Risks and Benefits of Kidney Transplantation during the COVID-19 Pandemic: Transplant or Not Transplant?

Maria Ajaimy, Luz Liriano-Ward, Jay A. Graham, and Enver Akalin

Abstract

COVID-19 has significantly affected the transplant community, by leading to decreased transplant activity and increased waiting list time. As expected, COVID-19 causes substantial mortality in both ESKD and kidney transplant populations. This is due to underlying CKD and a high prevalence of comorbid conditions, such as diabetes mellitus, hypertension, and cardiovascular disease in this group. Transplant programs have faced the difficult decision of weighing the risks and benefits of transplantation during the pandemic. On one hand, there is a risk of COVID-19 exposure leading to infection while patients are on maximum immunosuppression. Alternatively, there are risks of delaying transplantation, which will increase waitlist times and may lead to waitlist-associated morbidity and mortality. Cautious and thoughtful selection of both the recipient's and donor's post-transplant management has been required during the pandemic, to mitigate the risk of morbidity and mortality associated with COVID-19. In this review article, we aimed to discuss previous publications related to clinical outcomes of COVID-19 disease in kidney transplant recipients, patients with ESKD on dialysis, or on the transplant waiting list, and the precautions transplant centers should take in decision making for recipient and donor selection and immunosuppressive management during the pandemic. Nevertheless, transplantation in this milieu does seem to be the correct decision, with careful patient and donor selection and safeguard protocols for infection prevention. Each center should conduct risk assessment on the basis of the patient's age and medical comorbidities, waitlist time, degree of sensitization, cold ischemia time, status of vaccination, and severity of pandemic in their region.

KIDNEY360 2: 1179-1187, 2021. doi: https://doi.org/10.34067/KID.0002532021

Introduction

Kidney transplantation during the emergence of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) causing the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic was wrought with significant challenges worldwide. Although this crisis resulted in an unbelievable loss of life in the general community, transplant recipients were particularly susceptible (1). Transplantation is a resource-intensive endeavor, and it rapidly became clear that continuation in the face of this pandemic was fraught with unknowns because it pertained to the ability to provide unmitigated clinical care. A survey of 204 centers from 16 countries in May and June 2020 documented that 75% of responding centers held living kidney transplantation (from 67% of North American centers to 91% of European centers) (2). There was a 51% drop in transplant activity in the United States and 91% in France, which was largely driven by reductions in kidney transplantation (3). The significant decrease in kidney transplant activity during the first peak of the pandemic was due to multiple factors, including scarce hospital resources, limited testing capacity, unclear test result sensitivity, and reported poor outcomes in kidney transplant recipients with COVID-19.

Expectedly, COVID-19 causes substantial mortality in both dialysis and kidney transplant populations, due to their underlying CKD and a high prevalence of comorbid conditions such as diabetes mellitus, hypertension, and cardiovascular disease. Transplant programs have faced the difficult decision of weighing the risks and benefits of transplantation during the pandemic. Potent induction agents and higher immunosuppressive doses used early in the post-transplantation period may put patients at risk for developing COVID-19 infection. Contrastingly, the risks of delaying transplantation and increasing wait time and waitlistassociated morbidity and mortality are not without consideration. Therefore, careful and thorough selection of the recipients, donors and posttransplant management is required during the pandemic, so as not to increase the risk of morbidity and mortality associated with COVID-19. In this review article, we aimed to discuss previous publications related to clinical outcomes of COVID-19 disease in kidney transplant recipients, patients with ESKD on dialysis, or on the waiting list for transplantation. We will also examine the predictors of poor outcomes in those patients. Lastly, we aimed to discuss what precautions transplant centers should take in decision making for recipient and donor selection and immunosuppressive management during the pandemic.

Division of Nephrology, Montefiore Einstein Center for Transplantation, Bronx, New York

Correspondence: Enver Akalin, Montefiore Einstein Center for Transplantation, Montefiore Medical Center, The University Hospital for Albert Einstein College of Medicine, 111 East 210th Street, Bronx, NY 10467. Email: eakalin@montefiore.org

Predictors of Mortality in Kidney Transplant Recipients with COVID-19

A summary of 10 previous publications reporting mortality rates in kidney transplant recipients with COVID-19 infection are described in Table 1 (4-13). We included only publications reporting more than 100 patients because risk estimates with small sample sizes are known to suffer from inaccuracy due to random variation. Mortality rates varied between 17.9% and 32% (mean 22%) in those 2880 patients. However, most of those patients were hospitalized and thus represent patients who are more severely ill, and may not be generalizable to the broader kidney transplant recipient population. One of the initial largest single center studies from the United States was from our center, Montefiore Medical Center in New York (4,14,15). Overall mortality was 21% in 229 kidney transplant recipients and it was higher (38%) in patients who required hospitalization. However, 42% of our patients were diagnosed by SARS-CoV-2 IgG antibodies alone without significant clinical symptoms. Kates et al. analyzed the outcomes of 318 kidney transplant recipients from >50 transplant centers and reported that 78% of the cohort was hospitalized for COVID-19 (13). Among those hospitalized, 21% had died by 28 days after diagnosis. Similar in Europe, the European Renal Association COVID-19 Database collaboration demonstrated a hospitalization rate of 89% and mortality rate of 21% (9).

Kidney transplant recipients from the French Registry of Solid Organ Transplant were compared with a single-center cohort of patients who were nontransplant. The 30-day mortality was significantly higher in transplant recipients (18% vs 11%, respectively, P=0.04) (5). In a multivariate analysis for predictors of mortality in 10,926 COVID-19-related deaths in England, solid organ transplantation has the highest hazard ratio of 3.53 (95% CI, 2.77 to 4.49), and it was 2.52 (95% CI, 2.33 to 2.72) in those with GFR <30 mL/min (16).

Factors associated with higher mortality in kidney transplant recipients are summarized in Table 1. The most common risk factor, reported in almost all of the studies, was older age. Poor outcomes in the elderly were also reported in the general population. From March 1 to June 6, 2020, although the overall mortality was 1% in 205,639 New York City residents with COVID-19, it was 5% for those aged 65-74 years and 14% for those aged \geq 75 years (17). The elderly, in general, are usually vulnerable to infection, mainly explained by immunosenescence. This combination of decreased production of naive T and B cells and dysfunction of innate immune cells, coupled with chronic immunosuppressive treatment, may worsen outcomes in elderly transplant recipients if they acquire COVID-19. The presence of chronic heart and lung disease, and obesity were also associated with mortality.

Predictors of Mortality in Patients with ESKD with COVID-19

According to the 2018 United States Renal Data System report, 88% of patients with ESKD receive in-center hemodialysis treatment. Undergoing this life-sustaining treatment in an enclosed facility together with other patients limits the ability of these patients to self-isolate, which in turn places them at a higher risk of contracting COVID-19. Compared with the general population, patients with ESKD are not only more susceptible to infection, but also have a higher risk of having moderate to severe disease requiring hospitalization, thereby leading to increased mortality. We have summarized previous studies reporting mortality rate and its predictors reporting in more than 100 patients with ESKD (Table 2) (9,12,15,18–29). The mortality rate was high between 20% and 32% (mean 25%) in a total of 8370 patients. Hospitalization rates ranged from 57% to 100% and intensive care unit admission rates were around 10%. The European Renal Association-European Dialysis and Transplant Association registry from seven countries involving 3285 patients receiving dialysis and 1013 kidney transplant recipients showed the mortality risk was 1.28 (1.02-1.60) times higher in transplant recipients compared with matched patients on dialysis (8). COVID-19 mortality was 44% in kidney transplant recipients >75 years of age compared with 31% in patients on dialysis. As presented in Table 2, many risk factors have been associated with increased COVID-19-related mortality in patients with ESKD, with older age being the most common. Other predictors of mortality included medical comorbidities,

Table 1. Mortality and predictors of mortality in kidney transplant recipients with coronavirus disease 2019						
Study	Total Number of Patients	Overall Mortality, %	Predictors of Mortality			
Ravanan <i>et al.</i> (11)	489	26	n/a			
Marinaki <i>et al.</i> (10)	420	22	n/a			
Kates et al. (13)	318	18	Older age, congestive heart failure, obesity, chronic lung disease, pneumonia on imaging, and lymphopenia (<0.5 thousand/ml)			
Caillard <i>et al.</i> (6)	306	18	Age >60 years, cardiovascular disease, dyspnea, fever, and creatinine level >115 μ mol/L			
Hilbrands <i>et al.</i> (9)	305	21	Older age			
Sánchez-Álvarez et al. (12)	286	19	Older age, pneumonia on imaging			
Caillard et al. (5)	279	23	Age >60 years, cardiovascular disease, dyspnea			
Azzi et al. (4)	229	21	Older age, deceased donor transplant recipients, lack of receipt of influenza vaccination previous year			
Cravedi et al. (7)	144	32	Older age, respiratory rate >20 per min, low eGFR, and elevated serum IL-6 levels			
Favá <i>et al.</i> (8)	104	27	Older age, acute respiratory distress syndrome, elevated lactic dehydrogenase levels on admission			

Table 1. Mortanty and predictors of mortanty in Muncy dansplant recipients with coronavirus disease 20	Table 1.	Mortality and	I predictors of mortality	y in kidney t	transplant reci	pients with	coronavirus	disease	201
--	----------	---------------	---------------------------	---------------	-----------------	-------------	-------------	---------	-----

Study	Total Number of Patients	Overall Mortality, %	Predictors of Mortality
Jager et al. (20)	3285	21	Older age, male sex
Quintaliani et al. (25)	1368	33	n/a
Hilbrands <i>et al.</i> (9)	768	25	Frailty score, older age, obesity, dyspnea, high body temperature, high heart rate and elevated liver enzymes at presentation
Sánchez-Álvarez et al. (12)	582	25	Age, pneumonia on imaging
Ng et al. (24)	419	32	Older age, mechanical ventilation, vasoactive medication use, lymphopenia, elevated blood urea nitrogen and ferritin
Sosa <i>et al</i> . (27)	325	28	n/a
Weiss et al. (28)	306	28	Age over 65 years, longer dialysis vintage
Corbett et al. (18)	300	20	Older age, inactive on kidney transplant waitlist
De Meester et al. (19)	234	30	Male sex, diabetic nephropathy as cause of kidney disease and diabetes mellitus
Xiong et al. (29)	154	31	Older age, elevated D-dimer
Sim <i>et al.</i> (26)	133	23	Older age, ischemic heart disease, heart failure, diabetes mellitus
Manganaro et al. (23)	130	25	Male sex, cardiovascular disease
Lano <i>et al</i> . (22)	129	28	Need for oxygen therapy at presentation, lymphopenia
Keller et al. (21)	123	24	Fever, C-reactive protein on admission
Fisher et al. (15)	114	28	Elevated respiratory rate and lower oxygen saturation on admission, initial elevated procalcitonin, ferritin, lactic dehydrogenase levels and lower lymphocytes count

Table 2. Mortality and predictors of mortality in patients with ESKD and coronavirus disease 2019

such as diabetes and heart disease, and longer dialysis vintage.

Comparing Patients who Are Waitlisted to Transplant Recipients with COVID-19

Outcomes for patients on the transplant waiting list with COVID-19 infection have not been as widely reported. Studying this patient population is particularly important as the waiting list frequently excludes patients with ESKD with significant frailty or severe comorbid conditions. As a result, one would expect this patient population to have better outcomes as compared with all patients on dialysis. Such studies are of interest because they would help make better informed decisions regarding whether to proceed with transplantation during the pandemic versus having the patient accrue time on the waiting list. We summarized the studies comparing patients who had received a transplant to patients who were waitlisted and had COVID-19 in Table 3 (9,11,30-35). The incidence of COVID-19 infection was much lower in the transplant recipients than in patients who were waitlisted, but this could be secondary to testing bias as waitlisted patients could be tested more often. Another explanation is the increased exposure of waitlisted patients to virus while receiving in-center hemodialysis. Most studies, which were conducted in Europe, identified a much higher COVID-19-related mortality in transplant recipients versus waitlisted patients, ranging from 20% to 37% versus 5% to 16%, respectively (9,11,31-35). The largest series came from France for the period March 1, through June 1, 2020 that identified 275 deaths among the 42,812 kidney transplant recipients and 144 deaths among the 16,210 candidates (35). This represents an excess of deaths for both populations, compared with the same period the previous 2 years, which accounted for 44% and 42% of the deaths in recipients and candidates, respectively. Although the excess risk of death due to COVID-19 was similar for recipients and candidates in high viral risk areas, it was four-fold higher for candidates in the low viral risk areas. The authors concluded that transplantation should be suspended in high viral risk areas but maintained outside those areas, both to reduce the excess of deaths of candidates and avoid wasting precious resources. The cumulative incidence rate of COVID-19 among solid organ waitlist candidates in the

Table 3. Coronavirus disease 2019 incidence and mortality in patients on the waiting list versus transplant recipients								
Study	Total Number of waitlisted Patients who Are Coronavirus Disease 2019+	Incidence of Coronavirus Disease 2019 in Waitlisted Patients, %	Overall Mortality in Waitlisted Patients, %	Total Number of Coronavirus Disease 2019+ Transplant Recipients	Incidence of Coronavirus Disease 2019 in Transplant Recipients, %	Overall Mortality in Transplant Recipients, %		
Thaunat et al. (35)	478	3	13	606	1	20		
Ravanan <i>et al</i> . (11)	197	4	10	470	1	26		
Hilbrands et al. (9)	148	n/a	5	23	n/a	30		
Craig-Schapiro et al. (32)	56	n/a	34	80	n/a	16		
Clarke et al. (31)	53	18	11	16	7	38		
Mamode et al. (33)	52	4	27	121	n/a	30		
Mohamed et al. (34)	32	10	16	28	2	32		

United Kingdom was 4% through May 20, 2020, with an allcause mortality rate of 10% among those who developed COVID-19 (11). In another center in the United Kingdom, patients who were waitlisted had a lower mortality rate (11%) compared with transplant patients (37%) with a hazard ratio (HR) of 3.36 (95% confidence interval [95% CI], 1.19 to 9.50) (31). In contrast, a study in London by Mamode et al. did not identify a mortality difference between both groups (27% in waitlisted patients vs 30% in transplant recipients) (33). In contrast, Craig-Schapiro et al. in New York detected a much higher mortality in 56 waitlisted patients at 34% versus 16% in 80 renal transplant recipients (32). In the United States, kidney waiting list mortality was higher after the national emergency declaration on March 13, 2020 (adjusted HR [aHR], 1.37; 95% CI, 1.23 to 1.52). The hazard of waitlist mortality was not significantly different for liver, pancreas, lung, and heart (36). Mortality risk was highest in New York City donation service area (aHR, 2.52) and in Black patients (aHR, 1.41 [95% CI, 1.07 to 1.86]) compared with White patients.

Differences in waitlist eligibility among transplant centers may explain the different outcomes. Some centers may accept higher-risk candidates with a higher number of comorbidities, which would increase the risk of mortality in their patients who are waitlisted. More studies comparing outcomes between these two groups are needed at this time to better inform patients of their risk of proceeding with transplant versus waiting on the list during the pandemic. Massie *et al.* built a simulation model of waitlist and posttransplant mortality in the context of COVID-19, which showed that transplantation provided survival benefit in modeled scenarios, except when the patient fatality rate of COVID-19 in transplant recipients greatly exceeded that of patients who are waitlisted (37).

Donor Assessment during Pandemics

American Society of Transplant Surgery COVID-19 Strike Force Guidance was tailored to aggressively test all donors and recipients, regardless of symptomatology (38). To date there have been innumerable protocols to assess donors for coronavirus that include donor history, RT-PCR, presence of lymphopenia, and/or axial chest imaging. Given ongoing widespread community transmission, viral testing of at least one sample from the respiratory tract by RT-PCR for SARS-CoV-2 should be performed within 3 days of procurement (Table 4). A second viral test should be performed 24 hours after the initial test, and within 24-48 hours of procurement, when feasible. Chest computed tomography findings of ground glass opacities should be assessed in the context of COVID-19 disease due to 10%-20% chance of false negative RT-PCR result. Although the risk of SARS-CoV-2 transmission through deceased donor, nonpulmonary, organs is very low (39), individuals with active RT-PCR positivity for SARS-CoV-2 should not be accepted as kidney donors. For donors previously known to have had COVID-19, it is suggested the initial COVID-19 infection occurred between 21 and 90 days before donor evaluation, irrespective of repeat nucleic acid amplification technique test results, and \geq 30 days should have passed after symptom resolution.

All living donors should have viral testing of at least one sample from the respiratory tract by RT-PCR for SARS-CoV-2 within 3 days of donation. For living donors who were previously known to have had COVID-19, at least 30 days should have passed after all symptoms were resolved and should have negative chest x-ray. Living donors ideally should be vaccinated for SARS-CoV-2 before transplantation.

During the pandemic, uneasiness about surging coronavirus rates in the hemodialysis centers ushered in a desire to avoid delayed graft function (DGF) if possible. Posttransplant oliguria would relegate the patient toward an extended in-house hospital stay to avoid coronavirus exposure in a dialysis unit. As such, donor characteristics tended to favor younger ages and a lower kidney donor profile index. Moreover, consideration was given toward ensuring lower cold ischemia times to minimize DGF. This proved to be particularly challenging, because aviation disruption led to severe logistic challenges for moving organs across the country. Lastly donors after cardiac death were less favored due to their propensity for DGF.

Recipient Assessment for Transplantation during Pandemics

As discussed above, an older age has been shown to be the best predictor of mortality in multivariate analysis. For patients aged >65, especially if they have additional comorbidities such as cardiovascular disease and diabetes mellitus, transplantation was deferred at the peak of the pandemic (Table 4). Another at-risk group is comprised of highly sensitized patients with donor-specific antibodies who have an increased risk for development of acute rejection that might require augmented immunosuppressive medications, such as antithymocyte globulin and/or rituximab. Although there is scant evidence to assign coronavirus-progressive risk to antithymocyte globulin, a practice of avoidance when possible has been adopted. However, patients who are highly sensitized and have calculated panel reactive antibody >95%, receiving an offer from a donor without any donor-specific antibody, and/or mismatch could be considered for transplantation. Another important factor in decision making is the patient's time on the waiting list. Although patients at the top of the waiting list can afford to wait until the pandemic resolves, patients with an expected waiting time of >3 years on the list can be considered for transplantation if they do not have significant comorbidities. Waiting time is shorter in simultaneous kidney and pancreas transplantation, and those patients require potent induction agents so it would be advisable to defer transplant at the peak of pandemics. For simultaneous kidney and heart or liver transplantation, allocation is driven by heart and liver transplantation; the sickest patients receive the offer and transplant should not be deferred during pandemics, because survival without transplantation is limited in those patients.

Perhaps the area most rife for debate is when to transplant patients after they have been infected with, or vaccinated against, COVID-19. The American Society of Transplant Surgery Strike Force's most recent recommendation is to proceed with transplant once the patient has no evidence of active infection and has two consecutive negative PCR tests, 1 week apart, before transplantation. More importantly, the patient should wait at least 30 days after resolution of

Table 4. Clinical approach to living and deceased donor sand recipients during the coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic

Clinical Approach

Donor assessment

1. Deceased and living donor transplant activity should be assessed at each center on the basis of COVID-19 pandemic severity at their region.

2. One sample from the respiratory tract by RT-PCR for SARS-CoV-2 should be performed within 3 days of procurement. A second viral test be performed 24 hours after the initial test and within 24–48 hours of procurement when feasible.

3. For donors previously known to have had COVID-19, it is suggested the initial COVID-19 infection occurred between 21 and 90 days before donor evaluation, irrespective of repeat NAT test results, and at least 30 days passed after symptom resolution. 4. Chest computerized tomography should be negative for COVID-19 suspicious pneumonia.

5. Consideration should be given toward ensuring lower cold ischemia times to minimize delayed graft function.

6. For living donors who were previously known to have had COVID-19, \geq 30 days should have passed after all symptoms were resolved.

7. Living donors should be vaccinated for SARS-CoV-2 before transplantation.

Recipient assessment

1. Patients aged >65years, especially if they have additional comorbidities such as cardiovascular disease and diabetes mellitus, transplantation could be deferred at the peak of pandemics.

2. Transplantation in patients who are highly sensitized with use of antithymocyte globulin and/or rituximab should be assessed patient by patient, considering the recipient's age and other comorbidities, degree of HLA-matching and mismatching, and severity of the pandemic at the region.

3. For recipients who were previously known to have had COVID-19, at least 30 days should have passed after all symptoms were resolved and should have an updated cardiac and pulmonary assessment before they are considered for transplantation. 4. Patients ideally should be vaccinated for SARS-CoV-2 before transplantation.

COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019; SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2; NAT, nucleic acid amplification technique.

COVID-19–associated symptoms before consideration for transplantation (38). These patients should have an updated cardiac and pulmonary assessment before they are considered for transplantation due to the effects of COVID-19 on heart and lung function. Patients that have received the first dose of coronavirus vaccine (Moderna and Pfizer BioNtech), and are awaiting the second dose, can be transplanted, although there is mounting evidence that these patients do not develop an appropriate response. Initial reports documented a lower antibody response (6%–17%) to vaccination after first dose of mRNA vaccination (40–42), which is in contrast with the robust early immunogenicity observed in the general population after mRNA vaccination (43–45). However, the antibody response rate was higher in a small group of patients with ESKD (41).

Patients ideally should be vaccinated for SARS-CoV-2 before transplantation. Uncertainty sometimes arises if patients are between their first and second vaccine dose, and they receive an excellent kidney transplant offer. In this scenario, we allow the patients to decide whether to pursue transplantation, but recommend forgoing the second dose of the vaccine should they accept the organ offer. Revaccination should start 3 months after transplantation. Nevertheless, transplant center should educate fresh transplant recipients to take all precautionary measures to reduce the chance of getting infected: limiting visitors, maintaining 6 feet distance from others, wearing masks, and consider home-based blood draw, if feasible.

Immunosuppression Management during the COVID-19 Pandemic

After infection detection, lowering the immunosuppressive regimen may help recover specific immunity, which may help control viral replication. Theoretically, this may lead to lesser disease severity, especially given the documented lymphopenia and low T cell counts in these recipients (14). However, during the late phases of the disease, which is mainly considered a state of immune dysfunction, withdrawal or significant reduction of immunosuppressive drugs could hypothetically exacerbate this dysfunctional immune response. Bae et al. included 69,884 recipients (64,849 transplanted in the prepandemic period and 5035 in the pandemic era) and reported a decrease in the use of lymphocytedepleting induction agents from 73% in the prepandemic era to 68% in the pandemic era (46). The use of lymphocytedepleting agents was associated with decreased acute rejection rates, but was not associated with increased mortality. Two national registries in France reported that renal transplant recipients who died from COVID-19 were more frequently within their first year of transplantation, but there was no association between antithymocyte globulin or alemtuzumab use and death (35). A single center in New York reported a safe use of antithymocyte globulin at the peak of the pandemic (47).

Given that T cell function and proliferation is the mainstay of the immune response against generalized viral infections, withdrawal or reduction of antimetabolites such as mycophenolate mofetil of azathioprine was a practical approach in mild patients not requiring hospital admission (Table 5). A review by Marinaki et al. including 63 articles with 420 patients found reduction or discontinuation of immunosuppression in 58% of patients, with antimetabolite discontinued in 91% of patients and calcineurin inhibitor in 58% (10). Calcineurin inhibitor reduction or withdrawal was most frequently done in more moderate to severe disease, particularly in patients in the intensive care unit. Steroids, in contrast, were frequently left unchanged or increased in some patients. The RECOV-ERY trial demonstrated mortality benefit in treatment with 6 mg of dexamethasone daily for patients with COVID-19

Table 5. Management of kidney transplant recipients with coronavirus disease 2019

Management Approach

Mild patients not requiring hospital admission

- 1. Continuation of current immunosuppression with calcineurin inhibitor and prednisone
- 2. Decrease in antimetabolite dose (25%-100%)
- 3. Monoclonal neutralizing antibody treatment (LY-CoV555 or REGN-COV2)
- Moderate patients requiring hospital admission
 - 1. Continuation of current immunosuppression with calcineurin inhibitor treatment with 25%-50% dose reduction
 - 2. Dexamethasone 6 mg daily for 5-10 days
 - 3. Hold antimetabolite

Severe patients requiring intensive care unit admission

- 1. Holding calcineurin inhibitor and antimetabolite
- 2. Dexamethasone 6 mg daily for 5–10 days

REGN-COV2, casirivimab and imdevimab.

requiring oxygen. The World Health Organization consequently recommended the use of systemic corticosteroids in severe and critical patients as the standard of care (48).

Neutralizing monoclonal antibody treatment has been used successfully in mild patients not requiring hospital admission. In a randomized phase 2 trial of a single intravenous infusion of neutralizing antibody LY-CoV555 decreased the COVID-19–related hospitalization or emergency room visit (2%) compared with placebo group (6%) (49). Another randomized double-blind study using a combined cocktail (casirivimab and imdevimab) decreased the medical visit from 6% to 3% (50).

IL-6 has been shown to be the driving cytokine in severe patients and high IL-6 levels were shown to be associated with mortality. Early observational cohort studies of tocilizumab, a monoclonal antibody that blocks the IL-6 receptor, found that patients receiving tocilizumab had reduced mortality compared with standard of care (51,52). However, two randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled, multicenter trials did not show any benefit with tocilizumab therapy (53,54). In patients who were hospitalized and had COVID-19 pneumonia, but were not receiving mechanical ventilation, tocilizumab reduced the likelihood of progression to the composite outcome of mechanical ventilation or death, but it did not improve survival (55). In a multicenter cohort study of 80 hospitalized kidney transplant recipients in Spain, tocilizumab treatment did not have an effect on outcome (56).

In a multicenter, randomized, placebo-controlled trial, patients receiving a 10-day course of remdesivir, an inhibitor of viral RNA polymerase, had a shorter time to recovery compared with placebo (11 vs 15 days, ratio for recovery, 1.32; 95% CI, 1.12 to 1.55), with the most significant improvement seen in patients who were not intubated receiving supplemental oxygen, but no mortality benefit was observed (57). Baricitinib, a Janus kinase inhibitor, plus remdesivir did not decrease mortality, but patients receiving high-flow oxygen or noninvasive ventilation at enrollment had a time to recovery of 10 days with combination treatment, and 18 days with control (58).

Passive antibody therapy through the use of convalescent plasma is another potential therapy for COVID-19, which may be effective through viral neutralization (59). A randomized trial from China revealed a trend toward clinical improvement with plasma therapy (52% vs 43%) but failed to meet statistical significance (P=0.26) (60). A metaanalysis of 10 studies reported that treatment with convalescent plasma compared with placebo or standard of care was not significantly associated with a decrease in all-cause mortality or with any benefit for other clinical outcomes (61). Plasma exchange has been used to remove the circulating cytokines in small case series (62,63) but also has the potential to remove antibodies to SARS-CoV-2 and could be combined with convalescent plasma.

We have reviewed the published data to answer the question of whether to "transplant or not transplant" during the pandemic. The available data do not particularly support one choice over the other. However, the higher incidence of disease observed in the waitlisted population (likely due to increased exposure during dialysis) suggests that proceeding with transplant with protocols that safeguard against infection combined with careful patient and donor selection seems most appropriate at this time. Still, each center should conduct risk assessments on the basis of the patient's age and other medical comorbidities, time on the waiting list, degree of sensitization, cold ischemia time, status of vaccination, and severity of the pandemic in their region.

Disclosures

All authors have nothing to disclose.

Funding

None.

Author Contributions

All authors wrote the original draft and reviewed and edited the manuscript.

References

- Azzi Y, Bartash R, Scalea J, Loarte-Campos P, Akalin E: COVID-19 and solid organ transplantation: A review article. *Transplantation* 105: 37–55, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1097/TP. 00000000000352333148977
- Salvalaggio PR, Ferreira GF, Caliskan Y, Vest LS, Schnitzler MA, de Sandes-Freitas TV, Moura LR, Lam NN, Maldonado RA, Loupy A, Axelrod DA, Lentine KL: An international survey on living kidney donation and transplant practices during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Transpl Infect Dis* 23: e13526, 2020 https://doi.org/ 10.1111/tid.1352633245844
- Loupy A, Aubert O, Reese PP, Bastien O, Bayer F, Jacquelinet C: Organ procurement and transplantation during the COVID-19

pandemic. Lancet 395: e95-e96, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/ S0140-6736(20)31040-032407668

- Azzi Y, Parides M, Alani O, Loarte-Campos P, Bartash R, Forest S, Colovai A, Ajaimy M, Liriano-Ward L, Pynadath C, Graham J, Le M, Greenstein S, Rocca J, Kinkhabwala M, Akalin E: COVID-19 infection in kidney transplant recipients at the epicenter of pandemics. *Kidney Int* 98: 1559–1567, 2020 https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.kint.2020.10.00433069762
- 5. Caillard S, Anglicheau D, Matignon M, Durrbach A, Greze C, Frimat L, Thaunat O, Legris T, Moal V, Westeel PF, Kamar N, Gatault P, Snanoudj R, Sicard A, Bertrand D, Colosio C, Couzi L, Chemouny JM, Masset C, Blancho G, Bamoulid J, Duveau A, Bouvier N, Chavarot N, Grimbert P, Moulin B, Le Meur Y, Hazzan M; French SOT COVID Registry: An initial report from the French SOT COVID Registry suggests high mortality due to COVID-19 in recipients of kidney transplants. *Kidney Int* 98: 1549–1558, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.kint.2020.08. 00532853631
- 6. Caillard S, Chavarot N, Francois H, Matignon M, Greze C, Kamar N, Gatault P, Thaunat O, Legris T, Frimat L, Westeel PF, Goutaudier V, Jdidou M, Snanoudj R, Colosio C, Sicard A, Bertrand D, Mousson C, Bamoulid J, Masset C, Thierry A, Couzi L, Chemouny JM, Duveau A, Moal V, Blancho G, Grimbert P, Durrbach A, Moulin B, Anglicheau D, Ruch Y, Kaeuffer C, Benotmane I, Solis M, LeMeur Y, Hazzan M, Danion F; French SOT COVID Registry: Is COVID-19 infection more severe in kidney transplant recipients? *Am J Transplant* 21: 1295–1303, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.1642433259686
- Cravedi P, Mothi SS, Azzi Y, Haverly M, Farouk SS, Pérez-Sáez MJ, Redondo-Pachón MD, Murphy B, Florman S, Cyrino LG, Grafals M, Venkataraman S, Cheng XS, Wang AX, Zaza G, Ranghino A, Furian L, Manrique J, Maggiore U, Gandolfini I, Agrawal N, Patel H, Akalin E, Riella LV: COVID-19 and kidney transplantation: Results from the TANGO International Transplant Consortium. *Am J Transplant* 20: 3140–3148, 2020 https:// doi.org/10.1111/ajt.1618532649791
- Favà A, Cucchiari D, Montero N, Toapanta N, Centellas FJ, Vila-Santandreu A, Coloma A, Meneghini M, Manonelles A, Sellarés J, Torres I, Gelpi R, Lorenzo I, Ventura-Aguiar P, Cofan F, Torregrosa JV, Perelló M, Facundo C, Seron D, Oppenheimer F, Bestard O, Cruzado JM, Moreso F, Melilli E: Clinical characteristics and risk factors for severe COVID-19 in hospitalized kidney transplant recipients: A multicentric cohort study. *Am J Transplant* 20: 3030–3041, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt. 1624632777153
- Hilbrands LB, Duivenvoorden R, Vart P, Franssen CFM, Hemmelder MH, Jager KJ, Kieneker LM, Noordzij M, Pena MJ, Vries H, Arroyo D, Covic A, Crespo M, Goffin E, Islam M, Massy ZA, Montero N, Oliveira JP, Roca Muñoz A, Sanchez JE, Sridharan S, Winzeler R, Gansevoort RT; ERACODA Collaborators: COVID-19-related mortality in kidney transplant and dialysis patients: Results of the ERACODA collaboration. *Nephrol Dial Transplant* 35: 1973–1983, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1093/ndt/ gfaa26133151337
- Marinaki S, Tsiakas S, Korogiannou M, Grigorakos K, Papalois V, Boletis I: A systematic review of Covid-19 infection in kidney transplant recipients: A universal effort to preserve patients' lives and allografts. J Clin Med 9: 2986, 2020 https://doi.org/10.3390/ jcm909298632947798
- Ravanan R, Callaghan CJ, Mumford L, Ushiro-Lumb I, Thorburn D, Casey J, Friend P, Parameshwar J, Currie I, Burnapp L, Baker R, Dudley J, Oniscu GC, Berman M, Asher J, Harvey D, Manara A, Manas D, Gardiner D, Forsythe JLR: SARS-CoV-2 infection and early mortality of waitlisted and solid organ transplant recipients in England: A national cohort study. *Am J Transplant* 20: 3008– 3018, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.1624732780493
- Sánchez-Alvarez JE, Pérez Fontán M, Jiménez Martín C, Blasco Pelícano M, Cabezas Reina CJ, Sevillano Prieto ÁM, Melilli E, Crespo Barrios M, Macía Heras M, Del Pino Y Pino MD: SARS-CoV-2 infection in patients on renal replacement therapy. Report of the COVID-19 Registry of the Spanish Society of Nephrology (SEN). Nefrologia 40: 272–278, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/j. nefro.2020.04.00232389518
- 13. Kates OS, Haydel BM, Florman SS, Rana MM, Chaudhry ZS, Ramesh MS, Safa K, Kotton CN, Blumberg EA, Besharatian BD,

Tanna SD, Ison MG, Malinis M, Azar MM, Rakita RM, Morillas JA, Majeed A, Sait AS, Spaggiari M, Hemmige V, Mehta SA, Neumann H, Badami A, Goldman JD, Lala A, Hemmersbach-Miller M, McCort ME, Bajrovic V, Ortiz-Bautista C, Friedman-Moraco R, Sehgal S, Lease ED, Fisher CE, Limaye AP; UW COVID-19 SOT Study Team: COVID-19 in solid organ transplant: A multi-center cohort study [published online ahead of print August 7, 2020]. *Clin Infect Dis* https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ ciaa109732766815

- Akalin E, Azzi Y, Bartash R, Seethamraju H, Parides M, Hemmige V, Ross M, Forest S, Goldstein YD, Ajaimy M, Liriano-Ward L, Pynadath C, Loarte-Campos P, Nandigam PB, Graham J, Le M, Rocca J, Kinkhabwala M: Covid-19 and Kidney Transplantation. *N Engl J Med* 382: 2475–2477, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJMc201111732329975
- Fisher M, Mokrzyckí M, Golestaneh L, Alahiri E, Coco M: Chronic hemodialysis patients hospitalized with COVID-19: Short-term outcomes in Bronx, New York. Kidney360 1: 755– 762, 2020
- Williamson EJ, Walker AJ, Bhaskaran K, Bacon S, Bates C, Morton CE, Curtis HJ, Mehrkar A, Evans D, Inglesby P, Cockburn J, McDonald HI, MacKenna B, Tomlinson L, Douglas IJ, Rentsch CT, Mathur R, Wong AYS, Grieve R, Harrison D, Forbes H, Schultze A, Croker R, Parry J, Hester F, Harper S, Perera R, Evans SJW, Smeeth L, Goldacre B: Factors associated with COVID-19-related death using OpenSAFELY. *Nature* 584: 430–436, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-020-2521-432640463
- 17. Yang W, Kandula S, Huynh M, Greene SK, Van Wye G, Li W, Chan HT, McGibbon E, Yeung A, Olson D, Fine A, Shaman J: Estimating the infection-fatality risk of SARS-CoV-2 in New York City during the spring 2020 pandemic wave: A model-based analysis. *Lancet Infect Dis* 21: 203–212, 2021 https://doi.org/10. 1016/S1473-3099(20)30769-633091374
- Corbett RW, Blakey S, Nitsch D, Loucaidou M, McLean A, Duncan N, Ashby DR; West London Renal and Transplant Centre: Epidemiology of COVID-19 in an urban dialysis center. *J Am Soc Nephrol* 31: 1815–1823, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1681/ASN. 202004053432561681
- De Meester J, De Bacquer D, Naesens M, Meijers B, Couttenye MM, De Vriese AS; NBVN Kidney Registry Group: Incidence, characteristics, and outcome of COVID-19 in adults on kidney replacement therapy: A regionwide registry study. J Am Soc Nephrol 32: 385–396, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1681/ASN. 202006087533154174
- 20. Jager KJ, Kramer A, Chesnaye NC, Couchoud C, Sánchez-Álvarez JE, Garneata L, Collart F, Hemmelder MH, Ambühl P, Kerschbaum J, Legeai C, Del Pino Y Pino MD, Mircescu G, Mazzoleni L, Hoekstra T, Winzeler R, Mayer G, Stel VS, Wanner C, Zoccali C, Massy ZA: Results from the ERA-EDTA Registry indicate a high mortality due to COVID-19 in dialysis patients and kidney transplant recipients across Europe. *Kidney Int* 98: 1540–1548, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.kint.2020.09. 00632979369
- Keller N, Chantrel F, Krummel T, Bazin-Kara D, Faller AL, Muller C, Nussbaumer T, Ismer M, Benmoussa A, Brahim-Bouna M, Beier S, Perrin P, Hannedouche T: Impact of first-wave coronavirus disease 2019 infection in patients on haemodialysis in Alsace: The observational COVIDIAL study. *Nephrol Dial Transplant* 35: 1338–1411, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1093/ndt/ gfaa17032871594
- 22. Lano G, Braconnier A, Bataille S, Cavaille G, Moussi-Frances J, Gondouin B, Bindi P, Nakhla M, Mansour J, Halin P, Levy B, Canivet E, Gaha K, Kazes I, Noel N, Wynckel A, Debrumetz A, Jourde-Chiche N, Moal V, Vial R, Scarfoglière V, Bobot M, Gully M, Legris T, Pelletier M, Sallee M, Burtey S, Brunet P, Robert T, Rieu P: Risk factors for severity of COVID-19 in chronic dialysis patients from a multicentre French cohort. *Clin Kidney J* 13: 878–888, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1093/ckj/sfaa19933354330
- Manganaro M, Baldovino S; Working group of the Piedmont and Aosta Valley Section of the SIN: First considerations on the SARS-CoV-2 epidemic in the dialysis units of Piedmont and Aosta Valley, Northern Italy. J Nephrol 33: 393–395, 2020 https://doi. org/10.1007/s40620-020-00732-132277423
- Ng JH, Hirsch JS, Wanchoo R, Sachdeva M, Sakhiya V, Hong S, Jhaveri KD, Fishbane S; Northwell COVID-19 Research

Consortium and the Northwell Nephrology COVID-19 Research Consortium: Outcomes of patients with end-stage kidney disease hospitalized with COVID-19. *Kidney Int* 98: 1530–1539, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.kint.2020.07.03032810523

- 25. Quintaliani G, Reboldi G, Di Napoli A, Nordio M, Limido A, Aucella F, Messa P, Brunori G; Italian Society of Nephrology COVID-19 Research Group: Exposure to novel coronavirus in patients on renal replacement therapy during the exponential phase of COVID-19 pandemic: Survey of the Italian Society of Nephrology. J Nephrol 33: 725–736, 2020 https://doi.org/10. 1007/s40620-020-00794-132621109
- 26. Sim JJ, Huang CW, Selevan DC, Chung J, Rutkowski MP, Zhou H: COVID-19 and survival in maintenance dialysis. *Kidney Med* 3: 132–135, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.xkme.2020.11. 00533251507
- 27. Sosa R, Garcia P, Cipriano EO, Hernández A, Hernández EE, Chavez PI, Manchinelli A, Morales OA, Flores LE, Romero HJ, Raquec Y, Sapón BF, Soch KE, Anand S, Sánchez-Polo V: Coronavirus disease 2019 in patients with end-stage kidney disease on hemodialysis in Guatemala. *Kidney Int Rep* 6: 1110–1117, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ekir.2021.01.02833532670
- Weiss S, Bhat P, Del Pilar Fernandez M, Bhat JG, Coritsidis GN: COVID-19 infection in ESKD: Findings from a prospective disease surveillance program at dialysis facilities in New York City and Long Island. J Am Soc Nephrol 31: 2517–2521, 2020 https:// doi.org/10.1681/ASN.202007093233077614
- 29. Xiong F, Tang H, Liu L, Tu C, Tian JB, Lei CT, Liu J, Dong JW, Chen WL, Wang XH, Luo D, Shi M, Miao XP, Zhang C: Clinical characteristics of and medical interventions for COVID-19 in hemodialysis patients in Wuhan, China. J Am Soc Nephrol 31: 1387–1397, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1681/ASN. 202003035432385130
- Benden C, Haile S, Kruegel N, Beyeler F, Aubert JD, Binet I, Golshayan D, Hadaya K, Mueller T, Parvex P, Immer F: SARS-CoV-2/COVID-19 in patients on the Swiss national transplant waiting list. Swiss Med Wkly 150: w20451, 2020 https://doi.org/ 10.4414/smw.2020.2045133382903
- Clarke C, Lucisano G, Prendecki M, Gleeson S, Martin P, Ali M, McAdoo SP, Lightstone L, Ashby D, Charif R, Griffith M, McLean A, Dor F, Willicombe M; ICHNT Renal COVID Group: Informing the risk of kidney transplantation versus remaining on the waitlist in the coronavirus disease 2019 era. *Kidney Int Rep* 6: 46–55, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ekir.2020.10.03233173838
- 32. Craig-Schapiro R, Šalinas T, Lubetzky M, Abel BT, Sultan S, Lee JR, Kapur S, Aull MJ, Dadhania DM: COVID-19 outcomes in patients waitlisted for kidney transplantation and kidney transplant recipients. *Am J Transplant* 21: 1576–1585, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.1635133043597
- 33. Mamode N, Ahmed Z, Jones G, Banga N, Motallebzadeh R, Tolley H, Marks S, Stojanovic J, Khurram MA, Thuraisingham R, Popoola J, Ghazanfar A, Game D, Sran K, Dor FJMF, Lucisano G, Sinha M, Olsburgh J, Willicombe M: Mortality rates in transplant recipients and transplantation candidates in a high-prevalence COVID-19 environment. *Transplantation* 105: 212–215, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1097/TP.0000000000353333196624
- 34. Mohamed IH, Chowdary PB, Shetty S, Sammartino C, Sivaprakasam R, Lindsey B, Thuraisingham R, Yaqoob MM, Khurram MA: Outcomes of renal transplant recipients with SARS-CoV-2 infection in the eye of the storm: A comparative study with waitlisted patients. *Transplantation* 105: 115–120, 2021 https://doi. org/10.1097/TP.00000000000340633350626
- 35. Thaunat O, Legeai C, Anglicheau D, Couzi L, Blancho G, Hazzan M, Pastural M, Savoye E, Bayer F, Morelon E, Le Meur Y, Bastien O, Caillard S; French nationwide Registry of Solid Organ Transplant Recipients with COVID-19: IMPact of the COVID-19 epidemic on the moRTAlity of kidney transplant recipients and candidates in a French Nationwide registry sTudy (IMPOR-TANT). *Kidney Int* 98: 1568–1577, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.kint.2020.10.00833137341
- 36. Miller J, Wey A, Musgrove D, Son Ahn Y, Hart A, Kasiske BL, Hirose R, Israni AK, Snyder JJ: Mortality among solid organ waitlist candidates during COVID-19 in the United States [published online ahead of print February 23, 2021]. Am J Transplant https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.1655033621421

- 37. Massie AB, Boyarsky BJ, Werbel WA, Bae S, Chow EKH, Avery RK, Durand CM, Desai N, Brennan D, Garonzik-Wang JM, Segev DL: Identifying scenarios of benefit or harm from kidney transplantation during the COVID-19 pandemic: A stochastic simulation and machine learning study. *Am J Transplant* 20: 2997– 3007, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.1611732515544
- Danziger-Isakov L, Blumberg EA, Manuel O, Sester M: Impact of COVID-19 in solid organ transplant recipients. Am J Transplant 21: 925–937, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1111/ajt.1644933319449
- Neidlinger NA, Smith JA, D'Alessandro AM, Roe D, Taber TE, Pereira MR, Friedman AL: Organ recovery from deceased donors with prior COVID-19: A case series. *Transpl Infect Dis* 23: e13503, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1111/tid.1350333174324
- Boyarsky BJ, Werbel WA, Avery RK, Tobian AAR, Massie AB, Segev DL, Garonzik-Wang JM: Immunogenicity of a single dose of SARS-CoV-2 Messenger RNA vaccine in solid organ transplant recipients. JAMA 325: 1784–1786, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1001/ jama.2021.438533720292
- 41. Yi SG, Knight RJ, Graviss EA, Nguyen DT, Ghobrial RM, Gaber AO, Huang HJ: Kidney transplant recipients rarely show an early antibody response following the first COVID-19 Vaccine Administration [published online ahead of print March 19, 2021]. *Transplantation* https://doi.org/10.1097/TP. 00000000000376433741844
- 42. Benotmane I, Gautier-Vargas G, Cognard N, Olagne J, Heibel F, Braun-Parvez L, Martzloff J, Perrin P, Moulin B, Fafi-Kremer S, Caillard S: Weak anti-SARS-CoV-2 antibody response after the first injection of an mRNA COVID-19 vaccine in kidney transplant recipients [published online ahead of print March 26, 2021]. *Kidney Int* https://doi.org/10.1016/j.kint.2021.03. 01433775674
- 43. Baden LR, El Sahly HM, Essink B, Kotloff K, Frey S, Novak R, Diemert D, Spector SA, Rouphael N, Creech CB, McGettigan J, Khetan S, Segall N, Solis J, Brosz A, Fierro C, Schwartz H, Neuzil K, Corey L, Gilbert P, Janes H, Follmann D, Marovich M, Mascola J, Polakowski L, Ledgerwood J, Graham BS, Bennett H, Pajon R, Knightly C, Leav B, Deng W, Zhou H, Han S, Ivarsson M, Miller J, Zaks T; COVE Study Group: Efficacy and safety of the mRNA-1273 SARS-CoV-2 vaccine. N Engl J Med 384: 403–416, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa203538933378609
- 44. Dagan N, Barda N, Kepten E, Miron O, Perchik S, Katz MA, Hernán MA, Lipsitch M, Reis B, Balicer RD: BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 vaccine in a nationwide mass vaccination setting. N Engl J Med 384: 1412–1423, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJM0a210176533626250
- 45. Polack FP, Thomas SJ, Kitchin N, Absalon J, Gurtman A, Lockhart S, Perez JL, Pérez Marc G, Moreira ED, Zerbini C, Bailey R, Swanson KA, Roychoudhury S, Koury K, Li P, Kalina WV, Cooper D, Frenck RW Jr, Hammitt LL, Türeci Ö, Nell H, Schaefer A, Ünal S, Tresnan DB, Mather S, Dormitzer PR, Şahin U, Jansen KU, Gruber WC; C4591001 Clinical Trial Group: Safety and efficacy of the BNT162b2 mRNA Covid-19 vaccine. *N Engl J Med* 383: 2603–2615, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJMoa203457733301246
- 46. Bae S, McAdams-DeMarco MA, Massie AB, Ahn JB, Werbel WA, Brennan DC, Lentine KL, Durand CM, Segev DL: Early changes in kidney transplant immunosuppression regimens during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Transplantation* 105: 170–176, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1097/TP.00000000000350233093404
- 47. Santeusanio AD, Zendel A, Fenig Y, Mahamid A, Bhansali A, De Boccardo G, Delaney V, Farouk SS, Dunn D, Rana M, Florman S, Shapiro R: Kidney transplantation using lymphocyte depleting induction and standard maintenance immunosuppression at the height of the SARS-CoV-2 pandemic in New York City: A singlecenter experience. *Clin Transplant* 34: e14055, 2020 https://doi. org/10.1111/ctr.1405533439508
- Normand ST: The RECOVERY Platform. N Engl J Med 25: 757– 758 2020 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMe202567432706531
- 49. Chen P, Nirula A, Heller B, Gottlieb RL, Boscia J, Morris J, Huhn G, Cardona J, Mocherla B, Stosor V, Shawa I, Adams AC, Van Naarden J, Custer KL, Shen L, Durante M, Oakley G, Schade AE, Sabo J, Patel DR, Klekotka P, Skovronsky DM; BLAZE-1 Investigators: SARS-CoV-2 neutralizing antibody LY-CoV555 in outpatients with Covid-19. *N Engl J Med* 384: 229–237, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa202984933113295

- 50. Weinreich DM, Sivapalasingam S, Norton T, Ali S, Gao H, Bhore R, Musser BJ, Soo Y, Rofail D, Im J, Perry C, Pan C, Hosain R, Mahmood A, Davis JD, Turner KC, Hooper AT, Hamilton JD, Baum A, Kyratsous CA, Kim Y, Cook A, Kampman W, Kohli A, Sachdeva Y, Graber X, Kowal B, DiCioccio T, Stahl N, Lipsich L, Braunstein N, Herman G, Yancopoulos GD; Trial Investigators: REGN-COV2, a neutralizing antibody cocktail, in outpatients with Covid-19. *N Engl J Med* 384: 238–251, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa203500233332778
- 51. Somers EC, Eschenauer GA, Troost JP, Golob JL, Gandhi TN, Wang L, Zhou N, Petty LA, Baang JH, Dillman NO, Frame D, Gregg KS, Kaul DR, Nagel J, Patel TS, Zhou S, Lauring AS, Hanauer DA, Martin E, Sharma P, Fung CM, Pogue JM: Tocilizumab for treatment of mechanically ventilated patients with COVID-19 [published online ahead of print July 11, 2020]. *Clin Infect Dis* https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciaa95432651997
- 52. Guaraldi G, Meschiari M, Cozzi-Lepri A, Milic J, Tonelli R, Menozzi M, Franceschini E, Cuomo G, Orlando G, Borghi V, Santoro A, Di Gaetano M, Puzzolante C, Carli F, Bedini A, Corradi L, Fantini R, Castaniere I, Tabbi L, Girardis M, Tedeschi S, Giannella M, Bartoletti M, Pascale R, Dolci G, Brugioni L, Pietrangelo A, Cossarizza A, Pea F, Clini E, Salvarani C, Massari M, Viale PL, Mussini C: Tocilizumab in patients with severe COVID-19: A retrospective cohort study. *Lancet Rheumatol* 2: e474– e484, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/S2665-9913(20)30173-932835257
- 53. Wang Y, Zhang D, Du G, Du R, Zhao J, Jin Y, Fu S, Gao L, Cheng Z, Lu Q, Hu Y, Luo G, Wang K, Lu Y, Li H, Wang S, Ruan S, Yang C, Mei C, Wang Y, Ding D, Wu F, Tang X, Ye X, Ye Y, Liu B, Yang J, Yin W, Wang A, Fan G, Zhou F, Liu Z, Gu X, Xu J, Shang L, Zhang Y, Cao L, Guo T, Wan Y, Qin H, Jiang Y, Jaki T, Hayden FG, Horby PW, Cao B, Wang C: Remdesivir in adults with severe COVID-19: A randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled, multicentre trial. *Lancet* 395: 1569–1578, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31022-932423584
- 54. Spinner CD, Gottlieb RL, Criner GJ, Arribas López JR, Cattelan AM, Soriano Viladomiu A, Ogbuagu O, Malhotra P, Mullane KM, Castagna A, Chai LYA, Roestenberg M, Tsang OTY, Bernasconi E, Le Turnier P, Chang SC, SenGupta D, Hyland RH, Osinusi AO, Cao H, Blair C, Wang H, Gaggar A, Brainard DM, McPhail MJ, Bhagani S, Ahn MY, Sanyal AJ, Huhn G, Marty FM; GS-US-540-5774 Investigators: Effect of remdesivir vs standard care on clinical status at 11 days in patients with moderate COVID-19: A randomized clinical trial. *JAMA* 324: 1048–1057, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.1634932821939
- 55. Salama C, Han J, Yau L, Reiss WG, Kramer B, Neidhart JD, Criner GJ, Kaplan-Lewis E, Baden R, Pandit L, Cameron ML, Garcia-Diaz J, Chávez V, Mekebeb-Reuter M, Lima de Menezes F, Shah R, González-Lara MF, Assman B, Freedman J, Mohan SV: Toci-lizumab in patients hospitalized with Covid-19 pneumonia. N Engl J Med 384: 20–30, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJMoa203034033332779
- 56. Pérez-Sáez MJ, Blasco M, Redondo-Pachón D, Ventura-Aguiar P, Bada-Bosch T, Pérez-Flores I, Melilli E, Sánchez-Cámara LA, López-Oliva MO, Canal C, Shabaka A, Garra-Moncau N, Martín-Moreno PL, López V, Hernández-Gallego R, Siverio O, Galeano C, Espí-Reig J, Cabezas CJ, Rodrigo MT, Llinàs-Mallol L,

Fernández-Reyes MJ, Cruzado-Vega L, Pérez-Tamajón L, Santana-Estupiñán R, Ruiz-Fuentes MC, Tabernero G, Zárraga S, Ruiz JC, Gutiérrez-Dalmau A, Mazuecos A, Sánchez-Álvarez E, Crespo M, Pascual J; Spanish Society of Nephrology COVID-19 Group: Use of tocilizumab in kidney transplant recipients with COVID-19. *Am J Transplant* 20: 3182–3190, 2020 https://doi. org/10.1111/ajt.1619232654422

- Beigel JH, Tomashek KM, Dodd LE: Remdesivir for the treatment of Covid-19: Preliminary report. Reply. N Engl J Med 383: 994, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa200776432649078
- 58. Kalil AC, Patterson TF, Mehta AK, Tomashek KM, Wolfe CR, Ghazaryan V, Marconi VC, Ruiz-Palacios GM, Hsieh L, Kline S, Tapson V, Iovine NM, Jain MK, Sweeney DA, El Sahly HM, Branche AR, Regalado Pineda J, Lye DC, Sandkovsky U, Luetkemeyer AF, Cohen SH, Finberg RW, Jackson PEH, Taiwo B, Paules CI, Arguinchona H, Erdmann N, Ahuja N, Frank M, Oh MD, Kim ES, Tan SY, Mularski RA, Nielsen H, Ponce PO, Taylor BS, Larson L, Rouphael NG, Saklawi Y, Cantos VD, Ko ER, Engemann JJ, Amin AN, Watanabe M, Billings J, Elie MC, Davey RT, Burgess TH, Ferreira J, Green M, Makowski M, Cardoso A, de Bono S, Bonnett T, Proschan M, Deye GA, Dempsey W, Nayak SU, Dodd LE, Beigel JH; ACTT-2 Study Group Members: Baricitinib plus remdesivir for hospitalized adults with Covid-19. N *Engl J Med* 384: 795–807, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJMoa203199433306283
- Casadevall A, Pirofski LA: The convalescent sera option for containing COVID-19. *J Clin Invest* 130: 1545–1548, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1172/JCI13800332167489
- 60. Li L, Zhang W, Hu Y, Tong X, Zheng S, Yang J, Kong Y, Ren L, Wei Q, Mei H, Hu C, Tao C, Yang R, Wang J, Yu Y, Guo Y, Wu X, Xu Z, Zeng L, Xiong N, Chen L, Wang J, Man N, Liu Y, Xu H, Deng E, Zhang X, Li C, Wang C, Su S, Zhang L, Wang J, Wu Y, Liu Z: Effect of convalescent plasma therapy on time to clinical improvement in patients with severe and life-threatening COVID-19: A randomized clinical trial. *JAMA* 324: 460–470, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.1004432492084
- 61. Janiaud P, Axfors Č, Schmitt AM, Gloy V, Ebrahimi F, Hepprich M, Smith ER, Haber NA, Khanna N, Moher D, Goodman SN, Ioannidis JPA, Hemkens LG: Association of convalescent plasma treatment with clinical outcomes in patients with COVID-19: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *JAMA* 325: 1185–1195, 2021 https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2021.274733635310
- 62. de Prost N, Bastard P, Arrestier R, Fourati S, Mahévas M, Burrel S, Dorgham K, Gorochov G, Tandjaoui-Lambiotte Y, Azzaoui I, Fernandes I, Combes A, Casanova JL, Mekontso-Dessap A, Luyt CE: Plasma exchange to rescue patients with autoantibodies against type I interferons and life-threatening COVID-19 pneumonia. J Clin Immunol 41: 536–544, 2021 https://doi.org/10. 1007/s10875-021-00994-933616813
- 63. Faqihi F, Alharthy A, Alodat M, Kutsogiannis DJ, Brindley PG, Karakitsos D: Therapeutic plasma exchange in adult critically ill patients with life-threatening SARS-CoV-2 disease: A pilot study. *J Crit Care* 60: 328–333, 2020 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrc. 2020.07.00132763058

Received: April 13, 2021 Accepted: May 12, 2021