



Disease mortality in domesticated animals is predicted by host evolutionary relationships

Maxwell J. Farrell^{a,1} and T. Jonathan Davies^{b,c,d}

^aDepartment of Biology, McGill University, Montreal, QC, Canada H3A 1B1; ^bBotany, Forest, and Conservation Sciences, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada V6T 1Z4; ^cBiodiversity Research Centre, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada V6T 1Z4; and ^dAfrican Centre for DNA Barcoding, University of Johannesburg, Johannesburg, South Africa 2092

Edited by Douglas Futuyma, Stony Brook University, Stony Brook, NY, and approved February 28, 2019 (received for review October 8, 2018)

Infectious diseases of domesticated animals impact human well-being via food insecurity, loss of livelihoods, and human infections. While much research has focused on parasites that infect single host species, most parasites of domesticated mammals infect multiple species. The impact of multihost parasites varies across hosts; some rarely result in death, whereas others are nearly always fatal. Despite their high ecological and societal costs, we currently lack theory for predicting the lethality of multihost parasites. Here, using a global dataset of >4,000 case-fatality rates for 65 infectious diseases (caused by microparasites and macroparasites) and 12 domesticated host species, we show that the average evolutionary distance from an infected host to other mammal host species is a strong predictor of disease-induced mortality. We find that as parasites infect species outside of their documented phylogenetic host range, they are more likely to result in lethal infections, with the odds of death doubling for each additional 10 million years of evolutionary distance. Our results for domesticated animal diseases reveal patterns in the evolution of highly lethal parasites that are difficult to observe in the wild and further suggest that the severity of infectious diseases may be predicted from evolutionary relationships among hosts.

host specificity | domestication | virulence | phylogeny | infectious disease

Infectious diseases that cross species barriers are responsible for severe human health burdens (1) and act as direct and synergistic drivers of species extinctions (2). Many of these diseases infect domesticated animals and impact human well-being via loss of food security, labor and livelihoods, costs of prevention and control programs, and increased human infection (3). However, the severity of disease can vary dramatically among parasites. Canine rabies alone results in ~59,000 human deaths and 8.6 billion US dollars in economic losses annually (4). By contrast, other diseases rarely result in death. For example, bovine brucellosis largely impacts cattle by causing abortion, infertility, and reduced growth, but disease-induced mortality in adult cows is uncommon (5).

Well-established theory on single-host parasites predicts that the reduction in host fitness due to infection (termed “virulence”) should evolve to an optimal level determined by a trade-off with transmission (6). For multihost parasites, optimal virulence may be subject to additional trade-offs, with selection for high or low virulence depending on the ecologies and evolutionary histories of each susceptible host species (7–9). In the absence of trade-offs, a wider host breadth should provide a larger pool of susceptible individuals, increasing opportunities for transmission and the evolution of higher virulence (10). However, adaptation to novel hosts may reduce a parasite’s ability to use resources of their coevolved hosts (11, 12), resulting in limited replication and decreased virulence (13). This trade-off is supported by comparative studies of plant RNA viruses and avian malaria parasites, in which specialist parasites tend to be more virulent than generalists (14, 15). Yet generalist parasites remain highly virulent in some host species (16).

Our ability to predict the outcome of a given host–parasite interaction is currently limited because the full suite of traits underlying virulence is either poorly estimated or unknown for the vast majority of host–parasite interactions. However, our understanding of evolutionary relationships is often much better, and host phylogeny can be used as a proxy for latent traits and evolutionary histories that have shaped contemporary host–parasite associations (17). For example, closely related hosts suffer similar impacts for some parasites of *Drosophila* (18, 19), consistent with the prediction that parasite virulence should covary with host phylogeny. However, there have been few studies that have developed and tested theories of how host evolutionary relationships influence disease outcomes across multiple host–parasite combinations.

As parasites adapt to infect novel host species increasingly distant from their coevolved hosts, they are expected to experience increased fitness costs (13), leading to the prediction of lowered virulence following greater phylogenetic jumps. This pattern, termed “nonhost resistance” (13), may act in opposition to resistance evolved by hosts in response to infection, which is expected to decrease with evolutionary distance from a parasite’s coevolved hosts and lead to phylogenetically distant hosts experiencing more intense disease (13). The relative strengths of these opposing relationships will likely influence the virulence of a given host–parasite interaction.

Infectious diseases of domestic species, many of which have severe economic impacts (3), present a unique opportunity to explore the links between virulence, host specificity, and the

Significance

Diseases that infect domestic and wild species cause severe human health burdens and exacerbate declines of endangered species. However, we currently lack theory for predicting the mortality of multihost parasites in different hosts: Some of these diseases rarely harm their hosts, while others are nearly always fatal. Using global case-fatality data for multiple diseases of domestic mammals, we show that the evolutionary relationship among infected and susceptible hosts is a strong predictor of disease-induced mortality. We find that parasites infecting domestic species that are more evolutionarily distant from their other known hosts have a higher probability of resulting in lethal infections.

Author contributions: M.J.F. and T.J.D. designed research; M.J.F. performed research; M.J.F. analyzed data; M.J.F. and T.J.D. wrote the paper; and M.J.F. organized data.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

Published under the PNAS license.

Data deposition: The data and code necessary to reproduce our analyses have been deposited in Figshare (doi:10.6084/m9.figshare.7497137).

¹ To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: maxwell.farrell@mail.mcgill.ca.

This article contains supporting information online at www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1817323116/-DCSupplemental.

Published online March 29, 2019.

hierarchical effects for host, host taxonomic order, country, and year of reporting. Environmental conditions, which include socio-economic factors such as the ability of local peoples to maintain animal health, effects of ambient temperature on parasite growth rate, or coinfection with other parasites, may also influence host mortality. To adjust for these additional country-level effects, we included per capita GDP and latitude per country, in addition to modeling variation among countries. The virulence-transmission trade-off suggests that outbreaks resulting in large numbers of infected individuals are unlikely to be associated with high mortality, as premature host death restricts transmission rate, ultimately resulting in lower case numbers for more lethal diseases (46). We therefore also included the number of cases per report as an offset variable. We estimated the effect sizes of these predictors on host mortality with a Bayesian hierarchical binomial-logit model. For additional information on materials and methods, see *SI Appendix, section 1*.

To assess the sensitivity of our model to exclusion of subsets of the data, and inclusion of additional or substitute predictors, we constructed five alternative models described in *SI Appendix, section 2.2*. These comprise models that exclude single-host parasites, exchange host species richness for host taxonomic diversity, include whether parasites are known to have avian reservoirs, exchange parasite type for parasite taxonomic family, and include the number of citation counts per parasite as a mea-

sure of study effort. We show that, for each of our alternative models, the effect sizes of our main model predictors remain qualitatively unchanged.

Data and Code

All data and code necessary to reproduce the results can be found at doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.7497137 (47).

This archive includes underlying data and R scripts used to download and process additional covariate data, Stan model code for the main model and four alternative models, and R scripts used to run models, generate simulated data to validate the main model, and generate model plots and tables.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We thank Vanessa Ezenwa, Charlie Nunn, Elizabeth Wolkovich, Ria Ghai, Jan Gogarten, and Carl Boodman for helpful feedback on the manuscript; Elizabeth Wolkovich, Margaret Kosmala, the Harvard Stanley group, Will Pearse, and Bob Carpenter for feedback on the model; and Debarun Gupta and Madeleine McGreer for help with data entry. M.J.F. was supported by a National Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada Vanier Canada Graduate Scholarship, the Canadian Institutes of Health Research Systems Biology Training Program, the Quebec Centre for Biodiversity Science, and the McGill Biology Department.

- Hotez PJ, et al. (2014) The global burden of disease study 2010: Interpretation and implications for the neglected tropical diseases. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 8:1–9.
- Heard MJ, et al. (2013) The threat of disease increases as species move toward extinction. *Conservation Biol* 27:1378–1388.
- Dehove A, Commaut J, Pettitclerc M, Teissier M, Macé J (2012) Economic analysis and costing of animal health: A literature review of methods and importance. *Revue Sci Tech (International Off Epizootics)* 31:605–617.
- Hampson K, et al. (2015) Estimating the global burden of endemic canine rabies. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 9:e0003709, and erratum (2015) 9:0003786.
- McDermott JJ, Grace D, Zinsstag J (2013) Economics of brucellosis impact and control in low-income countries. *Sci Tech Rev Off Int des Epizooties (Paris)* 32:249–261.
- Cressler CE, McLeod DV, Rozins C, Van den Hoogen J, Day T (2016) The adaptive evolution of virulence: A review of theoretical predictions and empirical tests. *Parasitology* 143:915–930.
- Woolhouse MEJ, Taylor LH, Haydon DT (2001) Population biology of multihost pathogens. *Science* 292:1109–1112.
- Gandon S (2004) Evolution of multihost parasites. *Evolution* 58:455–469.
- Rigaud T, Perrot-Minnot M-J, Brown MJF (2010) Parasite and host assemblages: Embracing the reality will improve our knowledge of parasite transmission and virulence. *Proc R Soc Biol Sci* 277:3693–3702.
- Barrett LG, Kniskern JM, Bodenhausen N, Zhang W, Bergelson J (2009) Continuum of specificity and virulence in plant host-pathogen interactions: Causes and consequences. *New Phytol* 183:513–529.
- Ebert D (1998) Experimental evolution of parasites. *Science* 282:1432–1436.
- Longdon B, Brockhurst M, Russell C, Welch JJ, Jiggins FM (2014) The evolution and genetics of virus host shifts. *PLoS Pathog* 10:e1004395.
- Antonovics J, et al. (2013) The origin of specificity by means of natural selection: Evolved and nonhost resistance in host-pathogen interactions. *Evolution* 67:1–9.
- Zsolt Garamszegi L (2006) The evolution of virulence and host specialization in malaria parasites of primates. *Ecol Lett* 9:933–940.
- Agudelo-Romero P, Elena SF (2008) The degree of plant resilience to infection correlates with virus virulence and host-range. *Spanish J Agric Res* 6:160–169.
- Leggett HC, Buckling A, Long GH, Boots M (2013) Generalism and the evolution of parasite virulence. *Trends Ecol Evol* 28:592–596.
- Davies TJ, Pedersen AB (2008) Phylogeny and geography predict pathogen community similarity in wild primates and humans. *Proc Biol Sci-R Soc* 275:1695–1701.
- Longdon B, et al. (2015) The causes and consequences of changes in virulence following pathogen host shifts. *PLoS Pathog* 11:e1004728.
- Perlman SJ, Jaenike J (2003) Infection success in novel hosts: An experimental and phylogenetic study of *Drosophila*-parasitic nematodes. *Evolution* 57:544–557.
- World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE) (2016) Terrestrial animal health code: general provisions (World Organization for Animal Health, Paris), Technical Report.
- Stephens PR, et al. (2017) Global mammal parasite database version 2.0. *Ecology* 98:42–49.
- Warddeh M, Riskey C, McIntyre MK, Setzkorn C, Baylis M (2015) Database of host-pathogen and related species interactions, and their global distribution. *Sci Data* 2:150049.
- Strauss SY, Webb CO, Salamin N (2006) Exotic taxa less related to native species are more invasive. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 103:5841–5845.
- Parker IM, et al. (2015) Phylogenetic structure and host abundance drive disease pressure in communities. *Nature* 520:542–544.
- The Stan Development Team (2017) The Stan core library, Version 2.17.0, Available at mc-stan.org.
- OIE (2007) *World Animal Health in 2005* (World Organisation for Animal Health, Paris).
- OIE (2008) *World Animal Health in 2006* (World Organisation for Animal Health, Paris).
- OIE (2008) *World Animal Health in 2007* (World Organisation for Animal Health, Paris).
- OIE (2009) *World Animal Health in 2008* (World Organisation for Animal Health, Paris), Vol 1–2.
- OIE (2010) *World Animal Health in 2009* (World Organisation for Animal Health, Paris), Vol 1–2.
- OIE (2011) *World Animal Health in 2010* (World Organisation for Animal Health, Paris), Vol 1–2.
- OIE (2012) *World Animal Health in 2011* (World Organisation for Animal Health, Paris), Vol 1–2.
- Dissanayake DMRB, Stephen C, Daniel S, Abeynayake P (2012) Gap assessment of animal health legislation in Sri Lanka for emerging infectious disease preparedness. *Outlook Agric* 41:203–208.
- Counotte MJ, Minbaeva G, Usualieva J, Abdykerimov K, Torgerson PR (2016) The burden of zoonoses in Kyrgyzstan: A systematic review. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 10:e0004831.
- Stojmanovski Z, Zdravkovska M, Taleski V, Jovevska S, Markovski V (2014) Human brucellosis in the republic of Macedonia by regions depending on vaccination procedures in sheep and goats. *Macedonian J Med Sci* 7:135–140.
- Hotez PJ, Savioli L, Fenwick A (2012) Neglected tropical diseases of the Middle East and North Africa: Review of their prevalence, distribution, and opportunities for control. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 6:e1475.
- Wang L, et al. (2008) Emergence and control of infectious diseases in China. *Lancet* 372:1598–1605.
- Weaver SC, Barrett ADT (2004) Transmission cycles, host range, evolution and emergence of arboviral disease. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 2:789–801.
- van Baarlen P, van Belkum A, Summerbell RC, Crous PW, Thomma BPHJ (2007) Molecular mechanisms of pathogenicity: How do pathogenic microorganisms develop cross-kingdom host jumps? *FEMS Microbiol Rev* 31:239–277.
- Graham AL, Allen JE, Read AF (2005) Evolutionary causes and consequences of immunopathology. *Annu Rev Ecol Syst* 36:373–397.
- Michel AL, Bengis RG (2012) The African buffalo: A villain for inter-species spread of infectious diseases in Southern Africa. *Onderstepoort J Vet Res* 79:453.
- Barrett T, Rossiter PB (1999) Rinderpest: The disease and its impact on humans and animals. *Adv Virus Res* 53:89–110.
- Levin BR, Bull JJ (1994) Short-sighted evolution and the virulence of pathogenic microorganisms. *Trends Microbiol* 2:76–81.
- Mennerat A, Nilsen F, Ebert D, Skorping A (2010) Intensive farming: Evolutionary implications for parasites and pathogens. *Evol Biol* 37:59–67.
- Farrell MJ, Berrang-Ford L, Davies TJ (2013) The study of parasite sharing for surveillance of zoonotic diseases. *Environ Res Lett* 8:015036.
- Alizon S, Hurford A, Mideo N, Van Baalen M (2009) Virulence evolution and the trade-off hypothesis: History, current state of affairs and the future. *J Evol Biol* 22:245–259.
- Farrell MJ, Davies TJ (2019) Data & code: “Disease mortality in domesticated animals is predicted by host evolutionary relationships.” Available at https://figshare.com/articles/Data_Code_Disease_mortality_in_domesticated_animals_is_predicted_by_host_evolutionary_relationships/7497137. Deposited March 15, 2019.