

Mechanisms of Resistance to Quinupristin-Dalfopristin among Isolates of *Enterococcus faecium* from Animals, Raw Meat, and Hospital Patients in Western Europe

MEHNAM SOLTANI,^{1,2} DAVID BEIGHTON,² JOHN PHILPOTT-HOWARD,³ AND NEIL WOODFORD^{1*}

Antibiotic Resistance Monitoring and Reference Laboratory, Central Public Health Laboratory, London NW9 5HT,¹ The Guys, King's and St. Thomas' School of Dentistry, London SE5 9RW,² and Public Health Laboratory and Medical Microbiology Department, The Guys, King's and St. Thomas' School of Medicine, London SE5 9PJ,³ United Kingdom

Received 21 June 1999/Returned for modification 17 August 1999/Accepted 16 November 1999

Twenty-eight quinupristin-dalfopristin-resistant isolates of *Enterococcus faecium* from hospital patients and nonhuman sources in European countries were studied. High-level resistance (MICs, ≥ 32 $\mu\text{g/ml}$) was associated with the presence of *vat(E)* (*satG*) (14 isolates [50%]) or *vat(D)* (*satA*) (6 isolates [21%]). These genes were not detected in eight (29%) isolates with lower levels of quinupristin-dalfopristin resistance (MICs, 4 to 16 $\mu\text{g/ml}$). This suggests the presence of further mechanisms of resistance to quinupristin-dalfopristin in *E. faecium*.

Quinupristin-dalfopristin is a semisynthetic, injectable mixture of streptogramin A and B compounds which has recently been licensed for clinical use in the United States and in Europe for the treatment of infections caused by multiresistant gram-positive pathogens, including glycopeptide-resistant *Enterococcus faecium* (9, 17, 18). Virginiamycin, another streptogramin A and B combination, has been used as a growth promoter in animal feed for many years. It selects for virginiamycin-resistant strains of *E. faecium*, which are cross-resistant to quinupristin-dalfopristin (11, 12, 19) and which may pose a risk to public health. As a consequence, the use of virginiamycin has been banned in the European Union.

Resistance to mixtures of streptogramin A and B compounds was first reported among staphylococci (10) and requires only resistance to the A component (15), although resistance to both the A and B components may give a higher level of resistance (B. Bozdogan and R. Leclercq, Abstr. 39th Intersci. Conf. Antimicrob. Agents Chemother., abstr. 841, 1999). Several genes conferring resistance to type A streptogramins have been identified in staphylococci (1–5, 7, 8). In this paper we adopt the nomenclature proposed recently by Roberts and colleagues (16). The staphylococcal genes *vat(A)*, *vat(B)*, and *vat(C)* encode acetyltransferases (2, 4, 7); *vga(A)* and *vga(B)* encode ATP-binding proteins involved in active efflux (3, 5). Among enterococci, *Enterococcus faecalis* is naturally resistant to streptogramin A-B combinations (15), whereas most isolates of *E. faecium* are susceptible. Two acetyltransferase genes, *satA* (15) and *satG* (20), have been characterized for strains of *E. faecium* resistant to streptogramin A-B combinations. These have been renamed *vat(D)* and *vat(E)*, respectively (16). However, *vat(D)* occurs in only a minority of the resistant *E. faecium* organisms investigated in several countries in the European Union (11, 12), and the prevalence of *vat(E)* is unknown. In this study we investigated the basis of resistance to quinupristin-dalfopristin in a small, diverse group of *E. faecium* isolates.

(This work was presented at the 39th Interscience Confer-

ence on Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy, San Francisco, Calif., September 1999.)

Twenty-eight quinupristin-dalfopristin-resistant (MICs, ≥ 4 $\mu\text{g/ml}$) isolates of *E. faecium* were collected in the United Kingdom (UK) and other European countries prior to both the licensing of quinupristin-dalfopristin and the ban on virginiamycin use: 18 from animals (15 from pigs and 3 from chickens), 4 from raw meat, 2 from sewage, and 4 from UK hospital patients. Isolates from hospital patients, raw meat, and sewage were from a collection of enterococci kept at the Antibiotic Resistance Monitoring and Reference Laboratory. Animal isolates were kindly provided by Pfizer Ltd., Reigate, UK). *E. faecium* strain BM4145 [*vat(D)*] (kindly supplied by P. Courvalin, Institut Pasteur, Paris, France) and three strains of staphylococci, BM3093 [*vat(A)* *vga(A)* *vga(B)*], BM12235 [*vat(B)* *vga(B)*], and BM12392 [*vga(B)* *vat(C)*] (kindly supplied by N. El-Solh, Institut Pasteur, Paris, France), were used as positive PCR controls. A *vat(E)*-positive control strain was not available for this study. The identity of all isolates was confirmed by amplification of the *E. faecium*-specific gene encoding D-alanyl-D-alanine ligase (21).

The MICs of quinupristin-dalfopristin (Rhone Poulenc Rorer, West Malling, UK) and virginiamycin (Pfizer, Rixensart, Belgium) were determined by agar incorporation in DST agar (Oxoid, Basingstoke, UK) containing 5% lysed horse blood, with an inoculum of 10^4 CFU per spot. Etest strips (Cambridge Diagnostic Services, Cambridge, UK) were used for some quinupristin-dalfopristin MIC determinations. Isolates were screened by PCR for *vat(A)*, *vat(B)*, *vat(C)*, *vat(D)*, *vat(E)*, *vga(A)*, *vga(B)*, *vga(B)*, *vga(B)*, and *erm(B)*. The primer sequences and cycling conditions are listed in Table 1. Degenerate primers M and N (Table 1), derived from motifs conserved within streptogramin A acetyltransferases (14), were used to detect putative genes encoding acetyltransferases in quinupristin-dalfopristin-resistant isolates. Plasmid DNA was isolated from *E. faecium* isolates by alkaline lysis (22), separated by electrophoresis through 0.8% agarose gels, and transferred to nylon membranes by vacuum blotting. Hybridization was performed at high stringency using digoxigenin-labeled *vat(D)*- and *vat(E)*-specific probes, which were prepared by incorporation of digoxigenin-11-dUTP (Roche, Lewes, UK) into PCR products. *Escherichia coli* strain 39R861 (NCTC 50192), an

* Corresponding author. Mailing address: ARMRL, CPHL, 61 Colindale Ave., London NW9 5HT, United Kingdom. Phone: 44-208-200-4400. Fax: 44-208-200-7449. E-mail: nwoodford@phls.nhs.uk.

TABLE 1. Primer sequences and PCR conditions used for streptogramin resistance genes

Primer	Sequence (5'-3')	GenBank accession no. and/or gene	Position of amplicon	PCR conditions	Reference(s)
<i>vat-1</i>	TGGAGTGTGACAAGATAGGC	L07778	200-712	Same as for <i>vat</i> (D)	7, 11
<i>vat-2</i>	GTGACAACAGCTTCTGCAGC	<i>vat</i> (A)			
<i>vatB-1</i>	GGCCCTGATCCAAATAGCAT	U19459	76-634	1 cycle of 3 min at 94°C;	2, 11
<i>vatB-2</i>	GTGCTGACCAATCCCACCAT	L38809, <i>vat</i> (B)		35 cycles of 1 min at 94°C, 1 min at 60°C, and 1 min at 72°C; and 1 cycle of 10 min at 72°C	
<i>vatC-O</i>	ATGAATTCGCAAATCAGCAAGG	AF015628	1307-1886	1 cycle of 3 min at 95°C and 2 min at 60°C; 30 cycles of 20 s at 72°C, 20 s at 95°C, and 20 s at 60°C; and 1 cycle of 1 min at 72°C	4
<i>vatC-P</i>	TCGTCTCGAGCTCTAGGTCC	<i>vat</i> (C)			
<i>satA-1</i>	GCTCAATAGGACCAGGTGTA	L12033	361-632	1 cycle of 3 min at 94°C;	11, 15
<i>satA-2</i>	TCCAGCTAACATGTATGGCG	<i>vat</i> (D)		35 cycles of 1 min at 94°C, 1 min at 55°C, and 1 min at 72°C; and 1 cycle of 10 min at 72°C	
<i>satG-1</i>	ACTATACCTGACGCAAATGC	AF139725	66-577	1 cycle of 5 min at 94°C;	20
<i>satG-2</i>	GGTTCAAATCTTGGTCCG	<i>vat</i> (E)		30 cycles of 25 s at 94°C, 40 s at 52°C, and 50 s at 72°C; and 1 cycle of 6 min at 72°C	
<i>vga-1</i>	AGTGGTGGTGAAGTAACACG	M90056	1149-1808	Same as for <i>vat</i> (D)	5, 11
<i>vga-2</i>	CTTGTCTCCTCCGCGAATAC	<i>vga</i> (A)			
<i>vgaB-1</i>	TGACAATATGAGTGGTGGTG	U82085	990-1566	1 cycle of 3 min at 94°C;	3, 11
<i>vgaB-2</i>	GCGACCATGAAATTGCTCTC	<i>vga</i> (B)		35 cycles of 1 min at 94°C, 1 min at 52°C, and 1 min at 72°C; and 1 cycle of 10 min at 72°C	
<i>vgb-1</i>	TACAGAGTACCCACTACCGA	M36022	781-1350	Same as for <i>vga</i> (B)	6, 11
<i>vgb-2</i>	TCAATTCCTGCTCCAGCAGT	<i>vgb</i> (A)			
<i>vgbB-Q</i>	CAGCAGTCTAGATCAGAGTGG	AF015628	512-1240	Same as for <i>vat</i> (C)	4
<i>vgbB-R</i>	CATACGGATCCATCTTTTCC	<i>vgb</i> (B)			
<i>ermB-1</i>	CATTTAACGACGAAACTGGC	M11180	836-1260	1 cycle of 3 min at 94°C;	13
<i>ermB-2</i>	GGAACATCTGTGGTATGGCG	<i>ermB-1</i>		25 cycles of 1 min at 94°C, 1 min at 52°C, and 1 min at 72°C; and 1 cycle of 10 min at 72°C	<i>erm</i> (B)
strep-M	ATHATGAAYGGIGICIAAYCAYMGIATG			1 cycle of 5 min at 95°C;	14
strep-N	ICCDATCCAIACRTCRTTICC			35 cycles of 2 min at 40°C, 90 s at 72°C, and 30 s at 95°C; and 1 cycle of 4 min at 40°C and 12 min at 72°C	

isolate containing plasmids of known size, was used as a source of molecular size markers.

The 28 quinupristin-dalfopristin-resistant isolates of *E. faecium* studied were divided into three categories: 6 (21%) isolates (from live pigs in Belgium, Germany, Spain, and The Netherlands) contained *vat*(D), 14 (50%) isolates (from UK hospital patients, from live pigs and poultry, and from raw poultry meat in Spain, Germany, and the UK) contained *vat*(E), and 8 (29%) isolates (from live pigs, raw poultry meat, and sewage in Belgium, Spain, and the UK) contained neither of these genes (Table 2). The MICs of both quinupristin-dalfopristin and virginiamycin were ≥ 32 $\mu\text{g/ml}$ for all *vat*(D)-

or *vat*(E)-positive isolates. In contrast, the eight *vat*(D)-negative, *vat*(E)-negative isolates had lower levels of resistance to quinupristin-dalfopristin (MICs, 4 to 16 $\mu\text{g/ml}$) and virginiamycin (MICs, 2 to 4 $\mu\text{g/ml}$). None of the isolates carried the *vat*(A), *vat*(B), *vat*(C), *vga*(A), and *vga*(B) streptogramin A resistance genes or the *vgb*(A) and *vgb*(B) streptogramin B resistance genes (4, 6) previously detected in staphylococci. The *erm*(B) gene, conferring macrolide-lincosamide-streptogramin B resistance (13), was detected in 82% of the isolates tested and in $\geq 75\%$ of isolates in each quinupristin-dalfopristin resistance category (Table 2). The absence of *erm*(B) from some *vat*(D)- or *vat*(E)-positive isolates does not rule out the

TABLE 2. Categories of quinupristin-dalfopristin-resistant *E. faecium* based on amplification of acetyltransferase genes

Source or group	No. (%) in PCR group			Total
	<i>vat(D)</i> ⁺	<i>vat(E)</i> ⁺	<i>vat(D)</i> and <i>vat(E)</i> negative ^a	
Human	0	4	0	4
Sewage	0	0	2	2
Animal	6	7	5	18
Raw meat	0	3	1	4
Total	6 (21)	14 (50)	8 (29)	28 (100)
<i>erm(B)</i> ⁺ isolates	6 (100)	11 (79)	6 (75)	23 (82)

^a Did not give a PCR product with M and N, degenerate primers for genes that encode streptogramin A acetyltransferases.

presence of other genes conferring resistance to streptogramin B compounds; it has been reported recently that resistance to both the A and B components is necessary to confer high-level resistance to streptogramin combinations on *E. faecium* (Bozdogan and Leclercq, 39th ICAAC).

When degenerate primers M and N were used to detect genes likely to encode streptogramin A acetyltransferases, amplicons of ca. 150 bp were obtained from the 20 *vat(D)*- or *vat(E)*-positive isolates but from none of the 8 negative isolates. When the DNA was blotted onto nylon membranes, the M and N amplicons from *vat(D)*-positive strains hybridized only with a *vat(D)*-specific probe, and those from *vat(E)*-positive isolates hybridized only with a *vat(E)*-specific probe. Plasmid DNA prepared from the eight *vat(D)*-negative, *vat(E)*-negative isolates failed to hybridize with either *vat(D)*- or *vat(E)*-specific probes. The *vat(E)*-specific probe hybridized with plasmids in the range of 35 to 100 MDa in all *vat(E)*-positive isolates (not shown).

The proportion of quinupristin-dalfopristin-resistant isolates shown to contain *vat(D)* (21%) is similar to that reported by other workers (11, 12). The majority of *vat(D)*-negative isolates (63% [14 of 22]) carried the recently described *vat(E)* gene (20). Our data indicate wide dissemination of *vat(E)*, which we confirmed to be plasmid mediated, among enterococci from diverse sources and countries. One of the resistance plasmids now known to carry *vat(E)* could be transferred in vitro to a sensitive laboratory strain of *E. faecium* (23). Eight diverse isolates expressed lower levels of streptogramin resistance but contained no detectable acetyltransferase genes. The degenerate primers used yielded products with the five genes, *vat(A)* to *vat(E)*, known to encode streptogramin A acetyltransferases, but we cannot rule out the possibility that these isolates contain unrelated acetyltransferases. However, their streptogramin resistance may have resulted from a mechanism unrelated to acetyltransferase production. Active efflux associated with ATP-binding cassette transporters (3, 5) is the only other mechanism reported to confer resistance to streptogramin A compounds, and it is possible that these isolates have such a mechanism, although the demonstration of this requires further study.

In conclusion, we have shown that distinct categories of quinupristin-dalfopristin resistance exist in isolates of *E. faecium*. The *Vat(D)* and *Vat(E)* acetyltransferases occurred in enterococci from different European countries and conferred resistance to both quinupristin-dalfopristin and virginiamycin. An undefined mechanism conferred higher levels of resistance to quinupristin-dalfopristin than to virginiamycin. A wide distribution of *vat(D)* in strains from human and nonhuman sources has been reported previously (11, 12, 19). Similarly, in

this study we detected *vat(E)* on plasmids in *E. faecium* isolated from farm animals, meat, and UK hospital patients; comparable findings have been reported in Germany (20). None of the UK patients had received quinupristin-dalfopristin. It therefore seems likely that exchange of resistant strains or resistance genes may occur between *E. faecium* isolates from nonhuman and human sources. Until such time as these fears are proven to be unfounded, the occurrence of virginiamycin-resistant *E. faecium* in animals must be considered to remain a potential risk to public health, the extent of which has yet to be quantified.

We are grateful to Pim Kon (Rhône-Poulenc Rorer Ltd.) for providing quinupristin-dalfopristin, to Pfizer for providing virginiamycin and resistant isolates of *E. faecium* from animals, and to Anette Hammerum and Lars Jensen (Danish Veterinary Laboratory) for sharing data concerning PCR primers and cycling conditions prior to publication. M.S. was supported by a Ph.D. studentship award from the PHLs Central Research and Development Fund.

REFERENCES

- Allignet, J., S. Aubert, A. Morvan, and N. El Solh. 1996. Distribution of genes encoding resistance to streptogramin A and related compounds among staphylococci resistant to these antibiotics. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **40**:2523–2528.
- Allignet, J., and N. El Solh. 1995. Diversity among the gram-positive acetyltransferases inactivating streptogramin A and structurally related compounds and characterization of a new staphylococcal determinant, *vatB*. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **39**:2027–2036.
- Allignet, J., and N. El Solh. 1997. Characterization of a new staphylococcal gene, *vgaB*, encoding a putative ABC transporter conferring resistance to streptogramin A and related compounds. *Gene* **202**:133–138.
- Allignet, J., N. Liassine, and N. El Solh. 1998. Characterization of a staphylococcal plasmid related to pUB110 and carrying two novel genes, *vatC* and *vgaB*, encoding resistance to streptogramins A and B and similar antibiotics. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **42**:1794–1798.
- Allignet, J., V. Loncle, and N. El Solh. 1992. Sequence of a staphylococcal plasmid gene, *vga*, encoding a putative ATP-binding protein involved in resistance to virginiamycin A-like antibiotics. *Gene* **117**:45–51.
- Allignet, J., V. Loncle, P. Mazodier, and N. El Solh. 1988. Nucleotide sequence of a staphylococcal plasmid gene, *vga*, encoding a hydrolase inactivating the B components of virginiamycin-like antibiotics. *Plasmid* **20**:271–275.
- Allignet, J., V. Loncle, C. Simenel, M. Delepierre, and N. El Solh. 1993. Sequence of a staphylococcal gene, *vat*, encoding an acetyltransferase inactivating the A-type compounds of virginiamycin-like antibiotics. *Gene* **130**:91–98.
- Aubert, S., K. G. H. Dyke, and N. El Solh. 1998. Analysis of two *Staphylococcus epidermidis* plasmids coding for resistance to streptogramin A. *Plasmid* **40**:238–242.
- Dever, L. L., S. M. Smith, D. Dejesus, M. Masurekar, D. Patel, Z. C. Kaminski, and J. W. G. Johanson. 1996. Treatment of vancomycin-resistant *Enterococcus faecium* infection with an investigational streptogramin antibiotic (quinupristin/dalfopristin): a report of fifteen cases. *Microb. Drug Resist.* **2**:407–413.
- El Solh, N., J. M. Fouace, Z. Shalita, D. H. Bouachaud, R. P. Novick, and Y. A. Chabbert. 1980. Epidemiological and structural studies of *Staphylococcus aureus* R plasmids mediating resistance to tobramycin and streptogramin. *Plasmid* **4**:117–120.
- Hammerum, A. M., L. B. Jensen, and F. M. Aarestrup. 1998. Detection of the *satA* gene and transferability of virginiamycin resistance in *Enterococcus faecium* from food-animals. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* **168**:145–151.
- Jensen, L. B., A. M. Hammerum, F. M. Aarestrup, A. E. Van den Bogaard, and E. E. Stobberingh. 1998. Occurrence of *satA* and *vgaB* genes in streptogramin-resistant *Enterococcus faecium* isolates of animal and human origins in The Netherlands. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **42**:3330–3331.
- Jensen, L. B., N. Frimodt-Møller, and F. M. Aarestrup. 1999. Presence of *erm* gene classes in gram-positive bacteria of animal and human origin in Denmark. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* **170**:151–158.
- Liassine, N., J. Allignet, A. Morvan, S. Aubert, and N. El Solh. 1997. Multiplicity of the genes and plasmids conferring resistance to pristinamycin in staphylococci selected in an Algerian hospital. *Zentbl. Bakteriologie* **286**:389–399.
- Rende-Fournier, R., R. Leclercq, M. Galimand, J. Duval, and P. Courvalin. 1993. Identification of the *satA* gene encoding a streptogramin A acetyltransferase in *Enterococcus faecium* BM4145. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **37**:2119–2125.
- Roberts, M. C., J. Sutcliffe, P. Courvalin, L. B. Jensen, J. Rood, and H.

- Seppala.** 1999. Nomenclature for macrolide and macrolide-lincosamide-streptogramin B antibiotic resistance determinants. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **43**:2823–2830.
17. **Sahgal, V. S., C. Urban, N. Mariano, F. Weinbaum, J. Turner, and J. J. Rahal.** 1995. Quinupristin/dalfopristin (RP59500) therapy for vancomycin-resistant *Enterococcus faecium* aortic graft infection: case report. *Microb. Drug Resist.* **1**:245–247.
18. **Wade, J., L. Baillie, N. Rolando, and M. Casewell.** 1992. Pristinamycin for *Enterococcus faecium* resistant to vancomycin and gentamicin. *Lancet* **339**:312–313.
19. **Werner, G., I. Klare, and W. Witte.** 1998. Association between quinupristin/dalfopristin resistance in glycopeptide-resistant *Enterococcus faecium* and the use of additives in animal feed. *Eur. J. Clin. Microbiol. Infect. Dis.* **17**:401–402.
20. **Werner, G., and W. Witte.** 1999. Characterization of a new enterococcal gene, *satG*, encoding a putative acetyltransferase conferring resistance to streptogramin A compounds. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **43**:1813–1814.
21. **Woodford, N.** 1998. Glycopeptide-resistant enterococci: a decade of experience. *J. Med. Microbiol.* **47**:849–862.
22. **Woodford, N., D. Morrison, B. Cookson, and R. C. George.** 1993. Comparison of high-level gentamicin-resistant *Enterococcus faecium* isolates from different continents. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **37**:681–684.
23. **Woodford, N., M. F. Palepou, A. P. Johnson, P. R. Chadwick, and J. Bates.** 1997. Methicillin-resistant *Staphylococcus aureus* and vancomycin-resistant enterococci. *Lancet* **350**:737–738.