ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Hypoparathyroidism‑Retardation‑Dysmorphism Syndrome due to a Variant in the *Tubulin‑Specifc Chaperone E* **Gene as a Cause of Combined Immune Defciency**

OdeyaDavid^{1,2,3} · Eyal Kristal^{2,3} **D** · Galina Ling^{2,3} · Arnon Broides^{2,3,4} · Nurit Hadad^{3,5,6} · George Shubinsky^{3,6} · **Amit Nahum3,4,7,8**

Received: 27 June 2022 / Accepted: 6 October 2022 / Published online: 18 October 2022 © The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Science+Business Media, LLC, part of Springer Nature 2022

Abstract

Background Hypoparathyroidism-retardation-dysmorphism (HRD) syndrome is a disease composed of hypoparathyroidism, growth retardation, severe developmental delay, and typical dysmorphic features caused by the tubulin-specifc chaperone E gene variant. Many patients succumb in infancy to HRD due to overwhelming infections mainly caused by *Pneumococcus* spp. Knowledge related to the immune system in these patients is scarce.

Purpose To defne the immune phenotype of a cohort of HRD patients including their cellular, humoral, and neutrophil functions.

Methods The study included HRD patients followed at Soroka University Medical Center. Clinical and immunological data were obtained, including immunoglobulin concentrations, specifc antibody titers, lymphocyte subpopulations, lymphocyte proliferation, and neutrophil functions.

Results Nine patients (5 females and 4 males) were enrolled, aged 6 months to 15 years. All received amoxicillin prophylaxis as part of a routine established previously. Three patients had bacteremia with *Klebsiella*, *Shigella* spp., and Candida. Three patients had confrmed coronavirus disease 19 (COVID-19), and two of them died from this infection. All patients had normal blood counts. Patients showed high total IgA and IgE levels, low anti-pneumococcal antibodies in spite of a routine vaccination schedule, and reduced frequency of naive B cells with increased frequency of CD21lowCD27- B cells. All patients had abnormal T-cell population distributions, including reduced terminally diferentiated efector memory CD8, inverted CD4/ CD8 ratios, and impaired phytohemagglutinin (PHA)-induced lymphocyte proliferation. Neutrophil superoxide production and chemotaxis were normal in all patients tested.

Conclusion HRD is a combined immunodeficiency disease with syndromic features, manifesting in severe invasive bacterial and viral infections.

Keywords Hypoparathyroidism-Retardation-Dysmorphism (HRD) syndrome · Sanjad–Sakati syndrome · Inborn Errors of Immunity $(IEI) \cdot$ combined immune deficiency

 \boxtimes Eyal Kristal eyalkr2@clalit.org.il

- Pediatric Endocrine Clinic, Soroka University Medical Center, Beer Sheva, Israel
- ² Pediatric Ambulatory Center, Soroka University Medical Center, Beer Sheva, Israel
- ³ Joyce & Irving Goldman Medical School, Faculty of Health Sciences, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer Sheva, Israel
- ⁴ Pediatric Immunology Clinic, Soroka University Medical Center, Beer Sheva, Israel
- ⁵ Infectious Disease Laboratory, Department of Clinical Biochemistry, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer Sheva, Israel
- Flow Cytometry Unit, Soroka University Medical Center, Beer Sheva, Israel
- Primary Immunodeficiency Research Laboratory, Faculty of Health Sciences, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer-Sheva, Israel
- ⁸ Pediatrics Department A, Soroka University Medical Center, Beer Sheva, Israel

Introduction

Hypoparathyroidism-retardation-dysmorphism (HRD) syndrome, also known as Sanjad–Sakati syndrome [[1–](#page-6-0)[3](#page-6-1)], (OMIM # 241,410), is an autosomal recessive disease composed of hypoparathyroidism, both intra-uterine and postnatal severe growth retardation, severe mental retardation, and dysmorphism.

HRD is caused by variants in the gene encoding tubulin-specific chaperone E (TBCE), which is important for microtubule assembly pathways [\[3\]](#page-6-1). The common cause for HRD among the Arab Bedouin population is homozygosity for a founder variant NM_001079515.3:c.155_166del (c.155_166del p.Ser52_Gly55del) [[3\]](#page-6-1). Variants in TBCE, with autosomal recessive traits, were also described as causing Kenny–Caffey syndrome, type 1, KCS1 (OMIM #244,460), which shares very similar features. Other important characteristics of the syndrome are signifcant delay in achieving developmental milestones, and signifcantly arrested gross and fne motor skill development. Speech is never achieved by some patients, whereas others have incomprehensible speech [\[4](#page-6-2)]. Eye and brain anomalies are common, as are multiple endocrine deficiencies (including hypothyroidism, adrenal insufficiency, and hypogonadism), epilepsy, and bowel obstruction. [\[5](#page-6-3)]. Susceptibility to pneumococcal infections is a signifcant aspect of this syndrome, as many patients succumb in infancy due to these infections*.* In a recent publication reporting a longterm follow-up of a large cohort of HRD patients, 33 out of 63 patients died before reaching the age of 5 years [\[4](#page-6-2)]. All but one patient died from infections, which included septic shock, meningitis, and pneumonia. The introduction of amoxicillin prophylaxis as an institutional practice in 2000 has reduced the mortality rate under 5 years of age from 77 to 24% [\[4](#page-6-2)]. The frst clinical descriptions of HRD patients by Richardson et al. in 1990 reported normal immunoglobulin levels and a reduced number of T-lymphocyte subsets [[1](#page-6-0)]. Sanjad and Sakati in 1991 reported normal T- and B-lymphocyte counts and mitogen response [\[2](#page-6-4)]. A year later, Kalam and Hafeez reported one patient with low IgG and IgA levels, normal Band T-lymphocyte subsets and CD8/CD4 ratio, and normal thymus in a CT scan [\[6](#page-6-5)]. In 2007, Hershkovitz et al. reported hyposplenism, impaired neutrophil chemotaxis, and phagocytosis without signifcant diferences in superoxide production [\[7](#page-6-6)]. Autoimmunity was also reported as some patients were described with Hashimoto thyroiditis [\[5](#page-6-3), [8\]](#page-6-7). In this study, we aimed to describe the immune phenotype of a cohort of HRD patients including cellular, humoral, and neutrophil functions.

Methods

This study included genetically diagnosed HRD patients, who were followed at Soroka University Medical Center in a study conducted during 2021–2022.

Clinical data were obtained from electronic medical records and included demographic, clinical, and laboratory data.

The immunological evaluation was performed during ambulatory clinic visits, while patients were free of infection. All patients received vaccinations as per the mandatory schedule, including diphtheria-tetanus-pertussis, conjugated pneumococcal Prevenar 13, hepatitis B, and Hemophilus infuenza type B vaccines. Four patients received Pneumovax vaccine during the last 6 months of the study period. The workup included IgG, IgM, IgA, and IgE levels; specifc antibodies (anti-tetanus, pneumococcal, hepatitis B, and diphtheria); lymphocyte subpopulations by flow cytometry; lymphocyte proliferation by PHA; and neutrophil functional tests including superoxide production and chemotaxis. For detailed methods, please see the Supplemental Materials section.

Results

Patient Cohort and Clinical Course Nine patients (5 female and 4 male) were enrolled in the study, with an age range from 6 months to 15 years (mean 6.3 years). Two patients died from COVID-19 infection a few weeks after enrollment (Table [1\)](#page-2-0). All patients were homozygous for the NM_001079515.3:c.155_166del variant. Table [1](#page-2-0) outlines the main infection events during the patients' lifetime and other signifcant clinical features. As part of institutional routine, all patients received amoxicillin prophylaxis, yet sufered from recurrent episodes of otitis media and pneumonia. Two patients (5 and 6, respectively) had bacteremia with *Klebsiella* and *Shigella* spp., and another patient experienced septic shock due to Candida. Patients 7 and 8 had urinary tract infections with *E. coli* spp., as did another patient due to Candida (Table [1](#page-2-0)). As for viral infections, seven out of nine patients were tested for COVID-19. Three were positive and two of them died due to acute respiratory distress syndrome (ARDS) associated with the virus. Infections with common viruses such as infuenza A, adenovirus, parainfuenza, and RSV virus were severe enough to warrant hospitalization in six patients (Table [1](#page-2-0)).

In agreement with the known phenotype of the syndrome, all patients exhibited hypoparathyroidism, severe growth retardation, severe progressive developmental delay, and hearing loss. The oldest patient's weight did not exceed 15 kg, and none of the patients was able to communicate verbally. Of note are two patients with additional endocrinopathies—hypothyroidism in one and adrenal insufficiency in the other—who did not survive COVID-19 infection.

Table 1 Clinical features of HRD patient cohort

Immunoglobulins and Specifc Antibodies High IgG levels were recorded in three out of nine protective levels (Table [2\)](#page-3-0). Both T- and B-cell population distributions were abnormally had normal TREC results.

Discussion

Our study establishes HRD syndrome, due to the previ ously described Arab founder variant in the TBCE gene, as an inborn error of immunity that should be classifed as

Immunological Workup

patients, elevated IgA titers in fve of nine, and IgE levels were also markedly increased, up to 1000 IU/mL, in four out of six patients tested. All patients were vaccinated according to schedule including diphtheria-tetanus-per tussis (DTP), hepatitis B vaccine, and conjugated antipneumococcal vaccine (Prevenar 13). Four of the older patients received Pneumovax vaccine. All patients had low total anti-pneumococcal antibodies in spite of serial Prevenar 13 vaccination and recurrent ear and pulmonary infections. Only one patient had a post-Pneumovax vac cine antibody titer. Two patients had low, non-protective anti-tetanus antibody titers, and two had only short-term

Lymphocyte Phenotyping and Proliferation Studies

skewed in most patients. In seven patients, an inverted CD4/ CD8 ratio was recorded, attributed to CD8 expansion, as none of our patients had CD4 lymphopenia (Table [2](#page-3-0)). In six patients, a detailed T- and B-subpopulation analysis was performed. A reduced frequency of naive B cells and increased percentage of plasmablast B cells were found in four patients. An increased frequency of CD21lowCD27- B cells was evident in all patients. As for T-cell populations, three out of six patients had a low percentage of CD4 efec tor memory and of terminally diferentiated subsets that expressed CD45RA (TEMRA). There was notable CD8 lym phocytosis with an increased percentage of central memory cells, a low percentage of efector memory, and a prominent reduction in TEMRA cells in all tested patients (Table [3](#page-4-0)). Lymphocyte proliferation tests by mitogen stimulation with PHA were poor—at or below 50% of controls in four out of the nine of patients tested (Table [2](#page-3-0)). Neutrophil func tions, as tested by superoxide production and chemotaxis, were normal in all patients tested (Table [4\)](#page-5-0). Of note are the results from the severe combined immunodeficiency (SCID) newborn screening program using a T-cell receptor exci sion circle (TREC) assay that was introduced in 2015. Three patients enrolled in this study were born after 2015, and all

45–244 mg/dL. IgE 6–11 months<or=34; 1 and 2 years<or=97; 4–6 years<or=307; 7 and 8 years<or=403; 9–12 years<or=696; 13–15 years<or=629

Table 2 Immunoglobulins, specific antibodies, lymphocyte populations, and proliferation studies **Table 2** Immunoglobulins, specifc antibodies, lymphocyte populations, and proliferation studies

² Springer

Table 4

a combined immunodefciency (CID) disease with syndromic features. Patients frequently display impaired mitogen responses, T cell-dependent antibody responses, and reduced frequencies of CD4+and CD8+efector memory of CD4+and CD8+TEMRA and naive B cells, with an increased proportion of CD21lowCD27- B-cell populations. They suffer from varied bacterial infections in spite of amoxicillin prophylaxis and display opportunistic viral and fungal infections.

Historically, these patients had a high mortality rate due to pneumococcal infections, but this was reduced signifcantly upon introduction of amoxicillin prophylaxis (4). Although patients continued to die due to severe sinopulmonary infections, these invasive pneumococcal infections were signifcantly lower in patients adhering to this regimen. TBCE is important for assembly pathways of microtubules, and hypoparathyroidism causes impaired calcium homeostasis. Thus, HRD syndrome encompasses two features that can infuence normal activity of the immune system.

Microtubules are essential for immunological synapse (IS) formation of both T and B lymphocytes $[9, 10]$ $[9, 10]$ $[9, 10]$ $[9, 10]$, exocytosis of cytotoxic granules, secretion of chemokines from T cells [\[11](#page-7-0)], and antigen-dependent CD8 T-cell activation [[12\]](#page-7-1). Our fndings are in line with other known CIDs with cytoskeleton abnormalities such as Wiskott–Aldrich syndrome (WAS) and dedicator of cytokinesis 8 (DOCK8). As shown in the presented study, HRD patients share some phenotypic features with those disorders, including elevated IgA and IgE concentrations and abnormal humoral response. All HRD patients are afflicted with hypoparathyroidsm, and are thus treated with calcium supplements and active vitamin D metabolites. Hypocalcemia is the most prevalent complication seen among our patients, starting a few hours after birth, and both hypo- and hypercalcemia are common complications, reflecting treatment difficulties. Regulated changes in calcium concentrations in lymphocytes control the complex pathways of proliferation, diferentiation, antibody and cytokine secretion, and cytotoxicity, and diseases such as Ca^{+2} release-activated Ca^{+2} (CRAC) channelopathy (ORAI1, STIM1, etc.) can cause immunodeficiency $[13-17]$ $[13-17]$ $[13-17]$. At present, there are no data to support such a mechanism in HRD patients, and we believe this to be worth future study.

An interesting fnding found in all six patients with a detailed analysis of lymphocyte subpopulations was an increase in CD21lowCD27- B cells. The frequency of these cells is often increased in immunodefciency patients, such as in common variable immune defciency (CVID) and in those with autoimmunity disorders [[18](#page-7-4)]. These cells have been described as anergic naive B cells to resemble exhausted memory B cells [[19](#page-7-5)]. This fnding, although nonspecifc, may further point to the fundamental immunological abnormalities in HRD patients.

Two of the patients who tested positive for COVID-19 died during the research period. This, at least in part, could be attributed to the apparent combined immunodefciency involving both T- and B-cell defects, in combination with other features. It is of importance to note that both patients were on the severe spectrum of the syndrome, with extremely restricted growth and developmental delays, and one of these patients had adrenal insufficiency, which may serve as a signifcant risk factor for mortality. As far as other possible mechanisms, abnormal type I interferon responses serve as a risk factor for higher morbidity and mortality from COVID-19. [[20](#page-7-6)] Assembly pathways of microtubules, as well as calcium signaling impairment, have also been reported to affect interferon response [\[21\]](#page-7-7). However, the very small number of patients afected, as well as those willing to be vaccinated, mandates further follow-up, data collection, and study before any conclusions can be drawn in regard to this intriguing issue.

The limitations of this study are refected in the inclusion of patients with a single variant and the relatively small sample size. Since it is possible that other HRD patients may have similar or diferent immune abnormalities, further research with HRD patients who are homozygous for other TBCE variants is required.

As far as treatment options for CID, hemotopoietic stem cell transplantation (HSCT), currently the defnitive and most rewarding option, is less likely to be benefcial to our patients. The severe physical and mental developmental delays, as well as hypoparathyroidism, are the most pronounced aspects of this severe syndromic inborn error of immunity (IEI), which cannot be corrected by HSCT and will probably not contribute to either patient life quality or longevity. However, considering our current results, it is worthwhile to compare the added beneft of IVIg treatment in some of these patients to the current antibiotic prophylactic regimen as part of their routine treatment.

Conclusion

In this study, we demonstrated that HRD patients should be classifed as IEI group of CID with syndromic features, manifesting in varying degrees of severity. This should alert physicians and mandate an in-depth investigation and careful follow-up for each patient, with administration of appropriate prophylaxis regimens.

Supplementary Information The online version contains supplementary material available at<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10875-022-01380-9>.

Author Contribution All authors contributed to the study conception and design. Material preparation, data collection, and analysis were performed by Odeya David, Eyal Kristal, and Amit Nahum. Flow cytometric analysis, proliferation studies, and neutrophil functional tests

were performed by Nurit Hadad and George Shubinsky. The manuscript was written by Odeya David, Eyal Kristal, Arnon Broides, and Amit Nahum. All authors have read and approved the fnal manuscript. Odeya David and Eyal Kristal are co-authors.

Funding This study was partially supported by the Jefrey Modell Foundation.

Data Availability The datasets generated during the current study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

Declarations

Ethics Approval The study was approved by the Soroka University Medical Center Ethics Committee.

Consent to Participate Informed consent was signed by the patients' parents prior to enrollment.

Consent for Publication Not applicable.

Conflict of Interest The authors declare no competing interests.

References

- 1. Richardson RJ, Kirk JM. Short stature, mental retardation, and hypoparathyroidism: a new syndrome. Arch Dis Child. 1990;65(10):1113–7.
- 2. Sanjad SA, Sakati NA, Abu-Osba YK, Kaddoura R, Milner RDG. A new syndrome of congenital hypoparathyroidism, severe growth failure, and dysmorphic features. Arch Dis Child. 1991;66:193–6.
- 3. Parvari R, Hershkovitz E, Grossman N, Gorodischer R, Loeys B, Zecic A, et al. Mutation of TBCE causes hypoparathyroidismretardation-dysmorphism and autosomal recessive Kenny-Cafey syndrome. Nat Genet. 2002;32(3):448–52.
- 4. David O, Agur R, Novoa R, Shaki D, Walker D, Carmon L, et al. Hypoparathyroidism-retardation dysmorphism syndrome—clinical insights from a large longitudinal cohort in a single medical center. Front Pediatr. 2022;10:916679. [https://doi.org/10.3389/fp.](https://doi.org/10.3389/fp.ed.2022.916679) [ed.2022.916679.](https://doi.org/10.3389/fp.ed.2022.916679)
- 5. David O, Barash G, Agur R, Loewenthal N, Carmon L, Shaki D, et al. Multiple endocrine defciencies are common in hypoparathyroidism-retardation-dysmorphism (HRD) Syndrome. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2021;106(2):e907–16.
- 6. Kalam MA, Hafeez W. Congenital hypoparathyroidism, seizure, extreme growth failure with developmental delay and dysmorphic features—another case of this new syndrome. Clin Genet. 1992;42(3):110–3.
- 7. Hershkovitz E, Rozin I, Limony Y, Golan H, Hadad N, Gorodischer R, et al. Hypoparathyroidism, retardation, and dysmorphism syndrome: impaired early growth and increased susceptibility to severe infections due to hyposplenism and impaired polymorphonuclear cell functions. Pediatr Res. 2007;62(4):505–9.
- 8. Anteet AM, Al Issa ST, Al-Ali AO, Al-Otaibi HM, Mohamed S, Babiker A, et al. Autoimmune thyroiditis associated with Sanjad-Sakati syndrome: a call for regular thyroid screening. Sudan J Paediatr. 2016;16(2):41–4.
- 9. Soares H, Lasserre R, Alcover A. Orchestrating cytoskeleton and intracellular vesicle traffic to build functional immunological synapse. Immunol Rev. 2013;256:118–32.
- 10. Sáez JJ, Diaz J, Ibañez J, Bozo JP, Cabrera Reyes F, Alamo M, et al. The exocyst controls lysosome secretion and

antigen extraction at the immune synapse of B cells. J Cell Biol. 2019;218(7):2247–64. [https://doi.org/10.1083/jcb.201811131.](https://doi.org/10.1083/jcb.201811131)

- 11. Franciszkiewicz K, Boutet M, Gauthier L, Vergnon I, Peeters K, Duc O, et al. Synaptic release of CCL5 storage vesicles triggers CXCR4 surface expression promoting CTL migration in response to CXCL12. J Immunol. 2014;193:4952–61.
- 12. Compeer EB, Flinsenberg TW, Boon L, Hoekstra M, Boes M. Tubulation of endosomal structure in human dendritic cells by toll-like receptor ligation and lymphocyte contact accompanies antigen cross presentation. J Biol Chem. 2014;289:520–8.
- 13. Trebak M, Kinet JP. Calcium signalling in T cells. Nat Rev Immunol. 2019;19(3):154–69.
- 14. Babich A, Burkhardt JK. Coordinate control of cytoskeleton remodeling and calcium mobilization during T cell activation. Immunol Rev. 2013;256:80–94.
- 15. McCarl C-A, Picard C, Khalil S, Kawasaki T, Röther J, Papolos A, et al. ORAI1 deficiency and lack of store operated Ca2+ entry cause immunodeficiency, myopathy and ectodermal dysplasia. J Allergy Clin Immunol. 2009;124(6):1311-8.e7.
- 16. Vaeth M, Kahlfuss S, Feske S. CRAC channels and calcium signaling in T cell-mediated immunity. Trends Immunol. 2020;41(10):878–901.
- 17. Lacruz RS, Feske S. Diseases caused by variants in ORAI1 and STIM1. Ann NY Acad Sci. 2015;1356(1):45–79. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1111/nyas.12938) [10.1111/nyas.12938](https://doi.org/10.1111/nyas.12938).
- 18. Isnardi I, Ng YS, Menard L, Meyers G, Saadoun D, Srdanovic I, et al. Complement receptor 2/CD21- human naive B cells contain mostly autoreactive unresponsive clones. Blood. 2010;115:5026–36.
- 19. Thorarinsdottir K, Camponeschi A, Gjertsson I. Mårtensson I-L CD21−/low B cells: a snapshot of a unique B cell subset in health and disease. Scand J Immunol. 2015;82:254–61. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1111/sji.12339) [10.1111/sji.12339](https://doi.org/10.1111/sji.12339).
- 20. Rodríguez-Gallego C, Novelli G, Hraiech S, Tandjaoui-Lambiotte Y, Duval X, Laouénan C, et al. Inborn errors of type I IFN immunity in patients with life-threatening COVID-19. Science. 2020;370(6515):eabd4570. [https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abd45](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abd4570) [70.](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abd4570)
- 21. Yue C, Soboloff J, Gamero AM. Control of type I interferoninduced cell death by ORAI1-mediated calcium entry in T cells. J Biolog Chem. 2012;287(5):3207–16.

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional afliations.

Springer Nature or its licensor (e.g. a society or other partner) holds exclusive rights to this article under a publishing agreement with the author(s) or other rightsholder(s); author self-archiving of the accepted manuscript version of this article is solely governed by the terms of such publishing agreement and applicable law.