#### **TREND EDITORIAL**



# COVID-19 pandemic: the possible influence of the long-term ignorance about climate change

Shaghayegh Gorji<sup>1</sup> • Ali Gorji<sup>1,2,3,4,5</sup>

Received: 13 October 2020 / Accepted: 18 December 2020 / Published online: 6 January 2021 © The Author(s) 2021

#### Abstract

In addressing the current COVID-19 pandemic and evaluating the measures taken by global leaders so far, it is crucial to trace back the circumstances influencing the emergence of the crisis that the world is presently facing. Could it be that the failure to act in a timely manner dates way back to when first concerns about climate change and its inevitable threat to human health came up? Multiple lines of evidence suggest that the large-scale and rapid environmental changes in the last few decades may be implicated in the emergence of COVID-19 pandemic by increasing the potential risk of the occurrence and the spread of zoonotic diseases, worsening food security, and weakening the human immune system. As we are facing progressive climatic change, a failure to act accordingly could inevitably lead to further, more frequent confrontations with newly emerging diseases.

The global mean atmospheric Co<sub>2</sub> levels in the last few decades are higher than at any time in the past 800,000 years (Lüthi et al. 2008) and the last decade was the warmest decade on record at least during the past 150 years (Vitasse et al. 2018; Mann et al. 2016). There are complex and multifaceted links between human-induced climate change and global health risks (McMichael et al. 2008; Butler 2018). Climate change intensifies the risks of both direct and indirect zoonotic diseases (Bradley and Altizer 2007). A large amount of evidence suggests that the rapid ecological changes in the last few decades may be implicated in the emergence of COVID-19 pandemic by increasing the potential risk of the occurrence

Responsible Editor: Philippe Garrigues

Ali Gorji gorjial@uni-muenster.de

- <sup>1</sup> Epilepsy Research Center, Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster, Domagkstr. 11, Münster 48149, Germany
- <sup>2</sup> Department of Neurosurgery, Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster, Münster, Germany
- <sup>3</sup> Shefa Neuroscience Research Center, Khatam Alanbia Hospital, Tehran, Iran
- <sup>4</sup> Neuroscience research Center, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran
- <sup>5</sup> Department of Neurology with Institute of Translational Neurology, Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster, Münster, Germany

and the spread of infectious illnesses (Wu et al. 2016; Baylis 2017), exacerbating food insecurity (Wheeler and von Braun 2013), and weakening the human immune system (Swaminathan et al. 2014).

More than three decades ago, it was predicted that climate change could affect the prevalence, spread, and intensity of viral diseases through (i) alterations in the pathogen transmission pattern, (ii) the host's susceptibility to infection, and (iii) the socioeconomic status (Shope 1991; Nicholls 1993; Chan et al. 1999). Climatic alterations and global warming enhance the seasonal peak and time window of future, potentially epidemic viral infections, particularly zoonotic viral diseases (Liu-Helmersson et al. 2016). Researchers in the Shanxi Province, China, (a neighboring state to Wuhan city) in 2013 have reported an association between climatic change and the alterations of transmission patterns of vector-, air-, and water-borne infectious diseases (Wei et al. 2014a; Tong et al. 2015). These studies also predicted that the elderly, children, subjects with existing chronic diseases, and outdoor workers are the most vulnerable groups to the outbreak of any climaterelated zoonotic diseases (Wei et al. 2014b; Tong et al. 2015).

Furthermore, it has been suggested that climate change tends to increase the geographic expansion of infectious diseases by affecting the pathogens, vectors, hosts, and/or their living environment (Wu et al. 2016). Climate alteration has a potent impact on the replication, development, and transmission rate of viral pathogens (Ruiz et al. 2010; Ruiz-Moreno et al. 2012; Altizer et al. 2013). The ambient temperature change affects viral replication in vitro and affects the

frequency of virus transmission in various in vivo models (Lowen et al. 2007; Foxman et al. 2016; Moriyama and Ichinohe 2019). Global warming was positively correlated with the rate of virus evolution in previous viral outbreaks, such as the epidemic of West Nile virus, and played a crucial role in the preservation and intensification of human infection (Paz 2015). Bats are the natural reservoir for several viruses, such as Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome and Middle East Respiratory Syndrome viruses, which have caused the previous coronavirus outbreaks (O'Shea et al. 2014). Bats are also suspected as natural hosts for SARS-CoV-2, the causative agent of COVID-19 (Sun et al. 2020). The emerging novel coronavirus within bat communities could be due to the impact of climate change on their geographic distribution and habitat suitability in the last few years (Lorentzen et al. 2020). The implication of climate changes on habitat contracture and distributional shifts of bat populations leads to a high prevalence of coronavirus shedding and viral loads in Western Australia (Prada et al. 2019). Climate-induced mismatch in the timing of bird migration enhances viral infection prevalence and spillover potential (Brown and Rohani 2012). Stressful events, such as climate change and habitat destruction, could lead to an alteration of the immune tolerance as well as a significant enhancement of the viral replication and load of persistently infected bats, which subsequently facilitates shedding of virus (Chionh et al. 2019; Subudhi et al. 2019). The interval between the first spillover and viral outbreak originating in bats markedly decreased during the last few decades, which is probably due to several factors, such as climate change, food insecurity, and population growth (Plowright et al. 2015; Wang and Anderson 2019).

Aside from its unprecedented consequences on pathogen development and transmission, climatic alterations also strongly threaten human health by compromising food security (McMichael 2013; Wheeler and von Braun 2013; Watts et al. 2019), which plays a crucial role in human immune function, particularly on vulnerable subjects such as the elderly (Childs et al. 2019). Global warming and air pollution significantly reduce the global availability of micronutrients and vitamins (such as iron, zinc, and copper as well as vitamins C, D, and E), which can lead to the emergence of more virulent strains via changes of the genetic make-up of the viral genome (Beck and Matthews 2000; Schmidhuber and Tubiello 2007; Gorji and Khaleghi Ghadiri 2020). In addition, global warming and increased CO<sub>2</sub> emissions lead to a more suitable environment for food-borne pathogens, which subsequently increase the risk of inadequate nutrient intake (Tirado et al. 2013; Myers et al. 2014; Beach et al. 2019; Macdiarmid and Whybrow 2019). The emergence of novel strains of pathogens with new pathogenic characteristics could be facilitated through enhanced mutation rates in nutrient-deprived populations (Beck et al. 1995). Furthermore, nutrient deficiencies reduce the ability to resist infections and are common causes of the immune system malfunctions (WHO 2013). Climatic alterations weaken the immune system on both individual and population levels (Swaminathan et al. 2014) and can shape the evolution of immune genes and regulate the immune gene diversity (O'Connor et al. 2020). Air pollution and greenhouse gases stimulate proinflammatory immune responses across different immune cells and dysregulate antiviral immune responses (Glencross et al. 2020). Nutrient deficiencies and immune system dysfunction affect the occurrence and overall outcome of viral infections (Gombart et al. 2020). For instance, multiple clinical studies indicate an association between an increased risk of viral infections and vitamin D deficiency (Laplana et al. 2018; Zhou et al. 2019). Approximately 60% of deaths from COVID-19 in Italy occurred in the Lombardy region (Statista 2020), the most air polluted areas in Italy (Conticini et al. 2020) with an extremely high prevalence of vitamin D deficiency, particularly in the cold seasons (Ferrari et al. 2019). Air pollution is associated with increased ozone and nitrogen dioxide values which lead to solar ultraviolet-B (UVB) absorption and reduce the efficiency of cutaneous synthesis, therefore facilitating vitamin D deficiency (Wacker and Holick 2013). Substantial negative correlations have been reported for associations of UVB values and population mean vitamin D levels with case fatality rate and pneumonia during the 1918–1919 influenza pandemic (Grant and Giovannucci 2009; Gorji and Khaleghi Ghadiri 2020).

In the future, more extreme climate events, such as droughts and floods, are expected to change human and wildlife behavior/migration patterns and bringing both species into a closer contact, especially during a shortage of food; an event that may have occurred in Wuhan, China, due to severe droughts in this area over the past four decades (Bell et al. 2018; Sun et al. 2020). Climate change and increasing urbanization have extensively decreased wetland areas in Wuhan, China (Wu et al. 2020), which lead to seriously restrict food production (Yu et al. 2016; Wang et al. 2020). Forcing humans to look for new food sources lead to increased sharing space with wildlife (Woods et al. 2019). Several patients who were admitted to hospitals with COVID-19 infection have links with wet animal and seafood wholesale market in Wuhan, China (Chen et al. 2020).

These observations linking climate change to numerous factors encouraging the development of novel pathogens point out that an adequate response to the current crisis is bound to involve addressing climate change. As we are facing extensive climatic changes, a failure to act accordingly could inevitably lead to further, more frequent confrontations with newly emerging infections, such as COVID-19 (Botzen et al. 2021; Kumar et al. 2021).

**Authors' contributions** SG conceived, carried out the literature review, and drafted the manuscript. AG conceived, designed, and coordinated the study, and contributed to and finalized the draft. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Funding Open Access funding enabled and organized by Projekt DEAL.

### **Compliance with ethical standards**

**Conflict of interest** The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

**Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

## References

- Altizer S, Ostfeld RS, Johnson PT, Kutz S, Harvell CD (2013) Climate change and infectious diseases: from evidence to a predictive framework. Science 341(6145):514–519. https://doi.org/10.1126/science. 1239401
- Baylis M (2017) Potential impact of climate change on emerging vectorborne and other infections in the UK. Environ Health 16(Suppl 1): 112. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12940-017-0326-1
- Beach RH, Sulser TB, Crimmins A, Cenacchi N, Cole J, Fukagawa NK, Mason-D'Croz D, Myers S, Sarofim MC, Smith M, Ziska LH (2019) Combining the effects of increased atmospheric carbon dioxide on protein, iron, and zinc availability and projected climate change on global diets: a modelling study. Lancet Planet Health 3(7):e307–e317. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2542-5196(19)30094-4
- Beck MA, Matthews CC (2000) Micronutrients and host resistance to viral infection. Proc Nutr Soc 59(4):581–585. https://doi.org/10. 1017/s0029665100000823
- Beck MA, Shi Q, Morris VC, Levander OA (1995) Rapid genomic evolution of a non-virulent coxsackievirus B3 in selenium-deficient mice results in selection of identical virulent isolates. Nat Med 1(5):433–436. https://doi.org/10.1038/nm0595-433
- Bell JE, Brown CL, Conlon K, Herring S, Kunkel KE, Lawrimore J, Luber G, Schreck C, Smith A, Uejio C (2018) Changes in extreme events and the potential impacts on human health. J Air Waste Manag Assoc 68(4):265–287. https://doi.org/10.1080/10962247. 2017.1401017
- Botzen W, Duijndam S, van Beukering P (2021 Jan) Lessons for climate policy from behavioral biases towards COVID-19 and climate change risks. World Dev. 137:105214. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. worlddev.2020.105214
- Bradley CA, Altizer S (2007) Urbanization and the ecology of wildlife diseases. Trends Ecol Evol 22(2):95–102. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. tree.2006.11.001

- Brown VL, Rohani P (2012) The consequences of climate change at an avian influenza 'hotspot'. Biol Lett 8(6):1036–1039. https://doi.org/ 10.1098/rsbl.2012.0635
- Butler CD (2018) Climate Change, Health and existential risks to civilization: a comprehensive review (1989'2013). Int J Environ Res Public Health 15(10):2266. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph15102266
- Chan NY, Ebi KL, Smith F, Wilson TF, Smith AE (1999) An integrated assessment framework for climate change and infectious diseases. Environ Health Perspect 107(5):329–337. https://doi.org/10.1289/ ehp.99107329
- Chen N, Zhou M, Dong X, Qu J, Gong F, Han Y, Qiu Y, Wang J, Liu Y, Wei Y, Xia J', Yu T, Zhang X, Zhang L (2020) Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of 99 cases of 2019 novel coronavirus pneumonia in Wuhan, China: a descriptive study. Lancet 395(10223): 507–513. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30211-7
- Childs CE, Calder PC, Miles EA (2019) Diet and immune function. Nutrients 11(8):1933. https://doi.org/10.3390/nu11081933
- Chionh YT, Cui J, Koh J, Mendenhall IH, Ng JHJ, Low D, Itahana K, Irving AT, Wang LF (2019) High basal heat-shock protein expression in bats confers resistance to cellular heat/oxidative stress. Cell Stress Chaperones 24(4):835–849. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12192-019-01013-y
- Conticini E, Frediani B, Caro D (2020) Can atmospheric pollution be considered a co-factor in extremely high level of SARS-CoV-2 lethality in Northern Italy? Environ Pollut 261:114465. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.envpol.2020.114465
- Ferrari D, Lombardi G, Strollo M, Pontillo M, Motta A, Locatelli M (2019) Association between solar ultraviolet doses and vitamin D clinical routine data in European mid-latitude population between 2006 and 2018. Photochem Photobiol Sci 18(11):2696–2706. https://doi.org/10.1039/c9pp00372j
- Foxman EF, Storer JA, Vanaja K, Levchenko A, Iwasaki A (2016) Two interferon-independent double-stranded RNA-induced host defense strategies suppress the common cold virus at warm temperature. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 113:8496–8501. https://doi.org/10.1073/ pnas.1601942113
- Glencross DA, Ho TR, Camiña N, Hawrylowicz CM, Pfeffer PE (2020) Air pollution and its effects on the immune system. Free Radic Biol Med pii: S0891-5849(19):31521–31527
- Gombart AF, Pierre A, Maggini S (2020) A review of micronutrients and the immune system-working in harmony to reduce the risk of infection. Nutrients 12(1):236. https://doi.org/10.3390/nu12010236
- Gorji A, Khaleghi Ghadiri M (2020) Potential roles of micronutrient deficiency and immune system dysfunction in the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic. Nutrition. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.nut.2020.111047
- Grant WB, Giovannucci E (2009) The possible roles of solar ultraviolet-B radiation and vitamin D in reducing case-fatality rates from the 1918-1919 influenza pandemic in the United States. Dermatoendocrinol 1(4):215–219. https://doi.org/10.4161/derm.1. 4.9063
- Kumar S, Singh R, Kumari N, Karmakar S, Behera M, Siddiqui AJ, Rajput VD, Minkina T, Bauddh K, Kumar N (2021) Current understanding of the influence of environmental factors on SARS-CoV-2 transmission, persistence, and infectivity. Environ Sci Pollut Res Int. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-12165-1
- Laplana M, Royo JL, Fibla J (2018) Vitamin D receptor polymorphisms and risk of enveloped virus infection: a meta-analysis. Gene 678: 384–394. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gene.2018.08.017
- Liu-Helmersson J, Quam M, Wilder-Smith A, Stenlund H, Ebi K, Massad E, Rocklöv J (2016) Climate change and Aedes vectors: 21st century projections for dengue transmission in Europe. EBioMedicine 7:267–277. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ebiom.2016. 03.046

- Lorentzen HF, Benfield T, Stisen S, Rahbek C (2020) COVID-19 is possibly a consequence of the anthropogenic biodiversity crisis and climate changes. Dan Med J 67(5):A205025
- Lowen AC, Mubareka S, Steel J, Palese P (2007) Influenza virus transmission is dependent on relative humidity and temperature. PLoS Pathog 3:1470–1476. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.0030151
- Lüthi D, Le Floch M, Bereiter B et al (2008) High-resolution carbon dioxide concentration record 650,000-800,000 years before present. Nature 453(7193):379–382. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature06949
- Macdiarmid JI, Whybrow S (2019) Nutrition from a climate change perspective. Proc Nutr Soc 78(3):380–387. https://doi.org/10.1017/ S0029665118002896
- Mann ME, Rahmstorf S, Steinman BA, Tingley M, Miller SK (2016) The likelihood of recent record warmth. Sci Rep 6(1). https://doi. org/10.1038/srep19831
- McMichael AJ (2013) Globalization, climate change, and human health. N Engl J Med 368:1335–1343. https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJMra1109341
- McMichael AJ, Friel S, Nyong A, Corvalan C (2008) Global environmental change and health: impacts, inequalities, and the health sector. BMJ 336(7637):191–194. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.39392. 473727.AD
- Moriyama M, Ichinohe T (2019) High ambient temperature dampens adaptive immune responses to influenza A virus infection. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 116(8):3118–3125. https://doi.org/10.1073/ pnas.1815029116
- Myers SS, Zanobetti A, Kloog I, et al (2014) Increasing CO2 threatens human nutrition published correction appears in Nature 5;510(7503):139-142. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature13179.
- Nicholls N (1993) El niño-southern oscillation and vector-borne disease. Lancet 342(8882):1284–1285. https://doi.org/10.1016/0140-6736(93)92368-4
- O'Connor EA, Hasselquist D, Nilsson JÅ, Westerdahl H, Cornwallis CK (2020) Wetter climates select for higher immune gene diversity in resident, but not migratory, songbirds. Proc Biol Sci 287(1919): 20192675. doi: https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2019.2675
- O'Shea TJ, Cryan PM, Cunningham AA et al (2014) Bat flight and zoonotic viruses. Emerg Infect Dis 20(5):741–745. https://doi.org/10. 3201/eid2005.130539
- Paz S (2015) Climate change impacts on West Nile virus transmission in a global context. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci. 370(1665): 20130561. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2013.0561
- Plowright RK, Eby P, Hudson PJ, Smith IL, Westcott D, Bryden WL, Middleton D, Reid PA, McFarlane RA, Martin G, Tabor GM, Skerratt LF, Anderson DL, Crameri G, Quammen D, Jordan D, Freeman P, Wang LF, Epstein JH, Marsh GA, Kung NY, McCallum H (2015) Ecological dynamics of emerging bat virus spillover. Proc Biol Sci 282(1798):20142124. https://doi.org/10. 1098/rspb.2014.2124
- Prada D, Boyd V, Baker ML, O'Dea M, Jackson B (2019) Viral diversity of microbats within the south west botanical province of western Australia. Viruses 11(12):1157. https://doi.org/10.3390/v11121157
- Ruiz MO, Chaves LF, Hamer GL, Sun T, Brown WM, Walker ED, Haramis L, Goldberg TL, Kitron UD (2010) Local impact of temperature and precipitation on West Nile virus infection in Culex species mosquitoes in northeast Illinois, USA. Parasit Vectors 3(1):19. https://doi.org/10.1186/1756-3305-3-19
- Ruiz-Moreno D, Vargas IS, Olson KE, Harrington LC (2012) Modeling dynamic introduction of Chikungunya virus in the United States. PLoS Negl Trop Dis 6(11):e1918. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pntd.0001918
- Schmidhuber J, Tubiello FN (2007) Global food security under climate change. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 104(50):19703–19708. https:// doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0701976104
- Shope R (1991) Global climate change and infectious diseases. Environ Health Perspect 96:171–174. https://doi.org/10.1289/ehp.9196171

- Statista (2020) Distribution of Coronavirus cases in Italy as of March 25, 2020. https://www.statista.com/search/?q=Distribution+of+Coronavirus+cases&Search=&qKat=search. Accessed on 09 May, 2020.
- Subudhi S, Rapin N, Misra V (2019) Immune system modulation and viral persistence in bats: understanding viral spillover. Viruses 11(2):192. https://doi.org/10.3390/v11020192
- Sun Z, Thilakavathy K, Kumar SS, He G, Liu SV (2020) Potential factors influencing repeated SARS outbreaks in China. Int J Environ Res Public Health 17(5):1633. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17051633
- Swaminathan A, Lucas RM, Harley D, McMichael AJ (2014) Will global climate change alter fundamental human immune reactivity: implications for child health? Children (Basel) 1(3):403–423. https://doi. org/10.3390/children1030403
- Tirado MC, Crahay P, Mahy L et al (2013) Climate change and nutrition: creating a climate for nutrition security. Food Nutr Bull 34(4):533– 547. https://doi.org/10.1177/156482651303400415
- Tong MX, Hansen A, Hanson-Easey S et al (2015) Infectious diseases, urbanization and climate change: challenges in future China. Int J Environ Res Public Health 12(9):11025–11036. https://doi.org/10. 3390/ijerph120911025
- Vitasse Y, Signarbieux C, Fu YH (2018) Global warming leads to more uniform spring phenology across elevations. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 115(5):1004–1008. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1717342115
- Wacker M, Holick MF (2013) Sunlight and Vitamin D: a global perspective for health. Dermatoendocrinol 5(1):51–108. https://doi.org/10. 4161/derm.24494
- Wang LF, Anderson DE (2019) Viruses in bats and potential spillover to animals and humans. Curr Opin Virol 34:79–89. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.coviro.2018.12.007
- Wang C, Linderholm HW, Song Y et al (2020) Impacts of drought on maize and soybean production in northeast China during the past five decades. Int J Environ Res Public Health 17(7):2459. https:// doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17072459
- Watts N, Amann M, Arnell N et al (2019) The 2019 report of The Lancet Countdown on health and climate change: ensuring that the health of a child born today is not defined by a changing climate. Lancet 394(10211):1836–1878. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(19) 32596-6
- Wei J, Hansen A, Zhang Y, Li H, Liu Q, Sun Y, Bi P (2014a) Perception, attitude and behavior in relation to climate change: a survey among CDC health professionals in Shanxi province, China. Environ Res 134:301–308. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2014.08.006
- Wei J, Hansen A, Zhang Y et al (2014b) The impact of climate change on infectious disease transmission: perceptions of CDC health professionals in Shanxi Province, China. PLoS One 9(10):e109476. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0109476
- Wheeler T, von Braun J (2013) Climate change impacts on global food security. Science 341(6145):508–513. https://doi.org/10.1126/ science.1239402
- Woods R, Reiss A, Cox-Witton K, Grillo T, Peters A (2019) The importance of wildlife disease monitoring as part of global surveillance for zoonotic diseases: the role of Australia. Trop Med Infect Dis 4(1): 29. https://doi.org/10.3390/tropicalmed4010029
- World Health Organization (2013) World health report 2013: research for universal health coverage. https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/ 9789240690837. Accessed 30 June 2020
- Wu X, Lu Y, Zhou S, Chen L, Xu B (2016) Impact of climate change on human infectious diseases: empirical evidence and human adaptation. Environ Int 86:14–23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2015. 09.007
- Wu H, Cheng W, Shen S, Lin M, Arulrajah A (2020) Variation of hydroenvironment during past four decades with underground sponge city planning to control flash floods in Wuhan, China: an overview. Undergr Space 5(2):184–198. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.undsp. 2019.01.003

- Yu G, Yang Y, Tu Z et al (2016) Modeling the water-satisfied degree for production of the main food crops in China. Sci Total Environ 547: 215–225. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.12.105
- Zhou YF, Luo BA, Qin LL (2019) The association between vitamin D deficiency and community-acquired pneumonia: a meta-analysis of

observational studies. Medicine (Baltimore) 98(38):e17252. https://doi.org/10.1097/MD.00000000017252

Publisher's note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.