6.2 + 0.39^{\rm b}$	$6.2 + 0.39^{\rm b}$	$6.94 + 0.2^c$	$4.9 + 0.14$ <sup>a</sup>
No. of fruits/plant	$26 + 3$ <sup>ab</sup>	$29 + 4$ <sup>bc</sup>	$35 + 3^c$	$21 + 2^a$

The values with different letters are significantly different.

shortage of combined nitrogen in the media greatly affect the activity of nitrogen fixing microorganisms [[23](#page-4-0)]. Increase in Azotobacter (SR-4) activity was observed with increase incubation time. This increase in activity is due to increase in cell mass and hence the increased nitrogenase enzymes production by Azotobacter that fix nitrogen ([Table](#page-2-0) 2). Our findings of increase in efficiency of Azotobacte with increase in incubation time is consistent with other studies, where similar trend in behavior has been reported [\[24](#page-4-0)]. Furthermore, we observed higher nitrogen fixing efficiency as compared to other published reports [\[25](#page-4-0),[26\]](#page-4-0). Variation in efficiency of Azotobacter may be due to difference in strains being used in different studies.

Sometimes, the efficiency might be different due to amount of dissolved oxygen that affect the carbon consumption rate as well as nitrogen fixation. Although, it has been shown that Azotobacter sp. is usually considered as nitrogen fixer, however, addition of small quantity of nitrogen in the medium reduce the fermentation time due to short lag phase and generation time [[25](#page-4-0)]. This assumption was tested by increasing the incubation time and hence maximum nitrogen fixation was observed in the current study. Due to this Nfaxing capability of Azotobacter, extracellular proteins and ammonia are secreted in nitrogen free medium that are accessible to the plants. Similarly, Azotobacter (SR-4) was found to be efficient nitrogen fixer able to fix 23.52–35.08 mg N/g of carbon oxidized which correspondent to 8–21.40 mg N/g sucrose consumed within 72 h [\(Table](#page-2-0) 2). A similar trend of increase in cell count with increase in incubation time has been previously observed which reaches to its peak after two weeks [[26\]](#page-4-0). Although, an aerobic condition is required for growth of Azotobacter, while low oxygen tension or anaerobic conditions are optimum for enzymatic activity of a system, such as nitrogenase responsible for nitrogen fixation. Similarly, compare to liquid media, soil provides more suitable condition for Azotobacter growth and subsequently nitrogen fixation by providing superior equilibrium between anaerobiosis and aerobiosis.

We observed an efficient phosphorus solubilizing activity in A. niger which agrees to previous reports [27-[29\]](#page-4-0). A significant increase in the concertation of phytase, phosphatase and soluble phosphorus was also found after 48 h of fermentation along with decrease in soluble phosphorus concentration. This decrease may be due to utilization of phosphorous by fungus mycelia. Our

findings are consistent to an earlier study where Aspergillus has shown maximum growth after incubation of 50 h under favorable conditions [[30](#page-4-0)].

The increase in concentration of enzymes observed in our study is higher than that reported in literature [\[31](#page-4-0)]. Although, fungi produce these enzymes to solubilize phosphate and phytic acid for its own growth, consequently, a considerable amount of phosphorus become available to plants as well. These N fixing and phosphorus solubilizing biofertilizer were tested in field trails on selected plants in 3 different treatments (Tables 4 and 5). Previous studies have reported that co-inoculation of strains has enhanced root growth, shoot biomass, N% as well as total plant nitrogen in many crops [\[10](#page-4-0)-12]. Similarly, co-inoculations have considerably increased the yields as compared to single inoculation in soybean, pea, chickpea, groundnut, mungbean and in other crops [\[31](#page-4-0)–37]. There are several reports available on the inevitability and applicability of bacterial fertilizers and phosphate dissolving and  $N<sub>2</sub>$ -fixing bacteria [[24](#page-4-0),38–[42\]](#page-4-0). Azotobactor when applied to green gram and rice have shown a significant improvement in seed germination and root nodules [\[42\]](#page-4-0). Furthermore, Aspergillus sp. has been considered as plant growth promoting fungi by solubilizing phosphorus and can travel long distance as compared to bacteria [[39,41\]](#page-4-0). Interestingly, the co-inoculation of phosphorus solubilizing fungi and nitrogen fixing bacteria were found effective in overcoming drought stress in legume plants as well [[40\]](#page-4-0).

Considering these fact and findings it can be said that the effects can be highly variable in practical agriculture. However, it further signifies that combined inoculation of seeds with A. niger and Azotobacter may replace costly and environment toxic fertilizers with environment friendly biofertilizers [\[43](#page-4-0)].

## 5. Conclusion

It is concluded that biofertilizers, including the nitrogen fixing and phosphorus solubilizing biofertilizer, can be produced cost effectively and can be used for the sustainable and environmental friendly yield enhancement of vegetables. Higher yield than the control showed that the produced biofertilizers have no adverse effect on plant growth of bottle guard and okra. Therefore, the used microbial strains have been proved potential for the routine agriculture practices with additional benefits either separately or in combination or may be supplemented to the chemical fertilizers to reduce their impact on environment.

#### Conflict of interest

There is no conflict of interest in the research work.

### References

- [1] J.W. Kloepper, C.J. [Beauchamp,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0005) A review of issues related to measuring [colonization](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0005) of plant roots by bacteria, J. Microbiol. 38 (1992) 1219–1232.
- [2] G. Höflich, W. Wiehe, G. Kühn, Plant growth [stimulation](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0010) by inoculation with symbiotic and associative rhizosphere [microorganisms,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0010) Experientia 50 (1994) 897–[905](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0010).
- <span id="page-4-0"></span>[3] R. [Çakmakçi,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0015) F. Kantar, ÖF. Algur, Sugar beet and barley yields in relation to Bacillus polymyxa and Bacillus megaterium var. [phosphaticum](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0015) inoculation, J. Plant Nutr. Soil Sci. 162 [\(1999\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0015) 437–442.
- J. Davison, Plant beneficial bacteria, Nat. [Biotechnol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0020) 6 (1988) 282.
- [5] G.A. Amer, R.S. Utkhede, [Development](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0025) of formulations of biological agents for [management](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0025) of root rot of lettuce and cucumber, Can. J. Infect. Microbiol. 46 [\(2000\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0025) 809–816.
- [6] R. Çakmakçı, F. Kantar, F. Sahin, Effect of N2-fixing bacterial [inoculations](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0030) on yield of sugar beet and barley, J. Plant Nutr. Soil Sci. 164 [\(2001\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0030) 527–531.
- [7] F. Şahin, R. [Çakmakçi,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0035) F. Kantar, Sugar beet and barley yields in relation to inoculation with N 2-fixing and phosphate [solubilizing](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0035) bacteria, Plant Soil 265 [\(2004\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0035) 123–129.
- [8] M.A. Whitelaw, T.J. Harden, G.L. Bender, Plant growth [promotion](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0040) of wheat inoculated with [Penicillium](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0040) radicumsp, Soil Res. 35 (1997) 291–300.
- [9] K.D. Earl, J.K. Syers, J.R. [McLaughlin,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0045) Origin of the effects of citrate, tartrate, and acetate on [phosphate](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0045) sorption by soils and synthetic gels 1, J. Soil Sci. Soc. Am. 43 [\(1979\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0045) 674–678.
- [10] N. Parmar, K.R. Dadarwal, [Stimulation](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0050) of nitrogen fixation and induction of flavonoid-like compounds by [rhizobacteria,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0050) J. Appl. Microbiol. 86 (1999) 36– [44](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0050).
- [11] B. Hamaoui, J. Abbadi, S. [Burdman,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0055) A. Rashid, S. Sarig, Y. Okon, Effects of inoculation with [Azospirillum](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0055) brasilense on chickpeas (Cicer arietinum) and faba beans (Vicia faba) under different growth conditions, [Agronomie](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0055) 2 (2001) [553](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0055)–560.
- [12] S.S. Sindhu, S. Suneja, A.K. Goel, N. Parmar, K.R. [Dadarwal,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0060) Plant growth promoting effects of Pseudomonas sp. on coinoculation with [Mesorhizobium](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0060) sp. Cicer strain under sterile and "wilt sick" soil [conditions,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0060) Appl. Soil Ecol. 19  $(2002)$  57–64.
- [13] A. Zaidi, M.S. Khan, M.D. Amil, Interactive effect of [rhizotrophic](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0065) [microorganisms](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0065) on yield and nutrient uptake of chickpea (Cicer arietinum L.), Eur. J. Agron. 19 [\(2003\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0065) 15–21.
- [14] M. Gull, F.Y. Hafeez, M. Saleem, K.A. Malik, [Phosphorus](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0070) uptake and growth promotion of chickpea by [co-inoculation](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0070) of mineral phosphate solubilising bacteria and a mixed [rhizobial](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0070) culture, Aust. J. Exp. Agric. 44 (2004) 623–628.
- [15] A.A. Belimov, A.P. Kojemiakov, C.N. [Chuvarliyeva,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0075) Interaction between barley and mixed cultures of nitrogen fixing and [phosphate-solubilizing](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0075) bacteria, Plant Soil 173 [\(1995\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0075) 29–37.
- [16] R. Nelofer, Q. Syed, M. [Nadeem,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0080) F. Bashir, S. Mazhar, A. Hassan, Isolation of [Phosphorus-Solubilizing](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0080) Fungus from Soil to Supplement Biofertilizer, Arab. J. Sci. Eng. 4 [\(2016\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0080) 2131–2138.
- [17] P.L. Kirk, Kjeldahl method for total [nitrogen,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0085) Anal. Chem. 22 (1950) 354-358. [18] D. Pearson, General [methods-determination](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0090) of phosphate by the vanado-
- molybdate [colorimetric](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0090) method, Chem. Anal. Anal. Foods (1976). [19] J.K. Heinonen, R.J. Lahti, A new and convenient colorimetric [determination](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0095) of

inorganic [orthophosphate](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0095) and its application to the assay of inorganic [pyrophosphatase,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0095) Anal. Biochem. 113 (1981) 313–317.

- [20] J.J. Revillas, B. Rodelas, C. Pozo, M.V. [Martínez-Toledo,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0100) J. González-López, Production of B-group vitamins by two [Azotobacter](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0100) strains with phenolic compounds as sole carbon source under diazotrophic and [adiazotrophic](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0100) [conditions,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0100) J. Appl. Microbiol. 89 (2000) 486–493.
- [21] D.A. El-Fattah, W.E. Eweda, M.S. Zayed, M.K. [Hassanein,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0105) Effect of carrier materials, sterilization method, and storage [temperature](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0105) on survival and biological activities of Azotobacter [chroococcum](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0105) inoculant, Ann. Agric. Sci. 58 [\(2013\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0105) 111–118.
- [22] N. Narula, K.G. Gupta, Ammonia excretion by Azotobacter [chroococcum](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0110) in liquid culture and soil in the presence of [manganese](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0110) and clay minerals, Plant Soil 93 [\(1986\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0110) 205–209.
- [23] A.W. Johnston, J.D. Todd, A.R. Curson, S. Lei, N. [Nikolaidou-Katsaridou,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0115) M.S. Gelfand, D.A. Rodionov, Living without Fur: the subtlety and [complexity](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0115) of

[iron-responsive](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0115) gene regulation in the symbiotic bacterium Rhizobium and other α[-proteobacteria,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0115) Biometals 20 (2007) 501–511.

- [24] P.B. Tinker, Role of Rhizosphere [Microorganisms](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0120) in Phosphorus Uptake by Plants. Role of Rhizosphere [Microorganisms](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0120) in Phosphorus Uptake by Plants, [\(1980\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0120) , pp. 617–654.
- [25] E.A. Paul, J.D. Newton, Studies of aerobic [non-symbiotic](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0125) nitrogen-fixing bacteria, Can. J. Infect. Dis. Med. [Microbiol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0125) 7 (1961) 7–13.
- [26] Y. [Abd-el-Malek,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0130) I. Hosny, B.T. Shawky, Nitrogen-fixing capacity of Azotobacter as affected by the type and depth of substrate, Zentralblatt für [Bakteriologie,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0130) Parasitenkunde, [Infektionskrankheiten](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0130) und Hygiene. Zweite [Naturwissenschaftliche](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0130) Abteilung: Mikrobiologie der Landwirtschaft, der Technologie und des [Umweltschutzes](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0130) 134 (1979) 390–397.
- [27] N. Vassilev, M. Vassileva, V. Bravo, M. [Fernández-Serrano,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0135) I. Nikolaeva, [Simultaneous](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0135) phytase production and rock phosphate solubilization by A. niger grown on dry olive [wastes,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0135) Ind. Crops Prod. 26 (2007) 332–336.
- [28] C. Xiao, H. Zhang, Y. Fang, R. Chi, Evaluation for rock phosphate [solubilization](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0140) in fermentation and soil– plant system using a [stress-tolerant](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0140) phosphate[solubilizing](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0140) A. niger WHAK1, Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. 169 (2013) 123–133.
- [29] V. Achal, V.V. Savant, M.S. Reddy, Phosphate [solubilization](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0145) by a wild type strain and UV-induced mutants of Aspergillus [tubingensis,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0145) Soil Biol. Biochem. 39 [\(2007\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0145) 695–699.
- [30] S. Marin, V. Sanchis, R. Saenz, A.J. Ramos, I. Vinas, N. Magan, [Ecological](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0150) [determinants](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0150) for germination and growth of some Aspergillus and Penicillium spp. from maize grain, J. Appl. [Microbiol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0150) 84 (1998) 25–36.
- [31] M.K. Chelius, R.J. Wodzinski, Strain [improvement](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0155) ofA. niger for phytase [production,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0155) Appl. Microb. Biotechnol. 41 (1994) 79–83.
- [32] N. Dashti, F. Zhang, R. Hynes, D.L. Smith, Plant growth promoting [rhizobacteria](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0160) accelerate [nodulation](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0160) and increase nitrogen fixation activity by field grown soybean [Glycine max (L.) Merr.] under short season [conditions,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0160) Plant Soil 200 [\(1998\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0160) 205–213.
- [33] H. Bolton, L.F. Elliott, R.F. Turco, A.C. Kennedy, Rhizoplane [colonization](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0165) of pea seedlings by Rhizobium [leguminosarum](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0165) and a deleterious root colonizing [Pseudomonas](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0165) sp. and effects on plant growth, Plant Soil 123 (1990) 121–124.
- [34] R.N. Patil, P.A. Shinde, Studies on [nodulation](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0170) pattern in gram (Cicer arietinum L.), J. [Maharashtra](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0170) Agric. Univ. 5 (1980) 211–213.
- [35] H. [Manjunatha,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0175) L.S. Devi, Effect of phosphate solubilizing bacteria (PSB) on P availability to groundnut from rock [phosphate,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0175) Curr. Res.-Univ. Agric. Sci. [\(Bangalore\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0175) 19 (1990) 56–57.
- [36] M.S. Khan, A. Zaidi, M. Amil, Associative effect of [Bradyrhizobium](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0180) sp.(vigna) and phosphate [solubilizing](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0180) bacteria on mungbean [Vigna radiata (L.) Wilczek], [Biojournal](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0180) 9 (1997) 101–106.
- [37] A.R. Alagawadi, A.C. Gaur, Inoculation of [Azospirillum](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0185) brasilense and [phosphate-solubilizing](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0185) bacteria on yield of sorghum [Sorghum bicolor (L.) Moench] in dry land, Trop. Agric. [\(Trinidad](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0185) and Tobago) (1992).
- [38] D.A. Zuberer, Soil and rhizosphere aspects of N2-fixing [plant-microbe](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0190) [associations,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0190) Rhizosphere (1990) 317–353.
- [39] E.T. Alori, B.R. Glick, O.O. Babalola, Microbial phosphorus [solubilization](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0195) and its potential for use in sustainable [agriculture,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0195) Front. Microbiol. 8 (2017) 971.
- [40] J.U. Itelima, W.J. Bang, M.D. Sila, I.A. [Onyimba,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0200) O.J. Egbere, A review: Biofertilizer - A key player in enhancing soil fertility and crop [productivity,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0200) Microbiol. [Biotechnol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0200) Rep. 2 (2018) 22–28.
- [41] D. Owen, A.P. Williams, G.W. Griffith, P.J.A. Withers, Use of [commercial](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0205) bioinoculants to increase agricultural production through improved [phosphorus](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0205) [acquisition,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0205) Appl. Soil Ecol. 86 (2015) 41–54.
- [42] A. Soma Prabha, Potential Use of [Azotobacter](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0210) and Phosphate Solubilizing Bacteria as [Biofertilizer,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0210) Int. J. Curr. Microbiol. Appl. Sci. 10 (2016) 79–90.
- [43] F. Kantar, Prospect of [bio-organic](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0215) fertilizers and sustainable agriculture in Turkey, [Proceedings](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0215) of the Training Course on Bio-Organic Farming Systems for [Sustainable](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S2215-017X(18)30141-3/sbref0215) Agriculture (1997) 263–276.