



Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company's public news and information website.

Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active.



## Letter to the Editor

**Serological markers of SARS-CoV-2 infection; anti-nucleocapsid antibody positivity may not be the ideal marker of natural infection in vaccinated individuals**


Dear Editor,

We write in response to correspondence from Whitaker et al. in this Journal (1). The authors demonstrate increases in seropositivity for SARS-CoV-2 antibodies against the spike protein as the roll out of COVID-19 vaccines continues, whilst parallel assessment of nucleocapsid antibodies remained stable. This study is an example of the use of parallel assessment of spike (S) and nucleocapsid (N) antibodies to discriminate between natural infection and vaccine related seropositivity (2) (3). This approach remains attractive, but as the pandemic rolls on it is worth considering the paucity of evidence about the impact of vaccination on antibody production in response to a subsequent natural infection.

As part of a large seroprevalence study in hospital healthcare workers (PRECISE 2 (4)), we measured antibody response following vaccination in over 4000 hospital healthcare workers (HCW), coupled with a questionnaire about previous symptoms and confirmed infection. We measured anti-S and anti-N antibodies using Roche Elecsys total antibody assays to determine both serological response to vaccination and to natural infection. Twenty-three participants reported a breakthrough infection post-vaccination, defined as PCR-confirmed SARS-CoV-2 infection  $\geq 14$  days after completion of vaccination (5). This represented 0.6% (23/4111) of all fully vaccinated participants in the study. All had received Pfizer vaccine (which was the vaccine received by most study participants). For these 23 participants, the median number of days between second vaccine dose and positive PCR was 30 days (IQR 25–50 days). Five (22%) had symptoms at the time of the positive PCR test and 18 (78%) did not have symptoms (they were tested as close contacts or as part of hospital outbreaks). All 23 participants had detectable anti-S antibodies, as expected post vaccination (6). Notably, only 6/23 (26%, 95%CI: 11–49) had detectable anti-N antibodies in response to their infection, compared to 663/812 (82%, 95%CI: 79–84,  $p$ -value =  $<0.001$  (Chi-squared) of all participants in the study with previous PCR-confirmed infection having detectable anti-N antibodies. Of the 17 that were anti-N negative, median number of days between PCR positivity and sampling mid-point was 52 (range 9–67) so it is surprising that the majority of these had not mounted an anti-N antibody response (7). This low number of seroconversions might suggest that anti-N antibodies may be insensitive as a marker of natural infection post vaccination. It is possible that early viral neutralisation, perhaps even at mucosal surfaces, might modify the natural humoral response and limit the development of anti-N antibodies.

There are a very limited number of studies evaluating the production of anti-N post infection in vaccinated individuals; Dem-

mer et al., in a study awaiting peer-review, have commented on high sensitivity and specificity of anti-N antibody assays in detecting infection in vaccinated individuals (8), however the infection in these individuals pre-dated their vaccination. Studies such as that conducted by Whittaker et al. that we are here responding to, are continuing to rely on anti-N as a marker of seropositivity related to natural infection, including in vaccinated individuals (1). Vaccine effectiveness studies will also incorporate periodic serological testing for SARS-CoV-2 antibodies as a marker of breakthrough infection (9). To the best of our knowledge there are no published data to date that have identified a comparative reduction in anti-N seroconversion following natural infection in vaccinated individuals. Whilst our numbers are small, even in large seroprevalence studies numbers of breakthrough infections will be small (5), and further research of individuals with well-defined vaccine breakthrough infections are required. This information will be critical in informing optimal assessment of seroprevalence in vaccinated cohorts.

## References

- Whitaker HJ, Elghohari S, Rowe C, Otter AD, Brooks T, Linley E, et al. Impact of COVID-19 vaccination program on seroprevalence in blood donors in England, 2021. *J Infect* 2021 S0163445321002243.
- Okba NMA, Müller MA, Li W, Wang C, GeurtsvanKessel CH, Corman VM, et al. Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2–Specific antibody responses in coronavirus disease patients. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2020;26(7):1478–88.
- Dörschug A, Frickmann H, Schwanbeck J, Yilmaz E, Mese K, Hahn A, et al. Comparative assessment of sera from individuals after S-Gene RNA-based SARS-CoV-2 vaccination with spike-protein-based and nucleocapsid-based serological assays. *Diagnostics* 2021;11(3):426.
- Prevalence of antibodies to SARS-CoV-2 natural infection and post-vaccination in Irish Hospital Healthcare Workers (PRECISE 2) [Internet]. Health Protection Surveillance Centre of Ireland (HPSC); 2021 [cited 2021 Jul 26]. Available from: <https://www.hpsc.ie/a-z/respiratory/coronavirus/novelcoronavirus/research/precise/PRECISE%20%20Report.pdf>
- CDC morbidity and mortality weekly report (MMWR) - interim estimates of vaccine effectiveness of BNT162b2 and mRNA-1273 COVID-19 vaccines in preventing SARS-CoV-2 infection among health care personnel, first responders, and other essential and frontline workers – Eight U.S. locations, December 2020–March 2021 [Internet]. 2021 [cited 2021 Jun 16]. Available from: <https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/volumes/70/wr/mm7013e3.htm>
- Eyre DW, Lumley SF, Wei J, Cox S, James T, Justice A, et al. Quantitative SARS-CoV-2 anti-spike responses to Pfizer-BioNTech and Oxford-AstraZeneca vaccines by previous infection status. *Clin Microbiol Infect* 2021 S1198743X21002895.
- Algaissi A, Alfaleh MA, Hala S, Abujamel TS, Alamri SS, Almahboub SA, et al. SARS-CoV-2 S1 and N-based serological assays reveal rapid seroconversion and induction of specific antibody response in COVID-19 patients. *Sci Rep* 2020;10(1):16561.
- Demmer RT, Baumgartner B, Wiggen TD, Ulrich AK, Strickland AJ, Naumchik BM, et al. Identification of natural SARS-CoV-2 infection in seroprevalence studies among vaccinated populations [Internet]. *Infect Dis (except HIV/AIDS)* 2021. [cited 2021 Jul 8]. Available from <http://medrxiv.org/lookup/doi/10.1101/2021.04.12.21255330>.
- World Health Organisation; evaluation of COVID-19 vaccine effectiveness [Internet]. 2021 [cited 2021 Jul 8]. Available from: [https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-vaccine\\_effectiveness-measurement-2021.1](https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-vaccine_effectiveness-measurement-2021.1)

Niamh Allen\*

Department of GU Medicine and Infectious Diseases (GUIDE), St.  
James's Hospital, Dublin, Ireland

Melissa Brady

European Programme for Intervention Epidemiology Training (EPIET),  
European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control, (ECDC),  
Stockholm, Sweden  
Health Protection Surveillance Centre (HPSC), Dublin, Ireland

Antonio Isidro Carrion Martin

Division of Preventive Medicine and Public Health, Department of  
Public Health Sciences, University of Murcia School of Medicine,  
Murcia, Spain

Lisa Domegan

Health Protection Surveillance Centre (HPSC), Dublin, Ireland

Cathal Walsh

Health Protection Surveillance Centre (HPSC), Dublin, Ireland  
Health Research Institute and MACSI, University of Limerick, Ireland  
MISA and NCPE, St James's Hospital, Dublin, Ireland

Lorraine Doherty

Health Protection Surveillance Centre (HPSC), Dublin, Ireland

Una Ni Riain

Department of Microbiology, University Hospital Galway, Ireland

Colm Bergin

Department of GU Medicine and Infectious Diseases (GUIDE), St.  
James's Hospital, Dublin, Ireland

Catherine Fleming

Department of Infectious Diseases, University Hospital Galway,  
Ireland

Niall Conlon

Department of Immunology, St. James's Hospital, Dublin, Ireland

\*Corresponding author.

E-mail address: [nallen@stjames.ie](mailto:nallen@stjames.ie) (N. Allen)