Changes in blood coagulation in patients with severe coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19): a meta-analysis

To the Editor:

Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) is widely spread and poses a critical threat to global health.¹ Prominent changes in coagulation function in severe patients of COVID-19 have been reported in a recent study.² Therefore, we conducted this quantitative meta-analysis to explore the difference in blood coagulation parameters between severe and mild cases of COVID-19.

Literature published from December 1, 2019 to March 30, 2020 was searched systematically using PubMed and Embase without language limits. The keywords were: *coronavirus, laboratory, clinical manifestations, clinical characteristics*, and *clinical features*. All documents comparing information on coagulation parameters between mild and severe cases of COVID-19 patients were finally referred to in our meta-analysis. The pooled standardised mean difference (SMD) and 95% confidence interval (CI) were computed by applying the random-effect model using Stata software (STATA 14.0, Stata Corp, College Station, TX, USA). The study quality was measured by adopting an 11-item checklist, which was suggested by the Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ).

Table I displays the main characteristics of the included studies. Nine studies, including one study from medRxiv, with 1105 patients were eventually included for detailed evaluation. Platelet count (PLT), activated partial thromboplastin time (APTT), prothrombin time (PT) and D-dimer (D-D) levels were available in five, six, six and eight studies, respectively. All the studies were conducted in China. Quality score varied from 3 to 7 points, with a mean of 5.4 (Table I). All the studies were of moderate quality, except one of low quality.

The main difference in coagulation function between severe and mild COVID-19 patients is shown in Fig 1. Pooled results revealed that PT and D-D levels were significantly higher in patients with severe COVID-19 (0.68, 95% CI = 0.43–0.93, $I^2 = 53.7\%$; 0.53, 95% CI = 0.22–0.84, $I^2 = 78.9\%$, respectively). However, no significant difference in PLT and APTT values between severe and mild patients was observed (-0.08, 95% CI = -0.34 to 0.18, $I^2 = 60.5\%$; -0.03, 95% CI = -0.40 to 0.34, $I^2 = 79.5\%$, respectively). Increasing values of D-D and PT support the notion that disseminated intravascular coagulation (DIC) may be common in COVID-19 patients.² In addition, the rise of D-D level also indicates secondary fibrinolysis conditions in these patients. According to Berri *et al.*,³ fibrin clot formation helps people to fight against influenza virus infections. Hence, fibrinolysis may potentially induce following severe COVID-19 infection. Future studies should aim to discover more biomarkers of severe cases of COVID-19, and studies exploring the underlying mechanism of deranged coagulation function in COVID-19 are urgently needed. The haemostatic system might be explored for underlying treatment against coronavirus.

Due to the lack of sufficient study data, we cannot perform a more thorough analysis to prove beneficial screening parameters for PLT, APTT, PT and D-D for prediction of severity of COVID-19. However, we suggest that clinical practitioners pay attention to the changes in coagulation function in COVID-19 patients on a daily basis.

Mi Xiong¹ (D)

Xue Liang¹

You-Dong Wei^{1,2}

¹Department of Neurology, the First Affiliated Hospital of Chongqing Medical University and ²Chongqing Key Laboratory of Neurobiology, Chongqing, China. E-mail: havonewei@163.com

Keywords: COVID-19, coronavirus, coagulation, laboratory, metaanalysis

First published online 14 May 2020 doi: 10.1111/bjh.16725

References

- Zhang JJ, Dong X, Cao YY, Yuan YD, Yang YB, Yan YQ. Clinical characteristics of 140 patients infected with SARS-CoV-2 in Wuhan, China. *Allergy.* 2020. https://doi.org/10.1111/all.14238
- Han H, Yang L, Liu R, Liu F, Wu KL, Li J, et al. Prominent changes in blood coagulation of patients with SARS-CoV-2 infection. *Clin Chem Lab Med.* 2020. https://doi.org/10.1515/cclm-2020-0188
- Berri F, Rimmelzwaan GF, Hanss M, Albina E, Foucault-Grunenwald ML, Lê VB, et al. Plasminogen controls inflammation and pathogenesis of influenza virus infections via fibrinolysis. *PLoS Pathog.* 2013;9: e1003229.
- Huang C, Wang Y, Li X, Ren L, Zhao J, Hu Y, et al. Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel coronavirus in Wuhan, China. *Lancet*. 2020;**395**:497–506.
- Liu M, He P, Liu HG, Wang XJ, Li FJ, Chen S, et al. Clinical characteristics of 30 medical workers infected with new coronavirus pneumonia. *Zhonghua Jie He He Hu Xi Za Zhi*. 2020;43:E016.

© 2020 British Society for Haematology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd British Journal of Haematology, 2020, **189**, 1050–1063

						Coagulation parameters*			
Study	N (male %)	и	Age (years)	Severity criteria	QS	$PLT (10^{9}/I)$	APTT (s)	PT (s)	D-D (mg/l)
Han et al. ²	94 (51.0)	45	NA	Trail version 5	5	NA	29.5 (3.2)/28.6 (2.7)	12.7 (1.1)/12.2 (0.9)	19.3 (34.5)/2.1 (2.9)
Huang et al. ⁴	41 (73.0)	13	49.0 (12.6)	ICU and non-ICU	9	196.0 (72.6)/149.0 (97.8)	26.2 (8.4)/27.7 (6.9)	$12.2 \ (1.6)/10.7 \ (1.7)$	2.4 (10.2)/0.5 (0.4)
Liu et al. ⁵	30 (33.3)	4	35.0 (8.0)	Trail version 5	IJ.	NA	NA	NA	1.5 (1.2)/0.3 (0.1)
Mao et al. ⁶	214 (40.7)	88	52.7 (15.5)	WHO interim guideline	5	204.5 (413.3)/219.0 (400.7)	NA	NA	0.9 (14.7)/0.4 (6.3)
Peng et al. ⁷	112 (47.3)	16	62.0 (8.9)	Standard version	9	NA	36.5 (8.4)/35.8 (6.2)	13.9 (1.6)/13.0 (1.2)	NA
Wan et al. ⁸	135 (53.3)	40	47.0(14.1)	Trail version 5	9	147.0 (70.4)/170.0 (72.6)	29.7 (9.8)/26.6 (3.2)	$11.3 \ (0.8)/10.8 \ (0.7)$	$0.6 \ (0.5)/0.3 \ (0.2)$
Wang et al. ⁹	138 (54·3)	36	56.0 (19.2)	ICU and non-ICU	7	$142.0 \ (61.5)/165.0 \ (46.7)$	30.4 (4.1)/31.7 (2.9)	13.2 (1.6)/12.9 (0.8)	$0.4 \ (0.8)/0.2 \ (0.1)$
Wu et al. ¹⁰	201 (63.7)	84	51.0 (12.3)	With and without ARDS	9	187.0 (94.1)/178.0 (73.7)	26.0 (9.2)/29.5 (5.4)	11.7 (1.0)/10.6 (1.1)	1.2 (3.6)/0.5 (0.4)
Zhang et al. ¹	140(50.7)	58	57.0 (45.9)	Trail version 5	3	NA	NA	NA	$0{\cdot}4~(1{\cdot}6)/0{\cdot}2~(0{\cdot}1)$
N, number of	included patients	; <i>n</i> , nun	nber of severe pa	ntients; QS, quality score; NA,	not ava	ulable; PLT, platelet, reference in	terval 125–350 × $10^9/l; /$	APTT, activated partial th	romboplastin time, ref-
erence interval	(17 % C·0C-1·C2	prount	imbin unue, reiei	rence interval v-4-12.5 S, U-U	, D-uIII	ler, rererence interval u-u-o ing/1,	; ICU, Intensive care unit	t; AKDS, acute respiratory	aistress synarome.

*Data presented as severe/mild COVID-19 patients; data as given as mean (standard derivation).

© 2020 British Society for Haematology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd British Journal of Haematology, 2020, **189,** 1050–1063

Table 1. Study characteristics.

Study ID		SMD (95% CI)	% Weight
PLT Huang et al. Mao et al. Wan et al. Wang et al. Wu et al. Subtotal ($I^2 = 60.5\%$, $P = 0.038$)		$\begin{array}{l} 0.52 \ (-0.15, \ 1.19) \\ -0.04 \ (-0.31, \ 0.24) \\ -0.32 \ (-0.69, \ 0.05) \\ -0.45 \ (-0.84, \ -0.07) \\ 0.11 \ (-0.17, \ 0.39) \\ -0.08 \ (-0.34, \ 0.18) \end{array}$	10.44 25.06 20.21 19.65 24.64 100.00
APTT Han et al. Huang et al. Peng et al. Wan et al. Wang et al. Wu et al. Subtotal ($I^2 = 79.5\%$, $P = 0.000$)		$\begin{array}{c} 0.31 \ (-0.10, \ 0.71) \\ -0.20 \ (-0.86, \ 0.46) \\ 0.11 \ (-0.42, \ 0.64) \\ 0.52 \ (0.15, \ 0.90) \\ -0.40 \ (-0.78, \ -0.02) \\ -0.48 \ (-0.77, \ -0.20) \\ -0.03 \ (-0.40, \ 0.34) \end{array}$	17·24 12·93 15·10 17·80 17·66 19·27 100·00
PT Han et al. Huang et al. Peng et al. Wan et al. Wang et al. Wu et al. Subtotal $(I^2 = 53.7\%, P = 0.055)$		0.50 (0.09, 0.91) 0.90 (0.21, 1.59) 0.71 (0.18, 1.25) 0.68 (0.31, 1.06) 0.28 (-0.10, 0.66) 1.04 (0.74, 1.34) 0.68 (0.43, 0.93)	17-47 9-58 13-18 18-79 18-66 22-32 100-00
D–D Han et al. Huang et al. Liu et al. Mao et al. Wan et al. Wang et al. Wu et al. Zhang et al. Subtotal $(l^2 = 78.9\%, P = 0.000)$.		0.72 (0.30, 1.14) 0.34 (-0.33, 1.00) 2.97 (1.66, 4.28) 0.05 (-0.23, 0.32) 0.94 (0.55, 1.33) 0.48 (0.10, 0.87) 0.30 (0.02, 0.58) 0.19 (-0.14, 0.53) 0.53 (0.22, 0.84)	13.28 9.74 4.26 15.40 13.76 13.79 15.28 14.49 100.00
I _2.5	0	1 2·5	

Fig 1. Forest plot of PLT, APTT, PT and D-D levels in severe COVID-19 patients versus mild COVID-19 patients. [Colour figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

- Mao L, Wang M, Chen S, He Q, Chang J, Hong C, et al. Neurologic manifestations of hospitalized patients with coronavirus disease 2019 in Wuhan, China. *JAMA Neurol.* 2020. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamaneurol. 2020.1127.
- Peng YD, Meng K, Guan HQ, Leng L, Zhu RR, Wang BY, et al. Clinical characteristics and outcomes of 112 cardiovascular disease patients infected by 2019-nCoV. *Zhonghua xin xue guan bing za zhi.* 2020;48: E004.
- Wan S, Xiang Y, Fang W, Zheng Y, Li B, Hu Y, et al. Clinical features and treatment of COVID-19 patients in Northeast Chongqing. J Med Virol. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.25783
- Wang D, Hu B, Hu C, Zhu F, Liu X, Zhang J, et al. Clinical characteristics of 138 hospitalized patients with 2019 novel coronavirus-infected pneumonia in Wuhan, China. *JAMA*. 2020;**323**(11):1061.
- Wu C, Chen X, Cai Y, Xia J, Zhou X, Xu S Risk factors associated with acute respiratory distress syndrome and death in patients with coronavirus disease 2019 pneumonia in Wuhan, China. JAMA Intern Med. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2020.0994