

1 **Household secondary attack rates of SARS-CoV-2 by variant and vaccination status: an updated**  
2 **systematic review and meta-analysis**

3  
4 Zachary J. Madewell\*, PhD, Yang Yang, PhD, Ira M. Longini Jr, PhD, M. Elizabeth Halloran, MD, DSc,  
5 Natalie E. Dean, PhD

6  
7 Author affiliations:

8 Department of Biostatistics, University of Florida, Gainesville, FL (ZJM, YY, IML, NED)  
9 Fred Hutchinson Cancer Research Center, Seattle, WA (MEH)  
10 Department of Biostatistics, University of Washington, Seattle, WA (MEH)

11  
12 \* Correspondence to: Zachary J. Madewell, Department of Biostatistics, University of Florida, PO Box  
13 117450, Gainesville, FL 32611; [zmadewe@emory.edu](mailto:zmadewe@emory.edu)

14  
15 Keywords: Delta; Alpha; vaccine effectiveness; COVID-19; household transmission

16 Running title: Transmission by variant and vaccination

17 Summary: Household secondary attack rates (SARs) were higher for Alpha and Delta variants than  
18 previous estimates. SARs were higher to unvaccinated contacts than to partially or fully vaccinated  
19 contacts and were higher from unvaccinated index cases than from fully vaccinated index cases.

20 **Abstract**

21 We previously reported a household secondary attack rate (SAR) for SARS-CoV-2 of 18.9% through  
22 June 17, 2021. To examine how emerging variants and increased vaccination have affected transmission  
23 rates, we searched PubMed from June 18, 2021, through January 7, 2022. Meta-analyses used generalized  
24 linear mixed models to obtain SAR estimates and 95%CI, disaggregated by several covariates. SARs  
25 were used to estimate vaccine effectiveness based on the transmission probability for susceptibility  
26 ( $VE_{S,p}$ ), infectiousness ( $VE_{I,p}$ ), and total vaccine effectiveness ( $VE_{T,p}$ ). Household SAR for 27 studies  
27 with midpoints in 2021 was 35.8% (95%CI, 30.6%-41.3%), compared to 15.7% (95%CI, 13.3%-18.4%)  
28 for 62 studies with midpoints through April 2020. Household SARs were 38.0% (95%CI, 36.0%-40.0%),  
29 30.8% (95%CI, 23.5%-39.3%), and 22.5% (95%CI, 18.6%-26.8%) for Alpha, Delta, and Beta,  
30 respectively.  $VE_{I,p}$ ,  $VE_{S,p}$ , and  $VE_{T,p}$  were 56.6% (95%CI, 28.7%-73.6%), 70.3% (95%CI, 59.3%-  
31 78.4%), and 86.8% (95%CI, 76.7%-92.5%) for full vaccination, and 27.5% (95%CI, -6.4%-50.7%),  
32 43.9% (95%CI, 21.8%-59.7%), and 59.9% (95%CI, 34.4%-75.5%) for partial vaccination, respectively.  
33 Household contacts exposed to Alpha or Delta are at increased risk of infection compared to the original  
34 wild-type strain. Vaccination reduced susceptibility to infection and transmission to others.

## 35 **Introduction**

36 A previous systematic review and meta-analysis of household transmission of SARS-CoV-2  
37 published through June 17, 2021 reported an overall secondary attack rate (SAR) of 18.9% (95% CI,  
38 16.2%-22.0%) [1]. Emerging variants of concern and increased vaccination have affected transmission  
39 rates. Delta (B.1.617.2) became the predominant variant in many parts of the world and Omicron  
40 (B.1.1.529) poses additional challenges given its high level of spike mutations and increased potential for  
41 transmissibility [2, 3]. Other variants of concern include Alpha (B.1.1.7), Beta (B.1.351), and Gamma  
42 (P.1).

43 Vaccine efficacies against symptomatic disease and death have been demonstrated in randomized  
44 controlled trials [4] and vaccine effectiveness has been corroborated in large observational studies in  
45 Denmark [5], Israel [6], and the United Kingdom [7]. Household studies can supplement efficacy trials to  
46 determine vaccine effectiveness. Vaccine studies based on secondary attack rates (SARs) can be used to  
47 estimate the protective effectiveness of a vaccine in vaccinated susceptible contacts compared to  
48 unvaccinated susceptible contacts who are exposed to an infected index case ( $VE_{S,p}$ ) [8, 9]. Household  
49 studies also enable estimation of vaccine effectiveness in reducing infectiousness ( $VE_{I,p}$ ) by comparing  
50 SARs from vaccinated and from unvaccinated index cases to household contacts, which was done for  
51 pertussis [10]. Total vaccine effectiveness ( $VE_{T,p}$ ), or the combined effect of direct vaccine protection and  
52 indirect vaccine effectiveness, can also be estimated. It is unknown how effective the SARS-CoV-2  
53 vaccines are in reducing susceptibility and infectiousness in the confines of the household where there is  
54 prolonged close contact between household members and index cases. Here, we aggregate evidence of  
55 household contact tracing studies to evaluate SARs for variants of concern and by index case or contact  
56 vaccination status.

57

## 58 **Methods**

59 This study followed the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses  
60 (PRISMA) reporting guideline using the same definitions and eligibility criteria as our original study [11].  
61 Our last review identified studies published through June 17, 2018 [1]. Herein, we searched PubMed and  
62 reference lists of eligible studies between June 18, 2021, and January 7, 2022, with no restrictions on  
63 language, study design, or place of publication. Search terms were: "SARS-CoV-2", "COVID-19",  
64 "severe acute respiratory syndrome", "SARS", "SARS-CoV", "coronavirus", "variant", "vaccination",  
65 "immunization", "secondary attack rate", "secondary infection rate", "household", "family contacts",  
66 "close contacts", "index case", "contact transmission", "contact attack rate", and "family transmission"  
67 (S1 Table). Pre-prints were included. Citations were managed in EndNote 20 (Thomson Reuters, Toronto,  
68 CA).

69 Articles with original data that reported at least 2 of the following factors were included: number  
70 of infected household contacts, total number of household contacts, and household secondary attack rates.  
71 Studies that reported infection prevalence, included populations that overlapped with another included  
72 study, and tested contacts using antibody tests only or using antibody tests and another test but did not  
73 disaggregate SARs by test were excluded. We first screened studies by titles and abstracts to identify  
74 potential studies for inclusion. That reviewer then evaluated full-text articles and selected those that met  
75 the inclusion criteria.

76 For this study, we extracted the following information: first author, location, index case  
77 identification period, number of index cases, index case symptom status, household/family contact type,  
78 test used to diagnose contacts, universal/symptomatic testing, number of tests per contact, and follow-up  
79 duration. We also extracted the number of infected household contacts and total number of household  
80 contacts and disaggregated by covariates including variant, index case vaccination status, household  
81 contact vaccination status, and vaccine type.

82 To examine temporal patterns, we assessed household SARs by index case identification period  
83 midpoint. We restricted this analysis to laboratory-confirmed infections and SARs from unvaccinated  
84 index cases to unvaccinated household contacts to observe how transmission patterns changed

85 independent of vaccination. Next, we evaluated household SARs by variants that were reported in  $\geq 2$   
86 studies regardless of vaccination status and restricted to SARs from unvaccinated index cases to  
87 unvaccinated contacts for comparison with SAR estimates from our original analyses of the  
88 predominantly wild-type variant [1, 11].

89 Traditionally, vaccine efficacies for reducing susceptibility and infectiousness are estimated as  
90  $VE_{S,p} = 1 - SAR_{01}/SAR_{00}$  and  $VE_{I,p} = 1 - SAR_{10}/SAR_{00}$  respectively, where  $SAR_{ij}$  is the SAR  
91 associated with vaccine status  $i$  ( $1$ =vaccinated,  $0$ =unvaccinated) for the index case and  $j$  for the  
92 household contact [8]. The total vaccine effectiveness is defined as  $VE_{T,p} = 1 - (1 - VE_{S,p})(1 - VE_{I,p})$ .  
93 We examined SARs by index case vaccination status (unvaccinated, partially vaccinated, fully  
94 vaccinated, all) and household contact vaccination status (unvaccinated, partially vaccinated, fully  
95 vaccinated, all). The resultant SARs were used to estimate  $VE_{S,p}$ ,  $VE_{I,p}$ , and  $VE_{T,p}$ . We created forest  
96 plots of SARs by index case vaccination status to all household contacts regardless of vaccination status  
97 and restricted to unvaccinated contacts only. We also created forest plots of SARs by contact vaccination  
98 status from all index cases regardless of vaccination status and from unvaccinated index cases only.  
99 Furthermore, we evaluated SARs by vaccine type and vaccination status for index cases and/or household  
100 contacts if reported in  $\geq 2$  studies. Finally, we evaluated SARs by variant and vaccination status for index  
101 cases and/or household contacts if reported in  $\geq 2$  studies.

102

### 103 *Evaluation of Study Quality and Risk of Bias*

104 To assess study quality and risk of bias, we used the same modified version of the Newcastle-  
105 Ottawa quality assessment scale used by Fung *et al.* and in our first analysis [11, 12]. Studies received up  
106 to 9 points based on participant selection (4 points), study comparability (1 point), and outcome of  
107 interest (4 points). Studies were classified as having high ( $\leq 3$  points), moderate (4-6 points), and low ( $\geq 7$   
108 points) risk of bias. When at least 10 studies were available, we also used funnel plots and Begg and  
109 Mazumdar's rank correlation to evaluate publication bias with significance set at  $P < 0.10$  [13].

110

## 111 *Statistical Analysis*

112 We used generalized linear mixed-effects models to obtain SAR estimates and 95% CIs. For  
113 comparisons across covariate subgroups (variant, index case vaccination status, household contact  
114 vaccination status, vaccine type), study was treated as a random effect and the covariate as a fixed effect  
115 moderator. For analyses of SARs by index case vaccination status and contact vaccination status,  
116 comparisons between subgroups (e.g., fully vaccinated versus unvaccinated index cases) were restricted  
117 to pairwise analyses (studies in which SARs were reported from both fully vaccinated and unvaccinated  
118 index cases). For vaccine effectiveness measures, we also used generalized linear mixed models to obtain  
119 the logit of the SAR and corresponding sampling variances, which were back-transformed to obtain VE  
120 summary estimates and 95% CIs. Heterogeneity was measured using the  $I^2$  statistic, with thresholds of  
121 25%, 50%, and 75% indicating low, moderate, and high heterogeneity, respectively. All analyses were  
122 performed using the metafor package in R software, version 4.1.2 (R Foundation for Statistical  
123 Computing) [14, 15]. Statistical significance was set at a 2-tailed  $P$ -value  $\leq 0.05$ .

124

## 125 **Results**

126 We identified 1,291 records (1,281 from PubMed and 10 from reference lists of eligible articles)  
127 published between June 18, 2021 and January 7, 2022 (S1 Figure). Forty-eight new studies [16-64] were  
128 included in this review (S2 Table), 4 of which were preprints in our previous review that were  
129 subsequently published [53-55, 64].

130 Forty-nine new studies[16-64] were combined with 77 studies from our previous review [1] for  
131 our analysis of household SAR by study period (5 studies were excluded that did not include laboratory-  
132 confirmed infections and 1 that included only asymptomatic index cases), resulting in 126 total studies  
133 representing 1,437,696 contacts from 35 countries (see S3 Table for references). Figure 1 demonstrates  
134 large heterogeneity in SAR over time but estimates with midpoints after July 2020 are generally higher  
135 than the earliest estimates. The household SAR for 27 studies with midpoints in 2021 was 35.8% (95%CI,

136 30.6%-41.3%), whereas the household SAR for 62 studies with midpoints through April 2020 was 15.7%  
137 (95% CI, 13.3%-18.4%). Begg and Mazumdar's rank correlation was statistically significant for studies in  
138 2021 ( $P=0.001$ ), but not studies through April 2020 (S2 Figure). Excluding one study in 2021 [54] that  
139 had a relatively low SAR improved the funnel plot symmetry and resulted in a SAR of 33.9% (95% CI,  
140 29.4%-38.7%) for studies with midpoints in 2021. When restricting to unvaccinated contacts only, the  
141 household SAR for studies with midpoints in 2021 was 35.4% (95% CI, 30.0%-41.2%).

142 Eight new studies [23, 28, 31, 39, 50, 52, 55, 56] were combined with 1 study [65] from our  
143 previous review for our analysis of Alpha variant. Figure 2 summarizes results from these 9 studies as  
144 well as 12 [23, 25, 29, 32, 41, 43, 48, 52, 56, 61-63] and 3 [20, 23, 56] new studies reporting household  
145 SARs for Delta and Beta variants, respectively. Estimated mean household SAR for Alpha was 38.0%  
146 (95% CI, 36.0%-40.0%), Delta was 30.8% (95% CI, 23.5%-39.3%), and Beta was 22.5% (95% CI, 18.6%-  
147 26.8%) (Figure 2). SARs between Alpha/Delta and Delta/Beta were not significantly different, but Alpha  
148 was significantly higher than Beta ( $P<0.001$ ). High heterogeneity was found among studies for Delta  
149 (98.0%), and low for Alpha (16.7%) and Beta (2.6%). Begg correlation was not significant for studies of  
150 Delta (S3 Figure). SARs did not significantly change for Alpha (37.8%, 95% CI, 35.7%-39.9%) (5  
151 studies) [23, 28, 31, 50, 55] or Delta (27.0%, 95% CI, 18.5%-37.4%) (7 studies) [23, 29, 32, 43, 48, 61,  
152 62] when restricting to studies with low risk of bias (S4 Table). Restricting to unvaccinated contacts only,  
153 mean estimated SAR for Delta was 34.9% (95% CI, 26.7%-44.1%) (S4 Figure).

154 Eight studies [24, 26, 34, 39, 43, 48, 54, 62] reported SARs by vaccination status of the index  
155 case to all household contacts regardless of vaccination status, seven of which were at low risk of bias and  
156 one was moderate (Figure 3). Overall estimated mean SAR was 26.6% (95% CI, 18.7%-36.4%) from  
157 unvaccinated (8 studies) [24, 26, 34, 39, 43, 48, 54, 62], 16.2% (95% CI, 8.3%-29.4%) from partially  
158 vaccinated (5 studies) [24, 43, 48, 54, 62], and 14.4% (95% CI: 10.5%-19.4%) from fully vaccinated (7  
159 studies) [24, 26, 34, 39, 43, 48, 62] index cases to household contacts. For 7 paired studies [24, 26, 34, 39,  
160 43, 48, 62], estimated mean SAR from unvaccinated index cases (29.9%; 95% CI, 23.0%-37.7%) was  
161 significantly higher than from fully vaccinated index cases ( $P<0.001$ ). For 5 paired studies [24, 43, 48,

162 54, 62], SARs were not significantly different from unvaccinated index cases (19.7%; 95%CI, 13.9%-  
163 27.3%) than from partially vaccinated index cases. Three studies included only Delta infections [43, 48,  
164 62]. Restricting to those 3 studies, we found no significant difference in SAR by index case vaccination  
165 status to all contacts regardless of vaccination status. Excluding those 3 studies, the estimated mean SAR  
166 was significantly higher from unvaccinated index cases (36.3%; 95%CI, 31.3%-41.6%) than from fully  
167 vaccinated index cases (10.7%; 95%CI, 9.0%-12.8%) ( $P<0.001$ ) (4 paired studies) [24, 26, 34, 39], but  
168 not from partially vaccinated index cases (2 paired studies) [24, 54]. Restricting to unvaccinated  
169 household contacts, SARs were also significantly higher from unvaccinated index cases (30.9%, 95%CI,  
170 23.9%-38.8%) than from fully vaccinated index cases (12.0%, 95%CI, 10.0%-14.2%) ( $P<0.001$ ) (4 paired  
171 studies) [24, 26, 48, 62], but not from partially vaccinated index cases (3 paired studies) [24, 54, 62] (S5  
172 Figure). SARs were generally lower from fully vaccinated index cases regardless of contact vaccination  
173 status (S6 Figure). Direct comparison of these studies is compromised, however, because of differences  
174 between studies in terms of vaccine types, definition of vaccination status (e.g., time elapsed since  
175 vaccination or dosage) (S5 Table), vaccination coverage among contacts, characteristics of the study  
176 population, duration of follow-up, diagnostic procedures and tools, location, magnitude of the pandemic,  
177 and circulating variants.

178 Figure 4 summarizes 9 studies [24, 26, 34, 38, 43, 48, 56, 62, 63] reporting household SARs by  
179 contact vaccination status regardless of index case vaccination status, eight of which were at low risk of  
180 bias and two were moderate. Overall estimated mean SAR was 33.8% (95%CI, 28.0%-40.2%) to  
181 unvaccinated contacts (9 studies) [24, 26, 34, 38, 43, 48, 56, 62, 63], 23.7% (95%CI, 19.1%-28.9%) to  
182 partially vaccinated contacts (6 studies) [24, 38, 43, 48, 56, 63], and 14.1% (95%CI, 10.6%-18.6%) to  
183 fully vaccinated contacts (9 studies) [24, 26, 34, 38, 43, 48, 56, 62, 63]. In the 9 paired studies, estimated  
184 mean household SARs were significantly higher to unvaccinated contacts than to fully vaccinated  
185 contacts ( $P<0.001$ ). For 6 paired studies [24, 38, 43, 48, 56, 63], SARs were significantly higher to  
186 unvaccinated contacts (33.1%, 95%CI, 27.8%-38.8%) than to partially vaccinated contacts ( $P=0.020$ ), but  
187 SARs were not significantly different to partially vaccinated contacts than to fully vaccinated contacts



188 (16.6%, 95% CI, 11.9%-22.9%). SARs were consistent when restricting to only unvaccinated index cases  
189 (4 studies [24, 26, 48, 62]) (S7 Figure). When restricting to 4 studies [43, 48, 62, 63] that targeted Delta,  
190 SARs were also significantly higher to unvaccinated contacts (24.4%, 95% CI, 19.3%-30.4%) than to fully  
191 vaccinated contacts (14.3%, 95% CI, 9.3%-21.3%) ( $P=0.027$ ). We also estimated vaccine effectiveness  
192 based on the SARs (Table 1).

193 Next, we examined SARs by vaccine type and index case vaccination status regardless of  
194 vaccination status of household contacts. SARs were included in 2 studies [26, 39] for BNT162b2 and the  
195 mean estimated SAR from fully vaccinated index cases was 8.3% (95% CI, 5.6%-12.1%) compared to  
196 35.9% from unvaccinated index cases (95% CI, 34.1%-37.6%) (S8 Figure).

197 We also examined SARs by vaccine type and contact vaccination status regardless of index case  
198 vaccination status (3 studies [24, 38, 56]). Mean estimated SAR to household contacts fully vaccinated  
199 with Ad26.COV2.S (1 dose) (42.7%, 95% CI: 13.6%-77.9%) ( $P=0.005$ ) or BNT162b2 (15.8%, 95% CI,  
200 15.0%-16.7%) ( $P<0.001$ ) was significantly higher than to contacts fully vaccinated with mRNA-1273 (2  
201 doses) (6.2%, 95% CI: 2.8%-13.0%) (S9 Figure). Additionally, mean estimated SAR was higher to  
202 contacts partially vaccinated with ChAdOx1-S (29.5%, 95% CI: 24.0%-35.7%) than contacts partially  
203 vaccinated with mRNA-1273 (17.5%, 95% CI, 13.7%-22.3%) ( $P=0.008$ ). There was no significant  
204 difference in SAR to contacts fully vaccinated for ChAdOx1-S and BNT162b2, Ad26.COV2.S, or  
205 mRNA-1273; or to contacts partially vaccinated for BNT162b2 and mRNA-1273 or ChAdOx1-S.

206

## 207 **Discussion**

208 We aggregated household studies to examine how variants of concern and vaccination affected  
209 household transmission rates of SARS-CoV-2. Household SARs from fully vaccinated index cases were  
210 lower than from unvaccinated index cases. Fully and partially vaccinated household contacts were less  
211 susceptible to SARS-CoV-2 infection than unvaccinated contacts. SARs for Delta and Alpha were  
212 significantly higher than estimates for the original wild-type variant.

213 Several individual studies included in this analysis reported that full vaccination of index cases  
214 significantly reduced the risk of transmission to household contacts [24, 34]. Conversely, other studies  
215 included in this analysis reported that vaccination status of the index case was not associated with  
216 household contact infection [43, 48]. A meta-analysis allows us to aggregate all the evidence of index  
217 case vaccination status from multiple studies and control for differences between the studies. We found  
218 lower transmission to household contacts from fully vaccinated index cases than from unvaccinated index  
219 cases, but not from partially vaccinated index cases. An observational cohort study from England which  
220 included contacts outside the household also reported that two doses of BNT162b2 or ChAdOx1 reduced  
221 onward transmission of Delta, but by less than Alpha, and the impact of vaccination against onward  
222 transmission waned over time [66]. Our estimate for  $VE_{I,p}$  of 56.6% was within the 41%-79% range  
223 reported for  $VE_I$  from a modeling study that used household data from Israel before Delta became  
224 widespread [67]. Potential mechanisms for reduced infectiousness following vaccination include  
225 decreases in the respiratory tract viral load and severity of symptoms [68].

226 Fully vaccinated and partially vaccinated contacts had significantly lower SARs than  
227 unvaccinated contacts. Other observational studies demonstrated reduced susceptibility to infection  
228 among high risk or household contacts vaccinated with BNT162b2 or ChAdOx1 in Scotland [69],  
229 BNT162b2 in Sweden [70], and BNT162b2 or mRNA-1273 in Belgium [71]. Studies have reported that  
230 full vaccination with mRNA vaccines or ChAdOx1 effectively prevent infection against the original wild-  
231 type, Alpha, and Beta variants, but are less protective against infection for Delta [72, 73]. Our estimates  
232 of  $VE_{S,p}$  (70.3%, 95%CI, 59.3%-78.4%) and  $VE_{T,p}$  (86.8%, 95%CI, 76.7%-92.5%) were slightly lower  
233 than the age-adjusted  $VE_S$  (80.5%, 95%CI, 78.9%-82.1%) and  $VE_T$  (88.5%, 95%CI, 82.3%-94.8%)  
234 reported by *Prunas et al* [67]. Myriad factors preclude our ability to make direct comparisons of vaccine  
235 effectiveness across studies including differences in the study population (e.g., age, comorbidities,  
236 serostatus), viral characteristics, vaccine type, time period defining vaccination status, intensity of the  
237 epidemic, community behavior, and use of nonpharmaceutical interventions (masks, social distancing)

238 [74]. For example, in this analysis *Singanayagam et al.* [48] included households of any size with  
239 contacts  $\geq 5$  years, whereas *Gazit et al.* [26] restricted to households with only one contact other than the  
240 index case. Moreover, *Ng et al.* in Singapore reported that all identified close contacts were placed under  
241 a legally-binding quarantine for 14 days during which they were not allowed to leave their homes [43],  
242 whereas contacts in other studies may have had a higher risk of infection outside the household.

243 With the addition of 49 studies since our last review [1], we observed higher SARs in 2021 than  
244 earlier in the pandemic. This pattern may be attributed in part to the emergence of more contagious  
245 variants. SAR estimates for Alpha (38.0%) and Delta (30.8%) variants were both higher than the overall  
246 SAR previously reported (18.9%) for study periods earlier in the pandemic when the wild-type variant  
247 was prevalent [1]. Public Health England (PHE), which tracks SARs for variants of concern and variants  
248 of interest regardless of vaccination status for index cases and household contacts, found SARs similar for  
249 Alpha (10.2%, 95% CI, 10.1%-10.3%) and Delta (10.4%, 95% CI, 10.4%-10.5%) variants [75]. They note,  
250 however, that direct comparisons between variants are not valid as vaccination levels and social  
251 restrictions in England have varied over this period. Similarly, SARs for Delta and Alpha were not  
252 significantly different in this study even when restricting to unvaccinated contacts only, which may be  
253 partially attributed to an increase in population immunity consequent to infection. A prospective cohort  
254 study [22] and case-control study [76] in England demonstrated increased household transmission for  
255 Delta compared to Alpha. Increased transmissibility may be attributed to higher viral loads, shorter  
256 incubation periods, and mutations in the spike glycoprotein of the virus, which may confer immune  
257 escape potential [77]. Delta infections produced more viral RNA copies per mL than Alpha infections  
258 [78], its *in vitro* replication rate is higher than Alpha [79], and its spike protein binds more efficiently to  
259 the host cell entry receptor ACE2 protein [80].

260 There was large heterogeneity in SARs over time which may be attributed to variations in study  
261 methods, environmental factors, and contact patterns. Comparisons of SARs by vaccination status  
262 between studies were also hindered by differences between studies and there were few studies  
263 disaggregating SARs by both vaccination status of the index cases and contacts. The studies included in

264 this review are from contact tracing investigations which are more likely to identify symptomatic index  
265 cases than asymptomatic individuals, which could inflate the crude SAR. This may also underestimate the  
266 reduction in transmission from vaccination for people infected with Delta [81]. Our analyses by vaccine  
267 type and Beta variant were limited to three studies. There was insufficient data to determine vaccine  
268 effectiveness for specific subgroups (e.g., by age group) and whether that varied by variant.

269 Household contacts exposed to Delta or Alpha variants are at increased risk of infection  
270 compared to the original wild-type variant from Wuhan. Vaccination was demonstrated to reduce  
271 susceptibility to infection and infectiousness. The household remains an important venue of transmission  
272 for SARS-CoV-2. Other public health measures such as hygiene, increased testing, isolation, and  
273 improved ventilation may help limit its spread. Preliminary analyses from PHE demonstrate increased  
274 odds of household transmission from Omicron index cases than from Delta index cases, adjusting for  
275 index case vaccination status and other factors [82]. A study from Denmark reported higher transmission  
276 rates for Omicron than Delta for fully vaccinated individuals but not unvaccinated individuals [61]. The  
277 transmissibility and virulence of Omicron is only now being elucidated and other variants are likely to  
278 emerge.

279  
280 **Acknowledgments:** This work was supported by the National Institutes of Health [R01-AI139761 to  
281 ZJM, YY, IML, MEH, NED].

## 282 References

- 283 1. Madewell ZJ, Yang Y, Longini IM, Jr., Halloran ME, Dean NE. Factors Associated With  
284 Household Transmission of SARS-CoV-2: An Updated Systematic Review and Meta-analysis.  
285 JAMA Netw Open **2021**; 4(8): e2122240.
- 286 2. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Global Variants Report. Available at:  
287 <https://covid.cdc.gov/covid-data-tracker/#global-variant-report-map>.
- 288 3. Willett BJ, Grove J, MacLean O, et al. The hyper-transmissible SARS-CoV-2 Omicron variant  
289 exhibits significant antigenic change, vaccine escape and a switch in cell entry mechanism.  
290 medRxiv **2022**.
- 291 4. Shapiro J, Dean NE, Madewell ZJ, Yang Y, Halloran ME, Longini I. Efficacy Estimates for  
292 Various COVID-19 Vaccines: What we Know from the Literature and Reports. medRxiv **2021**:  
293 2021.05.20.21257461.
- 294 5. Moustsen-Helms IR, Emborg H-D, Nielsen J, et al. Vaccine effectiveness after 1st and 2nd dose  
295 of the BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 Vaccine in long-term care facility residents and healthcare  
296 workers – a Danish cohort study. medRxiv **2021**: 2021.03.08.21252200.
- 297 6. Haas EJ, Angulo FJ, McLaughlin JM, et al. Impact and effectiveness of mRNA BNT162b2  
298 vaccine against SARS-CoV-2 infections and COVID-19 cases, hospitalisations, and deaths  
299 following a nationwide vaccination campaign in Israel: an observational study using national  
300 surveillance data. Lancet **2021**; 397(10287): 1819-29.
- 301 7. Lopez Bernal J, Andrews N, Gower C, et al. Effectiveness of Covid-19 vaccines against the B.  
302 1.617. 2 (Delta) variant. N Engl J Med **2021**: 585-94.
- 303 8. Halloran ME, Longini IM, Struchiner CJ, Longini IM. Design and analysis of vaccine studies:  
304 Springer, **2010**.
- 305 9. Datta S, Halloran ME, Longini IM, Jr. Efficiency of estimating vaccine efficacy for susceptibility  
306 and infectiousness: randomization by individual versus household. Biometrics **1999**; 55(3): 792-  
307 8.
- 308 10. Préziosi MP, Halloran ME. Effects of pertussis vaccination on transmission: vaccine efficacy for  
309 infectiousness. Vaccine **2003**; 21(17-18): 1853-61.
- 310 11. Madewell ZJ, Yang Y, Longini IM, Jr., Halloran ME, Dean NE. Household Transmission of  
311 SARS-CoV-2: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. JAMA Netw Open **2020**; 3(12):  
312 e2031756.
- 313 12. Fung HF, Martinez L, Alarid-Escudero F, et al. The household secondary attack rate of severe  
314 acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2): a rapid review. Clinical Infectious  
315 Diseases **2021**; 73(Supplement\_2): S138-S45.
- 316 13. Begg CB, Mazumdar M. Operating characteristics of a rank correlation test for publication bias.  
317 Biometrics **1994**: 1088-101.
- 318 14. Viechtbauer W. Conducting meta-analyses in R with the metafor package. Journal of statistical  
319 software **2010**; 36(3): 1-48.
- 320 15. R Core Team. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. Available at:  
321 <http://r.meteo.uni.wroc.pl/web/packages/dplR/vignettes/intro-dplR.pdf>.
- 322 16. Afonso ET, Marques SM, Costa LD, et al. Secondary household transmission of SARS-CoV-2  
323 among children and adolescents: Clinical and epidemiological aspects. Pediatric Pulmonology  
324 **2021**.
- 325 17. Bistaraki A, Roussos S, Tsiodras S, Sypsa V. Age-dependent effects on infectivity and  
326 susceptibility to SARS-CoV-2 infection: results from nationwide contact tracing data in Greece.  
327 Infectious Diseases **2021**: 1-10.
- 328 18. Burke RM, Calderwood L, Killerby ME, et al. Patterns of Virus Exposure and Presumed  
329 Household Transmission among Persons with Coronavirus Disease, United States, January–April  
330 2020. Emerging Infectious Diseases **2021**; 27(9): 2323.

- 331 19. Calvani M, Cantiello G, Cavani M, et al. Reasons for SARS-CoV-2 infection in children and their  
332 role in the transmission of infection according to age: a case-control study. *Ital J Pediatr* **2021**;  
333 47(1): 193.
- 334 20. Cheng VC-C, Siu GK-H, Wong S-C, et al. Complementation of contact tracing by mass testing  
335 for successful containment of beta COVID-19 variant (SARS-CoV-2 VOC B. 1.351) epidemic in  
336 Hong Kong. *The Lancet Regional Health-Western Pacific* **2021**; 17: 100281.
- 337 21. Chu VT, Yousaf AR, Chang K, et al. Household transmission of SARS-CoV-2 from children and  
338 adolescents. *New England Journal of Medicine* **2021**; 385(10): 954-6.
- 339 22. Clifford S, Waight P, Hackman J, et al. Effectiveness of BNT162b2 and ChAdOx1 against  
340 SARS-CoV-2 household transmission: a prospective cohort study in England. *medRxiv* **2021**;  
341 2021.11.24.21266401.
- 342 23. Cohen C, Kleynhans J, von Gottberg A, et al. SARS-CoV-2 incidence, transmission and  
343 reinfection in a rural and an urban setting: results of the PHIRST-C cohort study, South Africa,  
344 2020-2021. *medRxiv* **2021**: 2021.07.20.21260855.
- 345 24. de Gier B, Andeweg S, Joosten R, et al. Vaccine effectiveness against SARS-CoV-2 transmission  
346 and infections among household and other close contacts of confirmed cases, the Netherlands,  
347 February to May 2021. *Eurosurveillance* **2021**; 26(31): 2100640.
- 348 25. Dougherty K, Mannell M, Naqvi O, Matson D, Stone J. SARS-CoV-2 B. 1.617. 2 (Delta) variant  
349 COVID-19 outbreak associated with a gymnastics facility—Oklahoma, April–May 2021.  
350 *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report* **2021**; 70(28): 1004.
- 351 26. Gazit S, Mizrahi B, Kalkstein N, et al. BNT162b2 mRNA Vaccine Effectiveness Given  
352 Confirmed Exposure: Analysis of Household Members of COVID-19 Patients. *Clinical Infectious*  
353 *Diseases* **2021**.
- 354 27. Ge Y, Martinez L, Sun S, et al. COVID-19 transmission dynamics among close contacts of index  
355 patients with COVID-19: a population-based cohort study in Zhejiang province, China. *JAMA*  
356 *Internal Medicine* **2021**; 181(10): 1343-50.
- 357 28. Gorgels K, Alphen L, Hackert BvdVV, et al. Increased Transmissibility of SARS-CoV-2 Alpha  
358 Variant (B.1.1.7) in Children: Three Large Primary School Outbreaks Revealed by Whole  
359 Genome Sequencing in the Netherlands. *Research Square* **2021**.
- 360 29. Hwang H, Lim J-S, Song S-A, et al. Transmission dynamics of the Delta variant of SARS-CoV-2  
361 infections in South Korea. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases* **2021**.
- 362 30. Jagdale GR, Parande MA, Borle P, et al. Secondary Attack Rate among the Contacts of COVID-  
363 19 Patients at the Beginning of the Pandemic in Pune City of Western Maharashtra, India. *Journal*  
364 *of Communicable Diseases (E-ISSN: 2581-351X & P-ISSN: 0019-5138)* **2021**; 53(3): 51-9.
- 365 31. Julin CH, Robertson AH, Hungnes O, et al. Household Transmission of SARS-CoV-2: A  
366 Prospective Longitudinal Study Showing Higher Viral Load and Increased Transmissibility of the  
367 Alpha Variant Compared to Previous Strains. *Microorganisms* **2021**; 9(11): 2371.
- 368 32. Kang M, Xin H, Yuan J, et al. Transmission dynamics and epidemiological characteristics of  
369 Delta variant infections in China. *Medrxiv* **2021**.
- 370 33. Karumanagoundar K, Raju M, Ponnaiah M, et al. Secondary attack rate of COVID-19 among  
371 contacts and risk factors, Tamil Nadu, March–May 2020: a retrospective cohort study. *BMJ open*  
372 **2021**; 11(11): e051491.
- 373 34. Layan M, Gilboa M, Gonen T, et al. Impact of BNT162b2 vaccination and isolation on SARS-  
374 CoV-2 transmission in Israeli households: an observational study. *MedRxiv* **2021**.
- 375 35. Li Y, Liu J, Yang Z, et al. Transmission of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 to  
376 Close Contacts, China, January–February 2020. *Emerging Infectious Diseases* **2021**; 27(9): 2288.
- 377 36. Liu PY, Gagnani CM, Timmerman J, et al. Pediatric Household Transmission of Severe Acute  
378 Respiratory Coronavirus-2 Infection—Los Angeles County, December 2020 to February 2021.  
379 *The Pediatric Infectious Disease Journal* **2021**; 40(10): e379.
- 380 37. Martinez DA, Klein EY, Parent C, et al. Latino Household Transmission of Severe Acute  
381 Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2. *Clinical Infectious Diseases* **2021**.

- 382 38. Martínez-Baz I, Trobajo-Sanmartín C, Miqueleiz A, et al. Product-specific COVID-19 vaccine  
383 effectiveness against secondary infection in close contacts, Navarre, Spain, April to August 2021.  
384 *Eurosurveillance* **2021**; 26(39): 2100894.
- 385 39. Meyer ED, Sandfort M, Bender J, et al. Two doses of the mRNA BNT162b2 vaccine reduce  
386 severe outcomes, viral load and secondary attack rate: evidence from a SARS-CoV-2 Alpha  
387 outbreak in a nursing home in Germany, January-March 2021. *medRxiv* **2021**:  
388 2021.09.13.21262519.
- 389 40. Miller E, Waight PA, Andrews NJ, et al. Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in the household setting:  
390 A prospective cohort study in children and adults in England. *Journal of Infection* **2021**; 83(4):  
391 483-9.
- 392 41. Ministry of Health NZ. COVID-19 Variants Update. Available at:  
393 [https://www.health.govt.nz/system/files/documents/pages/22-november-2021-variants-update-](https://www.health.govt.nz/system/files/documents/pages/22-november-2021-variants-update-summary.pdf)  
394 [summary.pdf](https://www.health.govt.nz/system/files/documents/pages/22-november-2021-variants-update-summary.pdf).
- 395 42. Musa S, Kissling E, Valenciano M, et al. Household transmission of SARS-CoV-2: a prospective  
396 observational study in Bosnia and Herzegovina, August–December 2020. *International Journal of*  
397 *Infectious Diseases* **2021**; 112: 352-61.
- 398 43. Ng OT, Koh V, Chiew CJ, et al. Impact of Delta Variant and Vaccination on SARS-CoV-2  
399 Secondary Attack Rate Among Household Close Contacts. *The Lancet Regional Health-Western*  
400 *Pacific* **2021**; 17: 100299.
- 401 44. Ng DCE, Tan KK, Chin L, et al. Risk factors associated with household transmission of  
402 SARS-CoV-2 in Negeri Sembilan, Malaysia. *Journal of paediatrics and child health* **2021**.
- 403 45. Ogata T, Irie F, Ogawa E, et al. Secondary Attack Rate among Non-Spousal Household Contacts  
404 of Coronavirus Disease 2019 in Tsuchiura, Japan, August 2020–February 2021. *International*  
405 *Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* **2021**; 18(17): 8921.
- 406 46. Rajmohan P, Jose P, Thodi JBA, et al. Dynamics of transmission of COVID-19 cases and  
407 household contacts: A prospective cohort study. *Journal of Acute Disease* **2021**; 10(4): 162.
- 408 47. Ratovoson R, Razafimahatratra R, Randriamanantsoa L, et al. Household transmission of  
409 COVID-19 among the earliest cases in Antananarivo, Madagascar. *Influenza Other Respir*  
410 *Viruses* **2021**.
- 411 48. Singanayagam A, Hakki S, Dunning J, et al. Community transmission and viral load kinetics of  
412 the SARS-CoV-2 delta (B. 1.617. 2) variant in vaccinated and unvaccinated individuals in the  
413 UK: a prospective, longitudinal, cohort study. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases* **2021**.
- 414 49. Soriano-Arandes A, Gatell A, Serrano P, et al. Household Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome  
415 Coronavirus 2 Transmission and Children: A Network Prospective Study. *Clin Infect Dis* **2021**;  
416 73(6): e1261-e9.
- 417 50. Tanaka H, Hirayama A, Nagai H, et al. Increased transmissibility of the SARS-CoV-2 alpha  
418 variant in a Japanese population. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public*  
419 *Health* **2021**; 18(15): 7752.
- 420 51. ur Rehman S, Qaisrani M, Abbasi S, et al. COVID-19 outbreak in Islamabad resulting from a  
421 travel-associated primary case: A case series. *Global Biosecurity* **2021**; 3(1).
- 422 52. Watanapokasin N, Siripongboonsitti T, Ungtrakul T, et al. Transmissibility of SARS-CoV-2  
423 variants as a secondary attack in Thai households: a retrospective study. *IJID Regions* **2021**; 1: 1-  
424 2.
- 425 53. Cerami C, Popkin-Hall ZR, Rapp T, et al. Household transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in the United  
426 States: living density, viral load, and disproportionate impact on communities of color. *Clin Infect*  
427 *Dis* **2021**.
- 428 54. Harris RJ, Hall JA, Zaidi A, Andrews NJ, Dunbar JK, Dabrera G. Effect of Vaccination on  
429 Household Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in England. *New England Journal of Medicine* **2021**.
- 430 55. Lyngse FP, Mølbak K, Skov RL, et al. Increased transmissibility of SARS-CoV-2 lineage B.1.1.7  
431 by age and viral load. *Nature Communications* **2021**; 12(1): 7251.

- 432 56. Sachdev DD, Chew Ng R, Sankaran M, et al. Contact tracing outcomes among household  
433 contacts of fully vaccinated COVID-19 patients - San Francisco, California, January 29-July 2,  
434 2021. *Clin Infect Dis* **2021**.
- 435 57. Dub T, Nohynek H, Hagberg L, et al. High secondary attack rate and persistence of SARS-CoV-2  
436 antibodies in household transmission study participants, Finland 2020. **2021**.
- 437 58. Montecucco A, Dini G, Rahmani A, et al. Investigating SARS-CoV-2 transmission among co-  
438 workers in a University of Northern Italy during COVID-19 pandemic: an observational study. *La*  
439 *Medicina del Lavoro | Work, Environment and Health* **2021**; 112(6): 429-35.
- 440 59. Remón-Berrade M, Guillen-Aguinaga S, Sarrate-Adot I, et al. Risk of Secondary Household  
441 Transmission of COVID-19 from Health Care Workers in a Hospital in Spain. *Epidemiologia*  
442 **2022**; 3(1): 1-10.
- 443 60. Loss J, Wurm J, Varnaccia G, et al. Transmission of SARS-CoV-2 among children and staff in  
444 German daycare centers: results from the COALA study. *medRxiv* **2021**: 2021.12.21.21268157.
- 445 61. Lyngse FP, Mortensen LH, Denwood MJ, et al. SARS-CoV-2 Omicron VOC Transmission in  
446 Danish Households. *medRxiv* **2021**: 2021.12.27.21268278.
- 447 62. de Gier B, Andeweg S, Backer JA, et al. Vaccine effectiveness against SARS-CoV-2  
448 transmission to household contacts during dominance of Delta variant (B.1.617.2), August-  
449 September 2021, the Netherlands. *medRxiv* **2021**: 2021.10.14.21264959.
- 450 63. Yi S, Kim JM, Choe YJ, et al. SARS-CoV-2 Delta Variant Breakthrough Infection and Onward  
451 Secondary Transmission in Household. *J Korean Med Sci* **2022**; 37(1): 0.
- 452 64. Tanaka ML, Marentes Ruiz CJ, Malhotra S, et al. SARS-CoV-2 Transmission Dynamics in  
453 Households With Children, Los Angeles, California. *Frontiers in Pediatrics* **2022**; 9(1520).
- 454 65. Loenenbach A, Markus I, Lehfeld A-S, et al. SARS-CoV-2 variant B. 1.1. 7 susceptibility and  
455 infectiousness of children and adults deduced from investigations of childcare centre outbreaks,  
456 Germany, 2021. *Eurosurveillance* **2021**; 26(21): 2100433.
- 457 66. Eyre DW, Taylor D, Purver M, et al. The impact of SARS-CoV-2 vaccination on Alpha &  
458 Delta variant transmission. *medRxiv* **2021**: 2021.09.28.21264260.
- 459 67. Prunas O, Warren JL, Crawford FW, et al. Vaccination with BNT162b2 reduces transmission of  
460 SARS-CoV-2 to household contacts in Israel. *medRxiv* **2021**: 2021.07.13.21260393.
- 461 68. Richterman A, Meyerowitz EA, Cevik M. Indirect Protection by Reducing Transmission: Ending  
462 the Pandemic with SARS-CoV-2 Vaccination. *Open Forum Infectious Diseases* **2021**: ofab259.
- 463 69. Shah AS, Gribben C, Bishop J, et al. Effect of vaccination on transmission of SARS-CoV-2. *New*  
464 *England Journal of Medicine* **2021**; 385(18): 1718-20.
- 465 70. Björk J, Inghammar M, Moghaddassi M, Rasmussen M, Malmqvist U, Kahn F. High level of  
466 protection against COVID-19 after two doses of BNT162b2 vaccine in the working age  
467 population—first results from a cohort study in Southern Sweden. *Infectious Diseases* **2021**: 1-6.
- 468 71. Braeye T, Cornelissen L, Catteau L, et al. Vaccine effectiveness against infection and onwards  
469 transmission of COVID-19: Analysis of Belgian contact tracing data, January-June 2021. *Vaccine*  
470 **2021**; 39(39): 5456-60.
- 471 72. Fiolet T, Kherabi Y, MacDonald C-J, Ghosn J, Peiffer-Smadja N. Comparing COVID-19  
472 vaccines for their characteristics, efficacy and effectiveness against SARS-CoV-2 and variants of  
473 concern: A narrative review. *Clinical Microbiology and Infection* **2021**.
- 474 73. Seppälä E, Veneti L, Starrfelt J, et al. Vaccine effectiveness against infection with the Delta (B.  
475 1.617. 2) variant, Norway, April to August 2021. *Eurosurveillance* **2021**; 26(35): 2100793.
- 476 74. Madewell ZJ, Dean NE, Berlin JA, et al. Challenges of evaluating and modelling vaccination in  
477 emerging infectious diseases. *Epidemics* **2021**; 37: 100506.
- 478 75. Public Health England. SARS-CoV-2 variants of concern and variants under investigation in  
479 England: Technical briefing 23. Available at:  
480 [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1018547/Technical_Briefing_23_21_09_16.pdf)  
481 [1018547/Technical Briefing 23 21 09 16.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1018547/Technical_Briefing_23_21_09_16.pdf).



- 482 76. Allen H, Vusirikala A, Flannagan J, et al. Household transmission of COVID-19 cases associated  
483 with SARS-CoV-2 delta variant (B.1.617.2): national case-control study. *Lancet Reg Health Eur*  
484 **2021**: 100252.
- 485 77. Kumar V, Singh J, Hasnain SE, Sundar D. Possible link between higher transmissibility of alpha,  
486 kappa and delta variants of SARS-CoV-2 and increased structural stability of its spike protein and  
487 hACE2 affinity. *International journal of molecular sciences* **2021**; 22(17): 9131.
- 488 78. Earnest R, Uddin R, Matluk N, et al. Comparative transmissibility of SARS-CoV-2 variants Delta  
489 and Alpha in New England, USA. *medRxiv* **2021**: 2021.10.06.21264641.
- 490 79. Mlcochova P, Kemp SA, Dhar MS, et al. SARS-CoV-2 B. 1.617. 2 Delta variant replication and  
491 immune evasion. *Nature* **2021**: 1-6.
- 492 80. Zhang J, Xiao T, Cai Y, et al. Membrane fusion and immune evasion by the spike protein of  
493 SARS-CoV-2 Delta variant. *Science* **2021**: eabl9463.
- 494 81. Meyerowitz E, Richterman A. SARS-CoV-2 Transmission and Prevention in the Era of the Delta  
495 Variant. Available at SSRN 3964247 **2021**.
- 496 82. Public Health England. SARS-CoV-2 variants of concern and variants under investigation in  
497 England: Technical briefing 31.

498

499 **Figure Legends**

500

501 **Figure 1. Household secondary attack rates over time (by study midpoint), 126 studies**  
502 **(unvaccinated index cases, unvaccinated contacts).** Restricted to laboratory-confirmed results only.  
503 The blue line is a loess smoothing line and bands are 95% confidence intervals. Bicolored points  
504 represent studies with 2 predominant variants.

505 **Figure 2. Household secondary attack rates for Alpha (B.1.1.7), Delta (B.1.617.2), and Beta**  
506 **(B.1.351) variants.**

507 **Figure 3. Household secondary attack rates by index case vaccination status.** All contacts are  
508 included regardless of vaccination status. \*For Harris *et al.*, most of the vaccinated index cases (93%) had  
509 received only the first dose of vaccine and secondary attack rates were not disaggregated by dose.

510 **Figure 4. Household secondary attack rates by contact vaccination status.** All index cases are  
511 included regardless of vaccination status.

<b>Table 1.</b> Estimated vaccine effectiveness (95%CI) estimates from household secondary attack rates.		
Vaccine effectiveness	Full Vaccination	Partial Vaccination
$VE_{I,p}$	56.6% (28.7%-73.6%)	27.5% (-6.4%-50.7%)
$VE_{S,p}$	70.3% (59.3%-78.4%)	43.9% (21.8%-59.7%)
$VE_{T,p}$	86.8% (76.7%-92.5%)	59.9% (34.4%-75.5%)
$VE_{I,p}$ : vaccine effectiveness for infectiousness based on the transmission probability $p$ ; $VE_{S,p}$ : vaccine effectiveness for susceptibility; $VE_{T,p}$ : total vaccine effectiveness		







