# Post-traumatic stress disorder: a state-of-the-art review of evidence and challenges

### Richard A. Bryant

School of Psychology, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia

Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) is arguably the most common psychiatric disorder to arise after exposure to a traumatic event. Since its formal introduction in the DSM-III in 1980, knowledge has grown significantly regarding its causes, maintaining mechanisms and treatments. Despite this increased understanding, however, the actual definition of the disorder remains controversial. The DSM-5 and ICD-11 define the disorder differently, reflecting disagreements in the field about whether the construct of PTSD should encompass a broad array of psychological manifestations that arise after trauma or should be focused more specifically on trauma memory phenomena. This controversy over clarifying the phenotype of PTSD has limited the capacity to identify biomarkers and specific mechanisms of traumatic stress. This review provides an up-to-date outline of the current definitions of PTSD, its known prevalence and risk factors, the main models to explain the disorder, and evidence-supported treatments. A major conclusion is that, although trauma-focused cognitive behavior therapy is the best-validated treatment for PTSD, it has stagnated over recent decades, and only two-thirds of PTSD patients respond adequately to this intervention. Moreover, most people with PTSD do not access evidence-based treatment, and this situation is much worse in low- and middle-income countries. Identifying processes that can overcome these major barriers to better management of people with PTSD remains an outstanding challenge.

Key words: Post-traumatic stress disorder, trauma, DSM-5, ICD-11, cognitive behavior therapy, definition, evidence-based treatment, access to treatment

(World Psychiatry 2019;18:259-269)

Although traumatic stress has been known for over 100 years by a number of terms, including "shell shock", "battle fatigue", or "soldier's heart", it was only in the 1980s that persistent stress reactions were recognized in psychiatric nosology. In the wake of the mental health problems evident in many troops returning from deployment in Vietnam, the DSM-III introduced the diagnosis of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD).

Since that time, our knowledge about PTSD has grown significantly. However, in spite of this, the field of traumatic stress has often been dogged with controversy over the very definition of PTSD, its etiology, and optimal means for treatment. This situation has not changed today, since our conceptualization of psychological responses to trauma continues to be a matter of debate.

In this context, this review outlines our current understanding of PTSD, including diagnostic definitions, prevalence and risk factors, conceptual models, treatment approaches, and some of the major challenges currently facing the field.

#### **DIAGNOSTIC DEFINITIONS**

There are currently two major diagnostic definitions of PTSD. The DSM-5 requires that a person experience or witness a major traumatic event (exposure to actual or threatened death, serious injury or sexual violence) (Criterion A). If one has experienced or witnessed such an event, there are four symptom clusters that he/she should manifest. First, one needs to have at least one of the following re-experiencing symptoms: intrusive distressing memories, recurrent distressing dreams, dissociative reactions (e.g., flashbacks), intense or prolonged psychological distress at exposure to reminders of the trauma, marked physi-

ological reactions to internal or external cues symbolizing or resembling an aspect of the traumatic event (Criterion B). Second, one is required to have active avoidance of internal (e.g., thoughts, memories) and/or external (e.g., situations, conversations) reminders of the trauma (Criterion C). Third, at least two "alterations in cognitions and mood" symptoms are needed, including inability to remember an important aspect of the traumatic event, persistent and exaggerated negative thoughts about oneself or the world, persistent distorted cognitions about the cause or consequences of the event, pervasive negative emotions, markedly diminished interest, feeling detached or estranged from others, persistent inability to experience positive emotions (Criterion D). Finally, one has to present at least two of the following arousal symptoms: irritable behavior and angry outbursts, reckless or self-destructive behavior, hypervigilance, exaggerated startle response, problems with concentration, sleep disturbance (Criterion E). People are required to manifest these symptoms for more than one month after trauma exposure, in order to minimize pathologization of normal stress reactions.

It is worth noting that the DSM-5 definition has broadened the scope of PTSD from its traditional focus on fear responses to also include other emotional reactions to trauma. In fact, many PTSD patients, especially from military and first responder populations, present with non-fear emotional responses<sup>2</sup>.

Many areas of the world operate on the World Health Organization's International Classification of Diseases (ICD) to guide psychiatric diagnoses, rather than the DSM-5. The ICD typically adopts a simpler approach to psychiatric diagnoses than the DSM, because of the need to impose less burden on diagnosticians in poorly resourced settings, who often cannot allocate lengthy assessments to each patient.

**World Psychiatry** 18:3 - October 2019 **259** 

The recently approved ICD-11 diagnostic guidelines for PTSD strategically adopt a narrow focus on fear circuitry symptoms, comprising re-experiencing of the traumatic event, avoidance of reminders, and a perception of heightened current threat (reflected by various forms of arousal)<sup>3</sup>. Central to this definition is the proposition that a core component of PTSD is re-experiencing the memories of the traumatic event in the present.

In addition to PTSD, the DSM-5 also includes the diagnosis of acute stress disorder, which describes stress reactions occurring in the first month after trauma exposure. This diagnosis was initially introduced in the DSM-IV as a means for describing severely distressed people who could not be diagnosed with PTSD in the initial month, and also as a way to identify people who were at high risk for later PTSD. Subsequent longitudinal studies indicated that this diagnosis is only a modest predictor of PTSD: at least half of people who develop PTSD do not initially meet the criteria for acute stress disorder<sup>4</sup>.

Initial conceptualizations of acute stress disorder placed much emphasis on dissociative responses immediately after trauma exposure (including depersonalization, derealization, reduced awareness of one's surroundings)<sup>5</sup>, resulting in the DSM-IV requirement that dissociative symptoms be present to meet the criteria for the disorder. In contrast to this position, convergent findings indicated that, despite the relationship between peri-traumatic dissociation and later PTSD<sup>6</sup>, many people who develop PTSD do not display dissociative responses in the acute phase after trauma<sup>4</sup>. As a result, in the DSM-5, the diagnosis of acute stress disorder does not require specific symptom clusters to be present, but, in recognition that people can experience acute stress in diverse ways, requires at least 9 of 14 potential acute stress reactions to occur in the initial month after trauma<sup>7</sup>. Importantly, this diagnosis is not intended to predict subsequent PTSD, but rather to describe people with elevated distress in the initial month who may benefit from mental health services<sup>7</sup>.

A major reason for the inclusion of the category of acute stress disorder in the diagnostic system was that, in the US context, it is easier for many people to receive mental health care under local health insurance rules if they have a diagnosis. It was argued that the requirement that PTSD can only be diagnosed if the symptoms persist for more than one month after the trauma can result in many distressed individuals not receiving mental health care.

Another diagnostic construct that is worth noting is complex PTSD, which has been introduced in the ICD-11. To receive this diagnosis, one needs to present the core PTSD symptoms, and in addition experience disturbances in self-identity (e.g., negative self-concept), emotional dysregulation (e.g., emotional reactivity, violent outbursts), and persistent difficulties in relationships<sup>3</sup>. Although most commonly seen in the wake of prior prolonged childhood abuse, this disorder can also occur in survivors of other severe traumas, such as torture<sup>8</sup>.

Complex PTSD has been the focus of many studies in recent years. A significant number of factor analytic studies tend to converge on the proposed factor structure of the disorder, with evidence of two overarching factors of PTSD symptoms and disturbances in self-organization <sup>9-12</sup>. Furthermore, latent class analyses have consistently documented that there is a class of individuals with high PTSD symptoms and high disturbances in self-organization, and another class with high PTSD symptoms and low disturbances in self-organization <sup>12-16</sup>. Importantly, there is also evidence that complex PTSD identifies a distinct class from borderline personality disorder <sup>14</sup>. Consistent with the proposal that complex PTSD emerges after prolonged childhood trauma, there are higher rates of childhood abuse in people with complex PTSD than in those with PTSD <sup>13,14,17</sup>.

#### **PREVALENCE**

Although many people are exposed to traumatic events at some point in their lives, most of them rebound to enjoy pretrauma levels of psychological functioning<sup>18</sup>. Epidemiological studies have reported lifetime PTSD prevalence rates of 13.0-20.4% for women and 6.2-8.2% for men<sup>19,20</sup>. The World Mental Health Surveys have observed higher 12-month prevalence rates in high-income (Northern Ireland: 3.8%; US: 2.5%; New Zealand: 2.1%) than in low- and middle-income countries (Colombia: 0.3%; Mexico: 0.3%)<sup>21</sup>.

There is evidence that some features of a traumatic event are more likely to trigger PTSD. For example, there are markedly lower rates of PTSD following natural disasters (typically 5-10%) relative to sexual assault  $(>40\%)^{20,22}$ . Overall, interpersonal violence typically leads to higher rates of PTSD<sup>23,24</sup>. In fact, the World Mental Health Surveys found that organized, physical or sexual violence increased the risk for PTSD<sup>25</sup>. Adjusting for methodological factors, reported torture is the strongest factor associated with PTSD, followed by cumulative exposure to potentially traumatic events<sup>26</sup>.

In studies that have focused on individual countries (which is methodologically sounder, because it allows greater consistency of potential contextual confounding influences), there is evidence that the prevalence of PTSD is higher in certain ethnic groups, such as Hispanics and African Americans in the US<sup>27,28</sup>. The finding that Hispanics are more at risk of PTSD has been confirmed in military samples<sup>29</sup>. Of course, these differences may be ascribed to differential access to health resources, ethnic discrimination, or socio-economic factors, so that their interpretation remains uncertain.

Epidemiological studies suggest that most people with PTSD have comorbid disorders, particularly depression, anxiety disorders, and substance use disorder<sup>20,30,31</sup>. These high rates of comorbidity may be explained by psychiatric disorders predisposing people to experience traumatic events<sup>31</sup>, or by traumatic events or PTSD itself triggering the development of other psychiatric conditions. Indeed, depression may result from prolonged learned helplessness, and substance use disorder may be due to self-medication<sup>32</sup>. Greater exposure to traumatic events is likely to result in greater comorbidity<sup>21</sup>.

#### **COURSE**

For many years it was believed that PTSD followed a linear course after trauma exposure, with a trend for symptoms to be highly prevalent in the days and weeks after exposure and to remit over the following months in most people. This view was supported by much evidence that rates of PTSD diminished by 6 months after trauma with respect to rates in the weeks after the event<sup>33,34</sup>. The exception to this trend was delayed-onset PTSD, which the DSM has traditionally defined as the onset of PTSD occurring at least 6 months after the traumatic event.

The understanding that PTSD follows a linear course has been challenged in recent years by evidence that the severity of the disorder fluctuates over time, that it can worsen or remit, and that this pattern can keep recurring, with the result that one's PTSD status is not static<sup>35</sup>. Recent studies have used latent growth mixture modelling to map the trajectories of the course of PTSD, reliably demonstrating a resilient class which consistently shows few PTSD symptoms, a recovery class with initial distress followed by gradual remission, a delayed reaction class with initial low symptom levels but increased symptoms over time, and a chronic distress class with consistently high PTSD levels<sup>36-39</sup>.

Using network analysis, which considers the strength of relationships between symptoms, there is also evidence that the PTSD syndrome develops over time. In the acute phase after trauma, PTSD symptoms appear more loosely interconnected, while they become more closely related with the known factors (e.g., re-experiencing, active avoidance) as time progresses<sup>40</sup>.

These convergent findings emphasize the challenges of predicting subsequent PTSD from acute reactions. Although there is evidence of an association between elevated symptoms in the acute phase and development of later PTSD<sup>41-45</sup>, we do not have adequate cut-offs to reliably identify who will develop PTSD. One way of improving early detection comes from a consortium that recently pooled 2,473 trauma survivors from ten longitudinal studies using a likelihood estimate approach<sup>46</sup>. This study found that, in a patient with elevated early symptom severity, the concomitance of female gender, less than secondary level education, and exposure to past interpersonal trauma was associated with a 34% greater likelihood of developing PTSD.

# **RISK FACTORS**

What predisposes only a small proportion of trauma survivors to develop PTSD? Many of the risk factors are in fact the same observed across several psychiatric disorders: female gender, low socio-demographic background, prior mental disorder, family history of mental disorders, and traumatic childhoods<sup>47</sup>. In terms of vulnerability factors more specific to PTSD, the disorder is more likely to occur after prolonged trauma or interpersonal traumatic events<sup>47</sup>.

The subjective response to the trauma is also predictive, with acute dissociative reactions  $^{48,49}$  and catastrophic appraisals  $^{50-52}$ 

about the outcome of the event being strongly associated with later PTSD severity. The post-trauma environment is also important, with low social support and ongoing stressors contributing to risk for PTSD development<sup>47</sup>.

#### MODELS OF PTSD

## **Neurobiological models**

Most theories of PTSD invoke processes involving fear conditioning. This model posits that at the time of trauma the surge of stress hormones released in association with the fear experienced by the individual results in strong associative learning between cues present at the time of trauma and fear responses. The associated cues assume the property of predicting future threat, thereby resulting in a re-experiencing of fear when the individual is exposed to internal and external reminders of the trauma <sup>53</sup>. This model also posits that recovery from initial stress reactions usually involves extinction learning, in which one is repeatedly exposed to reminders of the trauma but on these occasions there is no adverse consequence; accordingly, there is new learning that the previously conditioned cues now signal safety <sup>54</sup>.

There is evidence of neural changes in people with PTSD that are consistent with circuitry known to be implicated in fear conditioning: the amygdala, prefrontal cortex, and the hippocampus. Many studies indicate that PTSD is associated with a smaller size of the hippocampus, with meta-analyses reporting that this finding is observed bilaterally<sup>55</sup>. A recent consortium study including 1,868 participants (794 with PTSD) found an average smaller size of the hippocampus in those with the disorder<sup>56</sup>. The extent to which a smaller hippocampus is a consequence of PTSD or a risk factor has yet to be definitively addressed. One study compared monozygotic co-twins who either did or did not serve in Vietnam<sup>57</sup>, and found that veterans with PTSD had smaller hippocampi than Vietnam veterans without PTSD, but the co-twins of those with PTSD who had not served in Vietnam had hippocampi that were just as small. There is also much evidence of reduced volume of prefrontal regions in PTSD<sup>58</sup>, consistent with proposals that PTSD patients have problems with extinction learning.

Other studies have used fear provocation tasks to activate the threat network in PTSD patients. The most replicated finding is evidence of underactivation of medial prefrontal cortex regions, consistent with the notion of an impairment of the regulatory processes that promote extinction  $^{59}$ . There is also evidence of dysfunctions in threat detection, executive functioning, emotion regulation, and contextual processing  $^{60,61}$ .

Noradrenergic dysregulation is well-documented in PTSD, and has been postulated to be key to the development of intrusive re-experiencing of trauma memories  $^{62-65}$ . This notion is supported by evidence that prazosin (a noradrenergic receptor inhibitor) is efficacious in reducing nightmares and re-experiencing symptoms of PTSD $^{66,67}$ . Further support is from evidence

that administration of propranolol (a beta-adrenergic antagonist) in the hours after trauma exposure limits subsequent reactivity to reminders<sup>68</sup>, although it does not prevent overall PTSD<sup>69,70</sup>.

The PTSD field has also focused on the glucocorticoid system. Although increased cortisol levels are typically associated with chronic stress, PTSD is often linked with lower cortisol levels<sup>71</sup>. Further, lower cortisol levels shortly after trauma predict subsequent PTSD severity<sup>72</sup>. This paradoxical finding has been interpreted in terms of cortisol binding to the glucocorticoid receptors in a negative feedback loop that promotes homeostasis of the stress response<sup>73</sup>. This proposal posits that lower cortisol in PTSD may result in elevated ongoing activity of the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis, resulting in exaggerated catecholamine response and consequent over-consolidation of trauma memories. This idea has received some support from studies reporting that, in animal models, the administration of hydrocortisone shortly after stressor exposure results in reduced subsequent PTSD-like reactions<sup>74</sup>. There is pilot evidence that this procedure also limits subsequent PTSD symptoms following trauma in humans<sup>75</sup>.

A consistent pattern in PTSD research is that females are twice as likely to develop PTSD as males<sup>76</sup>. Females have greater noradrenergic response to aversive stimuli<sup>77,78</sup>, display greater context-potentiated startle magnitude<sup>79</sup>, and show greater amygdala reactivity after threatening stimuli<sup>80</sup>. The menstrual phase (reflecting cycling levels of progesterone and estradiol) impacts PTSD phenomena, suggesting that sex hormones play an important role in this regard. Females with PTSD (relative to those without PTSD) show impaired extinction learning in the mid-luteal phase (when progesterone and estradiol levels are high)<sup>81</sup>. Indeed, females are more likely to experience flashback memories if they are exposed to traumatic events during the mid-luteal phase<sup>82</sup>. One reason why progesterone may facilitate emotional memories is that it binds to glucocorticoid receptors, thus affecting the release of endogenous glucocorticoids<sup>83</sup>.

Supporting fear conditioning models is the robust finding of enhanced psychophysiological reactivity to reminders of the trauma in people with PTSD. Script-driven imagery paradigms direct participants to listen to pre-recorded accounts of their trauma, during which heart rate, skin conductance or facial electromyogram measurements are obtained; this typically results in greater reactivity in PTSD relative to non-PTSD participants<sup>84</sup>. Consistent with fear conditioning models is also the evidence of elevated resting heart rate in the days after trauma in those who subsequently develop PTSD<sup>85</sup>, particularly in response to trauma reminders<sup>86</sup>. Further, people with PTSD display impaired extinction learning<sup>87</sup>, and deficient capacity for extinction learning is a risk factor for PTSD<sup>88-90</sup>.

# **Genetic factors**

The well-documented fact that the vast majority of people who are exposed to trauma do not develop  $PTSD^{40}$  highlights

that there are key individual differences in propensity to manifest this disorder. Much evidence indicates that genetic factors play an important role, accounting for 30-72% of the vulnerability to develop PTSD<sup>91,92</sup>.

Many studies have attempted to link PTSD with genetic candidates, and not surprisingly genes associated with PTSD are also linked with other common psychiatric disorders, including major depression, generalized anxiety disorder, panic disorder, and substance use<sup>93</sup>. For example, numerous studies have pointed to the functional polymorphism in the promoter region of the serotonin transporter gene (SLC6A4) across many disorders. The short allele (5-HTTLPR S), which reduces serotonergic expression and uptake by nearly 50%<sup>94</sup>, has been linked with impaired extinction learning in both mice and humans<sup>95</sup>. Gene x environment association studies also show that a functional variant in FKBP5, a gene encoding a co-chaperone of the glucocorticoid receptor, increases risk for PTSD following trauma<sup>96</sup>.

Over 50 gene variants have been linked with PTSD, involved in the function of HPA axis; noradrenergic, dopaminergic and serotonergic systems; and neurotrophins<sup>97</sup>. However, this field is characterized by poor replication of findings, and accordingly there is convergent agreement that the most promising avenue for understanding the genetic basis of PTSD is via polygenic approaches. The largest genome-wide study to date was conducted by the Psychiatric Genomics Consortium – Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Group, which recently reported an analysis of 20,730 people: no single nucleotide polymorphism was found to be significantly associated with PTSD, but the study did find a polygenic risk profile that overlapped with risk for schizophrenia<sup>98</sup>.

The genetic vulnerability to PTSD appears to be moderated by contextual factors. Early life stress is particularly relevant, with evidence that childhood trauma modifies the genetic risk for PTSD <sup>96</sup>. Epigenetic studies in PTSD have typically focused on DNA methylation, with a primary focus on peripheral indicators of candidate genes <sup>99</sup>, and epigenetic regulation of the HPA axis in particular <sup>100</sup>. Distinctive methylation in PTSD has been documented in a number of genes, including NR3C1, CRHR1 and FKBP5 <sup>97</sup>. However, the evidence has relied to date on peripheral blood assessments, that may not reflect central mechanisms occurring in neural circuits.

# Cognitive behavioral models

Although most cognitive behavioral models recognize the role of fear conditioning in the etiology of PTSD, they also place considerable emphasis on memory organization<sup>101</sup>. Cognitive models propose that trauma memories are encoded in a distinctive manner, as a result of the elevated arousal at the time of trauma. They tend to be encoded in predominantly sensory modalities, with a fragmented and disorganized sequencing, thereby reducing the likelihood that the memory is adequately embedded into one's autobiographical memory base<sup>102</sup>. There is some evidence that interfering with the visual memory sys-

tem during the consolidation phase after trauma exposure can limit subsequent PTSD symptoms <sup>103</sup>.

Much emphasis is also placed on the extent to which people appraise the traumatic event, their responses to it, and their future likelihood of harm. It is postulated that excessively negative appraisals tend to exaggerate the individual's sense of threat, thereby maintaining PTSD<sup>104,105</sup>. As noted above, there is abundant evidence of the predictive role of catastrophic appraisals in the development and maintenance of PTSD, as well as of their decline after successful therapy<sup>106</sup>. These appraisals tend to result in strong avoidance of potential threats, which impairs emotional processing of trauma memories and extinction learning<sup>107</sup>.

Implicit in most cognitive (and biological) models of PTSD is the attentional bias towards threat, as reflected in the inclusion of hypervigilance in the DSM-5/ICD-11 descriptions of PTSD. Using a range of experimental paradigms, PTSD has been found to be characterized by a strong bias towards potentially threatening stimuli <sup>108-110</sup>. Relatedly, PTSD patients have problems with disengagement from threat, response inhibition, and orienting <sup>62</sup>. The resulting intrusions and arousal can contribute to the well-documented deficits in neuropsychological functions such as concentration, sustained attention, executive control, and working memory <sup>111</sup>.

## **PREVENTION**

Defence organizations have sometimes tried to prepare their personnel for deployment to combat by targeting key mechanisms known to increase the risk for PTSD.

One example comes from an Israeli initiative that built on evidence regarding the attentional biases in PTSD. The disorder is characterized by both a bias towards threat <sup>109,112</sup> and a bias towards avoidance of the threat <sup>113,114</sup>, resulting in greater attentional variability <sup>115</sup>. A computerized prevention program tested in Israeli soldiers involved training them to control their attentional biases by using a modified dot-probe task administered prior to deployment. The study found that soldiers receiving the program had fewer subsequent PTSD symptoms than those in a control condition, and this result was mediated by a reduction in attentional variability <sup>116</sup>. This program appears to be a promising preventive strategy, at least in military personnel, and has been found to reduce PTSD symptoms in treatment seeking combat veterans <sup>117</sup>.

#### **PSYCHOLOGICAL TREATMENTS**

The treatment of choice for PTSD is trauma-focused cognitive behavior therapy (TF-CBT), as suggested by most treatment guidelines 118,119.

There are numerous variants of TF-CBT, including prolonged exposure, eye movement desensitization and reprocessing, cognitive therapy, cognitive processing therapy, and imagery rescripting therapy. Although these treatments are presented as distinctive, they all essentially comprise emotional processing of the traumatic memory and integration of new corrective information. This form of therapy has been shown to be effective in many populations, including victims of traumatic injury and assault, sexual assault, combat, terrorist attacks, displacement, and childhood sexual abuse  $^{120-125}$ .

The core component of this treatment typically involves exposure, i.e. the patient is directed to engage with the trauma memory for a prolonged period. This strategy is commonly conceptualized as a form of extinction learning, insofar as the person learns that the trauma reminder is no longer a signal of threat. Although this exposure was traditionally implemented for 40-60 min, later trials have shown that it can be effective with repeated sessions lasting 20 or even 10 min  $^{126,127}$ .

The introduction of the diagnosis of acute stress disorder triggered a series of early intervention studies targeting people who were regarded as being at high risk for PTSD development. These programs evaluated abridged versions of TF-CBT (usually 5-6 sessions), and typically found that they were more efficacious than control conditions <sup>128-132</sup>. Meta-analytic studies have supported the utility of early targeted intervention to limit later PTSD <sup>133,134</sup>. However, one large study found that, whereas early provision of TF-CBT facilitated recovery, all patients typically adapted in the long-term regardless of the type of intervention <sup>135</sup>.

Although TF-CBT has been shown to be effective in PTSD, it is important to note that only two-thirds of patients respond adequately to this intervention<sup>136</sup>. This has led to attempts to augment treatment, mostly based on pharmacological or psychological strategies to increase extinction learning, building on animal neuroscience work<sup>137,138</sup>. These approaches have targeted the mechanisms of extinction by combining exposure therapy with device-based, pharmacological or behavioral techniques that promote neural processes to enhance associative learning.

Device-based techniques include repetitive transcranial magnetic stimulation (rTMS) focusing on the ventromedial and dorsolateral prefrontal cortex, areas that are relevant to extinction learning. Several studies suggest that rTMS is superior to sham in augmenting exposure therapy  $^{139,140}$ .

One of the earlier pharmacological attempts used D-cycloserine, an antibiotic that acts as an agonist of N-methyl-D-aspartate (NMDA) receptors and promotes extinction learning in animals. A series of trials tested this drug to augment exposure therapy for PTSD. One study found evidence of a faster rate of symptom reduction  $^{141}$ , while another reported a detrimental effect  $^{142}$ , and three further trials found no effect  $^{143\cdot145}$ . The conclusion was that this adjunctive treatment is not useful  $^{146}$ .

The other pharmacological adjunct that has received considerable recent attention is methylenedioxy-methamphetamine (MDMA). This drug enhances activity in the ventromedial prefrontal cortex, which is key for extinction. Furthermore, it increases cortisol release, which can promote emotional engagement and enhance extinction <sup>147</sup>. Several small trials suggest that MD-MA-assisted psychotherapy does have a superior effect <sup>148,149</sup>, and large multi-site studies are now underway <sup>150</sup>.

Further attempts to augment PTSD treatment have combined

World Psychiatry 18:3 - October 2019

exposure with acute bouts of exercise, because this can promote extinction retention (possibly via increased release of brain-derived neurotrophic factor)<sup>151</sup>. One small pilot study did show that acute bouts of exercise after exposure can boost the effect of therapy<sup>152</sup>.

Although some attempts to augment psychotherapy for PTSD appear to offer promise, we are not at the point of recommending any of them. Larger trials, more targeted augmentation strategies, and replication of findings are needed before we are in a position to integrate these approaches into clinical practice.

## PHARMACOLOGICAL INTERVENTIONS

There is much less compelling evidence for pharmacological treatment of PTSD. In fact, psychotherapeutic approaches yield more robust effect sizes than pharmacological agents, and the potential for adverse side effects and relapse after discontinuation of medications supports the idea, endorsed by treatment guidelines, that psychotherapy should be the first line of treatment.

At present, two selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors (SSRIs), sertraline and paroxetine, are the only medications approved by the US Food and Drug Administration for treatment of PTSD, although their effect size in this disorder is small (0.23; 95% CI: 0.12-0.33)<sup>153</sup>. There is also some evidence for efficacy of the selective noradrenaline reuptake inhibitor (SNRI) venlafaxine. One common reason why these drugs are prescribed is that they are efficacious in treating major depressive disorder, which is highly comorbid with PTSD.

Other pharmacological agents have been used for specific PTSD symptoms: as noted above, multiple studies have found prazosin (an alpha1-adrenergic antagonist) to be effective in reducing nightmares and hyperarousal<sup>154</sup>. Benzodiazepines have often been prescribed in the context of PTSD, but they are generally contraindicated, because of limited efficacy and risk of abuse.

Over the past 20 years, there have been attempts to limit PTSD development by the early administration of agents that target key neurobiological processes occurring in the initial days after trauma exposure.

The proposition that PTSD is largely driven by a surge of noradrenergic release in the acute post-trauma period has led to attempts to reduce noradrenergic activity. These attempts have focused on administering propranolol (a beta-adrenergic antagonist) in the hours or days after trauma exposure, because of preclinical evidence that this drug blocks fear memory reconsolidation <sup>155</sup>. As noted above, the initial trial of propranolol found that it resulted in reduced subsequent reactivity to trauma reminders, even though it did not reduce the severity of PTSD <sup>68</sup>. Subsequent trials were negative, and one meta-analysis concluded that there was no evidence for the utility of propranolol in limiting PTSD development <sup>156</sup>.

It is also worth noting that there is indirect evidence of a potentially protective role for morphine in the acute phase after trauma. The locus coeruleus, which produces noradrenaline, is inhibited by morphine, and animal work indicates that morphine injections into the amygdala impair memory for fear

conditioning in rats<sup>157</sup>. It has been suggested that the administration of morphine in the initial days after trauma exposure may be associated with reduced PTSD at follow-up<sup>158,159</sup>, but no randomized controlled trials are available.

The evidence that low levels of cortisol after trauma are predictive of subsequent PTSD<sup>72,160</sup> has led to attempts to limit later PTSD severity by increasing cortisol levels in the period shortly after trauma exposure. As noted above, animal studies reported that administering hydrocortisone to rats after exposure to a stressor results in less fear behavior compared to placebo<sup>74</sup>. Similarly, administering cortisol to humans immediately after exposure to a stressful event results in fewer memories of the event<sup>161,162</sup>. Indeed, a preliminary study found that the administration of cortisol within hours of trauma exposure is more efficacious that placebo in limiting subsequent PTSD<sup>75</sup>.

# MAJOR CHALLENGES FOR THE PTSD FIELD

## The diagnostic conundrum

One of the main challenges in the PTSD field is the fact that we have two official definitions of the disorder that are somewhat different. As noted above, whereas the DSM-5 definition intentionally encompasses a broad range of trauma-related presentations, the ICD-11 adopts a much narrower approach focused on fear circuitry.

This situation is problematic, because multiple studies indicate that PTSD is diagnosed at higher rates using the DSM-5 criteria compared to the ICD-11 guidelines  $^{163-165}$ , although there are also some reports that rates are comparable  $^{166}$ . Further concern comes from the evidence that the two diagnostic systems tend to identify different individuals, with one study showing that only 42% of trauma survivors were diagnosed as having PTSD using both definitions  $^{163}$ .

There has been considerable discussion about the relative merits of the two diagnostic definitions. On the one hand, it has been emphasized that the DSM-5 definition is applicable to a larger number of trauma survivors<sup>164</sup>. On the other, it has been argued that moving beyond the traditional focus on fear symptoms undermines much of the evidence base of exposure-based treatments for PTSD and may increase the rate of psychiatric comorbidities<sup>167</sup>. Actually, some studies suggest that the ICD-11 definition of PTSD is associated with less psychiatric comorbidity<sup>166,168</sup>, while others indicate that there is not a marked difference in this respect between the DSM-5 and ICD-11 definitions<sup>163,164</sup>. A further argument is that, when using the DSM-5 definition of PTSD, there are 636,120 permutations of how the disorder may present<sup>169</sup>, which may impair the identification of meaningful biomarkers.

# **Delayed-onset PTSD**

Delayed-onset PTSD, traditionally defined as PTSD that develops at least 6 months after exposure to trauma, has been

described for many years, with cases of PTSD reportedly commencing decades after the trauma occurrence<sup>170</sup>. Systematic reviews indicate that, of those people who develop PTSD, approximately 25% may be delayed-onset cases<sup>171,172</sup>.

Longitudinal studies suggest that most of these cases actually experience sub-syndromal levels of PTSD in the acute phase, and this reaction subsequently compounds to a more severe disorder, so that the diagnostic threshold for PTSD is surpassed <sup>173-176</sup>. Systematic reviews recognize, however, that some people do apparently have an initial period of minimal symptoms and subsequently develop PTSD <sup>172</sup>. This latter scenario has been particularly noted in military cohorts, where delayed-onset PTSD is markedly more common than in civilian trauma survivors <sup>177</sup>. It appears that many troops return from deployment with little indication of stress response, while on follow-up they display full PTSD symptoms.

Different theories have been put forward for delayed-onset PTSD. It is possible that, in the initial phase, denial and numbing inhibit PTSD responses and that, as time progresses and numbing abates, PTSD symptoms emerge<sup>178</sup> - however, no strong evidence supporting this hypothesis is available. A second possibility is that, immediately after the traumatic event, people are more preoccupied with immediate needs (such as pain, legal proceedings, post-deployment activities, or dislocation) that distract their attention from their stress reactions <sup>179</sup> – again, there is a paucity of evidence in favor of this explanation. The observation that many delayed PTSD cases experience significant acute stress responses that subsequently worsen has prompted the proposal that delayed PTSD may be caused by additional stressors in the post-trauma phase, compounded with diminished resources to deal with these demands 180 - indeed, there is evidence that delayed-onset PTSD is predicted by the severity of post-trauma stressors 135,173,181,182. One further possibility is that relief from the immediate threat of danger may provide people with a temporary sense of safety, that subsequently gives way to ongoing perceptions of threat, leading to PTSD - this interpretation may be especially applicable to military cohorts, who may be relieved by abandoning the combat zone, but may then have difficulties to readjust to ordinary life<sup>177</sup>.

# PTSD in poorly resourced countries

The majority of people with PTSD do not access care. This situation is particularly stark in low- and middle-income countries, which are disproportionately affected by wars, natural disasters, and humanitarian crises that can facilitate the emergence of mental disorders such as PTSD<sup>183</sup>. A major challenge for the management of PTSD worldwide is the dissemination of evidence-based interventions that can be scaled up affordably in settings lacking adequate numbers of mental health specialists.

It is well documented that evidence-based programs can be implemented effectively in low- and middle-income countries<sup>184,185</sup>. However, they are rarely applied in ordinary conditions, because they typically involve many therapy sessions,

require mental health specialists, and are predicated on a skilled diagnosis of PTSD. In response to this situation, there has been a concerted effort in recent years to engage in "task-shifting", which involves training non-specialists to deliver evidence-based programs to address a range of common mental disorders<sup>186</sup>. This approach has been used successfully in treating PTSD<sup>187,188</sup>.

While some programs have been successful in addressing PTSD in low- and middle-income countries by adopting a transdiagnostic approach, that does not require sophisticated diagnostic skills but relies on targeting common problems that underpin anxiety and depression <sup>189</sup>, others have used a modular approach that tailors key strategies to the primary problems that a person is experiencing <sup>190,191</sup>. Despite these promising developments, massive challenges remain in disseminating affordable evidence-based programs in low- and middle-income countries, because most of them lack the resources to implement and sustain mental health initiatives.

#### CONCLUSIONS

Since the introduction of the PTSD diagnosis 40 years ago, our understanding of traumatic stress conditions has grown significantly. However, despite this burgeoning knowledge, our capacity to facilitate recovery from PTSD appears to have stalled over recent decades. Although our treatments are reasonably efficacious, too many patients fail to respond optimally, and many more are not able to access them.

These problems remain a major challenge for the field. Considering the millions of people directly affected by trauma, the limited success in providing the majority of them with efficacious treatments is resulting in a major public health burden. Identifying novel mechanisms that can be translated into optimizing treatment outcomes, and overcoming the major barriers facing most health systems in delivering evidence-based treatments, should remain the top priorities for the field of traumatic stress in the years to come.

#### **REFERENCES**

- Shephard B. A war of nerves: soldiers and psychiatrists in the twentieth century. London: Cape, 2000.
- Friedman MJ, Resick PA, Bryant RA et al. Considering PTSD for DSM-V. Depress Anxiety 2011;28:750-69.
- Reed GM, First MB, Kogan CS et al. Innovations and changes in the ICD-11 classification of mental, behavioral and neurodevelopmental disorders. World Psychiatry 2019;18:3-19.
- Bryant RA. Acute stress disorder as a predictor of posttraumatic stress disorder: a systematic review. J Clin Psychiatry 2011;72:233-9.
- Bryant RA, Harvey AG. Acute stress disorder a critical review of diagnostic issues. Clin Psychol Rev 1997;17:757-73.
- Harvey AG, Bryant RA. Acute stress disorder: a synthesis and critique. Psychol Bull 2002;128:886-902.
- Bryant RA, Friedman MJ, Spiegel D et al. A review of acute stress disorder in DSM-5. Depress Anxiety 2011;28:802-17.
- Nickerson A, Cloitre M, Bryant RA et al. The factor structure of complex posttraumatic stress disorder in traumatized refugees. Eur J Psychotraumatol 2016;7:33253.

World Psychiatry 18:3 - October 2019

- Hyland P, Shevlin M, Elklit A et al. An assessment of the construct validity of the ICD-11 proposal for complex posttraumatic stress disorder. Psychol Trauma 2017:9:1-9.
- Hyland P, Shevlin M, Brewin CR et al. Validation of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and complex PTSD using the International Trauma Questionnaire. Acta Psychiatr Scand 2017;136:313-22.
- Shevlin M, Hyland P, Karatzias T et al. Alternative models of disorders of traumatic stress based on the new ICD-11 proposals. Acta Psychiatr Scand 2017;135:419-28.
- Karatzias T, Shevlin M, Fyvie C et al. Evidence of distinct profiles of posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and complex posttraumatic stress disorder (CPTSD) based on the new ICD-11 Trauma Questionnaire (ICD-TQ). J Affect Disord 2017;207:181-7.
- Cloitre M, Garvert DW, Brewin CR et al. Evidence for proposed ICD-11 PTSD and complex PTSD: a latent profile analysis. Eur J Psychotraumatol 2013:4
- Cloitre M, Garvert DW, Weiss B et al. Distinguishing PTSD, complex PTSD, and borderline personality disorder: a latent class analysis. Eur J Psychotraumatol 2014:5.
- Elklit A, Hyland P, Shevlin M. Evidence of symptom profiles consistent with posttraumatic stress disorder and complex posttraumatic stress disorder in different trauma samples. Eur J Psychotraumatol 2014:5.
- Perkonigg A, Hofler M, Cloitre M et al. Evidence for two different ICD-11
  posttraumatic stress disorders in a community sample of adolescents and
  young adults. Eur Arch Psychiatry Clin Neurosci 2016;266:317-28.
- Knefel M, Garvert DW, Cloitre M et al. Update to an evaluation of ICD-11 PTSD and complex PTSD criteria in a sample of adult survivors of childhood institutional abuse by Knefel & Lueger-Schuster (2013): a latent profile analysis. Eur J Psychotraumatol 2015;6:25290.
- Bonanno GA, Romero SA, Klein SI. The temporal elements of psychological resilience: an integrative framework for the study of individuals, families, and communities. Psychol Inquiry 2015;26:139-69.
- Breslau N, Davis G, Andreski P et al. Traumatic events and posttraumatic stress disorder in an urban population of young adults. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1991;48:216-22.
- Kessler RC, Sonnega A, Hughes M et al. Posttraumatic stress disorder in the National Comorbidity Survey. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1995;52:1048-60.
- Karam EG, Friedman MJ, Hill ED et al. Cumulative traumas and risk thresholds: 12-month PTSD in the World Mental Health (WMH) Surveys. Depress Anxiety 2014;31:130-42.
- Creamer M, Burgess P, McFarlane AC. Post-traumatic stress disorder: findings from the Australian National Survey of Mental Health and Wellbeing. Psychol Med 2001;31:1237-47.
- Forbes D, Fletcher S, Parslow R et al. Trauma at the hands of another: longitudinal study of differences in the posttraumatic stress disorder symptom profile following interpersonal compared with noninterpersonal trauma. J Clin Psychiatry 2012;73:372-6.
- Forbes D, Lockwood E, Phelps A et al. Trauma at the hands of another: distinguishing PTSD patterns following intimate and nonintimate interpersonal and noninterpersonal trauma in a nationally representative sample. J Clin Psychiatry 2014;75:147-53.
- Liu H, Petukhova MV, Sampson NA et al. Association of DSM-IV posttraumatic stress disorder with traumatic experience type and history in the World Health Organization World Mental Health Surveys. JAMA Psychiatry 2017;74:270-81.
- Steel Z, Chey T, Silove D et al. Association of torture and other potentially traumatic events with mental health outcomes among populations exposed to mass conflict and displacement: a systematic review and metaanalysis. JAMA 2009;302:537-49.
- Adams RE, Boscarino JA. Differences in mental health outcomes among Whites, African Americans, and Hispanics following a community disaster. Psychiatry 2005;68:250-65.
- DiGrande L, Perrin MA, Thorpe LE et al. Posttraumatic stress symptoms, PTSD, and risk factors among lower Manhattan residents 2-3 years after the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks. J Trauma Stress 2008;21:264-73.
- Schlenger WE, Kulka RA, Fairbank JA et al. The prevalence of post-traumatic stress disorder in the Vietnam generation: a multimethod, multisource assessment of psychiatric disorder. J Trauma Stress 1992;5:333-63.
- Rytwinski NK, Scur MD, Feeny NC et al. The co-occurrence of major depressive disorder among individuals with posttraumatic stress disorder: a meta-analysis. J Trauma Stress 2013;26:299-309.
- Breslau N, Davis GC, Peterson EL et al. Psychiatric sequelae of posttraumatic stress disorder in women. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1997;54:81-7.

- Perkonigg A, Kessler RC, Storz S et al. Traumatic events and post-traumatic stress disorder in the community: prevalence, risk factors and comorbidity. Acta Psychiatr Scand 2000;101:46-59.
- Galea S, Vlahov D, Resnick H et al. Trends of probable post-traumatic stress disorder in New York City after the September 11 terrorist attacks. Am J Epidemiol 2003;158:514-24.
- Riggs DS, Rothbaum BO, Foa EB. A prospective examination of symptoms of posttraumatic stress disorder in victims of nonsexual assault. J Interperson Viol 1995:10:201-14.
- Bryant RA, O'Donnell ML, Creamer M et al. A multisite analysis of the fluctuating course of posttraumatic stress disorder. JAMA Psychiatry 2013; 70:839-46.
- Bonanno GA, Ho SM, Chan JC et al. Psychological resilience and dysfunction among hospitalized survivors of the SARS epidemic in Hong Kong: a latent class approach. Health Psychol 2008;27:659-67.
- 37. deRoon-Cassini TA, Mancini AD, Rusch MD et al. Psychopathology and resilience following traumatic injury: a latent growth mixture model analysis. Rehab Psychol 2010;55:1-11.
- Bryant RA, Nickerson A, Creamer M et al. Trajectory of post-traumatic stress following traumatic injury: 6-year follow-up. Br J Psychiatry 2015;206: 417-23.
- Galatzer-Levy IR, Huang SH, Bonanno GA. Trajectories of resilience and dysfunction following potential trauma: a review and statistical evaluation. Clin Psychol Rev 2018;63:41-55.
- Bryant RA, Creamer M, O'Donnell M et al. Acute and chronic posttraumatic stress symptoms in the emergence of posttraumatic stress disorder: a network analysis. JAMA Psychiatry 2017;74:135-42.
- Blanchard EB, Hickling EJ, Forneris CA et al. Prediction of remission of acute posttraumatic stress disorder in motor vehicle accident victims. J Trauma Stress 1997;10:215-34.
- Frommberger UH, Stieglitz RD, Nyberg E et al. Prediction of posttraumatic stress disorder by immediate reactions to trauma: a prospective study in road traffic accident victims. Eur Arch Psychiatry Clin Neurosci 1998; 248:316-21.
- 43. Jehel L, Paterniti S, Brunet A et al. Prediction of the occurrence and intensity of post-traumatic stress disorder in victims 32 months after bomb attack. Eur Psychiatry 2003;18:172-6.
- Karstoft KI, Galatzer-Levy IR, Statnikov A et al. Bridging a translational gap: using machine learning to improve the prediction of PTSD. BMC Psychiatry 2015;15:30.
- 45. Shalev AY, Freedman S. PTSD following terrorist attacks: a prospective evaluation. Am J Psychiatry 2005;162:1188-91.
- Shalev AY, Gevonden M, Ratanatharathorn A et al. Estimating the risk of PTSD in recent trauma survivors: results of the International Consortium to Predict PTSD (ICPP). World Psychiatry 2019;18:77-87.
- Brewin CR, Andrews B, Valentine JD. Meta-analysis of risk factors for posttraumatic stress disorder in trauma-exposed adults. J Consult Clin Psychol 2000;68:748-66.
- Murray J, Ehlers A, Mayou RA. Dissociation and post-traumatic stress disorder: two prospective studies of road traffic accident survivors. Br J Psychiatry 2002;180:363-8.
- Shalev AY, Freedman A, Peri T et al. Prospective study of posttraumatic stress disorder and depression following trauma. Am J Psychiatry 1998;155: 630-7.
- Dunmore E, Clark DM, Ehlers A. A prospective investigation of the role of cognitive factors in persistent posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) after physical or sexual assault. Behav Res Ther 2001;39:1063-84.
- Kleim B, Ehlers A, Glucksman E. Early predictors of chronic post-traumatic stress disorder in assault survivors. Psychol Med 2007;37:1457-67.
- 52. Wikman A, Molloy GJ, Randall G et al. Cognitive predictors of posttraumatic stress symptoms six months following acute coronary syndrome. Psychol Health 2011;26:974-88.
- Pitman RK, Rasmusson AM, Koenen KC et al. Biological studies of posttraumatic stress disorder. Nat Rev Neurosci 2012;13:769-87.
- 54. Rauch SL, Drevets WC. Neuroimaging and neuroanatomy of stress-induced and fear circuitry disorders. In: Andrews G, Charney DS, Sirovatka PJ et al (eds). Stress-induced and fear circuitry disorders: refining the research agenda for DSM-V. Arlington: American Psychiatric Association, 2009:215-54.
- Smith ME. Bilateral hippocampal volume reduction in adults with posttraumatic stress disorder: a meta-analysis of structural MRI studies. Hippocampus 2005;15:798-807.
- Logue MW, van Rooij SJH, Dennis EL et al. Smaller hippocampal volume in posttraumatic stress disorder: a multisite ENIGMA-PGC study: subcortical

- volumetry results from Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Consortia. Biol Psychiatry 2018;83:244-53.
- Gilbertson MW, Shenton ME, Ciszewski A et al. Smaller hippocampal volume predicts pathologic vulnerability to psychological trauma. Nature Neurosci 2002;5:1242-7.
- Kitayama N, Quinn S, Bremner JD. Smaller volume of anterior cingulate cortex in abuse-related posttraumatic stress disorder. J Affect Disord 2006;90: 171-4.
- Patel R, Spreng RN, Shin LM et al. Neurocircuitry models of posttraumatic stress disorder and beyond: a meta-analysis of functional neuroimaging studies. Neurosci Biobehav Rev 2012;36:2130-42.
- Shalev A, Liberzon I, Marmar C. Post-traumatic stress disorder. N Engl J Med 2017;376:2459-69.
- Block SR, Liberzon I. Attentional processes in posttraumatic stress disorder and the associated changes in neural functioning. Exp Neurol 2016;284: 153.67
- Hendrickson RC, Raskind MA. Noradrenergic dysregulation in the pathophysiology of PTSD. Exp Neurol 2016;284:181-95.
- McGaugh JL. Memory a century of consolidation. Science 2000;287:248-51.
- Southwick SM, Krystal JH, Bremner JD et al. Noradrenergic and serotonergic function in posttraumatic stress disorder. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1997;54:749-58
- Southwick SM, Bremner JD, Rasmusson A et al. Role of norepinephrine in the pathophysiology and treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder. Biol Psychiatry 1999;46:1192-204.
- Taylor FB, Lowe K, Thompson C et al. Daytime prazosin reduces psychological distress to trauma specific cues in civilian trauma posttraumatic stress disorder. Biol Psychiatry 2006;59:577-81.
- Raskind MA, Peskind ER, Taylor F et al. A parallel group placebo controlled study of prazosin for trauma nightmares and sleep disturbance in combat veterans with post-traumatic stress disorder. Biol Psychiatry 2007; 61:928-34.
- Pitman RK, Sanders KM, Zusman RM et al. Pilot study of secondary prevention of posttraumatic stress disorder with propranolol. Biol Psychiatry 2002;51:189-92.
- Stein MB, Kerridge C, Dimsdale JE et al. Pharmacotherapy to prevent PTSD: results from a randomized controlled proof-of-concept trial in physically injured patients. J Trauma Stress 2007;20:923-32.
- Hoge EA, Worthington JJ, Nagurney JT et al. Effect of acute posttrauma propranolol on PTSD outcome and physiological responses during scriptdriven imagery. CNS Neurosci Therapeut 2012;18:21-7.
- Yehuda R, Southwick SM, Nussbaum G et al. Low urinary cortisol excretion in patients with posttraumatic stress disorder. J Nerv Ment Dis 1990; 178:366-9.
- Delahanty DL, Raimonde AJ, Spoonster E. Initial posttraumatic urinary cortisol levels predict subsequent PTSD symptoms in motor vehicle accident victims. Biol Psychiatry 2000;48:940-7.
- Yehuda R. Sensitization of the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis in posttraumatic stress disorder. Ann NY Acad Sci 1997;821:57-75.
- Cohen H, Matar MA, Buskila D et al. Early post-stressor intervention with high-dose corticosterone attenuates posttraumatic stress response in an animal model of posttraumatic stress disorder. Biol Psychiatry 2008;64: 708-17.
- Zohar J, Yahalom H, Kozlovsky N et al. High dose hydrocortisone immediately after trauma may alter the trajectory of PTSD: interplay between clinical and animal studies. Eur Neuropsychopharmacol 2011;21:796-809.
- Olff M, Langeland W, Draijer N et al. Gender differences in posttraumatic stress disorder. Psychol Bull 2007;133:183-204.
- Lithari C, Frantzidis CA, Papadelis C et al. Are females more responsive to emotional stimuli? A neurophysiological study across arousal and valence dimensions. Brain Topography 2010;23:27-40.
- Segal SK, Cahill L. Endogenous noradrenergic activation and memory for emotional material in men and women. Psychoneuroendocrinology 2009;34:1263-71.
- Grillon C. Greater sustained anxiety but not phasic fear in women compared to men. Emotion 2008;8:410-3.
- Williams LM, Barton MJ, Kemp AH et al. Distinct amygdala-autonomic arousal profiles in response to fear signals in healthy males and females. Neuroimage 2005;28:618-26.
- Pineles SL, Nillni YI, King MW et al. Extinction retention and the menstrual cycle: different associations for women with posttraumatic stress disorder. J Abnorm Psychol 2016;125:349-55.

- 82. Bryant RA, Felmingham KL, Silove D et al. The association between menstrual cycle and traumatic memories. J Affect Disord 2011;131:398-401.
- 83. Kirschbaum C, Kudielka BM, Gaab J et al. Impact of gender, menstrual cycle phase, and oral contraceptives on the activity of the hypothalamus-pituitary-adrenal axis. Psychosom Med 1999;61:154-62.
- Orr SP, Pitman RK, Lasko NB et al. Psychophysiological assessment of posttraumatic stress disorder imagery in World War II and Korean combat veterans. J Abnorm Psychol 1993;102:152-9.
- Bryant RA, Harvey AG, Guthrie RM et al. A prospective study of psychophysiological arousal, acute stress disorder, and posttraumatic stress disorder. J Abnorm Psychol 2000;109:341-4.
- O'Donnell ML, Creamer M, Elliott P et al. Tonic and phasic heart rate as predictors of posttraumatic stress disorder. Psychosom Med 2007;69:256-61.
- 87. Peri T, Ben Shakhar G, Orr SP et al. Psychophysiologic assessment of aversive conditioning in posttraumatic stress disorder. Biol Psychiatry 2000;47: 512-9.
- Guthrie RM, Bryant RA. Extinction learning before trauma and subsequent posttraumatic stress. Psychosom Med 2006;68:307-11.
- 89. Lommen MJ, Engelhard IM, Sijbrandij M et al. Pre-trauma individual differences in extinction learning predict posttraumatic stress. Behav Res Ther 2013;51:63-7.
- Orr SP, Lasko NB, Macklin ML et al. Predicting post-trauma stress symptoms from pre-trauma psychophysiologic reactivity, personality traits and measures of psychopathology. Biol Mood Anxiety Dis 2012;2:8.
- 91. True WR, Rice J, Eisen SA et al. A twin study of genetic and environmental contributions to liability for posttraumatic stress symptoms. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1993;50:257-64.
- 92. Sartor CE, McCutcheon VV, Pommer NE et al. Common genetic and environmental contributions to post-traumatic stress disorder and alcohol dependence in young women. Psychol Med 2011;41:1497-505.
- 93. Koenen KC, Fu QJ, Ertel K et al. Common genetic liability to major depression and posttraumatic stress disorder in men. J Affect Disord 2008;105: 109-15.
- 94. Lesch KP BD, Heils A, Sabol SZ et al. Association of anxiety-related traits with a polymorphism in the serotonin transporter gene regulatory region. Science 1996;274:1527-31.
- Hartley CA, McKenna MC, Salman R et al. Serotonin transporter polyadenylation polymorphism modulates the retention of fear extinction memory. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2012;109:5493-8.
- 96. Binder EB, Bradley RG, Liu W et al. Association of FKBP5 polymorphisms and childhood abuse with risk of posttraumatic stress disorder symptoms in adults. JAMA 2008;299:1291-305.
- Sheerin CM, Lind MJ, Bountress KE et al. The genetics and epigenetics of PTSD: overview, recent advances, and future directions. Curr Opin Psychol 2017;14:5-11.
- 98. Duncan LE, Ratanatharathorn A, Aiello AE et al. Largest GWAS of PTSD (N=20 070) yields genetic overlap with schizophrenia and sex differences in heritability. Mol Psychiatry 2018;23:666-73.
- Zannas AS, Provencal N, Binder EB. Epigenetics of posttraumatic stress disorder: current evidence, challenges, and future directions. Biol Psychiatry 2015;78:327-35.
- 100. Golier JA, Schmeidler J, Legge J et al. Twenty-four hour plasma cortisol and adrenocorticotropic hormone in Gulf War veterans: relationships to posttraumatic stress disorder and health symptoms. Biol Psychiatry 2007; 62:1175-8.
- Ehlers A, Clark DM. A cognitive model of posttraumatic stress disorder. Behav Res Ther 2000;38:319-45.
- 102. Brewin CR, Gregory JD, Lipton M et al. Intrusive images in psychological disorders: characteristics, neural mechanisms, and treatment implications. Psychol Rev 2010;117:210-32.
- 103. Iyadurai L, Blackwell SE, Meiser-Stedman R et al. Preventing intrusive memories after trauma via a brief intervention involving Tetris computer game play in the emergency department: a proof-of-concept randomized controlled trial. Mol Psychiatry 2018;23:674-82.
- 104. Foa EB, Ehlers A, Clark DM et al. The Posttraumatic Cognitions Inventory (PTCI): development and validation. Psychol Assess 1999;11:303-14.
- 105. Bryant RA, Guthrie RM. Maladaptive appraisals as a risk factor for post-traumatic stress: a study of trainee firefighters. Psychol Sci 2005;16:749-
- 106. Kleim B, Grey N, Wild J et al. Cognitive change predicts symptom reduction with cognitive therapy for posttraumatic stress disorder. J Consult Clin Psychol 2013;81:383-93.

**World Psychiatry** 18:3 - October 2019 **267** 

- Foa EB, Steketee G, Rothbaum BO. Behavioral/cognitive conceptualizations of post-traumatic stress disorder. Behav Ther 1989;20:155-76.
- Bryant RA, Harvey AG. Processing threatening information in posttraumatic stress disorder. J Abnorm Psychol 1995;104:537-41.
- Bryant RA, Harvey AG. Attentional bias in posttraumatic stress disorder. J Trauma Stress 1997;10:635-44.
- Felmingham KL, Rennie C, Manor B et al. Eye tracking and physiological reactivity to threatening stimuli in posttraumatic stress disorder. J Anxiety Disord 2011:25:668-73.
- Aupperle RL, Melrose AJ, Stein MB et al. Executive function and PTSD: disengaging from trauma. Neuropharmacology 2012;62:686-94.
- Buckley TC, Blanchard EB, Neill WT. Information processing and PTSD: a review of the empirical literature. Clin Psychol Rev 2000;20:1041-65.
- Bar-Haim Y, Holoshitz Y, Eldar S et al. Life-threatening danger and suppression of attention bias to threat. Am J Psychiatry 2010;167:694-8.
- Wald I, Lubin G, Holoshitz Y et al. Battlefield-like stress following simulated combat and suppression of attention bias to threat. Psychol Med 2011;41:699-707.
- Naim R, Abend R, Wald I et al. Threat-related attention bias variability and posttraumatic stress. Am J Psychiatry 2015;172:1242-50.
- Wald I, Fruchter E, Ginat K et al. Selective prevention of combat-related post-traumatic stress disorder using attention bias modification training: a randomized controlled trial. Psychol Med 2016;46:2627-36.
- 117. Badura-Brack AS, Naim R, Ryan TJ et al. Effect of attention training on attention bias variability and PTSD symptoms: randomized controlled trials in Israeli and U.S. combat veterans. Am J Psychiatry 2015;172:1233-41.
- Institute of Medicine. Treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder: an assessment of the evidence. Washington: Institute of Medicine, 2008.
- 119. National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence. Post traumatic stress disorder: the management of PTSD in adults and children in primary and secondary care. London: Gaskell and the British Psychological Society, 2005.
- 120. Neuner F, Schauer M, Klaschik C et al. Comparison of narrative exposure therapy, supportive counseling, and psychoeducation for treating posttraumatic stress disorder in an African refugee settlement. J Consult Clin Psychol 2004;72:579-87.
- Bryant RA, Moulds ML, Guthrie RM et al. A randomized controlled trial of exposure therapy and cognitive restructuring for posttraumatic stress disorder. J Consult Clin Psychol 2008;76:695-703.
- Duffy M, Gillespie K, Clark DM. Post-traumatic stress disorder in the context of terrorism and other civil conflict in Northern Ireland: randomised controlled trial. BMI 2007:334:1147.
- 123. Foa EB, Rothbaum BO, Riggs DS et al. Treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder in rape victims: a comparison between cognitive-behavioral procedures and counseling. J Consult Clin Psychol 1991;59:715-23.
- 124. McDonagh A, Friedman M, McHugo G et al. Randomized trial of cognitive-behavioral therapy for chronic posttraumatic stress disorder in adult female survivors of childhood sexual abuse. J Consult Clin Psychol 2005;73:515-24.
- 125. Schnurr PP, Friedman MJ, Foy DW et al. Randomized trial of traumafocused group therapy for posttraumatic stress disorder: results from a Department of Veterans Affairs cooperative study. Arch Gen Psychiatry 2003;60:481-9.
- 126. Nacasch N, Huppert JD, Su YJ et al. Are 60-minute prolonged exposure sessions with 20-minute imaginal exposure to traumatic memories sufficient to successfully treat PTSD? A randomized noninferiority clinical trial. Behav Ther 2015;46:328-41.
- 127. Bryant RA, Kenny L, Rawson N et al. Efficacy of exposure-based cognitive behavior therapy for post-traumatic stress disorder in emergency service personnel: a randomised clinical trial. Psychol Med 2019;49:1565-73.
- Bryant RA, Harvey AG, Dang ST et al. Treatment of acute stress disorder: a comparison of cognitive-behavioral therapy and supportive counselling. J Consult Clin Psychol 1998;66:862-6.
- Bryant RA, Mastrodomenico J, Felmingham KL et al. Treatment of acute stress disorder: a randomized controlled trial. Arch Gen Psychiatry 2008;65: 659-67.
- 130. Bryant RA, Moulds M, Guthrie R et al. Treating acute stress disorder following mild traumatic brain injury. Am J Psychiatry 2003;160:585-7.
- Bryant RA, Moulds ML, Guthrie RM et al. The additive benefit of hypnosis and cognitive-behavioral therapy in treating acute stress disorder. J Consult Clin Psychol 2005;73:334-40.
- 132. Shalev AY, Ankri Y, Israeli-Shalev Y et al. Prevention of posttraumatic stress disorder by early treatment: results from the Jerusalem Trauma Outreach and Prevention Study. Arch Gen Psychiatry 2012;69:166-76.

- 133. Kornør H, Winje D, Ekeberg Ø et al. Early trauma-focused cognitive-behavioral therapy to prevent chronic post-traumatic stress disorder and related symptoms: a systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC Psychiatry 2008;8:81.
- Roberts NP, Kitchiner NJ, Kenardy J et al. Systematic review and meta-analysis of multiple-session early interventions following traumatic events. Am J Psychiatry 2009;166:293-301.
- Shalev AY, Ankri Y, Gilad M et al. Long-term outcome of early interventions to prevent posttraumatic stress disorder. J Clin Psychiatry 2016;77: e580-7.
- Bradley R. A multidimensional meta-analysis of psychotherapy for PTSD. Am J Psychiatry 2005;162:214-27.
- Lebois LAM, Seligowski AV, Wolff JD et al. Augmentation of extinction and inhibitory learning in anxiety and trauma-related disorders. Annu Rev Clin Psychol 2019;15:257-84.
- 138. Weisman JS, Rodebaugh TL. Exposure therapy augmentation: a review and extension of techniques informed by an inhibitory learning approach. Clin Psychol Rev 2018;59:41-51.
- 139. Kozel FA, Motes MA, Didehbani N et al. Repetitive TMS to augment cognitive processing therapy in combat veterans of recent conflicts with PTSD: a randomized clinical trial. J Affect Disord 2018;229:506-14.
- Isserles M, Shalev AY, Roth Y et al. Effectiveness of deep transcranial magnetic stimulation combined with a brief exposure procedure in post-traumatic stress disorder – a pilot study. Brain Stimul 2013;6:377-83.
- 141. de Kleine RA, Hendriks GJ, Kusters WJ et al. A randomized placebo-controlled trial of D-cycloserine to enhance exposure therapy for posttraumatic stress disorder. Biol Psychiatry 2012;71:962-8.
- Litz BT, Salters-Pedneault K, Steenkamp MM et al. A randomized placebocontrolled trial of D-cycloserine and exposure therapy for posttraumatic stress disorder. J Psychiatr Res 2012;46:1184-90.
- 143. Rothbaum BO, Price M, Jovanovic T et al. A randomized, double-blind evaluation of D-cycloserine or alprazolam combined with virtual reality exposure therapy for posttraumatic stress disorder in Iraq and Afghanistan War veterans. Am J Psychiatry 2014;171:640-8.
- 144. Scheeringa MS, Weems CF. Randomized placebo-controlled D-cycloserine with cognitive behavior therapy for pediatric posttraumatic stress. J Child Adolesc Psychopharmacol 2014;24:69-77.
- 145. Difede J, Cukor J, Wyka K et al. D-cycloserine augmentation of exposure therapy for post-traumatic stress disorder: a pilot randomized clinical trial. Neuropsychopharmacology 2014;39:1052-8.
- Baker JF, Cates ME, Luthin DR. D-cycloserine in the treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder. Ment Health Clin 2017;7:88-94.
- Johansen PO, Krebs TS. How could MDMA (ecstasy) help anxiety disorders? A neurobiological rationale. J Psychopharmacol 2009;23:389-91.
- 148. Mithoefer MC, Wagner MT, Mithoefer AT et al. The safety and efficacy of {+/-}3,4-methylenedioxymethamphetamine-assisted psychotherapy in subjects with chronic, treatment-resistant posttraumatic stress disorder: the first randomized controlled pilot study. J Psychopharmacol 2011;25:439-
- 149. Oehen P, Traber R, Widmer V et al. A randomized, controlled pilot study of MDMA (+/- 3,4-methylenedioxymethamphetamine)-assisted psychotherapy for treatment of resistant, chronic post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). J Psychopharmacol 2013;27:40-52.
- Sessa B, Higbed L, Nutt D. A review of 3,4-methylenedioxymethamphetamine (MDMA)-assisted psychotherapy. Front Psychiatry 2019;10:138.
- 151. Keyan D, Bryant RA. Acute exercise-induced enhancement of fear inhibition is moderated by BDNF Val66Met polymorphism. Trans Psychiatry 2019;9:131
- Powers MB, Medina JL, Burns S et al. Exercise augmentation of exposure therapy for PTSD: rationale and pilot efficacy data. Cogn Behav Ther 2015; 44:314-27.
- Thomas E, Stein DJ. Novel pharmacological treatment strategies for posttraumatic stress disorder. Expert Rev Clin Pharmacol 2017;10:167-77.
- 154. Singh B, Hughes AJ, Mehta G et al. Efficacy of prazosin in posttraumatic stress disorder: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Prim Care Companion CNS Disord 2016;18(4).
- 155. Debiec J, Bush DE, LeDoux JE. Noradrenergic enhancement of reconsolidation in the amygdala impairs extinction of conditioned fear in rats a possible mechanism for the persistence of traumatic memories in PTSD. Depress Anxiety 2011;28:186-93.
- Steenen SA, van Wijk AJ, van der Heijden GJ et al. Propranolol for the treatment of anxiety disorders: systematic review and meta-analysis. J Psychopharmacol 2016;30:128-39.

- McNally GP, Westbrook RF. Anterograde amnesia for Pavlovian fear conditioning and the role of one-trial overshadowing: effects of preconditioning exposures to morphine in the rat. J Exp Psychol Anim Behav Process 2003;29:222-32.
- Holbrook TL, Galarneau MR, Dye JL et al. Morphine use after combat injury in Iraq and post-traumatic stress disorder. N Engl J Med 2010;362:110-7.
- 159. Bryant RA, Creamer M, O'Donnell M et al. A study of the protective function of acute morphine administration on subsequent posttraumatic stress disorder. Biol Psychiatry 2009;65:438-40.
- Delahanty DL, Nugent NR, Christopher NC et al. Initial urinary epinephrine and cortisol levels predict acute PTSD symptoms in child trauma victims. Psychoneuroendocrinology 2005;30:121-8.
- Schelling G, Briegel J, Roozendaal B et al. The effect of stress doses of hydrocortisone during septic shock on posttraumatic stress disorder in survivors. Biol Psychiatry 2001;50:978-85.
- 162. Schelling G, Kilger E, Roozendaal B et al. Stress doses of hydrocortisone, traumatic memories, and symptoms of posttraumatic stress disorder in patients after cardiac surgery: a randomized study. Biol Psychiatry 2004;55: 627-33.
- 163. O'Donnell ML, Alkemade N, Nickerson A et al. Impact of the diagnostic changes to post-traumatic stress disorder for DSM-5 and the proposed changes to ICD-11. Br J Psychiatry 2014;205:230-5.
- 164. Wisco BE, Marx BP, Miller MW et al. A comparison of ICD-11 and DSM criteria for posttraumatic stress disorder in two national samples of U.S. military veterans. J Affect Disord 2017;223:17-9.
- Hansen M, Hyland P, Armour C et al. Less is more? Assessing the validity of the ICD-11 model of PTSD across multiple trauma samples. Eur J Psychotraumatol 2015;6:28766.
- 166. Stein DJ, McLaughlin KA, Koenen KC et al. DSM-5 and ICD-11 definitions of posttraumatic stress disorder: investigating "narrow" and "broad" approaches. Depress Anxiety 2014;31:494-505.
- 167. Hoge CW, Yehuda R, Castro CA et al. Unintended consequences of changing the definition of posttraumatic stress disorder in DSM-5: critique and call for action. JAMA Psychiatry 2016;73:750-2.
- 168. Hyland P, Shevlin M, McNally S et al. Exploring differences between the ICD-11 and DSM-5 models of PTSD: does it matter which model is used? J Anxiety Disord 2016;37:48-53.
- 169. Galatzer-Levy I, Bryant RA. 636,120 ways to have posttraumatic stress disorder: the relative merits of categorical and dimensional approaches to posttraumatic stress. Perspect Psychol Sci 2013;8:651-62.
- Ruzich MJ, Looi JCL, Robertson MD. Delayed onset of posttraumatic stress disorder among male combat veterans – a case series. Am J Geriatr Psychiatry 2005;13:424-7.
- Andrews B, Chris B, Philpott R et al. Delayed-onset posttraumatic stress disorder: a systematic review of the evidence. Am J Psychiatry 2007;164:1319-
- 172. Smid GE, Mooren TT, van der Mast RC et al. Delayed posttraumatic stress disorder: systematic review, meta-analysis, and meta-regression analysis of prospective studies. J Clin Psychiatry 2009;70:1572-82.
- Bryant RA, Harvey AG. Delayed-onset posttraumatic stress disorder: a prospective evaluation. Aust N Z J Psychiatry 2002;36:205-9.
- Carty J, O'Donnell ML, Creamer M. Delayed-onset PTSD: a prospective study of injury survivors. J Affect Disord 2006;90:257-61.

- 175. Green MM, McFarlane AC, Hunter CE et al. Undiagnosed post-traumatic stress disorder following motor vehicle accidents. Med J Aust 1993;159:529-34.
- Blanchard EB, Hickling EJ, Barton KA et al. One-year prospective followup of motor vehicle accident victims. Behav Res Ther 1996;34:775-86.
- Andrews B, Brewin CR, Philpott R et al. Delayed-onset posttraumatic stress disorder: a systematic review of the evidence. Am J Psychiatry 2007; 164:1319-26.
- 178. Horowitz MJ, Solomon GF. A prediction of delayed stress response syndromes in Vietnam veterans. J Social Issues 1975;31:67-80.
- Andreasen NC. Acute and delayed posttraumatic stress disorders: a history and some issues. Am J Psychiatry 2004;161:1321-3.
- Grossman AB, Levin BE, Katzen HL et al. PTSD symptoms and onset of neurologic disease in elderly trauma survivors J Clin Exp Neuropsychol 2004; 26:698-705.
- 181. Horesh D, Solomon Z, Zerach G et al. Delayed-onset PTSD among war veterans: the role of life events throughout the life cycle. Soc Psychiatry Psychiatr Epidemiol 2011;46:863-70.
- 182. Smid GE, van der Velden PG, Lensvelt-Mulders GJ et al. Stress sensitization following a disaster: a prospective study. Psychol Med 2012;42:1675-86
- 183. Barbui C, Tansella M. Mental disorders and conditions specifically related to stress. Epidemiol Psychiatr Sci 2013;22:195-6.
- 184. Morina N, Malek M, Nickerson A et al. Meta-analysis of interventions for posttraumatic stress disorder and depression in adult survivors of mass violence in low- and middle-income countries. Depress Anxiety 2017;34:679-91.
- 185. Morina N, Malek M, Nickerson A et al. Psychological interventions for posttraumatic stress disorder and depression in young survivors of mass violence in low- and middle-income countries: meta-analysis. Br J Psychiatry 2017;210:247-54.
- 186. Singla DR, Raviola G, Patel V. Scaling up psychological treatments for common mental disorders: a call to action. World Psychiatry 2018;17:226-
- 187. Catani C, Kohiladevy M, Ruf M et al. Treating children traumatized by war and Tsunami: a comparison between exposure therapy and meditationrelaxation in North-East Sri Lanka. BMC Psychiatry 2009;9:22.
- Ertl V, Pfeiffer A, Schauer E et al. Community-implemented trauma therapy for former child soldiers in Northern Uganda: a randomized controlled trial. JAMA 2011;306:503-12.
- 189. Rahman A, Hamdani SU, Awan NR et al. Effect of a multicomponent behavioral intervention in adults impaired by psychological distress in a conflict-affected area of Pakistan: a randomized clinical trial. JAMA 2016; 316:2609-17.
- 190. Weiss WM, Murray LK, Zangana GA et al. Community-based mental health treatments for survivors of torture and militant attacks in Southern Iraq: a randomized control trial. BMC Psychiatry 2015;15:249.
- 191. Bolton P, Lee C, Haroz EE et al. A transdiagnostic community-based mental health treatment for comorbid disorders: development and outcomes of a randomized controlled trial among Burmese refugees in Thailand. PLoS Med 2014;11:e1001757.

DOI:10.1002/wps.20656

**World Psychiatry** 18:3 - October 2019 **269**