



Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.

incidence.<sup>11</sup> The UNAIDS-Lancet Commission estimated that HIV/AIDS funding will need to increase from the current \$19 billion annually to \$36 billion per year.<sup>12</sup> Failure to contain the HIV epidemic now will result in an eventually unmanageable global disease burden; the challenge is to pay now or pay a lot more later.

With the issue of when to start treatment resolved, how best to use pre-exposure antiretroviral prophylaxis (PrEP) and in what formulation rises in importance as an operational question, especially for young African women. WHO recommended PrEP as an additional intervention for groups with an annual HIV incidence of 3% or greater.<sup>10</sup> Experience with preventive treatment in other infectious diseases such as malaria and tuberculosis has been mixed, but PrEP offers potent protection against HIV if adhered to. Science drives formulation of guidelines, yet the benefit of guidelines depends on social and political will to implement them.

\*Kevin M De Cock, Wafaa M El-Sadr

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Village Market 00621, Nairobi, Kenya (KMDC); ICAP at Columbia University, Mailman School of Public Health, New York, NY, USA (WME-S) kmd2@cdc.gov

The findings and conclusions in this article are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent the official position of the US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. We declare no competing interests.

- 1 De Cock KM, El-Sadr WM. When to start ART in Africa – an urgent research priority. *N Engl J Med* 2013; **368**: 886–89.
- 2 The INSIGHT START study group. Initiation of antiretroviral therapy in early asymptomatic HIV infection. *N Engl J Med* 2015; **373**: 795–807.
- 3 The TEMPRANO ANRS 12136 study group. A trial of early antiretrovirals and isoniazid preventive therapy in Africa. *N Engl J Med* 2015; **373**: 808–22.
- 4 Cohen MS, Chen YQ, McCauley M, et al. Prevention of HIV-1 Infection with early antiretroviral therapy. *New Engl J Med* 2011; **365**: 493–505.
- 5 Granich RM, Gilks CF, Dye C, De Cock KM, Williams BG. Universal voluntary HIV testing with immediate antiretroviral therapy as a strategy for elimination of HIV transmission: a mathematical model. *Lancet* 2009; **373**: 48–57.
- 6 Tanser F, Barnighausen T, Grapsa E, Zaidi J, Newell ML. High coverage of ART associated with decline in risk of HIV acquisition in rural KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. *Science* 2013; **339**: 966–71.
- 7 Karim SSA, Karim QA. Antiretroviral prophylaxis: a defining moment in HIV control. *Lancet* 2011; **378**: e23–25.
- 8 De Cock KM, Mbori-Ngacha D, Marum E. Shadow on the continent: public health and HIV/AIDS in Africa in the 21st century. *Lancet* 2002; **360**: 67–72.
- 9 McNairy ML, Lamb MR, Abrams EJ, et al. Use of a comprehensive HIV care cascade for evaluating HIV program performance: Findings from 4 sub-Saharan African countries. *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr* 2015; **70**: e44–51.
- 10 WHO. Guideline on when to start antiretroviral therapy and on pre-exposure prophylaxis for HIV. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2015.
- 11 UNAIDS. Global summary of the AIDS epidemic. 2014. [http://www.unaids.org/sites/default/files/media\\_asset/20150714\\_epi\\_core\\_en.pdf](http://www.unaids.org/sites/default/files/media_asset/20150714_epi_core_en.pdf) (accessed Nov 17, 2015).
- 12 Piot P, Karim SSA, Hecht R, et al. Defeating AIDS: advancing global health. *Lancet* 2015; **386**: 171–218.

## Camels, MERS-CoV, and other emerging infections in east Africa

Although human Middle-East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) infection seems to be associated with exposure to animals, including camels, identification of the animal reservoir remains challenging.<sup>1,3</sup> We believe that this gap results from the fact that surveillance systems for diseases in both human beings and animals remain fragmented and fail to take into account the social and ecological contexts within which diseases emerge. Additionally, there is a paucity of data for emerging infectious diseases in animals, especially camels in east Africa. For example, most MERS-CoV cases have been identified in the Arabian Peninsula, in places with robust health care, veterinary care, and disease surveillance. Although preliminary data link some cases of human MERS-CoV to exposure to dromedary camels or their products,<sup>1,2</sup> reliable health records of both human beings and animals cannot confirm a causal relationship. At the same time, many of the camels in the Arabian

Peninsula derive from herds in east Africa, where both human and animal health systems, including surveillance, remain inadequate.

To understand the potential reservoirs and prevalence of MERS-CoV, and in the absence of surveillance and clinical data in east Africa, some researchers have tapped into banked animal and human biological specimen repositories as a proxy for baseline data.<sup>3</sup> Findings of retrospective serosurveys done between 1983 to 1997 in east Africa showed that most (up to 81%) camels were exposed or infected as early as 1980.<sup>3</sup> However, these findings do not consider exposure to other viruses or the potential sources of exposure. Indeed, although not recognised until now, MERS-CoV infection seems likely among east African camels, but the lack of surveillance delays its detection.

Further, in human and camel populations, MERS-CoV infections might be masked by other common co-

morbidities. Thus, one of the challenges of surveillance is that syndromic definitions cannot differentiate MERS-CoV from pneumonia, tuberculosis, and other common respiratory infections; MERS-CoV cases might go undetected in human beings and in camels, necessitating confirmatory diagnostics.<sup>4,6</sup>

In addition to MERS, tuberculosis poses another, arguably more economically important, zoonotic disease in camels and other livestock in east Africa. The disease is transmitted from infected animals through bodily fluids, including milk, and might cause up to 10% of the global human tuberculosis burden.<sup>7</sup> Although no population-based studies of tuberculosis in human or camel populations in east Africa specify mycobacterium species, data from small studies suggest that ethnic Somalis' extraordinarily high rates of tuberculosis and extrapulmonary tuberculosis without high prevalence of HIV/AIDS could be related to their exposure to tuberculosis in livestock milks.<sup>8</sup>

Even so, little research or policy work has been done to address these potential sources of spillover and infection. Although tuberculosis interventions in domesticated, non-mobile livestock have proven successful, surveillance and control for camel herds remain restricted because of their mobility and the poverty and disintegration of many local and regional agricultural and health bureaus.<sup>7</sup>

Camels are central to the diets, economies, and cultures of millions of people in east Africa. Camel milk is typically consumed—and strongly preferred—without pasteurisation or other processing, and milk and meat economies are mostly unregulated, informal, and thus outside the purview of governmental and international regulation.<sup>9</sup> More than 65% of the world's camels are raised by ethnic Somalis in Ethiopia, Somaliland, and Somalia,<sup>8</sup> and production has increased exponentially in the past 15 years, including among non-Somali groups in east Africa. Prices for camels have risen as much as ten times<sup>10</sup> and exports from Africa to the Middle East are increasing substantially.<sup>11</sup>

Despite the importance of camels to so many lives and livelihoods, the absence of effective monitoring and sustainable disease reporting systems within and between countries in the region keep proximal populations vulnerable to both anticipated and unexpected disease outbreaks.<sup>12</sup>

In addition to MERS-CoV and tuberculosis, other emerging infectious diseases linked to camels include Rift Valley fever, brucellosis, trypanosomiasis, adenovirus, equine herpes virus, and camelpox. There are gaps in data on each of these, as well as about the association between different zoonotic diseases in increasing risks of comorbidity. Research is necessary to understand if and how MERS-CoV or tuberculosis, for example, might heighten risk of other infections, and vice versa, in both human beings and animals. As preliminary research on emergent zoonoses in camels suggest, infectious diseases and surveillance systems cannot be regarded alone or in isolation from their broader social and ecological environment.

\**Amira Roess, Lauren Carruth, Sally Lahm, Mo Salman*

Department of Global Health, School of Public Health, George Washington University, Washington, DC, USA (AR, SL); School of International Service, American University, Washington, DC, USA (LC); Animal Population Institute, College of Veterinary Medicine and Biomedical Sciences, Colorado State University, Colorado, CO, USA (MS)  
aroess@gwu.edu

- 1 Haagmans BL, Al Dhahiry SH, Reusken CB, et al. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus in dromedary camels: an outbreak investigation. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2014; **14**: 140–45.
- 2 Reusken CB, Haagmans BL, Müller MA, et al. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus neutralising serum antibodies in dromedary camels: a comparative serological study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2013; **13**: 859–66.
- 3 Müller MA, Corman VM, Jores J, et al. MERS coronavirus neutralizing antibodies in camels, eastern Africa, 1983–1997. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2014; **20**: 2093.
- 4 Hemida M, Perera R, Wang P, et al. Middle East Respiratory Syndrome (MERS) coronavirus seroprevalence in domestic livestock in Saudi Arabia, 2010 to 2013. *Euro Surveill* 2012; **18**: 20659.
- 5 Nowotny N, Kolodziejek J. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) in dromedary camels, Oman, 2013. *Euro Surveill* 2014; **19**: 20781.
- 6 Cauchemez S, Fraser C, Van Kerkhove MD, et al. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus: quantification of the extent of the epidemic, surveillance biases, and transmissibility. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2014; **14**: 50–56.
- 7 Cosivi O, Grange J, Daborn C, et al. Zoonotic tuberculosis due to *Mycobacterium bovis* in developing countries. *Emerg Infect Dis* 1998; **4**: 59.
- 8 Sadler K, Catley A. Milk matters: the role and value of milk in the diets of Somali pastoralist children in Liben and Shinile, Ethiopia. Addis Ababa: Feinstein International Center, Tufts University and Save the Children, 2009.
- 9 Carruth L. Camel milk, amoxicillin, and a prayer: medical pluralism and medical humanitarian aid in the Somali Region of Ethiopia. *Soc Sci Med* 2014; **120**: 405–12.
- 10 Kadim IT. Camel meat and meat products. Wallingford: CAB International, 2012.
- 11 Aklilu Y, Catley A. MIND THE GAP commercialization, livelihoods and wealth disparity in pastoralist areas of Ethiopia. 2010. <http://fic.tufts.edu/assets/mind-the-gap.pdf> (accessed Nov 17, 2015).
- 12 Aklilu Y, Catley A. Livestock exports from the Horn of Africa: an analysis of benefits by pastoralist wealth group and policy implications. Report commissioned by the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) under the Livestock Policy Initiative of the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) 2009. <http://fic.tufts.edu/assets/LivestockExports.pdf> (accessed Nov 17, 2015).