

HHS Public Access

Author manuscript Hum Mutat. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2021 June 01.

Published in final edited form as: Hum Mutat. 2020 June ; 41(6): 1138–1144. doi:10.1002/humu.24017.

CACNA1H variants are not a cause of monogenic epilepsy.

Jeffrey D. Calhoun1, **Alexandra M Huffman**2, **Irena Bellinski**3, **Lisa Kinsley**3, **Elizabeth Bachman**3, **Elizabeth Gerard**1,3, **Jennifer A. Kearney**2, **Gemma L. Carvill**1,*

¹The Ken & Ruth Davee Department of Neurology, Northwestern University Feinberg School of Medicine, Chicago, IL

²Department of Pharmacology, Northwestern University Feinberg School of Medicine, Chicago, IL

³Northwestern Memorial Hospital, Chicago, IL

Abstract

CACNA1H genetic variants were originally reported in a childhood absence epilepsy cohort. Subsequently, genetic testing for *CACNA1H* became available and is currently offered by commercial laboratories. However, the current status of CACNA1H as a monogenic cause of epilepsy is controversial, highlighted by ClinGen's recent re-classification of $CACNA1H$ as disputed. We analyzed published *CACNA1H* variants and those reported in ClinVar and found none would be classified as pathogenic or likely pathogenic per the ACMG classification criteria. Moreover, Cacna1h did not modify survival in a Dravet Syndrome mouse model. We observed a mild increase in susceptibility to hyperthermia-induced seizures in mice with reduced *Cacna1h* expression. Overall, we conclude that there is limited evidence that CACNA1H is a monogenic cause of epilepsy in humans and that this gene should be removed from commercial genetic testing panels to reduce the burden of variants of uncertain significance for healthcare providers, families and patients with epilepsy.

Keywords

CACNA1H; epilepsy; genetics; seizure; ion channel

CACNA1H encodes Cav3.2, a member of the T-type calcium channel family. CACNA1H variants were originally reported in a cohort of individuals with childhood absence epilepsy (CAE) (Y. Chen et al., 2003). Since the initial report, a number of studies have reported on $CACNA1H$ variants in the context of epilepsy, some support this original observation, while others fail to find sufficient evidence for an association with seizures (Y. Chen et al., 2003; Chioza et al., 2006; Heron et al., 2004). However, many of these early supportive studies suffered from small cohort sizes and lack of statistical rigor (Y. Chen et al., 2003). In addition, exome sequencing studies in large epilepsy cohorts including patients with developmental and epileptic encephalopathy (DEE), genetic generalized epilepsy (GGE) and non-acquired focal epilepsy (NAFE) have failed to identify an enrichment of de novo or rare

^{*}Corresponding author: Gemma Carvill, PhD, Feinberg School of Medicine, Department of Neurology, Ward 9-250, 303 E Chicago Ave, Chicago, IL 60611, gemma.carvill@northwestern.edu.

CACNA1H variants in patients relative to controls (Epi25 Collaborative. Electronic address & Epi, 2019; Epi & Epilepsy Phenome/Genome, 2017; Epi et al., 2013; Heyne et al., 2018).

Reported pathogenic CACNA1H variants are primarily missense, though one frameshift variant has been identified (Table 1). Functional studies of these CACNA1H missense variants suggested they may lead to altered biophysical properties or protein trafficking (Y. Chen et al., 2003; Heron et al., 2007; Heron et al., 2004; Khosravani et al., 2005; Vitko et al., 2005). However, because these studies were performed in non-excitable heterologous cell systems (i.e. HEK 293), it remains unclear whether the altered channel properties are sufficient to affect firing of individual neurons or result in hyperexcitability at the network level. Further, without assaying a number of missense variants present in the general population, it is difficult to ascertain what level of altered channel function is tolerated. While studies in model organisms can help elucidate a gene's role in seizure susceptibility, there are few such studies of Cacna1h in rodent or other models. Powell et al. demonstrate that a *Cacna1h* variant (gcm; R1584P) accounts for \sim 33% of the variance for seizure frequency and time spent seizing in the spontaneously epileptic rat model of absence seizures (GAERS), in support of Cav3.2 contributing to seizure susceptibility as a modifier (Powell et al., 2009). In contrast, Cacna1h knockout mice exhibit constitutively constricted coronary arterioles and focal myocardial fibrosis, but not seizures (C. C. Chen et al., 2003).

At The Northwestern Adult Epilepsy Genetics clinic, we encountered an individual with an inherited p.Arg295Ter *CACNA1H* truncating variant. This patient has myoclonic epilepsy and difficult to control tonic-clonic seizures as well as mild intellectual disability. The CACNA1H variant was identified through clinical genetic testing on a commercially available epilepsy gene panel and was reported as a variant of uncertain significance (VUS). As part of our internal process for variant interpretation, we performed a more thorough evaluation of the evidence that CACNA1H is a monogenic cause of epilepsy. Overall, we identified a total of 37 CACNA1H variants reported either in the literature or ClinVar in individuals with epilepsy (Table 1). These 37 patients were reported to have a range of epilepsies, including CAE, febrile seizures (FS), myoclonic-astatic epilepsy (MAE), temporal lobe epilepsy (TLE), symptomatic generalized epilepsy (SGE), juvenile myoclonic epilepsy (JME), epilepsy with generalized tonic-clonic seizures (EGTCS), GGE and juvenile absence epilepsy (JAE). We used the American College of Medical Genetics (ACMG) criteria for variant classification of these 37 reported variants (Richards et al., 2015). Overall, 17/37 (45.9%) were reclassified as VUSs and 20/37 (54.1%) as likely benign or benign, none were classified as likely pathogenic. In particular many of these variants were present in a sampling of >140,000 individuals in the general population (gnomAD - see URLs) (Lek et al., 2016). Overall, 28/37 (75%) of these published 'epilepsy-associated' $CACNA1H$ variants are present in gnomAD, with slightly over 50% (18/37) being present in 10 or more individuals. For instance, CACNA1H p.Ala876Thr is present in over 250 individuals in gnomAD.

URLs

gnomAD population database [v2.1.1 (non-neuro); accessed 28 Jun 2019]: <https://gnomad.broadinstitute.org/> Protter: <http://wlab.ethz.ch/protter/start/> Clinvar [accessed 28 Jun 2019]:<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/clinvar/>

We also used Combined Annotation Dependent Depletion (CADD) scores to compare published and ClinVar missense CACNA1H variants to missense CACNA1H variants present in gnomAD. CADD is an in silico measure of the likelihood that a genetic variant may be deleterious, higher scores are more likely deleterious and CADD 20 represents the top 1% of predicted deleterious variants (Kircher et al., 2014; Rentzsch, Witten, Cooper, Shendure, & Kircher, 2019). CADD scores for published CACNA1H variants (mean=12.8; n=35) showed the same distribution of CADD scores as the variants present in the general population (gnomAD) (mean=12.9; n=1938) (Figure 1A). Moreover, the 'epilepsy associated' and population variants were both located throughout the protein and showed no clustering in the pore loops, transmembrane domains, or gating brake (Figure 1D–E). For contrast, we performed the same CADD score analysis for two bona-fide calcium channel genes implicated in epilepsy, CACNA1A and CACNA1E. For both of these genes pathogenic or likely pathogenic missense variants have significantly higher CADD scores compared to missense variants present in gnomAD (Figure 1B–C). Finally, *CACNA1H* is not under functional constraint (Z_{mis} =−2.36; pLI=0), suggesting that missense and predicted loss-of-function alleles are tolerated. Conversely, as above with the CADD score analysis, CACNA1A (Z_{mis} =5.78; pLI=1) and CACNA1E (Z_{mis} =5.81; pLI=1) are among the most constrained genes in the human genome $(Z_{\text{mis}} > 3.09;$ pLI 0.9).

A valid argument could be made that these other monogenic causes, CACNA1A and CACNA1E, are generally associated with much more severe epilepsy disorders, including DEE; while the CACNA1H associated variants are reported in individuals with milder epilepsies. In this instance genetic association is more appropriate, and indeed CACNA1H variants may convey some risk to these milder epilepsies. However, as outlined above, this association is disputed in the literature and original reports were not sufficiently statistically rigorous. Moreover, a recent GWAS in 15,000 individuals with various epilepsy syndromes, including CAE, GGE and JME failed to identify any risk loci in or near CACAN1H (International League Against Epilepsy Consortium on Complex, 2018). Moreover, exome sequencing in the common epilepsies, including GGE, have failed to identify CACNA1H as being enriched for rare variants using a gene burden analysis (Epi25 Collaborative. Electronic address & Epi, 2019; Epi & Epilepsy Phenome/Genome, 2017). Conversely, $CACNA1G$ is the most highly enriched gene for deleterious variants in individuals with GGE and is the only calcium channel gene found to be putatively associated with epilepsy in this large exome sequencing study.

We previously published *Cacna1g* as a modifier of both *Scn1a* and *Scn2a* mouse models of epilepsy (Calhoun, Hawkins, Zachwieja, & Kearney, 2016, 2017). Given that *Cacna1g* and Cacna1h are both members of the T-type calcium channel gene family and CACNA1G is enriched for rare variants in GGE, we sought to determine whether altered *Cacna1h* expression would also modulate phenotype severity in a mouse model of Dravet syndrome. *Cacna1h*^{KO/+} (1H^{KO/+}) mice were crossed with *Scn1a*^{tm1Kea} (1A^{KO/+}) mice to generate double transgenic $(1A^{KO/+};1H^{KO/+})$ mice and single mutant littermate controls. We found that mice with reduced *Cacna1h* expression $(1A^{KO/+};1H^{KO/+})$ exhibited similar survival over 8 weeks relative to their control littermates $(1A^{KO/+})$ (Fig. 2A). $1A^{KO/+}$; $1H^{KO/+}$ mice were slightly more susceptible to hyperthermia-induced seizures relative to control $1A^{KO/+}$ littermates (Fig. 2B). However, the magnitude of this effect is much smaller than the effect

of antiepileptic drugs (AEDs) such as clobazam, levetiracetam, phenobarbital, or lamotrigine suggesting that, while statistically significant, the result is unlikely to be biologically relevant (Hawkins et al., 2017). Based on a lack of effect on survival and a small but statistically significant increase in hyperthermia-induced seizure susceptibility, we conclude that Cacna1h is not a robust modifier of Scn1a-associated seizures.

In summary, there is currently no human genetic evidence to support the association of $CACNA1H$ with epilepsy, nor does $Cacnath$ meaningfully modify seizure susceptibility in an Scn1a mouse model. Similar to our findings here, the ClinGen working group has undertaken an effort to curate genes appearing on panels (I. Helbig et al., 2018) and has classified CACNA1H as a disputed gene based on poor genetic support, moderate experimental support, and lack of replication over time. Despite minimal evidence for $CACNA1H$ as a monogenic cause of epilepsy, it currently appears on at least 20 independent commercial clinical genetic tests. While CACNA1H-associated variants could potentially be a risk factor for milder epilepsies, the inclusion of 'risk factor' genes is completely inappropriate for current clinical genetic testing, as identification of variants has no diagnostic value. New CACNA1H variant epilepsy case reports continue to appear in the literature, which may lead to confusion among clinicians and genetic counselors when interpreting VUS in *CACNA1H*, as was the case initially in our Adult Epilepsy Genetic Clinic (Chourasia, Osso-Rivera, Ghosh, Von Allmen, & Koenig, 2019). There a large number of VUS being reported in this gene, data from one commercial company alone has reported 407 CACNA1H VUSs in 4859 individuals (almost 10% of reports) in recent years from their epilepsy panel (Truty et al., 2019). These VUSs place a large burden on clinicians and genetic counselors to properly counsel patients regarding variants that are unlikely to be a primary contributor to their phenotype. Our findings here are not limited to CACNA1H, and the ClinGen working group are reevaluating genes to ensure they are removed from clinical testing panels.

Supplementary Material

Refer to Web version on PubMed Central for supplementary material.

Acknowledgments

We acknowledge the Dravet Syndrome Foundation for supporting this study (postdoctoral fellowship to JDC). This work was supported by the National Institutes of Health [R00 NS089858 (GLC), R01 NS084959 (JAK)] and by the NUCATS TL1 [TR001423 (JDC)].

Grant numbers: R00 NS089858 (GLC), R01 NS084959 (JAK), NUCATS TL1 TR001423 (JDC)

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The data that support the findings of this study are available in gnomAD and Clinvar (please see URLs below). Mouse data (hyperthermia & survival) will be provided upon reasonable request.

References

Becker F, Reid CA, Hallmann K, Tae HS, Phillips AM, Teodorescu G, . . . Maljevic S (2017). Functional variants in HCN4 and CACNA1H may contribute to genetic generalized epilepsy. Epilepsia Open, 2(3), 334–342. doi:10.1002/epi4.12068 [PubMed: 29588962]

- Calhoun JD, Hawkins NA, Zachwieja NJ, & Kearney JA (2016). Cacna1g is a genetic modifier of epilepsy caused by mutation of voltage-gated sodium channel Scn2a. Epilepsia, 57(6), e103–107. doi:10.1111/epi.13390 [PubMed: 27112236]
- Calhoun JD, Hawkins NA, Zachwieja NJ, & Kearney JA (2017). Cacna1g is a genetic modifier of epilepsy in a mouse model of Dravet syndrome. Epilepsia, 58(8), e111–e115. doi:10.1111/epi.13811 [PubMed: 28556246]
- Chen CC, Lamping KG, Nuno DW, Barresi R, Prouty SJ, Lavoie JL, . . . Campbell KP (2003). Abnormal coronary function in mice deficient in alpha1H T-type Ca2+ channels. Science, 302(5649), 1416–1418. doi:10.1126/science.1089268 [PubMed: 14631046]
- Chen Y, Lu J, Pan H, Zhang Y, Wu H, Xu K, . . . Wu X (2003). Association between genetic variation of CACNA1H and childhood absence epilepsy. Ann Neurol, 54(2), 239–243. doi:10.1002/ ana.10607 [PubMed: 12891677]
- Chioza B, Everett K, Aschauer H, Brouwer O, Callenbach P, Covanis A, . . . Gardiner RM (2006). Evaluation of CACNA1H in European patients with childhood absence epilepsy. Epilepsy Res, 69(2), 177–181. doi:10.1016/j.eplepsyres.2006.01.009 [PubMed: 16504478]
- Chourasia N, Osso-Rivera H, Ghosh A, Von Allmen G, & Koenig MK (2019). Expanding the Phenotypic Spectrum of CACNA1H Mutations. Pediatr Neurol, 93, 50–55. doi:10.1016/ j.pediatrneurol.2018.11.017 [PubMed: 30686625]
- Epi25 Collaborative. Electronic address, s. b. u. e. a., & Epi, C. (2019). Ultra-Rare Genetic Variation in the Epilepsies: A Whole-Exome Sequencing Study of 17,606 Individuals. Am J Hum Genet, 105(2), 267–282. doi:10.1016/j.ajhg.2019.05.020 [PubMed: 31327507]
- Epi, K. c., & Epilepsy Phenome/Genome, P. (2017). Ultra-rare genetic variation in common epilepsies: a case-control sequencing study. Lancet Neurol, 16(2), 135–143. doi:10.1016/ S1474-4422(16)30359-3 [PubMed: 28102150]
- Epi, K. C., Epilepsy Phenome/Genome, P., Allen AS, Berkovic SF, Cossette P, Delanty N, . . . Winawer MR (2013). De novo mutations in epileptic encephalopathies. Nature, 501(7466), 217– 221. doi:10.1038/nature12439 [PubMed: 23934111]
- Hawkins NA, Anderson LL, Gertler TS, Laux L, George AL Jr., & Kearney JA (2017). Screening of conventional anticonvulsants in a genetic mouse model of epilepsy. Ann Clin Transl Neurol, 4(5), 326–339. doi:10.1002/acn3.413 [PubMed: 28491900]
- Helbig I, Riggs ER, Barry CA, Klein KM, Dyment D, Thaxton C, . . . Mefford HC (2018). The ClinGen Epilepsy Gene Curation Expert Panel-Bridging the divide between clinical domain knowledge and formal gene curation criteria. Hum Mutat, 39(11), 1476–1484. doi:10.1002/ humu.23632 [PubMed: 30311377]
- Helbig KL, Lauerer RJ, Bahr JC, Souza IA, Myers CT, Uysal B, . . . Mefford HC (2018). De Novo Pathogenic Variants in CACNA1E Cause Developmental and Epileptic Encephalopathy with Contractures, Macrocephaly, and Dyskinesias. Am J Hum Genet, 103(5), 666–678. doi:10.1016/ j.ajhg.2018.09.006 [PubMed: 30343943]
- Heron SE, Khosravani H, Varela D, Bladen C, Williams TC, Newman MR, . . . Zamponi GW (2007). Extended spectrum of idiopathic generalized epilepsies associated with CACNA1H functional variants. Ann Neurol, 62(6), 560–568. doi:10.1002/ana.21169 [PubMed: 17696120]
- Heron SE, Phillips HA, Mulley JC, Mazarib A, Neufeld MY, Berkovic SF, & Scheffer IE (2004). Genetic variation of CACNA1H in idiopathic generalized epilepsy. Ann Neurol, 55(4), 595–596. doi:10.1002/ana.20028 [PubMed: 15048902]
- Heyne HO, Singh T, Stamberger H, Abou Jamra R, Caglayan H, Craiu D, . . . Lemke JR (2018). De novo variants in neurodevelopmental disorders with epilepsy. Nat Genet, 50(7), 1048–1053. doi:10.1038/s41588-018-0143-7 [PubMed: 29942082]
- International League Against Epilepsy Consortium on Complex, E. (2018). Genome-wide megaanalysis identifies 16 loci and highlights diverse biological mechanisms in the common epilepsies. Nat Commun, 9(1), 5269. doi:10.1038/s41467-018-07524-z [PubMed: 30531953]
- Khosravani H, Bladen C, Parker DB, Snutch TP, McRory JE, & Zamponi GW (2005). Effects of Cav3.2 channel mutations linked to idiopathic generalized epilepsy. Ann Neurol, 57(5), 745–749. doi:10.1002/ana.20458 [PubMed: 15852375]

- Kircher M, Witten DM, Jain P, O'Roak BJ, Cooper GM, & Shendure J (2014). A general framework for estimating the relative pathogenicity of human genetic variants. Nat Genet, 46(3), 310–315. doi:10.1038/ng.2892 [PubMed: 24487276]
- Lee CG, Lee J, & Lee M (2018). Multi-gene panel testing in Korean patients with common genetic generalized epilepsy syndromes. PLoS One, 13(6), e0199321. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0199321
- Lek M, Karczewski KJ, Minikel EV, Samocha KE, Banks E, Fennell T, . . . Exome Aggregation, C. (2016). Analysis of protein-coding genetic variation in 60,706 humans. Nature, 536(7616), 285– 291. doi:10.1038/nature19057 [PubMed: 27535533]
- Liang J, Zhang Y, Wang J, Pan H, Wu H, Xu K, . . . Wu X (2006). New variants in the CACNA1H gene identified in childhood absence epilepsy. Neurosci Lett, 406(1–2), 27–32. doi:10.1016/ j.neulet.2006.06.073 [PubMed: 16905256]
- Powell KL, Cain SM, Ng C, Sirdesai S, David LS, Kyi M, . . . O'Brien TJ (2009). A Cav3.2 T-type calcium channel point mutation has splice-variant-specific effects on function and segregates with seizure expression in a polygenic rat model of absence epilepsy. J Neurosci, 29(2), 371–380. doi:10.1523/JNEUROSCI.5295-08.2009 [PubMed: 19144837]
- Rentzsch P, Witten D, Cooper GM, Shendure J, & Kircher M (2019). CADD: predicting the deleteriousness of variants throughout the human genome. Nucleic Acids Res, 47(D1), D886– D894. doi:10.1093/nar/gky1016 [PubMed: 30371827]
- Richards S, Aziz N, Bale S, Bick D, Das S, Gastier-Foster J, . . . Committee, A. L. Q. A. (2015). Standards and guidelines for the interpretation of sequence variants: a joint consensus recommendation of the American College of Medical Genetics and Genomics and the Association for Molecular Pathology. Genet Med, 17(5), 405–424. doi:10.1038/gim.2015.30 [PubMed: 25741868]
- Truty R, Patil N, Sankar R, Sullivan J, Millichap J, Carvill G, . . . Aradhya S (2019). Possible precision medicine implications from genetic testing using combined detection of sequence and intragenic copy number variants in a large cohort with childhood epilepsy. Epilepsia Open, 4(3), 397–408. doi:10.1002/epi4.12348 [PubMed: 31440721]
- Vitko I, Chen Y, Arias JM, Shen Y, Wu XR, & Perez-Reyes E (2005). Functional characterization and neuronal modeling of the effects of childhood absence epilepsy variants of CACNA1H, a T-type calcium channel. J Neurosci, 25(19), 4844–4855. doi:10.1523/JNEUROSCI.0847-05.2005 [PubMed: 15888660]

Calhoun et al. Page 7

Figure 1. Analysis of published or Clinvar 'pathogenic' missense calcium channel variants and effect of reduced *Cacna1h* **expression in a** *Scn1a* **mouse model of Dravet syndrome. (A)** Distribution of CADD scores in CACNA1H. The CACNA1H_path distribution (n=35) is from published missense variants or Clinvar pathogenic or likely pathogenic missense variants as listed in Table 1. The CACNA1H_gnomAD distribution (n=1938) includes all $CACNA1H$ missense variants in gnomAD. Error bars represent standard deviation. $p =$ 0.9758 (Mann-Whitney ranksum). **(B)** Distribution of CADD scores in CACNA1A. The CACNA1A_path distribution (n=46) includes all Clinvar pathogenic or likely pathogenic

missense variants. The CACNA1A_gnomAD distribution (n=910) includes all *CACNA1A* missense variants in gnomAD. Error bars represent standard deviation. p < 2.2e-16 (Mann-Whitney ranksum). **(C)** Distribution of CADD scores in CACNA1E. The CACNA1E_path distribution (n=17) is from published missense variants (K. L. Helbig et al., 2018) or Clinvar pathogenic or likely pathogenic missense variants. The CACNA1E_gnomAD distribution (n=821) is from CACNA1E missense variants in gnomAD. Error bars represent standard deviation. p = 0.003252 (Mann-Whitney ranksum). **(D)** Distribution of published or Clinvar 'pathogenic' missense variants in CACNA1H (Protter; see URLs). **(E)** Distribution of gnomAD missense variants in CACNA1H (Protter; see URLs). **(F)** Reduced Cacna1h expression does not affect survival in a mouse model of Dravet syndrome. $p = 0.978$ (Mantel-Cox logrank). **(G)** Reduced Cacna1h expression increases hyperthermia-induced seizure susceptibility. GTCS = generalized tonic-clonic seizure. $p = 0.0332$ (Mantel-Cox logrank).

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Abbreviations: CDNA = coding DNA, Cons = consequence, AF_Popmax = allele frequency in the population with highest allele frequency, Num_Het_Indiv = number of heterozygous individuals with this Abbreviations: $CDNA$ = $coding$ DNA, Cons = $comessage$ are AP Popmax = allele frequency in the population with highest allele frequency, Num_Het_Indiv = number of heterozygous individuals with this variant present in gnomAD, Num_Homoz_Indiv = number of homozygous individuals with this variant present in gnomAD, ACMG = ACMG reclassification. variant present in gnomAD, Num_Homoz_Indiv = number of homozygous individuals with this variant present in gnomAD, ACMG = ACMG reclassification.

* Annuscript notes none of these four variants segregate with phenotype. Manuscript notes none of these four variants segregate with phenotype.

Hum Mutat. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2021 June 01.

 $**$ Manuscript lists as c.1612C>T / p.Leu538Phe, but amino acid 538 is actually Arg. Manuscript lists as c.1612C>T / p.Leu538Phe, but amino acid 538 is actually Arg.

*** manuscript lists as c.5879C>T / p. Ala1960Val, but amino acid 1960 is actually Thr. manuscript lists as c.5879C>T / p. Ala1960Val, but amino acid 1960 is actually Thr.

Clinvar pathogenic or likely pathogenic variants. Clinvar pathogenic or likely pathogenic variants.

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript